RAJYA SABHA

_____

*SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE

_____

(Proceedings other than Questions and Answers)

_____

Thursday, December 11, 2008/Agrahayana 20, 1930 (Saka)

_____

OBITUARY REFERENCE

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I have to refer with profound sorrow to the passing away of Shri Munavvar Hasan, a former member of this House and a sitting Member of the 14th Lok Sabha.

Shri Munavvar Hasan passed away on the 10th December, 2008 in a road accident at the age of 44 years.

Born at Kairana, in district Muzaffarnagar in Uttar Pradesh in May, 1964, Shri Hasan had his education at Muzaffarnagar.

An agriculturist by vocation, Shri Hasan steadfastly worked for the cause of social justice and for the welfare of the poor and deprived sections of the society.

The legislative career of Shri Hasan started with the membership of the Uttar Pradesh Legislative Assembly in 1991 and he served as Member of that Assembly for two terms from

---

*This Synopsis is not an authoritative record of the proceedings of the Rajya Sabha.

1991 to 1996. He was a Member of the Uttar Pradesh Legislative Council from January, 2004 to May, 2004 and was also Member of the 11th and 14th Lok Sabha.

Shri Munavvar Hasan represented the State of Uttar Pradesh in this House from July, 1998 to January, 2004.

In the passing away of Shri Munavvar Hasan, the country has lost an able Parliamentarian.

We deeply mourn the passing away of Shri Munavvar Hasan.

(One minute's silence was observed as a mark of respect to the memory of the deceased.)

DISCUSSION ON THE RECENT TERRORIST ATTACKS IN MUMBAI ON NOVEMBER 26-29, 2008

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI SHRIPRAKASH JAISWAL): I wish to make a statement on the terrorist attacks that look place in Mumbai between November 26, 2008 and November 29, 2008. With deep regret, I have to report to this House that 164 persons (civilians and security personnel) lost their lives and 308 persons were injured. Among the civilians killed were 26 foreigners belonging to many nationalities. Besides, nine terrorists were killed in the operations by the security forces. One terrorist was overpowered and captured.

At the outset, I wish to pay homage to the innocent civilians who were killed and the brave security personnel who laid down their lives in order to save the lives of many others. I offer my heartfelt condolences to the bereaved families. The Government of India and the Government of Maharashtra have

announced a set of measures as compensation for the terrible loss suffered by the families. Monetary compensation and free treatment have been offered to the injured. While words of sympathy and money can never adequately recompense the loss, I sincerely hope that our gesture will bring some comfort to the affected families.

The broad facts of the horrific tragedy are, by now, known to the Honourable Members and the people of India. According to information gathered during the course of the investigations, it appears that 10 Pakistani nationals belonging to the Lashkar-e-Toiba, a proscribed terrorist outfit, had left Karachi on November 23, 2008; boarded a launch by the name of *Al Hussaini*; accosted and hijacked an Indian fishing vessel, *M.V. Kuber,* off the coast of Gujarat; killed its occupants; and a few miles short of the coast of Mumbai abandoned the fishing vessel, got into an inflatable rubber dinghy, and landed near Budhwar Park, Colaba, Mumbai between 8.00 p.m. and 8.30 p.m. on November 26, 2008. The terrorists split into four groups and the main targets of the four groups were (i) Chatrapati Shivaji Terminus (CST); (ii) the Leopold Café and Taj Hotel; (iii) the Oberoi - Trident Hotel and; (iv) the Nariman House. These attacks involved indiscriminate firing, throwing of grenades and bomb blasts at 13 locations. Considering the extensive publicity that the whole episode has already received in the media and through official statements, it may not be necessary for me to go into the details of what happened at each of these locations.

I shall now give you a brief account of the response of the authorities to the terrorist attack. At the CST, security personnel belonging to the Mumbai police and the RPF confronted two heavily armed terrorists. After causing mayhem at CST, the two terrorists escaped via a lane opposite the station. Meanwhile, as soon as news of the firing at the CST and near Cama Hospital was received, police officers rushed to the sites. There was an

unexpected - and fortuitous - confrontation between the two terrorists and the police personnel in which three officers were killed. Subsequently, the two terrorists were challenged by a police party and, in an exchange of fire, one terrorist was killed and one was captured alive. The name of the apprehended terrorist is Mohammed Ajmal Amir. Interrogation and investigation have revealed that he belongs to Village Faridkot, in District Ukada, in the province of Punjab in Pakistan.

As information about the terrorist attacks poured in from the Nariman House, Taj Hotel and the Oberoi-Trident Hotel, police parties were rushed to the places.

Shortly before 11 p.m. on November 26, 2008, information was received by the Central Government that there were incidents of firing in several places in Mumbai. Immediately, the Central Government authorities got in touch with the authorities of the Government of Maharashtra. At the request of the Government of Maharashtra, the local Army and Navy authorities were asked to provide assistance. Accordingly, the Army deployed 5 columns to cordon off the affected areas and the Navy deployed their commandos to deal with the terrorists. Meanwhile, at about 11.30 p.m., the Government of Maharashtra asked for the National Security Guards. The Central Government immediately alerted the NSG and mobilized their counter terrorist units, based at Manesar in Haryana. A group of around 200 men (which was reinforced the next day) was airlifted to Mumbai late that night. They were deployed at the various sites of the operation in the early hours of November 27, 2008.

