

Vol. 265  
No. 3



Wednesday,  
24<sup>th</sup> July, 2024  
2 Sravana, 1946 (Saka)

PARLIAMENTARY DEBATES  
**RAJYA SABHA**  
OFFICIAL REPORT (FLOOR VERSION)

CONTENTS

Welcome to Parliamentary delegation from Tanzania (page 1)

Papers Laid on the Table (pages 1 -9)

Reports of the Public Accounts Committee (pages 9 - 11)

Recommendations of the Business Advisory Committee (page 11)

Leave of Absence - *Granted* (page 12)

Motion for Election to the Committee on Welfare of Other Backward  
Classes - *Adopted* (page 12)

Motion for Nomination to the Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes  
and Scheduled Tribes - *Adopted* (page 13)

Motion for Nomination to the Committee on Public Accounts - *Adopted* (page 13)

©

RAJYA SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI

Motion for Nomination to the Committee on Public Undertakings -*Adopted* (page 14)

Observations by the Chair (page 14)

Regarding Mentioning of States in the Budget and other Matters (pages 14 -19)

Matters raised with Permission-

Demand to take necessary steps to stop erosion by the Ganga river in Malda, West Bengal (pages 21 -22)

Demand for justice to the family of the victims of the 1985 Kanishka Bombing (pages 22 - 23)

Demand for increasing road infrastructure under the PMGSY scheme (page 24)

Concern over the navigational clearance in the Brahmaputra River (page 25)

Demand to expedite the work related to the establishment of AIIMS at Darbhanga, Bihar (page 26)

Request to construct Pachpedi ghat bridge in Lakhimpur Khiri, Uttar Pradesh (pages 26 - 27)

Demand to reduce rate of GST on Mediclaim Policies (pages 27 - 28)

Request to confer Bharat Ratna to Late Dr. Panjabrao Shamrao Deshmukh for his great contribution to the country especially in the field of education and agriculture (pages 28 - 29)

Demand to release the funds for the Chennai Metro Rail project, Phase-II (page 29)

Demand to declare Rath Yatra of Mahaprabhu Shri Jagannath as a National Holiday (pages 30 - 31)

Demand for inquiry into the financial irregularities by the Karnataka Government (pages 31 - 32)

Concern over increasing number of deaths due to dog bites (pages 32 -33)

Website: <http://rajyasabha.nic.in>

<https://sansad.in/rs>

E-mail : [rsedit-e@sansad.nic.in](mailto:rsedit-e@sansad.nic.in)

Concern over emerging threats and potential risks associated with Artificial Intelligence (pages 33 - 35)

Oral Answers to Questions (pages 35 - 71)

*[Answers to Starred and Un-starred Questions (Both in English and Hindi) are available as Part – I to this Debate, published electronically on the Rajya Sabha website under the link <https://sansad.in/rs/debates/officials>]*

General Discussion-

The Union Budget, 2024-25 - *Not Concluded.* (pages 72 - 122)

The Budget of Union territory of Jammu and Kashmir, 2024-25- *Not Concluded.* (pages 72 - 122)

Special Mentions-

Concern over natural calamities in Karnataka, its neighbouring States and other parts of our country (pages 123 - 132)

Demand for Unified Law on Industrial Accidents in India (pages 132 - 133)

Demand to increase the amount of Member of Parliament Local Area Development Scheme i.e. 'MPLAD' (pages 133 - 134)

Government to intervene in the recent hike of import duty for exporters of Oranges from Vidarbha region in Maharashtra to Bangladesh (pages 134 - 135)

Demand for Tribal Circuit for Western Odisha under Swadesh Darshan Scheme (Kalahandi - Rayagada - Koraput – Kandhamal) (page 135)

The issue of reconstruction of Marathwada Statutory Development Board (pages 136 - 137)

Concern over abuse of elders (page 137)

Demand for making tourism management simple and effective by using technology (pages 137 - 138)

Demand for reservation of seats for Limboo and Tamang Scheduled Tribe Communities in the Sikkim Legislative Assembly (pages 138 - 139)

Demand for holistic development of Kozhikode International Airport (pages 139 - 140)

Demand for conservation of Shaniwar Wada Architecture of Pune (pages 140 - 141)

The issue of Life and Medical Insurance and Public Sector Insurance Companies (page 141)

Demand to increase in the number of beds in emergency ward of AIIMS, Patna (page 142)

Demand for Nipah viral testing facilities in Kerala (pages 142 - 143)

The need to ensure efficient implementation of MNREGS (pages 143 - 144)

Concern over access to washrooms, sanitation facilities like toilets in educational institutions and work places for women across the country (pages 144 - 145)

Demand for change in the timing of Ranchi-Patna Jan Shatabdi Express (pages 145 - 146)

Demand for reservation for Scheduled Tribes in the Goa Legislative Assembly (page 146)

Demand for inclusion of languages spoken in Odisha into the 8th Schedule of Constitution (page 147)

Demand for awareness campaign of Central Government schemes through banks (pages 147 - 148)

Demand to expedite projects under Bharatmala in the State of Bihar (pages 148 - 149)

Concern over energy security projects in Tamil Nadu (page 149)

Concern over attacks by stray animals in the country (page 150)

Concern over difficulties faced by pilgrims in Char Dham Yatra in Uttarakhand (pages 150 - 151)

Need for Reconsideration of NCTE's oversight of NIOS D.El.Ed (ODL) programme (pages 151 - 152)

Demand for adequate budgetary allocation for ensuring safety of mining workers (page 152)

Demand for bringing back the royal throne of Maharaja Ranjit Singh ji (page 153)

Demand for establishment of a multi-purpose industrial training centre and Hi-tech Trade Centre with Entertainment Park at North Chennai industrial cluster (pages 153 - 154)

Demand for formation of Greater Cooch Behar as a Union Territory (pages 154 - 155)

Demand to increase the One Stop Centres in Odisha (page 155)

Demand to establish more Kendriya Vidyalayas and Eklavya Schools in Odisha (page 156)

Demand for effective flood management works in India (pages 156 -157)

Need to address the issues faced by Agricultural Workers (page 157)

Concern over high level of pollution in rivers flowing through Bagpat, Uttar Pradesh (page 158)

## RAJYA SABHA

*Wednesday, the 24<sup>th</sup> July, 2024/2, Sravana 1946 (Saka)*

*The House met at eleven of the clock,*

*MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.*

### WELCOME TO PARLIAMENTARY DELEGATION FROM TANZANIA

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, on my own behalf and on behalf of this august House, I have great pleasure in welcoming hon. Dr. Tulia Ackson, President of the International Parliamentary Union, IPU, and Speaker of the National Assembly of Tanzania. She is on an official visit to India as our honoured guest.

Hon. Dr. Tulia Ackson arrived in *Bharat* on Friday, the 19<sup>th</sup> July, 2024. She has visited Agra on 21<sup>st</sup> July, 2024. Yesterday she also witnessed the presentation of the Union Budget, 2024-25 in the Lok Sabha. Hon. Members, she is now seated in the Special Box. We wish her a happy and fruitful stay in our country. We also wish her success in her role as the President of the International Parliamentary Union. Through her, we convey our greetings and best wishes to the Members of the Parliament of Tanzania, the Government and the friendly people of Tanzania.

---

### PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Papers to be laid on the Table.

#### Report and Accounts (2022-23) of NCERT, New Delhi and related papers

शिक्षा मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री जयंत चौधरी): महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्रों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-

- (a) Annual Report of the National Council of Educational Research and Training (NCERT), New Delhi, for the year 2022-23.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the National Council of Educational Research and Training (NCERT), New Delhi, for the year 2022-23, and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Council.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at

(a) and (b) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 165/18/24]

### Notifications of the Ministry of Finance

**वित्त मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री पंकज चौधरी):** महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्र सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-

(i) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Revenue) Notification No. G.S.R. 182(E)., dated the 12<sup>th</sup> March, 2024, amending the First Schedule to the Customs Tariff Act, 1975, issued under sub-section (1) of Section 8A of the said Act, along with Explanatory Memorandum.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 169/18/24]

(ii) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Revenue) Notification No. G.S.R. 183(E)., dated the 12<sup>th</sup> March, 2024, amending the Principal Notification No. G.S.R. 785(E), dated the 30<sup>th</sup> June, 2017, issued under sub-section (1) of Section 25 of the Customs Act, 1962 and sub-section (12) of Section 3 of the Customs Tariff Act, 1975, along with Explanatory Memorandum.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 168/18/24]

### Notifications of the Ministry of Home Affairs

**गृह मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री नित्यानन्द राय):** महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्र सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-

(i) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Home Affairs Notification No. S.O. 1120(E)., dated the 7<sup>th</sup> March, 2024, amending the Fourth Schedule to the Unlawful Activities (Prevention) Act, 1967, by inserting the name of Mohammad Qasim Gujjar @ Salman @ Suleman in that Schedule, under sub-section (5) of Section 35 of the said Act.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 305/18/24]

(ii) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Home Affairs Notification No. G.S.R. 26., in the Weekly Gazette dated the March 3, 2024 - March 9, 2024, publishing the Ministry of Home Affairs, Assam Rifles Naib Subedar

(Draughtsman), Group 'B'(Combatised) Posts Recruitment Rules, 2024, under Section 167 of the Assam Rifles Act, 2006.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 307/18/24]

(iii) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Home Affairs, under sub-section (3) of Section 18 of the Central Reserve Police Force Act, 1949: -

- (1) G.S.R. 147(E)., dated the 29<sup>th</sup> February, 2024, publishing the Ministry of Home Affairs, Central Reserve Police Force, Tradesmen Cadre, Assistant Sub-Inspector (Carpenter), Group 'C' Post, Recruitment Rules, 2024.
- (2) G.S.R. 220(E)., dated the 19<sup>th</sup> March, 2024, publishing the Ministry of Home Affairs, Central Reserve Police Force, Technical Cadre, Sub-Inspector (Armourer) and Sub-Inspector (Motor Mechanic), Group 'B' Posts, Recruitment Rules, 2024.
- (3) G.S.R. 277(E)., dated the 16<sup>th</sup> May, 2024, publishing the Central Reserve Police Force, Pioneer Cadre (Group 'B' and Group 'C' Posts) Recruitment Rules, 2024.
- (4) G.S.R. 308(E)., dated the 4<sup>th</sup> June, 2024, publishing the Ministry of Home Affairs, Central Reserve Police Force, Tradesmen Cadre, Head Constable (Cook) and Head Constable (Water Carrier), Group 'C' Posts, Recruitment Rules, 2024.

[Placed in Library. For (1) to (4) See No. L. T. 306/18/24]

(iv) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Home Affairs, under sub-section (3) of Section 155 of the Sashastra Seema Bal Act, 2007: -

- (1) G.S.R. 198., in the Weekly Gazette dated the December 17 - December 23, 2023, publishing the Ministry of Home Affairs, Sashastra Seema Bal Group 'A' Combatised (Gazetted) Ministerial and Private Secretary Cadre Post Recruitment Rules, 2023, along with delay statement.
- (2) G.S.R. 01., in the Weekly Gazette dated the January 7 - January 13, 2024, publishing the Sashastra Seema Bal, Combatised, Ministerial and Stenographers (Non-Gazetted) Group 'B' Posts Recruitment Rules, 2024, along with delay statement.
- (3) G.S.R. 16., in the Weekly Gazette dated the February 18 - February 24,



- 2024, publishing the Ministry of Home Affairs, Sashastra Seema Bal, Combatised, Para-Medical Cadre (Group 'B' Posts) Recruitment Rules, 2024.
- (4) G.S.R. 17., dated the 24<sup>th</sup> February, 2024, publishing the Sashastra Seema Bal Combatised Para-Medical Cadre (Group 'C' Posts) Recruitment Rules, 2024.
- (5) G.S.R. 31., in the Weekly Gazette dated the March 10 - March 16, 2024, publishing the Ministry of Home Affairs, Sashastra Seema Bal, Assistant Sub-Inspector (Veterinary), Head Constable (Veterinary) and Constable (Veterinary), Group 'C' Posts, Recruitment Rules, 2024.
- (6) G.S.R. 32., dated the 16<sup>th</sup> March, 2024, publishing the Ministry of Home Affairs, Sashastra Seema Bal, Combatised Communication Cadre, Assistant Sub-Inspector (Communication) and Head Constable (Communication), Group 'C' Posts, Recruitment Rules, 2024.
- (7) G.S.R. 33., dated the 16<sup>th</sup> March, 2024, publishing the Sashastra Seema Bal Group 'A' Combatised Engineering Cadre Recruitment (Amendment) Rules, 2024.
- (8) G.S.R. 55., dated the 18<sup>th</sup> May, 2024, publishing the Ministry of Home Affairs, Sashastra Seema Bal, Combatised Engineering Cadre, Inspector (Draughtsman), Inspector (Pioneer), Sub-Inspector (Draughtsman) and Sub-Inspector (Pioneer), Group 'B' Posts, Recruitment Rules, 2024.
- (9) G.S.R. 56., dated the 18<sup>th</sup> May, 2024, publishing the Ministry of Home Affairs, Sashastra Seema Bal, Combatised, Constable (Driver), Group 'C' Post, Recruitment Rules, 2024.
- (10) G.S.R. 54., in the Weekly Gazette dated the May 12 - May 18, 2024, publishing the Ministry of Home Affairs, Sashastra Seema Bal, Combatised, Communication Cadre, Inspector (Communication) and Sub-Inspector (Communication), Group 'B' Posts, Recruitment Rules, 2024.
- (11) G.S.R. 74., dated the 15<sup>th</sup> June, 2024, publishing the Ministry of Home Affairs, Sashastra Seema Bal, Combatised, Inspector (Junior Hindi Translator) Group 'B' Post, Recruitment Rules, 2024.
- (12) G.S.R. 75., dated the 15<sup>th</sup> June, 2024, publishing the Ministry of Home Affairs, Sashastra Seema Bal, Combatised, Ministerial and Stenographer Cadre, Assistant Sub-Inspector (Stenographer), Assistant Sub-Inspector (Ministerial) and Head Constable

(Ministerial), Group 'C' Posts, Recruitment Rules, 2024.

[Placed in Library. For (1) to (12) See No. L. T. 309/18/24]

- I. Report and Accounts (2022-23) of various IISERs; NITs and related papers
- II. Report and Accounts (2022-23) of AIU, New Delhi; IAS, Shimla, Himachal Pradesh; ICSSR, New Delhi; and ICHR, New Delhi and related papers

शिक्षा मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री सुकान्त मजूमदार): महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्र सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-

I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (4) of Section 22 of the National Institute of Technology, Science, Education and Research Act, 2007: -

- (i) (a) Annual Report of the Indian Institute of Science Education and Research (IISER) Kolkata, West Bengal, for the year 2022-23.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the Indian Institute of Science Education and Research (IISER) Kolkata, West Bengal, for the year 2022-23, and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) and (b) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 592/18/24]

- (ii) (a) Annual Report of the Indian Institute of Science Education and Research (IISER) Mohali, Punjab, for the year 2022-23.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the Indian Institute of Science Education and Research (IISER) Mohali, Punjab, for the year 2022-23, and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) and (b) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 593/18/24]

- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Institute of Science Education and Research (IISER) Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh, for the year 2022-23, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the Indian Institute of Science Education and

Research (IISER) Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh, for the year 2022-23, and the Audit Report thereon.

- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) and (b) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 594/18/24]

- (iv) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute of Technology Durgapur, West Bengal, for the year 2022-23, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 595/18/24]

- (v) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute of Technology Agartala, Tripura, for the year 2022-23, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 596/18/24]

- (vi) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh, for the year 2022-23, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 183/18/24]

- (vii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute of Technology Tiruchirappalli, Tamil Nadu, for the year 2022-23, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 187/18/24]

- (viii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Sardar Vallabhbhai National Institute of Technology, Surat, Gujarat, for the year 2022-23, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 184/18/24]

- (ix) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Motilal Nehru National Institute of Technology Allahabad, Prayagraj, Uttar Pradesh, for the year 2022-23, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 185/18/24]

- (x) (a) Annual Report of the National Institute of Technology Srinagar, UT of Jammu & Kashmir, for the year 2022-23.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the National Institute of Technology Srinagar, UT of Jammu & Kashmir, for the year 2022-23, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) and (b) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 186/18/24]

- (xi) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute of Technology Meghalaya, for the year 2022-23, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 597/18/24]

- (xii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute of Technology Nagaland, for the year 2022-23, together with the Auditor's Report

on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 598/18/24]

- (xiii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute of Technology Goa, for the year 2022-23, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 599/18/24]

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers: -

- (i) (a) Annual Report of the Association of Indian Universities (AIU), New Delhi, for the year 2022-23.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the Association of Indian Universities (AIU), New Delhi, for the year 2022-23, and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Association.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) and (b) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 188/18/24]

- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Institute of Advanced Study (IIAS), Shimla, Himanchal Pradesh for the year 2022-23, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 180/18/24]

- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Council of Social Science Research (ICSSR), New Delhi, for the year 2022-23, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Council.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers

mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 181/18/24]

- (iv) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Council of Historical Research (ICHR), New Delhi, for the year 2022-23, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Council.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L. T. 182/18/24]

---

### REPORTS OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports\* of the Public Accounts Committee (2023-24):-

- (i) 124<sup>th</sup> Report on Construction of toilets in schools by CPSEs;
- (ii) 125<sup>th</sup> Report on Rejuvenation of River Ganga (Namami Gange);
- (iii) 126<sup>th</sup> Report on Avoidable Payment due to Non-Charging of Service Tax/ GST from the Passengers;
- (iv) 127<sup>th</sup> Report on Action Taken by the Government on the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee contained in their 46<sup>th</sup> Report (16<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) on Implementation of Public Private Partnership Project at Chhatrapati Shivaji International Airport, Mumbai;
- (v) 128<sup>th</sup> Report on Action Taken by the Government on the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee contained in their 71<sup>st</sup> Report (17<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) on Implementation of USOF Project (Phase - I) to Provide Mobile Services in Areas Affected by Left Wing Extremist;
- (vi) 129<sup>th</sup> Report on Action Taken by the Government on the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee contained in their 93<sup>rd</sup> Report (15<sup>th</sup> Lok

---

\* The Reports were presented to the Speaker, Lok Sabha on the 23<sup>rd</sup> February, 2024 and 29<sup>th</sup> April, 2024 and to the Chairman, Rajya Sabha on the 28<sup>th</sup> February, 2024 and 13<sup>th</sup> May, 2024, before dissolution of the 17<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha. The Speaker had ordered the printing, publication and circulation of the Reports.

