

# RAJYA SABHA

---

## \*SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE

---

(Proceedings other than Questions and Answers)

---

Thursday, March 4, 2010/Phalguna 13, 1931(Saka)

---

### OBITUARY REFERENCES

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, I refer with profound sorrow to the passing away of Shri V.M. Surendra Ram and Shri Chimanbhai Mehta, former Members of this House.

**Shri V.M. Surendra Ram** passed away on the 16<sup>th</sup> June, 2009 at the age of 88 years.

Born in Ooty in March, 1921, Shri Ram had his education at Municipal High School, Ooty and P.S. High School, Mylapore, Chennai.

An agriculturist and planter by vocation, Shri Ram was involved in several social activities including welfare of Scheduled Castes and development of cottage industries. Shri Ram was the President of the Nilgiri District Depressed Classes League and Secretary of the National Volunteer Corps. He also served as the Member of the Rubber Board, and the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes Board.

Shri V.M. Surendra Ram represented the State of Tamil Nadu in this House from April 1952 to April 1958.

In the passing away of Shri V.M. Surendra Ram, the country has lost an able parliamentarian and a noted social worker.

**Shri Chimanbhai Mehta** passed away on 26<sup>th</sup> January, 2010, at the age of 84 years.

---

**\*This Synopsis is not an authoritative record of the proceedings of the Rajya Sabha.**

Born in Burma in June 1925, Shri Mehta was educated at Mohandas Karamchand Vidyalaya, Rajkot.

A social worker, Shri Mehta participated in 'Responsible Government' movement at the early age of 12 and underwent imprisonment several times during the 'Quit India Movement'. He was president of the Saurashtra Kisan Sangh and Chairman of the Gujarat High Powered Forest Committee in 1973 and Gujarat Housing Board from 1981 to 1984.

Shri Mehta was awarded an Honorary Doctorate by the Gurukul Kangri Vishwa Vidyalaya, Hardwar in 1991. Shri Mehta also had some publications to his credit.

Shri Chimanbhai Mehta started his legislative career as a Member of the Gujarat Legislative Assembly from 1975 to 1980 and served as Cabinet Minister holding the portfolio of Labour, Transport and Jail in the Government of Gujarat.

Shri Chimanbhai Mehta represented the State of Gujarat in this House from April 1984 to April 1990 and April 1990 to April 1996. He served on the Panel of Vice-Chairmen, Rajya Sabha from 1984 to 1985. He also served as Union Minister of State in the Ministry of Human Resource Development from 1989 to 1990.

In the passing away of Shri Chimanbhai Mehta, the country has lost a veteran freedom fighter, a noted social worker and an able parliamentarian.

We deeply mourn the passing away of Shri V.M. Surendra Ram and Shri Chimanbhai Mehta.

*(One minute's silence was observed as a mark of respect to the memory of the deceased.)*

---

#### **MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION OF THE CHAIR**

##### **I. Serious repercussions of the statement made by the Minister of State in Ministry of External Affairs during the Prime Minister's visit to Saudi Arabia**

**DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA:** I raise an urgent matter regarding a statement of the Minister of State for External Affairs

during the visit of the Prime Minister to Saudi Arabia. As per the Shimla Agreement, India and Pakistan should settle the dispute bilaterally. I would like to seek a clarification of the Hon'ble Prime Minister on the Indian foreign policy with regard to the Indo-Pakistan relations and whether the statement by the MOS, has the approval of the Government. Such irresponsible remarks may seriously sabotage the outcome of your visit. I would like to know whether Hon'ble Minister of State for Foreign Affairs is very much a member of the Council of Ministers. What is the meaning of when he says. "I wanted to be an interlocutor?"

*(Shri Rudra Narayan Pany, Shri Brijesh Pathak and some Hon'ble Members associated.)*

## **II. National convention scheduled to be organized by the National Association on Street Vendors of India in Delhi**

**SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT:** A very large section of street vendors of this country, who are around 2.5 per cent of the urban population are women. There is no place earmarked for them and they are becoming victims to the corrupt policy of police and administration. A national policy was formulated in this regard but it is not being implemented properly. If we can not safeguard their livelihood, what is the meaning of this national policy. I urge the Prime Minister to implement this model bill.

*(The whole House associated.)*

## **III. Illegal construction of Dandavati and other projects on Dandavati river in Karnataka**

**SHRI M.V. MYSURA REDDY:** I would like to bring to the notice of the Ministry of Water Resources the illegal construction of Dandavati Project on the Dandavati River. The Government of Karnataka is constructing this project in Shimoga District with an estimated cost of Rs. 300 crores by utilizing about 400 TMC water. I fail to understand what made the Karnataka Government to construct another illegal dam. Apart from this, Karnataka is also constructing three more minor projects on Tungbhadra sub-basin. It is illegally utilizing 54 TMC more water than allocated by the Tribunal. I request the Government of India to immediately intervene in this matter and direct the Government of Karnataka to stop constructing illegal projects.

