

RAJYA SABHA

*SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE

(Proceedings other than Questions and Answers)

Thursday, July 21, 2016/ Ashadha 30, 1938 (Saka)

MATTERS RAISED WITH THE PERMISSION OF THE CHAIR

1. Death of Renowned Hockey Player Mohd. Shahid

SHRI DILIP KUMAR TIRKEY: The legend Hockey player Mohd. Shahid expired yesterday. I express my condolence to him. He was the member of Indian Hockey team which won the gold medal in the Moscow Olympics held in 1980. He was also the captain of Indian Hockey team. I urge upon the Government to extend adequate economic help to his family.

(Several Hon'ble Members associated.)

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI: This reference should have been made by the Chair itself and we all would have paid condolence to him.

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF MINORITY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI), responding to the matter, said: When Late Mohd. Shahid was ill and admitted in the hospital the Government extended full support to meet expenditure on his treatment. Moreover additional Rupees ten lac were also given to his family. If more help is required, it will also be extended.

*This Synopsis is not an authoritative record of the proceedings of the Rajya Sabha.

2. Withholding of Funds Allocated to District Boards

SHRIMATI VIPLOVE THAKUR: The NDA Government has been weakening the Panchayati Raj institution. The funds used to be allocated to the members of District Council/District Panchayat or to the members of Block Development Committees have been withheld now. The fourteenth Finance Commission has given these funds direct to the Panchayats. The development works have been affected as a result of this step. This problem should be resolved by the Government at the earliest.

(Several Hon'ble Members associated.)

3. Rising Inflation in Country

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI: The life of the common man has become very difficult today due to the rising inflation. The inflation rate has increased to the level of 5.77 percent. The economic policies of the Government has put the country on the verge of being ruined. Some steps should be taken by the Government to check the inflation.

(Shri Ripun Bora and Shrimati Viplove Thakur associated.)

4. Suspension of Students by Vice-chancellor of Banaras Hindu University

SHRI ALI ANWAR ANSARI: The Vice Chancellor of BHU has rusticated 9 students from the University for two years. These students were just demanding the opening of the Digital Library of the University twenty four hours a day. When they were staging a hunger strike on this issue, they were also got arrested. This is a very serious issue and the Government should take immediate action in this regard.

(Several Hon'ble Members associated.)

5. Demand for CBI Inquiry into Alleged Rigging in Rajya Sabha Elections in Haryana

SHRI SHADI LAL BATRA: I would like to raise an important issue about the alleged rigging of Rajya Sabha elections recently held in Haryana where the pen provided by the Election Commission official was changed and the votes were cancelled on the ground that there was a difference in ink. The Election Commission is probing into the matter but has not yet submitted inquiry report. I demand that that election be declared countermanded and a CBI inquiry be instituted to probe the whole issue.

(Several Hon'ble Members associated.)

6. Notifications Issued Under Lokpal Act Requiring Trustees and Senior Functionaries of Certain NGOs to Declare Their Assets

MS. ANU AGA: Under The Lokpal Act of 2013 all trustees and other senior officials of NGOs that receive FCRA over Rs.10 lakhs per year and or Central Government funding over Rupees one crore are also required to disclose their assets and liabilities. The Trustees of these NGOs are not public servants as they work on a voluntary basis. All such NGOs already have detailed disclosure procedures. A permanent solution of this problem by amending the Act will have to be found by the Government. Till then, as a temporary solution the date of filing such return should be extended by a few months.

(Several Hon'ble Members associated.)

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: This is a very serious issue. The rules have not been framed. Therefore, the whole country, the NGOs, the people who have contributed to the development of this country, are resiling it. The Government must respond and we should address the situation immediately.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: The date should be extended and then, definitely, the hon. Minister can call the party leaders and give a collective thinking.

THE MINISTER OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT, THE MINISTER OF HOUSING AND URBAN POVERTY ALLEVIATION AND THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU), responding to the matter, said: There is some rational and force in it. We have to study various dimensions. We shall keep in mind the sentiments of the House in this regard. The date will be extended, but it all depends on the response of all other political parties also.

