

## RAJYA SABHA

---

### \*SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE

---

(Proceedings other than Questions and Answers)

---

Thursday, February 03, 2022 / Magha 14, 1943 (Saka)

---

### OBITUARY REFERENCE

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, I refer with profound sorrow to the passing away of Shrimati Jamana Devi Barupal, a former Member of this House.

**Shrimati Jamana Devi Barupal** passed away on 20th of January, 2022 at the age of 87 years.

Shrimati Jamana Devi Barupal was born in August, 1934 at Bikaner in Rajasthan. An agriculturist and a social worker, Shrimati Barupal strived assiduously for the upliftment and empowerment of women as well as the downtrodden. She actively took part in eradication of social evils and helped to establish many schools for girls in rural areas. Shrimati Barupal also authored 'Akhar Prernageet' which was published in 1995.

Shrimati Jamana Devi Barupal served as a Member of this House representing the State of Rajasthan, from April, 2000 to April, 2006.

---

\*This Synopsis is not an authoritative record of the proceedings of the Rajya Sabha.

In the passing away of Shrimati Jamana Devi Barupal, the country has lost a dedicated social worker and an able Parliamentarian.

*(One Minute's silence was observed as a mark of respect to the memory of the departed.)*

---

### **OBSERVATION BY THE CHAIR**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, yesterday Rajya Sabha witnessed disruption-free proceedings after a long gap. It was delightful to watch quality debate on the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address. The debates yesterday were marked by effective assertions of the achievements of the Ruling Party on one side, and the contestation by the Opposition Members on the other side. This is an advantage of smooth functioning of the House. I hope this spirit will continue to prevail for the remaining part of the Session and also for the future.

---

### **MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION OF CHAIR**

#### **1. Need for Development of Kanwar Lake at Manjhaul, Bihar**

**SHRI RAKESH SINHA:** The Kanwar Lake located at Manjhol in Begusarai district of Bihar was included in Ramsar site on October 20, 2020. The Ramsar site is a settlement, associated with the name of a city in Iran. The Kanwar lake is spread over about 2,400 acres where 59 types of exotic birds come from foreign shores and 107 types of native birds come from within the country. This lake should be protected and developed. This area is important not only from the environmental point of view, but also from the cultural point of view. There is a stupa of Lord Buddha here which is very historical, Lord Buddha had arrived here. Considering the importance of this place, the Central Government, the State Government and the District Administration, all three stakeholders, for its development, should pay

give proper attention to this place so that this may get the same status at the national level, which it has acquired at international level.

*(Shri Subhash Chandra Singh and Dr. Sasmit Patra associated.)*

## **2. Need for Inclusion of Houses in the State of Odisha under Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana(Gramin)**

**DR. SASMIT PATRA:** The Chief Minister of Odisha, has written three letters to Central Government to provide six lakh houses to poor and tribal people under Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana. Incidentally, these people are from the most backward regions of the state. Therefore, it is requested to open the scheme portal so that needy people could avail due benefits under the scheme.

**DR. AMAR PATNAIK:** I too urge the Central Government to open the portal of Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana, so that over 6.65 lakh beneficiaries get their due like people from from Karnatka.

**SHRI SUJEET KUMAR:** I support my colleagues and strongly urge the Government to show a non-partisan attitude. Like Karnataka, the Awas Portal should be opened for Odisha as well.

*(Shri M. Mohamed Abdul, Shri Subhash Chandra Singh and Shrimati Priyanka Chaturvedi associated.)*

## **3. Need for Inclusion of Kutchi Language in Eighth Schedule to the Constitution**

**SHRI SHAKTISINH GOHIL:** The Kutchi language is such an Indo-Aryan language, which is spoken by millions of people of Kutchi origin, in addition to Kutchis living in Kenya, Congo and many countries of South Africa, England, America, and many cities of the country. In fact, Kutch is bigger than many small states of the country and is famous as a major centre of Harappan culture and tourist destination. Respecting the spirit of this region and its people, The Kutchi language should be included in the 8th schedule of the constitution.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

#### **4. Faulty Representation of COVID Statistics of India in the World Map depicted in WHO website**

**DR. SHANTANU SEN:** On 30th January while searching the international data through who covid19.int., I observed that the map of India showed blue colour. And, surprisingly, Jammu and Kashmir was coloured separately in yellow. When I clicked the yellow part it showed the data of Pakistan. I noticed that one part of Jammu and Kashmir was separately coloured once again and it showed the data of China. Even the State of Arunachal Pradesh was also demarcated separately. Our Government should be more vigilant in this particular issue.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

#### **5. Need to Issue Notification Enhancing the Ceiling of Gratuity to Workers during the Intervening Period between January 2016 and March, 2018**

**SHRI M. SHANMUGAM:** The 'Gratuity' is a social security scheme and retirement benefit for all Government employees. The Seventh Central Pay Commission has enhanced ceiling of gratuity to Rs.20 lakhs from 1.1.2016 for Government employees. However, for workers, the effective date is 29th March, 2018, as per a revised notification. To address this anomaly, the ceiling limit of gratuity for workers also should be enhanced to Rs.20 lakhs during the intervening period of January, 2016 to March, 2018.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

#### **6. Need to Provide Approval and Financial Assistance to Thiruvananthapuram-Kasargod Semi-High Speed Rail Corridor (K-Rail Silver Line Project) in Kerala**

**SHRI ELAMARAM KAREEM:** The government of Kerala has proposed a semi-high speed rail corridor from Thiruvananthapuram to Kasargod called the Silver Line. This double lane rail will connect both ends of Kerala within four hours. The travel time will be reduced. Trains will run at a maximum operational speed of 200 km per hour by carrying around 80,000 passengers per day.