**IV. Situation arisen due to citizenship conferred on the Indian artist  
M.F. Hussain by Qatar**

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN:** I would like to inform that since 2006 the great artist Maqbool Fida Husain is out of the country. Some right-wing outfits targeted him and forced him to leave this country. The Qatar Government has conferred citizenship upon him. It is a shame that our nation is not in a position to give him adequate security. I urge upon the Government to actively intervene and bring back Mr. M.F. Hussain who is now 95 years old.

*(All Hon'ble Members associated.)*

**V. Crash of Naval Aircraft during an Air show in Hyderabad**

**SHRI KALRAJ MISHRA:** During an Air-show in Hyderabad, an aircraft of Navy crashed into a three storeyed building. Two pilots and a citizen were killed due to this crash. Seven people were also injured in it. At present, information is not available as to how many people were killed. I urge that complete information may be provided in this regard.

**VI. Death of 30 persons due to consumption of illicit liquor in Uttar  
Pradesh**

**SHRI RAJNITI PRASAD:** Due to the wrong policy of the Government, the people, particularly poor people are dying after consuming illicit liquor. I urge that some measures should be taken to impose prohibition in the country.

*(Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav associated.)*

**VII. Need for introducing Bill for the creation of the State Telangana**

**SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR:** Today, serious situation is prevailing in Telangana. Hundreds of youths have self-immolated themselves. The demand of creating separate Telangana is justified. Pranab Mukherjee Committee was constituted which had no constitutional power. Then Shri Krishnan Committee was constituted, but the Government is not bound to implement recommendations of this Committee. Separate Telangana may be created by bringing Bill in Lok Sabha. If you bring bill regarding creation of separate Telangana in this Budget Session, we will fully cooperate in passing it.

## **SUPPLEMENTARY DEMANDS FOR GRANTS (RAILWAYS) 2009-10**

**THE MINISTER OF RAILWAYS (KM. MAMATA BANERJEE):** I lay on the Table, a statement (in English and Hindi) showing the Supplementary Demands for Grants (Railways) for the year 2009-10.

---

### **MOTION OF THANKS ON PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS-Contd.**

**SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:** The country is disappointed with the Hon'ble President's Address, because it did not contain any answers to the challenges being faced by the country. Some promises are repeated once again in the Address. There are so many problems including price-rise. The Government has really run out of ideas. None of the Hon'ble Ministers has explained about the price rise. This Government has failed to take any action. Price-rise is affecting the common people. On the one hand, purchasing power has gone up according to the President's Address and on the other the NSSO contradicts the same. The UPA Government has inherited a robust economy.

One of the main reasons for the price rise is the corruption involved in the export and import of foodgrains. You exported at cheaper prices and imported at higher prices. You had enough time to lay more stress on those crops or those grains which were in shortage. But you did not do that. You are making excuses. During our regime, there were calamities. We released around 40-60 lakhs tones of foodgrains to different States. You have not released foodgrains in the market. A Joint Parliamentary Committee should be set up to inquire into the scam of export and import of foodgrains, including sugar. You ordered export of sugar and rice even though shortage was there in the country. Why is there sudden increase in the prices? Let us have a debate on this. When we were in power, we were able to control the prices. You are blaming each other. You are all equally responsible for all this. The Congress leadership is also silent on this.

Consumer Price Index in India today is the highest amongst all the countries of Asia Pacific. The price rise in India is the single most important issue in India today. What has been done to contain the prices? Then, the Finance Minister announced in the Budget that petroleum prices will be hiked. The friends supporting the ruling Party are also concerned about the price rise. The increase in the prices of petroleum products will have effect

on transport charges, vegetables, milk, dal, tel, coal, steel, etc. It seems the Government intends to increase the price of petroleum products once again after the Budget Session is over.

We demand that a Joint Parliamentary Committee should be set up to enquire into the reasons such as food inflation despite bumper crop, as told by the Minister, last year and why 49 lakh tonnes of sugar was exported in the year 2008-09 at Rs.12.50 and it was now imported at 36-40 rupees.

The Government has claimed that it has taken new measures to strengthen the situation to meet the challenges posed by terrorism. Then why has Pune incident happened? The Ram Pradhan Committee appointed by the Maharashtra Government said in a report that Pune will be the possible target. How do you explain this? The Intelligence security in the country still remains fragile. Whatever advisory notes are sent to the States are casual. Generalise advisories are taken casually by the people. The policy of the Government seems to be 'condolence for the dead, compensation for the survival.'

The Pak sponsored terrorism has made the Government to realise the seriousness to some extent. They started taking some corrective measures, but there is no forward movement on this. The senior leaders of the ruling party are publically endorsing the claims that action by the Delhi Police at Batla House was a fake encounter. It is a great injustice to the memory of the persons who have laid down their lives fighting terrorists.

