

RAJYA SABHA

*SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE

(Proceedings other than Questions and Answers)

Friday, February 05, 2021 / Magha 16, 1942 (Saka)

MOTION OF THANKS ON PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS - *Contd.*

SHRI BINOY VISWAM, Continuing his unfinished speech dated 04.02.2021, said: The President's address mentions about the measures that the Government had taken to help the poor during the COVID days. Despite that during those days the poor migrant labourers were killed at railway track after being hit by a train. It speaks a lot about the plight of the poor and the Government has no reason to tell them that their interests and their concerns are taken care of, which is not at all true. The Government termed the COVID and the crisis in the economy as an 'act of God'. It cannot be termed as an 'act of God'. Of course, in the lockdown days, the country, as a whole, faced a lot of difficulties. But the economy was trembling down even before the COVID and the lockdown happened. In March, 2020, the economy fell down to the level of 3.1 per cent. In March, 2018, it was 8.2 per cent. From 8.2 per cent in March, 2018 to 3.1 per cent in the beginning of the lockdown itself speaks that under the BJP Government, the economy was in a shambles. The Government should not put the blame on God. God cannot be so cruel. In fact, the policies of the Government are responsible. The

*This Synopsis is not an authoritative record of the proceedings of the Rajya Sabha.

Government should admit its failures. The Private Final Consumption Expenditure collapsed to 2.7 per cent in March, 2020. This was the lowest since 2012. A sum of 20 lakh crore of rupees was earmarked by the Government but that money did not reach the people of the country. In fact, it was a gimmick with figures. This was only two lakh crore of rupees. The most important issue is unemployment. So, there should be a Bhagat Singh Employment Scheme to address this gravest issue. During COVID days, the profits of the corporate houses rose up to the level of 35 per cent. If we take the income of the 100 billionaires, the money is enough to give to 138 million poorest of the poor a sum of Rs. 94,045 but the Government is not keen on that. Therefore, I cannot support this Motion.

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: The President's address mentions about various government policies. For the last one year, the whole world has faced a lot of problems due to coronavirus infection. The Central Government and the State Governments have confronted together this huge crisis. I would like to thank all the doctors, health workers, police personnel, municipal workers, sanitation workers, government officials on my behalf and on behalf of the whole country. The dedication of these people has saved us from this crisis. Corona virus has caused about one lakh 55 thousand deaths. Today, thanks to our doctors and medical professionals, the mortality rate is less than one per cent. It is a matter of great pride for us to launch the vaccination programme. During the COVID crisis, our country has suffered a lot of economic loss, people have lost their jobs, small businesses have been hit and many businesses have been shut down. We have to fight it together and create more employment opportunities for the people. The ongoing peasant movement is a matter of concern for our country. We need to think about it. The Government says that it has enacted new laws for the well-being of farmers. If you think about the well-being of the farmers, it is welcome. More green revolutions will have to be started in our country. When last time these ordinances were brought in the House, we asked the Government to refer them to the Select Committee. If a wider consultation had been held on these ordinances, the peasant

agitation would not have happened around Delhi. To resolve this issue, Shri Prakash Singh Badal, Shri Sharad Pawar, Shri H.D. Deve Gowda ji and Shri Rajnath Singh ji should be consulted, who have worked in the field of agriculture throughout their lives. It would probably have been better for us, if we had included all such people in this matter. Sharad Pawar ji wrote to the states that there is a need to amend the agricultural law. He requested the states to give their comments on this issue so that the Bill could be brought in the Parliament. According to this draft Bill, the state governments were empowered with regard to the mandi committee and the state government could levy fees etc. Mandi committees had the power to resolve disputes. Market committees were empowered to issue licenses for agricultural trade. But, the new law makes a provision that agribusiness remains out of the ambit of mandi system. Today's law restricts the APMC and the state government from collecting fees etc. from the private market. In the present Bill, SDM and other higher officials have been empowered to settle the dispute. As a result, the farmers will have to make several rounds of government offices. In the current Bill, the Union Government has the right to issue licenses to those who are not part of the agri-trade. If the government brings in a new law to address the issue of farmers, everyone will support it.

