

## **RAJYA SABHA**

---

### **\*SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE**

---

**(Proceedings other than Questions and Answers)**

---

**Tuesday, June 9, 2009/ Jyaistha 19, 1931 (Saka)**

---

### **OBITUARY REFERENCES**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, I refer with profound sorrow to the passing away of Shrimati Vidyawati Chaturvedi and Shri Habib Tanvir, former Members of this House.

**Shrimati Vidyawati Chaturvedi** passed away on the 11<sup>th</sup> of March, 2009, at the age of 84 years.

Born at village Kulpahar in district Hamirpur, Uttar Pradesh, in December, 1924, Shrimati Chaturvedi had her education privately and was conferred 'Sahitya Ratan' and 'Vidya Visharad'.

An agriculturist and a medical practitioner, Shrimati Chaturvedi was the founder and Headmistress of a Girl's school in Garhi Malhera, Chattarpur, Madhya Pradesh. She was imprisoned twice in the year 1946 and 1947 for organising Civil Disobedience Movement in Bundelkhand. She worked for women's education and their uplift. She was the Chairman of the Council for the Aid of Crippled and Handicapped, New Delhi and Vice-President of Regional Cooperative Union, Vindya Pradesh.

Shrimati Chaturvedi began her legislative career with the membership of the Madhya Pradesh Legislative Assembly from 1957 to 1962, and was a Member of the 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha.

---

\*This Synopsis is not an authoritative record of the proceedings of the Rajya Sabha.

Shrimati Vidyawati Chaturvedi represented the State of Madhya Pradesh in this House for two terms from April, 1966 to April, 1972 and April, 1972 to April, 1978.

In the passing away of Shrimati Vidyawati Chaturvedi, the country has lost a social worker and a distinguished Parliamentarian.

**Shri Habib Tanvir** passed away on the 8<sup>th</sup> of June, 2009 at the age of 85 years.

Born at Raipur in September, 1923, Shri Tanvir had his education at Laurie Municipal High School, Morris College, Nagpur; Aligarh Muslim University; Royal Academy of Dramatic Arts, London; Bristol Old Vic Theatre School, Bristol; and British Drama League, London.

A journalist, dramatist, producer of plays and writer, Shri Tanvir was a good debater and interested in hiking in his student days. He was an Associate of the Drama Board, London and was the Editor of 'Textile Journal' and 'Box Office'. Apart from being a drama critic as well as a film critic for many newspapers and magazines, Shri Tanvir also served as the Senior Editor of the Soviet Information Department, New Delhi from 1965 to 1972.

Shri Tanvir acted in plays, wrote and produced plays for Indian People's Theatre Association, Bombay; founded the first professional theatre in Delhi, 'The Hindustan Theatre' in 1954; and also founded 'Naya Theatre' in 1959. Some of his important productions were Sudraka's 'Mrichchakatika', Visakhadatta's 'Mudra Rakshas', Agha Hashar's 'Rustom-o-Sohrab' and his own 'Agra Bazar', 'Shatranj ke Mohrey', 'Meray Baad' and 'Charan Das Chor'. He wrote songs and dialogues for films and made advertising films for T.V. He also acted in films.

Shri Habib Tanvir was awarded the 'Sangeet Natak Akademi Award' in 1969, the 'Padma Shri' award in 1983, the 'Sangeet Natak Akademi Fellowship', in 1996 and the 'Padma Bhushan' award in 2002.

Shri Habib Tanvir was nominated to the Rajya Sabha in April, 1972, and remained a Member of this House till April, 1978.

In the passing away of Shri Habib Tanvir, the country has lost a veteran theatre personality, a leading playwright and an eminent Parliamentarian.

We deeply mourn the passing away of Shrimati Vidyawati Chaturvedi and Shri Habib Tanvir.