As far as the security of the country is concerned, we are one with you and are ready to extend whatever help is needed from an opposition party. The Government must evolve a clear-cut policy to tackle terrorism. Politics and religion should not be linked with the issue of fighting terrorism. Terrorists have to be dealt with in a firm manner.

From Pashupati to Tirupati, Naxalites want to have a 'red corridor'. That is their stated goal. They are attacking public and destroying the property of the nation. The duty of the Government is to show absolutely no lenience towards Maoist leaders. The NGOs talk about so-called civil liberties. For whose liberties are they fighting? Ordinary human beings are more important than organised people like these, who have a different and murderous ideology. The Government should not have any talks with them.

If the Maoists and CPI-ML are confident of their ideology, they should leave the arms, form a political party, contest elections and capture

power. The situation is becoming serious day by day. Around 25 per cent of the total districts in the country have Maoist presence today. If this situation continues, we may have to hand over certain districts to the military in the years to come. This issue cannot be dealt with by State Governments alone. 40,000 sq. km of Indian soil is not within the reach of administration. Is it not a challenge to all of us? There has to be a political, educative action plan to educate the people about this menace and they have to be isolated. Law must also take its own course. There is nothing wrong in talking to them in democracy but they must abjure violence and give up arms. All the political parties are spending time for years to solve the problems, but they are trying to prove that not we, but they are doing everything. It cannot be acceptable.

Terror and talk cannot coexist. The PM himself accused Pakistan of using terrorism as an instrument of State Policy. No meaningful steps were taken by neighbours to stop terrorism. It would be very dangerous to allow those terrorists to come back to the country without any enquiry, who are settled in Pak occupied Kashmir at present. There are chances of adopting a strategy to push militants into India taking the cover of surrender. It would be better to have a discussion in this regard with everyone and then move forward. The Government should make a categorical statement to clear these doubts in the minds of the people.

Sharm-el-Sheikh statement is an indication that there is no co-ordination in this Government. The Minister of State for External Affairs should be extra careful while speaking. He should be properly advised and guided.

Coming to the issue of Telangana, the State is burning for the last three months. Boys are committing suicide and their parents are worried. We should not deal with such a sensitive issue in a casual manner. Government have taken sufficient time in this matter and made a promise to the people. Members of Parliament have not been taken into confidence before a decision was made. The Chief Minister along with the MPs of both the regions, Andhra and Telangana, should have been called separately and enough consultations should have been held with them before making an announcement. Regional feelings become very strong. The issue of Telangana has got a background. It is not an all of a sudden movement by somebody. It is the people's movement. The entire State is worried, the investment has stopped, the growth has come to a halt, and, the division in different parties is increasing day-by-day. It should not be allowed to continue. Is the Srikrishna Committee's recommendation going to be binding

on the Government of India? Is it going to be the end of this issue? In that case, we will review our stand because the issue is that we need to be clear about the purpose of this committee. The PM should pay personal attention to this issue, have a serious discussion within his party and come to a political conclusion.

As regards food security, last year also you said the Food Security Act was coming. What is the Act? What is the provision in the Budget? Legislation alone will not ensure the food security, you need to do it in a more transparent manner. The hike in urea prices should be withdrawn. Agriculture production has failed to keep pace with the growing demand and precious little has been done by the Government to improve it. The Presidential Address boasts about so many measures taken for the welfare of the farmers. You have increased the MSP many folds. But, at the same time, you allowed input prices to be increased by many folds. What is the benefit the farmer is getting? Our farmers are ready to produce more, give them the new technologies, give them the needed support, give them the credit. Even today, 65 per cent of the people in the countryside are getting credit from the private sector, moneylenders. The farmers are in distress and because of their inability to repay the debt, they are committing suicide. The rural people suffer because water levels are going down. Power situation is worsening day by day. I request the Prime Minister to see that some meaningful steps are taken at the earliest for reforms in the power sector for the progress of the country.

Coming to institutions, I would say that in a democracy, the use of institution should not be made inappropriately. Recently, there was an announcement by the Government and the ruling party about the austerity measures. Government is spending huge amount of money on advertisements. We should be serious and do something. Now, I come to the issue of large community of Indian people living in Australia. They are being harassed and killed sometimes. So, the Government needs to be very sensitive to this issue and take all effective steps to see that they are taken care of. I am also sorry to talk about Sri Lankan Tamils. Even today, around one lakh people are living in camps as per the information that is available. The condition in the camps is horrible. I urge upon the Indian Government to explore a political solution.

With regard to reservation based on religion, I would say please do not do this. It is not in the interest of the country. With regard to the National Highways, there is a decrease of 13 per cent allocation. You have failed to achieve the targets. With regard to Padma Awards, these should not

be devalued. About the black money parked outside, there is no progress with regard to illegal money stashed in the Swiss bank accounts. Nothing specific has been done for the girl child. Take care of them and also the health of the people. I also request the Government of India to implement the scheme of Soil Health Card Programme at the national level. Coming to the assistance to the States, the hon'ble Prime Minister promised Rs.1000 crores to Andhra Pradesh after the floods. But that money also is not fully released so far. The Karnataka Government also needs Central assistance. Now, I am coming to the Women's Reservation Bill. It would be better if it is passed. At last, I would say that there are challenges before the country and a solution should be there for them.