7. Concern over Delay in Dispensation of Justice due to Vacant Posts of Judges in High Courts.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: There are a number of criminal and civil cases pending in various courts of India. People are in prison. These are poor people who cannot even pay for their bail. They have been languishing in prisons for a period longer than the sentence to be given to them if they were to be convicted. But the trials have not been taken place. There are a number of posts of Judges in High Courts of the country are lying vacant. When the Government talks of 'justice to all', it has to address this issue.

THE MINISTER OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT, THE MINISTER OF HOUSING AND URBAN POVERTY ALLEVIATION AND THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU), responding to the matter, said: We have to address the issue. Pendency of cases is not because of these two years rather pendency of cases has been there for years.

THE MINISTER OF STATISTICS AND PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION (SHRI D.V. SADANANDA GOWDA), responding to the matter, said: The appointments can be proceeded with as per the previous memorandum procedure. I wrote a letter to the Chief Justice of India and on the basis of that appointments have started.

8. Suspicious Death of an AIIMS Student

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: A young doctor from Tiruppur, Tamil Nadu was found dead in his Hauz Khas Apartment a few days ago in mysterious circumstances. Though he was very happy of getting into a course of his choice in AIIMS. That is why, I have many reasons to say that there was a foul play but the Police are keen on saying that it was a suicidal case, not homicidal. Hence, we want an investigation by a special team or a CBI probe.

SHRI D. RAJA: I associate myself with. The dead student was from a poor family. He did his MBBS in Madurai and came to AIIMS for further studies. He got everything on merit. He died under very suspicious circumstances.

(Several Hon'ble Members associated.)

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI JAGAT PRAKASH NADDA), responding to the matter, said: We are seized of the matter. Investigation is going on. Some report is being awaited. The moment we get it, the investigation will take place.

9. Crisis in Eastern India due to Wheat Blast Disease Causing Huge Damage to Crops

SHRI VIVEK GUPTA: India is facing a very serious threat of wheat blast and rice blast. Already, the disease has reached Bangladesh. This is the first time that this disease has come in South Asia. The damage caused by this disease in various other countries is enough. I would request the hon. Minister to urgently take steps to prevent this disease from reaching India and to make farmers aware of.

(Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu and Shri Ranvijay Singh Judev associated)

10. Misuse of Social Websites by Some Terrorist Organizations

SHRI BHUPENDER YADAV: Some of the newspapers have published that social media websites are being used by several terrorist groups as a weapon to destabilize the Country. They are provoking youths hailing from border areas to get into violence. The Government have identified many such websites. Banning of these websites immediately is need of the hour.

(Dr. Prabhakar Kore, Shri Meghraj Jain, Shri Basawaraj Patil and Shri Ranvijay Singh Judev associated.)

11. Death of Tribals of Madhya Pradesh Working in Gujarat due to Silicosis Disease

SHRI D.P. TRIPATHI: I am raising a matter concerns the health and life of tribal workers. Workers have died because of the disease called Silicosis, while working in the quartz crushing factories in Gujarat. This disease is caused by inhaling the dust of silica. But the doctors don't register this disease as Silicosis but in some other name. Hence, the workers don't get the treatment. I urge upon the Government to take note of this. There is no attempt in this regard by neither any Government nor by these quartz crushing factories.

(Several Hon'ble Members associated.)

12. Proposed Move to Privatize Salem Steel Plant and Visvesvaraya Iron and Steel Plant of Sail

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: The Government is moving to privatize the Salem Steel Plant in Tamil Nadu and the Visvesvaraya Iron & Steel Plant of Karnataka. The Salem Steel Plant came into being after a big struggle by the people of Tamil Nadu. It has been producing quite efficiently since its inception. But during the last one decade, this is being neglected and the plant is being pushed into red. The Visvesvaraya Iron & Steel Plant has been also pushed to loss. Hence, a plea is made knowingly to privatize it. There will be a

serious resistance if this is acceded to. The Government must stop selling of the national assets.

(Several Hon'ble Members associated.)

13. Boycott of Courts by Lawyers in Tamil Nadu Affecting Litigants

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: In Tamil Nadu, the District Court Bars and Senior Advocates are on strike against a notification issued by the committee constituted by the Competent Authority. Consequently, the Bar Council has directed to suspend some of the lawyers. The lawyers are also not permitted to hold meetings. I urge upon the Government to provide relief to the suspended lawyers and to end the court boycott to save the interests of the litigants.

