

RAJYA SABHA

\*SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE

(Proceedings other than Questions and Answers)

Friday, February 10, 2023 / Magha 21, 1944 (Saka)

**MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION OF THE CHAIR**

**1. Need to Improve Employment Opportunities for Youth**

**DR. V. SIVADASAN:** Today, there is an urgent need to address the issue of unemployment. The lakhs of vacancies are existing across various Departments, including Railways and Military. In a reply to my question from the office of Hon'ble Prime Minister, I was told that about 10 lakh posts are lying vacant in various Ministries and Departments. From 2016-17 onwards about three lakh regular jobs have been destroyed. Even the Central services like, Indian Forest Service, Indian Economic Service, Indian Forest Service and Indian Information Service are facing the manpower shortage. Hence, the issue of unemployment needs an urgent attention.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

**2. Need for Expansion of Airstrip at Meerut**

**SHRI VIJAY PAL SINGH TOMAR:** The Central Government has decided to connect various major cities of the country by domestic air service under the 'Udaan' scheme. Meerut happens to be the main city of western Uttar Pradesh, which has its own historical significance. In addition to the martyr's memorial and museum built in the memory of the first freedom struggle, there are also Baba Aughadnath Temple and many famous places of Mahabharata period. The city is also famous for sports goods and the recently established Dhyani Chand Sports University. However, traveling from Meerut to Lucknow, Allahabad, Varanasi or Gorakhpur, the commuters face a lot of difficulties. I would like to urge the Government through you to expand the airstrip already built in Meerut and connect Meerut city to different cities of the country by bringing it under 'Udaan' scheme.

*(Dr. Sasmit Patra, Dr. Fauzia Khan, Dr. Santanu Sen and Shri M. Mohd. Abdullah associated.)*

**3. Revenue Sharing of Advertising between Tech Giants and News Publishers**

**SHRI SUSHIL KUMAR MODI:** The print media, electronic media, digital media and news channels included under the fourth pillar of democracy are undergoing a crisis today. In fact, they have to spend billions of Rupees on collecting news, verifying the facts thereof, preparing content, and remuneration to journalists and other employees. Their

---

\*This Synopsis is not an authoritative record of the proceedings of the Rajya Sabha.

main source of income remains advertisement. But, big companies like Facebook, Google, You Tube keep most of their advertisement revenue and do not spend any of their own money in creating the content. The profit of these companies is increasing every year. But, the person who prepares the content of the news item does not get the benefit of it. I urge the Government of India through the Digital India Act and with the intervention of the Competition Commission to ensure that on the lines of Australia, Canada, France, the European Union and New Zealand, the advertising revenue earned by these big companies is passed on to the original writers as well and he/ she should also have a share therein. Thus, India's print and news TV channel can be saved from economic crisis.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

#### **4. Illegal Possession of Uncultivated Land in Jharkhand**

**SHRI ADITYA PRASAD:** For the last three years, the use category of land is being changed for purchase and sale in the State of Jharkhand. About 4 lakh acres of land has been illegally occupied and *Jamabandi* was also done. In Bokaro district alone, around 70 thousand acres of land has been entered in revenue record and sold among about 51 thousand people. The Government schemes are not being implemented in Jharkhand. Many landless families were allotted land. Some people got the land, but could not get its ownership. Most of the landless family members in the State are very scared. I would like to urge the Government that action should be taken against those who are doing illegal business of land under the protection of authorities.

*(Dr. Santanu Sen, Dr. Fauzia Khan, Dr. Sasmit Patra and Shri Deepak Prakash associated.)*

#### **5. Need for Revision of the New Population Criteria for Eklavya Model Residential Schools**

**SHRI SUJEET KUMAR:** My concern is about the new population criteria for the establishment of Eklavya Model Residential Schools and the non-operation thereof. Even the Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment highlighted the fact that a 50 per cent tribal population criterion is very unfair and discriminatory. We know that there are several tribal pockets in this country which may not have 50 per cent tribal population. Thus, a great number of tribal people are left out of empowerment, education and welfare schemes. Presently, various Eklavya Model Residential Schools are not functioning well. The adequate numbers of teachers are not available over there. The necessary action needs to be taken to improve the situation, in this regard.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