The operations were conducted under very difficult circumstances: the terrorists were heavily armed, there was a hostage situation, and the terrorists had the advantage of shield and height afforded by the tall buildings that they had entered.

Nevertheless, through their patience, skill and bravery, the security forces were able to neutralize the terrorists and rescued hundreds of persons who had been trapped in the buildings. The operations came to an end at about 8.20 a.m. on November 29, 2008.

Cases have been registered and the investigations have been entrusted to the Crime Branch of the Mumbai Police. The authorities of the Maharashtra Police and the Central agencies have extended their full support to the Mumbai Police in the conduct of the investigations. Honourable Members will appreciate that it would not be appropriate to disclose any details of the investigations except to draw attention to the official briefings given by the Mumbai Police. Nor would I be able to comment on the many reports that have appeared in the media from time to time. I would respectfully urge patience until the investigations are completed and the reports are filed before the court of law.

I am, however, able to say that the finger of suspicion unmistakably points to the territory of our neighbour, Pakistan. The interrogation of the captured terrorist has yielded valuable material evidence. The origins of the ten terrorists who entered India have been established conclusively. There is also abundant evidence gathered from the inflatable rubber dinghy, the fishing vessel and the bodies of the terrorists that has enabled the investigators to reconstruct the sequence of events from the origin to the targets.

I know that Honourable Members - as well as the people of the country - would wish to ask a number of questions concerning the nature and extent of the terrorist threat to India, the intelligence gathering machinery, the preparedness of our security forces, the effectiveness of the operations, and on the path forward. There are genuine concerns on each of these matters. I share these concerns. In the last ten days, even while familiarising myself with the

security situation and the working of the Ministry of Home Affairs, the intelligence agencies, the Central Paramilitary Forces and the State Police forces, I have initiated a number of steps that will, I believe, enhance security and restore the confidence of the people.

Honourable Members, in my assessment, South Asia is in the eye of the storm of terror. Several terrorist organizations operating from territories beyond India's borders have been identified as the source of the terrorist attacks in India that have occured over the last several years. India told the United Nations Security Council yesterday that "India will act to safeguard and protect its people from such heinous attacks; however long and difficult that task may be. We have acted with restraint in the face of terrorist attacks. We must do our duty by our people and take all actions as we deem fit to defend and protect them." That is our policy. My colleague, Shri Pranab Mukherjee, Minister for External Affairs will intervene in the discussion and deal with the external and diplomatic aspects of the situation arising out of the terrorist attacks in Mumbai.

We have a number of intelligence gathering agencies. Intelligence is shared, evaluated and acted upon. However, I have found that there is a tendency to treat some intelligence inputs that are not specific or precise as not actionable intelligence. Further, the responsibility for acting upon intelligence inputs is quite diffused. In the case of the Mumbai attacks, intelligence regarding a suspected LeT vessel attempting to infiltrate through the sea route was shared with the Director General, Coast Guard and the Principal Director, Naval Intelligence. The Coast Guard made a serious effort, including deploying vessels and aircraft, to locate the suspect vessel, but was not successful. The Navy found that the coordinates of the vessel, as reported, placed it well within the territorial waters of Pakistan. Nevertheless, the Navy had committed several surface units and aircraft in the zone during the

period November 19-20, 2008. In the absence of further inputs or information from the agencies concerned, the Navy concluded that no further action could be taken on the basis of the available information.

I wish to inform Hon'ble Members that all aspects concerning intelligence are under my examination. While the basic structure seems sound, there is a need to make intelligence gathering and intelligence sharing more effective and result oriented. Some changes have already been made and more are underway.

The NSG is our best trained and best equipped force to counter a terrorist attack. On many occasions in the past- and in Mumbai too - they have displayed exceptional courage and skill. They are hampered by the distance between their headquarters and the airport; the absence of a dedicated aircraft; and the poor logistics in the theatre of operations. Nevertheless, once deployed, the NSG is a very effective counter terrorist force. I have initiated a number of steps to remove the logistical weaknesses in mobilizing and deploying the NSG. A decision has been taken to locate NSG units in a few regional hubs. A decision has also been taken to draw upon the commando units of the Armed Forces to create more regional hubs until a decision is taken to locate NSG units in those hubs too. These decisions will be implemented as expeditiously as possible.

The Mumbai terrorist attacks have brought into sharp focus the vulnerability of our coastline that extends to 7,500 kms and the imperative need to enhance maritime and coastal security. A coastal security scheme was approved in January 2005 for implementation over a period of five years with an outlay of Rs. 400 crore for capital expenditure and Rs. 151 crore for recurring expenditure during the first five years. We have reviewd the

scheme and we have concluded that there is a need to strengthen it and integrate it into a larger security system. A decison has been taken in-principle to create a Coastal Command for overall supervision and coordination of maritime and coastal security. The mandate of the Coastal Command will be to secure India's coast line.

