

RAJYA SABHA

*SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE

(Proceedings other than Questions and Answers)

Friday, May 13, 2016/ Vaisakha 23, 1938 (Saka)

ANNOUNCEMENT BY THE CHAIR

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon'ble Members, as per the understanding arrived at the Leaders Meeting held on 12th of May, 2016, the House will today bid Farewell to its 53 Members who will be retiring in the coming months of June and July. No other business will be transacted today.

FAREWELL TO THE RETIRING MEMBERS

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon'ble Members, today, we bid farewell to some of our colleagues, who will be retiring in the months of June and July this year during the intervening period between the conclusion of this Session and the commencement of the next Session. 53 Members from the States of Andhra Pradesh, Telangana, Chattisgarh, Madhya Pradesh, Tamil Nadu, Karnataka, Odisha, Maharashtra, Punjab, Rajasthan, Uttar Pradesh, Uttarakhand, Bihar and Jharkhand will be retiring on the 21st, 29th and 30th of June and the 1st, 4th and 7th of July, 2016, respectively, on the completion of their term of office.

Parting is painful, more when it involves a colleague and a friend, a member of the fraternity. The solace is that life and public

life is a continuum and parting today will be a reunion tomorrow for some in the same surroundings. Every Member retiring has contributed significantly to the functioning of the House and in the process, to nurturing and strengthening our parliamentary democracy. You leave behind an indelible legacy that will continue to enrich the parliamentary proceedings in the future.

For those, who will come back, it will be more of the same. Excitability is a human trait. Tempering it with moderation, good sense and serious debate produces better results. This is the public's expectation from the senior House and this should be our endeavour.

I wish all the retiring Members good health, happiness and a modicum of leisure and many more years of service to the nation.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I also join you in extending a very happy retirement life and greetings to the retiring Members. But, in common parlance, retirement means retiring from the official work, formal work and take rest. But for a politician, retirement does not mean that. In fact, no politician retires. Actually, retirement for the Rajya Sabha Members is only a change of position. Most of them may be becoming MLAs, MPs and again Ministers. Some of them will come back. It is only a change of position.

All the Members have significantly contributed towards enriching the House. For that, I thank each one of them.

If anyone feels that I had been too harsh to them, he or she should condone that.

I sincerely hope they would get a better position hereafter. I wish you all the best.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI NARENDRA MODI): Rajya Sabha has an advantage which Lok Sabha does not have and that is, we are able to extend farewell to our colleagues among ourselves and to welcome them also. Lok Sabha does not have this privilege. The good wishes from this house for retiring members is not for their retirement, but for inspiring them to be more active. I too express my gratitude towards those who carried out their

responsibilities with the Government, played their role during the last 6 years and shared their knowledge, experience and expertise in national interest. Both the governments have benefitted from your experience. This government availed it for a shorter time, earlier government got it for a longer time, but the nation benefitted on the whole.

When we come here we are bound by limits of our opinions. Our thinking broadens by sitting and interacting with people from different backgrounds who come from every corner of the nation. We are a different person when we leave the house and this difference becomes the wealth of the society and the nation.

I am of the opinion that, this house and each of its members have played an important role in imparting wisdom to us, in enriching our knowledge and in broadening our vision. The great wealth of your experience will continue to be useful for your region, society and the nation. My good wishes are always with you. After you leave this house, this government would continue to provide you the assistance that is your right as a Member. I would also like that you avail this right and continue to serve the society. You have contributed in many important decisions. If we look at one session of your tenure, many important reforms and decisions took place in your presence and with your partnership and intervention. Your priority has always been the state because you represent the state. It would have been better if two decisions regarding states had been taken in your presence. Then the state that you represent would always have been proud of you. GST would have benefitted Bihar and Uttar Pradesh a lot. With the exception of one or two states, all states would have benefitted. Now you won't get that opportunity. But I believe that those of you who come back to this house, would get the opportunity for the welfare of the state that you represent. The other important work is that of CAMPA. If we had taken the decision this time, states would have received 42,000 crore rupees under CAMPA. Then, each state would have received about two or three thousand rupees. Two or three thousand crore rupees is not a meagre amount. This money was meant for forestry and could have been very useful in rainy season. It was to be a good decision but somehow, it did not happen this time. Rainy