- Sabha) on Performance of Civil Aviation in India;
- (vii) 130<sup>th</sup> Report on Pradhan Mantri Ujjawala Yojana;
  - (viii) 131<sup>st</sup> Report on Action Taken by the Government on the observations and Recommendations of the Committee contained in their 39<sup>th</sup> Report (17<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) on Failure to implement Scheme objectives on disbursement of Capital Subsidy;
  - (ix) 132<sup>nd</sup> Report on Derailment in Indian Railways;
  - (x) 133<sup>rd</sup> Report on Short Closure of Electrification Works due to Incomplete Pre-Requisite Works: South East Central Railway;
  - (xi) 134<sup>th</sup> Report on Infructuous Expenditure on Creation of Mid-Life Rehabilitation Facilities at Parel Workshop, Central Railways;
  - (xii) 135<sup>th</sup> Report on Action Taken by the Government on Observation/ Recommendations of PAC contained in their 70<sup>th</sup> Report on Failure to Implement Ministry of Railways Order resulted in Damage to Railway Cables: South Eastern Railway and West Central Railway;
  - (xiii) 136<sup>th</sup> Report on Grant of Concession without the support of Declaration in Form 'F';
  - (xiv) 137<sup>th</sup> Report on Action Taken by the Government on Observation/ Recommendations of PAC contained in their 66<sup>th</sup> Report on Excesses over Voted Grants and Charged Appropriations (2020-21);
  - (xv) 138<sup>th</sup> Report on Evasion of Tax Due to Suppression of Sales;
  - (xvi) 139<sup>th</sup> Report on Loss of Revenue due to Running of Suvidha Express Trains: South Western Railway;
  - (xvii) 140<sup>th</sup> Report on Manpower and Logistics Management in Delhi Police;
  - (xviii) 141<sup>st</sup> Report on Loss of Revenue Due to Non-Registration of Lease Agreement;
  - (xix) 142<sup>nd</sup> Report on National Social Assistance Programme;
  - (xx) 143<sup>rd</sup> Report on Performance Audit on Schemes for Flood Control and Flood Forecasting;
  - (xxi) 144<sup>th</sup> Report on Implementation of Phase-I of Bharatmala Pariyojana;
  - (xxii) 145<sup>th</sup> Report on Measures underway for Transition in the Energy Sector;
  - (xxiii) 146<sup>th</sup> Report on Subject specific Compliance Audit on GST Refunds;
  - (xxiv) 147<sup>th</sup> Report on Short realization of Entry Fees and Licence Fees;
  - (xxv) 148<sup>th</sup> Report on Short levy of tax and interest due to excess allowance of ITC on purchase of Capital Goods;
  - (xxvi) 149<sup>th</sup> Report on Reforms in Banking Sector;

- (xxvii) 150<sup>th</sup> Report on Reforms in Insurance Sector;
- (xxviii) 151<sup>st</sup> Report on Performance Audit of Ayushman Bharat — Pradhan Mantri Jan Arogya Yojana; and
- (xxix) 152<sup>nd</sup> Report on Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their 69<sup>th</sup> Report (17<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) on the Issues Relating to Accounting of Cess/Levies.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE): Sir, ...  
....(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will come to that. ...(*Interruptions*)...

---

### RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE BUSINESS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have to inform hon. Members that the Business Advisory Committee in its meetings held on 22<sup>nd</sup> July, 2024 and 23<sup>rd</sup> July, 2024, has allotted time for Government Legislative and other Business as follows:-

<b>BUSINESS</b>	<b>TIME ALLOTTED</b>
1. General Discussion on the Union Budget, 2024-25	Twenty Hours
2. General Discussion on the Budget for Union Territory of Jammu and Kashmir for 2024-25	(1 and 2 to be discussed together)
3. Consideration and return of the Appropriation Bills relating to the owing Demands, after they are passed by Lok Sabha:-	
(i) Demands for Grants for the year 2024-25	
(ii) Demands for Grants of the Union Territory of Jammu and Kashmir for the year 2024-25	Four Hours
4. Consideration and return of the Finance (No.2) Bill, 2024, after it is introduced, considered and passed by Lok Sabha	Four Hours

---



**LEAVE OF ABSENCE**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I have to inform you that letters have been received from hon. Members, Dr. Dharmasthala Veerendra Heggade and Shri Vaiko for grant of Leave of Absence from 22<sup>nd</sup> July, 2024 to 5<sup>th</sup> August, 2024, and from 22<sup>nd</sup> July, 2024 to 12<sup>th</sup> August, 2024, respectively. Dr. Dharmasthala Veerendra Heggade has sought Leave of Absence on personal reasons while Shri Vaiko has sought Leave of Absence on medical grounds.

Do they have the permission of the House for remaining absent for the duration of leave which they have sought?

*(No hon. Member dissented.)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Permission to remain absent is granted.

---

**MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE COMMITTEE ON WELFARE OF  
OTHER BACKWARD CLASSES**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. L. Murugan to move a Motion for election of ten Members to the Committee on Welfare of Other Backward Classes.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (DR. L. MURUGAN): Sir, I move the following Motion:

"That this House concurs in the recommendation of the Lok Sabha that a Committee of both the Houses to be called the 'Committee on Welfare of Other Backward Classes (OBCs)' be constituted for the purposes set out in the Motion adopted by the Lok Sabha at its sitting held on 1<sup>st</sup> July, 2024 and communicated to this House, and resolves that this House do join in the said Committee and proceed to elect, in accordance with the system of proportional representation by means of the single transferable vote, ten Members from amongst the Members of this House to serve on the said Committee.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

---

**MOTION FOR NOMINATION TO THE COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF  
SCHEDULED CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. L. Murugan to move the Motion for nomination of ten Members to the Committee on Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (DR. L. MURUGAN): Sir, I move the following Motion:

"That this House resolves that the Rajya Sabha do join the Committee of both the Houses on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes for the term ending on 30.04.2025, and do proceed to elect, in accordance with the system of proportional representation by means of the single transferable vote, ten Members from amongst the Members of the House to serve on the said Committee."

*The question was put and the Motion was adopted.*

---

**MOTION FOR NOMINATION TO THE COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC ACCOUNTS**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. L. Murugan to move the Motion for nomination of seven Members to the Committee on Public Accounts.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (DR. L. MURUGAN): Sir, I move the following Motion:

"That this House concurs in the recommendation of the Lok Sabha that the Rajya Sabha do agree to nominate seven Members from Rajya Sabha to associate with the Committee on Public Accounts for the term ending on 30.04.2025, and do proceed to elect, in such manner as directed by the Chairman, seven Members from amongst the Members of the House to serve on the said Committee."

*The question was put and the Motion was adopted.*

---

**MOTION FOR NOMINATION TO THE COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC UNDERTAKINGS**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. L. Murugan to move the Motion for nomination of seven Members to the Committee on Public Undertakings.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (DR. L. MURUGAN): Sir, I move the following Motion:

"That this House concurs in the recommendation of the Lok Sabha that the Rajya Sabha do agree to nominate seven Members from Rajya Sabha to associate with the Committee on Public Undertakings for the term ending on 30.04.2025, and do proceed to elect, in such manner as directed by the Chairman, seven Members from amongst the Members of the House to serve on the said Committee."

*The question was put and the Motion was adopted.*

---

**OBSERVATIONS BY THE CHAIR**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, this is regarding Rule 267; for your benefit, my observations on Rule 267 have been uploaded today for your consideration. I call upon you and I strongly urge you to seriously bestow your attention on the same. I reiterate that the leaders of the political parties need to take a call on the issue as it is becoming a routine, daily affair in every sitting of the House. I had already indicated that in the last 36 years, this mechanism has been allowed only on six occasions. It is only in exceptional circumstances that the same may be allowed. I need not emphasise that seeking suspension of the proceedings of the House for taking business indicated is indeed a very serious matter. The notices filed today do not conform to the directives imparted by the Chair in this behalf and the same are not admitted.

---

**REGARDING MENTIONING OF STATES IN THE BUDGET AND OTHER MATTERS**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Matters raised with Permission. Do you want to say something? Yes, the Leader of the Opposition. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**विपक्ष के नेता (श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे):** सभापति महोदय, मैं रूल 267 की बहस में नहीं जाना चाहता हूँ, क्योंकि अब की स्थिति क्या है, आज किस ढंग से लोक सभा और राज्य सभा चल रही हैं और उसके बारे में बाहर हमारा इम्प्रेशन कैसा है, यह बात आप भी जानते हैं और हम सब लोग भी जानते हैं, तो मैं उसमें जाना नहीं चाहता हूँ।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** प्लीज़ ...

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे:** महोदय, मैं सिर्फ आपसे यही रिक्वेस्ट करूंगा कि कल जो बजट पेश हुआ, उस बजट में किसी स्टेट को कुछ नहीं मिला, सबकी थाली खाली है और केवल दो की थाली में ही पकौड़े और जलेबी है।...(व्यवधान).... इन दोनों को छोड़कर किसी को कुछ नहीं मिला है। सर, न तमिलनाडु को कुछ मिला, न केरल को कुछ मिला, न कर्णाटक, महाराष्ट्र, पंजाब, हरियाणा, राजस्थान, छत्तीसगढ़ और न ही दिल्ली को कुछ मिला। मैं कितनी स्टेट्स बताऊँ। ओडिशा को भी कुछ नहीं दिया गया है। मैंने ऐसा बजट कभी नहीं देखा है और यह सिर्फ किसी को खुश करने के लिए, कुर्सी बचाने के लिए यह सब हुआ है। इसका हम खंडन करते हैं। यदि इस ढंग से बजट पेश होगा... मैं समझता हूँ कि वे कर्णाटक से आई हैं, ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sir, let the hon. Finance Minister speak.

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे:** सर, वे कर्णाटक से आई हैं, तो हमारी अपेक्षा ऐसी थी कि सबसे ज्यादा हमें ही मिलेगा, लेकिन हमें कुछ नहीं मिला, तो इसका हम खंडन करेंगे, प्रोटेस्ट करेंगे और सारी इंडिया पार्टी एलायन्स, सारे कन्याकुमारी से लेकर कश्मीर तक...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sir, let the hon. Finance Minister speak.

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे:** सर, मैं बोल देता हूँ...(व्यवधान).... माताजी बोलने में एक्सपर्ट हैं, मुझे मालूम है।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** खरगे जी, ये माताजी नहीं, बल्कि ये तो आपकी बेटी के बराबर हैं।

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे:** इसलिए, मैं इसका खंडन करता हूँ। जिस-जिस जगह अपोजिशन पार्टी चुनकर आई है, जिस-जिस जगह आपको नेगलेक्ट किया गया है या लोगों ने आपको नकार दिया है, उस जगह कुछ नहीं मिला। अगर आप ऐसा ही करते गए, अगर बैलेंस नहीं होगा, तो डेवलेपमेंट कैसे होगा?...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have made your point, Sir.

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे:** आज लोग आपके साथ हैं, कल लोग दूसरे के साथ होंगे।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let the hon. Finance Minister speak.

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे:** लोग तो अलग-अलग समय में अलग-अलग के साथ होते हैं, इसलिए मैं इसका खंडन करता हूँ। हम सभी पार्टी के लोग इस टाइप के attitude का खंडन करते हैं।

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have made your point. Now, hon. Finance Minister.

*(At this stage, some hon. Members left the Chamber.)*

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE; AND THE MINISTER OF CORPORATE AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN): Sir, thank you for giving me an opportunity to respond. ...*(Interruptions)*... Much before I respond, they would like to make a lot of noise and go away. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Finance Minister.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: In the true spirit of democracy ...*(Interruptions)*... They don't even want...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, discussion on the Budget was listed for today. I gave floor to the Leader of the Opposition in the expectation that rules will be followed. I find that it has been used as a ploy and a strategy. Hon. Members, I strongly plead with you that democracy will be seriously threatened if disruption and disturbance are weaponised as a political strategy as has been done now. Parliament is the citadel of constitutional and democratic values and liberties. I am aghast. As a matter of fact, during the day and the days following, we will have ample opportunities to reflect on the Budget presented by the hon. Finance Minister. There was absolutely no occasion, justification, even remotely, to avail the facility accorded by me for this purpose. I cannot persuade myself but take serious exception to this unwholesome practice adopted by a senior Member, the Leader of the Opposition. I will call upon Leaders of the Parties to soul-search on my reflections on Rule 267 that in more than three decades, it has been availed only on half a dozen occasions. And every day of the sitting, I get a number of such requests. It is being taken as a routine exercise. As a habit, it has reduced itself to a farcical exercise. In spite of my serious observations

yesterday, since no focus has taken place, I have again uploaded the same on your portal. Now, hon. Finance Minister, on the observations made.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Sir, thank you very much for giving me this opportunity. It is unfortunate. A senior leader, the Leader of the Opposition, Shri Mallikarjun Kharge, stood up to say his views on what he heard of the Budget yesterday. I would think and maybe it is a bit too much to expect that in the honour of democracy, at least, the Opposition would have stayed here to listen to what I have to respond. The Leader of the Opposition raised issues on the Budget, which was presented yesterday and tabled in this House yesterday. Just to the point that he raised that I have not named many States and probably spoke about only two States, there are a few points which I have to table here with your permission, Sir. I have to voice a few points here, Sir, as to what happens in a speech. The Congress Party has been in power for a very long time in this country. They presented so many different Budgets. And they would know clearly that in every Budget, you don't get an opportunity to name every State of this country. I will take this example. Between Vote on Account, which was presented on 1<sup>st</sup> February this year, and now the full Budget, which was presented yesterday, for this year, I have not named very many States but let me take the name of Maharashtra, for instance. In Vote on Account and yesterday's Budget, I had not named Maharashtra. Hence, I will take that as an example. Under the leadership of Prime Minister Modi, the Cabinet has passed a very important decision. It has taken a decision to set up a very big port in Vadhavan in Maharashtra. Did Maharashtra get ignored because I did not mention the name of Maharashtra? An amount of Rs.76,000 crore has been announced for that project. Maharashtra's name was not taken in the Vote on Account; nor was it taken yesterday. But does it mean that we have ignored Maharashtra? I can take the names of so many other different States where we have major projects. That is one. Second, if the speech does not mention the name of a particular State, does it mean that the benefits of schemes of the Government of India, programmes of the Government of India and the Externally Aided schemes, which we obtain from the World Bank, ADB, AIIB and such institutions like that, do not go to these States? They go as per routine and actually the Expenditure Statement of the Government, the Department-wise allocation of the Government, clearly mentions all these item-wise. This is a deliberate attempt, and I am saying this with responsibility. This is a deliberate attempt of the Opposition parties led by the Congress Party to give an impression to the people that nothing has been given to our States, that it has been given only to two States. I would challenge the Congress Party, for all the Budget

Speeches that they have delivered, that in each of the Budget Speeches, have they named every State of this country? This is an outrageous allegation. ...*(Interruptions)*... And now that they have come here, now that TMC has come here, I would like to say...*(Interruptions)*... Now that there is a Member trying to disrupt me, I would like to say that even the schemes which have been given to Bengal...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Mr. Chairman, Sir, please allow me to say this. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record and no one should shout. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Even the schemes which were allocated to Bengal...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, you have allowed me to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please don't shout. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is not a shouting place. ...*(Interruptions)*... Is it a shouting place? ...*(Interruptions)*... Dr. John Brittas, Shrimati Priyanka Chaturvedi, Ms. Dola Sen, you are senior Members. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... Take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Sir, let me complete. ...*(Interruptions)*... I hope I am allowed to finish. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, please take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... Take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, please.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Sir, let me finish.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. Finish it in two minutes.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Yes, I will speak on Bengal. I have already spoken on Maharashtra for the Members who chose to walk out of the House without

even listening to my reply. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, let me have some order in the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Finance Minister, you will have ample opportunity to respond to each of them when you finally respond.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Yes, Sir, but this kind of a statement by a very senior Member of the House, the Leader of the Opposition, I think, is not acceptable. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let me answer the Members from TMC. ...*(Interruptions)*... Even yesterday, TMC questioned the Budget saying that nothing has been given to Bengal. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let me just highlight the fact that several schemes given by the hon. Prime Minister in the last ten years have not even been implemented in West Bengal. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay Madam, thank you. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Health insurance! ...*(Interruptions)*... And you have the audacity to ask me now. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Bengal should correct its course. ...*(Interruptions)*...