#### **6. Need for Investigation over the Alleged Misuse of Funds of the District Mineral Foundation Trust**

**SHRI KHIRU MAHTO:** Hon'ble Prime Minister has created the District Mineral Foundation Trust with the objective of implementing drinking water, education, road, employment and other development schemes in the mining affected area. The funds for this purpose are arranged mainly from a deduction of Rs 30 per tonne from the coal

business. The mining affected areas are Mandu, Chitalpur, Patratu blocks in Ramgarh District of Jharkhand State. But in this district, the funds have been diverted towards construction and beautification of District Collectorate, Swimming Pool, Town Hall, Park and Indoor Stadium etc. The crores of rupees have been spent for it. In all, the displaced people from 20 villages are affected by this anomaly. About 8 kms long metalled road in my hometown itself remains in a highly dilapidated condition. I make a demand to the Government of India for the construction of the said road and to investigate the matter related to the misuse of the funds of the District Mineral Foundation Trust.

*(Shri Deepak Prakash, Dr. Santanu Sen, Dr. Fauzia Khan and Dr. Sasmit Patra associated.)*

#### **7. Leasing of Railway Land near Kannur Railway Station for Commercial Purposes**

**SHRI SANDOSH KUMAR P:** I demand a probe into the recent dealings and transactions of the Railway Development Authority. The unfairly executed deal by the Indian Railways involving handing over of seven acres of land for 45 years to a private company must be cancelled.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

#### **8. Hardships faced by Disabled People in getting their Aadhaar Card Issued**

**DR. SUMER SINGH SOLANKI:** I would like to draw your kind attention to the grim situation in Nimar region of Madhya Pradesh as well as in different regions across India. According to the 2011 census, more than 20 million people in India fall under the category of some kind of disability. Nowadays, Aadhaar cards are not being issued due to non-availability of thumb, fingers and eyes impressions of differently-abled citizens, due to which they are not getting the full benefits of the facilities being provided by the Government. The Persons with disabilities living in remote areas are facing even more difficulties. They are not able to get their Aadhaar cards issued. Even after getting the Aadhaar card, they have to face various other problems.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

---

### **PRIVATE MEMBERS' RESOLUTION**

#### **Implementation of Sachar Committee Report and Other Reports for Improving Educational and Social Backwardness of Muslims**

**SHRI ABDUL WAHAB:** I move the following Resolution:-

"Having regard to the fact that:-

- (i) Sachar Committee Report, 2006 and Ranganath Mishra Commission Report, 2007 reveals that the condition of Muslims in India is worse than SCs and STs;
- (ii) according to the "Sachar Committee Report" one-fourth of Muslim children in the age group of 6-14 years have either never attended school or are drop-outs;
- (iii) for children above the age of 17 years, the educational attainment of Muslims

at higher education is 17%, as against national average at 26% and only 50% of muslim children who complete middle school education are likely to complete secondary education, compared to national average of 62%;

- (iv) Muslim population comprises of 14% of national population but their representation in Higher Education is very low;
- (v) in All India Survey on Higher Education (AISHE) 2019-20, a total of 1019 universities including central, state, open and other types of universities in India participated and it was found in the Survey that only 5.5% Muslims are in Higher education;
- (vi) the number of muslim women in higher education is 13 out of 100 which is too low as per All India level National Sample Survey Organisation (NSSO), 2018 report;
- (vii) as per National Sample Survey Organisation (NSSO), 2018 Muslims were the lowest represented in salaried-class employment and the share of Muslims in government jobs is less than half of their proportion of the population;
- (viii) Muslims account for a mere 2.67 percent of directors and senior executives among Bombay Stock Exchange (BSE) 500 companies;
- (ix) as per NSSO, 2013 nearly 46 percent of Muslims are self-employed in urban India, the largest as compared with any other community,

This house urges upon the government to:-

- (a) implement the recommendation of Sachar Committee Report and other reports that have discussed the educational and social backwardness of Muslims;
- (b) reinstate and enhance all those scholarship and educational upliftment program that aimed to improve the higher education participation of Muslims;
- (c) help Madrassas to modernise with special infrastructural fund;
- (d) develop and implement special affirmative actions for Muslim women to improve their Higher education in central universities, Institutes of National Importance and work participation of Muslim women;
- (e) form a commission to study the representation of Muslims in University spaces including higher education and in the private and public jobs; and
- (f) enact a legislation for prevention of atrocities against minorities of the country so as to build confidence amongst Muslims who are vulnerable."