season would be over and there would have to be another wait for four to six months. This work of direct benefit to the states could not be done. I believe that you will keep on sending good wishes from wherever you are so that work for welfare of states is carried out from this house. The other house cannot do what this house can do for welfare of states. I believe that your energy and experience would contribute towards this end. Once again, I extend good wishes from bottom of my heart to the retiring members for their more active journey. I express my gratitude from the Government for your cooperation. Thank you.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Today is an emotional day for all members because we are extending our good wishes and bidding farewell to our friends who are leaving the house after 6 years on completion of their tenure. Parliament is the biggest gift given to us by our freedom fighters and makers of constitution. Our house represents the unity in diversity of our country. It reflects the thinking of makers of our constitution. The greatest strength of this house is that whenever situation arose, it has risen to the occasion in the interest of the country. Each of the retiring members have contributed to the house. Some have taken part in discussion, some have taken part in debate, some have raised questions and some have raised important matters during zero hour. Those who come to the house after becoming Member of Parliament are fortunate. Their perspective changes and they have national and international perspective. When you are in the state your thought is something else and when you come to national level, your thought changes. Members who are leaving after completing their 6 years' tenure, have seen change of power and many laws were passed which were very important. We congratulate all those members. This house passed land boundary agreement with Bangladesh. Insurance Bill, which was pending for seven years, was passed. Laws are formulated with consensus and that is in the interest of the nation. When we were in power, GST couldn't be passed because of stalemate and lack of consensus. India has a culture of discussion and debate. Forming consensus in the country is Government's responsibility and opposition also plays an important role. I extend my party's good wishes to retiring members.

PROF. RAM GOPAL YADAV: We stand with a heavy heart to bid farewell to retiring members because we know that some will come back and some of them will not come back. Some very senior are also retiring and I hope that they will come back. It is true that, Rajya Sabha has no power with regards to finance and government formation. This creates misunderstanding in some people that Rajya Sabha is a weak and second grade house. This is not true. This is very important house. There are many bills which were brought in Rajya Sabha and then they went to Lok Sabha and were passed. When the house is in session, there are heated debates and discussions, but there is no animosity. Members of Rajya Sabha are worried that judiciary is unnecessarily encroaching upon our jurisdiction. Despite the clear cut demarcation of powers in our Constitution the interference by the Judiciary in the purview of the Parliament is the matter of concern. I wish all the retiring members a good health and a prosperous life.

SHRI SHARAD YADAV: There is no farewell in the politics. I would like to mention here that our country has not been moved forward on the expected lines. The dreams of our great personalities are yet to be fulfilled. Most of the members who are retiring today have given their valuable contribution in this House. I hope that they will continue to work in the public interest even after retirement. I hope that all the members who are retiring today would be re-elected.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: I have learnt a lot from the members who are retiring today. These members have sometime taken the decision in public interest and in the national interest and contributed in passing of several Bills across the party line. We pray to the Almighty that they spend their remaining life with their family and also work for the society.

KM. MAYAWATI: I wish a good health to all the members who are retiring today. All these members are having a vast experience and have contributed widely in the different spheres of life. On behalf of my Party, I congratulate all of them and also hope that the experience they have got here will be utilized by them in the

interest of their party and also in the national interest. So far as the GST is concerned, we will support it, whenever it will be introduced and will also give suggestions regarding thereto.

SHRI DILIP KUMAR TIRKEY: This moment is very emotional one for all of us. The members, who are retiring today, have done a very good job towards the country, the poor and Tribal people, through the Parliament and I also hope that they will be continuing to do so in the time to come. I congratulate to all the retiring members especially from the state of Odisha.

