

RAJYA SABHA

*SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE

(Proceedings other than Questions and Answers)

Wednesday, February 23, 2011/ Phalgun 4, 1932 (Saka)

MOTION OF THANKS ON PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS-Contd.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: The President talks of a healthy and prosperous India. A healthy and prosperous India is impossible without the workers and the exploited sections of our people's wellbeing being taken care of. The living conditions of our people are increasingly deteriorating. The speech of the President is a customary address, a balance-sheet, an indication of what would be done by this Government in future. This Government is in a sense of stupor. The President's Speech actually reflects a directionless drift that this Government has been gripped in. There is not one concrete step given here in order to combat inflation. Are they going to ban speculation in the essential commodities? It has reached to the tune of 15 lakh crores of rupees a year. On that, there is not even a word in the President's Address. Neither is there any mention of the strengthening of public distribution system. Even the fact that you have deregulated the petroleum prices has not found a place. The ad valorem tax on petroleum products continues.

If her Government is sincere about the first of the five priorities that she has listed, where she talks of combating inflation, at least, on

*This Synopsis is not an authoritative record of the proceedings of the Rajya Sabha.

these three measures, we would like the Government to answer. Will you ban speculative trading in essential commodities? Will you release the excess food that is there in your stocks to the States to be distributed under the Public Distribution System? Will you restructure the tax structures in the petroleum sector so that this rise in prices of petroleum products can be stopped?

When we talk of corruption in high places, it is not a question of individuals we are talking of. We are questioning the infallibility of the entire system. How are we allowing our system to degenerate to such an extent, and that is because we are not promoting capitalism, but we are promoting crony capitalism. The Government is saying that we are giving incentives for greater tele-density; we are giving incentives for cheaper telecom services. The scam lies in the fact that the licenses to whom they were sold were sold within months for at least six times what they paid to the Government. Today, if the tele-density is high, it is high in spite of the fact that those who are providing the tele-density had paid six times more to the original licensees.

You do not collect money and say that it is incentive for growth. Whatever little you spend on the poor, you say that is subsidies for the poor and it is bad for growth. You can provide education for all and you can provide food security in our country if you can only stop this sort of siphoning through this crony capitalism. 70 per cent of our population is below the age of 35 years. If we can give them good health, if we can give them good education, our country will flourish. All that we have to do is to create those policies by which we can actually tap our own potential. If anybody is stopping us from being the leaders of the intellectual world today, it is we. If you stop siphoning of this money and instead use it to provide food security, to provide education for our youth, then, India's true potential can be achieved. And, that is where we want this Government to think about corruption.

We wanted a JPC because we need to examine how our system could be so manipulated to allow such a big scam. It is the system's manipulation that needs to be plugged. You declared a legitimate tax rate and instead of collecting that tax revenue, you gave concessions.

But if you had collected this money and invested in you public investments, in food security, in right to education, in building the infrastructure we would have not only built our infrastructure, provided health and education for our youth, but we would also have generated massive amount of employment.

I think that, instead of providing concessions to the rich, the legitimate money should be collected from them. That money should be utilized through public investments to create our infrastructure and provide a better life for our youth. That is how we will have 'inclusive' growth. As far as the 'PPP' project is concerned, it is not really 'private participation in public projects', but it is 'private profit making project through public funds'. The London Transport has withdrawn 23 out of their 25 'PPP' projects. In the name of 'PPP' projects, new scheme for corruption has been created in the States. As far as health insurance in private hospitals is concerned, the poor patients are being deviated. Therefore, the Government should take a serious look at this 'PPP' project. The private sector is a very important element of our economy in our country. If private capital enters the public projects through joint ventures, it should be welcomed. I think that the crony capitalism is developing. It needs to be stopped. I am beseeching the Government to shift their policy priorities and utilise the legitimate revenues to provide jobs and education for all. That is how we can build a better and prosperous India.