*(One minute's silence was observed as a mark of respect to the memory of the deceased).*

---

**MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENT'S  
ADDRESS-Contd.**

**SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR :** I thank you for giving me the opportunity to express myself on the most important policy document unveiled by the new Government. The President's Address is, indeed, a charter of national renewal. It is a charter of national regeneration.

The President's Address unfolds the charter of humane and caring governance. This address concerns itself with the welfare of the aam aadmi, concerns itself with the empowerment of those who have remained on the margins of the society and it reflects the will of our age. The National Food Mission, the Food Security Act, the Independent Evaluator's Office in the Prime Minister's Office are all the measures found place in the Address for the first time. This Address seeks to eliminate the distinction between India and Bharat. It says that the economic growth is necessary, but the economic growth per se cannot be an end itself. We have tried to bring economic growth with empowerment.

There are many, many new avenues that we have treaded. Our Foreign Policy initiatives, our strategic relationship with global powers is for everybody to see. Our relationship with our neighbouring countries need to be improved. India is an emerging global power. We have to engage with the rest of the world economically, strategically, politically and to address global challenges. Climate change, pandemics, human rights violation, destitution, hunger are global challenges and require global responses. The *Vasudhev Kutumbhakam* was our philosophy that we gave to the world. Globalization, in a way, is nothing more than an extension of that. But, then, we have to be watchful against the pitfalls of globalization and that is also what this Address promises.

On the economic side, infrastructural development is to be a key focus. This Address seeks to assure the nation that public expenditure in infrastructure, particularly, power, roads, highways, airports, etc., will be

enhanced. The Foreign Direct Investment has been an important ingredient of our development process. The President has graciously argued that we need to enhance Foreign Direct Investment.

Telecom and IT revolution, is indicated in the President's Address. Democratic governance is about responsiveness, it is about sensitivity to aspirations, it is about sensitivity to perceptions. This Address, in my view takes all of that into account and seeks to offer good governance to this country.

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Our President gave a great speech. She congratulated the Election Commission, for the great job done in this country to protect and see how the democracy worked under the Commission. When everybody have a code of conduct during the election, the Commission itself does not have any code of conduct. Though, no officer can be transferred during election, but the Commission can change its members when the whole election process is on. This is a matter of great concern.

The Government should admit and accept some good things done by other State Governments. The Hon'ble President said that there should be reservation of 50 per cent for women in Panchayats in local bodies. The State Government of Bihar has done that. Let's say that there is a Government, which has performed like this; we want to adopt it.

We are talking about giving 33 per cent reservation to women. Reservations in this country has been basically an outcome of inefficiency of the Governments. We could not fulfil the dream in sixty years. Similarly, when we are failed on other fronts, we have started reservation for certain other categories of people. So, basically it is the failure of Governments one after the other that we had to go for reservation. Gender reservation, of course, is a very great thing which should have been done.

When we are talking about the youth, young India in Australia is under attack, and now, a situation has emerged that they have also retaliated. Now, this is a very serious situation if retaliation starts in Australia. Here, from this country, every year, almost four-and-a-half lakh students go out to study. We spend more than Rs. 50000 crores. With this Rs. 50000 crores, hundreds of IITs and IIMs could be built. But, it was never done so. So, it is the time to think what we have been doing for the last fifty-five years and adopt a strategy where we can see that this situation do not emerge.

This Government should realize that no one has been in Government permanently. Governments keep on changing, but democracy has to stay; governance has to stay. And, that is why, all the good things, which you want to do will be supported by us.

Hon'ble President mentioned about reforms in the judicial process. Now, if we are talking about judicial reforms, we have to have a complete site of what is happening in this country. So, judicial reforms is an essential part.

We have been discussing about environment, climate change, carbon emissions and global warming. There are States in this country which are directly affected by the environmental changes, for example, Bihar. We witnessed the floods in Bihar which displaced almost 40 lakh to 50 lakh people. It is happening because the entire forest reach in the Himalayan region has been absolutely removed; they have been cut. No Government of the day is working to stop the deforestation, which is flowing into this country where the catchment area cannot have any water retention.