After feasibility study, the Railway Board had issued in-principle approval, for it. This project will reduce carbon-dioxide emission. It will create more than 50,000 direct and indirect employment during the construction phase and 11,000 direct and indirect employment during the operational phase. I request the Government of India to grant a permission to this project immediately.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

### **7. Need to Conduct OBC Census in the Country**

**\*SHRI B. LINGAIAH YADAV:** The Other Backward Class (OBC) comprises around 60 to 70 percentage of the country's population. In 2018, Shri Rajnath Singh, the then Home Minister had promised that a census for OBC will be conducted. Such a census for OBC was conducted during the British regime. But, it was not conducted in the last 75 years. It reflects the negligence of the Central Government. The States of Tamil Nadu, Telangana, Maharashtra and Odisha have passed resolutions in their respective State Assemblies urging the Central Government to conduct such a census. As the statistical data regarding the OBC are not available, the students and employees belonging to this group are being subjected to injustice. Therefore, I request the Central Government to conduct a census.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

### **8. Problems being faced by Rubber Farmers**

**SHRI JOSE K. MANI:** The rubber growing farmers of Kerala are in distress owing to the import of natural rubber, the falling price of natural rubber, and COVID pandemic. The Government of India has also brought the Rubber Promotion and Development Bill, 2022. This Bill is learnt that it is detrimental to the farmers. Similar thing has been done to the Spices Board Act. Now, the powers of the Rubber growers have been taken away and no support has been given to the rubber farmers. Only twelve days were given for inviting comments. No publicity was given for this Bill. So, please extend this

---

\* Spoke in Telugu.

time for another 30 days. Enough publicity should be given so that public can send their comments. Secondly, the rubber and the spices should be declared as an agricultural produce. And, a mechanism should be devised both by the Spices Board and the Rubber Board, so that cost of production is reviewed and a minimum price should be provided to farmers.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

### **9. Need to Reduce GST on Tendu Leaves**

**\*SHRI SUBHASH CHANDRA SINGH:** I wish to highlight the plight of 10 Lakh tendu leaf workers of Odisha. These workers belong to the tribal and SC community, out of which 80% are women. With an increase in GST to 18%, which was earlier 5%, the Government of Odisha is incurring a loss of Rs. 200 crores. It is requested that GST on Tendu leaves be reduced. Secondly, there has been imposition of GST on every item associated with the handloom, ranging from its selling price and on products like cotton, dyes and wax. Kindly look into it. Thirdly, the Ministry of Textile may consider introducing a course on handloom technology at the degree-level in the Institute of Technology at Bargarh. Sir, through you, I urge upon the Government to consider all the three issues.

### **10. Need to Use Tax Collected from Goods like Alcohol and Tobacco for Rehabilitation and De-Addiction Centres**

**DR. VIKAS MAHATME:** According to a study conducted by AIIMS in the year 2019, 14.6 percent of the country's population is consuming alcohol and tobacco. Instead of banning such discardable substances, state governments like Maharashtra are promoting them to collect more taxes. If the money received from this is used for drug de-addiction, public awareness and mental development, then the use of such substances will decrease.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

---

\* Spoke in Odiya.

**11. Need for Re-examination of UGC NET Exam for Kannada  
Conducted by the National Testing Agency (NTA)**

**DR. L. HANUMANTHAIHAH:** The University Grants Commission has outsourced the examination of regional languages to the National Testing Agency (NTA). This agency has conducted the Kannada Language Test for the post of Lecturer in Karnataka. Out of 100 questions, only 10 questions were in Kannada and 90 questions were in Hindi. It was an online exam. The system was not going well. Some students could log in and some students could not. 90 questions in the exam were not in Kannada. The candidates did not answer those questions. Now, poor and unemployed students have to apply for correction by paying a fee of Rs.1,000/- per question. I request the Government to cancel this examination and conduct the examination again so that the affected students can get justice.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

**12. Need to Address Rising Malnutrition among Children in  
Post Pandemic Period**

**DR. AMEE YAJNIK:** I request the Hon'ble Minister of Women and Child Development to look into the figures of about 70.76 lakh children included under Severely Malnourished (SAM) category and about 15.76 lakh children suffering from moderate acute malnutrition. These neglected children need immediate attention.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

## **OBSERVATIONS BY CHAIR**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Shri K.C. Venugopal and two more Members have given a Notice of Privilege against the IT Minister. I am examining it. Once I examine it, I have to seek the clarification of the Minister and then we would get back to you, Venugopalji.

Time allocation of 12 hours and 11 hours for discussion has been done by the Business Advisory Committee. Once the time was allocated, various parties were informed about the time allocation. Respective parties have been told to give names accordingly and also, if possible, mark the time that they want to give to each Member. Now, I am told that they have sent it to Members, but they are not following it. The problem is, if some speakers take more time and leave less time for their colleagues, there would be practical problems. I do not want to name any party here. I would request all the Leaders to see to it that whatever time Members have been allocated is followed by one and all.