---

### MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, 'Matters Raised with Permission'. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shrimati Mausam Noor. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. JOHN BRITTAS: Sir, one minute. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI MAUSAM NOOR (West Bengal): Sir, my Zero Hour today is 'Demand to take necessary steps to stop erosion by the Ganga river in Malda, West Bengal'. ..*(Interruptions)*...



MR. CHAIRMAN: We will wait for all these issues during the debate. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI MAUSAM NOOR: Sir, thank you for accepting my Zero Hour as the first notice. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have allocated twenty hours. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MS. SUSHMITA DEV: Sir, how can Nirmalaji accuse the Bengal Government? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... No. ...*(Interruptions)*... What is this? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MS. SUSHMITA DEV: This is wrong. ...*(Interruptions)*... You owe one lakh crore.....*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Patel, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... All of you take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... Take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Patel, take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Jairam, take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... You created chaos. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, just a minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please allow me to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... Allow me to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please. ...*(Interruptions)*... All of you take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, hon. Members. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, Shrimati Mausam Noor. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI MAUSAM NOOR: Sir, my Zero Hour today.. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing has gone on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... One minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... Dr. Sasmit Patra, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Digvijayaji, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Digvijayaji, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Minister. Please... ...*(Interruptions)*... *Interruptions)*... I will.....*(Interruptions)*... Don't force my hands. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... One minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... Take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, hon. Minister, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, I gave the floor to the Leader of the Opposition and he made his point. Since the hon. Finance Minister had to say something, there is a right. ...*(Interruptions)*... One minute. The rest of you will have ample opportunity during the 20 hours, and I will increase the time also to accommodate others. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let us set some example. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please. ...*(Interruptions)*... The way we have done is not good. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shrimati Mausam Noor. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes, please hear. ...*(Interruptions)*... She is raising a good point. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI MAUSAM NOOR: Sir, my Zero Hour today is, Demand to take necessary steps to stop.. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Why don't you hear the lady? ...*(Interruptions)*... It is 'Demand to take necessary steps to stop erosion by the Ganga river in Malda, West Bengal.' It is a very important point. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes, Madam Mausam Noor. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**Demand to take necessary steps to stop erosion by the Ganga river in Malda,  
West Bengal**

SHRIMATI MAUSAM NOOR (West Bengal): Sir, thank you for accepting my Zero Hour as the first notice. You have been very generous. However, the Finance Minister has not been generous at all. ...*(Interruptions)*... Zero has been given to Bengal in the Budget and zero has been given to battle the floods of Malda. So, here I am in the Parliament speaking for the people of Malda Uttar and Malda Dakshin on behalf of the Trinamool Congress. ...*(Interruptions)*...

(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*)

Every year, during the monsoon, Malda, where I hail from, is devastated by major floods and erosions by the Rivers of Ganga, Mahananda, Fulahar and Tangon but, this year, it is more alarming as, over the course of time, the rivers have changed its direction and the distance between the two major Rivers, Ganga and Fulahar, has come down to only 700 metres which was earlier almost eight kilometres apart. Sir, if these rivers merge, there will be a huge disaster causing colossal damage. Huge areas of lands will be engulfed by the rivers. People will lose their lands, mango orchards, farming fields and the situation will render lakhs of people homeless.

Especially affected are the Blocks of Kaliachak 3, Kaliachak 2, Manikchak Ratua 1 where the Ganga flows and Harischandrapur 2, Chachal 2 where the Fulahar flows. Sir, since this issue comes under the purview of the Central Government, our hon. Chief Minister Ms. Mamata Banerjee has several times asked the Ministry of Water Resources and Farraka Barrage to conduct anti-erosion works and to come up with a permanent solution. Specifically in February, 2022, she wrote to the Ministry of Water Resources requesting to restore the extended 120 kilometres jurisdiction of the Farakka Barrage Protection Authority.

Earlier, during the UPA regime, anti-erosion and bank protection works had been conducted several times in the affected areas. But, unfortunately, since 2014, the Farakka Barrage has failed to combat the situation and take any major actions. ...*(Interruptions)*...

Sir, I have also raised this matter several times in Zero Hour and also through Special Mention, and since the situation has turned extremely alarming as Ganga and Fulahar might merge and create havoc in the afore-mentioned areas, through you, I once again appeal to the Government to look into this immediately. A permanent solution is needed and is needed urgently. If this issue is not looked into, many lives, lands, public and private property will be lost forever. Thank you, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shrimati Mausam Noor: Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Shri Sandosh Kumar P (Kerala), Shri Saket Gokhale (West Bengal), Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala), Shri Jawhar Sircar (West Bengal), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Shri Niranjana Bishi (Odisha), Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala), Shri Imran Pratapgarhi (Maharashtra), Shrimati Priyanka Chaturvedi (Maharashtra), Ms. Dola Sen (West Bengal), Dr. Fauzia Khan (Maharashtra), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri Mohammed Nadimul Haque (West Bengal), Shrimati Sagarika Ghose (West Bengal), Shri Prakash Chik Baraik (West Bengal), Shri Samirul Islam (West Bengal), Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Shrimati Mahua Maji (Jharkhand) and Ms. Sushmita Dev (West Bengal).

Now, Dr. Ashok Kumar Mittal; Demand for justice for family of the victims of the 1985 Kanishka Bombing.

#### **Demand for justice to the family of the victims of the 1985 Kanishka Bombing**

**डा. अशोक कुमार मित्तल** (पंजाब): उपसभापति महोदय, आज मैं सदन के समक्ष एक बहुत ही संवेदनशील और भावुक विषय उठाना चाहता हूँ। पिछले सत्र में हमारी संसद ने उन सभी

विक्टिम्स की याद में श्रद्धांजलि अर्पित की थी जो 1985 की कनिष्का एयर बॉम्बिंग में मारे गए थे। कनिष्का एयर बॉम्बिंग, 9/11 हमले से पहले तक, विश्व का सबसे बड़ा एविएशन अटैक था, जिसमें 23 जून, 1985 को एयर इंडिया फ्लाइट 182 में बम लगाया गया, जिसके कारण सभी 329 यात्रियों की मृत्यु हो गई थी, जिसमें 82 बच्चे भी थे। ये आंकड़े अपने आप को भयभीत करते हैं, हम सबको भयभीत करते हैं। यह हमला इतना भयानक था कि ब्लास्ट के बाद जहाज एटलांटिक ओशन में गिर गया, जिसके कारण बहुत सारे मृतकों की लाशें भी नहीं मिलीं और बहुत सारे परिवार अपने प्रियजनों का अंतिम संस्कार भी नहीं कर पाए।

सर, इस घटना को 40 वर्ष होने जा रहे हैं। पिछले महीने जून, 2024 में कनाडा सरकार ने बताया कि वे इस घटना की जांच कर रहे हैं। शायद पूरे विश्व में इतनी लंबी इन्वेस्टिगेशन बहुत कम हुई होगी। कनाडा के साथ हमारे अच्छे संबंध हैं। मुझे शंका इस बात की भी होती है कि कनाडा अपने आप को डेवलपड कंट्री बोलता है, अपने आपको डेमोक्रेटिक कंट्री बोलता है, अपने आपको न्याय देने वाली कंट्री बोलता है, अपनी पार्लियामेंट में टेररिज़्म एक्ट को condemn करता है, लेकिन जो कनिष्का एयरक्राफ्ट की फ्लाइट उनकी अपनी जमीन से उड़ी, जो कि खुद सिव्योरिटी लैप्सेज़ के जिम्मेवार थे, उस घटना के विक्टिम्स को आज तक वे न्याय नहीं दे पा रहे हैं। अचंभित करने वाली बात यह भी है कि कनाडा ने अभी तक सिर्फ एक व्यक्ति को कन्विक्ट किया है और उसमें सजा भी इतनी कम थी कि वह बाहर आ गया।

सर, मैं पंजाब से आता हूँ। वहां के बहुत से परिवारों ने इस घटना में अपने लोगों को खोया है, लेकिन आज 40 वर्ष के बाद भी इन मृतकों के परिवारों को न्याय नहीं मिला है। सर, मैं अपने माननीय सभापति जी का विशेष धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ कि उन्होंने इन परिवारों के दुख और वेदना को समझा और इस सदन में पिछले सत्र में मौन रखवाया। उन्होंने इस घटना का संज्ञान लिया और कहा कि विक्टिम्स को न्याय मिलना चाहिए। **...(समय की घंटी)...** सर, सिर्फ आधा मिनट...\*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude. आपका समय समाप्त हो गया है। माननीय डा. अशोक कुमार मित्तल जी, अब आपकी बात रिकॉर्ड पर नहीं जा रही है। It is not going on record. इसमें तीन मिनट का ही समय होता है।

The following hon. Members associated themselves with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Dr. Ashok Kumar Mittal: Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Fauzia Khan (Maharashtra), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Shri Niranjana Bishi (Odisha), Shri Jawhar Sircar (West Bengal), Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Shri Sandosh Kumar P (Kerala), Shri Sujeet Kumar (Odisha), Shri Jose K. Mani (Kerala), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala) and Shri Sant Balbir Singh (Punjab).

Now Shri Niranjana Bishi; demand for increasing road infrastructure under the P.M.G.S.Y. Scheme.

---

\* Not recorded.

### **Demand for increasing road infrastructure under the PMGSY scheme**

SHRI NIRANJAN BISHI (Odisha): Sir, hon. ex-Chief Minister of Odisha, Shri Naveen Patnaik had raised concern over the inadequate financial support from the Central Government in the field of road connectivity and infrastructure development of Odisha. Despite numerous projects announced by the Government of India including initiative for the construction of national highways and roads to enhance road connectivity, minimum progress has been made in confirming these commitments into tangible results.

In addition to that, there has been a noticeable decline in the length of road construction under the Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana (PMGSY), a Centrally-funded scheme over the years posing significant challenges to the road infrastructure of Odisha. In response to these challenges, the then Odisha Government led by our ex-Chief Minister, Shri Naveen Patnaik, had initiated projects such as the State Highway Development Programme and Biju Expressway Yojana providing financial assistance for road construction. Moreover, the State Government led by our ex-Chief Minister, Shri Naveen Patnaik, had earmarked funds for additional schemes aimed at transforming rural infrastructure. However, despite these endeavours, there remained a pressing need for increased intervention from the Government of India.

Therefore, through you, Sir, I respectfully urge upon the Government of India to scrutinize this matter and allocate funds and assistance immediately to ensure timely completion and enhancement of the road infrastructure, Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana in the State of Odisha. This proactive intervention is crucial for addressing the deteriorating condition of roads and fostering overall economic and social development in the State of Odisha.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Niranjana Bishi: Shri A. A. Rahim (Kerala), Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala), Shrimati Mamata Mohanta (Odisha), Shri Jawhar Sircar (West Bengal), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri R. Girirajan (Tamil Nadu), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shri Sujeet Kumar (Odisha), Shrimati Mausam Noor (West Bengal), Shri Jose K. Mani (Kerala), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala) and Dr. Fauzia Khan (Maharashtra).

Now Shri Ajit Kumar Bhuyan; 'Concern over navigational clearance in Brahmaputra river'.

### **Concern over the navigational clearance in the Brahmaputra River**

SHRI AJIT KUMAR BHUYAN (Assam): Sir, I thank you for allowing me to raise an important issue about Assam. I am a representative of the State of Assam through which the mighty river Brahmaputra is flowing, dissecting the State from Sadiya to Dhubri, Bangladesh border. Traversing a distance of 891 km, the Ministry of Shipping and Waterways has declared the above waterway as National Waterway No. 2.

As per the Inland Waterways of Authority of India Act, 1985, IWAI is responsible for developing the waterway for navigation. The IWAI is carrying out various development works on the waterway to improve its navigability as laid down in the IWAI Act, 1985. At present, the waterway is being used by vessels of the Government of Assam, the Army, Border Security Force, tourism organizations and other private operators. Long cruise tourist vessels are making voyages between Pandu and Majuli Islands. From October to May, our dimensional cargo is also transported through the waterway from time to time.

Now, Sir, a new bridge over the river Brahmaputra between Bharalumukh, Guwahati and North Guwahati is under construction, obviously, which has many utilities. However, the navigational clearance that is essential to run over-dimensional cargo may be a concern if the required clearance has not been maintained for the same. Since it is a declared National Waterway clearance, no objection must be essential before construction of a bridge is taken up. Through this mention, I urge upon the Minister concerned, who incidentally is also an elected representative of Assam, to come up with a detailed note or statement to allay any misgivings in the minds of the people for apparent less navigational clearance in comparison to Saraighat Bridge, which is majestically standing closely to the new bridge under construction. Thank you, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Ajit Kumar Bhuyan: Dr. Fauzia Khan (Maharashtra), Ms. Sushmita Dev (West Bengal), Shri Prakash Chik Baraik, (West Bengal), Shrimati Priyanka Chaturvedi (Maharashtra), Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala), Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Shri Jawhar Sircar (West Bengal), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shri Niranjan Bishi, (Odisha), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Shri A. A. Rahim (Kerala), Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu) and Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha).

Thank you, Ajitji. Now, Shrimati Dharmshila Gupta; demand to expedite the work related to the establishment of AIIMS at Darbhanga, Bihar.

**Demand to expedite the work related to the establishment of AIIMS at  
Darbhanga, Bihar**

**श्रीमती धर्मशीला गुप्ता (बिहार):** उपसभापति महोदय, मुझे सदन में बोलने का अवसर देने के लिए आपका बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

महोदय, मैं मिथिला की बेटी हूँ और एक सामान्य परिवार में पली-बढ़ी हूँ। मैंने गरीबी को बहुत नजदीक से देखा है। मैंने स्वयं इस पीड़ा को महसूस किया है कि कैसे पिछली सरकारों के समय में बिहार में स्वास्थ्य सेवाएँ लचर अवस्था में थीं। मैंने देखा है कि कैसे बिहार के गरीब और दलित व्यक्ति इलाज के लिए दिल्ली एम्स में परेशान होते हैं। उनको एम्स के बाहर फुटपाथ पर सोना पड़ता था, न खाने का ठिकाना होता था, न सोने का। बार-बार बिहार से दिल्ली और दिल्ली से बिहार आने-जाने में उनकी आर्थिक हालत खराब हो जाती थी। लेकिन उपसभापति महोदय, समाज के गरीब, दलित, पिछड़े और लाचार लोगों की चिन्ता करने वाले हमारे माननीय प्रधान मंत्री, श्री नरेन्द्र मोदी जी का मैं हृदय से धन्यवाद व्यक्त करना चाहती हूँ, क्योंकि उन्होंने बिहार में पटना के बाद दूसरा एम्स दरभंगा जिले को दिया। इससे उत्तर बिहार के करोड़ों लोगों के साथ-साथ हमारे पड़ोसी राज्य पश्चिम बंगाल के कुछ क्षेत्रों के अलावा पड़ोसी देश नेपाल के लोगों को भी स्वास्थ्य सुविधाओं का लाभ मिलेगा। मैं इसके लिए तत्कालीन केन्द्रीय स्वास्थ्य मंत्री का भी आभार व्यक्त करती हूँ।

महोदय, मैं सदन के माध्यम से हमारी सरकार से विनम्र अनुरोध करना चाहती हूँ कि मिथिला के दरभंगा में प्रस्तावित एम्स का निर्माण कार्य जल्द से जल्द प्रारंभ किया जाए, जिससे वहाँ की जनता को शीघ्रतापूर्वक स्वास्थ्य सेवाओं का लाभ मिल सके। साथ ही मैं आदरणीय प्रधान मंत्री, श्री नरेन्द्र मोदी जी का धन्यवाद और आभार व्यक्त करना चाहती हूँ कि इस शानदार बजट में महिलाओं, युवाओं, गरीब, शोषित, दलित...

**श्री उपसभापति:** माननीय मैडम, जब आप बजट पर बोलिएगा, तब आप यह बोलें, प्लीज। Thank you.

The following hon. Members associated themselves with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Ajit Kumar Bhuyan: Dr. Fauzia Khan (Maharashtra) and Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha).

Now, Shri Ramji; request to construct Pachpedi Ghat Bridge at Lakhimpur Khiri, Uttar Pradesh.