SHRI SANJAY RAUT: Today, the person who speaks the truth in our country is branded as a traitor. The person who asks the question to the Government is charged with sedition. Several eminent persons have been charged with sedition. A number of journalists reporting at the Singhu border have been booked for sedition. Though, you have got a thumping majority, yet the country is not run with arrogance. Today, you defame the person who condemns you. Similarly, attempts are being made to discredit the farmers' agitation. I think this is not good for the country's reputation, farmers and all of us. On 26th January, the tricolour was insulted at the Red Fort and the whole nation is saddened by it, but its culprit has not been caught yet. Today more than 200 farmers are incarcerated in Tihar Jail in this case and they are facing trial for sedition. More than a hundred youth agitators are missing. But, no action is taken against a TV anchor

who has breached our official secret. He informed everyone about the Balakot strike in advance. But you have given him protection. It is a matter of national security. He also spoke about a cabinet minister. You should not shield him. The President has spoken of solidarity in his address. But for the last three months, the Government has been trying to break the solidarity of the peasant movement. Thousands of farmers are fighting for their rights at Ghazipur, Singhu border and you see sedition in it. The whole country is with farmers today, so it is not fair to brand them as traitors. The farmers of Punjab are fighting for their rights, so it is not fair to call them Khalistani.

SHRI SATISH CHANDRA MISRA: You have put obstacles to stop the agitation, to stop the protest of the farmers. Gun wielding soldiers have been posted, water cannon are being used, tear gas shells are being lobbed. You have stopped water supply, food supply for the farmers. You have even shut down the toilets and didn't even think that there are women among the protesters. It is a huge violation of human rights. The farmers do not like these laws. You should leave your ego and withdraw these three laws. The Government gives the farmers Rs. 500 per month and says that we have given thousands of crores of rupees to the farmers. You want to buy them with these 500 rupees per month and want to impose these laws on them. The farmers are scared that you will snatch their land permanently through these laws. Today you are preparing to sell the public sector banks. When you are trying to sell even the public sector banks, the farmers are also scared about their fate. There are several loopholes in these three laws. In these laws, you have fixed a time limit of one month for appeal and review for the farmers, whereas there is no limit for review for the industrialists and contractors. The farmers are fighting for the MSP. If you want to give MSP, then why you haven't made any mention of the MSP in the laws? The community for whose welfare you are talking, they themselves are saying that it is not in our favour, do not impose it on us. But you say that we will implement it. Therefore, we demand that these three laws should be withdrawn, Swaminathan Report should be implemented and legal provisions should be made to give MSP for all the crops.

Stern action should be taken against the people who insulted the tricolor at Red Fort on 26th January. Today, the unemployment has reached a very high level in the country. You have formulated an education policy in which you ask a PHD degree holder to teach the nursery class children. The decision taken by you to sell LIC is very dangerous. Today, you are selling it also to the private parties. It is not fair. There is a need to surge ahead in the health sector. Linear X-ray machine is required for the treatment of cancer. It is manufactured in the foreign countries and only two companies manufacture this machine. Attention should be paid to this fact. Import duty on MRI, CT scan etc. should be stopped, taxes should not be levied.

SHRI ABDUL WAHAB: I rise to oppose this Motion of Thanks. I also agree with the concerns of the Members from the Opposition parties on the farmers' issue and protest. When the Covid issue came, the first thing what our Prime Minister did was to just revoke the MPLADS funds. Even the money which is due to us in the year 2020 is not given. This is the only money through which we are getting some credibility amongst the people. So, please reinstate the MPLADS funds. I would like to say one more thing which is regarding vaccine. Vaccines are first given to medical and Service people. I request our Prime Minister to give the vaccine, in the first phase itself, to, at least MPs, MLAs and Panchayat members. We are going around. I already had Corona and for one month I was in hospital.

SARDAR SUKHDEV SINGH DHINDSA: I am, straightaway, going to speak on the farmers' agitation. When these ordinances were issued, I had written a letter to the Prime Minister that these are not in favour of farmers. Therefore, these should be withdrawn. This agitation doesn't belong to the farmers only, all the people of the society have extended their support to it. The agitation of farmers has been lingering over four months now, they have been sitting on the borders for more than two months, 11 meetings have been held so far, but with no outcome. I feel that they should get justice. Their demand should be met. It was very sad to see the tricolor

being insulted on 26 January. There is something being spread in the media that is hurting the communal harmony of Hindus and Sikhs. All regional parties want the federal system, while it is being weakened. The Department of Agriculture is a state subject, but the Laws are being framed by the Union Government. The only solution to this problem is that the Prime Minister should listen to them in a respectable way to find out a solution. My request is to start MSP in a scientific way. I want to bring this topic to everyone's attention that this subject should not be looked at on the basis of caste. A farmer is a farmer. If it is of state, then it is of state, but it should not involve caste.