The famous Urdu poet Altaf Hussain Hali has described the condition of Muslims in free independent India saying that we are not trusted by the Government nor we are among the prominent courteous of the ruler, neither are we among the educated elite, we have no share in trade or in industry, nor do you find us in Civil Services or in the business. The Sachar Committee Report and the Ranganath Mishra Commission Report reveal that the condition of Muslims in India is very poor regarding education, higher

education, employment, civil services etc. The Human Rights Watch Report and many other similar Reports reveal that there has been a constant increase in the attacks on lower class Muslims in India in recent times. In the last few months, a new pattern has emerged to evict and bulldoze properties in Haldwani in the State of Uttarakhand, Dima Hasao district of Assam that belong mostly to minority community, particularly Muslim of lower class. Therefore, I propose that this House may urge upon the Government to implement the recommendations of Sachar Committee Report and enact a legislation for prevention of atrocities against minorities of the country so as to build confidence amongst Muslims who are vulnerable to mob attacks and other hate crimes.

**SHRI JAWHAR SIRCAR:** This year, the Budget of the Minority Welfare Department has been slashed by forty per cent. Their scholarships are being taken off. If you go through the list of all of those who were sent to jail in the Andaman Islands, you will see the contribution of the Muslim community to the Indian Freedom Struggle. There are hundreds of others who have sacrificed because they, at least a large section, had never considered themselves to be different from anybody else. There are certain nawabs and certain others who had compromised with the British. But, that does not speak for the whole community, as such. The entire community cannot be accused and cannot be put on the defensive. In Bengal and many other secular States of India like in Kerala, Tamil Nadu, we have offered them full rights and we consider them to be a part of our national and regional traditions. If only a small part of it decides to behave differently, we will all be in a difficult position. Make a firm promise that we shall fulfil all your demands to the extent of your percentage of population. I fully support the Resolution.

**DR. JOHN BRITTAS:** I am glad that Mr. Abdul Wahab took the initiative of moving this Resolution, though he was not very emphatic regarding the reasons why there has been a backwardness in the Muslim community as a whole in this country. The quality of the democracy in any society can be understood by the cardinal aspect of representation for different sections of the people. When we talk about the Indian democracy, the gross deficiency that is being demonstrated in a humongous way is the lack of representation of minorities in the discourse of this country. The students in Mangalore in Karnataka were prevented from wearing hijab in the name of ensuring secular-dress code. More than a lakh Muslim girls backed out of Government colleges in Karnataka. Enrolment of Muslim girls has come down drastically. Hon'ble Member should have cited the example of Kerala where we hold his hands together. So much of talk has been whipped-up in the name of modernizing the madrassas in U.P. There is a reduction of 93 per cent in the allocation of madrassas. The allocation for research schemes for minorities was reduced by 50 per cent in this Budget. The allocation for pre-matric scholarship for minorities has come down. The most important aspect in a democracy is representation. Just look at the representation of certain sections. There is not a single Muslim Chief Minister amongst 28 States.

**SHRI JAVED ALI KHAN:** I rise to speak in support of this resolution. By Minority welfare, we mean that they should get opportunities for education and employment, they should move forward in the field of skill development with modern technology and their language and culture should also be protected. But the present

Government is neglecting the minorities. There is a provision for constituting district level monitoring committees to review the schemes of the Ministry of Minority Welfare. After being elected as a member of Rajya Sabha in 2014, I was also made a member of such seven district monitoring committees by the ministry, but till date not even a single meeting of any committee has taken place. Similarly, district level committees called 'DISHA', review several schemes of the Central Government, but not a single scheme of the Ministry of Minority Welfare is included in it. Review of the schemes, being implemented for the welfare of minorities is necessary. The budget of the Ministry has also been reduced significantly in comparison to previous year and most of the reduction is in heads like education empowerment and skill development and livelihoods. A programme for the modernization of Madrassas was started during the tenure of Prime Minister Vajpayee ji, but these modernization teachers have not received their salaries for years . The UGC grant for Jamia Millia Islamia has been drastically reduced. With these points, I fully support this resolution.