SHORT DURATION DISCUSSION

Recent Incidents of Atrocities on Dalits in Various Parts of the Country

SHRI SHARAD YADAV, initiating the discussion, said: I would like to draw the attention towards prevailing circumstances in the country. Incidents of atrocities on dalits are still alive and kicking. one-fourth population of India constitutes dalits and aboriginals. Despite having small means of livelihood, these people toil hard and have to face extreme form of social segregation and disparaging remarks commented against them by the dominated people even after 70 years of Independence. They keep on confronting all kinds of injustices and are devoid of their due place in society. These people do not have any representation in courts of the country. So, time has come to uproot the evil of caste-based discrimination by putting in place stringent laws and persons responsible for this should be taken to task.

SHRI AHMED PATEL: I would like to draw attention of the House towards the incident occurred in district Somnath. The incident has brought disregard to everyone and the nation. The incident of Una is very embarrassing. In my view the situation of Gujarat is very dangerous and explosive. It should be controlled. Injustice is being done with the Dalits. It is very sad that some indecent words have been said against one of the senior Dalit woman member of this house. Government must give serious attention to all such incidents. This government is trying to divide our society. Now the whole Dalit and Backward community are feeling humiliated. Government must try to find out the reason of all such things. In the last two years many incidents had happened against Dalits. The incident occurred in Gujarat should not have happened again. Some time some people gave controversial statement. Government must give attention on this also. Vulnerable groups must be treated respectfully. Do not try to ignore them. Everything must be done according to constitution. Human welfare is the most important thing. In Gujarat there is need of serious monitoring otherwise the situation will become worse. Centre should take it seriously.

DR. VINAY P. SAHASRABUDDHE, making his maiden speech, said: I condemn the Una incident. I do not want to go by the statistics in this regard. The question is not related to statistics. This is a question of mentality. We have to discuss on this issue of social equality and social justice across the party lines. It should be discussed in a broader aspect. My only point is about the change in the mind set of our society. The system of upper and lower cast is the main reason behind all this. The vulnerability of SCs, STs, Dalit and women is the main reason of such incidents. Our law and order system must be very strong and effective. Now people are not afraid of law. It is very sad that indecent words have been said about one of our senior member of this house. But it is also equally bad that social equality is being exploited politically. Such matters are above politics. Now, Dalit entrepreneurship is being promoted under the programmes of Skill India and other programmes in order to empower them. I feel, if we do not have any kind of sympathy towards our deprived brothers and sisters, reservation system will remain incomplete. More concrete

steps should be taken to fulfil all reserved seats. There is a need of a concrete and comprehensive improvement schemes for the hostels of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. There is a need of mentorship for Mudra Yojna. Unless the whole society makes a unanimous approach towards Dalits, we cannot find any solution for this. The democracy of aspiration is being achieved. We should certainly discuss on the issues like social harmony and social justice.

SHRI VISHAMBHAR PRASAD NISHAD: Dalit and OBCs are not safe in the state of Gujarat and only Capitalists are ruling the roost there. In the past, such incidents have also occurred in some other states which are condemnable. Despite the strict laws, these crimes are not curbed. After abolishing the constitution based on old Caste System, a new constitution of harmony should be made. When a poor person becomes a victim of sexual harassment again and again, either he/she leaves the house or commits suicide or takes to the arms. Nowhere, the quota of reservation for Scheduled Castes and OBCs is being fulfilled. The aid being provided by the Central Government for scholarship and Dalit harassment is not being released on time by the Government. To save the poor from the atrocities, the Government should make amendment in the constitution. Certain Castes are included in the list of Scheduled Castes in some states while the same are included in Backward Castes in other states. No double- standard talks would serve the poor people. The reservation quota should be implemented strictly in the all the departments of the Executive and the Judiciary. In Uttar Pradesh, many welfare schemes are being run for poor people. We demand that such incidents that occurred in Gujarat should not be repeated and strict action should be taken in that particular incident. Strict action should be taken against any kind of inhuman incident in any of the states.