**SHRI SITARAM YECHURY :** There are certain issues which the hon'ble President raised, on which there can't be any dispute. The fight against terror is non-negotiable and there can be no compromise on it. Terror can't be bracketed into any one religion or any one region or any one area. I would like the Government to make sure that there is no discrimination between the various terrorist activities that take place. Terror must be fought as terror. It is anti-national. There is a major contradiction. The Prime Minister who heads the Cabinet says Maoist violence is the gravest threat to India's internal security and a member of the Cabinet actually denies that Maoists have perpetrated this attack that the hon'ble President refers to in Para 2. This contradiction cannot coexist. This has to be settled. Besides, no mention has been made about the progress on the issue of 'one rank one pension'. The hon'ble President talks in terms of delivery of justice. There should be some plan of action also by the Government. There was no mention of the National Judicial Commission. There is a need for it. There is no reference at all to the problems being faced by our NRIs particularly in the Gulf areas, particularly those who come from Kerala.

Shri Ambedkar, while presenting the draft of Constitution said that in politics, we will have equality and in social and economic life, we will have inequality. In politics, we will be recognizing the principle of one man-one vote, one vote-one value. In our social and economic life, we shall by reason of our social and economic structure, continue to deny the principle of one man-one value. How long shall we continue to live this life of contradictions? This was said over 60 years ago and today, hearing the President's Address, we come back to this fundamental contradiction and this fundamental contradictions is in which direction are we progressing? We

had the illusion of a shining India which they gave us, we have the reality of a suffering India that they are giving us.

In 2004-05 alone, 4 crore people have slipped under poverty only due to health expenditures. Because of privatization of health services, they cannot afford their health expenditures. We have two India 'Shining India' and suffering India. Hon'ble President in President's Address has outlined the basic thrust of this UPA Government, the impact of the global recession, how to protect our people; and to work for inclusive growth the question of price rise. The shift of resources again continuously keeps taking place towards the rich, the whole Budget has planned for a nominal increase in expenditure of eight per cent. Whatever growth you are giving, you are giving it through such lopsided policies where the rich become richer and the poor become poorer. You have Rs. 1,20,000-odd crores of the legitimate tax that the Government could have collected, that was not collected. If you had collected this amount, we would have been able to generate jobs at a very high level. But, instead of adopting that path, you adopt path of giving concessions to the rich, to the corporates and impoverish the rest or the suffering India. It is not the direction which was envisaged at the time of Independence, at the time of adoption of our Constitution and the Republic.

In India, when price rise takes place, it is not the producer who gains, it is the middleman who gains. Our peasantry to being impoverished, and the common people are suffering from high prices. The value of trade in agricultural commodities during the fortnight ending January 31 was Rs. 52,313.63 crores. It has gone up by 65 per cent. If the value of trading is going up so much, there is a natural pressure to make the prices go up otherwise, they would not make the profits. So, what needs to be done is ban the future trading in all essential commodities. The public distribution system can be improved, you can actually contain prices. Your Economic Survey tells you as against 200 lakh tones of buffer that you require you have today 474.45 tonnes in your godowns.

What are you doing sitting with this stock. Why don't you release rice and wheat to the Public Distribution System so that prices can be controlled? Instead, on the other hand, you have reduced your allocation for APL category by huge amount of nearly 75 per cent. President talks of food security. The President of India talks about disinvestment. The Budget has estimated a disinvestment of Rs. 40,000 crores plus. Selling your assets to meet your expenditure doesn't make economic sense.

We talked about the future of India and after sixty years what sort of India our youth will inherit. We are one of the youngest nations in the world. It is a matter of pride for Indian youth and Indian intellectuals that they are dominating the world. President of India has laid down through many paragraphs on the issue of our relations with other countries. India has a pride of place in the world. Whether it is on the question of climate change, the Doha Round of talks that are taking place in the WTO, on all these issues, there is a certain shift. There is a greater emphasis in our strategic relationship with the United States of America. We want our country to have good relations with everybody, undoubtedly.

Quality of life of people is the most important aspect. If we measure it from that point that Mahatma Gandhi had given us in the final analysis it is to wipe every tear from every eye, the President's Address does not, in any way, give us the confidence that India is moving in that direction. So, let us not widen this gap between the shining and suffering India. Therefore, we have these reservations on the President's Address that she has delivered this time.

**DR. AKHILESH DAS GUPTA:** I on behalf of my Party, thank you that you have given me an opportunity to present my views and my party's views on his highness President's Address. I am very sorry to say that his highness President's Address states directionlessness of UPA Government and its defeats on all fronts. Faith of neglected and exploited section has again being shattered by this whole address. People of UP had great expectations by this address. There is no mention of UP in this address and also there is no mention of big factory or a big plan.

