

**RAJYA SABHA**

---

**\*SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE**

---

**(Proceedings other than Questions and Answers)**

---

**Thursday, February 06, 2020 / Magha 17, 1941 (Saka)**

---

**MATTERS RAISED WITH THE PERMISSION OF THE  
CHAIR**

**1. Chemical Waste Polluting Potable Water Leading to Serious  
Diseases**

**SHRI VIJAY PAL SINGH TOMAR:** 80 percent of drinking water sources have been polluted. The biggest reason for this is that there is not enough system to dispose of the industrial waste and water is discharged from the industrial units without treatment. I would like to talk particularly about the NCR region. Here, water treatment plants in industrial areas and industrial units do not function properly. Therefore, the contaminated water is discharged in the local drains or rivers which drain into the Ganges and Yamuna, due to which all the water gets polluted. Due to this, diseases of cancer, TB, kidney, liver, skin diseases are spread on a large scale. There are hundreds of villages where cancer, liver, TB. Diseases like skin diseases have spread even in children. I also urge the government to monitor it properly so that the industrial units run the water treatment plants well so that the lives of the people living there can be saved.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

---

**\*This Synopsis is not an authoritative record of the proceedings of the Rajya Sabha.**

## **2. Growing Arsenic Problems in Various Parts of the Country**

**SHRI AHAMED HASSAN:** Arsenic has become a life-threatening problem for some of the provinces in our country. People from West Bengal, Jharkhand, Bihar, Uttar Pradesh, Assam and Manipur are suffering from various life-threatening diseases caused by arsenic contamination. Arsenic contamination of ground water is responsible for the problems. It is a national problem and the Central Government should also come forward and fulfil its duty towards the affected population. The JadHAVpur University of Kolkata is a pioneer in arsenic research, but it needs more funds from the Central Government for doing research and conducting experiments.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

## **3. Need to Constitute Tribunals For Appeal Against Decision of District/State Level Committees Under Forest Act.**

**SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY:** The traditional forest dwellers have been given forest rights under the Scheduled Tribes and Other Traditional Forest Dwellers (Recognition of Forest Rights) Act. Under this, an application is to be made to the Gram Sabha first to settle the claim. If the Gram Sabha does not give a satisfactory decision, then a case will be filed in the Sub-Division level committee and if justice is not found in the Sub-Division level committee, then the case will go to the District level committee and a State level committee has been constituted over it so that it could be properly monitored. Over the years, all the claims of people have been rejected and this has been implemented in very tardy manner. It is monitored by the State Committee, but the district level decision is final, due to which no decision has been made on millions of claims till date. So, I demand that a tribunal should be constituted for those issues of forest land and all the issues of forest land should be handed over to this tribunal so that millions of tribal and forest traditional dwellers in this country could get justice.

*(Shri Jairam Ramesh And Shri Husain Dalwai Associated.)*

#### **4. Need to Regulate the Online Food Ordering and Delivery Services**

**SHRI K. SOMAPRASAD:** The e-commerce in India is a fast-growing branch. As part of this, online food ordering and delivery services are witnessing a spout. This sector is facing several issues. Moreover, an important fact is that either the online food delivery service companies or the restaurants are not ready to assume the responsibility related to the quality, safety or hygiene standards of the food which is being delivered by them. This is a very serious issue. There is every chance for adulteration. The online food supply business should be regulated. The food business under e-commerce must be fully brought under FSSAI. All the food sellers in the digital market place must be licensed to protect the rights of the customer and ensure the compliance of the provisions of the Food Safety and Standards Act, 2006. Hence, I urge upon the Government that adequate measure should be taken to ensure fair price, quality, food safety and hygiene standards of all online food ordering and delivery firms.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

**THE MINISTER OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS, FOOD AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION (SHRI RAMVILAS PASWAN), responding to the matter, said:** I will call him in my office tomorrow and also call the concerned officer.

#### **5. Need for Renovation of Biju Patnaik Hockey Stadium in Rourkela for the Upcoming Hockey Men's World Cup, 2023**

**SHRIMATI SAROJINI HEMBRAM:** In 2023, Men's Hockey World Cup will be held in Odisha. The Odisha government is organizing the Hockey World Cup in partnership with Hockey India. Biju Patnaik Hockey Stadium, Rourkela has been selected as a venue for World Cup matches. That stadium is under the Rourkela Steel Plant Authority. Many spectators and guests will come from the country and outside countries to watch the World Cup match. There should be all facilities for players and spectators. For this, renovation and upgradation of the stadium is very important. I request that the

stadium should be renovated and upgraded as soon as possible so that all the players and spectators can get all the facilities there.