---

## **MOTION OF THANKS ON PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS - *Contd.***

**DR. M. THAMBIDURAI:** Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I thank you for giving me an opportunity to speak on this subject. I rise to thank the Hon. President for his Address to the Parliament, which listed the achievements of Prime Minister Shri Narendra Modiji and the Government including the achievements in healthcare, infrastructure, defence, farming, and start-ups among others. I congratulate Modiji's Government for its successful fight against the COVID-19 pandemic and thank the Central Government for extending a meaningful support to the efforts of all the State Governments in India. Sir, at the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic, we were all caught unaware about what is going to happen. At that time, our hon. Prime Minister, Shri Narendra Modiji, took quick decisions and firm measures in containing the spread of virus. Sir, through Ayushman Bharat Mission, our Prime Minister is preparing the country to fight against any future healthcare crisis. I take this opportunity to thank the Central Government for the support it provided to us at that time. We

have administered 150 crore vaccines in less than a year. The Government deserves kudos for this monumental work executed effectively. Sir, India has emerged as a role model for the world in providing health care and affordable medicines to the people through the Pradhan Mantri Bhartiya Janaushadhi Pariyojana, as it has set up thousands of kendras to provide the poor with affordable medicines. Our country has exported AYUSH products worth Rs. 11,000 crores to foreign countries. In eight months between April and November, 2021, Foreign Direct Investment of 48 billion Dollars was made in India. Our foreign exchange reserves have exceeded 630 billion US dollars. People have benefited from direct cash transfer during the pandemic. These are all not small achievements. In the area of agriculture and food distribution, our country has set new records. Under the Pradhan Mantri Kisan Samman Nidhi Scheme, Rs. 1.8 lakh crores have been transferred to more than 11 crore farmer families. I register my appreciation on this historic achievement as I am also the son of a rural small farmer from a remote village of Tamil Nadu. A huge emphasis of this Government for the development of infrastructure and transport will accelerate the overall growth of the country and generate new job opportunities for several workers. The Godavari-Krishna, Krishna-Pennar and Pennar-Cauvery river-linking has been finalised. This proposal of interlinking of rivers to transfer surplus waters from Godavari-Krishna-Cauvery is a right decision. I draw the attention of the Government to the plight of Indian fishermen from my state who are continuously harassed, attacked, looted and brutalized by the Sri Lankan navy at Gulf of Mannar. I plead that our Government should take a firm policy decision to safeguard the interests of our fishermen and protect the livelihood of lakhs of poor fishermen. One way of stopping this menace could be retrieving the Katchatheevu. It was arbitrarily given, at that time but not ratified by the Parliament. But still, Katchatheevu is a part of the Indian territory. Therefore, it is high-time that we fight and get back Katchatheevu to solve the fishermen issue. Otherwise, you know, Sri Lanka is moving towards China. Relations are developing between the two countries. It is a threat to India's security. Sir, hon. President mentioned in his Address about 150th birth anniversary of V.O. Chidambaram Pillai,

125th birth anniversary of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose and said that the country is celebrating these sacred occasions. I am very thankful to the Central Government for coming forward to honour Shri V.O. Chidambaram Pillai, a freedom fighter. We, especially parties from Tamil Nadu, are all raising matter to get exemption for NEET examination, because it is affecting aspiring medical students, particularly from rural areas. 'Education' is under the Concurrent List, Since the subject is under the Concurrent List, our hands are tied. The Central Government has been enacting many laws under Concurrent List resulting in supersession of laws made by the State Legislatures. Therefore, it is high time that I request the Government of India to revisit the issue. All languages under the Eighth Schedule, including Tamil, Bengali, etc must be made national languages and official languages of this country. This is our demand also. When you are conducting examination at all India level, States must be given more powers so that admission in professional courses, such as medical, are taken up by the State Governments. Hon. President has mentioned hon. Prime Minister's vision that the Government is moving fast on building a strong foundation for the next 25 years following the mantra of Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas, Sabka Vishwas aur Sabka Prayas. We have to create India where all benefits are given to people and the country becomes self-sufficient. Therefore, I am very thankful for this opportunity to express my views.

**SHRI A. D. SINGH:** I rise to thank respected Rashtrapati ji for his very comprehensive listing of the achievements of the present Government, and the way forward. Indeed, the catalogue of success and achievements are impressive. This success will even be better if it was accompanied by social cohesion and unity. I urge the Government to inform the House about the actions that have been taken so far against those who publicly called for genocide and targeting of specific communities. The House will support strictest of action against all such individuals, irrespective of their political affiliations. We pay tribute to the 20 brave hearts who made the ultimate sacrifice to defend every inch of our land in June 2020. But the threats have not diminished. Protection of unity and sovereignty of the nation is not the work of one individual. It is also not about seeking personal glory. It

is a national duty. I would like to pay tribute to late Gen. Rawat, our first CDS, but it is disappointing that such a sensitive post has been lying vacant since his tragic accident. Momentous changes took place in our neighbourhood when a Government in Afghanistan was toppled and its friendly people had been brought under an extremist regime that denies all human and basic rights and has dragged the country into an unprecedented humanitarian crisis. We would urge the Government of India to stand firmly with the people of Afghanistan and facilitate travel and trade, and continue education of Afghans in India. Sir, India will have to learn to stand with its friends. In this increasingly multi-polar world, India will have to align itself firmly with its own national interests in its own neighbourhood and beyond.

**SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA:** I rise here to thank the Hon'ble President of India, for his Address. He has very rightly mentioned about our developments during this period in the sectors of health, infrastructure, agriculture, sports etc. I must compliment the Prime Minister Narendra Modi and his Government because within a year our Government successfully vaccinated 70 per cent of adult population. In the health sector, within this year, our country has made developments in a marvellous way. In the first wave of Covid, India was short of sanitizers, masks and medicines. But, Sir, within a year, India started manufacturing masks and other things and now, we can even export them. We have manufactured vaccines and now we are even exporting them. The Government has given priority to the agriculture sector. Even though it was Covid period, agricultural produce increased by 30 per cent. Even the horticulture production increased by 33 per cent. Farmers are getting right prices for their crops. Instead of farmers going to other places with their crops, the Government has procured them and paid enough money to them. Sir, I come from Assam. During this period, Assam also exported agricultural products to the neighbouring foreign countries. Through Bharatmala Pariyojana, the infrastructure development is being done in every part of the country. I am happy to say that I led the Indian Contingent in the Tokyo Olympic Games. I was the Chief of the Mission for Indian Contingent and for the first time, India made history. India got all-time record medals in Tokyo

Olympic Games. Sir, North-Eastern Region is very integral part of our country. This Narendra Modi Government has given an efficient transportation system, railway system to the North Eastern Region and today, I am proudly saying that the railway connectivity has reached all the capitals of North-Eastern Region, today. Assam is famous for tea production. India is getting huge amount of foreign currency from tea, I request the Government to look into this issue and give top most priority to the small tea growers of our country. It will be in the interest of the Indian economy, North-Eastern Region's economy, Assam's economy and most importantly, it will help curbing the unemployment in our country. Assam is an oil-producing State, having a huge reserves of oil and natural gas. This Government has taken the initiative to produce bio fuel gas in Numaligarh Refinery to export oil products to the other parts of the world. I would like to request that more social activity through the Petroleum Ministry should be done in Assam by giving more money under the social responsibility scheme to the North-Eastern Region to build some more hospitals, infrastructure projects, etc. As per a report of the WHO, the maximum number of cancer patients in our country are from Assam and the North-eastern Region. I would request the Government, to set up a modern super-specialty hospital in Assam. I support the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address.

**THE MINISTER OF MINORITY AFFAIRS (SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI):** The country has seen many occasions in these seven decades which are testimony to our glorious history. I am trying to draw your attention to the changes that have taken place in these eight years. It is said that today there are two Hindustans, in my understanding our India is *Ek Bharat, Shreshth Bharat*. To understand inclusive thinking, we have to come out of the idea of *Indira is India*. Today we are proud that irrespective of any political ideology, we are all proud of our India. India has made its mark in the world. 28 changes that have taken place in these eight years are coming to my mind. The biggest change since 2014 is the restoration of the dignity, credibility and honour of the post of Prime Minister in the largest democracy. Such was the situation eight years ago - the Prime Minister's Office was run from somewhere else. The

decisions of the cabinet were torn down as indiscreet. Now the prime minister of this is not weak but strong. The country's security, dignity and prosperity have strengthened under this government. The second change is that today we have come out of the negative atmosphere and talking with a positive mindset. The third change is that the legacy of cuts, corruption and commissions and the politics of appeasement has been put on hold. The deceit of appeasement has been demolished with the force of empowerment, this is the fifth change. The sixth change is that today the blockade of brokers from the corridors of power in Delhi and the lock-out on looting has been done - this government has brought this change. Seventh, there has been a big change in the politics of this country. Today, the culture of family worship has been replaced by a culture of hard work and courage. The fear of VIP culture used to tease the common man. This government ended this culture. The politics of bullying has been put to an end, this is the tenth difference. It was said that a particular sect has the right over the resources of the country. The deceit of appeasement has been demolished by this government with the power of "*Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas, Sabka Vishwas and Sabka Prayas*". Another change is that quota, permit, control, so many manipulations used to be, the money that should reach the poor of this country, it did not reach, but today farmers, labourers, women and elders get direct benefits through DBT. We used to make laws in our country, bills used to get piled up, laws were passed. More than 1,500 such bills, which were not effective but remained in the books in the form of bills, were repealed. This government made the law which was needed and also abolished the one which was not needed. This is the 14th change. Another major change is that earlier there used to be the week of riots and the month of terrorist attacks, that has been put on hold. There used to be riots, massacre of innocent people in one or the other part of the country. Along with this there was also terrorism. Even cities like Delhi, Mumbai were not safe. After coming to this government, it has been shown to the whole world that India is full of determination to protect its country, its people, its borders. When a neighbouring country resorted to any misadventure, our security forces entered that country and did a surgical strike, destroyed the terrorists. At that time also the