Today, the people of Bundelkhand are migrating from there because they are not getting any water. The Central Government is not paying any attention towards Bundelkhand. The Minister of Home Affairs said here that they are going to create Telangana state. It is a matter of great pleasure. With regard to Uttar Pradesh also, you indicated that development will not take place in the state unless it is divided into smaller states. But you don't believe in work. The biggest kumbh mela of the century is going on in Haridwar. All the approach roads for Haridwar pass through Uttar Pradesh. Six months back, a consensus was reached between the PWD department of Uttar Pradesh and the Central Government that the funds will be provided from the Central Road Fund. But, today, even after six months not a single paisa has been given to Uttar Pradesh by the Central Government. As regards power, the allocation made for the state is being continuously reduced.

I want to draw the attention towards the problem of naxalism, which is a problem of the whole country. The Government of Uttar Pradesh has several times sent a proposal to the Central Government to tackle the naxalites. There is no mention in this regard in the Address. The Uttar Pradesh Police is policing thousands of kilometres of Indo-Nepal Border. This is an International Border and the Central Government is responsible for security along this border. The Central Government is not providing any kind of help despite the State Government drawing attention towards the fact.

A lot has been discussed about the price rise. The whole country, particularly the poor, downtrodden, neglected, exploited sections are suffering due to price rise. You said that NREGA is a very good scheme. Under NREGA, you compel the poor, downtrodden, backward people to work under the severe sun for upto ten hours. You did not make efforts to uplift the poor.

As regards the women reservation, we welcome the women reservation bill. The women should get their due. But there should be separate provision for the women belonging to the Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes, Other Backward Classes. The Address is completely silent on reservation because the Central Government wants to remove the reservation in the Government services in a planned manner. The reserved posts are not filled with the plea that no suitable candidate is available. In fact, the reservation policy of the Government is not stable. I demand to the Government that the backlog of reserved vacancies should be filled on priority basis, de-reservation should be immediately stopped and the reservation should be implemented immediately in the private sector also. Today, there is a shortage of employment in the whole country. No mention thereof has been made in the Address.

**Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav:** Economic recession, drought, flood, price rise, food security and improvement in the growth rate have been mentioned in the Address, but all these things are like day dreams. No permanent arrangement is made to extend help in the event of flood or arrange water for the farmers in the event of drought. No permanent policy has been formulated therefor till date.

As far as the food security and increase in growth rate are concerned, the people of the country does not believe the figures that are given. An increase in the growth rate is claimed but the growth rate of agriculture sector, which is the most important, on which the maximum

number of people are dependent and which even today provide employment to the maximum number of people, is 1.3 per cent only.

What are the figures on the basis of which it is said that the number of people below poverty line is decreasing in the country. What is the poverty line? The people do not get two times' meal, even today they could not send their children to school, they could not provide nutritious food to their children but they are above the poverty line. The Central Government has fixed the criteria for the poverty line and the number of people below poverty line in every state and the cards more than this number cannot be provided.

National Rural Health Mission was started, but the funds for this mission can not be used because of the obstructions by the bureaucracy. As far as the shortage of sugar is concerned, you will be surprised to know that there are several such sugar mills in Uttar Pradesh in which lakhs of tonnes of sugar is lying, whereas it is being sold at the rate of 50 rupees per kg after importing it at the rate of 16-18 rupees per kg. The sugar cane growers are suffering losses due to the permission granted to the private companies for its import and the sugar mill owner are earning manifold. Mention about mid-day meal and nutritious diet scheme has also been made in the Presidential Address. Corruption has not been given any mention in the whole address. The mid-day meal scheme and the nutritious diet scheme have totally failed due to corruption.

There is no mention about the wide spread corruption prevailing in mid day meal and nutritious food scheme. This food is being sold to the people owning animals and it is used for the animals as it is not worth eating. There is no mention about the efforts and the progress made, so far, in bringing back black money from Switzerland.

This should be made clear that we will not accept the mediation in bilateral dialogue with Pakistan. We have a vast and a very strong country and we should not indulge in demeaning its status. There is no mention in the address of President about the reported infiltration by Chinese inside the boundaries of India including Ladakh, Himachal Pradesh and Arunachal Pradesh. Already, several square kilometers of our land is under the illegal occupation of China. But we could not say that there was infiltration from China.

NREGA which is now MNREGA, is not being implemented properly. The Central Government should monitor the scheme as the responsibility of implementation lies on the states. The money meant for this

scheme is being misused in a large scale. Only publicity will not serve the purpose. Some agency to monitor this scheme should be there.

Providing subsidy on fertilizers is a serious issue. In 2004-05, subsidy on fertilizers was given worth of Rs. 15000 crore, which has been increased three fold *i.e* Rs. 45000 crore in 2007-08 without actual increase in cultivated land and irrigation facilities. Why is such a huge increase in subsidy?