*(Dr. Amar Patnaik, Shri Bbhasakar Rao Nekkanti, Shrimati Kahkashan Perween and Dr. Sasmit Patra associated.)*

## **6. Socio-Economic and Educational Condition of Muslim Community in the Country**

**SHRI ABDUL WAHAB:** I wish to draw the attention of the Government towards the socio-economic indicators about the Muslim youth. The Sachar Committee suggested that policies should focus on inclusive development and mainstreaming of the community while respecting diversity. However, a recent study has confirmed that nothing has improved amongst Muslim community in India even after thirteen years of Sachar Committee report and the proportion of the youth who have completed graduation among Muslims in 2017-18 is 14 per cent which is much lower than that of dalits and other backward classes. While the marginalisation of Muslim began several years ago, the phenomenon seems to have gathered pace in recent years. The recent incidents and reports from our universities confirm that Muslim students continue to face discrimination.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

## **7. State of Education and Teachers across the Country**

**PROF. MANOJ KUMAR JHA:** I want to draw attention of the house about the education and the appointment of teachers, the D.El.Ed. Program of NIOS started in the previous NDA government. The NCTE reversed its decision on its own. Today 13 lakh trend teachers across the country are in despair. The issue of employment of 69,000 teachers started in Uttar Pradesh. Those people who should be in schools, today, those candidates are knocking the doors of courts. There are irregularities in the employment of teachers in different states because they are not in our priorities. I urge the government to take this as its priority. Nothing can be more important for our country and society other than it.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

## **8. Need to Relieve School Teachers of Election Related Duties**

**SHRI HARNATH SINGH YADAV:** Basic education is the milestone of overall development, but the condition of basic education in most parts of the country is extremely pathetic. Basic teachers should be separated from any other tasks other than teaching, because engaging in other tasks disrupts the concentration of teachers towards teaching work. Due to which the work of teaching is badly affected and the children of poor families have to suffer its consequences. Therefore, I demand the government to immediately free the basic teachers from all other functions besides revision of electoral rolls and teaching work.

*(Dr. Amar Patnaik and Dr. Sasmit Patra associated.)*

## **9. Encroachment of Tribal Forest Land in Various States**

**SHRI P. BHATTACHARYA:** I would like to mention some points in regard to the rights of the Scheduled Tribes to protect their land. In a recent judgment the Supreme Court has clearly directed the State and UT Governments to evict the persons or parties, whose claims under Forest Rights Act, 2006 were rejected. The law says that the Gram Sabha will sit together to protect the rights of the tribals in the forest area. But the Gram Sabha itself is taking decision for eviction and they are giving this land to private businessmen. Even after making complaint to different State Governments, there is no result yet. So, I feel that the Government should take proper action in this matter. If necessary, the Panchayat Act may be amended. There should be a clear provision that no outsider or a person who stays outside the jungle would be able to come in the jungle area and take the land there. That has to be done. Otherwise, you cannot protect the tribal people. So, I would request the Government to come out with this type of a law immediately.

*(Shri P. Wilson, Dr. Sasmit Patra and Shri Bhaskar Rao Nekkanti associated.)*

## **10. Indiscriminate Use of Antibiotics**

**SHRI MANAS RANJAN BHUNIA:** I want to draw the attention of the House towards the misuse and indiscriminate use of antibiotics and anti-microbial agents in India. In urban areas and cities, the indiscriminate use of antibiotics is creating a drug-resistant situation. A recent study shows that India is the topmost victim of the misuse and indiscriminate use of antibiotics. I would urge upon the Government to give direction to the concerned department to have a survey report from all the States. Our Government in West Bengal, under the leadership of Madam Mamata Banerjee, is thoroughly scrutinizing the use of antibiotics in our State and she has given directions. The Central Government should take the initiative to talk to the individual State Governments and the Health Ministry including Chief Ministers and get a report and enlighten us in this august House as to what the situation in India is.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

## **11. Need to Help Chilli Farmers in Guntur of Andhra Pradesh, Facing Losses Due To Suspension of Exports to China**

**DR. K.V.P. RAMACHANDRA RAO:** The Corona virus is hitting the farmers of Andhra Pradesh and Telangana also. The chilli farmers of Andhra Pradesh and Telangana are very badly hit as the prices are going down day by day. I urge upon the Government to take immediate steps to see that remunerative price is being given and the chillies are procured by FCI to the extent possible. Storage facilities with insurance should also be provided to them.