SARDAR SUKHDEV SINGH DHINDSA: We pray that all the retiring members are re-elected to this House. We get the know-how of the culture and problems of the country by coming into touch of the members who are coming here from the different states of the country. I would like to mention that a Special Session should be called with regard to the Judicial Reforms. On behalf of my Party I would like to congratulate all the members who are retiring today.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: On behalf of my party as well as on my personal behalf, I express a feeling that we will be missing some of our colleagues here, from the next session onwards. We also expect and hope that many of them will again come back to this House. During the period we worked together, we had a very rich experience of learning, both individually and collectively. I wish them a healthy and active life.

SHRI VISHAMBHAR PRASAD NISHAD: I would like to thank to Hon'ble Chairman, Hon'ble Deputy Chairman and to all the officers and employees of this House. I would also like to thank to the leaders of my Party for giving me the opportunity to be a part of this House. I would like to thank senior leaders of my party for giving me an opportunity to serve the people of through this august House. I had been a member of the Legislative Assembly for four terms and also elected for the Lok Sabha once. I would like to urge upon the government to fulfil their election promises. The country is facing the problems of starvation, poverty, unemployment, etc. and Bundelkhand is the most sufferer. Though, we are self reliant in food grains, but still people have to face many problems, particularly in Bundelkhand.

The central government should help the Government of Uttar Pradesh in solving these problems.

DR. CHANDAN MITRA: I believe that I have been able to contribute something to the national discourses during my term of more than 10 years. The role of the Rajya Sabha and the Lok Sabha is duly defined in the constitution and we know that we have no control over money but, I think, the Rajya Sabha can act as a repository of wisdom for showing the way to the Lok Sabha, to the States Legislatures and to the Government as to how we should go about. I would request all the Members that there should be some scope for discussing policy issues. We should discuss the meaning of nationalism and issues like, Wildlife and Environment.

SHRIMATI KANAK LATA SINGH: I am thankful to all the members, particularly senior leaders of my party for helping in discharging my duties as a member of this House. The Chair has always encouraged me. I joined active politics after the demise of my father and learned the actual meaning of politics as serving the people. Because, only then, a politician can understand in a better way the problems of a common man and justify his duty as a politician. I always remained present in the House, except on an instance of using my franchise in my state. I would like to request the government to sanction the required amount for upgrading the Gorakhpur Medical college as a Super Speciality Hospital and accord the status of a Central University to the University of Gorakhpur.

DR. K.P. RAMALINGAM: I would like to express my sincere gratitude to the Chair and all my colleagues. I also want to register my thanks to the officers and officials because they have done wonderful work. I served as a Member of the Legislative Assembly in Tamil Nadu for two terms and was also a member in the 11th Lok Sabha. The great leaders of Tamil Nadu, M.G.R and Dr. Kalignar played a significant role in shaping my entire life, particularly the political career. I would also like to mention the kindness of Chair for giving the opportunity to raise so many supplementary questions. I would like to make a humble request that the rule permitting Adjournment Motion should be amended as this

has been raised on many occasions by the Members to adjourn the Question Hour. Whereas, through the Question Hour only the people of this country could come to know about the functioning of the Ministries and response on a particular issue from the Government. The present Government should come forward in bringing a separate budget for agriculture.

SHRI V. HANUMANTHA RAO: I have been a Member of the Rajya Sabha since 2004. I always fought for the weaker sections of people and I have been in the forefront on any issues concerning OBCs, minorities and SC/STs. As the Convener of the Forum of OBC MPs, I had been taking up and pursuing the important issues with the Government concerning the welfare of the OBCs. Our Forum was able to have reservation in seats for OBCs in higher educational institutions like IITs, IIMs, AIIMS, etc. A Parliamentary Committee on Welfare of OBCs was formed in 2012. The NCBC should also be given Constitutional powers to address the grievances of OBCs and to monitor the 27 per cent reservation. Due to liberalization and globalization, unemployment has been on the rise, especially among the downtrodden and backward sections of the society.