As far as the internal and external security is concerned, there is no dispute at all here. Terrorism cannot be tolerated because it is anti-national. Terrorism knows no religion, no caste and no region. The cross-border terrorism from Pakistan or terrorism of any sort should be treated as anti-national. The gravest threat to India's internal security is Maoist violence. Since the last Lok Sabha election, 380 of my comrades have lost their lives due to Maoist violence. The Prime Minister regards it as the gravest threat. But, there is a contradiction between what he says and what is actually being done. We should not allow the nexus between the Maoists and the particular party which is associated with the Congress. In the name of terrorist blasts at Malegaon and Mecca Masjid, innocent youths of a particular

community have been languishing in jail for many years. They have been wrongly confined. The sense of alienation among the youths will become the fertile soil for the growth of such terrorist activities. What is the relief that the Government is proposing for the accused persons in Godhara incident who have been in jail for nine years?

As far as the event in Egypt and the Iran Gas Pipeline are concerned, we should act in a manner in which we can protect our interests in the global fora. In respects of the ongoing negotiations on climate change and the Doha round of discussions, the official positions taken by the Government of India, are comprising our national interests. The negotiations with the European Union will adversely affect the Indian agriculture. On climate change, the per capita carbon emissions of the United States of America are twenty times more than as that of India. Therefore, we should not make voluntary declarations that we will reduce our carbon emissions.

Fifty-five per cent of households in our country do not have direct access to electricity and seventy per cent of people do not have sanitation facilities. We want to provide them with electricity, good sanitation and living conditions. We need energy. The Planning Commission has estimated that the per capita food availability is declining since the 1990s. This is very depressing. Poverty, inflation and declining rate of food consumption are the major problems. Dr. Ambedkar had said that there are contradictions in our social and economic life. We must remove these contradictions at the earliest possible moment. I am sorry to say that there are two 'Indias' in the making. It is not good. We will have to pay heed to the lakhs of workers working in the streets of Delhi. Lastly, I make a sincere appeal to the Government of India that all the above-said issues must be probed and the guilty should be brought to book.

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: I support the Motion of thanks on President's Address moved by Shri Janardan Dwivedi. President's Address was vivid. The Government has clearly mentioned that they would fight corruption in the country. A Group of Ministers (GOM) has been formed to prepare a permanent mechanism in this respect. Our

intention is beyond suspicion. Our image gets tarnished in the world when we talk of corruption in India. Our Hon'ble Prime Minister is appreciated for his honesty. There is a long list of our Ministers against whom no allegations have been made. We have taken action against a Minister and the concerned Officers and they have been sent to jail. The C.B.I. is investigating the case. The Supreme Court has also started their monitoring. The JPC has been formed to conduct investigation in this regard. We have also taken action against the Chief Minister against whom allegation was made.

If we are not taking any action, if we are not conducting the enquiry then you can raise the finger. JPC has been announced as has been demanded. I would request the Government to bring all the cases of telecom after 1998 within the purview of the JPC. The cases of disinvestment should once again be investigated as the national assets have been sold away at throw-away prices. As regards S-band, an agreement was entered into to develop the satellite. There is no scam in this case. In the matter of Gujarat, it has been said that no Minister from the Centre has gone there. I would like to ask whether any Union Minister was invited for it? Secondly, I would say that all the banks have given their participation. As regards MOUs, I demand that they should come out with a White Paper on it.

Now, there is a matter of price-rise. We are all concerned about it. The common man is suffering. The price-rise must be contained and I think, both, Centre and the States, have to work together to solve the problem. It is the responsibility of all the political parties. One important step is to save the agricultural land which is diminishing. The conversion of land use should be curbed. The developmental activities should be carried out on wasteland. We have to save food also and for this purpose, waste food management should be there. A huge amount of food is being wasted through parties and this should be banned.