*(Shri Husain Dalwai and Shri M. Shanmugam associated.)*

## **12. Need for More Cancer Research Institutes in India**

**SHRI MAHESH PODDAR:** In order to improve the health system of the country, in the last 6 years, many important steps like Ayushman Bharat Yojana, Health Insurance Scheme have been taken. There has been a huge increase in the number of cancer victims in our country. Data from the World Health Organization report shows that 1.16 million new cases of cancer have been reported in India.

According to the report, six types of cancers are found more in India - breast cancer, oral cancer, cervical cancer, lung cancer, stomach cancer and colorectal cancer. There is an urgent need to take cognizance of the data of the World Health Organization report. Central and state governments should conduct cancer awareness campaigns. There are very few cancer research institutes in our country in comparison to our population. World-class cancer research institutes should be set up so that we can do world-class research and find out remedies to cure this disease.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

### **13. Need to Address the Difficulties being faced By Persons with Disability to Avail Facilities**

**DR. VINAY P. SAHASRABUDDHE:** I want to draw the attention of the House towards the problems of the persons with disabilities. It is a fact that the government has run many programs for the persons with disabilities. Sensitivity in society is decreasing. Within municipal corporations there is a reserve fund for the persons with disabilities. It should also be used for basic infrastructures. Guidelines in this regard should be issued by the Ministry of Social Empowerment. Easy entry in the Elders Homes should be ensured for the Persons with disabilities. Handicapped Finance Corporation has been set up by the government but it does not show the ease of loan disbursement. Banks also take a lot of time in this. Incorrectly constructed ramps are also causing problems for the persons with disabilities. Paraplegic, cerebral palsy, slow learner or autism is a new type of disabilities. It should also be mentioned somewhere. The implementation of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities Act, 2016 should be reviewed. The process of filling the seats reserved for the persons with disabilities in government departments should be expedited. Sensitivity training should also be included in the training of government employees.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

#### **14. Shortage of Infrastructure for Police Training**

**SHRI SANJAY SETH:** Police has a huge contribution in maintaining the internal security of the country. They discharge their duties with full capacity. There is a shortage of police personnel in every State of India. There are about 5.50 lakh vacancies of police personnel across the country. There are about 1.25 lakh vacancies in Uttar Pradesh. There is a lack of infrastructure for their training. I suggest that the States should be provided financial assistance by the Center for building basic infrastructure of training and for appointments.

*(Dr. Sasmit Patra and Shri K.C. Ramamurthy associated.)*

#### **15. Need to Prepare a Scheme for the Irrigation of Unirrigated Areas of Champaran District of Bihar**

**SHRI AKHILESH PRASAD SINGH:** Agriculture is the main occupation of the people of East Champaran district. The economic condition of the district is entirely dependent on agriculture. Adverse situations have also arisen in front of sugarcane farmers. Due to the closure of sugar mills, they are forced to sell their crops in remote areas at low prices. People also face difficulties due to drought and floods. Therefore, I request the government that an action plan should be prepared soon to irrigate the non-irrigated areas to strengthen the economic-social condition of the district.

#### **16. Need to Bring Lawful and Practical Regime in Favor of Farmers in the Country**

**SHRI SHIV PRATAP SHUKLA:** India is an agricultural country. I want to raise the subject of Uttar Pradesh where a list of revenue villages and its farmers is released every year. Based on this, information about their land is obtained and they get full benefits of government assistance. Hon'ble Prime Minister has made utmost efforts to double the income of farmers. The Government of Uttar Pradesh should be instructed to publish the list of farmers every year to ensure that the farmers of the area get central assistance on the basis of land revenue.

## **17. Need to Expedite Cases Falling Under Tenth Schedule of the Constitution**

**SHRI P. WILSON:** The legislative intent of the anti-defection law stands defeated by the inordinate delay in taking up and disposing complaints by the Speaker of the House or the Chairman as the case maybe. The object of the Constitution (Fifty Second Amendment) Act, 1985 is to curb the evil of political defections motivated by lure of office or other similar considerations which endangers the foundations of our democracy. There are many instances wherein the Speaker of certain State Assemblies sit over the issue relating to disqualification for years. The Court has also called upon the Parliament to consider amending the Constitution to substitute the Speaker of the Houses with an independent Tribunal to decide disputes concerning disqualification arising under the tenth Schedule. I request this August House to extend the application of the Tenth Schedule to posts in Part IX and IX-A that is municipal and local bodies by suitably amending the Constitution.