**Request to construct Pachpedi ghat bridge in Lakhimpur Khiri, Uttar Pradesh**

**श्री रामजी (उत्तर प्रदेश):** मान्यवर, मैं लखीमपुर खीरी से आता हूँ। लखीमपुर खीरी एक तराई क्षेत्र है, यह एक काफी पिछड़ा क्षेत्र भी है और यहाँ के लोग मोस्टली खेती पर निर्भर करते हैं। लेकिन मान्यवर, बरसात के समय नेपाल के पानी की वजह से वहाँ बाढ़ आती है, जिससे वहाँ की 60 परसेंट आबादी प्रभावित होती है, यहाँ की फसलें जलमग्न हो जाती हैं, स्कूल, कॉलेज,

अस्पताल के रास्ते बंद हो जाते हैं और लाखों लोग बेघर हो जाते हैं। पलिया और लखीमपुर का लगभग 90 किलोमीटर का जो रेल का और रोड का संपर्क मार्ग है, वह हर साल टूट जाता है। इसलिए मान्यवर, वहाँ की जनता की एक लम्बे अरसे से एक माँग रही है कि शारदा नदी पर पचपेड़ी घाट के पुल का निर्माण कराया जाए। यह आज से नहीं, बीसों साल से माँग रही है। कई बार यह कहा गया कि वर्ल्ड बैंक से फाइनेंस हो गया, वहाँ पर नक्शा बनाया गया, टेंडर की प्रक्रिया शुरू कर दी गई, लेकिन आज तक वहाँ पर पचपेड़ी घाट का पुल नहीं बनाया गया। अगर यह पचपेड़ी घाट का पुल बन जाता है, तो इससे वहाँ पर एक लंबे क्षेत्रफल में बाढ़ का जो प्रकोप है, वह भी रुकेगा। इससे सबसे बड़ी बात यह होगी कि निघासन और पलिया की जो दूरी है, वह करीब-करीब 30 किलोमीटर कम हो जाएगी। इसके साथ ही हमारा जो नेपाल का बॉर्डर एरिया है, वह भी हमारे लिए सामरिक दृष्टिकोण से बेहतर होगा, क्योंकि बरसात के समय पलिया का रास्ता बंद हो जाता है और हमारा कोई संपर्क नहीं रहता है। अगर यह पुल बन जाता है, तो हमारी पहुँच नेपाल तक होगी, इसलिए यह सामरिक दृष्टिकोण से भी महत्वपूर्ण है।

मान्यवर, मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार से यह अनुरोध करना चाहता हूँ कि पचपेड़ी घाट पुल का निर्माण कराया जाए और ऐसा करके लखीमपुर की जनता पर उपकार किया जाए। वहाँ की जनता की लंबे अरसे से यही माँग है। मैं आपसे यही कहना चाहता हूँ, धन्यवाद।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Ramji: Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri Niranjan Bishi (Odisha), Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala), Shri A. A. Rahim (Kerala), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu) and Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu).

The next speaker is Shrimati Rajani Ashokrao Patil; Demand to reduce rate of GST on Mediclaim policies.

### **Demand to reduce rate of GST on Mediclaim Policies**

SHRIMATI RAJANI ASHOKRAO PATIL (Maharashtra): Sir, I would like to state about a very important issue regarding the health sector of India. Sir, GST on luxury goods like gold, silver, diamond is restricted to three per cent whereas for the services of medical importance and necessities, it is kept at 18 per cent, for example, life insurance and mediclaim insurance policies. This clearly shows that the Government is least bothered about public health care matters. Due to such heavy taxes, the common people avoid taking mediclaim insurance policies and ends up paying their hospital bills in lakhs. Our country had already experienced this at the time of Covid pandemic in 2019, where common man had to sell his property to pay the hospital bills as he was not covered under the medical insurance policy. It is recommended to



cut down the GST rates on mediclaim insurance policies. This will encourage the common man to insure his life by taking mediclaim policies.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Zero Hour matter raised by the hon. Member, Shrimati Rajani Ashokrao Patil: Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri Niranjan Bishi (Odisha), Shri Sujeet Kumar (Odisha), Shrimati Priyanka Chaturvedi (Maharashtra), Shri Imran Pratapgarhi (Maharashtra), Dr. Fauzia Khan (Maharashtra), Shri A. A. Rahim (Kerala), Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala), Shri Sandosh Kumar P (Kerala), Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala), Shri Jose K. Mani (Kerala), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shri Jawhar Sircar (West Bengal), Shri Prakash Chik Baraik (West Bengal), Shrimati Mausam Noor (West Bengal), Ms. Sushmita Dev (West Bengal), Shri Saket Gokhale (West Bengal), Shri Shaktisinh Gohil (Gujarat), Shrimati Phulo Devi Netam (Chhattisgarh), Shri Neeraj Dangi (Rajasthan), Shri Ajit Kumar Bhuyan (Assam), Shri Ramji (Uttar Pradesh), Shri Anil Kumar Yadav (Telangana), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Shri R. Girirajan (Tamil Nadu) and Shri Sanjeev Arora, (Punjab).

The next speaker is Dr. Anil Sukhdeorao Bonde; Request to confer Bharat Ratna to Late Dr. Panjabrao Shamrao Deshmukh for his great contribution to the country especially in the field of education and agriculture.

**Request to confer Bharat Ratna to Late Dr. Panjabrao Shamrao Deshmukh for his great contribution to the country especially in the field of education and agriculture**

**डा. अनिल सुखदेवराव बोंडे (महाराष्ट्र):** आदरणीय उपसभापति महोदय, मैं आपका ध्यान स्वर्गीय डॉ. पंजाबराव उपाख्य बहुसेव शामराव देशमुख के शिक्षा, सामाजिक और कृषि क्षेत्र में महान योगदान की ओर आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ। वे भारत में एक प्रमुख सामाजिक कार्यकर्ता और किसानों के नेता थे। उन्होंने पं. जवाहरलाल नेहरू जी की कैबिनेट में कृषि मंत्री के रूप में काम किया था। भारत में प्रथम अंतर्राष्ट्रीय कृषि प्रदर्शनी और हरित क्रांति में उनका योगदान सराहनीय तथा अविस्मरणीय था। उन्होंने वर्ष 1932 में शिवाजी शिक्षण संस्थान की स्थापना की। उनके द्वारा स्थापित शिवाजी शिक्षण संस्थान के अंतर्गत 24 डिग्री कॉलेज, 54 इंटरमीडिएट कॉलेज, 75 स्कूल, 25 छात्रावास, मेडिकल कॉलेज, लॉ कॉलेज और इंजीनियरिंग कॉलेज संचालित किए जाते हैं। अकोला के शासकीय कृषि विश्वविद्यालय का नाम डॉ. पंजाबराव देशमुख कृषि विद्यापीठ रख कर भी उन्हें सम्मानित किया गया है। उन्होंने भारतीय संविधान के निर्माण में भी महत्वपूर्ण भूमिका निभाई है और आजाद हिंद सेना के लिए बचाव पक्ष के वकील के रूप में भी काम किया है। उन्होंने अस्पृश्यता के लिए भी काम किया है। अमरावती के अम्बादेवी मंदिर में अछूतों को प्रवेश की अनुमति देने के लिए सत्याग्रह किया है। इस वर्ष पूरा भारत डॉ. पंजाबराव

देशमुख जी की 125वीं जयंती मना रहा है। चूँकि डॉ. पंजाबराव शामराव देशमुख ने देश में शिक्षा, कृषि, संसदीय तथा सामाजिक क्षेत्र में बहुत बड़ा योगदान दिया है, इसलिए मैं उन्हें 'भारत रत्न' से सम्मानित करने का अनुरोध और आग्रह करता हूँ, धन्यवाद।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Dr. Anil Sukhdeorao Bonde: Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Dr. Fauzia Khan (Maharashtra), and Shri Dhananjay Bhimrao Mahadik (Maharashtra).

The next speaker is Shri K.R.N. Rajeshkumar; Demand to release the funds for the Chennai Metro Rail project, Phase-II.

### **Demand to release the funds for the Chennai Metro Rail project, Phase-II**

SHRI K.R.N. RAJESHKUMAR (Tamil Nadu): Respected Deputy Chairman Sir, I bring to your kind notice that in Budget speech of 2021-2022, the hon. Finance Minister of the Union Government announced a budget allocation of Rs. 63,246 crores for the second phase of the Chennai Metro Rail Project. As recommended by the Public Investment Board on August 17, 2021. However, this project has been waiting the approval of the Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs for the last three years. As a result, the entire expenditure is being borne by the State. This delay is severely impacting the State finances. Sir, I raised a question on the same issue to the hon. Minister of Housing and Urban Affairs for which I received a reply stating that the 118.9 kilometre Chennai Metro Rail Phase 2 project is currently under process and its approval depends upon the feasibility of the project. In this matter, I would like to submit that the population of Chennai metro city is approximately 1.2 crores, which is huge in size. The condition of traffic in Chennai city is quite hectic because of high population, which is 26,000 people per square kilometre. Similar other cities, like Delhi and Bengaluru, which have a large population, have excellent metro network. Additionally, the floating population of Chennai settles around 25 kilometres on daily basis, which is on par with other metro cities.

Sir, the hon. Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu has reiterated his request for the release of funds. In the light of this, I respectfully make a request to the Union Government to allocate the previously-announced funds for the Chennai Metro Rail — Phase II Project.

Sir, the Union Government should treat all the States equally like a 'mother-bird'.

### **Demand to declare Rath Yatra of Mahaprabhu Shri Jagannath as a National Holiday**

**श्री शुभाशीष खुंटिया** (ओडिशा): जय जगन्नाथ! Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I would like to thank you for giving me this opportunity to draw the attention of the Government with a demand to declare Rath Yatra of Mahaprabhu Shri Jagannath as a National Holiday.

Sir, Lord Mahaprabhu Shri Jagannath is the Lord of the Universe. Every year, people from across the world -- irrespective of caste, colour, religion, and faith -- flock to Odisha on the occasion of Car Festival to have a *darshan* of Mahaprabhu Shri Jagannath, Sri Balabhadra, Maa Subhadra, and Sri Sudarshan on the open chariot. The festival attracts millions of devotees and is renowned for its vibrant rituals and cultural significance, marking the largest chariot festival in the world. It has got recognition as one of the oldest Hindu festival worldwide. Even people are observing the car festival in different places of the world. Given the festival's widespread appeal and its role in promoting cultural awareness and national unity, I firmly believe that declaring the Car Festival as a National Holiday would be a fitting tribute to our shared heritage. Such a declaration would allow citizens from all walks of life to participate in the celebrations, deepening their connection to our cultural roots and strengthening the sense of national pride. Furthermore, recognizing the Car Festival as a national holiday would underscore the Government's commitment to preserving and promoting our cultural heritage.

In view of the above, on behalf of the people of Odisha, I urge upon the hon. Minister of Culture to consider this request and take necessary steps to declare the Car Festival as a National Holiday. Your support in this matter would be greatly appreciated by millions of devotees and cultural ethos across the nation. Thank you, Sir. वन्दे उत्कल जननी!

**श्री उपसभापति:** धन्यवाद, माननीय शुभाशीष खुंटिया जी। जो लोग एसोसिएट करना चाहते हैं, वे अपने नाम यहाँ लिखित रूप में भेज दें। माननीय श्री ईरण्ण कडाडी, 'Demand for Inquiry into Financial Irregularities by Karnataka Government'.

**श्री जयराम रमेश**(कर्नाटक): सर, यह विषय नहीं लिया जा सकता।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज़।

**श्री जयराम रमेश:** सर, यह विषय नहीं लिया जा सकता।...(व्यवधान)....यह रूल्स के खिलाफ है।  
...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is listed. ...(*Interruptions*)... Hon. Chairman has listed it here. ...(*Interruptions*)... Nothing is going on record. ...(*Interruptions*)...

**श्री जयराम रमेश:** \*

**श्री उपसभापति:** यह विषय लिस्टेड है। ...(*व्यवधान*)... इसको माननीय चेयरमैन ने लिस्ट किया है, यह रिकॉर्ड पर जाएगा। ...(*व्यवधान*)... Now, Shri Iranna Kadadi.

### **Demand for inquiry into the financial irregularities by the Karnataka Government**

**श्री ईरण कडाडी (कर्नाटक):** उपसभापति महोदय, आज मैं अपनी बात कन्नड़ में कहना चाहता हूँ। † "Sir, I want to draw the attention of the Government and this House towards the 187 crore rupees scam, which occurred in the State of Karnataka in regard to the funds of Maharishi Valmiki Scheduled Tribe Development Corporation. The funds earmarked for the welfare activities of the downtrodden people, were misappropriated.

For the last one-year, members are not being appointed to this organization. The basic facilities are not being provided. The Dalit students residing in the Corporation's Hostels are not being provided with the basic facilities. Tube wells are not being installed on the lands belonging to the Scheduled Tribes. The Scheduled Tribes people engaged in small businesses are not being given any financial assistance. The funds allotted for the development of the Scheduled Tribes have been systematically looted. Such a serious scam came to light only after a suicide note, left by an officer of this Valmiki Corporation, was found. The Secretary of the Scheduled Tribes Welfare Department has already resigned as he was arrested by the Enforcement Directorate (E.D). The ED officials have raided 20 different locations in Karnataka. The SIT has arrested 15 people in this case. ...(*Interruptions*)...

Sir, the misappropriated funds have been transferred to 270 Benami Accounts in the States of Karnataka, Andhra Pradesh and Telangana and a sum of rupees 40 crores has already been confiscated. A well-planned mechanism is being used to spread the rumors that the Central Government is against the Minorities, Dalits and the Backward Castes." ...(*Interruptions*)...

---

\* Not recorded.

† English translation of the original speech delivered in Kannada.

**श्री उपसभापति:** सिर्फ माननीय ईरण कडाडी जी की बात ही रिकॉर्ड पर जा रही है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह लिस्टेड है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI IRANNA KADADI: "It has been wrongly stated that this Government is doing away with reservation and that the Constitution is under threat. Now they themselves are misappropriating the funds allocated for the welfare of the Dalits and the Scheduled Tribes. They have misused these funds for the election expenditure of their party candidates in the Lok Sabha elections, which is a serious betrayal of the Dalits and the Scheduled Tribes. They are making all possible attempts to influence the investigation process of the ED by politicizing the issue. I demand a fair investigation by the CBI in this scam, which is nothing but a dacoity committed in broad daylight, of the funds allocated for the welfare of the Dalits.

Through you, I would like to request that the culprits be brought to book and justice be meted out to the Dalits and the Backward Castes, whose money has been misappropriated. Namaskar!"

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with the issue raised by the hon. Member, Shri Iranna Kadadi: Shri Dhananjay Bhimrao Mahadik (Maharashtra), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu) and Shri Narayana Koragappa, (Karnataka).

This is listed. माननीय चेयरमैन ने इसे approve किया है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... Please take your seats ...**(Interruptions)**... माननीय एलओपी।

**विपक्ष के नेता (श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे):** सर, मैं आपसे विनती करता हूँ कि जो विषय राज्य का है, राज्यों में जो घटनाएं होती हैं, उनके बारे में वहां की असेम्बली में वहां के मेम्बर्स उठा सकते हैं, लेकिन वहां सरकार के जो administrative lapses हैं, अगर आपने उन्हें यहां उठाने की परमिशन दी, तो हम रोज़ ऐसे विषय उठाएंगे, दूसरे स्टेट्स में जितने मर्डर्स हो रहे हैं या अन्य कोई घटनाएं हो रही हैं...

**श्री उपसभापति:** डा. लक्ष्मीकान्त बाजपेयी। ...**(व्यवधान)**... Nothing else is going on record. Dr. Laxmikant Bajpayee. ...**(Interruptions)**

#### Concern over increasing number of deaths due to dog bites

**डा. लक्ष्मीकान्त बाजपेयी (उत्तर प्रदेश):** माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, मैं आपका ध्यान एक अत्यंत महत्वपूर्ण समस्या की ओर दिलाना चाहता हूँ। विश्व स्वास्थ्य संगठन का कहना है कि

भारत में dog biting से 36 परसेंट मृत्यु हो रही हैं, वह भी 15 साल के बच्चों की मृत्यु हो रही है। इसके लिए भारतीय पशु कल्याण बोर्ड ने यह कहा था कि इनकी जनगणना कराकर नसबंदी करानी चाहिए, लेकिन उस संबंध में अब तक कोई कार्यवाही नहीं हुई है। मेरा यह कहना है कि भारतीय पशु कल्याण बोर्ड ने जो राय दी है, उसका पालन किया जाना चाहिए। अस्पतालों में एंटी रेबीज़ वैक्सींस की पर्याप्त व्यवस्था होनी चाहिए। आवारा कुत्तों को इंजेक्शन लगाकर उनके काटने से होने वाले नुकसान से बच्चों को बचाया जाना चाहिए।

मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार से यह आग्रह करना चाहता हूँ कि अस्पतालों में पर्याप्त एंटी रेबीज़ वैक्सीन की व्यवस्था की जाए, आवारा कुत्तों की नसबंदी करके उनको टीका लगाया जाए और पालतु पशुओं को भी टीका लगाने का काम किया जाए।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with the issue raised by the hon. Member, Dr. Laxmikant Bajpayee: Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala), Shri Dhananjay Bhimrao Mahadik (Maharashtra), Shri Jose K. Mani (Kerala), Dr. Fauzia Khan (Maharashtra), Shri Sanjeev Arora (Punjab), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha) and Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala).

