

Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024

YSR-VNK/11.00/1A

**RAJYA SABHA**

*Monday, the 25<sup>th</sup> November, 2024 / Agrahayana 4, 1946 (Saka)*

*The House met at eleven of the clock,*

MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

---

*(The National Anthem, "Jana Gana Mana", was played.)*

**BIRTHDAY GREETINGS**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, I am pleased to extend greetings to the hon. Member of Parliament, Dr. Dharmasthala Veerendra Heggade, on his birthday today.

A Member of this august House since July 2022, Dr. Heggade has been recipient of Padma Vibhushan in 2015 and Padma Bhushan in 2000. He was also honoured with Karnataka Rathna in 2009 and Rajyotsav award in 1985 by the Government of Karnataka. Dr. Heggade has been serving as the Chief Administrator of Shri Kshetra Dharmasthala Manjunath Swamy temple from the age of 19. He has been instrumental in transforming the small village of Dharmasthala into the most visited temple-city in Southern Karnataka. His contributions also extend to education, rural development and promotion of yoga and ayurveda. He is a true example of a karma yogi

**Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024**

and I am sure society at large would be immensely benefited by his presence in the House.

He is married to Shrimati Hemavathi V. Heggade and the couple is blessed with a daughter - Shrimati Shraddha.

Hon. Members, on my own and your behalf, I wish him a long, healthy and happy life. (Ends)

**OBITUARY REFERENCES**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, I refer with profound sorrow to the passing away of former Members of this august House - Shrimati Gurcharan Kaur, Shri K. Natwar Singh, Shri Sitaram Yechury, Shri Dharam Pal Sabharwal, Shri Dhaneswar Majhi, Dr. Gyan Prakash Pilonia and Shri Pravat Kumar Samantaray.

Shrimati Gurcharan Kaur passed away on 4<sup>th</sup> July 2024. She served as a Member of this House representing the State of Punjab from 2001 to 2004. Born on 4<sup>th</sup> February 1936 at Jaitu in Faridkot District of Punjab, Shrimati Gurcharan Kaur began her journey as a teacher, shaping young minds with her wisdom and guidance. Over the years, she emerged as an

**Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024**

ardent advocate for women's rights and empowerment, championing the cause of gender equality with unwavering commitment.

In the passing away of Shrimati Gurcharan Kaur, the country has lost a champion of women's rights and an able parliamentarian.

(Contd. by NBR/1B)

NBR-DS/1B/11.05

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Shri K. Natwar Singh passed away on 11<sup>th</sup> August 2024. He was a Member of this House from 2002 to 2008.

Born on 16<sup>th</sup> May, 1931, in Bharatpur, Rajasthan, Shri Natwar Singh had a distinguished career spanning over five decades in public life. A Cambridge graduate and Indian Foreign Service Officer of 1953 Batch, Shri Natwar Singh served as a Member of the Eighth and Twelfth Lok Sabha. He was Minister of State holding portfolios of Steel, Mines, Coal, Agriculture and External Affairs from 1985 to 1989, and as Minister of External Affairs, from 2004 to 2005.

As a career diplomat of repute, he served under Prime Ministership of Shri Jawaharlal Nehru, Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri, Shri Morarji Desai, Smt. Indira Gandhi and later, in public life, under Shri P.V. Narasimha Rao and Dr. Manmohan Singh. His stints in London, Islamabad, Warsaw, New York

**Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024**

and Lusaka, Zambia, in particular, have been truly worthy of admiration. His contributions in the successful organization of the historic Non-Aligned Movement Summit in Delhi remain unmatched to this day. For his unmatched contribution, he was awarded Padma Bhushan in 1984. Shri Natwar Singh embodied the zeal to live and contribute. He was a prolific writer and chronicler of repute. His life and legacy continue to inspire many in public life.

I vividly recollect hosting him, on his birthday, in May 2023, and the lunch with him at his residence on his birthday this year - the last one we had. Both these occasions are deeply etched in my memory.

In the passing away of Shri Natwar Singh, the country has lost a distinguished diplomat, a prolific author and an outstanding parliamentarian whose contributions will be remembered for years to come.