The President has talked about judicial accountability. I welcome it. I request the Government that Judicial Accountability Bill should be brought in at the earliest because the system of judiciary is deteriorating. As regards Maoists, the naxalism should be contained and

in this process, our officers have to be attentive, alert and watchful while taking action in this regard. We have to tackle it collectively.

One point has been raised about coalition and it has been said that one political party has been given favour. I would say that you have also experienced the coalition Government. There are always some compulsions and so, such allegations should not be made. At last, I would request that English should be taught as optional subject in all the primary schools in all the Northern States so that the children do not have any inferiority complex throughout their life.

The Hon'ble President has mentioned about the democracy in the country of Egypt and has supported it in her Address. We have to be careful in the case of Pakistan. We want peace in our neighbour country. The Government must give some attention towards it. With these words, I support the Motion of Thanks.

SHRI SHANTA KUMAR: The President's Address is full of achievements as well certain schemes of Government. But no mention has been made about the problems being faced by the country today. There are problems of price-rise, the poverty, the increasing gap between rich and poor, terrorism, Maoism and corruption in the country. There are different factors responsible for it but the main cause is deterioration of moral values. Corruption is the root cause of all the problems centralizing the wealth in certain hands. The recommendations of Administrative Reforms Commissions had not been fully implemented. These should have been implemented seriously in the country.

The Benami Transactions (Prohibition) Act, 1988 was passed in 1988. But I am surprised that it was not utilized even once in the last 23 years. The Law Commission and the Supreme Court had stated a number of times to attach the property of public servants. But the Government has so far not taken any action in this regard. The Competition Act, passed in the year 2002, has not been implemented so far. And again strange thing about it is that when it was implemented and notified, all its clauses were not notified, which is contempt of the House.

The Lokpal Bill was introduced for the first time in 1968 in the Parliament. It was introduced 8 times and lapsed on 8 occasions. Since then 45 years had gone and even after 45 years such an essential legislation regarding curbing out corruption was not passed. A Group of Ministers had been formed regarding black money. But who will trust it? What is the state of affairs in India after 64 years post independence?

According to the Transparency International, India is one of the most corrupt countries of the world. A sub-committee set-up by the Supreme Court also stated that the amount of money which is provided to the Public Distribution System, half of it goes into corruption. The corruption is increasing like cancer endemic. Today, the situation is such that a minister who had committed a scam worth Rs.1.75 crore, you have reinducted him in your Cabinet. Yesterday some of your members were taking credit that the said minister is now in Tihar Jail. If he is in Tihar Jail, it is because of the opposition and people of the country. This very corruption is increasing price-hike and poverty. The poverty and price-hike are bringing economic disparity. It is one of the major reasons of escalating of Maoism and terrorism. In the recent past, attention of the people is attracted towards cases of black-money, especially the black money reported to be stashed away in the banks abroad. You have not paid your attention towards it. The Supreme Court termed it as loot. Swami Ramdeo is doing yeoman service in this regard. The UN Convention on Corruption was signed by 148 countries. It was ratified by 135 nations. But India signed the Convention on the last date i.e. on 15th December, 2005. Since then 6 years had gone by, but it was not ratified so far. You are committing a serious injustice by framing the cases of black money, stashed away in the banks abroad, as a matter of tax evasion. It is not a matter of tax evasion. This is legalization of corruption by taxation. It is referred in the Address that the Government had decided to ratify the convention. Now a resolution was moved in the meeting of the G-20 nations and it is because of that pressure you are forced to mention that you would ratify it. I would also like to make a submission to the Government to accept appropriate demands regarding the Telangana issue at the earliest.

SHRI NARENDRA KUMAR KASHYAP: I oppose the Address. There is no mention in the Address about safeguarding the freedom of the country and population belonging to the Bahujan Samaj. There is also no mention of increasing effect of price-rise, unemployment and terrorism in the Address. The Government had tried to eulogise MNREGA Scheme. But the ground realities are very different and the people belonging to the weaker sections of the society are not satisfied with MNREGA. It would have been far better, had the Government framed any scheme to provide employment for 265 days instead of 100 days, out of the 365 days, to the poor as mentioned in the Address.