**SHRI RAKESH SINHA:** I had hoped that after hearing the Prime Minister's speech yesterday and the first budget speech of the *Amrit Kaal*, the Hon'ble Member would review his resolution, but he did not do so. Also, some members of the opposition made points which were contrary to their own beliefs and views. In 1957, the Communist Government in Kerala was ousted by the Centre because Kerala Government wanted to introduce secular education. But today the leaders of that party, forgetting their heritage, are talking the opposite. A Christian Vice President of the Constituent Assembly termed the division of minority and majority as fatal to the concept of 'one nation, one people'. Similarly, a member of the Constituent Assembly who was a member of the Muslim League, demanded that the concept of minority should be abolished as it is a British creation. Many of the early presidents of the Congress were not Hindus but followers of other religions. The first session of the Congress was attended by a large number of Parsis, who were a very small part of the Indian population at that time. And all the Indians gave full respect to all of them. I am saying this because it is not the tradition and character of this country to discriminate against anyone. That is why today's Government is taking everybody along. Be it the scheme of financial inclusion, i.e. '*Jan Dhan Yojana*' or the programme to provide nutrition to every poor, people of all the religions and communities are benefiting from the schemes of the Government. Religion is not a criteria for medicines of Jan Aushadhi Kendras. This is '*Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas, Sabka Vishwas, Sabka Prayas*'. People from those countries with whom we have enmity, also come to India for medical tourism. This shows the secular character of India. I have read the Sachar Committee report. It mentions that on the basis of the report of the Hunter Committee constituted in 1871, the British Empire institutionalized the policy of appeasement and the division of minority and majority. In four more reports that followed, the installation of Gandhiji's portrait and tricolour was cited as majoritarianism and the reason for the spread of Hindu fascism. When the Constitution was framed, we were hoping that we would separate the country from that heritage, but it did not happen. Today's government has taken care in the policies and programs of the state that people who have remained poor and backward due to historical reasons like scheduled castes and

scheduled tribes, get their due. So schemes are being run for them. The OBC commission was given a constitutional form. There are historical reasons of SCs and STs remaining deprived, everyone is getting the benefit of the schemes being run for the rest of the public. Prime Minister's inspiration is that people's history is most important. It is the heritage of this country. This common heritage should not be divided in the name of minority and majority. Poverty, unemployment, law and order should not be divided in the name of minority and majority. In relation to educational institutions of minority character, the Supreme Court's bench has also said in a case that dividing educational institutions on the basis of religion is an antithesis of secular ethos. Education is very important in a secular democracy. People belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes have neither the right of reservation in faculty nor in admission in those universities. The Constitution ceases to operate there. In a secular country, if people of all religions, castes, languages and regions start running their institutions according to their own ways, it will be difficult. To protect your script, culture and tradition, give education in your own way, but do not close the doors of educational institutions for SC/ST people. The country will run on the basis of law, Constitution and policies. When communalism enters the economic sector, the country gets divided. This country was divided because parallel labour unions were formed everywhere on the basis of religion. We want to end the poison of communalism. I was shocked, I didn't imagine this. 12 consecutive letters were sent to the Army by the Secretary of Sachar Committee seeking the disclosure of the number of Hindu and Muslim soldiers in the Indian Army. The Army's reply said that the Indian Army has only one character and that is patriotism. The Army foiled the attempt to spew the venom of communalism. We have to leave that legacy. If India has to progress, the mantra of "*Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas*" has to be followed. This mantra is not only for India but for all the countries of the world. This ideology emanated from India's "*Vasudhaiva Kutumbakam*" concept and is an important contribution to the world. According to the Sub-Committee of the Sachar Committee, people of a particular religion do not get treatment in hospitals. School Principals exclude people of a particular religion. The Sachar Committee did the work of sowing the seeds of division. We believe in the concept of "One Nation One People". It was said that the scholarship budget has been reduced. The same person used to take four scholarships. The Government separated such people, obviously the budget got reduced. The Prime Minister's welfare schemes have closed the shops of those people who take the name of socialism by living a life of luxury. Baba Saheb Ambedkar had said in his last speech that the danger to this country is not from outside forces but from the Mir Jafars and Jaichands here. You should support the welfare schemes of the Prime Minister. This will increase your credibility in public.