I may also report to this House a number of other decisions that have been taken in order to enhance security:

(i) Intelligence gathering requires human resources and technical resources. We have identified the gaps. Steps are being taken to fill the vacancies in the intelligence organizations expeditiously and to provide them advanced technical equipment.

(ii) India Reserve Battalions are being raised in a number of States with financial assistance from the Central Government. Government have already authorized that two companies of each battalion may be raised as special commando units for which additional assistance will be provided for training, equipment etc.

(iii) It has been decided to set up 20 counter-insurgency and anti-terrorism schools in different parts of the country for training the commando units of the State police forces.

A separate exercise is underway to strengthen the laws relating to terrorist acts. We are in the process of consulting different political parties and I hope to introduce in this session, with the leave of this House, a set of Bills to strengthen the legal provisions relating to the prevention, investigation, prosecution and punishment of terrorist acts. One of the Bills is for setting up a National Investigation Agency. I would urge this House to consider and pass these Bills in this session. I would also urge this House to

pass the Amendment Bill to the Prevention of Money Laundering Act, 2002.

The Prime Minster, in his address to the Nation on November 27, 2008 declared the resolve of the Government to take the strongest possible measures to ensure the security of the Nation and the people. I promise, on behalf of the Government, that we will strain every nerve to carry this resolve into determined action. There is one thing that I wish to make clear: given the nature of the threat, we cannot go back to "business as usual". In the next few weeks and months, it will be my endeavour to take certain hard decisions and prepare the country and the people to face the challenge of terrorism.

I appeal to all sections of this Hon'ble House and to the people of India to stand united and barve in the face of the challenge of terrorism. I ask you to remember the extraordinary courage of Assistant Sub-Inspector Tukaram Ombale who grabbed the barrel of the gun and took all the bullets in his chest to enable his fellow policemen to over power Mohammed Ajmal Amir. I ask you to remember the supreme sacrifice made by Major Sandeep Unnikrishnan who ordered his men to stay back while he confronted the terrorists. Ordinary men and women like us cannot match their bravery, but we can stay united in our resolve and in our actions. Nothing should divide us-not religion, not language, not caste. In our fight against terror, there will be need for self-restraint, discipline and even some sacrifice. In seek your support; and I have no doubt that, with your support and the support of the people, we shall overcome and vanquish the forces of terror.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE, initiating the discussion, said: I very much want to compliment the Government on the initiative which has yielded fruit just now. The United Nations Security Council has placed sanctions on the Pakistan based Jamaat-ud-

Dawa, which is just an altered name of Lashkar-e-Toiba, and the four top leaders of LeT including Hafiz Mohammad Saeed. He and three others, including Lakhvi, have been declared 'terrorists' by the Security Council, and their assets have been frozen. In all such initiatives, the entire House, indeed the entire country will be with you.

Nine facts stand out in much of what the Minister of State has just read out. The first of these is a sort of thing which is happening every month, every two months. In 2008 alone, there were 49 such incidents in 19 cities; about 2,525 people have been killed in these incidents.

The second fact is that this is happening right across the country. The people who follow terrorism know that in just two years, from 2004 to 2006, 81 modules were busted by our intelligence agencies. These were ISI modules which were busted by our intelligence agencies. These were ISI modules in all over the country excluding J&K and the North-East.

The third fact that stands out is that the finger of suspicion points to Pakistan. Its 60 years of existence, Pakistan, for 50 years, has been under the heel of the army. I think that none of us, in India, can realise the terror and the pervasiveness of ISI in Pakistani state and society. Therefore, to imagine that Lashkar-e-Toiba or any other agency could do things without the knowledge, patronage, guidance, training and equipment of ISI, is to live in a fool's paradise.

The fourth fact is that in these circumstances to ask Pakistan to help nail the masterminds just does not make sense. It is told that even Mr. Zardari, the Pakistan President is not in control of the agencies like ISI. And we are appealing to him. Just now, the statement of Mr. Zardari that the fellows causing all the trouble in Jammu and Kashmir are terrorists. After this Ms. Sherry Rehman,

the Minister of Information there, immediately refuted it in a statement.

Therefore, in these circumstances, to invite Pakistan to come here for even discussions to put hope in the so-called joint mechanism for fighting and investigating terror is to fool oneself. The fifth point is that the infrastructure for terrorism in Pakistan has not been rolled up at all. There is a Status Paper on internal security situation which was presented by Mr. Shivraj Patil to the Parliament on 30th November. It says that the terrorist infrastructure in Pakistan and PoK is yet to be dismantled and is being used by Pakistan-based and Pakistan ISI sponsored outfits like Jaish-e-Mohammad, Lashkar-e-Toiba, Al Badr, Hizb-ul-Mujahideen, etc. and they want to do nothing about it. Because these organizations are the instruments of the ISI and the Pakistan Army.So to repose hope is to put ourselves in for difficulties.

The sixth point that comes out is local help. Yes, these are ISI inspired. Their principal instruments are Lashker-e-Tayeba, etc. But none of this could have happened without local help. Because they knew the entire layout. The seventh point is that these agencies abroad and these networks abroad like Lashker-e-tayeba, use existing channels, for instance, of smugglers. Just to get a ban there is a wonderful first step, but unless we get at these networks and the existing channels, we will never get anywhere.