asking for evidence and question on the issue of national security were raised. The 18th change was that all the great men, great heroes of our country, who sacrificed for our country and its independence, were given respect. This country is indebted to all the great men who made sacrifices. This government made this change that our great heroes Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose, Sardar Vallabhbhai Patel and Babasaheb Bhimrao Ambedkar, who were neglected earlier, were given respect and told to the coming generation about them. We brought the heroes and superheroes of this country out of the one family and brought them to the level of the country and gave them respect. Another important change is that constitutional institutions - the judiciary, the Election Commission - have been said to be ineffective, hostage. There was a time when Supreme Court decisions were made and majority vote was used to nullify them. There has been a change in this government that the Supreme Court has made triple talaq a legal offence, a malpractice and we brought a law in the Parliament to give effect to the court's decision. There were 312 judgments of the Supreme Court and High Courts, which were nullified by majority vote. But this government has worked to make the decisions effective. Earlier we used to think that Article 370 can never be abolished. In all the laws that were made, it was written - 'except Jammu and Kashmir'. This government has abrogated Article 370, which cut Jammu and Kashmir from the stream of progress of the country. Today, Parliament does not need to write on any law whether it is the law of education, employment, whether it is the law of electricity, water or roads, it is 'except Jammu and Kashmir', this is a big change. Apart from this, an atmosphere of confusion and fear was created regarding the CAA. India has the responsibility of protecting the minorities of Bangladesh, Afghanistan or Pakistan. When the Taliban mentality prevailed in these countries, the respect, culture and religious rights of all the people belonging to Hindu, Sikh, Christian, Jain or whatever minority communities were in danger. Amendments were brought in the CAA at that time. At the time when the atrocities of the Taliban were going on in Afghanistan, because of this CAA, the work of bringing many Hindus, Sikhs and even those who were Muslim brothers and sisters to India was done safely. A change has

come upon all of us in view of the Corona crisis. No one knew the nature of this pandemic that hit the country. 100 years ago there was a disaster called Spanish Flu in which more than 20 million deaths occurred. Today our population is around 140-150 crores. When this crisis came in January-February, 2020, not only we, but also the developed countries of the whole world did not have any means to protect the people. Indians living abroad were being driven out of those countries. This government has made arrangements to bring back lakhs of Indians living in many countries like UAE, UK, USA, Iran etc. safely and keep them safe in the country. Most of the deaths in the last pandemic were due to starvation and lack of medicines. Our Government had made arrangements for food to more than 80 crore people of the country which is still in operation. When this government was formed, there was a propaganda of intolerance. Relations with many countries were feared to be broken. The image of the country was tarnished. Modi ji's image was tarnished. Despite this, the government did not allow any effect on the power, dignity and nationalist will-power of the country. This is the 28th change. I would say that there were many crises, but the promise made by this government to the people of the country for security, respect and prosperity of the country was not allowed to be weakened. There are many other changes that this government has made.

**SHRI ABDUL WAHAB:** I rise to oppose this Motion. Young Muslim women professionals are auctioned online. Statues of Jesus Christ were smashed and churches were attacked during Christmas. This House should unanimously condemn such incidents happening in our great country. About unemployment, it is observed that there are more than eight lakh vacancies in the Central Government. Why is the Central Government not filling up these vacancies? I am concerned about the decline of India's global stature. Today, a large section of our youth is unemployed and uneducated. A significant section of our society is being left out of our growth. There is an increasing inequality in our society both in social and economic terms. India's image as a champion of democracy and human rights is diminishing due to its increasing intolerance to minorities and intellectuals. MPLADS fund was stopped because of corona. I urge

the Government to raise the MPLADS fund. That money is going to the public.

**SHRI RAM NATH THAKUR:** For the first time, India was a pioneer in making medicine for corona epidemic and supplied medicine not only in its own country but also abroad and succeeded in saving millions of lives. For the first time, the Ministry of Defence did the work of manufacturing the equipments in India. In the matter of agriculture, the Government of India has done a unique job of planting green trees, cultivating maize, growing green vegetables and making tourist places prosperous on the banks of river Ganga, which enters Bihar through 9 States. Opening of Jan Dhan accounts has been done. Rural women should be provided with facilities so that they do not need to stay in the bank all day. So we want to request to open a bank in every panchayat. To overcome the problem of flood, the Government of India should talk to the Government of Nepal and try to build a high dam. We demand a special package for Bihar. Through 'Pradhan Mantri Garib Kalyan Anna Yojana', an effort is made so that no poor and destitute person should die of hunger. An amount of more than Rs. 1,80,000 crore has been provided to more than 11 crore farmer families through 'Kisan Samman Nidhi Yojana'. Changes have also been made in the 'Crop Insurance Scheme' so that their claims are not rejected on technical basis. Now the plan of the government is to directly purchase the produce of the farmers under DBT and the money should be deposited directly into their accounts. The government has launched the 'Pradhan Mantri Gati Shakti Yojana'. In future, rail, highway and air transport will not be developed separately, but a master plan will be prepared for them. When the government implements such schemes, while doing so, it should focus on those states which are backward in this matter. The government should make special efforts to fulfil the aspirations of the farmers, youth and provide them the means of bread, employment, so that our country becomes prosperous. The Government of India must do what is needed to restore the Judges on the basis of reservation in the courts. More than eight lakh posts are vacant in the Government of India, you should fill them.