DR. VINAY P. SAHASRABUDDHE: Our Agriculture Minister has initiated dialogue with them 11-12 times and still we are ready to talk. But this does not mean that you do not show some flexibility. We have shown flexibility. We have proposed to defer the laws for one and half year, perhaps for the first time the government has adopted this approach. You also do this. We have a feeling of respect for all agitators, feeling of honour towards all the agitators, no one should make a wrong comment about it. But this does not mean that this House is should be taken for granted. This will be harmful to the democratic process, we should also realize it. We were called the Backward Districts, which were the most backward districts, we have converted them into aspiration districts and it is not just a game of words, it has also done a lot of work for that. Regarding the Singhbhum district from where the mineral originates, the amount found there is, 'that is at the disposal of the district authority, this is devolution of power.' This hardly matters that which state has power, which is not the subject, this is what is a good governance. In an annual report of the Ministry of Home Affairs, it was stated that the number of incidents in Naxal-affected areas in 2010 was 2,213, which has come down to 230 now. When I talk about security, naturally, the issue of security resources also comes up. We all know that the manner in which the government has worked on the economic front is commendable. We have also done a very good job in foreign policy area in the last six years. Whether it is vaccine diplomacy or the

matter of increasing soft power, I believe that this country has pledged to pay attention to all these subjects in a very good way. On the occasion of the 150th birth anniversary celebrations of Mahatma Gandhi, a webinar was organized in the form of 'weaving relations through textile traditions', which was attended by the Queen of Bhutan, the First Lady of Korea and the Textiles Minister of Bangladesh. We also want to further highlight our relationship in the world through art like textile. The Indian students educated in India, who went abroad are playing vital roles in their respective countries. We have for those alumni, organised an 'Association of Alumni of Indian Universities'. We are moving forward taking resort to development diplomacy. We are based on the concept of 'Vasudhaiva Kutumbakam', the whole world is a family. Our friends in opposition say that don't make Israel your friend, Palestine would be angry'. We can make both the countries friends. During the discussion on the budget regarding public sector banks, they said that we were selling family silver but unfortunately it came out to be family aluminium. If we move forward not taking resort to populism, we can discuss on the reforms in many ways. We have taken a large number of communities of the world with us, be it the Organisation of Islamic Countries. The number of awards and respect conferred upon our Prime Minister in the gulf countries, had never ever been conferred on any prime minister of India before. We have made innovative efforts to increase the income of apple farmers of Jammu and Kashmir by linking apple trade with NAFED. We have created a new post of Chief of Defence Staff as a result thereof some pleasant results are being seen. We are also working on Self-Reliant Defence Estate keeping in view the Self-Reliant India. We are giving due importance to ladies' participation in defence services. We want all to be together and all to be developed seeking everyone's confidence. We are moving fast towards Self-Reliance and doing away with the backlog of transformation.

***SHRI PARTAP SINGH BAJWA:** Loopholes are there in these laws, why don't you take them back. Crops are being procured by the agencies of Punjab from the Food Corporation of India as we don't impose taxes on our farmers. Being a Punjabi and a Sikh, I condemn the whole incidents. Who will teach us nationalism? Our ninth Guru, Guru Tegh Bahadur Ji Maharaj sacrificed his life for Kashmiri Brahmins. We are being called anti-national! I demand that one sitting Judge of the Supreme Court may be appointed to inquire into the matter within two months in a time bound manner and reveal the forces behind it. Had not been there Guru Gobind Singh, India would have been far different from what it looks today. The Government also wants to divide, intimidate, threaten some nationalist people. This is not right. Punjabis and especially Sikhs can accept what you say, if it is said with love, but these communities are not afraid of fear, gun, cannon. So, I request that the Government withdraw these black laws and bring new Bills. These should be sent to the Select Committee where all stakeholders will be consulted. The Government must bring laws for the benefit of farmers and we will support moving a step further. Let us create a new history.

SHRI RAKESH SINHA: To know the hon'ble Prime Minister, one has to go out of Delhi, Mumbai, Kolkata and visit small villages. His personality can be assessed only by going there. The Padma Awards were instituted in 1954 in this country. These were introduced when the Constituent Assembly abolished the titles of Rai Bahadur and Khan Bahadur. The provisions of Article 16 (1) in Fundamental Rights were implemented so that there is no discrimination between us. In 1954, the Government thought that the people who do such things in public life, which would benefit the society, the nation and promote the nation, should be given awards, not titles. Till now, 'Tantra' was dominating and 'Gan' was down in the 'Gantantra'. But, when the Government was formed under the leadership of Narendra Modi ji in 2014, since then there has been a

* Spoke in Punjabi.