The daily wager of meagre income can not purchase sugar, onion, pulse etc. If this is the benefit of MNREGA being provided to the people, I do not think that it is of any use. The Government should have mentioned in the address that we could provide employment to a poor person who remained unemployed for the remaining 265 days. The poor are committing suicide because of starvation and unemployment. The Government should have expressed concern in the address in this regard. The Country is fighting hard with the problem of Terrorism and Maoism. Officers are kidnapped. If the chasm between prosperity and poverty gets widened, the situation in the country may become more alarming. I found nothing in the address for the welfare of SCs/STs and OBCs. The U.P.A Government have not been releasing the amount under the Special Component Plan for the last five years which is meant to be spent on the welfare of SCs/STs.

Lakhs of posts reserved for the SCs/STs and OBCs are lying vacant in the Central Departments. No plan has been formulated by the Government for the same. There are many states where atrocities and injustice is on the rise on a large scale. The Government does not have any plan for the STs by which they might be educated and brought in the mainstream of the country. Even today, there are half a dozen states where the people of backward communities have not even been identified, not to speak of providing 27% reservation on the basis of the Mandal Commission. The Government should take notice to it.

Not any commitment has been shown in the address to do away with the corruption, unemployment, terrorism and price rise. Because of terrorism, curfew had been imposed in Jammu and Kashmir for months. But as yet, the Government could not be able to resolve the problem of Jammu and Kashmir. When there is a provision to provide reservation on the basis of population, the same should be applied to Jammu and Kashmir also.

SHRI ALI ANWAR ANSARI: Such an address being prosaic, directionless and ignoring, the artisan class has never been heard. Such a large scale scams have taken place as everyone has come under its effect. The subsidy provided on foodgrains, fertilizers and kerosene has been compared with the spectrum scam. The word minority appeared only once in the address and that too for the sake of scholarship. The Government have not come out with the action taken report on the Rangnath Mishra Commission's report. The apex court is calling for reply on it and the Government is going to ask for time from the court.

Earlier *Dalits* in Sikh community were not granted the status of Scheduled Caste but that status has been granted now. Sachar Committee reports clearly mentions that there are 21 lac Christian *Dalits* and 11 lac Muslim *Dalits* in the country. This is religious discrimination. This has been admitted in the reports of Rangnath Mishra Commission and Sachar Committee that this is unconstitutional. We do not demand reservation on the basis of religion but if there is discrimination on the basis of religion, this will not be tolerated. The Government talks about the *Dalits* and religious minorities but it is actually working against their interests.

The government has written off the debts of the farmers because they were committing suicides. We supported your move but there are artisans, weavers, carders, tailors, dyers, ironsmiths and carpenters in the country belonging to all communities and they are also committing suicides due to heavy debts. What have you done for them?

SHRIMATI VASANTHI STANLEY: * (*Spoke in Tamil*)

SHRI TARIQ ANWAR: The President's Address has incorporated all the things and admitted all the challenges, which are before the country and emphasized the need to deal with them. We should judge the speech by its merits but unfortunately, the opposition think that whatever the Government or President has said, their role is limited to merely criticize that.

The Hon'ble President has categorically accepted the issues of inflation and rising prices of food items and this House should welcome it. The price fixed for rice and wheat in Public Distribution System is the same which was in the year 2002, it has not been increased. The solution to the problem of inflation is to increase the production of food items as much as possible. The Government has increased the support price in order to motivate the farmers. The Government have also invested nearly 35 thousand crores in the agriculture sector.

The Address exhibits the commitment of Government to solve the problem of black money lying abroad as well as that of corruption. The Government will take effective steps in this regard in the coming days. India has faced the crisis of global recession very well. The dream of inclusive growth cannot be fulfilled until the needs of the people are met. Every citizen of India should get the benefit of economic growth.