Now, Shri Jose K. Mani.

### **Concern over emerging threats and potential risks associated with Artificial Intelligence**

SHRI JOSE K. MANI (KERALA): Sir, I urge the Government to formulate a comprehensive legislation to regulate to prevent the dangers associated with Artificial Intelligence in our country. AI is very much a part of our present reality. Soon, it will be the part of every person's daily life and decision-making process. However, there are inherent dangers and significant risks associated with AI. The risks associated with AI are not limited to individuals; they extend to society as a whole. The foremost issue is the case of data privacy. AI systems rely on vast amount of data to learn, adapt and make decisions.

(MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*)

This data often includes sensitive personal information which, if not properly protected, can lead to severe privacy violations. ....(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Don't shout. Use low decibel.

SHRI JOSE K. MANI: AI-powered tools can extract sensitive information from data base, social media accounts or online platform without obtaining proper consent. This not only breaches individual privacy rights but also exposes them to potential financial and personal problems. AI system can analyse and combine data from multiple sources creating detailed profiles of individuals without their knowledge or consent. This pervasive surveillance can lead to loss of autonomy and control of our personal information. Biased AI system trained on biased data can perpetuate and ...  
...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

The following hon. Members associated with the matter raised by hon. Member, Shri Jose K. Mani : Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Dr. Fauzia Khan (Maharashtra), Shri Sandosh Kumar P. (Kerala), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shri Mohammed Nadimul Haque (West Bengal), Ms. Dola Sen (West Bengal), Shri Saket Gokhale (West Bengal), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shrimati Mausam Noor (West Bengal), Shri Niranjana Bisi (Odisha), Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala), Shri Ravi Chandra Vaddiraju (Telangana), Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala) and Shri Prakash Chik Baraik (West Bengal) and Shrimati Mahua Maji (Jharkhand).

Now Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*....

AN HON. MEMBER: Sir, I have a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Member, Shri Pramod Tiwari has a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JOSE. K. MANI: Sir, ... ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No. ...*(Interruptions)*... Question Hour has to start at noon. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are one of the very senior Members of the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JOSE K. MANI: \*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

---

\* Not recorded.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी** (राजस्थान): रूल 238 (3) में संसद की सभाओं या किसी राज्य विधान-मण्डल दल के आचरण या कार्यवाही के विषय में क्षोभकारी पदावली का उपयोग नहीं होगा।...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी**: सर, मेरी बात तो सुनिए।

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will look into the entire record. You have raised a good point of order, and you will get my ruling.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी**: ठीक है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will look into it and give my ruling latest by tomorrow. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka): Sir, please don't mention my name in your ruling. ...*(Interruptions)*...

---

### ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Question Hour.

#### Tourism in U.T. of Jammu and Kashmir

<sup>†</sup>\*16. DR. DINESH SHARMA: Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

- (a) whether the tourism sector in U.T. of Jammu and Kashmir has grown rapidly after August, 2019;
- (b) if so, the details thereof ;
- (c) the efforts that are being made by Government to develop tourism in U.T. of Jammu and Kashmir; and
- (d) the outcomes thereof?

---

<sup>†</sup> Original notice of the question was received in Hindi.



THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI NITYANAND RAI): (a) to (d) A statement is laid on the table of the house.

### Statement

(a) and (b) The tourism sector in the UT of Jammu and Kashmir has witnessed unprecedented growth post abrogation of Art. 370. The details of total tourist visits, year-wise as under:

Year	Total Tourist Visits
2020*	34,70,834
2021	1,13,14,884
2022	1,88,64,332
2023	2,11,24,674
2024	1,08,41,009 (till June,2024)

*Source: Government of Union Territory of J&K*

*\* Due to COVID, the footfall witnessed a decline.*

(c) The Government of Jammu and Kashmir has reported that several measures have been taken that led to significant improvement in the tourism sector such as:

- i. The Government has notified Jammu and Kashmir Tourism Policy- 2020.
- ii. Provided the status of industry to the Tourism Sector for availing incentives under the Jammu and Kashmir Industrial Policy- 2021.
- iii. Notified the Homestay guidelines to accommodate increasing number of tourists and to give benefits to the locals from the economic gains of the Tourism Sector.
- iv. The Government has notified Jammu and Kashmir Film Policy- 2021.
- v. Notified Houseboat Policy - 2020.
- vi. Identified 75 off-beat destinations.
- vii. Border Tourism has picked up in J&K and hitherto unknown locations have been opened up for tourism viz. Gurez, Keran, Teetwal and R S Pura.
- viii. UT of J&K is also emerging in adventure and Golf tourism.
- ix. The Government of Jammu and Kashmir has undertaken various infrastructure projects to boost the tourism sector.
- x. UT of J&K is emerging as an international tourist destination after successful hosting of major events such as the 3<sup>rd</sup> G-20 Tourism Working Group Meeting.

xi. Modern infrastructure and growing number of luxury hotels and resorts make J&K a prime location for destination weddings and MICE (Meetings, Incentives, Conferences and Exhibitions) tourism.

(d) The Government of Jammu and Kashmir has reported that due to above initiatives, the contribution of Tourism in Gross State Domestic Product (GSDP) has increased from 7.84% in FY 2019-20 to 8.47% in FY 2022-23. The tourism sector has recorded an annual average growth rate of 15.13% during the last 03 years.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question No.16. Supplementary No.1, Dr. Dinesh Sharma.

**डा. दिनेश शर्मा:** महोदय, क्या जम्मू-कश्मीर में प्रधानमंत्री पैकेज लागू किया गया है? क्या उससे जम्मू-कश्मीर के विकास को गति मिल पा रही है और अभी स्थिति क्या है, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से जानना चाहता हूँ।

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय:** महोदय, ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Saket, I will name you now. Don't disturb the House. It is going peacefully. ...(Interruptions)... No, please. ...(Interruptions)... I will request the floor leader to control the Member. Please.

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय:** महोदय, जम्मू-कश्मीर के लिए प्रधानमंत्री पैकेज 2015 से प्रारंभ किया गया और इसके तहत भारत सरकार के 15 मंत्रालयों द्वारा 58,477 करोड़ का प्रावधान करके वहां के विकास को गति दी जा रही है। उसमें 53 परियोजनाओं को चालू किया गया और उसमें 35 परियोजनाएं पूरी हो गई हैं या पूरी होने की स्थिति में आ गई हैं। सर, इन 53 परियोजनाओं से वहां के विकास को गति मिली है, उसमें बिजली, स्वास्थ्य, शिक्षा, पर्यटन, कृषि और कौशल विकास आदि के क्षेत्र शामिल हैं।

महोदय, विकास पैकेज न केवल तत्काल जरूरतों को पूरा कर रहा है, बल्कि क्षेत्र में सतत विकास और स्थिरता का आधार भी बन रहा है। वहां पीएमडीपी योजना के तहत एम्स, आईआईएम-जम्मू, आईआईटी-जम्मू, व्यापक बाढ़ प्रबंधन कार्यक्रम, झेलम, चेनानी-नाशरी खंड सुरंग परियोजना, काजीगुंड-बनिहाल खंड सुरंग परियोजना आदि जैसी प्रमुख परियोजनाओं को पूरा किया गया है। इसके साथ ही पीओजेके से विस्थापित और वैस्ट पाकिस्तान से आए हुए शरणार्थियों को भी इस पैकेज का लाभ मिल रहा है।

**श्री सभापति:** सेकेंड सप्लीमेंटरी, डा. दिनेश शर्मा। And you should be satisfied with the first. Second supplementary.

**डा. दिनेश शर्मा:** सर, मैं गृहमंत्री जी को बधाई देना चाहूंगा कि उन्होंने शांति बहाली और बेरोजगारी दूर करने के लिए काम किया। मेरा दूसरा प्रश्न है कि छह हजार कश्मीरी पंडितों को नौकरी और आवास देने के संबंध में क्या प्रगति हुई है?

**श्री सभापति:** माननीय मंत्री जी। It is a pointed question.

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय:** महोदय, यह दुर्भाग्य रहा है कि एक समय में कश्मीर में हिंदुओं को बहुत प्रताड़ित किया गया। इतनी अपराधिक घटनाएं हुईं, हत्याएं भी बड़ी तादाद में हुईं, आगजनी हुई, महिलाओं के साथ बलात्कार हुए और एक साजिश के तहत, जिनको वोट से मतलब था, जिन्होंने धिनौनी राजनीति को आधार बनाया, ऐसे लोगों के कारण वहां के कश्मीरी पंडितों का पलायन हुआ था। सर, जैसे माननीय सदस्य का क्वेश्चन है कि वहां छह हजार ट्रांजिट आवास बनाए गए हैं। कश्मीर में पीएम पैकेज के तहत लगे कश्मीरी विस्थापित सरकारी कर्मचारियों को समानियोजित करने के लिए भारत सरकार ने 2015 के दौरान कश्मीर घाटी के विभिन्न जिलों में छह हजार ट्रांजिट आवास के निर्माण को भी मंजूरी दी है। सर, यह निर्माण की वर्तमान स्थिति है। निर्मित किए जाने वाले फ्लैटों की संख्या कुल 6,000 है, पूर्ण किए गए फ्लैटों की संख्या 2,088 है, शेष फ्लैटों के निर्माण का कार्य प्रगति पर है। सभापति महोदय, जहां तक इन्होंने नौकरियों की बात कही है, तो कश्मीर घाटी में कश्मीरी विस्थापित, कश्मीरी पंडितों और हिंदुओं की वापसी और पुनर्वास की सुविधा के लिए पीएमडीपी, 2015 के तहत भारत सरकार ने कश्मीरी विस्थापितों के अतिरिक्त 3,000 पदों को सृजित किया और अब तक कुल 6,000 पदों में से 5,724 पदों के लिए उम्मीदवारों की नियुक्ति कर दी गई है तथा शेष 276 पदों को पूरा भरा जा रहा है।

सभापति महोदय, इस प्रकार से वहां पूरा ख्याल रखा जा रहा है, चाहे उनका पुनर्वास हो, उनको नौकरी मिले, वहां पर शांति बहाल हो, वहां पर उस स्थिति में लोग वापस हो रहे हैं, उनका मनोबल बढ़ा है। आज हम यह कह सकते हैं कि जो भी व्यक्ति विस्थापित हुए हैं, आने वाले भविष्य में हम उनका पुनर्वास और उनको नौकरी देने का काम करेंगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Fauzia Khan. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please. Hon. Members, if you would have carefully gone through the reply, I am sure you would be happy to note -- I don't want to reflect on details -- that last year we had two crore tourists; this time, before June, as per the reply, we have already crossed the half-way mark.  
Dr. Fauzia Khan.

DR. FAUZIA KHAN: Sir, before I ask my question, I would like to draw your attention to the digital dashboard here. We are not getting any replies to the questions here on the dashboard. We should get to see the replies here before we put a supplementary question. Regarding this Question, the Minister has said that the tourism sector has grown, but I would like to point out that it has remained unregulated...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute, hon. Member. I myself check and the replies are loaded. They are loaded, Madam. You only have to operate it. All are loaded. Otherwise, how would I know?

DR. FAUZIA KHAN: No, Sir. It is not there on my dashboard.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Doesn't matter. Just have a cup of coffee with me in my Chamber. Things will be sorted out. Your supplementary now.

DR. FAUZIA KHAN: All right, Sir. Thank you.

Sir, my point is that tourism remains unregulated and such unregulated tourism in an ecologically fragile ecosystem has resulted in increasing pollution in the water bodies and generation of huge amounts of waste and greenhouse gases like Carbon-dioxide. What measures are being taken to ensure sustainable tourism development in the region? Is the Government planning to develop a specific eco-tourism policy in the Union Territory based on sustainable models?

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय:** सभापति महोदय, मैं माननीय सदस्या को बताना चाहूंगा कि 2023 में 2 करोड़ 11 लाख पर्यटक गए हैं। वहां पर सफाई और स्वच्छता की पूरी व्यवस्था की जा रही है। वहां पर शांति का माहौल है, तभी आज वहां पर कई गुना पर्यटकों की संख्या बढ़ी है। वहां पर स्वच्छता का पूरा ख्याल रखा जा रहा है। हम थोड़े दिन पहले श्रीनगर और आसपास के कई जिलों में गए थे। वहां पर पर्यटकों का पूरी तरह से ख्याल रखा जा रहा है।

सर, वहां पर स्वच्छता के माध्यम से जो हमारे कार्यक्रम चल रहे हैं, उनके माध्यम से वहां पर पर्यावरण का भी पूरा ख्याल रखा जा रहा है। स्वच्छता अभियान के लिए जम्मू-कश्मीर का प्रशासन काम पर लगा है। गृह मंत्रालय ने भी उसको स्पष्ट रूप से निर्देश दिया है। लेकिन माननीय सदस्य महोदय का जो क्वेश्चन है, उससे तो यह भाव उत्पन्न हो रहा है कि शायद वे जम्मू-कश्मीर के पर्यटन को बढ़ावा नहीं देना चाहती हैं। क्या वे चाहती हैं कि वहां पर पर्यटक नहीं जाएं। ....(व्यवधान)...

**श्री शक्तिसिंह गोहिल:** सर, माननीय मंत्री जी....(व्यवधान)...

**श्री दिग्वजय सिंह:** सर, माननीय मंत्री जी माननीय सदस्या के लिए ....(व्यवधान)...

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय:** इसलिए वे कह रही हैं। ....(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** माननीय मंत्री जी।

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय:** महोदय, वहाँ इस प्रकार से ....(व्यवधान)... महोदय, वहाँ पर्यावरण पर इसके संभावित प्रभाव का आकलन करने के लिए पर्यटन से संबंधित विकास योजनाओं को मंजूरी देने से पहले गहन पर्यावरण प्रभाव का विश्लेषण किया जाता है। महोदय, व्यापक नियामक ढांचे और विनियम पर्यटन विकास की दिशा तय करते हैं तथा अनुमेय भूमि, उपयोग निर्माण, दिशा निर्देश और पर्यावरणीय मानकों को भी देखा जाता है। इसके साथ ही स्थानीय समुदाय भी निर्णय लेने की प्रक्रियाओं में सक्रिय रूप से भाग लेते हैं, जिससे उनके अपने सांस्कृतिक मूल्य और पारंपरिक ज्ञान अक्षुण्ण रहें। महोदय, वहाँ पर नियमित निगरानी और सख्त प्रबंधन तंत्र के माध्यम से पर्यावरण के नियमों और नैतिक पर्यटन परिपाटियों का अनुपालन भी सुनिश्चित किया गया है।

महोदय, हितधारकों के लिए निरंतर क्षमता निर्माण कार्यक्रम, पर्यटकों हेतु जागरूकता अभियान के साथ-साथ परिपाटियों और पर्यावरण के सारे सिद्धांतों का भी ख्याल रखा जाता है और इसके लिए जागृति भी पैदा की जाती है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, no Member of the House is against wholesome activities in Jammu and Kashmir. So, to that extent, I will look into hon. Minister's observation. Hon. Member, Dr. Fauzia Khan, has always been contributing constructively. Now, Shri Pramod Tiwari. Tiwariji, keep the tempo of decorum. You are a very senior man. And, please put pointed question.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** सर, जैसा आप चाहते हैं, वैसा ही होगा। सर, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से प्वाइंटिड क्वेश्चन पूछना चाहता हूँ।

MR. CHAIRMAN: But, point towards me.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** सर, मैं आप ही को एड्रेस कर रहा हूँ।

महोदय, अगर उनके पास जवाब है, तो यह बता दें कि पिछले दस दिनों के अंदर सीमा पर \*अगर उनके पास जवाब नहीं है, तो कोई बात नहीं है। ..(व्यवधान)..

MR. CHAIRMAN: Pramodji, you are a senior man.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** सर, मंत्री जी इतना ही बता दें कि क्या आतंकवादी गतिविधियाँ ..(व्यवधान)..