massive change. Now 'Gan' dominates over 'Tantra'. I want to say to the opposition that your credibility in the public is coming to an end due to the symptom of dark truth and white lies. Get out of it. After independence, in 1958 the first law enacted was the Armed Forces (Special Powers) Act. The Unlawful Activities (Prohibition) Act was enacted in 1969, the Maintenance of Internal Security Act (MISA) was enacted in 1971. The National Security Act was enacted in the 1980. TADA was enacted in 1985. Many people were jailed under TADA. Majrooh Sultanpuri ji was jailed for two years for criticizing accepting the membership of the Commonwealth. But about our Government, the heads of many countries are saying that we have moved out of COVID nationalism and entered COVID globalism. On the question of humanitarianism, our Government works rising above selfishness and diplomacy. Hon'ble Prime Minister's speeches are India-centric, Indian culture-centric. Our Government is moving forward with de-colonisation of Indian mind, de-europeanization of ideas, de-europeanization of the administrative structure. For the first time in so many years, research on our languages, our culture at the National Research Foundation has become a new tradition of India. I want to tell the opposition not to do politics in the matter of republic, India's identity and sovereignty.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: The policies and achievements of the Government have been mentioned in detail in the Address of the hon'ble President. Very big claims have been made on which doubts arises. The Corona pandemic is an unprecedented crisis for the entire world. This has affected India and every country in the world. India as a nation has faced this challenge. The Central Government and the State Governments have fight this together. Before this COVID, the economy of India had collapsed but after the lockdown due to COVID, the situation got worse. Many people lost their jobs, their wages, their incomes, their families were devastated and their businesses closed forever. In such circumstances, the farmers were forced to fight for their justice and rights. The Government of India is responsible for this situation. The whole country is hurt by the incident of Red Fort. It should be investigated impartially. This

Address is monotonous and a disappointing citation of the Government. The unnecessary mention of disputed farm laws of the Government in this is unfortunate. A struggle, movement is going on in the country regarding these farm laws, but these have been praised in this Address. Nothing can be more painful than this. In this Address, big claims have been made but there is no mention of India's foreign policy in it. Lakhs of migrant labourers were suddenly disturbed after the lockdown. There is no mention about them. It is a matter of insensitivity and I condemn it too. It is the responsibility of the Government to listen to the voice of the people. Today the Government is declaring the protest a crime. It is not fair to suppress the voice of the people with the power of governance and police. What the Government has claimed about our economy is not correct. You say that you have done what other countries of the world have not done. Countries like UK, Germany and USA gave more than five trillion dollars. Our aspiration of becoming five-trillion-dollar economy, seems no longer possible by 2030, because in the year 2022 we will reach where we were in the year 2019. Therefore, I urge the government not to make a false claim. I want to tell the government through you that till the money goes into people's hands, the situation will not improve. It is not a matter of demand and production, it is a matter of consumption that will create business, create industry. Who will buy the product when there is no money. It is important to understand that there are many sectors of our economy which are completely stressed, will take time to revive. In relation to the pandemic, I think that the circumstances that appears before the nation, are seen from a national perspective. I calculated the vaccination that is going on right now. This is going to take seven years for the 30 crores people to be vaccinated. If we talk of science and if anyone gave a scientific attitude to this country, it is the first Prime Minister Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru. Governments come and go in a free country, but the country keeps working, the institutions of the country continue to work. It is not good to say that we are great and not you. Today the country has given you a mandate, so you are expected to take that work forward, you will carry forward that work more quickly. These vaccine institutions were formed in the 1960s

and today India has become the largest vaccine manufacturer in the world. You should not have brought these agricultural laws by ordinance. No one was consulted on this. Every rule has been violated. Bring ordinance in the pandemic and pass it this way, not to listen to anyone's voice, it is not a democracy. Please do introspection, don't make it a prestige issue. Repeal these laws. The constitutionality of the laws that are made is under question. I say and appeal from this floor that whatever is constitutional, the constitutionality of the laws, whether the Citizenship (Amendment) Bill or the farm laws, must be decided immediately. I urge the honourable government not to blame the farmer. The incident which took place on 26 January should be investigated by the sitting judge of the Supreme Court. All the farmers have condemned it, we have condemned it. We all condemn what happened at the Red Fort. If anybody disrespects our tricolor today, the whole country will stand united. Do not make it nationalism that the person who adds voice to your voice is a patriot and we all are traitors. The Constitution has given the right to movement in the Republic. In the movement, the government can neither obstruct, nor deny this right of demonstration. This is a fundamental right. Follow the ideals of Honorable Vallabhbhai Patel. You remove those barbed wire, fill those pits which have been dug, remove the barrier, this is free India. Food provider of free India has come, respect him. In the next session of Parliament, bring the bill after discussing with all stakeholders and send it to the committee, it will give an opportunity to talk to all. Keep the persons who tell the truth, if you have sycophant and smoothie in their place, it causes great harm. Whatever happens here today, the whole world sees. Our image should not be of a violent country and a repressive regime.