*(Shri Tiruchi Siva, Shri M. Shanmugam, Shri R.S. Bharathi and Shri Syed Nasir Hussain associated.)*

**THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE, THE MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS AND THE MINISTER OF ELECTRONICS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY (SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD), responding to the matter, said:** With the greatest respect to the hon. Supreme Court, those sweeping comments against the Presiding Officers, were surely avoidable. We need to have institutional respect for all the institutions of the country. The Presiding Officers of the Legislatures are equally important functionaries in the constitutional process. I must place it on record.

---

## **SPECIAL MENTIONS**

### **1. Need to Stop Illegal Mining from River Beds**

**SHRI VISHAMBHAR PRASAD NISHAD:** Illegal mining is being taking place in the rivers of the country, particularly of Uttar Pradesh, Uttarakhand, Bihar, Madhya Pradesh and Rajasthan. Due to such mining large pits are formed in the rivers. Such illegal mining is adversely affecting the animals and it is destroying the environment also. Sand and Moram are being extracted by stopping the flow of rivers like Dhasan, Yamuna, Betwa and Chandrawali of Bundelkhand. I urge upon the government to take necessary steps immediately to stop this illegal mining.

*(Dr. Amar Patnaik, Dr. Sasmit Patra and Shri Bhaskar Rao Nekkanti associated.)*

### **2. Demand for Assistance to Widows of Farmers Committing Suicide in Maharashtra**

**DR. VIKAS MAHATME:** I want to draw your attention towards the issue of suicides being committed by the farmers in Maharashtra. The number of widows is being increasing with the high rate of suicides of the farmers in Maharashtra. Their widows are left in adverse situations and they have no other choice but to bear responsibility of running the house. The government should ensure that priority in property distribution is given to such widows and financial assistance may be given for the marriage of their daughters. Keeping in view this situation I urge upon the government to formulate some schemes in this regards.

*(Several hon'ble Members associated.)*

### **3. Demand for Subsistence Allowance to Empower the Farmers of the Country**

**SHRI A. K. SELVARAJ:** The farmers of the country are suffering for a long time. A large number of Indian population depends on agriculture. Farmers are leaving farming and there is shortage of workforce in agriculture. Tamil Nadu is the first state to

enact law on contract farming. The union government should also take steps to empower farmers so as to remain them into farming activities. Small farmers are in distress and under pressure. Poor storage and transport facilities lead to losses. I appeal to the government to provide subsistence allowance to farmers as the first step to empower them.

#### **4. Demand to Expedite the Process of the Semi High Speed Railway Corridor in Kerala**

**SHRI K.J. ALPHONS:** There is a proposal to set up a Semi High Speed Rail Corridor in Kerala between Trivandrum and Kasargodu. At present it takes 12 hours to cover 532 Kms of this route. Drone survey has been done and the Ministry of Railways has given in principal approval for the project. I urge upon the government to expedite the process of preparing the estimate and grant sanction for the estimate. At least 50 per cent of the project cost should be borne by the government also.

---

#### **MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS - *Contd.***

**SHRI BINOY VISWAM:** I disagree and object to the Motion of Thanks on the Address of the President. It is mentioned in the President's Address that everything is okay with the country, but everybody knows that the country is going through a very difficult time nowadays. Ever since the present regime came to power, we had no dearth of promises. But, which promise was made to a reality, that question needs to be answered. The Government came with a great promise of two crore jobs per year for the youth. But the country is facing the biggest rate of unemployment in the last 45 years. What about the five trillion dollar economy? I can tell you emphatically clear that that five trillion dollar economy will remain as a dream, a dream which is going to be unfulfilled. The purchasing capacity of the Indian citizen is lowest in our experience because the poor in the rural India, the peasants, the middle class, all of them are having the same situation. They have no money with them. Their products are not getting the rightful price for them and the inflation on food is also

growing. All this shows that the economy is passing through a very pathetic condition today. The Government is trying to divide the country and the people because they have failed in all walks of life. It was said that demonetization is a big attack on the black-money. The Government promised that no terrorism now onwards; once black money is over, terrorism will be dead. Now, in no speech, the Prime Minister, the Finance Minister, the President say a single word on that great demonetization. Black-money is very much there. The demonetization has absolutely failed. Now the country is facing a very tough situation. The Government wants to divide the people on religious grounds. For that purpose, the Government wants to do away with the Constitution itself. A Government which came to power with all proclamations of allegiance to the Constitution, is trying to undermine the Constitution every day and night. CAA, NPR and NRC are aimed at dividing this nation because the Government wants to deviate peoples' attention from so many burning issues today. The people of India have made this country a Republic, with a conviction that irrespective of religion, the country and the people can stay as one. But, they want to divide it. The Muslims are part of India. They form Indian citizens. This fascist philosophy is sowing the seeds of havoc in the country. Treating the Muslims, the Christians and the Communists as the threats of the country from within is a very dangerous philosophy. The Government wants to give enough money for the military and armaments. But, there is no money for employment. Kisans are suffering. How will the Government double the income of peasants with the allotted amount? That alone will not double their income. Education also is going to be privatized. Health is also going to be privatized. The whole country is going to be privatized. Everything is for Adanis, Ambanis and FDI. For India, nothing is remaining. That is why, we are forced to oppose the Motion of Thanks.