SHRI A. NAVANEETHAKRISHNAN: In Tamil Nadu, 69 per cent reservation brought in through a special enactment for the first time in India. Dalit people are holding high positions in civil services and judiciary there. Dalit empowerment is the only way to abolish the untouchability in the real sense. In Tamil Nadu, Hon'ble

Chief Minister, empowered the Dalit community politically, socially and economically. I strongly condemn the statement issued by the person against Km. Mayawati. He must be dealt with in accordance with the law also. We must change our mindset. Without dalit community we cannot survive. Untouchability must be abolished in true letter and spirit.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: While venerating the cow, how can you mock and ridicule the oppressed whose only job is to skin the carcass when she dies. Some people have to do their job. They were only doing their job. This Government has shown in superficial symbolism the last two years. Conditions and situations of Dalits are worse. I will not be able to express as to what the Dalit feels today because of my limited experience. This is a great India where it does not matter which community I come from. I can eat what I want to eat. The power of democracy is that it can still bring me to the Rajya Sabha. This is the India I know. This is the unity in diversity. The problem is with the mindset. If you are a dalit Hindu, Sikh or Budhhist then you get the benefits. But if you are a dalit Christian you do not get a single benefit. We need to address this law because it is also a minority. Under this glorious Constitution, we are all equal and where even a humble dalit woman has the same dignity as a self-important.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Since this Government has come into office new avenues have been opened up for attacks on dalits and academia. A mindset is being created which I think is important. There has been an increase of 19 per cent in the attacks on dalits. The conviction rate was 48 per cent in 2013. In 2014, the conviction rate was less than five per cent. The sub-plan for dalits has been reduced by 38 per cent in this one year. Obscurantism is being reaffirmed once again in society today that due to sins of past birth unless someone has to go through that today, you cannot correct yourself and be reborn in a better caste for the next janma. That is the theological, philosophical, ideological obscurantism. Prevent any sort of a cross-mobility between castes and treat them as four separate compartments is the varna vyavastha 'The four-fold arrangement of

the Hindu society' is the ideological backdrop that is creating this mindset. There is no upward mobility in terms of profession. Therefore, if anybody is educated as a Dalit student, if they reach something higher, that has to be prevented and hence, the attacks on Dalit students in universities and educational centres. Eklavya and Shambhuk are the examples. This is the mindset. This is the ideological backdrop that is encouraging these attacks on the Dalits today. And this is what that needs to be confronted and fought. But sometimes we have a diarrhea of words, when we discuss, and there is constipation of action. What is the action that should follow? If the conviction rate has dropped what is the action that the Government proposes? The India of the last two years is degenerating and, therefore, this ideological, theological mindset has to be corrected. All this needs to be done along with giving the protection on the ground to people. Why is the situation not changing on the ground? There what is required is the economic empowerment of dalits. Unless you economically empower dalits, mere change of heart is not going to help. We should encourage the spirit of the scientific temper. It is the duty of the Government to implement Fundamental Duties. I am urging upon the Government to take action on all these aspects.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SOCIAL JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT (SHRI RAMDAS ATHAWALE): It is good thing that all that political parties condemn attacks on Dalits. There is no need to do politics in this regard. Instances of atrocities on dalits occur in everywhere. We should be united for stopping the atrocity on dalits as we are united in fight against terrorism. I feel that a stringent law should be enacted with regard to *Dalit* atrocities. We shall have to give a slogan of *Dalit-Sawarn* unity. There should not be any politics in whatever has happened. I feel that Government has full sympathy towards the youths who have been thrashed. The State Government has taken a decision to take stern action against those who are accused of thrashing and Union Government has also given orders to that effect. I have to say this much only to my friends in Congress that we need your help. The Union Government as well as State Government will take stern action and nobody will be spared.

SHRI DILIP KUMAR TIRKEY: I would like to say with anguish that the atrocity being committed against *Dalits* is a sensitive issue in our country. Laws have been enacted for the safety and security of *Dalits* and tribals. But on the ground level there is no improvement in the situation as yet. *Dalits* and tribals have to face disgrace and discrimination, whether they be in jobs, society or in politics. In my opinion, the chief reason of this atrocity is that there is no fear of law in the society. For some days, I have been watching clips in TV news that a person is thrashing four *Dalits*. They are making a video clip of this thrashing and after that they upload it on YouTube. They do not care for the law. We had a discussion on *Dalits* in Rajya Sabha yesterday, but we are watching in the television this morning that 22 *Dalits* are being beaten. It clearly shows that there is no fear of law. Here, *Dalits* have a fear from going to Police Station and they are also prevented from going to Police. Therefore, I would request that a separate *Dalit* cell should be created so that *Dalits* could go there easily and get their complaints registered. Besides, Christian *Dalits* are not being granted recognition of Scheduled Caste. I request the Government that Christian *Dalits* should also be included in the list of Scheduled Castes.