SHRI SHAMSHER SINGH MANHAS: For the first time, the country has seen a government that says that every head should have a roof, every habitation should have a paved road, everyone should get clean drinking water, everyone should get gas, everyone should get toilets, everyone should get health facility, everyone should get nutrition etc. There should be no discrimination on the basis of region, sect, caste, high and low; every plan should be completed in a

specified time frame with a specific goal. The government is preparing and encouraging every sector to discharge this role according to its capacity, efficiency and efficiency. There have been such conspiracies in different parts of the world, as have tried to stop pace of the country's progress. In the present scenario too, I see similar intrigues against India. In 1947, when India became independent, our Jammu -Kashmir state was not a slave. But the first Prime Minister, Shri Jawahalar Nehru, somehow joined hands with Sheikh Abdullah and imposed Article 370 there. Thus, an attempt was made to isolate it from India. This state could also be annexed in India, but this could not be done due to Article 370. Before 1953, there were two legislations, two symbols and two heads in Jammu and Kashmir. Two legislations, i.e. the Constitution of India was not applicable there. Two symbols, i.e, the tricolor were not hoisted in Jammu and Kashmir, and the two heads, that is, the Prime Minister was elected separately. Sardar Patel tried his best to annex Jammu and Kashmir with India, but Nehruji did not allow him to do so. Due to this decision of Nehruji, such situations were created in Jammu and Kashmir that there was a movement in the entire state. That region had to fight continuously till 1953. Only then, Jammu-Kashmir got a Prime Minister, that is, the Prime Minister of India. Just like you have to take a visa to go to another country, similarly for the first time you had to get a permit to go to Jammu and Kashmir. Today you will reach Jammu and Kashmir immediately by bus, train or ship. Thousands of tourists visit Kashmir. Jammu - Kashmir and Ladakh used to be a princely state. Two-thirds of this area was of Ladakh and Jammu and the smallest area was of Kashmir. Kashmiri rulers discriminated against Jammu-Kashmir. Development was not attempted there. About 80 percent amount of the tax was spent in Kashmir and barely two percent was spent in Ladakh. How long will they ignore Jammu and Ladakh in this way. We still call Jammu and Kashmir the crown jewel of Mother India. The largest tourist destination in India is Jammu-Kashmir. The maximum amount of Rs. 28,400 crores in Jammu has been provided for setting up industries only. If large industries had been set up in Jammu, Kashmir and Ladakh, more than 8 lakh people would not have been unemployed

there. If Jammu and Kashmir is made better, then we can collect a lot of taxes and promote our Jammu and Kashmir.

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: The President's Address is a government speech. Because of being a government speech, it is necessary to raise even minor mistakes of the government and keep them in front of the public and the House. The history of the country is a witness to the struggle of the farmers and the Congress has full participation in this history. All our great leaders have already made this point. Within a month of coming to power, Modi government ordered all the states that if any state government would give a bonus of even one rupee above the support price to the farmers, the purchase of food grains at the support price in that state will be stopped. After this exploitative order of Modi government, all the state governments stopped giving bonus to Annadata above the support price. They conspired for the capitalists to take over the peasants' lands. Rahul Gandhi ji got the cost of land acquisition in the UPA government doubled and four times. But to nurture the capitalists and exploit the farmers, the Modi government issued an ordinance in December 2018, conspiring to abolish that law. At that time the whole country opposed it. Later the Modi government had to withdraw the ordinance. This is a big win, we have to try for it. They have done all the things against the farmers. The Modi government only promised to double the income of the farmers but has never given 50 percent profit on the cost. The Modi government never implemented the Swaminathan Commission report. The support prices of crops had been increased by 219 percent during the tenure of the Congress government. In contrast, during the Modi government, the support prices of staple crops were increased by only 40 per cent and 42 per cent. Under the Pradhan Mantri Crop Insurance Scheme, the rich collected a premium of Rs. 99,073 for crop insurance and paid only Rs. 26,121 to the farmers. Under the Kisan Samman Nidhi, the Modi government had promised to give Rs. 6,000 to farmers every year, but the cost which has been increased today is at least Rs. 15,000 per hectare, whereas only Rs. 6,000 is being given to the farmer. There are a total of 14 crore 65 lakh farmers but the fact is that 6 crore

people out of them have not received even a single penny. Their all the three laws are anti-farming. These are black laws, today all are opposing them. These laws are not in their interest, but farmers are being harassed and attempts are being made to divide them. You are not going to succeed in this. The incident which took place on 26 January was a conspiracy. We do not support it. All people have condemned it. Our people have sacrificed, you don't have anyone.