**SHRI NARAYAN RANE:** In his address, His Excellency the President has given information about the development that our country has done in different fields in the last 6 years and also praised it. Giving information about the work of this government, the President has mentioned that these work are being done at a great

pace. I thank all the hon'ble members who have supported this address on the issue of development. The Hon'ble President has mentioned that this government will do good work in future. The progress that the country has made in different fields has been mentioned in this address. The work which could not be done in the last 70 years have been completed by this government, but many of our hon'ble members did not praise it. Hon'ble President has said that efforts should be made to make this country a new India. But it is regrettable that the Leader of the Opposition has criticized it. He said in his speech that this government did not fulfill its promises. I want to tell the Leader of the Opposition that the Congress had been in power in this country for more than 50 years and during every election, the Congress made a promise repeatedly to "banish poverty". So did the Congress remove poverty from the country? You could not fulfill a promise you made in 50 or 55 years. We have abrogated the Article 370 and the Article 35 (A) from Jammu and Kashmir. This decision taken by the government in the interest of security of the country should have been appreciated by the Leader of Opposition. After the abrogation of the Article 370, the progress of the citizens has started there and in view of that I want to say that nothing wrong has happened in it. And there is no wrong in enacting the CAA. When India became independent, the minority constituted 24 per cent in Pakistan, but today it is only 2 per cent. No one in the House expressed concern about the atrocities being perpetrated on them. It has been alleged that this law is wrong and against the Constitution. We have enacted this law in accordance with the Constitution. All the opposition leaders have only criticized the government on the President's address. I have to say that the government did not reduce the funds for the different schemes launched in our country. New schemes are being formulated and the government is providing funds for all them. We have not stopped growth and development. Our efforts to increase the growth rate should also be seen. It has been mentioned quite a lot in this address. We will double the production of farmers. What our Government is spending for farmers, education, industry, all are being done to increase our GDP, to create employment. Our Government is following the mantra 'Sabka Saath,

Sabka Vikas, Sabka Vishwas'. It has been mentioned in it. Hon'ble President has made special mention about the work we have done in the field of education, health, industry and has praised them in his address.

**SHRIMATI VIPLOVE THAKUR:** There is nothing new in this address. The same Ujjwala Yojana, Deendayal Yojana, same old objectives are being talked about. Unemployment, inflation have not been talked about because they are not worried about these things. They do not want to do anything for the youth. There is no mention of jobs in the President's address. Nothing has been said for women either. You do not have any programme, nor you have any new idea for India, you have nothing. The only idea is how to break this country. Do not split this country. As long as there were our Governments, no one dared to look at our country. But, you have no programme. Maintain the unity of this country. We are secular. In the end, I would just like to say here that do not divide this country, let it be united, do not spread this hatred. This is very dangerous for both, you and us.

**SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY:** I support the Motion. The Address was full of aspirations and, quite clearly, highlighted the Government's policies, priorities and plans for the upcoming years. But, the hon. President has missed out on assuring the country and the Parliament that the Government shall focus on better implementation of the laws enacted by this Parliament. The Andhra Pradesh Reorganization Act has failed to live up to the expectations of the five crore people of Andhra Pradesh. I wish that the Government focuses on the economic situation. I request for more aid to Andhra Pradesh. The President has assured speedy establishment of IIM and IIT in Jammu & Kashmir, but the IIM at Visakhapatnam is functioning out of a temporary arrangement. There is no mention of Special Category Status to the State of Andhra Pradesh. We are only demanding implementation of the decision of the then Union Cabinet which took a decision that the Special Category Status would be granted to the residuary State of Andhra Pradesh. Step-motherly treatment is being given to the southern States of this country. Andhra Pradesh is losing

Rs.1,521 crore. We are being penalised because Andhra Pradesh, Telangana, Tamil Nadu and Karnataka have strictly implemented the family planning and population control measures. An injustice has been meted out to Andhra Pradesh. On the lines Telangana, Karnataka and other States, including Jammu & Kashmir, Andhra Pradesh should be given special grant. The Central Government should reimburse to the extent of Rs.16,075 crore to Andhra Pradesh for 2014-15. I request the Central Government to release the balance amount of Rs.18,969 crores. The Central Government has yet to release Rs.3,283 crores on Polavaram project. A special package should be given to the State of Andhra Pradesh in respect of the seven Backward Districts. The Government is striving for social, economic and educational progress of the minorities. It is believed that the Government will ensure that insecurity among minorities does not arise and it will clarify their doubts.