Shri Sitaram Yechury passed away on 12<sup>th</sup> September, 2024. He served as a Member of this House, representing the State of West Bengal, for two consecutive terms from 2005 to 2017.

Born on August 12, 1952, in Chennai, Tamil Nadu, Shri Yechuri started his political career as a student leader and dedicated his life to the pursuit of social justice, workers' rights and progressive policies. His unwavering

**Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024**

commitment to these ideals resonated deeply with his work, both within and outside the walls of this hallowed Chamber. His ability to forge consensus on varied issues and his willingness to engage in constructive dialogue made him a beloved and respected figure in our parliamentary democracy. Members of this august House, irrespective of their party affiliations, held Shri Yechury in great respect and affection and looked up to him for guidance. Shri Yechury was elected as General Secretary of the Communist Party of India (Marxist) in the year 2015, a position he held till his demise.

In the passing away of Shri Yechury, the country has lost an influential leader, a committed socialist and a distinguished parliamentarian whose contributions will be remembered for years to come.

(contd. by VKK/1C)

VKK-MZ/1C/11.10

**MR. CHAIRMAN (CONTD.):** Shri Dharam Pal Sabharwal passed away on the 21<sup>st</sup> of September, 2024. He served as a Member of this august House, representing the State of Punjab from April 2004 to April 2010. Born on the 10<sup>th</sup> of January, 1941 in Jalandhar, Punjab, Shri Sabharwal dedicated his life to the service of the nation and the upliftment of weaker sections. Shri Sabharwal began his public journey at the grassroots level and went on to

**Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024**

make significant contributions to public life. He served as a Municipal Councillor in 1972, a Member of Punjab Legislative Assembly on two occasions, 1977 and 1992, and held several ministerial portfolios in the Government of Punjab. In the passing away of Shri Dharam Pal Sabharwal, the country has lost a compassionate leader, a seasoned administrator and an able parliamentarian.

Shri Dhaneshwar Majhi passed away on the 9<sup>th</sup> of October, 2024. He served as a Member of this House, representing the State of Odisha from April 1978 to April 1984. He also served as a Member of the Odisha Legislative Assembly for five terms between the years 1971 and 2019. Born on 5<sup>th</sup> July, 1941 at Babejor village in Kalahandi district of Odisha, Shri Majhi worked tirelessly for the upliftment of deprived sections of the society. His contributions have played a significant role in social, economic and political upliftment of the marginalized sections of Odisha. In the passing away of Shri Dhaneshwar Majhi, the country has lost a veteran tribal leader, a dedicated social worker and an experienced legislator.

Dr. Gyan Prakash Pilania passed away on the 13<sup>th</sup> of October, 2024. He served as a Member of this august House for two consecutive terms from 2004 to 2014, representing the State of Rajasthan. Born on 18<sup>th</sup>

**Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024**

February, 1932 in village Amarpura in Sri Ganganagar district of Rajasthan, Dr. Gyan Prakash Pilonia joined Indian Police Service in the year 1955 and served as the Director General of Police of the State of Rajasthan from 1988 to 1989. Dr. Pilonia also served as a Member of the Public Service Commission of Rajasthan. An ardent advocate of social justice, Dr. Pilonia played a pivotal role in socio-economic empowerment of marginalized sections in Rajasthan. As a parliamentarian, his priority was on water resources, renewable energy and agricultural sustainability, leaving a lasting impact on Rajasthan's development. In the passing away of Dr. Gyan Prakash Pilonia, the country has lost a capable administrator, a dedicated social worker and an able parliamentarian.

Shri Pravat Kumar Samantaray, a former Member of this House, passed away on the 17<sup>th</sup> of October, 2024. He served as a Member of this House representing the State of Odisha from April 1992 to April 1996. Born on 22<sup>nd</sup> April, 1950 at Shasanipara village in Kendrapara district of Odisha, Shri Samantaray's commitment to public service started from his student days. He worked tirelessly to improve the living conditions of workers and their socio-political empowerment. His exemplary contributions as the President of the Indian National Port and Dock Workers Federation are

**Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024**

remembered even to this day. Shri Samantaray also served as a Member of 12<sup>th</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha from 1998 to 2004, representing Kendrapara, Odisha. His numerous initiatives for the development of the district and the State made him a beloved figure among the common people. In the passing away of Shri Pravat Kumar Samantaray, the country has lost a veteran trade unionist, a committed social worker and a distinguished legislator.