SHRI V.P. SINGH BADNORE: Sir, It is a question of shame to us that instead of discussing, we go and disturb this House. Now, such a system should be devised in which if somebody goes into the Well, whether in a group or individually, they are suspended for the following two days, so that it would never happen. We can make an exception that if it is done in the Zero Hour, it is acceptable. I pay my profound gratitude to everybody for always been very kind to me. I want forgiveness from everybody if I have done any wrong to anybody.

SHRI ASHK ALI TAK: I express my gratitude to all of you and all the parties of this House for giving me so much affection and love. I started my political career from school and worked in various capacities. I have always discharged my duties diligently. Your able guidance will help me lifelong.

SHRI ISHWARLAL SHANKARLAL JAIN: I thank you for giving me an opportunity to express my views on this occasion. It

was my heartfelt wish to join Rajya Sabha so as to get an opportunity to serve for the country and to learn something. I have received considerable assistance from our national leaders. I got an opportunity to get knowledge of various subjects while working with various committees. I thank all of you for receiving affection and guidance from you.

SHRI ARVIND KUMAR SINGH: I have always raised my voice in favour of students, youth and down-trodden people of the society in this House. I started my Parliamentary career through student politics. We have seen many ups and downs in this House. I assure the whole House that I will observe all that in my personal life also whatever I have learnt from my seniors and juniors and would maintain dignity of this House.

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA: I would like to say a few things in my mother tongue Odia. As a disciplined soldier, I maintained discipline in this House and spoke only when the Chair asked me to speak. Corruption is the greatest enemy of our democracy. My request to Hon'ble Members is that our regional languages should be honoured, protected and developed as they define our identity and nationality.

SHRI TARUN VIJAY: I shall remain grateful lifelong to receive love, affection and co-operation of all those present here which is a remarkable achievement for me. I am pained to see injustice with dalits of the country. We should stand united to uproot this evil of untouchability from the country. Secondly, soldiers should be respected. This House should do whatever is possible in honour of our soldiers.

SHRIMATI MOHSINA KIDWAI: It is a great honour for us on being elected as a Member of this House. I had the privilege of serving as a Member of Uttar Pradesh Assembly. Thereafter by the grace of God I became Member of Lok Sabha and now Rajya Sabha. We are duty-bound to maintain dignity of this House. Co-operation from both sides is solicited to run this House. Our's is a country of peace and brotherhood. This 'unity in diversity' is the biggest strength of this country. Therefore I wish to say that maintain this 'unity in

diversity' and do not allow the atmosphere of the country to be vitiated.

SHRI K.C. TYAGI: First of all, I would like to extend a lot of thanks to you and after that to Hon'ble Deputy Chairman and Secretary General that you helped me at a number of occasions. Today, I do not want to say any serious thing because there is no Minister to reply it. In 1977, Sharad Yadav Ji, I and Mohan Singh Ji, our friend D.P.Tripathi and Leader of the House were released from prison. Arun Jaitely Ji started practicing as an advocate and we all engaged in politics. Now, we are getting 10,000 rupees from U.P. Government for being sent to jail and after today we will become ex-M.P. Then we will get an amount of 20,000 rupees per month as pension of ex-M.P. I had a tenure of 3 years and 4 months only. During this period, I participated in a number of debates and feel myself too much dignified. During this period I also got opportunity to work with Balraj Madhok Saheb, Biju Patnaik Saheb and Pilu Modi Saheb.

SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM: I would like to say a few things. It is a great privilege to be here for the last 12 years. I have learnt a lot. I take this opportunity to thank my leader, Hon'ble Congress President, Shrimati Sonia Gandhi and also Dr. Manmohan Singh. While getting myself enriched, I, also contributed my deliberations in the PAC and in the Energy Committee. I also express my gratefulness to the Leader of the Opposition, Deputy Leader and all senior leaders for guiding me on various occasions. 50 Members of Parliament have submitted a Memorandum to the Prime Minister. I hope the Prime Minister will take cognizance of that. We, as social activists, would like to remind that we will continue to work for the poor and will continue to be active in public life. Once again, I take this opportunity to thank all my former colleagues in the bureaucracy and the leaders of all political parties for their immense affection, and, as I said, the Hon'ble Chairman, the Deputy Chairman and the Secretariat. We request the Government to honour their commitments and do justice for the State of Andhra Pradesh.

SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA: At the outset, I thank you for giving me this opportunity. I will be failing in my duty if I do not thank my erstwhile party, Biju Janta Dal, and my erstwhile leader and the present adversary, Shri Naveen Patnaik, for sponsoring me twice to the Rajya Sabha. I came in 2004 and we were part of NDA. Participation in any debate or discussion was nearly out of question for me over a year. This House is the Council of States and all of us must support each other to see that the States must get their legitimate claims. The highpoint of these twelve years was passage of the Women Reservation Bill. These twelve years I had noticed that humour is necessary to lighten and soften discussions. Today, I was congratulating Mr. Siddhu that since you have come some humour will return to the House. But, I did not know the potentiality of Shri K.C. Tyagi. How much of humour he has in him, I have discovered it today. I must thank you, the Hon'ble Deputy Chairman, Secretary-General and the entire staff of the Rajya Sabha who made it possible for us to perform our duties.

SHRI SALIM ANSARI: During these six years I have learnt a lot in this House. This is my achievement that my presence in this House has been hundred percent. I am not retiring now rather I have completed my term. I will try to make a co-ordination among all parties. I wish a magnificent future to all the members who are retiring today. I bid thanks to the Secretary-General and his staff also.

SHRI RAJPAL SINGH SAINI: I express my gratitude to Bahujan Samaj Party and Behan Mayawati who sent me to this House. She is the Messiah of the poor, dalits, backwards and minorities. Whenever I requested to raise the issues of the poor and labourers, Kurian Saheb always gave me opportunity. I thank all of you.

SHRI AMBETH RAJAN: I express my heartfelt gratitude to my party leader, Kumari Mayawati, for sending me to this august House as a Member for two terms. Before coming to this House, I was involved in many social activities. I learned many things in this House. I am proud of myself for being a Member of this House. I am also very thankful to the Chairman, the Deputy Chairman, Secretary-

General and the other staffs of Rajya Sabha Secretariat, who were very cooperative and helpful to me.

SHRI VIJAY JAWAHARLAL DARDA: I don't consider by this journey as a last journey. I big thanks to all the leaders of my Party. This is my understanding that ideologies must have a place in the politics of a nation and its making. Every voice raised in this House is the voice of the nation. The Secularism is the pivot of the Democracy. Fundamentalism in Politics can ruin the people. Deadlocks and interruptions are contrary to our parliamentary tradition.

DR. VIJAYLAXMI SADHO: A mini India is sitting in this House. Becoming even a Member of this House is itself pride worthy for us. I would like to remember my father Late Sitaram Ji Sadho also. He participated in the building of the Freedom Movement. I would also like to remember Late Rajiv Gandhi Ji who had given opportunity to youth and women and to myself also to fight election of Legislative Assembly. I had been in the treasury bench and the opposition too. I bid thanks to all the Members of this House who helped me across the party line.

SHRI AVINASH PANDE: I would like to express my heartiest gratitude towards my party. I belong to a very simple family. During my college time I participated in many students movements. That's how I entered in the politics. Experiences gained in this House are very valuable for me and I hope it will prove helpful in my life. I would like to thank my parents and my guru for giving me good guidance. I would also like to thank all of the leaders, my colleagues and staff of the Rajya Sabha.

SHRI GULAM RASOOL BALLYAWI: I would like to express my gratitude to the senior leaders of all parties and my party also. I am a simple villager. It is a known fact that this House is above religion and cast. I have learned many things in this House. It is my request that on the name of terrorism many innocent people are languishing in the prisons. In my opinion Fast Track Court should be established in this regard.