There is need to remove structural deficiencies in rural areas. The programme of Bharat Nirman should be pushed forward rapidly. It is required to implement the programmes related to education, employment and housing at a rapid pace. Public life is not a profession. We should try to make the lives of the people better. The issue of internal and external security has also been mentioned in the Address. All sorts of terrorism needs to be checked. The Hon'ble President has said that India should have good relations with its neighbouring

* Synopsis of speech delivered by the Hon'ble Member in Tamil will be published separately as supplement.

countries, Gulf countries, West Asia, East Asia, Central Asia and all other countries. I support this Motion of Thanks.

SHRI SHASHI BHUSHAN BEHERA, making his maiden speech, said : I am proud to represent Orissa in this House and owe my gratitude to Shri Navin Patnaik and Shri Pyarimohan Mohapatra. The President's Address seems very unrealistic. UPA-II is not doing justice to *Aam Aadmi* even after 64 years of independence. Government is not serious to root out corruption from the society and also not impartial to justice.

Orissa had suffered from unseasonal rains and the farmers have lost their crops, but till now, we have not received the help of even a single rupee, though a Central team had gone there to evaluate the losses to the farmers. In the similar situations in Andhra Pradesh and Maharashtra, they immediately got the help. This kind of discrimination is not fair in a democratic country. This is the attitude of the Central Government towards the States that are ruled by non-Congress parties.

Seventy per cent of our population lives nearly on Rs.20 per day. Under such circumstances, we cannot think of inclusive growth and a prosperous India. The Government has no plan to check corruption. Our country is suffering from economic crisis and our identity in the world is that of a borrowing State. Whatever actions are being taken, are not sufficient to improve the economy. More than Rs.20,00,000 crores are lying in the foreign banks and the Government is taking the plea of having an international treaty.

We are developing cities only and forgetting the rural India where 85 per cent of our population lives. Then how rural areas will prosper? Health care is yet to be accessible to the common people. Education still remains a dream for the tribal people. Lakhs of tonnes of foodgrains get rotten in the godowns due to lack of storage facilities in the country, but the Government is not taking the moral responsibility. It is a very shameful matter. We are not able to supply pure drinking water to the common people and water of all the rivers in

the country is polluted. We have no sincere plans for improving the agricultural production of the country.

We are forgetting our traditional agricultural system. Government is not thinking of having any clear agricultural policy. The foodgrains are rotten in the godowns. We are not able to control the rising prices. There is a lot of neglect as far as industrial development of Orissa is concerned. Orissa is neglected by the Central Government. Mine-rich States including Orissa are not being supported by the national government for industrial development. These states are suffering from Left extremism problem. The national government has to intervene here as this is the national problem. Poverty-stricken state like Orissa has to bear with it. Out of Railway projects worth Rs.1800 crores, only projects worth Rs.600 crores are sanctioned. Development projects are not given to the poor states. Special packages must be given to those States having more populations of SCs/STs. I doubt the ability of the government to deal with corruption and take care of the poor, hence I do not support the Motion of Thanks.

SHRI D. RAJA: The President's Address does not give any confidence to the nation. The UPA Government is in a quagmire of corruptions and scams. The ruling coalition will have to do a very serious introspection, particularly the Congress Party. The Congress Party has lost its legacy. A 'Crony Capitalism' is being built in India. Even our academics have not taken this concept of crony capitalism to interrogate the nature of Indian State and the present UPA Government seems to have determined to continue this tradition. Therefore, several stories of corruptions and scams are coming out. The poor people are alienated from the mainstream of development policies. Because strong public sector undertakings global recession has not affected India. Privatization is being promoted everywhere. We have strong difference with the Government regarding this Government will have to go for a mid-course review of its policies. On a call given by eight trade unions, the workers have gathered in lakhs at Jantar Mantar. They are demanding that the public sector undertakings should not be disinvested. This is detrimental to country's interest. The UPA Government should think over what is wrong with its policies? The