I completely endorse what the Home Minister has said that the entire nation feels grateful for the bravery and the sacrifice of our poor NSG people and the other security personnel. It took three hours for the Government to decide to deploy the NSG. After that it took five-and-a- half hours, a total of nine hours, before our specialized Force was able to reach there. When they reached there, after nine hours of the beginning of the assault, they were blind. They did not have maps of the hotels and targets.

The ninth fact, which has now been acknowledged here on page 3 of the statement of the Home Minister is about Intelligence reports actually having come. There are many qualifications to what has been acknowledged.

In para 12, it says: "Intelligence, regarding a suspected LeT vessel attempting to infiltrate through the sea route, was shared with the Coast Guard. " But the fact of the matter is that it has been leaked by intelligence agencies that there were intercepts that these two hotels would be among targets. The coordinates of this vessel were given the information. So, intelligence was given. Yet what was our response? Kindly look upon it as an institutional matter of what we have to strengthen and what we are up against. In the annual meeting with the Director-Generals of Police and the Inspector General of Police in November, 2006, the Home Minister told them coastal areas are coming under increased threat from terrorist groups which have decided to use the sea route to infiltrate into India. They also plan to induct arms and ammunitions through the sea routes. These things could not have been said off-hand. Then, on 8th March, 2007 and 9th May, 2007 the Home Minister repeated the same facts. Then, on 8th December, 2007, the National Security Advisor, Shri M. K. Narayanan, was also educating the world at Manama, in the Middle-East, at a Security Conference that certain new schools that are being established on the Pakistan-Afghanistan border which now specialize in the training of an international brigade of terrorists to fight in many climes.

Then, he says, "The sea route, in particular, is becoming the chosen route for carrying out many attacks, even on land. I would like, therefore, to sound a note of warning that there is no scope for complacency. On 11th March, 2008, Mr. A. K. Antony, the Defence Minister said that the dangers of terror attacks from the sea in the region are now mounting, and that the Coast Guard has

deficiencies, but bureaucrats say, all necessary steps are being taken." On the 13th November, 2008, just a fortnight before the assaults, the Prime Minister is educating the BIMSTEC leaders that terrorism and threats from the sea continue to challenge the authority of the State and on the 22nd November, 2008, four days before the assaults, the Home Minister while addressing the Directors-General of Police, said, "To control terrorism in the hinterland, we have to see that infiltration of terrorist from other countries does not take place through the sea route."

It was agreed that terrorism must be prevented and as directed by the leadership of the two countries at the meeting in New York on 24th September, 2008, severe action be taken against any elements involved in terrorist acts. And, that very day, using that very sea route, the terrorists come to those very targets.

First, Pakistan is not going to suffer at all as it has not suffered for killing 50-60 thousand Indians already. Second, not just the infrastructure within Pakistan remains, the infrastructure that is used for and within India remains exactly as it was. Third, there is a great pressure on Pakistan. The fourth fact is that Pakistan having nurtured these extremists, now if it keeps deflecting them in Afganistan, it is in trouble because of NATO pressure, American pressure. If it keeps them at home, it is in very severe trouble. Therefore, the option of choice that they will exercise is to deflect extremists once again into India. Fifth fact is that in the coming months, the US will retreat in defeat from both Iraq and Afghanistan and this will be a great boost to the extremists. The extremists cannot get to America easily. They can get somewhat more easily to Europe. But, we are the open and open target.

The sixth point is that of the 608 districts, today 231 are affected by extremist violence or insurgency of on kind or the other. Leave the Assam, even a peaceful State like Arunachal

Pradesh, the three districts of Lohit, TIRAP, and Changlang have now started getting affected by the terrorist recruitment drive there.

As regards the finger of suspicion, I can say from my personal knowledge that ISI is now knitting together Indian insurgence extremist groups even in the North East. Therefore, things are going to get much worse. What is happening in the North East, is a matter of great concern. Democracy must be strengthened. Concessions can be given but the peace process must be going on. The terrorism has increased. In Lakshadweep, there are 36 islands. The Godbole Task Force set up in the wake of Kargil in 2000 reported that for all these 36 islands Intelligence Operation is carried out by one inspector, one sub-inspector, one head-constable and three constables only on one island, Kavaratti. It was recorded there that unidentified helicopters and turbo planes have been landing in these islands. The Coast Guard-Navy coordination is not good enough. The Coast Guard should be put under the control of the Navy and accountability fixed. We should not wait for assaults of this kind to be awakened to the things we have not implemented. Air traffic control, Railway traffic control, power grids, banking transactions and broadcasting facilities all are to be done in two minutes through cyber warfare. It is very distress to report that the initiatives that were started in collaboration with our Defence Forces for setting up of fire walls on our infrastructure have not helped at all.