**SHRIMATI JEBI MATHER HISHAM:** I am an Indian first an Indian last. Minority communities- Muslims, Sikhs, Parsis etc. do not get the best of education, health and livelihood. They are backward. If an Indian girl wants to wear a hijab or bindi or cross and wants to go the moon, we should all stand by her. I want to, specifically, speak on Maulana Azad National Fellowship. It was brought in 2009 pursuant to Sachar Commission Report. UPA believed that we should take everyone along. Now, the Government with a vague reason discontinued it. I want to know whether it was

discontinued because of the name 'Maulana Azad?' The Sachar Commission Report finds that there are minority communities which are poor and not getting the benefits. Don't deny them the benefits.

**PROF. MANOJ KUMAR JHA:** Our views may vary, but if our approach towards 20 percent of the population is not appropriate, then I think that even if we become a 5 trillion dollar economy, we will be alone as a country. Polarization is not good for the society. What is the condition of the countries today which were formed in the name of religion? We have to control the circumstances that are raising their heads here. It would not be good for the society to identify and decide on the basis of language, attire etc. We are celebrating '*Azadi Ka Amrit Varsh*'. The history of the world is a witness that if you create fear and dread for a community and go on a journey in reverse, ultimately it does not do you any good either, because political power is never permanent, every political power has an expiry date. We never call our country a country, all our friends will agree that we call it civilization, the civilization of India. At that time, Bapu had said that a civilization which does not have a place for minorities, will not be seen from a meaningful point of view. Problems will arise in it. We have filled a lot of poison in the entire ecosystem. Prime Minister, our Supreme Court has expressed concern as to why this is happening in this country. Hindu-Muslim, India-Pakistan debates are shown on television channels in the evening. Here our question is of livelihood, of employment. From where are these television channels getting incitement, which keep on showing hatred and hatred from evening till late night. Recently you must have seen that there was a decision of the Honourable High Court that you are making them a scapegoat. It often happens that they are acquitted, they are not proven guilty and they remain in jail unnecessarily. This is the condition of an average Muslim. The problem is that you see issues like Kashmir, Rohingya and Palestine also from the Muslim angle. No, look at it from human right angle, there are signs of solution in that too.

**DR. V. SIVADASAN:** We all know that India is built by the struggle of people. The struggle represents the unity of People. The Government is trying to destroy the diversity of the nation. The Union Government and ruling Party are continuously attacking the diversity of the nation, the rights of the minorities, including the Muslims and the Christians. One-fourth of the Muslim children in the age group of 6-14 years are not in schools. In higher education sector, the enrolment ratio of students belonging to Muslim community is really below the national average. I am trying to address the fear which is faced by the minorities in our country. Without addressing the fear of the minorities, we will not be able to resolve the issues. India has been built by the united struggle of the people. Everybody contributed in the struggle across all the communities and religions. We should promote the diversity. We should protect the right of the minorities. I support the Resolution moved by Shri Abdul Wahab.

**SHRI SANDOSH KUMAR P:** India is home to more than 200 million Muslims. So, what we are talking about is the plight of a considerable section of our population. The first question is the political representation of Indian Muslims. Everything begins with it. I would like to ask one thing from the hon. Members of the Treasury Benches, how many

Muslim Members of Parliament are there from their party? How many elected Lok Sabha Muslim Members do they have? Are they ready to hug the Indian Muslims, instead of the cow? If you carefully analyse all this data in detail, one thing is clear that you are always talking about Indian Muslims, you are always raising slogans like '*Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas*' but in reality you are not with the Indian Muslims and Indian minorities. Islamophobia is a reality in the modern world. In India also, you can see many areas which are called mini-Pakistan. Are we going to tackle and solve this kind of discrimination? I do not think so. In fact, this Government is a threat not only to the people of the country but its past also and its history also. This Government is purposefully, systematically and continuously promoting the Islamophobia. There are certain elements in the Muslim community, who are trying to misuse the Muslim sentiments. That has to be taken into account very seriously. There are many outfits, which purposefully try to drag the Muslims on the path of terrorism. Terrorism has no religion at all. This question is an Indian question, not a minority question. We have to take it very seriously. We have to promote their education. Rhetoric will not replace realities. I support this Resolution.