My last point is about disinvestment. Now, this is the question: whether you want to disinvest companies which have lost their core or fundamental business, or you want to disinvest companies which are inefficient? We, in the NDA Government did certain privatisation, for example, the Airport Authority of India. The airports which you call world-class today, whether it is Delhi or Mumbai, was not done by the previous Government. It was done because the Airport Authority Act was amended. Airport Authority did not get disinvested; a benchmark of excellence was established by an initiative. And today, the Airport Authority is geared up to create world-class airports. Now, this should be the fundamental aim of the Government to establish benchmarks. Now they are talking about disinvesting Air India and Indian Airlines because they are inefficiently run. Today all the airlines in this country are run by ex-officials of Indian Airlines and Air India. All of them are running efficiently, but government's own organisation is not running efficiently.

**SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA:** The President Address looks like a document based on the language of electioneering, as if another General Election is going to be held in a year. Government are selling dreams and utopian fantasies such as slum free India in 5 years, making all women literate in five years, etc. And Government are thinking of making quality education a right by law. We have under-paid teachers all over the country.

Can we think that they are going to impart quality education at the primary stage? We are wasting so much of money on world-class universities, central universities etc. Money was diverted from primary, elementary and mass education, which is needed for this country, to higher education, which can be best done by lot of foundations, which can be set up, and the corporate can be persuaded and even forced in that direction.

In the President's Address a lot of talk has been made about young people. Please learn something from these young people instead of pandering to religions and castes for votes and vote-bank politics.

Dozens of references to the word 'inclusive' have been made in the President's Address but it seems to have forgotten that India has a federal structure and discrimination has been made against the non-Congress or non-UPA States. The recommendations of the Sixth Pay Commission were accepted without consulting any of the States knowing fully well that the impact thereafter for development or uplifting the poor from poverty. At a time of reduction of wages and salaries worldwide, a pay hike of sixty to eighty per cent has been given. Is this prudent fiscal management of the Government?

Discrimination is made even in declaring any calamity. Super-cyclone in Orissa in 1999 was not declared as calamity. In 2008, flood in Orissa which was the highest ever since Independence was not declared as a calamity.

What are the criteria for determining special-category status to a state? Orissa has 38 per cent of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe population, 47 per cent people below the poverty line and levels of literacy are also very low. Continuous inundation is taking place there by almost annual natural calamities like floods or cyclones. What else are needed to declare a State as a special category State?

Government had done the most blatant discrimination against the States like Orissa, Chattisgarh, Jharkhand, Karnataka and Rajasthan, mostly the mining States, where the minerals are exploited without any commensurate royalty being given to the States.

In case of infrastructure also, Government ignore us. Railway infrastructure is very poor. We need at least rupees 2500 crores a year to complete sanctioned projects in 5 years so that in 10 years' time we can catch up with national average.

**DR. PRABHA THAKUR:** I welcome the future schemes and programmes of the present UPA Government spelt out in the President's Address.

Last U.P.A. Government have not made difference in profession and practice, commitment was shown to the promises which were made to the public in its manifesto. Therefore, the people of the country elected the Congress with a huge majority for the interest of the country, for the integrity of the country, to maintain harmony in the country and for the development of nation and building India.

It is a better coordination of power and organisation which must be in other parties also and other parties also must follow it. All alliance parties of U.P.A. worked in the guidance of Hon'ble Chairman of U.P.A. People recognised the difference of politics and working and voted for development, voted for work, voted for Dr. Manmohan Singh ji and voted for Shrimati Soniaji. I would like to appreciate youth leader Shri Rahul Gandhi also with whose untired efforts and real hard work nobody could imagine the results of Congress in Uttar Pradesh. The alliance parties, which contested elections with us and due to the work which this Government did, also got support from the public and came with victory. But the parties which remained our alliance during power but sought separation at the end of the tenure, people neglected them.