Unfortunately, there is no mention about the uncontrolled population growth in the country. Not a point out of 74 points covers this vital issue. Unless population is not controlled, no scheme is going to be effective.

Our party is against the reservation bill for women in the present form. No member of Parliament from muslim community represent from a number of states. When there is no male muslim MP from these states, how can a woman from minorities and backward sections come in Parliament. Therefore, it should be made mandatory for political parties to give tickets to women candidates. In the Second Para it is said that we have clear-cut mandate but it is not a fact. So make a provision for the reservation for the women of backward and minority sections of the society.

**SHRI N. BALAGANGA:** The president address does not mention about the permanent solution to end the decades long crisis in Sri Lanka. I request the Government to prevail upon the Sri Lankan Government for finding a solution to the problems of Tamils and ensure the proper rehabilitation of Tamil refugees in Sri Lanka.

President Address does not mention about the harassment and torture meted out by Sri Lankan Navy personnel to the Tamil Nadu fishermen and Government's intention to review Katchatheevu Agreement between Sri Lanka and India.

The agricultural land located around the cities and small and medium towns are vastly declining due to reclassification as Industrial Zone, Commercial Zone, Mixed Residential Zone, Recreational Zone and Institutional Zone. If these things are allowed to go unchecked, the people of the country cannot escape from the impending danger of food security.

Under the Jawaharlal Nehru National Urban Renewal Scheme, it is pointed out that that one lakh crores of rupees have been allocated for the

development and welfare of the urban poor but the good features of this Scheme have not originally reached the urban poor.

This expressway project will make many people who have been living in those areas for decades homeless. This project will only benefit corporate companies. Ordinary urban people can't move or drive their cars on that bridge because there will be a toll-gate. The Government should set up a mechanism for supervision. I request the Government to construct by-lanes or parking bays on the sides of the roads to prevent the loss of precious lives from road accidents.

The Rajiv Awas Yojana benefits only the city slum-dwellers. I urge upon the Government to extend this scheme to the villages also. The President's Address has failed to state the steps being taken to eradicate dreaded imported diseases like Swine flu, Chikungunya, etc. I request the Government of India to establish more Government hospitals with ultra modern medical facilities so that the poor people will be benefited. The Right to Free and Compulsory Education Act, has been notified to be effective from 1<sup>st</sup> April this year. The provision to admit 25 per cent poor children have not been clearly pointed out in the Address. Finally, I urge upon the Government to ensure the early passage of the Women Reservation Bill successfully.

**DR. JANARDHAN WAGHMARE:** I welcome and support the President's Address. The common man is the central point of the Address. The UPA Government have formulated schemes taking the common man in its account. Welfare of the common man should remain the objective of the Government. Today the common man is facing several problems. These problems are the challenges for the Government. The common man is very much fed up with price-rise. The Government are making all efforts to bail out the common man from that problem.

Rural India is heading towards progress on account of Bharat Nirman Yojnas. The Government will continue its effort to bring GDP rate to the level of 9 percent. It is our duty to get the Women Reservation Bill passed. Mahatma Gandhi Rashtriya Rozgar Yojna is a unique scheme in itself. Laws have been enacted even for the unorganized workers. Terrorism is the great challenge. The naxal and Maoist organizations have caused great losses to internal security. Their ideologies are harmful for the country. We will have to deal with them on the basis of democracy and non-violence.

India wants friendship with all our neighbour countries. The Government has formulated 'Look East policy'. In the address reforms in education have been emphasized. The basic structure of education requires to be changed. We require such education system which aims at making of man and national building.

The Address doesn't mention population explosion. The check on the rise at population can control all problems. There should be participation of all in development. The Address has expressed aspiration of creating inclusive society. India is emerging as super power. Therefore, we should try to do much more.

**SHRI N.K. SINGH:** There are ten critical issues namely 50 per cent reservation for women in Panchayati Raj and Local Bodies, concerted effort to increase women in Central Government jobs, a National Mission on Empowerment of women for a women-centric programme, a social audit and appointment of district level ombudsman, Annual reports on education, health, environment and infrastructure, a web-based information system on a Government portal, a modal Public Service Law in Social areas, a National Council for Human Resources in Health a roadmap on judicial reforms and institutionalizing quarterly reporting on flagship programmes. Which the President had promised to implement in the course of the next one year, but on that, there is very tardy action.

The performance of the Government on energy security has not remained upto mark. With regard the Rajiv Gandhi Grameen Vidyuteekaran Yojana to out of a total envisaged capacity of 78,700 MWS which was to be commissioned, is now subjected to a mid-term review. The record has been abysmal-against 90,000 MWS, just 40,000 MWS under implementation. So, the entire area of an integrated energy policy, still remains uncertainty.

The Hon'ble President has referred about Quantum jump in the pace of developing national highways to reach 20 kms a day. In 2009-10, against the stipulated target of 3,165 kms. of national highway the achievement so far was 1,490 kms. Similarly, as against 2009-10 target of 9,800 kms. for awarding projects, only 1,285 kms. were awarded by the end of 2009.