SHRI NAND KUMAR SAI: I have learned many things under the leadership of my leaders. We are trying to make this country more powerful in the guidance of our Prime Minister. We should take a pledge to make this country as a poverty free country. Our country has been a very great country and hub of education. I hope that we will keep on working for its progress.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: I would like to express my gratitude to my party. In the last 12 years, I have had the opportunity of having been associated with nine historic legislations that were passed in the Lok Sabha and the Rajya Sabha. There were also numerous debates in this House particularly on climate change in which my position has been criticized. But I am so happy that the position that I took in Copenhagen and Cancun with the support of the Prime Minister is now a part of official Government policy. I will never forget my colleagues.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF MINORITY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI): I would like to give my best wishes to all the retiring members. I hope that they will keep on working towards the development of this country with full commitment.

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE, THE MINISTER OF CORPORATE AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): I knew some of the retiring members earlier, while I had introduction with others during the Parliament itself. Shri Jairam Ramesh have to play a long inning. The country and his party certainly need him. We arrive at the solution in the end only through debate. When we work, conflict is always there in politics but national interest also comes to the front. The Rajya Sabha has a great importance. Not only in our country, but there is mutual debate between both the Houses all over the world. It is the maturity of politics that it finds solution in itself. If the right of law making and budget making goes out of the hands of the Parliament, then Parliamentary democracy alongwith whole democracy becomes weak.

I pay my good wishes to the retiring members of this House and pray for their long lives and good health.

VALEDICTORY REMARKS

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon'ble Members, the 239th Session of the Rajya Sabha, that commenced on 25th of April, 2016, comes to a close today. The House had 15 sittings during which it deliberated for more than 69 hours. The 239th Session has been a short and challenging one. Members have shown an extraordinary ability to debate and dissent, to accommodate and differ amidst their political compulsions and ideological positions. A variety of issues and subjects have been taken up and instruments of parliamentary procedures have been utilized with skill and determination.

The House welcomed thirteen newly elected or re-elected Members from the States of Assam, Himachal Pradesh, Kerala, Nagaland, Punjab and Tripura and six newly nominated Members and bid farewell to 53 Members whose term of office would expire in the months of June and July, 2016.

Transacting its main task of Legislative Business, the House during the Session passed or returned 12 Government Bills, which demonstrated the desirability of careful deliberation through available instrumentalities, and the benefits accruing from it.

Apart from the Government Legislative Business transacted, individual Members are utilizing in greater measure the Zero Hour and Question Hour. During the Session, 81 Zero Hour submissions were made; 225 Starred Questions and 2,391 Unstarred Questions were answered. Of these, 61 were orally answered and another 227 Supplementaries were also raised. Besides, Members expressed their concern on matters of urgent public interest through 37 Special Mentions. Private Members introduced 6 Bills and some important issues were discussed through Bills and Resolutions.

Transacting its deliberative function, the House discussed two Short Duration Discussions on Drought and the Agusta Westland

Chopper Deal. About 40 Members participated in these discussions. In addition, during two Calling Attention, about 20 Members sought clarifications.

The House witnessed lively debate during the discussions on the working of Ministries of Health & Family Welfare and Human Resource Development.

Notwithstanding the fact that a good amount of both legislative and non-legislative work was transacted, the proceedings of the House were occasionally disrupted.

I have asked the Secretary-General to make available the statistical information relating to this House.

I take this opportunity to thank the Leader of the House, the Leader of the Opposition, the Ministers of Parliamentary Affairs, the Leaders of various parties and groups and the Hon'ble Members for the cooperation extended by them in the overall functioning of the House.

I also thank the Deputy Chairman, the Members on the Panel of Vice-Chairmen and the officers and staff of the Secretariat for their help and cooperation.

(The National Song, “Vande Mataram” was played.)

The House adjourned *sine die*.

SHUMSHER K. SHERIFF,
Secretary-General.

rssynop@sansad.nic.in