Dr. Manmohan Singh showed his capability and strength at the time of the nuclear deal and made no agreement. For it the people of the country appreciated him. "NAREGA" scheme has been a specific achievement of our Government due to which women farmers have got much relief. I congratulate this Government for the concept of bringing the Women Reservation Bill for consideration on the Table of the House in hundred days. Today many political parties are also supporting this Bill. I also congratulate them for it. Today the time has come for the political empowerment of women. All should welcome it. Now the Women Reservation Bill will be passed and the resolutions and declarations government have made, have been fulfilled earlier and this time also those will not remain on paper alone. Government will implement them.

**DR. GYAN PRAKASH PILANIA :** BJP has, unqualifiedly, extended a hand of friendship to UPA because UPA has got people's verdict, and they want to help them in bringing forth all good legislations, which they can, for the country provided they are worthwhile.

I would like to point out certain grave and glaring omissions in this Address. Number one is regarding racial attacks on Indians in Australia. It is a matter of very serious concern for every Indian. Another grave omission is regarding suicide by farmers. Next is, regarding female foeticide. Nowhere she is safe. It is a matter to be looked into.

Another point is regarding Bangladeshi infiltrators. They are disturbing peace and tranquility. They are a kind of danger to the sovereignty, security and integrity of the nation. There is no mention about the rehabilitation of five lakh Kashmiri Pandits. They live in this country, uprooted from their own homes, and nobody bothers about them. I congratulate the Government because of their declaration of early passage of the Women Reservation Bill. There is mention of Dalits only once in this whole Address and that pertains to an elite Dalit, the Lok Sabha Speaker, a very distinguished person. The people have given a verdict for stability, security, development and good governance, and we hope and pray that the new Government rises to the occasion.

**SHRI SHIVANAND TIWARI :** Last year, Koshi witnessed horrible flood. The Prime Minister had said that this is a national calamity but we received no money for reconstruction and rehabilitation. The State of Jharkhand was constituted but no compensation was provided till today. Our money is being sent to other States. Today, backward States are being exploited. Poverty and unemployment have increased during the last five years. We have come down from 128<sup>th</sup> place to 132<sup>nd</sup> place in the human development index of UNO. Public have given mandate to them after being displeased with the opposition parties. The President's Address has built castles in the air but conditions are getting worse.

The poor is not getting money you send for their upliftment. This is a matter of concern for the whole country. You should prepare a list of those people and transfer money direct to their bank accounts. I want to raise the issue of disinvestment. Government want to disinvest the public sector companies for completion of the schemes. Where is the paucity of money in the country? Inequality is increasing in the country. You are creating such conditions which are forcing you to sell your assets. If you truly want betterment of the poor then take steps to ensure that they get total money.

**DR. (SHRIMATI) KAPILA VATSYAYAN:** I would like to commend the comprehensiveness of the Address. Paragraph 40 deals with climate change and global warming. If ecological imbalances have been

disturbed, it is because what has happened to our glaciers, and if there is no Gangotri, there is no Ganga. The question of cleanliness is also a question of spiritual cleanliness. The indigenous people have kept our environment. We should take into consideration all these people.

We talk about the Indian identity. That identity is given by the illiterate women of India. They have a oral knowledge system. Not thinking about oral traditions of this country would mean imbalances. The primacy should be on the mother tongue. We have made mother tongue secondary. We should pay attention towards indigenous people and the craftsmen.

**SHRI ARJUN KUMAR SENGUPTA:** This Congress Party's election victory was a victory of the inclusive development and the equitable development. It is a victory of the Left. The paragraph 6 is the most significant paragraph in this Speech. Flagship programmes should be identified and they should be fulfilled.

The National Commission of Enterprises of the Unorganized Sector, NCEUS has now been disbanded after the 30<sup>th</sup> of April. But the work has been done. When this Commission was formed, we were given the task of examining the conditions of living of the poor and vulnerable and suggest the measures. In 2007, we brought out a report which gave the picture of the condition of the living of these people. NREG is not a simple programme of giving certain employment to the poor people, it is a programme of the Left giving the people the poor, the rural landless people the rights to eke out a living in an honorable way. We worked out the whole scheme, pointed out the problem that they had.