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE AND FARMERS WELFARE; THE MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT; THE MINISTER OF PANCHAYATI RAJ; AND THE MINISTER OF FOOD PROCESSING INDUSTRIES (SHRI NARENDRA SINGH TOMAR): I have stood up to express my gratitude on the President's Address. I am very happy that the Hon'ble President jointly addressed both the Houses and put forward in detail the remarkable progress that he had expected from the country and its citizens in the last year. The country faced the crisis of Covid-19, all the activities came to an end, the economy was affected, but the discipline that our country showed at that time is very admirable. Both the Prime Minister's determination and the strength of the country together have made a successful attempt to gain control over this pandemic. Today we can say that India is fully capable of dealing with this kind of pandemic. In the present situation, it is very important for all of us to pay attention to health facilities. I am happy to say that the increase of 137 percent in this budget in terms of health services is definitely a welcome step. The scientists of our country produced indigenous vaccines and made available to the country. Due to this, India's strength has also definitely increased. India's image has improved and respect for our scientists has also gone up. India is also providing assistance to other countries in terms of vaccines and medicines which is certainly something we all Indians should be proud of. Many times, distinguished speakers from the Opposition say that we take all the credit for all the work done for the country, but that is not true. Our Prime Minister had emphatically said in his maiden speech in the Central Hall at the time of being elected the Leader of the House in his first tenure and also in his speech on 15th

August from the ramparts of the Red Fort that all the previous governments have contributed in the development of the country. I am happy to inform this House that the 15th Finance Commission has recommended 2,36,850 crore rupees for the Gram Panchayats and the Council of Ministers has accepted the same. I am also happy to say that we requested the Prime Minister to start a scheme named 'Swamitwa' on the Panchayati Raj Day last year. We launched this scheme in six states on a pilot basis and we have given 'ownership' of land to 1 lakh 47 thousand persons. The hon'ble Finance Minister has now through this Budget extended the said scheme for the whole country and has also agreed to provide funds for the same. About 'MNREGA' I want to say that you started this scheme but we have improved it further. The government ensured that the wages of the labourers is directly transferred into their accounts. We also made sure that the migrant workers get employment under MNREGA. Besides, the hon'ble Prime Minister also started 'Garib Kalyan Rojgar Abhiyaan' under which even more opportunities for employment was made available. During Corona, gram panchayat secretary, rojgar sahayak, ASHA workers and self-help groups played a commendable role in creating awareness among people in villages about corona protocol, wearing masks, using sanitizers etc. "Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojna" has been further improved, its scope expanded and funds have been increased under it. We provided eight crore cooking gas cylinders under 'Ujjawala Yojna', built toilets in every home and provided electricity connection under "Saubhagya Yojna". We know that agriculture is a crucial sector and there is a need to boost agricultural production and productivity. But I want to inform that agricultural production is rising at an unprecedented level in the country and we are self-reliant in terms of foodgrains today. We have transferred one lakh fifteen thousand crore rupees in the accounts of ten crore seventy five lakh farmers through DBT under "PM Kisan Yojna". I want to assure the House and also the farmers that there will never be a shortage of funds under Pradhan Mantri Kisan Samman Nidhi Yojna. One lakh crore rupees have been provided under Atmanirbhar Bharat and twenty thousand crore rupees for fisheries, fifteen thousand crore rupees for animal husbandry, four thousand

crore rupees for herbal farming and ten thousand crore rupees have been provided for food processing sector. Hundred kisan trains have been started which act as moving cold storage. These trains are operating everyday and the farmers are able to send their produce from one place to another which helps them to get fair price. Under 'PM Krishi Udaan Yojna', the pineapples of Tripura are reaching other countries and the farmers are getting good price for the same. The Government of India and the hon'ble Prime Minister are fully committed to the farmers. The government has called them 12 times and has held talks. There is a doubt that the APMC will come to an end, then the government would have considered it. APMC will not end. If the Government of India is ready for any amendment, it does not mean that there is an anomaly in the agriculture laws. Farmers have been misguided that these laws will take away their land. There are about 20-22 states in which a new Act has been enacted for the contract farming. The Punjab Government Act provides for the farmer to be sent to jail. 1,000 mandis have been converted into e-NAM mandis to bring transparency in procurement, increase e-transactions, provide fair prices to farmers and increase electronic trade and now 1,000 more mandis will be converted. A provision has been made in the budget for this. We have tried to double the income of farmers and the contribution of farming should increase at a faster pace in the country's GDP. The agrarian reform laws brought by the government will bring revolutionary changes in the life of the farmer. These will increase the income of the farmer and the country and villages will grow further. The Modi government is working in this country with this objective.