**SHRI RAMKUMAR VERMA:** The President's Address reflects the work done by the Government during the last five years and seven months. The work done are no doubt historic. And whatever is done is reflected in the Address. It is the duty of the Opposition to tell the Government about the reforms to be done in the interest of the country and also tell the ways and means to increase the pace of progress. It is sad that instead of doing justice with the poor and dalits, they are being frightened. It is told here that there is threat to the Constitution and it needs to be saved. There is threat to the unity of the country. In 2014 Modiji assured the people that everybody will be treated equally. Prior to 2014 there was desperation and the corruption was at its height. There was no law and order in the country and there was no control on monopoly. After the full fledged majority, Modiji assured the country. The words being used for the Prime Minister are unwarranted. The Prime Minister assured the country that the Government will work according to the Constitution only and this Government will work for all sections of the country without any distinction. Decisions are being taken in the interest of the country. But prior to this Government the ruling party at that time ignored the large section. Now that section ignored them. And due to

disappointment, their language is changed. These people say that whatever is being done that will divide the country. Everybody talks about the Dalits. Constitution is written for all Sections. It can solve all sorts of problems. It is said that the injustice is being done with the Dalits and Muslims. Opposition is misleading the people. There are Preamble, Fundamental Rights and Fundamental duties in the Constitution. But the persons who read the Constitution are saying that there is threat to Constitution. Opposition says that the reservation has been abolished. But whatever decision was taken in Indira Sahni Case in 1991 that decision abolished the reservation. During the regime of Atal Government amendments were made in 500 Office Memoranda and the reservation was restored. Modi Government changed the decision of the court to clear the backlog in the Universities. In this way this Government saved the constitution. Atrocities Act was changed by the court which was restored by this Government. This Government gave houses to poor, connected the poor with the banks, prepared Mudra banking and Ujjwala scheme. These are for the upliftment of the poor. 70% persons of Scheduled Castes got their rights.

**SHRI SHWAIT MALIK:** The future of the country depends upon self reliance. According to the President we should use the indigenous items. Our Prime Minister also says this. He started the Ministry for the skill development. In France 92% people are skilled, in European Union 80% people are skilled whereas in India only 2.3% people are skilled. The mandate of this Ministry is to provide skilled labour to the industry. This Government's policy is 'Make in India' to produce goods in India. This country is spending a lot to import goods. If these goods are produced in India, it will generate employment and India will be self-reliant. To finance the 'Make in India' policy Mudra Bank is created. With the help of Mudra Bank one can become self-reliant and he can help others also. If we give food to a hunger, he demands food. But if we make him self-reliant, he will help to others. Prior to 2014, corruption was on its height. The backbone of the common person was broken. Prime Minister paid respects to the Great Gurus of Punjab. Congress handed over

Kartarpur to Pakistan which is just two Kilo Meter away from the Border. Modi ji fulfilled the dreams of the people of Punjab by opening the corridor of Kartarpur Sahib. In 1984 several atrocities were committed on Sikhs. Their houses were burnt. They could not get the justice during Congress regime. But during Modi regime, SIT was constituted and Sikhs got their justice. Now the action is being taking to convert Sultanpur Lodhi into a world class city. The teachings of the Guru Nanak are being translated into all the languages of the world. Farmers are now getting Urea from open market. Pension is being given to farmers. Actions are being taken for the development of the land of Jaliawala Bagh. On foreign policy front also, this Government has done well. He travelled several foreign countries and made the world opinion in favour of India. Our Prime Minister got highest honour in Afganistan, Saudi Arab, UAE, Philipnese, Myanmar and Russia. He also got Champions of the Earth Award. He attended Howdi Modi Show along with the President of America. India progressed in the field of infrastructure, roads, highways, broadband and this government has done several other works also. Pension is given to farmers, traders and workers. This Government abolished Article 370 and Triple Talaq and modernised railways