In 2008, we said that this programme now should be extended to the urban areas. This has been recognised here that this will move in that direction. We talked about the debt waiver problem of the Indian farmers. The Government accepted. But the debt waiving is not the solution. You have to provide additional credit, new credit, new sources of marketing, new sources of technology to particularly to the small and marginal farmers. We examined the process of employment in our country. During this period of high rate of growth, employment growth had actually decelerated compared to the previous ten years. The only way to do something in this kind of a jobless growth scenario is to do everything possible to increase employment in the unorganized sector. We had formulated a social security programme which is the most important thing is to provide a social flow of existence of living to the vast majority of our below poverty line unorganised workers.

It is a question of right. The society has to take the responsibility to look after the minimum requirements of livelihood of these people. The whole scheme was worked out. If it is followed through, just consider, 340 millions of our unorganised workers, 77 per cent of our population, will have the assurance that if they fall sick they will be looked after. If they reach the old age, they will have pension, they will have maternity benefit and we also have some unemployment benefit. If we could provide that, it would really change the face of the Indian poor. The actual cost of the whole thing was 0.5 per cent of the GDP. Soon after this, this country has spent hundreds of thousands of crores to save the corporate sector.

**DR. T. SUBBARAMI REDDY:** I support the Motion moved to thank the President's Address. For the first time in the history, people who are, perhaps, not much educated have voted only to the Congress Party. When it comes to election of MLAs. I would say local issues like castes, community and other things prevailed. This very fact shows that the performance of the UPA Government in the last five years was phenomenal. Now, there is a challenge before the Government as to how will it work in the coming five years and how will it be able to fulfil the expectations of the people. Today, in the administrative system, redtapism is the biggest cancer or disease.

The administrative matters would not move unless you push things. While India, as compared to other countries in world, is number one in facing this crisis and still feeling comfortable. So far as agriculture is concerned, the NDA Government could hardly achieve one per cent growth rate, while we achieved 3.8 per cent. All these facts have been recognised by the people and gave the mandate. Now, the Government want to introduce the Women's Reservation Bill within 100 days. By amending the Constitution, 50 per cent reservation for women would be provided in the Panchayati Raj and the local bodies. In the Central Government also the Government will give priority to participation of women on the top posts. All these facts show that we are committed for women's welfare. It is also a challenge for the Government to provide 25 kgs. of rice or wheat every month at the rate of Rs. 3 per kg. to the people belonging to Below Poverty Line. The National Food Security Act is a phenomenal contribution for the poor people. The Government wants to strengthen the right to information further and plug the loopholes. We are equally committed to upgrade the ports, airports, national highways, roads etc. The entire economy is very much interlinked with all these things.

We must invite all over the world to participate and invest in building airports, roads, infrastructure, etc. The Government wants to introduce the telecommunication system even in the remote rural areas. I would also like to mention here about the recapitalisation of the State-owned banks, physical consolidation in the medium term, more liberal reforms in the insurance sector, two new flagship programs are to be launched. We are expecting that by 2024, there will be four hundred million skilled people in India.

The immediate priority of the Government would be to focus on management of the economy that will counter the effects of the global slowdown. The problem of unemployment could be solved only with spectacular growth in industry. Steps have already been taken by the Government of India to stop attacks against Indian students, especially in Australia. A serious situation has arisen out of US report stating that Pakistan has 60 nuclear bombs and is adding more nukes aimed at India, thereby causing serious concern. Some steps have been taken by the Government to meet threat and challenges posed to India. My last point is about zero tolerance towards terrorism. There is already a big scheme for this.

**SARDAR TARLOCHAN SINGH:** The Hon'ble President has mentioned in her address that we will perform these tasks within 100 days. We are failed to understand that if you accomplish all this within 100 days, then what will you do during next five years.