(Contd. by BHS/1D)

BHS-DN/1D/11.15

**MR. CHAIRMAN (Contd.):** Hon. Members, we deeply mourn the passing away of Shrimati Gurcharan Kaur, Shri K. Natwar Singh, Shri Sitaram Yechury, Shri Dharam Pal Sabharwal, Shri Dhaneshwar Majhi, Dr. Gyan Prakash Pilonia and Shri Pravat Kumar Samantaray. I request Members to rise in their places and observe silence as a mark of respect to the memory of the departed.

*(Hon. Members then stood in silence for one minute.)*

Secretary-General will convey to the members of the bereaved families our sense of profound sorrow and deep sympathy.

(Ends)

**Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, today marks the opening of the 266<sup>th</sup> Session of Rajya Sabha — a Session that coincides with the historic 75<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of adoption of our Constitution. This Session comprises 19 sittings, including four days allocated for Private Members' Business. The newly reconstituted Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committees have resumed their work and vital functions. Your active participation in these Committees is essential for ensuring robust policy recommendations and executive accountability. Our parliamentary democracy thrives on constructive dialogue and diverse perspectives—I urge all Members to uphold these principles with exemplary parliamentary decorum. As the House of Elders, we bear a unique responsibility. The hopes of 1.4 billion Indians rest upon our deliberations. This session offers us the opportunity to fulfill their aspirations through measured wisdom and thoughtful discourse. Now, Papers to be Laid on Table.

### **PAPERS LAID ON TABLE**

**SECRETARY-GENERAL:** Sir, I lay on the Table, a statement (in English and Hindi) showing the Bills passed by the Houses of Parliament during the Two Hundred and Sixty-fifth Session of the Rajya Sabha and assented to by the President.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024

**MESSAGE FROM LOK SABHA**  
**Bharatiya Vayuyan Vidheyak, 2024**

**SECRETARY-GENERAL:** Sir, with your kind permission, I rise to report that the Lok Sabha at its sitting held on 9<sup>th</sup> August, 2024, passed the Bharatiya Vayuyan Vidheyak, 2024.

I lay a copy of the said Bill on the Table.

(Ends)

**STATEMENTS RE. IMPLEMENTATION OF 21<sup>ST</sup> AND 28<sup>TH</sup> REPORTS OF  
DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON  
WATER RESOURCES**

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF JAL SHAKTI (SHRI V. SOMANNA):** Sir, I lay a statement regarding:—

- (a) Status of implementation of Recommendations contained in the 21<sup>st</sup> Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Water Resources on Demands for Grants (2023-24) pertaining to Ministry of Jal Shakti, Department of Drinking Water and Sanitation.
- (b) Status of implementation of Recommendations contained in the 28<sup>th</sup> Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Water Resources on Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Twenty-First Report of the Committee on Demands for Grants (2023-24) pertaining to Ministry of Jal Shakti, Department of Drinking Water and Sanitation.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024

### RESIGNATION BY MEMBERS

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, I have to inform that I had received letters from six Members, namely, Shri Venkataramana Rao Mopidevi, Shri Beedha Masthan Rao Yadav, Shri Sujeet Kumar, Shri Jawhar Sircar, Shri Ryaga Krishnaiah and Shri Krishan Lal Panwar resigning their seats in the Rajya Sabha. I had accepted their resignations with effect from 29<sup>th</sup> August, 2024, 6<sup>th</sup> September, 2024, 19<sup>th</sup> September, 2024, 23<sup>rd</sup>, September, 2024 and 14<sup>th</sup>, October, 2024 respectively. (Ends)

(Followed by RL/1E)

RL-GS/11.20/1E

### ANNOUNCEMENT RE. PANEL OF VICE-CHAIRMEN

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I have to inform Members that the Panel of Vice-Chairpersons has been re-constituted with the following Members:-

1. Shrimati S. Phangnon Konyak
2. Shrimati P.T. Usha
3. Shrimati Kiran Choudhry
4. Shrimati Mamata Mohanta
5. Shri Ghanshyam Tiwari
6. Dr. Sasmit Patra
7. Shri Ajay Makan
8. Shri Bhubaneswar Kalita.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Shri Manohar Lal to move a motion for election of one member to the Advisory Council of the Delhi Development Authority.