**SHRIMATI GEETA ALIAS CHANDRAPRABHA:** In the year 2005, a committee was formed under the chairmanship of Rajinder Sachar by the then Prime Minister Dr. Manmohan Singh. In the year 2006, the report of the committee was placed before the House. I was the head of the village when this report was discussed. Our Gram Panchayat had people from all castes, religions and communities. In my view, it is not appropriate to make any separate recommendation for a particular category. Today I want to place before this House the things said by the common people of the village at that time. The development of every citizen of the country should be the priority of the government. Our Prime Minister gave the basic mantra of '*Sabka Saath-Sabka Vikas-Sabka Vishwas*'. We thought and worked for the development of the last man in the queue with the basic mantra of *Antyodaya*. Our government is continuously working through various schemes to protect the interests of women. '*Beti Bachao-Beti Padhao Yojana*' is for the upliftment of all the daughters of the country. Under the '*Ujjwala Yojana*', gas cylinders have been given to all the women of the country without any discrimination. '*Sukanya Samridhi Yojana*' is for all the daughters of the country. Our government got toilets built for the convenience and for the respect of all the women of the country. In fact, we always worked to unite the country. About 1 lakh new self-help groups were formed for the economic development of our sisters of all classes living in rural areas. Mahila Samman Savings Certificate has been announced in the budget to strengthen women financially. Women have been given utmost importance in this budget. Our government is working with the objective of giving benefits of schemes like '*Deendayal Antyodaya Yojana*', '*Kisan Samman Nidhi*' etc. to every citizen of the country without any discrimination. All of you should cooperate with our government in making the country a New India with the schemes brought for the purpose of development.

**SHRI IMRAN PRATAPGARHI:** I support this resolution. Before me, two honourable members talked firmly about *Sabka Sath-Sabka Vikas*. Everyone should come forward together for the development of a particular community which is in extremely backward condition. But during the *Amrit Kaal*, there has been a huge cut in the budget for

the minorities. Madrassa teachers have not received salary for many years. They are in very pathetic condition. Provocative statements are made near the Parliament itself. An honourable Member of the ruling party calls for economic boycott of a particular community. No case is registered against him. The ruling party does not give any ticket to a particular community in the elections. Still, the slogan of *Sabka Sath-Sabka Vikas* is given. The Prime Minister talks about the rights of women. But in practice this does not appear to be the case. People who support a particular ideology are promoted while others are campaigned against. There are many such examples. The upliftment of Muslims has been talked about in this resolution. Everyone was promised a roof over their heads. But the roofs of those who have roofs are also being snatched by using bulldozers. All over the world, wherever a minority is successful, reaches a high position, we all rejoice. But slogans are raised against minorities in our country. We do not have to divide the common heritage into minority-majority. The inflammatory debate on the channels should be banned. The educational and economic condition of the Muslims should be improved. Efforts should be made to bridge the economic and social differences. This resolution will be very effective for this purpose.

**SHRI G.V.L. NARASIMHA RAO:** This Resolution is about implementation of the Sachar Committee. It reflected politics of minoritarianism and politics of appeasement. The recommendation of this committee was to count the military forces of the country on the basis of religion, which the whole country has opposed. Its terms of reference also included interference in the reservation of Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes on the basis of religion so as to benefit a particular community. It should have been opposed at that time. At present, *Amrit Kaal* is for every citizen of the country, for every community. Building toilets, LPG connection, *Jan Dhan* accounts have been implemented for all without any discrimination. We oppose this divisive resolution.

**SHRI A.A. RAHIM:** I thank you for giving me the opportunity to speak. (*Speech unfinished.*)

*Discussion not concluded.*

\* \* \* \* \*

**P. C. MODY,**  
*Secretary-General.*

[rssynop@sansad.nic.in](mailto:rssynop@sansad.nic.in)

---

\*\*\*\*Supplement covering rest of the proceedings is being issued separately.