**SHRI AJIT KUMAR BHUYAN:** I would like to know as to what happened to doubling the farm income. I would like to know what happened to disinvestment targets, 10 crore jobs and \$5 trillion economy. The pandemic has exhausted the nations but what is the relief to come out from such agonies. Agriculture and allied activities which still employ the largest bulk of the population have been left without any mention in the speech. The nation is facing terrible inflation and there is no mention of how to give relief to the middle and lower-middle classes. The subsidies on several schemes which directly benefit the common people has been reduced. 4.6 crores people have been pushed into poverty and 84 per cent of households have suffered a loss of income. Sixty-six lakhs MSMEs were closed and this has strained the people to go back to their native places but there has been no scope and incentives to employ those people at their respective places. The Government has not spelled out on the Naga Peace Solution. More than six years had gone but what is the latest update of the Naga conflict is still a mystery. Manipur and Assam's peace-loving people are still longing for a resolution of the conflict. The Government of India should take bold initiative in this direction.

**SHRI RIPUN BORA:** We have already passed three pandemics. The entire economy of our country has been badly devastated by the pandemic. The people of this country wanted that there should be some ways and means as to how to recover, how to develop, how to rebuild our economy, but, nothing has been mentioned in the President's Address. You are saying that we are leading our country to five trillion dollar economy, but during these seven years, nearly five crore people have again gone below the poverty line. Not a single word has been mentioned in the President's Address as to how to tackle the problem of unemployment and the price rise. The purchasing power of the people of our country has hugely declined. They say that 80 crore people have been given free rice under Pradhan Mantri Garib Kalyan Yojana, but the reality is that in the Global Hunger Index, India's number has come to 101 from 94. One more important thing is about women empowerment. 85 per cent of the household women have been given Ujjawala gas. But simply giving Ujjawala gas, there is no women empowerment. After taking

the first cylinder, the women have not been able to afford to take the second cylinder. The cylinder is lying in the kitchen of poor women. What is the meaning of women empowerment if we cannot protect our women? There is 18 per cent increase of suicide of girl children in the age from 14 to 18. In Assam, two private sector undertakings, two paper mills have been closed down. Not only that, from the last 14 years till today, not a single mega project was sanctioned for the North-Eastern Region. Normally our military is used against foreign aggression, but our military has killed our own people and nothing has been done. If we cannot protect the Scheduled castes and Scheduled tribes, then, where is empowerment? Where is development? We have not given scholarships to the Scheduled Caste students for the last several years. You have violated our rights by applying Pegasus.

**SHRI JAWHAR SIRCAR:** India, today, is at the crossroads as it has never been before. Indian history is going to be judged on what we do today and what we do for tomorrow. Our polity is shattered. Our economy has never gone through such a bad patch. The first two problems are inequality or inequity and joblessness. We need not quibble over the exact number of unemployed. Those who are without job, whatsoever, will forget security. The rate of unemployment has never reached such a devastating portion as it reached today. About 15 crore Indians were lifted out of poverty in ten years, from 2006 onwards. But, along with that, we will also have to see that 14 crores have been pushed into poverty in the last two years. Without an equitable economy, what does it matter whether the Indian economy reaches 3 trillion or 30 trillion? The Government has come up with the National Monetization Pipeline (NMP). Twenty categories of national assets would be handed over for a lease period. What guarantee do we have that after the so-called lease period we shall be getting back those goods that we gave them. Six airports were privatized. The LIC is the crown jewel of India. It has six lakh agents and employees. The LIC, which had been built such a solid institution, is now being diluted in favour of American insurance companies. I look upon just two sectors which ensure that the next generation of Indians are better than what we are and what we were. The contribution of the Government to education was 1.07 per cent of the

GDP. The poor States, the cash-strapped States have contributed 3.31 per cent of their money. Education as a percentage of the GDP, has been going down year after year. When we talk about health, India will not forget those devastating scenes of corpses being burnt on pavements and in parks, corpses being thrown into rivers to hide figures. You talk of Ayushman Bharat, you talk of insurance covered. All the money has gone to insurance companies. Look at the state of institutions, the public institutions that uphold democracy, Telecom Regulatory Authority of India. The people's verdict must be remembered. VVPAT was introduced and forced by the Supreme Court to be operationalized. The CBI and ED were excellent professional services. Their professionalism is being destroyed by putting henchmen at the top and giving them extension after extension in collusion with legislation. Look at the conduct of the CAGs. Indians have come together as a civilization, because they felt it was conducive. It must not be turned into an instrument of hegemony. BSF's jurisdiction has been extended without consulting the State. economic grants to the States are being dealt with in a wrong manner. The officers of the Indian Administrative Service can't be forced to draw them out from their cities and work under the Centre. Out of the 6,500 posts, 1,500 posts are lying vacant. They should be filled urgently. The States must not be bullied. The entire thing is being run on controls and arrogance. Even the linking of Aadhaar to Voter ID is another indication of this mentality. The Central Vista is an arrogant display of hubris. There was no need of it. It would have been much better if the Rajpath had been renamed in somebody's name. Draconian rule extends now to snooping and Pegasus is the greatest example of how this State has become a surveillance State. This Government is not worthy of further discussions because its every act spells out the deep hubris. Indian civilization will fly on its heterogeneity, not on any enforced homogeneity.

**SHRI R.S. BHARATHI:** The President has said that we have to learn lessons from the past but this Government did not learn anything from the past. The Covid-19 pandemic situation was totally mismanaged by this Government resulting in extreme miserable conditions of the migrant workers. Many of them died on their way.