The fact of the matter is that the software and work being done in the Ministry and Defence Forces is vulnerable for operation by terrorists. They use not only mobile phones, satellite phones, voice over Internet Protocol but they use GPS also. It is now established by the best intelligence sources in the world that within the coming five years terrorists will use non-conventional weapons. They use biological, chemical and sub-nuclear weapons in their miniature form. Instead of waiting for the next statement

after one of those attacks, we must review our preparedness. In the Pakistani State the pervasiveness of the ISI and the power of the Army depends only on hostility with India and with successes against India in these operations. As far as the society there is concerned, Taliban is not the cause of what is happening. Taliban is the result of the Talibanisation of Pakistani society. In Government schools of Pakistan, from Kindergarten the instructions from the Central School of Secondary Education and Primary School Education says that the child shall be judged by the fervour with which he gives speeches on Jihad and Shahadat.

No war can be won with a strategy of permanent defence. For ten terrorists 200 commandos only from the NSG were sent plus reinforcement and naval commandos. It can be done with minimal force. India must return double to the enemy. The time has come when India should attack on the enemy strongly. Pakistan should be kept preoccupied in its own problems in Baluchistan, in Gilgit Baltistan and in PoK. All inhibitions for collaborating with armies and intelligence agencies of other countries that have expertise in these matters must be removed. A very good point that have been made by the Home Minister is thinking of a National Investigative Agency and of amending and tightening the laws. On dealing with terrorism, it is clearly said that there is a felt need to strengthen the hands of security forces in the fight against terror so that human rights and constitutional values are protected.

It is evident that most countries have been adopting tough anti-terrorism measures, whereas the provisions of similar laws have been diluted in India over a period of time. There is, definitely, a need to have stringent provisions to deal with terrorists. So, a thing which is necessary for the country should not be delayed. The technology the terrorist used and the training that we are giving to the persons who are to fight them should be

reviewed. Security personnel are less educated and they are to meet high technology challenges. About 20 per cent of the police constables in Delhi have not been given family accommodation. In this situation how we want them to be motivated to fight terrorism? It is not possible to have first-class anti-terrorist operations without first-class policing. All necessary steps have to be taken in this regard. Till today the recommendations made by the Girish Chandra Saxena Task Force on Intelligence have not been implemented. Various agencies were set up. The multi-agency centre, the National Intelligence Data base and the joint Task Force on Intelligence were set up under the IB but they remained on paper.

Seven years after these agencies were set up nominally, as new agencies are going to be set up, they remain, to my personal knowledge, merely 'paper' organizations. The entire country is with you when you take effective steps.

DR. KARAN SINGH: The horrific attack in Mumbai was not only an attack on that great city with which many of us have been associated for decades, but it was an attack on the heart of India, an on the soul of India. The horrified people of this country were watching for three days and three nights the unfolding events.

I would like to pay homage to all the brave men and women who took the brunt of this terrible attack, the Maharashtra Police, who lost some of their officers, the National Security Guards, the fire fighters, the staff of the Hotels, who showed exemplary calmness under great pressure and saved a large number of guests, and to the people of Mumbai as a whole. I also express deep sympathy for those innocent people who were killed.

It is true that terrorism has become widespread throughout the country. It is a massive and a nationwide problem. All the murderers came from Pakistan. They were trained, equipped and

motivated and guided from Pak territory and waters. It is true that Pakistan is also suffering from these very fundamentalists.

The Jamaat-ud-Dawa has been banned apparently this morning as a result of the Security Council's intervention. It should have been done *suo motu* by Pakistan. We are a nation which is playing a critical and crucial role in the emerging global society. We must mobilize the international community around the world, all the countries, to see that these sorts of acts are condemned. Those murderers went on to a boat. They killed those fishermen through the middle of the water.

I must stress that they should be taken to task and responsibility should be fixed. With regard to intelligence agencies, we have some very fine intelligence officers. There is a total lack of coordination between intelligence agencies. But there has not yet been adequate coordination between them. A major exercise is required to streamline and coordinate our intelligence agencies, to equip them better and to finance them better. Lack of equipments is there. All of this has to be looked into. I think, whatever measures are needed should be taken legally. Russia has always been supportive to us, and, now when America is supportive to us, various other countries are supportive to us, we must take advantage of that. We must be strong; we must give as good as we get. There are still millions of people who do not have the basic facilities. At some point in time we need to have some compassion. According to the developing situation, we must maintain a certain sense of stability, certain sense of perspective. We must implement them urgently.

The next form of assault, cyber warfare, high technology, we must be fully prepared for that. In fact, after the Mumbai attack, there have been many attacks in Pakistan where dozens and hundreds of people have been killed. So Zardari says, "We can

identify with India's pain". We must force them to do it. We must get the international community to force them to do it. All communities in India have joined in condemning this dastardly act.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I am, actually, recollecting to assess the gravity of the attacks that have continuously taken place in our country for the past few months, There were serial blasts that had taken place at three places in Assam and had the attacks in Hyderabad, Jaipur and in Ahemadabad. There were about 48 in the last one year. These are not merely attacks of one nature. Since we have become independent, we lost Mahatma to the bullets of a Hindu fanatic, we lost the former Prime Minister, Mrs. Indira Gandhi to the hands of Sikh militants, we lost a former Prime Minister to the hands of terrorists of LTTE. We have various types of terrorist activities that are conducted in the country by various outfits particularly in the North-East. Spread of Naxalite violence and activities that are conducted by these forces. The diversity of terrorist attacks in our country must be recognized otherwise we cannot succeed in the fight against terror. A terrorist has no religion, no caste etc.