Eight missions were to be set up on an integrated policy towards climate change and towards getting renewable energy. This House has been kept in the dark on these eight missions which were set up.

What the Finance Minister has said with regard to programme evaluation that the Planning Commission itself would set up a programme evaluation entity is unfortunate. It is my suggestion that the Government must furnish an Action Taken Report on all cumulative promises made by the President in successive speeches. The Annual Plan of the Planning Commission should not look like repetitive report card. Further, I urge upon the Government to furnish to this House the total number of commissions, committees, task forces set up between UPA 1 and the UPA 2 and their present status. I request the Government to improve the quality of the public delivery system. Public-private partnership is not the panacea for everything.

**SHRI D. RAJA:** Every one of us must be aware of the historic speech made by the Dr. Ambedkar in the Constituent Assembly. When I see the President's Address I feel the things are going wrong in the country.

We should do some introspection. Why should things go wrong in India? We are a matured Republic. We should try to understand the meaning of inclusive growth. The neo-liberal policies pursued by the Government cannot pave the ground for inclusive growth. The concept of inclusive growth should be understood in a larger perspective as to how to integrate our society and our people. We may be happy that our GDP growth will improve from 7.2 per cent to 8 per cent or 9 per cent or double digit.

As far as the Human Development Index is concerned, as per the Economic Survey, India has been given 134<sup>th</sup> rank. We are proud of Chandra Yaan. Credit for this goes to our scientists. With regard to our GDP and faster growth we really fail to understand the demands of our society and the sufferings of the people. We demand that a time has come when we should go for a thorough review of paradigm of 'economic development'. The President's Address does not show that concern. With regard to price rise, it has nothing but justification of the Government's position. President's Address should admit that the Government has totally failed to control the prices.

With regard to the issue of internal security, I think the internal security, going by the statements made by our Home Minister, is made as an equivalent to the Left Wing extremism. Of course, it is to be fought and we never agreed with the ideology of Left Wing extremism. What is happening in the name of internal security is that the tribal people are being harassed. The Government should address the real issues which are faced by the tribal people. The Government should have a comprehensive approach. The tribal

people are the natural owner of forest and mineral wealth and you are now driving them away without any proper programme of rehabilitation or without any consensus of tribal people. This is a dangerous approach which Government needs to change. Regarding the Foreign Policy issues, we welcome the resumption of Indo-Pak composite dialogue but with regard to Sri Lanka, the President's Address talks about rehabilitation. We have been demanding political solution of the Sri Lankan Tamil question. Government should reopen such questions in order to protect our fishermen. On the Telengana issue, I share the concern expressed by Shri Venkaiah Naiduji. The Government should have a proper approach on this issue and it should not be delayed further forever.

**SHRIMATI SHOBHANA BHARTIA:** The Central focus of the President's Address is on an empowered and an equitable India. As far as the Bharat Nirman programme is concerned, over Rs.1,60,000 crores have been spent over five years resulting in a major step towards rural infrastructure development. They have also been able to allocate money in terms of trying to widen the social security net through various programmes. The welfare of millions of people actually depends on a thriving economy, and a thriving economy, in turn, depends on the ability of the State to maintain law and order, to be able to guarantee life and protection to its citizens. We are faced today with one of the most challenging issues of our times. We are dealing today, with a movement that is looking at an armed overthrow of the Indian States. This is no small thing and the Government has to effectively try to contain this at the earliest.

Today, we have seen that this left-wing extremist movement has covered over 220 of India's 626 districts, covering almost 40 per cent of our landmass. In February 2009, the Centre had announced an inter-State well-coordinated approach between the affected States so that all the escape routes could be effectively blocked. But the current crisis has its origins in Bihar, Jharkhand, Orissa and Bengal. For some reason, the Jharkhand and the Bihar Governments seem extremely reluctant to take on this menace with the sort of focus that is required. It is very easy to commit an act of violence in West Bengal and move over to Jharkhand or vice-versa. There seems to be some sort of lack of infrastructure or political will to deal with this issue. We are also being hampered by lack of appropriate training for our police force. I hope that we will look at this problem not just as one of security, but this can become the greatest drag on India's economic progress.

**Shri Tiruchi Siva:** I support the Motion moved by Prof. Kurien and seconded by Shri Santhosh Bagrodia to thank the President for her address to the Parliament. India is now the fastest growing economy in the world. We have had the Green, the White and the Blue Revolution. Now, we are the leaders in information-technology and our growth and progress in every sphere is immense.