**MOTION FOR ELECTION TO ADVISORY COUNCIL OF DELHI  
DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY (DDA)**

**आवासन और शहरी कार्य मंत्री (श्री मनोहर लाल) :** महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित प्रस्ताव उपस्थित करता हूँ:-

"कि दिल्ली विकास अधिनियम, 1957 (1957 का 61) की धारा 5 की उप-धारा (4) के साथ पठित उप-धारा (2) के खंड (ज) के अनुसरण में, यह सभा उस रीति से, जैसा सभापति निदेश दें, सभा के सदस्यों में से एक सदस्य को चार वर्ष की अवधि के लिए दिल्ली विकास प्राधिकरण की सलाहकार परिषद् का सदस्य होने के लिए निर्वाचित करने की कार्यवाही करे।"

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

(Ends)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Shri Jagat Prakash Nadda to move a motion for election of one member to the National Institute of Mental Health and Neuro-Sciences.

**MOTION FOR ELECTION TO NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF MENTAL  
HEALTH AND NEURO-SCIENCES (NIMHANS), BANGALORE**

**THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI JAGAT PRAKASH NADDA):** Sir, I move:—

“That in pursuance of clause (1) of sub-section (1) of Section 5 of the National Institute of Mental Health and Neuro-Sciences (NIMHANS),

**Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024**

Bangalore, Act, 2012, this House do proceed to elect in such manner as directed by the Chairman, one Member from amongst the Members of the House to be a member of the NIMHANS, Bangalore.”

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

(Ends)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, I have received 13 notices under Rule 267. Dr. John Brittas, Shri Mallikarjun Kharge, Shri Neeraj Dangi, Shri Pramod Tiwari, Shri Akhilesh Prasad Singh, Shri Sanjay Singh and Dr. Syed Naseer Hussain have sought discussion on the alleged corruption, bribery and financial irregularities of the Adani Group. Shri Sandosh Kumar P and Shri Raghav Chadha have sought discussion on the ongoing violence and killings in Manipur. Dr. Sayed Naseer Hussain, Shri Javed Ali Khan and Shri Haris Beeran have sought discussion on violent clashes during survey in Sambhal, Uttar Pradesh. Further, Dr. V. Sivadasan has sought discussion on the need for special assistance to address the plight of people of Wayanad.

Hon. Members would recall that in this regard, I had given my detailed rulings on Rule 267 on 8<sup>th</sup> December, 2022 and 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2022. The

same was reiterated by me on a number of occasions. These notices do not conform to the directives imparted by the Chair in this behalf.

(Contd. by DC/1F)

DC-LP/1F/11.25

**MR. CHAIRMAN (Contd.):** I have not been able to persuade myself to agree to the same. I would urge the hon. Members, as I indicated in my opening observations, we are in a very particular period, namely, 75<sup>th</sup> year of adoption of the Indian Constitution. I would urge the hon. Members to keep that in mind and exemplify the highest standard not only to the 1.4 billion people, but also to the world that we will work in decorum, with devotion and commitment to fructify aspirations of our people. Now, Matters raised with permission ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री जयराम रमेश :** सभापति जी, एलओपी को बोलने दीजिए। (... व्यवधान...)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, please bear with me. There was not even a second's gap; the LoP could hardly rise, and we have someone sitting there, 'एलओपी को बोलने दीजिए।' (... व्यवधान...) Let us not dilute the status of the Leader of the Opposition. खरगे जी, आप बोलिए। (... व्यवधान...) Khargeji, as a very senior parliamentarian and leader, you are aware that my ruling on this issue has been given. I would seek your earnest cooperation,

particularly, in the background, which matters to you more than anyone else, that we are in the 75<sup>th</sup> year of adoption of our Constitution.