**\*SHRI K. BHABANANDA SINGH: (Spoke in Manipuri.)**

**SHRI G.V.L. NARASIMHA RAO:** People all over the country are recognizing the fact that the country is moving forward. This Government has given speed and scale to the development of the country and has strived for improvement of the system. In the last five years, the ranking of our country has improved significantly in terms of ease of doing business and now we have moved from 142nd rank to 63rd rank. India's ranking has risen from 74th rank to 52nd rank in terms of global innovation. Our rank has also risen from 52nd to 34rd in terms of environment of competitiveness in the sector of travel and

---

\* Synopsis of speech delivered by hon'ble Member in Manipuri will be published separately as supplement.

tourism. The Leader of Opposition has compared Jammu and Kashmir with Gujarat and also with all India. Whereas, Jammu and Kashmir was already a thriving state and was given special status to give impetus to its development, under which 10% amount was being earmarked every year only for Jammu and Kashmir. But, the Central Government has taken steps to stop the anti-national activities there. It would have been better if the development of Jammu and Kashmir had been compared with Pakistan-occupied Kashmir, so that the whole world could know how Pakistan-occupied Kashmir has been kept bereft of development. The Prime Minister has been running the Government with a team spirit. But, after passing of the Citizenship Amendment Act by the Parliament, the manner in which the governments and legislatures of different states have expressed their voices in protest of this legislation is a major threat to the democracy. Only the Lok Sabha and the Rajya Sabha have the right to amend and make laws on citizenship. No state government is empowered to declare it unconstitutional. Although, this can be challenged in court. A number of petitions are already filed in the Supreme Court regarding this legislation and the decision of the Court should be awaited. The State Governments, which are challenging the Central Government, should keep Article 256 and Article 356 of the Constitution in mind. Through this statement, I wish to urge them to take this matter very seriously. A new politics of development is unfolding in the country, the basis of which is "Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas, Sabka Vishwas". There is no discrimination of any kind in development work. This is the biggest feature of this Government. But some political parties, who do not like us, are working against the country with a sense of revenge. While opposing the BJP, they have started opposing India. The role of the opposition is to discuss and debate. They may oppose us, but I urge you not to oppose the country.

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** The President's Address is disappointing. This ignores the ground reality. The atmosphere of fear within the country and the concern of the people about their future have been overlooked in this address. Some of the disputed policies, decisions and laws of the Government are mentioned in this address, which I feel, was unnecessary. Because, cases are already under

consideration of the Constitution bench of the Supreme Court with regard to them. There is discomfort in many states. Legislative assemblies of some states have unanimously passed resolutions opposing these legislations. Therefore, the Government should move a motion of amendment to remove such disputed issues from the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address. There is a tradition of discussion, debate and dialogue in democracy. Every decision and policy of the government is not necessarily supported by the opposition. This is not expected in democracy. The country should approve it and anyone who questions it should become a traitor. 62-63 percent of the people of India have also voted against your party. If you become India then who are we? The Constitution of India has given the people the right to protest. If the government starts quarreling with its people, wants to fight on its own, it is not a good thing for the country. The advertisement of Mahatma Gandhi's glasses and his name will not do, but adopt his thinking. On the occasion of his 150th birth anniversary, there are sticks and bullets fired at children in the country for raising their voice. Suppressing the voice of the public or opposition is a blow to democracy. What does section 144 mean? Before raising one's voice the imposition of Section 144, Teardrop Gas, Sticks and Water Cannon have become a custom. India is the largest democracy. The Prime Minister says that we want to become world gurus, what are you becoming leaders of. You are becoming the leader of Internet shutdowns, you are becoming the leader of the Civil Liberties Court. The Prime Minister of the country has given an explanation of the protest in the Delhi elections just two days ago. The Prime Minister of India should not say that those who raise the voice of protest are breaking the country. I am saying this because this will weaken the country, weaken the unity of the country and weaken the unity of the society. Opposition and freedom of expression is the foundation of democracy. When the people of India stand up, no British was able to suppress their voice and no one will be able to suppress it. You do not believe in building consensus. Legislative assemblies of states have rights. My question through you is, did the Prime Minister discuss with the Chief Ministers of the states before taking all these controversial steps? You