Any attempt to straitjacket terrorists into one particular community is the success of terrorist forces and it is not an answer to resolve terrorism. A witch-hunting against a community in the name of fighting terrorism will only breed terrorism further.

I entirely agree that there had to be accountability of the various officers and various people in charge of the various Departments. The heads of the various information agencies have gone to the media and said passing the buck that they passed on the information but the information was not taken seriously. Why all the proposals that had been suggested could not be implemented. There should be coordination among intelligence gathering agencies.

The weakest link in our security apparatus is the bottom rung of the ladder which is our police force. Unless we strengthen this at the bottom level, there is nothing that can be done to improve the situation. What has happened to the various Commissions that have talked about the modernization of the police force? The United Nations norms is to have 222 policemen for every lakh of population. Now the all-India average is 126 and, in many States, it is much less.

Now, there is a proposal for a federal investigative agency on the lines of USA. We are not against borrowing good things from anywhere, including the US. But it has to have two objectives. One objective is to strengthen and improve the coordination between the various intelligence gathering agencies. There is another objective that is the federal content of the Indian Constitution and the powers of the States should not be violated. Maintaining both these objectives, this new agency will have to be created.

We respect human rights, but we cannot have draconian laws that can violate human rights. But, if there is inadequacy in the existing laws which need to be repaired, which need to be strengthened, it should be done but there should be concrete proposals.

Mr. Hemant Karkare, a martyr of modern India, was seen with a tainted glass when he was pursuing the Malegaon cases. When he gives up his life in Mumbai against these terrorists, he is a martyr. These double-standards will only help terrorists. All terrorist attacks, have to be pursued without any compromise.

Various comparisons have been drawn between the 9/11 of USA and how USA went about protecting itself and how we are failing. USA invaded Iraq whereas none of the terrorist attackers came from Iraq. They came from the countries which are the

closest allies of the USA in the region. It is not a question of being compromising on this on this issue in the fight against terrorism, but actually it should be understood how this terrorism can be combated in our Indian conditions. But there is another thing that needs to be replicated from the US after the 9/11, it is the manner in which the media reported on 9/11. No officer came before the media to give some information. There was no live competition between channels creating news. Live footage was shown about NSG commandoes who were landing and that live footage was seen by terrorists who take the counter offensive against them. In the interest of national security some things will have to be done where we cannot aid and abet terrorism to succeed by allowing this flow of information.

We are absolutely uncompromising that no foreign land can be used for terrorist activities in India. The best course to do that, in my opinion would be to take up this matter with the United Nations. We are fully conscious that taking this issue to the United Nations Security Council, as some fear, may legitimately open the door for internationalizing the Kashmir dispute. But, in assessment, all the five permanent members of the United Nations Security Council have all gone on record to state that the Kashmir dispute is a bilateral India-Pakistan issue. So, I do not see that danger.

We are all proud of the fact that despite more than 150 million Muslim here, nobody is a memeber of the AI Quida and this is what even George Bush admits. With the Indo-US Nuclear deal, with the strategic partnership, that we are building with the United States of America, are we prepared to face the threats of Taliban and Al Quida.

We are seen as a strategic ally of the USA? Have we taken measures to strengthen our security in the light of that? Multilateralism is India's bedrock in terms of foreign policy and

relations with other countries. Let that not be replaced by a nuilateralism as this will invite further dangers and threads.

We should abjure internal bloodletting otherwise we will end up in a failure. This is an attack on India and we will succeed if India fight unitedly as Indians and for that strengthen our security apparatus, modernize our intelligence gathering apparatus, maintain the federal character of our constitution and marshal international support and I urge this Government to take the necessary measures to do that.

THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE), **intervening in the debate, said**: I would intervene in the debate from certain Foreign and External Ministry angle. This is for the first time when a large number of foreigners belonging to 13 countries were targeted. 26 foreigners lost their lives and 30 injured. I deeply mourn the loss of every life that was the victim of the violence. I do not blame Pakistan or the people of Pakistan. But at the same time, I cannot ignore the fact that the elements who perpetrated this attack and even the controller of this entire operation were located in Pakistan. This perception is shared by a large number of countries.

As far as mobilization of international support is concerned, almost every country of the world has extended sympathy and solidarity with India. As this is not the issue of India and Pakistan but a global phenomenon. The terrorists do not respect any geographical territory. We may have difference of opinions but democracy is the coexistence of dissensions and we should fight collectively. This was not an ordinary act. Its enormity, its ferocity, its dimension, the strength of its operations speaks of how much time, how much energy, how much training, how much planning was necessary for this. The point, which I am trying to drive at is, the needle of suspicion is on Pakistan. Therefore, I sent my demarche to the Pakistani authorities. I

suggested that we would expect Pakistan to act; to act to fulfill its own commitments. The commitment, which Pakistan has reiterated time and again that its soil would not be used for terrorists' activities. We have given the names of 46 persons but the response was a flat denial. We pointed out that unless these issues are addressed, the business, as usual, cannot go on. Some people may have fancy idea of destroying India through such acts but they will not succeed. India is emerging and India will emerge.