**विपक्ष के नेता (श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे) :** सभापति जी, जो 75 साल रहे हैं, उसमें मेरा भी 54 साल के योगदान का हिस्सा है। इसलिए मुझे कुछ सिखाने की, कुछ कहने की बात नहीं है। (... व्यवधान...)

**श्री सभापति :** खरगे जी, क्या मैं आपसे एक बात का अनुरोध करूँ?  
...*(Interruptions)*... No; please take your seat. In all humility from the Chair, all I said, “You know it more than anyone else.” I paid you the highest compliment. Still, you are taking exception that you...*(Interruptions)*...

**SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE:** Okay, Sir. Thank you very much.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** No, Sir. I am hurt. This is hardly any approach. I have commended his contribution.

**SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE:** Thank you, Sir.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I have praised it, and all the same... ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे :** सर, यह बहुत ही इम्पोर्टेंट मसला है।

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** You are going to say, but not on Rule 267.

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे :** रूल 267( ... व्यवधान ...)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** No; on that, my ruling is over. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE:** It is very important, Sir.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** You are questioning the ruling of the Chair.

**SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE:** Sir, if you suspend today's Business, we can explain. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Nothing is going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... No; nothing is going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE:** \* ...*(Interruptions)*...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Now, Matters raised with permission...*(Interruptions)*... Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**SHRIMATI JEBI MATHER HISHAM:** Sir,...*(Interruptions)*...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Not interested! ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Vaiko; not availing? ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Vaiko, you came to this House in 1974. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, nothing is going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... You said, your contribution is for 54 years. Let people get the benefit of it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing has gone on record. I am continuing. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri A.A. Rahim. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Muzibulla Khan. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Jairam Ramesh ...*(Interruptions)*...

---

\* Not recorded.

**Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024**

Shrimati Priyanka Chaturvedi. ...(Interruptions)... First you go to your seat.  
...(Interruptions)... No; if you do not go to your seat, you cannot make it.

(Contd. by DPS/1G)

DPS-RK/1G/11.30

**MR. CHAIRMAN (CONTD.):** You are not on your seat. ...(Interruptions)...  
Are you on your seat? ...(Interruptions)... I will not listen to you; you are not  
on your seat. ...(Interruptions)... This is indecorous. ...(Interruptions)... You  
should not shout. ...(Interruptions)... Avail the opportunity. ...(Interruptions)...  
It is a challenge that you, Member of Parliament, will come into the Well!  
...(Interruptions)... No, I am so sorry. ...(Interruptions)... The House stands  
adjourned to meet at 11.45 p.m.

-----

*The House then adjourned at thirty minutes past eleven of the clock.*

DPK-PRB/1H/11.45

*The House reassembled at forty-five minutes past eleven of the clock,*

**MR. CHAIRMAN** *in the Chair.*

---

**श्री जावेद अली खान** : सर, यह एक गंभीर मुद्दा है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, I will just take two minutes. I would  
strongly urge that I can bear with it. But even when I applauded the seminal

**Uncorrected/Not for Publication-25.11.2024**

contribution of Khargeji and I said, he knows more than me, his response ‘I have gone through the text myself’ is extremely hurtful -- I have seen the expression when he said — and, every time, to get in the groove that whatever the Chairman reflects, you can go off on a tangent. I would appeal to you, nobody in this House is in a category who does not enjoy my highest respect. I have the highest respect for some of them. Khargeji is there and Devegowdaji is there; they are the people who are at the very highest level. When I said so, it was hundred per cent misread. Secondly, Khargeji said, ‘Suspension of the Business of the House for the day’. It means, in spite of my fervent plea that we use this platform for the purpose for which it is meant, ‘to serve the people’, that, I think, is not being appreciated. I will urge all of you to allow me to continue with the normal Business of the House. ...(*Interruptions*)... Is the normal Business of the House not allowed? The House stands adjourned to meet at 11 a.m. on Wednesday, the 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2024.

-----

*The House then adjourned at forty-eight minutes past eleven of the clock till eleven of the clock on Wednesday, the 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2024.*