SHRI AKHILESH PRASAD SINGH: The way the Corona pandemic has affected life and the economy, in human history, such thing has never happened after the World War. The government which will ignore and insult farmers is not going to last long. During the late Vajpayee ji's Prime Ministership, the price of paddy was rupees five and a half hundred per quintal, Manmohan Singh led government increased it to rupees 1100 per quintal. During Vajpayee ji's Prime Ministership, farmers used to get loans from banks at ten

percent interest and when the capitalists and businessmen got loans at eight percent for buying cars. The UPA government reduced the interest rate of agricultural loans to six percent. When UPA -I was in government, FCI had procured 15 lakh metric tonnes of paddy and that is the record till date. The first of all use of APMC was made in Bihar. The economic condition of farmers in the entire country is the worst in Bihar. Unless the government does not withdraw these three agricultural laws, the farmers will not withdraw.

SARDAR BALWINDER SINGH BHUNDER: The farmers have been sitting on the Delhi border for 72 days. 190 farmers have been martyred. We pay tribute to him. The government has enacted a law for contract farming. It has also changed the Essential Commodities Act and the Trade Act. When companies come, a farmer having two acres or three acres of land will not be able to compete with them. After two years, they will have a monopoly. The government is requested to withdraw these laws and discuss on them again with the farmers.

SHRI K.J. ALPHONS: The global economy has collapsed because of the pandemic. The global growth rate has come down. We are closing the year with the negative growth rate of 7.7 per cent. The expenditure by the Government has gone up by 28 per cent. The budgeted capital expenditure was only Rs. 4.12 crores but, we went up to Rs. 4.49 crores. The inflation between April and December was about 6.6 per cent, it was only because of the breakdown in the supply chain. Now, it has come down to 4.6 per cent and during the six years of NDA rule, inflation has been well below 5 per cent against 10.1 per cent during the UPA rule. So, now the inflation is well within control. We had five mini Budgets, through which Rs. 27.1 lakh crores were set aside as stimulus package during Corona. The largest FDI in the world came to India during the pandemic. Stock exchange was 50900 on the BSE index. When people put money into the exchange that is the confidence of people in that Government. In November itself, 9.8 billion dollars came into the stock market. This is the highest anywhere in the world. In the coming year, India is going to be the

fastest-growing economy in the world. World has trust in us, and look at the way we handled this pandemic. I don't understand the logic even after participating in 50 debates as to what is the wrong with the Agri Bills at all. Under MSP, we have paid 72.5 per cent more than congress government in five years from 2009 to 2013. We have paid 139.6 per cent more for paddy than what your government had paid in five years. I don't understand where we have gone wrong. From 1345 rupees, we have increased the price of wheat to 1925 rupees. For pulses, congress government paid Rs.326 crores in your entire five years; we paid Rs.10,500 crores for pulses alone. we paid Rs. 1,13,000 crores to the farmers under PM Kisan Nidhi. We have paid to 42 crores in Jan Dhan Accounts, we have paid thirteen and a half lakh crores which we have given into the Jan Dhan Account that has gone to the farmers. The infant mortality rate has come down from 89 in 1990 to 28 in 2020. The maternal mortality has come down from 212 in 1990 to 130. These are the dramatic achievements of the Modi Government. Let me come to this agitation. it is very easy to be disruptive. Here a lot of people tried to make small of whatever happened in the Red Fort. This is treason.

DR. SASMIT PATRA: The Swaminathan Commission talks of a one-and-a-half-fold increase in the minimum support price, it has not been implemented properly. The Commission for Agricultural Costs and Prices makes its own cost of production of every crop every year. The CACP cost in respect of paddy was Rs 1,560 for 2018-2019. Considering the commission report, if the central government would have increased it by one and a half times, it would have increased by one and a half times over Rs 1560 to Rs 2,340. But it has been increased to Rs 1,750. The farmers has to suffered loss by it. The minimum support price of paddy what should have been fixed has not been fixed. The minimum support price should be Rs 2,930 per quintal. In the Odisha Legislative Assembly, all the MLAs unanimously said in one voice that the price of paddy should be 2,930 rupees for our farmers. I hope the house is not misguided, the house cannot be misled. A lot of people from Odisha and India are watching and everyone will get this message.