also do not want to reach consensus and only do politics of allegation. The government is against opponents. We do not need the authenticity of our patriotism from you. Every citizen of India is patriotic and loves India. India's army is our power. We are proud of its sacrifices. Stop calling this army your army. It is an army of India. There is a reference to the mandate given to your government in the President's address. In this, there is a reference to creating a new India. It is a coincidence that on June 20, 2009, the President's address after the election also mentioned the same thing. The vote of thanks was also passed in June, but it was again put back. You have few things to say. In the election, Pakistan rotates like you are doing bhajan in the morning. The one who speaks against you speaks the voice of Pakistan. You do not talk about China. It is said in this address that there are good relations with neighbouring countries. But the truth is the opposite. Many people are suffering if you speak of humanity in the true sense. The question is, which new India mandate have you got? What was lacking in India that your government inherited? India of the year 2014 was a respected and empowered India. It was a symbol of independence of India. After independence, this country achieved great achievements. Great things were done inside this country. It became a nuclear power in 1974. India went into space in 1975. In the year 2008, we reached the moon. In 2013, we sent Mangalyaan. The India we left was of an economy of two trillion dollars. The first IIT in that India was formed in 1951 at Kharagpur. Sardar Patel was also the President of the Indian National Congress. If you respect Patel then learn courage from him. Sardar Sarovar Dam was named by Jawaharlal Nehru as a tribute to Sardar Patel. Your ranking in Ease of Doing Business has risen and it is only in two big cities. You talked about the competitive index, the reality is that you have not gone ahead in it. You have fallen in the Global Hunger Index that Transparency International has referred to. India went down in the Global Hunger Index from Sri Lanka. What game are you playing today that does not make sense. You are ranked 102 out of 117 countries in the Global Hunger Index. Will you make hungry people fit or feed them bread? Their circumstances are such that they will say what they are made to say. There is luridness in the President's

address, there are hollow claims in it. There is no mention of economic crisis and unemployment. You have destroyed the strong economy of India in 5 years. Unemployment is at the top in 45 years, jobs are not being generated, the country's factories are closing, the market is falling and the rupee is falling. These are the figures of India. There are two main reasons for this, one is the Prime Minister's decision of unilateral demonetization on November 8. You hit the backbone of the country's economy. The unorganized sector, where 90 percent of the laborers work, broke down. Nehru was imprisoned for a long time in British prison. The Hindu Mahasabha was held in the year 1937 and a resolution was passed that Hindus and Muslims cannot live in one country. This government says in this address that an economy of \$ 5 trillion will be created, but there is 4.5 GDP. For Five-years the GDP should rise to double-digit. You have said about selling our PSUs. You are also selling LIC. There is a huge shortfall in your revenue collection. You took 1 lakh 76 thousand crores from the Reserve Bank. Why did you take money from the Reserve Bank? You are heading towards Grand Clearance Sale of National Assets which has been built in this country in 70 years. Everything is going wrong in the country. This government is running away from the real issues. Look at your 2014 manifesto and see 2019, you did not fulfill the promises you had made. I would like to give an advice. That advice is to change this mindset, have the ability to listen to the voice of protest and criticism, and leave insensitivity and bring sensitivity. The strength of this country is unity in diversity. We are multi-religions country, multi-lingual country, this is the power of India. Protect Ganga-Jamuni Tehzeeb. This country is neither mine nor yours, this country is ours. Stop hurting the soul of this country.

**DR. AMAR PATNAIK:** Many achievements of the government have been told in the President's address. Our state has also benefited in many areas. In paragraph 10, the President's Address talks about a new India in which adequate facilities and new opportunities for growth are available for the poor, dalits, women, youth, tribals and minorities. Using the powers under Articles 15(4) and 16(4), the State Government wanted to make special provisions for advancement of any Socially and Educationally Backward Classes

of citizens. The State Cabinet passed a Resolution. We had made a recommendation to the Central Government. Therefore, I would request the Central Government to look into it because that is a process which the State Government cannot independently do. I would like to talk about the DBT. Out of the total number of bank branches of 5,395, in rural areas there are only 2,838 branches. Eighty per cent of our gram panchayats do not have a bank branch. Even if government has a Direct Benefit Transfer scheme, the benefits of the scheme do not really go to the people for whom it is intended. I would like to talk about the Clean Energy Cess. There has been no transfer from the Clean Energy Cess, because the entire thing has gone to the GST compensation. We would request the Central Government to take this into account. Hon'ble President talks about the Coalition on Disaster Resilient Infrastructure which is a very welcome development and a very welcome step. The electrical infrastructure was not included in the Disaster Management Act for the purpose of getting any benefit. So, once again, while supporting the Motion, I would say that the Central Government should look into this.

\* \* \* \* \*  
\* \* \* \* \*

**Desh Deepak Verma,**  
*Secretary-General.*

[rssynop@sansad.nic.in](mailto:rssynop@sansad.nic.in)

---

\*\*\*Supplement covering rest of the proceedings is being issued separately.