MR. CHAIRMAN: I don't expect this from you. ...(*Interruptions*)... One second. ...(*Interruptions*)... Only Mr. Tiwari will speak. Everyone else will take seat. Pramodji, I appeal to you to please confine to the question. It is regarding tourism in the Union Territory of Jammu and Kashmir. ...(*Interruptions*)... And, if you have

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

gone through the reply, you will find something enriching for us, soothing for us, wholesome for us. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please ask the supplementary.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** सर, मैं पूरा कर लेता हूँ। मैं प्वाइंटिड क्वेश्चन पूछ रहा हूँ। ..*(व्यवधान)*...सर, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से एक सीधा सवाल पूछ रहा हूँ कि जब कोई टूरिस्ट जाता है, तो उसके दिमाग में सबसे बड़ी चिंता सुरक्षा की होती है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...मैं यही कह रहा हूँ।

**श्री सभापति:** एक सेकंड रुकिये, आप अपना प्रश्न पूछिए। *(व्यवधान)*....

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** सर, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से सिर्फ इतना जानना चाहता हूँ कि \* ..*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, this will not go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... माननीय मंत्री जी, प्रमोद तिवारी जी जानना चाहते हैं *(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय:** सभापति जी, मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय सदस्य को बताना चाहता हूँ कि मैं कोई संकोच नहीं कर रहा हूँ। महोदय, मैं उन्हें बताना चाहता हूँ कि मैं इतिहास का विद्यार्थी हूँ, मैं जम्मू-कश्मीर के इतिहास को भी जानता हूँ, इनके इतिहास को भी जानता हूँ और वर्तमान सुरक्षा परिवेश को भी जानता हूँ। *(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** सर, माननीय मंत्री जी बताना चाह रहे हैं, आप सुन लीजिए। *(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री सभापति:** एक सेकंड बैठिए। माननीय सदस्यगण, यदि किसी विषय पर एक प्रश्न है, तो यह मंत्री जी और माननीय सदस्य तय नहीं करेंगे कि क्या बोला जाएगा, बल्कि उस विषय पर ही बोला जाएगा और यह वह विषय नहीं है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... मंत्री जी, माननीय सदस्य जानना चाहते हैं कि पर्यटकों की सुरक्षा के लिए आपने क्या इंतजाम किए हैं। माननीय सदस्य, आप यही जानना चाहते हैं?

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय:** सभापति जी, वहाँ पर पूरा इंतजाम किया गया है। महोदय, अगर माननीय सदस्य जानना चाहते हैं और उनमें सुनने का धैर्य है, तो मैं भी बताना चाहूँगा, परंतु हमें थोड़ा-सा इतिहास में भी जाने की कोशिश करनी चाहिए। *(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** महोदय, टूरिज्म बढ़ा या घटा?

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय:** सभापति जी, टूरिज्म बढ़ा है।

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

महोदय, मैं बता रहा हूँ कि 2023 में 2 करोड़, 11 लाख पर्यटक गए हैं और यह नंबर क्रमबद्ध बढ़ रहा है। महोदय, कोविड के पूरे कालखंड में कुछ घटा था, लेकिन 2014 से लेकर 2023 और 2024, इन लगातार दो वर्षों में एक रिकॉर्ड बना है, इन दस वर्षों में रिकॉर्ड बना है। महोदय, 2004 से लेकर 2014 तक का जो इनका कालखंड था, ये उसको भी याद करें कि पर्यटक वहाँ पर जाने को कतराते थे और बिल्कुल नहीं जाते थे। महोदय, जहाँ तक सुरक्षा का सवाल है, तो मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि विगत कुछ दिनों में वहाँ पर 28 आतंकवादी मारे गए हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... महोदय, यह विषय दुख का है कि इन घटनाओं में, हमारी उन मुठभेड़ों में, हमारे कुछ फौजियों की भी मौत हुई है, जो दुखद है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... जो आतंकवादी मारे गए हैं, उनसे जो हमारे सैनिक मरे हैं, उनकी संख्या बहुत कम है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं इन्हें बताना चाहता हूँ कि ज़रा... ...**(व्यवधान)**... महोदय, दो मिनट का समय दिया जाए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... इन्होंने बहुत बड़ा विषय उठाया है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... महोदय, मैं इन्हें बताना चाहता हूँ कि 2004 से 2014 तक कुल 7,217 आतंकवादी घटनाएं हुई थीं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... 2014 से 21 जुलाई तक 2,259 घटनाएं हुई हैं, जो नहीं होनी चाहिए थीं, यह दुखद है, लेकिन इस पर वे राजनीति नहीं करें। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मोदी सरकार की आतंकवाद पर ज़ीरो टॉलरेंस है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... उसे समाप्त कर देंगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**... उसे समाप्त कर देंगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**... महोदय, या तो वह जेल में रहेगा, नहीं तो वह जहन्नुम में रहेगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं यह बिल्कुल आश्वस्त करना चाहता हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**... महोदय, ज़रा देख लीजिए, उस समय नागरिकों और सिक्योरिटी परसन्स की जो कुल मृत्यु हुई थी, दोनों मिलाकर इनके जमाने में, 2004 से 2014 तक 2,829 हुई थीं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... इन दस वर्षों में 2014 से 2021 तक 941 हुई हैं, जिसमें 67 प्रतिशत की कमी आई है और जो इनके दस वर्ष थे और जो मोदी सरकार के दस वर्ष हैं, उनमें अपराधिक घटनाओं में 69 प्रतिशत की कमी आई थी। ...**(व्यवधान)**... नागरिकों की मृत्यु में 80 प्रतिशत की कमी आई है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... धारा 370 हटने के बाद, लगभग 900 आतंकवादियों को अपनी सेना ने, जम्मू-कश्मीर पुलिस और पैरामिलिट्री फोर्स ने मारा है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... जब ये सुरक्षा की बात करते हैं, तो आतंकवाद की नींव तो 15 अगस्त, 1947 को देश के बंटवारे के साथ रख दी गई थी। ...**(व्यवधान)**... जिस समय इन लोगों ने धारा 370 लागू की थी, आतंकवाद की बुनियाद... ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Supplementary No. 5. ...*(Interruptions)*... You have made your point.

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय:** आज वहाँ व्यवस्था है, आज वहाँ उद्योग लग रहे हैं, स्कूल खुले हैं, कॉलेज खुले हैं, अस्पताल में मरीजों का इलाज हो रहा है, बागवानी अच्छे से हो रही है, सड़कें बनाई जा रही हैं और लोग वहाँ चैन के वातावरण में जिंदगी जी रहे हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... शांति है, सुरक्षा की पूरी गारंटी है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... आज आतंकवादियों ने जो भी पहल शुरू की है, वह जल्द समाप्त हो जाएगी। ...**(व्यवधान)**... जैसे बुझता हुआ दीपक फड़फड़ाता है, वैसे ही बुझने के समय आतंकवादी आज अपनी गतिविधियों को जारी करके देखना चाहते हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... आज हम बताना चाहते हैं कि उनके मंसूबे पूरे नहीं होंगे, लेकिन इनसे आग्रह जरूर है कि देश की सुरक्षा के संबंध में,

सीमा की सुरक्षा के संबंध में और आतंकवाद को समाप्त करने के संबंध में ये राजनीति नहीं करें, वोट का लालच न करें।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, Shri Praful Patel. ...*(Interruptions)*... One minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please take your seat. I have to act as per rules. Please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have no doubt that every Member of this House and the entire country is with our Armed Forces. We are in one voice with them. Now, Shri Praful Patel.

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: Sir, the question is related to tourism. Let us keep the temperature of the House like the beautiful weather of Kashmir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is what I said. I have already asked to keep the temperature of air conditioning a little lower so that we are cooler. Your suggestion should have come early in the morning. It is slightly late but don't generate more heat now. Am I right, Sir? Please go ahead.

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: Sir, the question is related to tourism, and, therefore, I will restrict myself to tourism.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am so happy.

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: So, I will not increase the temperature of the House by asking anything else. I will ask only my question and give some suggestion.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Suggestions will come during Budget speech and question will come now.

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: My question is that after the two crore tourist numbers of last year, which is a very satisfying and a good number, we should all be very happy and proud that Kashmir is receiving more than two crore tourists in a year, which helps the economy of Jammu and Kashmir and it is good for the people of Kashmir. After all, they are our citizens. They are patriotic as much as any other Indian.

MR. CHAIRMAN: And your supplementary?



SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: Therefore, it is our duty and the Government of India's duty to see that tourism increases in Jammu and Kashmir.

सर, आर्टिकल 370 के रद्द होने के बाद, वहां पर जमीन खरीदना या और लोगों का वहां पर बसना अब संभव हो चुका है। आज जब हम कश्मीर में 2 करोड़ से 4 करोड़ या जितनी भी मात्रा में टूरिज़्म बढ़ाना चाहते हैं, तो हमको वहां पर हर श्रेणी के होटलों की ज्यादा आवश्यकता होगी। ...**(व्यवधान)**... दूसरी ओर, हमको वहां पर्यटन बढ़ाने के लिए वहां की जो सुंदर-सुंदर नैसर्गिक जगहें हैं, वहां जाने के लिए गडकरी जी के माध्यम से और अच्छी सड़कों की जरूरत है। इन दोनों जरूरतों के संबंध में भारत सरकार निश्चित रूप से बहुत कदम उठा रही है, इसमें मुझे कोई भी शक नहीं है, लेकिन वहां पर होटल्स ज्यादा बनें, हर श्रेणी के होटल्स बनें और सहजता से बनें ...**(व्यवधान)**... अच्छी सड़के बनें। मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि इसके लिए सरकार की ओर से क्या कदम उठाए जा रहे हैं और उनकी क्या राय है?

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय:** महोदय, पर्यटन को बढ़ावा देने के लिए सरकार ने अनेक कदम उठाए हैं, जैसे एक तो नीतिगत पहल की गई है, होम स्टे, पेइंग गेस्ट हाउस का प्रावधान किया गया है और हाउस बोट की भी व्यवस्था की गई है। वहां सीमावर्ती गांव में भी पर्यटन की सुविधा उपलब्ध कराई गई है। वहां गुलमर्ग गोंडोला जैसे कुछ प्रमुख चिन्हित क्षेत्र हैं। गुलमर्ग गोंडोला में वर्ष 2022 में 8,54,496 पर्यटक पहुंचे। वहां की आमदनी की बात भी कही गई। 2022 में 91 करोड़ और अब 2023 में 10,13,458 पर्यटकों के द्वारा 108 करोड़ राजस्व की प्राप्ति की गई है। सर, वहां ढांचागत विकास कार्य किए गए हैं। पटनीटॉप में भी विकास कार्य किए गए हैं। जम्मू में रोपवे बनाया गया है। जम्मू और श्रीनगर में युवक और युवतियों के लिए दो गॉल्फ कोर्स एवं जम्मू तवी में दो गॉल्फ कोर्स बनाए गए हैं, ताकि वह स्थान पर्यटकों और खिलाड़ियों को भी आकर्षित कर सके। प्रधान मंत्री पैकेज योजना के तहत वहां ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: He is replying correctly. Dr. John Brittas, the hon. Minister is responding pointedly. Listen to him. ...**(Interruptions)**... Please, go ahead.

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय:** सर, उन्होंने कहा कि वहां बढ़ावा देने के लिए आप क्या कर रहे हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... वहां कई राजमार्ग बन रहे हैं। टनल भी लगभग कम्प्लीट है, जिससे वहां दूरी काफी कम होगी। वहां जम्मू और कश्मीर को पर्यटन के लिए अनेकों सम्मान प्राप्त हुए हैं। गुलमर्ग बेस्ट एडवेंचर टूरिज़्म अवॉर्ड, गुरेज को बेस्ट ऑफबीट राष्ट्रीय पुरस्कार के साथ वहां डल झील के लाइट एंड साउंड शो को भी पुरस्कार मिला है। इससे वहां विश्वास बढ़ा है और वहां जी20 का भी कार्यक्रम हुआ था।

महोदय, जम्मू-कश्मीर की अर्थव्यवस्था का प्रमुख आधार पर्यटक बन गया है और वह लोगों को रोजगार प्रदान करता है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... जम्मू-कश्मीर के क्षेत्र में अब तक लगभग 5 लाख लोगों को पर्यटन के माध्यम से, पर्यटकों के माध्यम से सुविधा हुई है। वहां की अर्थव्यवस्था में पर्यटन का योगदान 2022-2023 में 17,522 करोड़ का था और पिछले तीन वर्षों के दौरान यह

वार्षिक औसत वृद्धि दर 15.13 प्रतिशत है। इसलिए वहां की अर्थव्यवस्था में पर्यटकों और पर्यटन का निश्चित रूप से बहुत बड़ा योगदान है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think you are satisfied. I think we can congratulate the hon. Minister for being so thorough with the reply. Now, Q. No.17. Shri Beedha Masthan Rao Yadav. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MUZIBULLA KHAN: Sir, ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I don't appreciate this. ...(*Interruptions*)... I don't appreciate this. ...(*Interruptions*)... Nothing will go on record. ...(*Interruptions*)... Hon. Member, don't force me. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please don't force me. ...(*Interruptions*).. This is not the way. You are in the Upper House. Always remember this. The world is looking at us. Shri Beedha Masthan Rao Yadav.

### Compensation to Fishermen

\*17. SHRI BEEDHA MASTHAN RAO YADAV: Will the Minister of FISHERIES, ANIMAL HUSBANDRY AND DAIRYING be pleased to state:

- (a) the details of all ongoing fishery disputes between Andhra Pradesh and Tamil Nadu;
- (b) whether Government has taken any steps for resolving these disputes in a smooth and timely manner;
- (c) if so, the details thereof and if not, the reasons therefor;
- (d) whether Government has provided any compensation to the fishermen who have suffered loss of livelihood as a result of these disputes; and
- (e) if so, the details thereof and if not, the reasons therefor?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FISHERIES, ANIMAL HUSBANDRY AND DAIRYING (SHRI GEORGE KURIAN): (a) to (e) A Statement is placed on the Table of the House.

### Statement

(a) to (c) It was informed by Government of Andhra Pradesh during the 11<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Standing Committee of the Southern Zonal Council held in Chennai on

27<sup>th</sup> September, 2019, that unauthorized entry and illicit fishing is done by Tamil Nadu fishing boats in the territorial waters of Andhra Pradesh, which is causing fishing disputes between Andhra Pradesh and Tamil Nadu. Subsequently, the deliberations on this matter were held during the 12<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Standing Committee of the Southern Zonal Council on 28<sup>th</sup> May, 2022 and the 30<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Southern Zonal Council held on 3<sup>rd</sup> September, 2022. The Inter-State Council Secretariat, Ministry of Home Affairs (ISCS, MHA) advised the Department of Fisheries, Ministry of Fisheries, Animal Husbandry and Dairying, Government of India (DoF, M/o FAH&D, Gol) to constitute a Regional Fisheries Management Council to address the inter-state fishing related issues.

The DoF, M/o FAH&D, Government of India vide its Order dated 29<sup>th</sup> March, 2023 has constituted three Regional Fisheries Management Councils (RFMCs), namely Western, Eastern and Southern RFMC to address the inter-state fishing disputes. These RFMCs are Co-Chaired by the Joint Secretary (Marine Fisheries), DoF, M/o FAH&D, Gol and the Secretary, in-charge of Department of Fisheries, concerned Coastal States/UTs on annual rotation basis. A representative from Indian Coast Guard is also one of the members of the each of the three RFMCs.

The Governments of Coastal States under three RFMCs, were requested by DoF, M/o FAH&D, Gol, to inform about any inter-state fishing disputes before scheduling the first joint meeting of the three Regional Fisheries Management Council (RFMCs). Subsequently, the first joint meeting of three RFMCs was held on 19<sup>th</sup> August, 2023, wherein, the Government of Andhra Pradesh informed about the un-authorized entry and illicit fishing even during the fishing ban period by Tamil Nadu fishing boats in the territorial waters of the State of Andhra Pradesh and that clashes occurred between fishermen of Tamil Nadu and local fishermen. It was also informed that the matter was raised with the Government of Tamil Nadu at the Secretariat level for resolution.

Subsequent to the first Joint RFMC meeting, Government of Andhra Pradesh in its letter dated 23<sup>rd</sup> August, 2023 requested Government of Tamil Nadu to communicate the date and time to conduct a joint meeting to resolve the issue. The Government of Tamil Nadu has issued an Order dated 31<sup>st</sup> January, 2024 to constitute a district level committee with the District Collectors and other officers from Thiruvallur, Chennai, Chengalpattu of Tamil Nadu and SPSR Nellore, Prakasam and Tirupati districts of Andhra Pradesh to sensitize the fishermen and sort out the fishing disputes between the fishermen of both the States.

The DoF, M/o FAH&D, Gol has approved a project with total outlay of Rs. 364.0 Crores under the Pradhan Mantri Matsya Sampada Yojana (PMMSY) for the National Rollout of Vessel Communication and Support System including installation of

transponders on 1,00,000 fishing vessels in all coastal States and Union Territories. The transponders are being fitted in the fishing vessels with 100% government assistance. The transponders have geo-fencing features to give alerts to the fishermen upon approaching to or crossing over the authorized areas of fishing under the jurisdiction of the concerned coastal state/UT to prevent cross border or unauthorized fishing.

(d) and (e) The DoF, M/o FAH&D, GoI, is taking several steps under the PMMSY towards providing financial assistance, which includes livelihood and nutritional support for socio-economically backward fishers, and also Group Accident Insurance Scheme coverage. Under the PMMSY, financial assistance is also provided for procurement of boats for better catch, nets, communication and tracking devices, safety kits to ensure safety of fishermen while at sea. To improve the value realization to fishers, financial support is provided under PMMSY for development of post-harvest and cold chain facilities, fish transport, fisheries infrastructure, fish market, value added enterprise units and such other activities. Besides, for conservation and sustainable development of fish resources governmental support is provided under PMMSY for installation of artificial reefs, sea-ranching etc.