Now women bill is being discussed. I want to tell the ladies that Punjab has fulfilled the demand which you have been making for the last ten years. Out of 13 Members of Parliament elected from Punjab, four are women. This has first time happened in India. The party which was staunch supporter of this Bill, has not given the ticket to women to contest the election.

In President's Address you have said popular things that these things will be done but is there any mention about population control? Biggest disease of the country is population explosion. After this health of children come and in this we are at the bottom in the world. From last one month Shariat Law has been imposed in some parts of Pakistan and biggest sufferers are non-muslim sikh people. Jazia has been imposed on them. Jazia is a tax and it is imposed on non-muslims. Amount of Rupees one crore has been collected from sikhs. We are unanimous on Sri Lanka but whether our country does not want to take steps for the condition of Sikhs in Pakistan?

My suggestion for this is that delegation of M.P. should go to Pakistan and take stock of the situation. Till today, Government of India has not spent a paisa on those refugees.

When you were celebrating coming of new Government we were celebrating 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary of Operation Blue Star. What had Government done to us 25 years ago under Operation Blue Star? My suggestion is this that resolution for condemning it should be moved in both Houses of Parliament and you apologize to Sikhs. Army attacked a religious and also on the highest sacred place and they were given gallantry awards. My suggestion is that those gallantry awards should be withdrawn. Besides this no compensation has been given to them. Women are roaming in streets. What has been done by the Government for them? Throughout India 10,000 sikhs were killed in 1984 riots. No action has been taken.

Law Minister had assured in the House that amendment will be made in Anand Marriage Act relating to Sikh marriages. There is no clause for registration under this Act. Majority of sikhs going abroad do not get certificate. They need a small thing that a clause be added that every sikh marriage will be registered. We are happy that we have a sikh Prime Minister but sikh issues should be taken for consideration.

**SHRI SHARAD ANANTRAO JOSHI :** I rise to add my voice to the general sentiment in the House for expressing gratitude towards the Hon'ble President of India for the Speech and Address she delivered on the 4<sup>th</sup> June, 2009. I was particularly impressed by the humility, sobriety and modesty with which the President referred to the recent elections and the results thereof. I would like to bring out the fact that the 'aam aadmi' manifesto of the Congress Party has surprisingly brought in the Lok Sabha an unprecedentedly large number of Ranis, Maharanis, descendents of dynasties, the affluent and the beautiful people.

The voter at large was greatly concerned about the mounting threat of terrorism as also the wave of retrenchments and bankruptcies resulting from the global economic slow-down. The Congress has won 29 per cent of the popular vote this time and 38 per cent seats, that is 206 seats this time. Those suffering from a sense of euphoria and even arrogance would do well to remember that exactly 25 years back their party had won as many as 49 per cent votes and 412 seats, that is, exactly twice the number of seats they have won this time. However, the party managed to lose the very next

elections within five years due to the position it had taken particularly in the Shah Bano case and the Bofors imbroglio.

With Dr. Manmohan Singh at the helm of the present Government, it is extremely unlikely that a “Bofors” will be repeated. The President in her Address has emphasised various measures for evaluation of various programmes including NREG Scheme, Electronic Governance, etc. One of the major planks in the last elections campaign was the Debt Relief and Loan Waivers Scheme of 2008. Many claims have been made about the benefits obtained by the farmers through this Scheme. The fact remains that suicides by farmers continue even after the implementation of the scheme. I wish the President had indicated some sort of a failure standard by which we could adjudge the performance of the Government not only at the end of the tenure but from year to year.

|   |   |   |   |
|---|---|---|---|
| * | * | * | * |
| * | * | * | * |

**V. K. AGNIHOTRI,**  
*Secretary-General.*

[rssynop@sansad.nic.in](mailto:rssynop@sansad.nic.in)

---

**\*\*\*\*Supplement covering rest of the proceedings is being issued separately.**