I have never commented a word about the internal situation of Pakistan. When democratic Government came to power I started discussions but after that there was an attack on Embassy of Kabul. As per international law an attack on embassy is the attack on sovereignty, attack on that country. Afgan investigations pointed out the involvement of some elements in Pakistan but Pakistan said that they would investigate the matter themselves. We are still waiting the outcome.

I would not like to make any comment on their internal situation, internal mechanism and method of functioning. When there was the military government, we cooperated with them, but not at the dictates of somebody. Neighbours are going to stay there and we shall have to live in peace with the neighbours.

A point has been raised that we should move international institutions like the United Nations Security Council. As per the Resolution of the UN Security Council, when a committee was set up, it was *Al Qaida and Taliban*. When we pointed out that evidence is available that the outfit in Pakistan, *Jamat-ud-Dawah,* is an extension of Lashkar-e-Toiba under a different name, and asked them to take action against them; it has been put in the banned list.

We are not lacking in co-operation. On October 21st, we initiated the trade between our two countries. We opened the bus

routes, we would not like to make Kashmir an international issue. It will have to be resolved bilaterally, however it is very difficult strenuous and time consuming. I have never accused that Pakistan Government is responsible for these blasts. I used the words 'Elements in Pakistan'. There must be arrangement within Pakistan to control these elements. Therefore, instead of shielding or protecting these terrorists, action should be taken against them. There is no dearth of talks between two countries. Joint country terror mechanism, Framework of Composite Dialogue and eight subjects have been identified.

SHRI JANESHWAR MISHRA: I am happy that people in opposition have said that we are with you. This has also happened once before this when Parliament was attacked. This time whole opposition has said that terrorism should be stopped. Game of terrorism will not be stopped by politics. Politician is always cultured he may be of any party or ideology.

Whatever has happened in Mumbai we are in tension because of this. Government is also speaking and the whole national is in anger. Aim of the boys who had come to kill in Mumbai was to spread terrorism and terror is the natural human weakness. Because we are weak our neighbouring countries do not want to help us. It is to be noted that any country helps another country only when it knows well that other country strong.

Throughout the world there is a feeling in the hearts of minorities that there are insecure. There was no terrorism before demolition of Babri Masjid. These incidents started after that. Central office of existing terrorism is in Pakistan. For some days nation will remain in frenzy after Mumbai incidents. We will not advise war between two countries.

I will not comment on internal arrangement of the Government. Merely changing ministries will not serve any

purpose. Arrangement will have to be changed. Your Police Officers may be of any high rank but they cannot arrest any terrorist. Terrorists can take advantage of our corruption. Whether terrorism does not take birth from corruption? Parliament will not think over it, this world will think over it.

Times of lathi are over now. Now sophisticated weapons have come but our constables use only lathi. Why all recruitments are not done starting from constables in Police Department and promotion should be done on the basis of experience and hard work. Presently constable retires as a constable. There is no arrangement for education of their children. They are living in a bad condition. India will not become slave by any terrorist attack. We will be furious by this. Whether we have become so weak that we will not remain an independent nation?

Pakistan is younger brother and India is elder brother. But some strong measures are needed to be taken because such an activity is done again and again by them. This is not the way to get rid of present terrorism. Efforts should be undertaken again to unite both the countries. This task can be undertaken by the agencies of the Public. This situation is expected to be dealt with politely. Strong action will worsen the situation.

Don't make your children fanatic. Teach children good things. When mind turns fanatic, it becomes difficult to reform it. Every person who is against communalism, dreams about the unity of the people. Hardliners put hurdles in this direction. Such a step should be taken that Government could put pressure on the world. If you had taken action at the same time, nobody could have pronounced you guilty. Patience is needed. We socialist don't want to take any action which could give these people strength. We are supporting you. A little bit prestige of India has been eroded. The policy of tit for tat should be adopted. This incident

has made us laughing stock. A little bit of our self pride has been dented. Therefore you should take strong step. We advise you to call back our Ambassador. Centre of Laskar should be blown up. All the people are supporting you. Corruption is prevalent in bureaucracy. If political forces break this network of corruption, then terrorism will fear to enter the country. Majority community should treat person of minority community as his younger brother so that frenzy is not instigated.

SHRI SATISH CHANDRA MISHRA : This terrorist attack is not carried out only on Mumbai but on the whole of India, Terrorists don't belong to any religion or caste. I believe that all the muslims of Hindustan belong to Bharat. If this issue were discussed earlier, then deterrent action could have been taken by us. This issue is being discussed very first day of Parliament. Hon'ble Home Minister has mentioned about the removal of shortcomings in his statement. Perhaps we could have saved the lives of those citizens and policemen who died in the attack. The Government of Pakistan is not held responsible for the attack but people living there are held responsible. I don't agree with this completely.