address did not mention anything about the welfare of SCs/STs and OBCs. Have we spoken about skill development programme impartation to these disadvantaged sections? The National Skill Development Programme is a non-starter. 43 ministries have been excluded from the SC/ST Sub-Plan. There are no funds earmarked for this. Increase of a few hundred crores in the Budget will not help in achieving inclusive growth. The atrocities committed against the SCs and STs are on the rise. More number of deaths take place due to caste clashes in the country than otherwise. The Government should admit it.

The Government talks about Forest Rights Act. The supposed balance between the environment and development is nothing but an eye-wash. Between August, 2009 to July, 2010, a total of 535 projects were approved and only six were rejected. In the name of left wing extremism my party people are put in prison. In the name of fighting Maoism, you cannot arrest genuine persons. Sri Lankan Government has been harassing our Indian fishermen. It should be an issue for the entire nation. Our fishermen need protection. This issue should be taken up by the Government. President's Address does not speak about any political solution to the problem of Sri Lankan Tamils. There is no rehabilitation of their families. The Sri Lankan Tamils issue must be one of the priorities of this Government. Regarding Telangana, the Government will have to decide its stand.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA: Inflation has become a very serious problem in our country. Price rise is going up day-by-day and poor people are suffering.

The Government has given a very handsome growth of economy. The poor people are not getting any benefit from this economic growth. Government is totally fail in bridging the huge gap between poor people and wealthy people of country. The President has given a lot of emphasis on the improvement of Public Distribution System in our country. But I am very sorry to say that the Public Distribution System has totally failed in our country. There is nexus between the officers of the Food Corporation of India and blackmarketeers. The Government has totally failed in controlling this

corruption in PDS. The Government should take serious steps so that poor will get benefit from the Public Distribution System. I request Government of India to start serious talks with all insurgent groups for permanent solution to Assam and North eastern problem.

Due to wrong policies adopted by the Government of India the environment and forests of the North-Eastern Region are facing a serious future. It is known to everybody that by violating all the environment norms, 168 hydroelectric projects have been sanctioned in lower Arunachal Pradesh. Lower Subansiri Project dam site is an important biodiversity spot. The whole forest reserve of our region will submerge into water. This project totally violates the Indian Wildlife Protection Act, 1972. Brahmaputra and Barak rivers are not getting any priority. It is known to everybody that due to floods, every year, lakhs of people become homeless. They should declare the flood and erosion problem in Assam a national problem. The Government has announced rural electrification. This Government has totally failed in rural electrification in North-Eastern Region. There is large-scale corruption in rural electrification in the North-Easter Region. Despite Assam accord Government of India has totally failed to protect Indo-Bangladesh border. Indo-Bangladesh border is still open. Bangladeshi people are coming to Assam. This is a threat to the integrity and security of our country. We do not need any slogan of black-money from the Government. They should take strict measures to bring black money. I fully assure the House that my party will totally support this type of constitutional amendment to prevent the black money.

SHRI H.K. DUA: Despite the different views expressed in the House and outside, there is no difference of opinion among the leadership and the people that this country should emerge as a major economic, political and military power of the 21st Century. This is the national aim. We need to do more to attain this. Issues of national security both internal and external deserve a national consensus. Terrorism is a great threat nobody can differ on that. Terrorists can strike anywhere they like, at any time. Maoists are another great threat to our country. There are about 160 or 180 districts affected by Maoist threat. They also strike a surprising manner. Dantewada was one where

76 people of the CRPF were killed one night. There is a need for national consensus on this.

There is a need for consensus on Kashmir as there is no political consensus. All-party delegation which visited Kashmir and came back with the impression that it was possible to evolve consensus on Kashmir and the message goes much deeper if all the parties agree on Kashmir. Our world is no longer a bipolar world. I think that a consensus on foreign policy will help the Government to deal with the rest of the world. We need to have a consensus on functioning of Parliament, judicial reforms and administrative reforms. I hope the political parties will support these.