The President has said about the empowerment of women. While the Rajya Sabha has passed the Bill for 33 per cent reservation for women, it is still pending in the Lok Sabha. Imposition of NEET exam by this Government has resulted in scandal after scandal. In Tamil Nadu, 13 students of the backward communities and the poor people have committed suicide. To scrap this NEET or to exempt Tamil Nadu from NEET examination, the Tamil Nadu State Legislature unanimously passed a resolution and was sent to the Governor but the Governor has neither sent it to the President nor has he passed any comments on it for four months.

**DR. SASMIT PATRA:** On behalf of my leader Hon'ble Chief Minister Shri Naveen Patnaik ji, Biju Janata Dal and my party, we support this vote of thanks. The ideal of equality is not being followed in reality today. It has been continuously demanded by our Chief Minister from the Central Government that 6 lakh houses for 6 lakh families of Odisha, which are mostly of tribal brothers and sisters, should be included in Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana-Gramin but the housing portal of the Central Government is not being opened to Odisha for three years. This portal is opened for those states which are probably most loved by the Central Government. I hope the Government will look into this. The President's Address mentions 'Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas, Sabka Vishwas and Sabka Prayas' but today in this federal system 'Sabka Saath' is not being thought, only a few states are being thought of together. 'Sabka Vikas' is not being thought. The development of Odisha also needs attention. Instead of 'Sabka Vishwas', trust of only a few states is being taken. Odisha's trust should also be taken. The state of Odisha is moving ahead with perseverance under the leadership of Hon'ble Chief Minister, Shri Naveen Patnaik. But when it comes to Odisha, it is denied. 900 lakh metric tonnes of food grains have been procured by the Central Government but it is refusing to buy 22 lakh metric tonnes of parboiled rice from Odisha. Today the discussion of federal system seems to be declining somewhere. The subject of the federal system is not just the subject of Odisha. This will create a question mark on the federal system in the coming days. If the Government is alert, then it should act on these demands.

**DR. K. KESHAVA RAO:** We are disappointed with the Address. There is nothing new. Ever since the ruling party had come to power, the division of secular Indians and radical Hindu nationalists has sharpened. And the greatest threat today to this country is the politics of polarization. There is an urgent need to bring a special law to tackle the problem of hate speech as recommended by the hon. Supreme Court and the Viswanathan Committee. The partisan attacks on India's independent political institutions have intensified. Opposition parties have become extremely wary of defending pluralism and secularism which needs to be done but is not being done. Hatred and violence against minority communities have flared up. Polarization in India is more toxic today than it has ever been in the past, and it shows no signs of abating. We also got ignored. This does not mean that by talking about only this, I am ignoring the caste division, the division which is possible in the name of caste and language. The current wave of polarization has its roots in the colonial period. One strain of thinking envisioned India as a secular nation, in which membership was defined not by one's faith but by one's place of birth. We have to be a multinational nation. We have never been a nation at all. The word 'nation' is not used in the Constitution. It is 'Union of States'. We are trying for all these years and centuries to see how we can find some kind of unity in these diversities. we want to be one because we have been brought in and we are trying to do it. Democracy is not merely a form of Government, but it is primarily more of an associated living. The Government has attempted to destroy the secular nature of the Indian Constitution by changing the Citizenship Law and communalized through the passage of CAA and NRC. This is what exactly we are trying to talk. The federal structure is also under threat. The Government, through the passage of several Bills, is trying to destroy the essence of Indian Federalism. The proposed electricity power Bill will not only take away the power vested in the State Governments but also give an undue advantage to those States that have the BJP Government as the ruling party. The proposed amendment in electricity Bill allows the entry of private players in the power sector. The amendment seeks to improve the economic efficiency of power distributors. The private entrants would

supply power through the infrastructure developed by the State-owned PSUs while the profit-making areas would be poached by the private players. The obligation to provide the electricity to rural areas would solely fall on the State-owned distribution. This is a power electricity Bill which is coming. Since the creation of our State Telangana, the power capacity has increased multiple times. The effective Governance shown by TRS Party in Telangana has not only electrified villages but also provided quality assurance. This Bill would attempt to put meters at every pump set. It means that there is a threat lingering on the farmers that one day or the other, the meters would be rented. The Southern States are being ignored according to me. The Government's persistent efforts to sideline Southern States in the distribution of tax avenues is evident. The South Indian States have taken numerous policy measures to ensure population control yet collecting a higher portion of taxes. However, the distribution of funds to the States by the Government fails to provide any incentive to States who have performed well economically. The State of Telangana does not get a single institution. The discrimination and neglect of Telangana are blatant in the distribution of Higher Education Institutions. Seven IIMs, Seven IITs, Four NIDs, 16 IIITs and 157 medical colleges are allocated to various States but Telangana drew a blank. The Indian federal structure is under threat. This takes me to the crisis that the farmers are facing. During eleven months of agitation by the farmers all the farming community was with them. What happened was the Government brought the Farm Bills without consulting the States. The subject of agriculture belongs to the States. Telangana, today is the second largest producer of grain. We have attained that because of our irrigation facilities, power and, naturally, the farmers. The Government passed the Farms Laws without consultation with the State Governments. These Acts were against the federal structure of the country as agriculture falls under the State List. There was no mention of MSP in the law and there is no legal backing by law, and even the Speech does not make any mention of this issue even after so much of agitation. The Government would double the income of the farmers, but it has certainly doubled the cost of the inputs. The allocation of funds from the Union Budget has

substantially declined. Everybody knows that unemployment is the greatest challenge that the nation is facing, but is there a single mention about unemployment in this Speech? The Government is totally oblivious of what is needed in this country and what the people are asking for. The closure of business houses and laying off of employees has led to a sharp increase in the unemployment rate. It is important to note that the unemployment rate was already quite high. The Government cannot take the excuse of Covid at this point of time. The frustration of unemployment can be understood. The unorganized sector also needs to be taken into consideration. There is not a single agency which has the credibility as to what exactly the position today in the country is. This takes me to one sentence that is about the failure to 'Make in India'. The new Constitution that we are proposing to a nation for debate, for a discussion, not for acceptance. We will debate it.