KM. MAYAWATI: Yesterday, the way in which undignified and intemperate language was used by a BJP member, that has hurt badly to the self-esteem of people belonging to *Dalit* community in the whole country. The good thing was that leaders of all the political parties in the House condemned it and Hon'ble leaders of all the parties participating in the discussion today have also condemned it. I express my gratitude towards the leaders of ruling party, Opposition and all political parties. BJP has sacked that person from the post and has ousted him from the party. It was a good step and I appreciate it. This incident was condemned from all sides. Not only that, people in most of the states in the country came out on roads today and lodged their protest. I express my gratitude towards them as well. Today, injustice and atrocities are being committed against *Dalits* in various parts of the country. A discussion is going on in the House under Rule 176 on that count. Hon'ble leaders of various parties have expressed their opinions in quite detail before me. Almost 69

years have lapsed since our country became independent. During this period Governments of various parties have ruled in the Center. But Congress party has ruled for quite a long time. Congress party has ruled for almost 54 years. BJP has been in power for 8 years. But it is a matter of regret that harassment of *Dalits* and tribals has not stopped as yet in the country during this long span of time. Not even 50 percent change has been noticed in the condition of these communities. In absence of proper pleadings by Central Government, matters relating to reservation in promotion became nullified in Supreme Court. We were thinking that when BJP Government will come into power, it will take seriously the matter relating to reservation in promotion and will pass the Constitutional Amendment. But this did not happen. I also want to say that the Central Government made ineffective the reservation policy for SC/ST by providing most of the works to private sector. A great injustice is being done against them in judiciary. Their representation is not there. There is no reservation in higher judiciary. These people are quite sad. The mindset of the Governments against *Dalits* and tribals has not changed as yet. For that reason only they are being harassed. Whenever any atrocity is committed against *Dalits* in a state, their FIR is not registered easily; what to speak of dispensing justice to them. Not only Muslims but *Dalits* are also being harassed and many types of atrocities are committed against them on a large scale in the name of 'Go Raksha' in the BJP ruled states in the country. When these people comes on the roads in protest, the government tries to suppress their voice. This is a serious matter, therefore, I request the government to take stern action against the guilty police officers by dismissing them from service and putting them in the prison. The investigation by CID is not going to give justice to the victims, so, I would request that the final charge sheet be filed by the police in this present case of Una in Gujarat and it be tried in a Fast Track Court under the supervision of a sitting judge of the High Court. Otherwise, this case will also linger on like many other such cases of atrocities on *Dalits*. I demand that an all party meeting be called to find a solution and such cases be tried in a special court so that guilty persons be

punished at the earliest. All *Dalits* are citizens of this country and there should not be any politics in their matters.

SHRI MAJEED MEMON: Constitutionally, a *Dalit* cannot be discriminated as far as all the facilities of the country are concerned. Unfortunately, the society is not treating a *Dalit* and a *Non-Dalit* equally. The *Dalits* are left behind from the mainstream. The caste-related violence occurs in India in various forms. For the last few days in Gujarat *Dalit* community has been seething with anger over the public flogging of a group of *Dalits* in a village near Una town in the Saurashtra region by members of the local Gau Raksha Samiti. Even the flogging was filmed and posted on Facebook as warning to other *Dalits*. The *Dalits* face rampant discrimination at all levels in Gujarat, be it a question of entry into temples or crematorium. *Dalits* face multiple forms of discrimination, violence and exclusion from rest of the society. Sexual abuse and other forms of violence against women are used by landlords and the police. Laws designed to ensure that *Dalits* enjoy equal rights and protections have seldom been enforced. Laws and government policies on land reform and budget allocations for the economic empowerment of the *Dalit* community remain largely unimplemented. *Dalits* who dare to challenge the social order have often been subject to abuses by their dominant-caste neighbours.

* * * * *
* * * * *

SHUMSHER K. SHERIFF,
Secretary-General.

rssynop@sansad.nic.in

***Supplement covering rest of the proceedings is being issued Separately.