SHRI BEEDHA MASTHAN RAO YADAV: Sir, thank you for giving me this opportunity. The Central Water Commission recommended opening up of the sea mouth near Rayadoruvu village of Andhra Pradesh. Can the Minister elaborate on whether these recommendations have been implemented? And if so, what are the details? Are there any specific legal or policy frameworks in place to address inter-State fishery disputes? If so, have these mechanisms been utilised in the case of Andhra Pradesh and Tamil Nadu? And what have been the outcomes? Despite an easy solution of dredging the side of Pulicat Lake of Andhra Pradesh, why has the Government not worked on the solution? Does the hon. Minister have any timeline for the completion of dredging works? Sir, for your kind information, I accompanied the former Fisheries Minister, Shri Purushottam Rupala, along with the Joint Secretary three months ago just before the elections. He personally spoke to the fishermen of both the States and he promised them that the dispute will be resolved immediately and justice will be done. The only problem is the necessary funding to dredging the Pulicat Lake. The Government of India recommended 50:50 sharing of funds. Since it is an inter-State project, let the Government of India take up the project fully and do justice to the fishermen of both the States.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Second supplementary. Shri Beedha Masthan Rao Yadav.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, the answer.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Jairam, I will plead with you. Listen to the answer.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, the answer.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let me judge it. I am here to judge it. If there will be no answer, you have a mechanism. Avail it. Every time, don't intervene. It is not a good habit.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, I have a right to...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. If you have a right, go according to the rules. You have no right the way you are doing it. Sitting in your chair and intervening every time is inappropriate. ...*(Interruptions)*... No. I don't. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Second supplementary. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Soul-search and reflect. Only then will you try to understand what I am saying. Second supplementary.

SHRI BEEDHA MASTHAN RAO YADAV: Sir, during the visit of the former Minister, Shri Purushottam Rupala, to these two States, he promised that he would talk to both the Chief Ministers of the respective States and find a solution. But so far, nothing happened. Sir, please let the Minister explain about it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Minister.

**मत्स्यपालन, पशुपालन और डेयरी मंत्री (श्री राजीव रंजन सिंह उर्फ ललन सिंह):** सभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्य ने आंध्र प्रदेश और तमिलनाडु के बीच सीमा का जो विवाद है, उसके बारे में प्रश्न पूछा है। आंध्र प्रदेश के मछुआरे कभी तमिलनाडु चले जाते हैं, कभी तमिलनाडु के मछुआरे आंध्र प्रदेश की बाउंड्री में आ जाते हैं, यह विवाद बहुत पहले से चल रहा है, 2019 से चल रहा है। पहले ज़ोनल लेवल पर एक कमिटी थी - Southern Zonal Committee. उस कमिटी के अंदर इन विवादों पर चर्चा होती थी और उनका निराकरण होता था, जिसमें सभी राज्य शामिल रहते थे। इसकी कई बैठकें हुईं; 27 सितंबर, 2019 को हुई; फिर 28 मई, 2022 को हुई; फिर 3 सितंबर, 2022 को हुई। उसके बाद गृह मंत्रालय के परामर्श पर एक Regional Fisheries Management Committee का निर्माण हुआ। 29 मार्च, 2023 को इसका निर्माण हुआ और उसके बाद Regional Fisheries Management Committee को तीन ज़ोन्स में बाँटा गया। उन तीनों

जोन्स के लिए Western, Eastern और Southern, तीन RFMC कमिटियाँ बनाई गई हैं। इसके साथ-साथ स्टेट लेवल पर भी, जैसा माननीय सदस्य ने पूछा कि राज्य के स्तर पर भी - तमिलनाडु और आंध्र प्रदेश की सरकारों के बीच भी इस विषय पर चर्चा हो रही है। आंध्र प्रदेश की सरकार ने तमिलनाडु की सरकार को लिखा और तमिलनाडु की सरकार के निर्देश और उन दोनों की सहमति से कई जिलों में कलक्टर्स की अध्यक्षता में दोनों राज्यों के अधिकारियों की समिति बनी और उस समिति में इन सारे विवादों पर चर्चा हो रही है, यह सत्य है।

उसके अलावा लगभग 1 लाख फिशिंग वेसल्स ऐसे हैं, जिनमें अब मंत्रालय की तरफ से ट्रांसपोंडर में जियो फिशिंग की भी सुविधा दी गई है। जैसे ही कोई मछुआरा अपने राज्य की बाउंडरी को क्रॉस करता है, वह सिगनल देता है। लेकिन उसके बावजूद भी विवाद है और उस विवाद का निराकरण Regional Fisheries Management Committee के स्तर पर किया जा रहा है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri P. Wilson; third supplementary.

SHRI P. WILSON: Sir, you would have seen that there is periodical firing and securing of the Tamil fishermen even when they undertake fishing within the territorial waters of India. In fact, on July 11<sup>th</sup>, about 22 Tamil fishermen were arrested; on 19<sup>th</sup> June, four Tamil fishermen were arrested. The Sri Lankan Navy claims that 200 Indian fishermen were arrested and imprisoned, and about 27 trawlers were seized. One report says that 15 Tamil fishermen are still languishing in jail and 162 fishing boats are still under the control of Sri Lankan Navy. My question is: What steps are you taking in respect of Sri Lanka? Are you taking any steps to get them released immediately or taking any steps to negotiate and give legal advice? In fact, three fishermen were even sentenced to jail. They have to undergo trial and are still languishing in jail. Please explain that to this House. Our Chief Minister, Mr. M.K. Stalin, has written several letters, every now and then, bringing to your notice periodical firing and securing of the Indian Tamil fishermen and keeping them in jail for long period. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Member, the question relates to compensation to fishermen but the hon. Minister may address this issue if he likes.

**श्री राजीव रंजन सिंह उर्फ ललन सिंह:** सभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्य ने जो सवाल उठाया है, ऐसा कई बार होता है। हमारे मछुआरे श्रीलंका की सीमा में चले जाते हैं और श्रीलंका के मछुआरे हमारी सीमा में चले आते हैं, लेकिन इन विवादों पर एक joint working group है, जिसके माध्यम से श्रीलंका के साथ बातचीत करके इन समस्याओं का समाधान समय-समय पर होता रहता है। वर्तमान मामले पर भी joint working committee इस पर विचार करेगी। विदेश मंत्रालय

के अधीन ये सारी joint working committees हैं, groups हैं, जो बन कर इन पर चर्चा करती रहती हैं। माननीय सदस्य जो सवाल उठा रहे हैं, उसका joint working committee भी जरूर नोटिस लेगी।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Fourth supplementary; Shrimati Sulata Deo.

SHRIMATI SULATA DEO: Thank you so much, Sir.

सर, मैं ओडिशा को belong करती हूँ। हमारे ओडिशा की 430 किलोमीटर लम्बी coastal line है। अभी मछुआरों के बारे में जो बात की जा रही है, मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहती हूँ कि जो 'प्रधानमंत्री मत्स्य संपदा योजना' में ट्रांसपोंडर लगाने के लिए, 1 लाख ट्रांसपोंडर्स की व्यवस्था है, तो ओडिशा की coastal line में कितने मछुआरों के vessels में वह tracking device लगाने को मिला है और मछुआरों के ऐसे कितने traditional vessels हैं, जिनके upgradation के लिए कितना पैसा मिला है? सर, मैं आपके माध्यम से इसका to the point answer माननीय मंत्री से जानना चाहती हूँ। थैंक यू। जय जगन्नाथ।

**श्री राजीव रंजन सिंह उर्फ ललन सिंह:** माननीय सभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्या ने बहुत अच्छा सवाल पूछा है। मत्स्य उत्पादन के क्षेत्र में आदरणीय प्रधान मंत्री जी की सरकार ने पिछले 10 वर्षों में जो उपलब्धि हासिल की और माननीय सदस्या जिस 'प्रधान मंत्री मत्स्य सम्पदा योजना' की बात कह रही हैं, उसने उत्पादन के क्षेत्र में क्रांति लाने का काम किया है। महोदय, अगर मैं बताऊँ, तो 1950-51 से लेकर 2013 के अंत तक इस देश का जो मत्स्य उत्पादन था, वह लगभग 61.36 लाख टन था और 2014 से लेकर 2023 तक हमारा मत्स्य उत्पादन 121.12 लाख टन हो गया है, जो लगभग दोगुने के बराबर है। यह प्रधान मंत्री नरेन्द्र मोदी जी के नेतृत्व वाली सरकार के द्वारा मत्स्य उत्पादन को कृषि के साथ जोड़ने वाली क्रांतिकारी कदम का ही परिणाम है कि आज हम इतने बड़े पैमाने पर मत्स्य उत्पादन कर रहे हैं।

सभापति महोदय, आज हम विदेशों में 63 हजार करोड़ रुपए के मछली का सालाना एक्सपोर्ट कर रहे हैं। आज मत्स्य उत्पादन के क्षेत्र में विश्व में हमारा दूसरा स्थान है। माननीय सदस्या ने ओडिशा के बारे में एक लाख वैसल्स पर transponder, signaling system की जो बात की है, उनको इसकी जानकारी उपलब्ध कराई जाएगी कि ओडिशा में ऐसे कितने transponder हैं।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Saket Gokhale, fifth supplementary.

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: Thank you, Sir. This question pertains very specifically to the subject of compensation for traditional farmers.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes.

**श्री साकेत गोखले:** सर, उन्होंने टूरिज़्म पर कश्मीरी पंडित बोला, लेकिन आप हमेशा मुझे रोकते हैं। ठीक है, सर, कोई बात नहीं।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Saket, please confine to your supplementary, you would get a good answer.

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: You would not even let me finish, Sir. सर, आप मुझे बिना टॉपिक बोल देते हैं।

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. You talked of '*Kashmiri Pandits*'. Please.

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: Anyway, my question is this. I will introduce it in two sentences. In 2019, the United States banned imports of wild-caught shrimp from India. This ban has been in place for the last five years now. Due to this, the fishermen across the coastal areas, especially, of Southern and Eastern India, are forced to sell their wild-caught shrimp to other countries at much lower prices. So, my question is: "What steps is the Ministry taking to compensate fishermen who have been affected by the five year long shrimp ban that has been imposed by the United States?" Thank you, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is a very unique concept of compensation. Hon. Minister may respond.

**श्री राजीव रंजन सिंह उर्फ ललन सिंह:** सर, माननीय सदस्य ने श्रिम्प के बारे में जानना चाहा है। मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि आज हम जो फिश का एक्सपोर्ट कर रहे हैं, उसमें मैक्सिमम हिस्सेदारी श्रिम्प का है और श्रिम्प की हिस्सेदारी ही हमारे एक्सपोर्ट को बढ़ा रही है, लेकिन हम वैल्यू एडिशन श्रिम्प को विदेशों में एक्सपोर्ट करें, इसके लिए हम लोग कार्रवाई कर रहे हैं।

फिशरमेन के वेलफेयर की जो बात उन्होंने कही है, उस संबंध में मैं यह बताना चाहता हूँ कि 'प्रधान मंत्री मत्स्य सम्पदा योजना' में आज जो फिशरमेन हैं या जिसको हम लोग फिश फार्मर्स कहते हैं, उन फिशरमेन या फिश फार्मर्स के लिए प्रधान मंत्री जी ने 'किसान क्रेडिट कार्ड' की योजना शुरू की है और इसके लिए किसानों के लगभग 4,26,134 एप्लिकेशन्स स्वीकृत हुए तथा इसके लिए 2477.95 करोड़ रुपए रिलीज किये जा चुके हैं। आकस्मिक परिस्थिति में जो दुर्घटनाएँ होती थीं, उनके लिए आदरणीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने फिशरमेन को बीमा कवर से भी जोड़ने का काम किया है। आदरणीय प्रधान मंत्री नरेन्द्र मोदी जी के द्वारा ये जो सारे काम किए गए हैं, उन्हीं का यह परिणाम है कि आज हमारा मछली उत्पादन बढ़ रहा है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Q.No. 18, Dr. Sikander Kumar, first supplementary.



### Yuva Sahakar Scheme in Himachal Pradesh

\*18. DR. SIKANDER KUMAR: Will the Minister of COOPERATION be pleased to state:

- (a) whether National Cooperative Development Corporation (NCDC) is giving opportunities to Indian cooperative entrepreneurs under Yuva Sahakar Scheme for attracting cooperative business ventures in Himachal Pradesh;
- (b) if so, the details thereof;
- (c) the details of funds sanctioned and disbursed to Himachal Pradesh in the current year;
- (d) the number of beneficiaries who benefitted from this scheme till date; and
- (e) the steps taken by Government for development of cooperatives in the country?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF COOPERATION (SHRI MURLIDHAR MOHOL): (a) to (e) A statement is laid on the table of the House.

#### Statement

(a) and (b) Yes, “Yuva Sahakar — Cooperative Enterprise Support and Innovation Scheme” is being implemented by National Cooperative Development Corporation (NCDC) across the country including the state of Himachal Pradesh, with the aim to encourage newly formed cooperative societies with new and/or innovative ideas. The scheme encourages young entrepreneur Cooperative Societies which are in operation for a minimum of 3 months. The loan provided under the scheme is a long term loan (up to 5 years) and as an incentive, NCDC provides 2% interest subvention on its applicable rate of interest on term loan for the project activities. Further, the loan component under the scheme can also be dovetailed with subsidy, as applicable and available from other Government of India schemes.

(c) NCDC funding is project based. Till date, no proposal has been received from any cooperative in Himachal Pradesh under Yuva Sahakar Scheme.

(d) As on 30/06/2024, NCDC has sanctioned financial assistance of Rs.4,556.55 lakh to cooperatives across the country, under Yuva Sahakar scheme, with more than 14,000 beneficiary members and released assistance of Rs.248.35 lakh.

(e) Ministry of Cooperation with active participation of various States/ UTs has taken various initiatives to revitalize and strengthen the cooperative sector across the country, the details of which are enclosed at ***Annexure***.

## **Annexure**

### **Brief of 54 initiatives taken by Ministry of Cooperation**

Ministry of Cooperation, since its inception on 6<sup>th</sup> July, 2021, has undertaken several initiatives to realize the vision of “Sahakar-se-Samridhi” and to strengthen & deepen the cooperative movement from Primary to Apex level Cooperatives in the country. List of initiatives taken and progress made so far are as follows:

#### **A. Making Primary Cooperatives economically vibrant and transparent**

1. **Model Bye-Laws for PACS making them multipurpose, multidimensional and transparent entities:** Government, in consultation with all the stakeholders, including States/ UTs, National Level Federations, State Cooperative Banks (StCBs), District Central Cooperative Banks (DCCBs), etc., has prepared and circulated Model Byelaws for PACS to all the States/ UTs, which enable PACS to undertake more than 25 business activities, improve governance, transparency and accountability in their operations. Provisions have also been made to make the membership of PACS more inclusive and broad-based, giving adequate representation to women and Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes. So far, 32 States/ UTs have adopted Model Byelaws or their existing byelaws are in line with Model Byelaws.
2. **Strengthening of PACS through Computerization:** In order to strengthen PACS, project for Computerization of functional PACS with a total financial outlay of ₹2,516 Crore has been approved by the Government of India, which entails bringing all functional PACS in the Country onto a common ERP based national software, linking them with NABARD through StCBs and DCCBs. A total of 67,009 PACS from 30 States/ UTs have been sanctioned under the project. The hardware has been procured by 28 States/UTs. Total 25,674 PACS have been onboarded on ERP Software and 15,207 PACS have gone live.
3. **Establishing New Multipurpose PACS/Dairy/Fishery Cooperatives in uncovered Panchayats:** The plan for establishing new multipurpose PACS or primary dairy/fisheries cooperatives covering all the Panchayats/villages in the next five

years, with support of NABARD, NDDB, NFDB, NCDC and other National level Federations has been approved by the Government. As per National Cooperative Database, a total of 6,844 new PACS, Dairy and Fishery cooperative societies have been registered across States/UTs.