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** I conditionally support the Motion of Thanks to the President's Address. If the Government accepts our amendments, I will not mind. The policies of the Government, the action taken on the policies and the future plan are mentioned in it. In a democracy, the policies of the Government depend on the party that governs, what is its ideology. In seven years the gap between rich and poor has widened. The rich went on getting richer and the poor went on getting poorer. At the same time, due to bigotry in the society, bitterness kept increasing. On one hand, while the Government has not done any work in the interest of the poor in economic policies, on the other hand, it has hindered the harmony of society and the unity in our diversity. The Government collects direct taxes from the competent people and indirect taxes from the general public. Taxing less than the rich and taxing the poor more is the ideology of the government's economic policies. Unemployment kept rising. It is also not mentioned in the Address. By reducing the subsidy, it put the burden on the common man by increasing the tax. The subsidy went to the common man. Corporate tax did not make any difference. Why does the Government not impose super rich tax on those who have earned more and more money, whose wealth has increased even in the time of Covid? This

Government has not been working for the benefit of the poor. This Government is anti-farmer. Three anti-farmer Bills were brought, they were also opposed by the farmers and finally those three Bills had to be withdrawn. The Government had talked about doubling the income of farmers but it is not mentioned anywhere. No discussion was held with the trade unions regarding the labour laws of the workers. The manner in which the Government got those three anti-farmer Bills passed has been contrary to democratic traditions. This Government is anti-poor, anti-scheduled castes, anti-scheduled tribes, anti-farmers and anti-labourers. You are talking of 'Amrit Mahotsav' but you have not even mentioned in 'Amrit Mahotsav' those who took part in the freedom struggle. If not Mahatma Gandhi and Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru, then at least you could have taken the names of Shaheed Bhagat Singh, Ashfaqulla Khan and Chandrashekhar Azad. This is fascist thinking under which such individuals and groups are considered enemies who do not follow their ideals and the one supports their ideals are considered patriots. This government has violated every democratic value. I request through you that the government should accept some advice from us also because in a democratic system, unless you work in consultation, the government cannot run properly.

**SHRI KAMAKHYA PRASAD SINGH:** I stand in support of the Motion of Thanks to the President's address. I thank the Prime Minister that the vaccine developed in India, has been approved by the World Health Organization. The opposition should also appreciate the honest efforts of the government at times. Unfortunately, they are only trying to find fault all the time. This Government has tried to provide employment even for the street vendors under "Pradhan Mantri Swanidhi Yojana". What is happening in Manipur today? Today, after 75 years of independence, the railway line is reaching there. There was such a condition in Manipur that no one could go there. Today there is an atmosphere of peace in Manipur, elections are being held well there. This should also be appreciated. Just as there was Jammu and Kashmir in our country, so was the North-East. While going from the North-East, people used to ask us where do you live? Do you live in the forest? Jorhat is also a city in Assam, now there are

daily flights going there. There is a daily flight going to Imphal. Doesn't it show that things are changing in the North-East. Trains are now going to Nagaland. I would request the government to run interstate buses there as well. This government is moving ahead with the motto of Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas. For the first time, on the instructions of the Prime Minister, FCI and five other organizations are buying food grains in Assam. Assam MPs are sitting here, right now FCI and five other organizations are procuring rice. We thank the government for this. You are repeatedly talking about demonetisation. No poor person is unhappy with demonetisation. Only the one who had black money is unhappy. Now look at infrastructure development-for the first time after independence, the railway line is reaching Manipur. A few days ago a boy went missing near the China border. Through the efforts of this government, that boy came back from there. For this we should praise the government. AIIMS is being built there. Our Prime Minister had laid the foundation stone of this AIIMS and its construction is nearing completion. A medicinal hub is also being developed there for medicine. I would like to say that Manipur and Tripura, which were just like dead bodies, are getting back on their feet and have come up on the map of the whole country. In the President's address, the matter of North-East of our people has been given space which will be etched in history. I end my speech by supporting the Prime Minister and his government for all their praiseworthy work.

*Discussion not concluded.*

**P. C. MODY,**  
*Secretary-General.*

[rssynop@sansad.nic.in](mailto:rssynop@sansad.nic.in)

**ERRATA TO THE SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE  
DATED 2<sup>nd</sup> February, 2022**

<b>Page No.</b>	<b>Line No.</b>	<b>Correction</b>
11	12	Read 'CHAIRMAN' for 'CHAIRMANMAN'.
24	3	Remove 'is' after 'which'.
24	6	Remove 'and' after 'Jammu'.
24	12	Read 'Jallianwala' for 'Jallianwalan'.