India has achieved tremendous progress and development. There are still some challenges it is straining against. Two important things namely NREGA and expansion of water schemes and second being the Right to Free and Compulsory Education. What is good should be appreciated. We have already appreciated the Golden Quadrilateral Programme of the NDA Government. Every sector of the society has been taken care of and the same has clearly been accepted in the Address. A substantial amount has been allocated from various funds from the drought affected States. A Diesel Subsidy Scheme was introduced. The spirit of federalism can be established only by consulting the State Governments while making policies for the common men. The Government of Tamil Nadu has done a lot for the poor section of the society. And for this purpose India needs a set of honest men. The vision pointed out in the Address would be brought into action.

**DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA :** Motion of Thanks should remain unanimous. Whereas hundreds of amendments have appeared. It would have been appreciated, had the same been her own. It has been a practice in India that President in her Address used the term 'my Government', while the same is beyond Party Politics. In my opinion, the term, 'my Government' is quite objectionable. It should be amended. In the Address the issue of security has been marginalised while it is burning problem in India. The Government can holds talks with terrorists and other criminals and not with the opposition parties of the country. The issue of food securities has been raised. But, the price rise is on the rise. The president has mentioned about rural health but the Government does not have any data of the number of doctors. She has mentioned about education and Right to Education Bill but the reality is different. A large number of children of different age groups do not go to school. Girls are illiterate. Right to Education Bill has been passed but no Action Plan has been formulated therefor. What would be provision of free education and where from the allocation would come has not been made clear. The President has mentioned Women's Reservation Bill which is in the Session too appears doubtful to be passed.

**SHRI B. K. HARIPRASAD :** The President has pointed out the programmes chalked out by the Government.

We have historical evidences to prove that India has been secular country where the people believe in living in brotherhood. In the eight years of NDA regime, the interests of the farmers and labourers have been neglected. The prices of kerosene and LPG hiked manifold. Resultantly, the life of common masses worsened. Even in their earlier agenda, there was no place for the real *Aam Admi*. Their agenda was either regional or communal. The birth of the Jan Sangh was purely on the basis of some hidden agenda. But, now we have launched Bharat Nirman Programme, under which we are helping the *Aam Admi*. The essence of democracy is that the persons, elected by the people, will govern the country. But the outsourcing of candidates to context elections is unfortunately undemocratic on the part of the BJP.

In the past six years, the Government has launched many programmes, in respect of which the powerful lobbies of the States are not cooperating. The President's Address connotes to the inclusive growth. We are trying to raise the status of living of BPL population by providing them job opportunities. Even after 60 years of our Independence, we are still trying to have programmes for them. For this, the Opposition should be constructive. Though we are the 4<sup>th</sup> powerful economy in the world, we are one of the poorest countries. We have always been against the terrorist activities. We are cautious of the security of the nation. The Opposition should not teach us a lesson in this respect.

The Government has launched housing scheme for the poor sections by giving financial assistance for the construction of houses. But there is no helping hand on the part of the State Governments. There is no dearth of land for the rehabilitation of the slum dwellers. The country should adopt the modalities of Tamil Nadu for their rehabilitation.

The President's Address points out the Communal Violence Bill, 2005 which should be passed at the earliest. We should also have a rehabilitation programme for the people affected by the communal riots. I have a demand to set up an AIIMS - like institution in the South, so that the poor people thereof can have access to health facilities. I also want high standard Government schools to be set up in my State.

**SHRI MOHAMMED AMIN:** I am sorry to mention here that the President's Address does not highlight the challenging issues like price hike. There is no indication to contain the price hike and growing unemployment.

Where there were made land reforms in the States like West Bengal and Kerala, there is rather less price rise. I suggest the Government to procure the produces of the farmers and supply the same at the control rate in cooperation with the State Governments. That is how the price hike can be contained within a year. The Government should phase out the middlemen and provide a subsidy worth Rs.80,000 crores on foodgrains to save people from starvation.

As far as foreign policy is concerned, it should not be replicated on the line of the U.S. foreign policy. We should have a free foreign policy. The U.S. foreign policy is imperialistic and tyrannical. It is regretful that while we are corroborating the independence of Palestine, we are purchasing weapons from Israel. The Government should change the policy. We will have to do away with the capitalism in the well-being of the poor.

Thus, we will continue to struggle for having an alternative policy in the country.

\* \* \* \* \*  
\* \* \* \* \*

**V. K. AGNIHOTRI,**  
*Secretary-General.*

[rssynop@sansad.nic.in](mailto:rssynop@sansad.nic.in)

---

\*\*\*Supplement covering rest of the proceedings is being issued separately.

**ERRATA TO SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE, DATED 3<sup>RD</sup> MARCH, 2010**

- Page 48      Line 16, read 'criticism' for 'cricisms'  
                  Line 20, delete 'to the'
- Page 49      Line 12, read 'moved' for 'given'  
                  Line 5 from bottom, read 'MNREGA' for 'MNREAGA'
- Page 50      Line 12, read 'NREGA' for 'NREAGA'  
                  Line 14 from bottom, read 'a cause' for 'caused'
- Page 51      Line 15, read 'that payments to the' for 'that the'  
                  Line 16, delete 'payment'