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI: The President has given priority in her Address to the rising prices. The reasons for rise in prices have to be properly understood. The people of this country know how much prices have risen. There is a simple remedy to control the prices. Certain items must be given subsidy. Corruption is impacting each and every one in our country. Adarsh Society and the Commonwealth Games scams have hit the common man. There are a number of other scams in the country which are yet to come to light. If the Government does not become stern in such matters, the number of scams is bound to go ahead. Therefore, Commonwealth Games scam can also be called Mahaweight Scam.

After the Judgement of the Allahabad High Court everybody has become silent on Ram Mandir issue. The Ram Jhanmabhoomi was divided into three parts. Everything was proved to show that there existed Ram Mandir. But I do not know why the construction work at Ayodhya has not started. The President has also referred to the shortage of electricity. But no remedies have been suggested for that. Jaitapur Project is a harmful project. Therefore, the people do not want this project. The President also mentioned about terrorism. She has stated that the maintenance of law and order is the primary responsibility of State Governments with the support of the Central Government. This has become a challenge to the country. Afzal Guru's sentence has also not been executed since the last five years. Will Kasab's be hanged?

People are, slowly, losing faith in the Government. If terrorism is not checked, people would feel unsafe and they would remain unhappy with the Government. There are a few issues concerning the State of Maharashtra which have been pending with the Central Government. The Money Lending Bill, 2010 passed by the State of Maharashtra which has been pending with the Central Government for its approval and for the assent of the President of India. This Bill is in the interest of the poor. Statutory boards for development of certain backward regions in two or three States had been created. But the Central Government is not prepared to accept a statutory board for a backward region like Konkan and it does not give importance to this backward region. The issue of which I have been continuously speaking in this House is the issue concerning the border between Karnataka and Maharashtra.

SHRI PRAVEEN RASHTRAPAL: Today I have the opportunity of listening to various speeches. The Leader of the Opposition misguided the House in my absence. He said, that there is today an integrity deficit and a leadership deficit. Mr. Jaitley said that the biggest investment exercise in India is in vibrant Gujarat. The total amount of the MoUs is running into lakhs of crores of rupees. Gujarat NRIs come to Gujarat from all over the world during winter, because they cannot afford to stay over there in the icy climate. They come and attend such vibrant Gujarat.

Whether the Chief Minister of Gujarat has sent an invitation to the Hon'ble Prime Minister of the country to attend the Vibrant Gujarat? I have got a list of all the MoUs above 5,000. There are 98 entries from the Central Government. Everybody was making reference to the CAG in the Spectrum Scam. My Gujarat friends should tell me whether there was a scam named as *Sujalam Sufalam*? Is it true that there was a CAG Report on it? PAC was headed by a learned lady MLA, Dr. Chandrikaben Chudasama?

In that Report, there was no note of dissent but the Chief Minister of the State did not allow that Report to be produced before the Assembly. Even today, I warn, let that Report be presented by them.

CAG is doing audit of our work. If anybody who is implementing the law is making a mistake and mistake is pointed out by the CAG. He will be warned. On one side they give a certificate that he is an honest and on the other side they give a certificate that he is efficient and the best economist in the world and then you are criticizing the same Government under the name of corruption. Lastly, they do not know the meaning of black money.

There are a few people all over the country who earned money, but are not paying tax. Where Income Tax is not paid that money in our country is known as black money. Our Government is trying to bring back the money. In the last 20 years, have they not ruled for seven years? If they make wrong allegation against the leader of my party, I can give names of anybody's name from NDA.

* * * * *
* * * * *

V. K. AGNIHOTRI,
Secretary-General.

rssynop@sansad.nic.in

****Supplement covering rest of the proceedings is being issued separately.