

**RAJYA SABHA**

---

**\*SUPPLEMENT  
TO  
SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE**

---

**(Proceedings other than Questions and Answers)**

---

**Tuesday, March 15, 2016/Phalguna 25, 1937 (Saka)**

---

**Farewell to the Retiring Members - *Contd.***

**THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY):** Membership of this House is a great privilege. Each one of the retiring Members in their six-year tenure contributes his/her wisdom to the proceedings of this House and in nation building. Members, who come in, are normally senior in public life. They have excelled in some sphere or the other. That is probably one of the reasons that the debate in this House has always been of a very high quality. Despite political differences, the atmosphere of this House has always been one of mutual respect and courtesies. When one day all of us exit from this House, we will miss each one of them. I will miss some of my colleagues like Mr. Avinash Rai Khanna and others. I know Dr. Mungekar and Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar, who are known for their commitment. We will certainly miss the story-telling abilities of Mr. Javed Akhtar and my very own friend from college, Mr. Ashwani Kumar. My best wishes to all the retiring Members and, I am sure, in some capacity or the other, they will continue to serve this country.

---

\*This Synopsis is not an authoritative record of the proceedings of the Rajya Sabha.

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD):** Regarding Members of Parliament and politicians I will say that they are like Sun. It never sets. Sometimes they go to Legislative Assembly, sometimes to Parliament and sometimes they become Governor or reach somewhere else. I am dead sure that those politicians who come from mainstream, will appear sitting on high positions in Lok Sabha, Rajya Sabha, Vidhan Sabha or in their own party. But those who are nominated ones, they will also remain active in their respective fields. Our two artists-Javed Akhtar Saheb and Shrimati B. Jayashree- are sitting here, they have contributed a lot. I know many people like Mungekar Sahib, Mani Shankar Aiyar ji, Naznin ji, Antony ji, Avinash Rai ji, Ashwani Kumar ji, Dhindsa Sahib, Gill Sahib, Balagopal ji and Naresh Gujral ji personally and very well. I am extremely happy to learn that out of these, three Members- Dhindsa sahib, Naresh Gujral ji and Antony ji- are coming back. Anand Sharma ji will also come back in this House. This is a matter of great pleasure. We shall miss our colleagues and their contributions.

**SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR:** I have been a witness to the political history of this country in the making in the 21st century. This is a moment for all Members to pay their gratitude and offer their salutations to all those who contributed in one way or the other in them being here. I acknowledge a deep sense of gratitude and debt to some great men who mentored me, supported me and blessed me in my political journey. Late Shri Rajiv Gandhi taught me the value of decency, humility and grace in public life. Dr. Manmohan Singhji stands out as a shining example of integrity and probity in public life. I learnt a lot in the earlier years of my political life from Sardar Swaran Singh, Gyani Zail Singh, Shri Arjun Singh and also from Shri Chandrashekhar and Choudhary Devi Lal. These people have left an indelible imprint on my mind as a politician and, on my heart, as an individual and I record my deepest gratitude to each one of them. This House has to be the torch-bearer of the liberties of our countrymen. This House was conceived as a House for debating and deliberating upon issues of vital national importance so that we can convey to the people of this country that we are not failing to keep their trust in us.

Regrettably, we have seen the decline of the institution of Parliament. All of us have to commit ourselves that we will not fail the people of India. I do believe that there is never an ending in public service, but the roles and the modes may change. I would like to mention two regrets of my tenure, one, Justice Sen's Impeachment Motion when I had a conscientious dissent not because he was not heard but I realized that the verdict against a Judge has been etched in stone even before the debate had begun and the second, when I resigned as Law Minister because of the political frenzy of the moment and I could not be heard in this House.

**DR. M.S. GILL:** I always believe in democracy. India's people cannot be ruled by any kind of presidential system or any kind of autocratic system. To represent the crores of Indian's is something very special. Parties should not block this House and force its adjournment merely for getting votes. Poverty, lack of education and gender discrimination in India remains unabated due to non-fulfilment of responsibilities by the various parties.

**DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR:** Representing this House is the greatest privilege for me. This was possible because of India's vibrant democracy. I express my gratitude to former President of India Shrimati Pratibha Devi Singh Patil, Congress President Shrimati Sonia Gandhi and Hon'ble Dr. Manmohan Singh for bringing me to the Rajya Sabha and to the Planning Commission. I express my gratitude to Dr. Manmohan Singh, Khan Saheb and Kurien Saheb. I received respect, honour, affection from each and every Member of the House. I would suggest that the Question Hour should be sacrosanct as it is the most important instrument to challenge the Government on the policy matter. I wish each and every retiring colleague of mine with a happy and fruitful life.

**SHRIMATI B. JAYASHREE:** It is a very emotional moment. First of all, I would like to thank the Bharat Sarkar and Soniaji for nominating me in this House. Basically, I am an artist, so I don't know anything about politics. But I learnt a lot after coming to this House. I will miss you all. I feel proud that I have got a chance to serve the nation as a Member of Parliament.

**SHRI BALWINDER SINGH BHUNDER:** Today, our several learned colleagues are departing from us. I wish that after retirement they would be able to serve the nation and the society in a better way. Our colleagues Mr. Gill, Ashwani Ji, Khanna Saheb and Mungekar ji have done a lot of service to the country and to this House. We will miss them. I wish a good health and a prosperous life to all the retiring Members.

**SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR:** I have completed a quarter century of my association with the Parliament as a Member of Parliament. I remember, once in the Rajya Sabha, during the middle of the India-China war, Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee, being the member of this House, demanded that the Rajya Sabha be convened to debate the war. The Prime Minister immediately granted the request. That was democracy at its best. But, for last six years in the Rajya Sabha have been a somewhat disillusioning experience. Anyway, now the time have come to say farewell. I have had the opportunity of viewing Parliament from every possible dimension. I take my leave now with many warm memories.

**SHRI AVINASH RAI KHANNA:** I bid thanks to the Leader of House who has given me the responsibility of the Chief Whip and I also give thanks to my Party which has sent me to this House. I started my career as an MLA from Punjab and touched the level of the State President. After that, I was elected for the Lok Sabha and now I am a member of Rajya Sabha. I have gathered several experiences in both the Houses. When I was an MLA, I raised many issues. Parliament is a place where we can express our view in a very good manner. I have worked for different committees. I have worked as member of Human Rights Commission also. I am very thankful to my party for giving me various responsibilities. In this process I have learned many things also. I am from a very humble family. I have always tried that nobody should ever get hurt by my words. Today I am not going empty handed from here. Blessings of all these people are with me. I would like to express my gratitude for everybody.

**SHRIMATI BIMLA KASHYAP SOOD:** I would like to express my gratitude for my party. I am a social worker and for me politics is also like social work. I am very thankful to my party for giving me various responsibilities. I have learned so many things from this House. Today our country is in safe hands. Everybody must contribute to take this country to the top position in the world. I request all the Hon'ble Members that they should participate actively in all the programmes of national interests and should take part in discussions. I wish that my country India should emerge as a prosperous and progressive country. Today, I rise to bid farewell to leaders of all the parties.

**SHRI JAVED AKHTAR:** I heard many distinguished leaders in this House. My aim was to raise the problems of some writers, composers and copyright. I met the Government as well as the Leaders of Opposition in this regard and got full cooperation from both the sides. In our country, we have the Government as well as the opposition. We should always be thankful to the Government alongwith the complaints. There cannot be secularism without democracy. The Democracy goes ahead with the thought that majority and minority are not permanent. After Independence, we have achieved a lot. Our country has a very good constitution as well as a sizeable number of youth. Average India has a very good IQ. Development is not GDP but development is Human Development Index. In a country where there are lot of problems of unemployment, health, education and infrastructure, we are wasting our energy somewhere else. We are on the crossroad. Wise is he who learns from the experience but wiser one learns from the experience of others. Fringe is increasing day by day. There are many able persons also in this Government who are doing good work and they can do it. Japan and China don't have the advantage of youthful population. India has 20 years with youthful energy. Adjournments and polarization will not take us forward. It is possible to have housing, food, clothing, medicines, schools, roads and electricity for all provided that focus should not be just on next election.

**SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL:** I thank all the leaders for the great experience in this house. We experienced a lot of heated arguments and discussions. But friendships developed after such experiences will be cherished. In this House, I ensured to protect the interests of the common people of our country. Rajya Sabha is the highest body that symbolizes the federal character of the country. We discussed the Education Tribunal Bill .There were great experiences like the impeachment of Justice Soumitra Sen. We had great discussions and arguments on the Lokpal Bill as well. I raised the issue of the airport fee. I am getting pessimistic because issue of rubber could not be solved. If this style of bringing Bill through Money Bill route continues, the federal character of the country and the existence of the Council of States will be questioned in future. The interests of the people of the country are to be protected. I am thanking you all for these experiences.

**DR. T.N. SEEMA:** Every day in this House has been very educative. There were memorable debates on corruption, price rise, food security, especially women safety, etc. For a large and diverse democracy like India, this Council of States is the foundation of cooperative federalism. When law-making bodies like Assemblies and Parliaments have 50 per cent women then we can proudly say that Indian women have half the sky.I thank hon. Deputy Chairman, the Leader of the House, Mr. Arun Jaitley, the Leader of the Opposition, Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad and the leader of my Party, Comrade Sitaram Yechury. My thanks to the Secretariat, the Secretary-General and the staff who have been very cooperative throughout all these years.

**THE MINISTER OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT, THE MINISTER OF HOUSING AND URBAN POVERTY ALLEVIATION AND THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU):** I apologise to the House that I could not be present from the beginning because I was piloting a Bill in the other house. I would like to acknowledge the rich contribution made by all these Members who are retiring from the House. Some outstanding performances were made from different sides in this House and we will be missing some of them. I hope their

respective parties will re-nominate them so that we have the benefit of those great people's contribution in future also.

**SHUMSHER K. SHERIFF,**  
*Secretary-General.*

[rssynop@sansad.nic.in](mailto:rssynop@sansad.nic.in)

**ERRATA TO THE SUPPLEMENT TO SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE  
DATED 14<sup>th</sup> MARCH, 2016 AND SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE  
DATED 15<sup>th</sup> MARCH, 2016**

<b>Page No.</b>	<b>Line No.</b>	<b>Correction</b>
200	33	Read "expects" for "accepts".
200	35	Delete "there".
201	1	Add "is there" after "SMS".
211	20	Read "literate" for "Illiterate".