SHRI NEERAJ SHEKHAR: I rise to speak in support of the President's Address. When the entire opposition did not come to listen to the President's Address, this work is not against the government, but an insult to the constitutional office of the President. I am surprised and it seems ridiculous that people have not come to listen to the speech, but everyone has come here to give a speech. This government has done the work for making the lives of farmers happy. Some people were saying that they want to come in the power in Punjab, Haryana again. They have no sympathy for farmers, they are with the farmers only so that their government comes to the power. Our leader has worked continuously for the farmers and shown it by working. If our Prime Minister is doing something, then look at his actions. This country has not chosen him as Prime Minister to see the face of the Prime Minister. He is working for the country. He has increased the honour of the country all over the world. The Article 370 which has been removed is the best thing that has happened in the last several years. We had to reiterate repeatedly that Jammu and Kashmir is an integral part of India. But now after the removal of Article 370 people have stopped saying this. The people of Ladakh are very happy after becoming Union Territory. Development works are being done there. All the schemes of the Government of India were not applicable there, they are being implemented there today. Due to the work done in the last one year, the standard of living of people is increasing there. I would like to say about the Jal Jivan Yojana. It is the plan of the Prime Minister that by 2024, tap water will be made available to every house. In the last 70-72 years, we have not been able to provide clean drinking water to our people. I think this is a very big scheme. If it is completed by 2024, it will be a very important scheme for the country. The scheme related to toilet is the most important scheme of the Prime Minister. It is linked to our honour. I am very happy that toilets are being built today and this work will continue to happen in the future. The farmers who are sitting there and who have reservations, the Prime Minister has it in his mind that this problem should be addressed. The Prime Minister is always ready to talk and if even a single farmer is aggrieved, the Prime Minister feels pain.

¶SHRI SUBHASH CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: (Spoke in Telugu.)

MS. INDU BALA GOSWAMI, making her maiden speech, said: The President's Address is unique because the Parliament Session is being held under different circumstances. We have entered the new year and are about to celebrate the 75th anniversary of the country's independence. We have been able to overcome Corona successfully. When we talk about the 6-year tenure of the government, we do not know from where to start talking about the achievements of the government. I would like to thank Prime Minister Shri Narendra Modi ji for the manner in which our government saved the country from the Corona epidemic under the leadership of Prime Minister Shri Narendra Modi ji. The Prime Minister established a direct dialogue with the people of the country and made them believe that the government stands with them in this fierce calamity but the opposition finds faults even in this. The people of the country accepted the Prime Minister's guidelines. The people of the country believe that what our Prime Minister says, he shows it by doing it. The Prime Minister saved the country by putting a lockdown at the right time. We did not have enough resources to deal with Corona. Even in such a situation, our Prime Minister prepared the people of the country to fight against Corona. Today our government is exporting PPE kits. India has vaccinated more than 3 million of its Corona warriors in just 15 days. Our government has turned impossible in to possible in 6 years. According to the global rating, even during the Corona epidemic, Prime Minister Narendra Modi ji has remained the top leader but the opposition only knows how to oppose the Prime Minister. On behalf of the women power, who assimilated every order of the Prime Minister, I especially want to thank the Prime Minister of our Country. I support this Motion.

¶ Synopsis of speech delivered by hon'ble Member in Telugu will be published separately as supplement.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SOCIAL JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT (SHRI RAMDAS ATHAWALE):

The Address of the hon'ble President is a Address showing the direction of all round development of the Government. This Address will strengthen the nation. This Address will show the direction of justice to the dalits, tribals, women and unemployed people that's why I support this Address. I had also demanded that the census of 2021 should be on the basis of caste. On behalf of my party, I also demand that Kshatriya society should be given separate reservation. Similarly, reservation in promotion to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes should also be considered. Regarding farmer laws, my point is that Narendra Modi ji has come to power for the second time due to the votes of the farmers. Narendra Modi ji cannot bring laws against farmers. Who is responsible for the death of the farmers. When the Supreme Court ordered a stay on this, there should be no need for such protest. The government has also said that we will accept the order of the Supreme Court. With regard to this law we should have positive views.

* * * * *
* * * * *

Desh Deepak Verma,
Secretary-General.

rssynop@sansad.nic.in

***Supplement covering rest of the proceedings is being issued separately.

**ERRATA TO THE SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE
DATED 4th FEBRUARY, 2021**

Page No.	Line No.	Correction
58	27	Read 'an economy' for 'the economy'
63	14	Read 'the Government has' for 'they have'