If vigil at our boundaries were maintained, the people coming from outride could have been checked. It is mentioned that Pakistan is taking action. It is said that Azhar Mahmood has been put under house arrest. This person was arrested but released with honour. That person has spread terror in the country. It should be assured that this sort of thing did not happen in future. Bomb blasts happened at district Gorakhpur at three places on 22nd July, 2007. This case was successfully solved. Bomb blasts took place at courts of Lucknow, Varanasi and Faizabad in U.P. simultaneously in which thirteen people died. ATS arrested five terrorists in this connection. Third incident happened in C.R.P.F. Camp, Rampur. ATS of Uttar Pradesh solved this case

successfully. Fake currency is also being sent by Pakistan. Various agencies of Uttar Pradesh unearthed Fake Currency of crore of rupees. They have checked this activity to a large extent.

Some people residing in foreign countries have executed these incidents of terrorism in Uttar Pradesh. We have failed to check this. The onus of overseeing the international border lies on Central Government. Such incidents has happened due to lack of correct and accurate information to be provided by central agencies. Central Government release a Statement that we had already given information regarding this and no action was taken. This is a serious matter. False allegation is levelled at State Government. Political reasons should not interfere while dealing with terrorism. If you don't provide information, it is our failure. This has to be improved.

If you receive any specific information regarding mass destruction, the Central Government should appoint certain official or agency to take follow-up action in that matter. If it is not done then any new inputs become redundant. Such incident will occur again-and-again. Hence, our Central Government should think it seriously to strengthen our Intelligence Agency. Whatever specific information is received by that Agency, prompt action should be initiated rather than blaming other States or other Governments because, ultimately the sufferer is the common man. In this context, I thank the media for giving vast coverage to the general feelings of the common man.

I feel that we need to implement existing laws forcefully than enacting any laws. In Uttar Pradesh, we have established Anti-Terrorist Squad. We are imparting special training to that squad to deal firmly with terrorist attacks. It has shown fruitful results in three recent attacks in the State as we have been able to apprehend terrorists. We have also taken a decision to train two

thousand Commandos and to establish Commando Training Schools in the State. We are going to recruit 1,58,000 Police personnel which needs thousand crores of rupees. As you are saying that more and more NSG will be established to strengthen the system to deal with terrorism. Hence, I request you to extend special economic packages to the States also.

As far as the establishment of a Central Investigation Agency is concerned, we have some observations. That entity should not be made like C.B.I. That agency should not be established to serve any political interests of any specific party. Today, we are fed-up with assurances and we need some action. We will support any action to serve our country from terrorism.

SHRI SHARAD YADAV: Hon'ble Members have expressed their opinions in great detail. I would not repeat them. I associate myself with the feelings of members towards Assam incident also as it is not less important than the Mumbai incident.

I would like to submit that it is not an isolated incident. Country should remain prepared to deal with such incidents for a long time. We should strengthen and consolidate our system to fight terrorism. This time our visual media and print media both gave it a wide coverage. But, they singled out the politicians. I was hurt with this kind of propaganda. Sitting in opposition, I feel myself as helpless as any other common man. I can only give my suggestions to the Government and it is upto the Government to take action.

I feel, as if people are not united they are devided everywhere. But, throughout the country people have started candle march processions to express their resentment. In my opinion it is the failure of our Intelligence system. Now, they are saying that they did not have any specific information. Do you expect inch by inch information from them? Everybody is blaming

everybody. But, in my opinion it is our system failure. We have a very poor system of policising and Administration. Today, 7000 policemen have been deployed to protect Cricket teams in Chennai. Similarly, too much police protection has been given to several politicians. Every Government protects cricket. Real games have taken a back seat.

Now, you are talking about increasing the number of police personnel. How will you do that? I do agree that it was a security lapse. But, you are not going to involve that fisherman into this who knows about each and every boat personally. He don't have the courage to report to the Inspector. Similarly, after several Bomb blast in various dustbins in Delhi, did we ever try to involve the sweeper into such incidents. We are still not big hearted. U.S.A. can ensure a black to occupy the highest position. But, we never give the right to equality to the down trodden. Similarly, the coolie working in the railways is better informed about such incidents. So, please mobilize and gather information from them.

I request all parties to impart five minutes in their meetings to alert their cadres to remain vigilant. Everybody should be involved in this process. Today, nobody can attack China. As she has not adopted English as her official language. They are working in their own language. They are locally very sound. Here, we have accountable political system. It is a good thing. But, merely resignation of a Minister is not a solution to this problem. It is a war and we have to deal with it unitedly because our country is in danger today.

I do not understand the need of a National Security Adviser. Either you should have a full-fledged Home Minister with all Intelligence agencies under its belt or you should have a non constitutional entity, National Security Adviser. And that should be made fully accountable, they must be shown the door for

any lapse on their part. You can not deal with such incidents without interacting with general public. They must feel that they belong to this country and this country belongs to them. Any statement should be made before Parliament and not before the media.

Accountability of each and every person must be fixed. Interaction with citizens of this country is most important. Their voice must be heard in every meeting. Secondly, you must dismiss those officers who have committed such a security lapse.

* * * * *

* * * * *

V.K. AGNIHOTRI,
Secretary-General.

rssynop@sansad.nic.in

******Supplement covering rest of the proceedings is being issued separately.**