4. **World's Largest Decentralized Grain Storage Plan in Cooperative sector:** Government has approved a plan to create warehouses, custom hiring centers, primary processing units and other agri infrastructure for grain storage at PACS level, through convergence of various GOI schemes, including AIF, AMI, SMAM, PMFME, etc. This will reduce wastage of food grains and transportation costs, enable farmers to realize better prices for their produce and meet various agricultural needs at the PACS level itself. Under the Pilot Project, godowns have been constructed in 11 PACS of 11 States and the Pilot is now being extended to 500 additional PACS.
5. **PACS as Common Service Centers (CSCs) for better access to e-services:** An MoU has been signed between Ministry of Cooperation, MeitY, NABARD and CSC e-Governance Services India Limited for providing more than 300 e-services such as banking, insurance, Aadhar enrolment/updation, health services, PAN card and IRCTC/ Bus/ Air ticket, etc. through PACS. So far, 37,169 PACS have started providing CSC services to rural citizens which will also result in increase in income of these PACS.
6. **Formation of new Farmer Producer Organizations (FPOs) by PACS:** Government has allowed 1,100 additional FPOs to be formed by PACS with the support of NCDC, in those blocks where FPOs have not yet been formed or the blocks are not covered by any other implementing agency. Apart from this, 992 FPOs have been formed in the cooperative sector by NCDC. This will be helpful in providing farmers with necessary market linkages and get fair and remunerative prices for their produce.
7. **PACS given priority for Retail Petrol/Diesel outlets:** Government has allowed PACS to be included in the Combined Category 2 (CC2) for allotment of retail petrol/ diesel outlets. As per information received from Oil Marketing Companies (OMCs), more than 270 PACS from 25 States/UTs have applied online for retail petrol/ diesel outlets.
8. **PACS given permission to convert bulk consumer petrol pumps into retail outlets:** Based on the discussions with the Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas, guidelines have been issued to convert the existing bulk consumer licensee PACS into retail outlets for increasing the profit of PACS and generate employment opportunities in rural areas. 109 PACS from 4 States having

wholesale consumer pumps have given consent for conversion into Retail Outlets, out of which 43 PACS have received Letter of Intent (LOI) from the OMCs.

9. **PACS eligible for LPG Distributorship for diversifying its activities:** Government has now allowed PACS to apply for LPG Distributorships. This will give PACS an option to increase their economic activities and create new employment opportunities in rural areas. From four States/Union Territories, a total of 31 PACS have submitted online applications.
10. **PACS as PM Bhartiya Jan Aushadhi Kendra for improving access to generic medicines at rural level:** Government is promoting PACS to operate Pradhan Mantri Bhartiya Janaushadhi Kendras which will provide additional income source to them and ease the access to generic medicines for rural citizens. So far, 4,341 PACS/ cooperative societies have applied online for PM Bhartiya Janaushadhi Kendras, out of which 2,594 PACS have been given initial approval by PMBI and 674 have received drug licences from State Drug Controllers which are ready to function as PM Bhartiya Jan Aushadhi Kendras.
11. **PACS as Pradhan Mantri Kisan Samridhhi Kendras (PMKSK):** Government is promoting PACS to operate PMKSK for ensuring easy accessibility of fertilizer & related services to farmers in the country. As per the information shared by States/ UTs, 38,141 PACS are functioning as PMKSK.
12. **Convergence of PM-KUSUM at PACS level:** Farmers associated with PACS can adopt solar agricultural water pumps and install photovoltaic modules in their farms.
13. **PACS to carry out O&M of rural piped water supply schemes (PWS):** In order to utilize the deep reach of PACS in rural areas, on the initiative of the Ministry of Cooperation, Ministry of Jal Shakti has made PACS as eligible agencies to carry out the Operations & Maintenance (O&M) of PWS in rural areas. As per information received from States/ UTs, 1,833 PACS have been identified/ selected by 16 States/ UTs to provide O&M services at Panchayat/ Village level.
14. **Micro-ATMs to Bank Mitra Cooperative Societies for providing doorstep financial services:** Dairy and Fisheries cooperative societies can be made Bank Mitras of DCCBs and StCBs. To ensure their ease of doing business, transparency and financial inclusion, Micro-ATMs are also being given to these Bank Mitra Co-operative Societies with support from NABARD to provide 'Door-step Financial Services'. As a pilot project, about 2,700 Micro-ATMs have been distributed to Bank Mitra cooperative societies in Panchmahal and Banaskantha Districts of

Gujarat. This initiative is now being implemented in all the Districts of the State of Gujarat.

15. **Rupay Kisan Credit Card to Members of Milk Cooperatives:** In order to expand the reach of DCCBs/ StCBs and to provide necessary liquidity to the members of Dairy Cooperative societies, Rupay Kisan Credit Cards (KCCs) are being distributed to the members of cooperatives for providing credit at comparatively lower interest rates and to enable them to carry out other financial transactions. So far, 48,000 Rupay KCC have been distributed in Panchmahal and Banaskantha Districts of Gujarat. This initiative is now being implemented in all the Districts of the State of Gujarat.
16. **Formation of Fish Farmer Producer Organization (FFPO):** In order to provide market linkage and processing facilities to fishermen, NCDRC has registered 69 FFPOs in the initial phase. In addition, Department of Fisheries, Government of India has allocated the work of converting 1000 existing fisheries cooperative societies into FFPOs to NCDRC, with an approved outlay of Rs. 225.50 crore.

**B. Strengthening the Urban and Rural Cooperative Banks**

17. **UCBs have been allowed to open new branches to expand their business:** UCBs can now open new branches up to 10% (maximum 5 branches) of the existing number of branches in the previous financial year without prior approval of RBI.
18. **UCBs have been allowed by RBI to offer doorstep services to their customers:** Door step banking facility can now be provided by UCBs. Account holders of these banks can now avail various banking facilities at home such as cash withdrawal, cash deposit, KYC, demand draft and life certificate for pensioners, etc.
19. **Cooperative banks have been allowed to make one-time settlement of outstanding loans, like Commercial Banks:** Co-operative banks, through board-approved policies, can now provide the process for settlement with borrowers, along with technical write-off.
20. **Time limit increased to achieve Priority Sector Lending (PSL) targets given to UCBs:** RBI has extended the timeline for UCBs to achieve Priority Sector Lending (PSL) targets by two years i.e., up to March 31, 2026.
21. **A Nodal Officer designated in RBI for regular interaction with UCBs:** In order to meet the long pending demand of the cooperative sector for closer coordination and focused interaction, RBI has notified a nodal officer.

22. **Individual housing loan limit more than doubled by RBI for Rural and Urban Cooperative Banks:**
  - a. Housing loan limit of Urban Cooperative Banks has now been doubled from Rs. 30 lakhs to Rs. 60 lakhs.
  - b. Housing loan limit of Rural Cooperative Banks has been increased to two and a half times to Rs. 75 lakhs.
23. **Rural Cooperative Banks will now be able to lend to commercial real estate/ residential housing sector, thereby diversifying their business:** This will not only help Rural Cooperative Banks to diversify their business, but will benefit Housing cooperative societies also.
24. **License fee reduced for Cooperative Banks:** License fee for onboarding Cooperative Banks to 'Aadhaar Enabled Payment System' (AePS) has been reduced by linking it to the number of transactions. Cooperative financial institutions will also be able to get the facility free of cost for the first three months of the pre-production phase. With this, farmers will now be able to get the facility of banking at their home with through biometrics.
25. **Non-scheduled UCBs, StCBs and DCCBs notified as Member Lending Institutions (MLIs) in CGTMSE Scheme to increase the share of cooperatives in lending:** Cooperative banks will now be able to take advantage of risk coverage up to 85 percent on the loans given. Also, cooperative sector enterprises will also be able to get collateral free loans from cooperative banks now.
26. **Notification of Scheduling norms for including Urban Cooperative Banks:** UCBs that meet the 'Financially Sound and Well Managed' (FSWM) criteria and have maintained the minimum deposits required for classification as Tier 3 for the last two years are now eligible to be included in Schedule II of the Reserve Bank of India Act, 1934 and get 'Scheduled' status.
27. **Monetary ceiling doubled by RBI for Gold Loan:** RBI has doubled monetary ceiling from Rs. 2 lakhs to Rs.4 lakh, for those UCBs that meet the PSL targets.
28. **Umbrella Organization for Urban Cooperative Banks:** RBI has accorded approval to the National Federation of Urban Co-operative Banks and Credit Societies Ltd. (NAFCUB) for the formation of an Umbrella Organization (UO) for the UCB sector, which will provide necessary IT infrastructure and operational support to around 1,500 UCBs.

**C. Relief to Cooperative Societies in the Income Tax Act**

29. **Surcharge reduced from 12 % to 7% for co-operative societies having income between Rs. 1 to 10 Cr.:** This will reduce the burden of Income Tax on Cooperative Societies and more capital will be available with them to work for the benefit of their members.
30. **MAT reduced for cooperatives from 18.5% to 15%:** With this provision, now there is parity between Cooperative Societies and Companies in this regard.
31. **Relief in cash transactions under section 269ST of the Income Tax Act:** In order to remove difficulties in cash transactions by cooperatives under Section 269ST of IT Act, Government has issued a clarification that cash transaction of less than Rs. 2 lakhs done by a cooperative society with its distributor in a day will be considered separately, and will not be charged with income tax penalty.
32. **Tax cut for new manufacturing Cooperative societies:** Government has decided that a flat lower tax rate of 15% will be charged, compared to an earlier rate of up to 30% plus surcharge, for new cooperatives commencing manufacturing activities by March 31, 2024. This will encourage the formation of new cooperative societies in the manufacturing sector.
33. **Increase in limit of Cash Deposits and Cash Loans by PACS and PCARDBs:** Government has enhanced the limit for Cash Deposits and Cash Loans by PACS and Primary Cooperative Agriculture and Rural Development Banks (PCARDBs) from Rs. 20,000 to Rs. 2 lakh per member. This provision will facilitate their activities, increase their business and benefit members of their societies.
34. **Increase in the limit of Tax Deducted at Source (TDS) in Cash Withdrawal:** Government has increased the cash withdrawal limit of cooperative societies without deduction of tax at source from Rs.1 crore to Rs.3 crore per year. This provision will save Tax Deducted at Source (TDS) for cooperative societies, which will enhance their liquidity.

**D. Revival of Cooperative Sugar Mills**

35. **Relief from Income Tax to Sugar Cooperative Mills:** Government has issued a clarification that cooperative sugar mills would not be subjected to additional income tax for paying higher sugarcane prices to farmers up to Fair and Remunerative or State Advised Price, from April, 2016 onwards.
36. **Resolution of decades old pending issues related to Income Tax of Sugar Cooperative Mills:** Government has made a provision in its Union Budget 2023-24, wherein Sugar cooperatives have been allowed to claim as expenditure their

payments to sugarcane farmers for the period prior to assessment year 2016–17, giving them a relief of more than Rs.10,000 crore.

37. **Rs. 10,000 crore loan schemes launched for strengthening of Sugar Cooperative Mills:** Government has launched a scheme through NCDC for setting up ethanol plants or cogeneration plants or for working capital or for all three purposes. Loan amount of Rs. 5746.76 cr. has been sanctioned by NCDC to 36 Cooperative Sugar Mills so far.
38. **Preference to Cooperative Sugar Mills in purchase of ethanol:** Cooperative Sugar Mills have now been put at par with private companies for ethanol procurement by Government of India under the Ethanol Blending Programme (EBP).
39. **Reduction in GST on molasses from 28% to 5%:** Government has decided to reduce the GST on molasses from 28% to 5% which will enable cooperative sugar mills to earn more profits for their members by selling molasses to distilleries with higher margins.

#### E. Three new National Level Multi-State Societies

40. **New National Multi-State Cooperative Seed Society for certified seeds:** Government has established a new apex multi-state cooperative seed society under the MSCS Act, 2002, namely Bharatiya Beej Sahakari Samiti Limited (BBSSL) as an umbrella organization for quality seed cultivation, production and distribution under a single brand. BBSSL so far has planted breeder seeds of Wheat, Mustard, and Pulses (Gram, Pea) on 366 Hectare land during Rabi season. Similarly, during Kharif season breeder seeds of Paddy, Moong, Soyabean, Groundnut, Jowar and Guar have been planted on 148.26 Hectare land. As on date 11714 PACS/ Cooperative Societies have become member of BBSSL.
41. **New National Multi-State Cooperative Organic Society for organic farming:** Government has established a new apex multi-state cooperative organic society under the MSCS Act, 2002, namely National Cooperative Organics Limited (NCOL) as an umbrella organization to produce, distribute and market certified and authentic organic products. As on date 3,775 PACS/ cooperative societies have become member of NCOL. So far, 12 organic products have been launched by NCOL under “Bharat Organics” brand.
42. **New National Multi-State Cooperative Export Society for promoting exports:** Government has established a new apex multi-state cooperative export society



under the MSCS Act, 2002, namely National Cooperative Export Limited (NCEL) as an umbrella organization to give thrust to exports from cooperative sector. As on date, *about 7700 PACS/ cooperative societies* have become member of NCEL. *A total of 8,15,007 metric tonnes of commodities have been exported by NCEL. Out of which 8,01,790 metric tonnes of rice, 7,685 metric tonnes of onions, 4507 metric tonnes of sugar, 1025 metric tonnes of wheat have been exported.*

#### **F. Capacity Building in Cooperatives**

43. **Promotion of training and awareness through National Council for Cooperative Training (NCCT):** By increasing its reach, NCCT has conducted 3,619 training programs and provided training to 2,21,478 participants in FY 2023-24. From April to June 2024, NCCT has conducted 494 programmes against the quarterly target of 435 programmes and trained 19,591 participants against the target of 10875 participants.
44. **Establishment of the Cooperative University :** Cabinet Note has been prepared by Ministry of Cooperation for setting up of a National Cooperative University for Cooperative education, training, consultancy, research and development and a sustainable and quality supply of trained manpower.

#### **G. Use of Information Technology for 'Ease of Doing Business'**

45. **Computerization of the Central Registrar's Office:** Central Registrar's office has been computerized to create a digital ecosystem for Multi-State Cooperative Societies, which will assist in processing applications and service requests in a time bound manner.
46. **Scheme for computerization of office of RCSs in States and Union Territories:** To increase 'Ease of doing businesses for Cooperative Societies and create a digital ecosystem for transparent paperless regulation in all the States/ Union Territories, a Centrally Sponsored Project for computerization of RCS Offices has been approved by the Government. Grants will be provided for purchase of hardware, development of software, etc. to the States/ UTs.
47. **Computerization of Agriculture and Rural Development Banks (ARDBs):** To strengthen the long-term cooperative credit structure, the project of computerization of 1,851 units of Agriculture and Rural Development Banks (ARDBs) spread across 13 States/ Union Territories has been approved by the

Government. NABARD is the implementing agency for the project and will develop a national level software for ARDBs. Hardware, support for digitization of legacy data, training to the employees, etc. will be provided under the project. So far, proposals from 10 States/UTs have been received and sanctioned. Further, GOI share amounting to Rs 4.26 crore was released to 8 States/UTs in FY 2023-24 and FY 2024-25 for procurement of hardware, digitization and setting up of support system.

#### H. Other Initiatives

48. **New National Cooperative Database for authentic and updated data repository:** A database of cooperatives in the country has been prepared with the support of State Governments to facilitate stakeholders in policy making and implementation of programmes/ schemes related to cooperatives across the country. So far, data of around 8.09 lakh cooperatives has been captured in the database.
49. **Formulation of New National Cooperative Policy:** A National level committee comprising 49 experts and stakeholders drawn from all over the Country has been constituted to formulate the New National Cooperative Policy for enabling a vibrant ecosystem to realize the vision of 'Sahakar-se-Samridhi'.
50. **Multi-State Co-operative Societies (Amendment) Act, 2023:** Amendment has been brought in the MSCS Act, 2002 to strengthen governance, enhance transparency, increase accountability, reform electoral process and incorporate provisions of 97<sup>th</sup> Constitutional Amendment in the Multi State Cooperative Societies.
51. **Inclusion of Cooperatives as 'buyers' on GeM portal:** Government has permitted cooperatives to register as 'buyer' on GeM, enabling them to procure goods and services from over 67 lakh vendors to facilitate economical purchases and greater transparency. So far, 559 cooperative societies have been onboarded on GeM as buyers.
52. **Expansion of National Cooperative Development Corporation (NCDC) to increase its range and depth:** NCDC has launched new schemes in various sectors such as 'Swayamshakti Sahkar' for SHGs; 'Deerghavadhi Krishak Sahkar' for long term agricultural credit and 'Dairy Sahkar' for dairy. Total financial assistance of Rs. 60,618.47 Crores has been disbursed by NCDC in FY 2023-24. NCDC has disbursed Rs.19,287.17 crore so far in the financial year 2024-25. Government of India has permitted NCDC to issue bonds worth ₹2000

crore with government guarantee, subject to the adherence of specified terms and conditions. Further, NCDC is setting up sub-offices in 6 North Eastern States — Arunachal Pradesh, Meghalaya, Mizoram, Manipur, Nagaland and Tripura with the objective of taking various national schemes to the cooperative societies at their doorstep.

53. **Financial assistance by NCDC for Deep Sea Trawlers:** NCDC is providing financial assistance for projects related to deep sea trawlers in coordination with the Department of Fisheries, Government of India. Various financial assistances have been sanctioned by NCDC such as; Rs. 11.55 crores for purchase of 14 deep sea trawlers in Maharashtra at a block cost of Rs 20.30 crores, Rs 37.39 crores to Rajmata Vikas Macchimar Sahakari Sanstha Limited, Mumbai for setting up a seafood processing unit at a Block Cost of Rs.46.74 crores, Rs. 32.69 crores for Integrated Fisheries Development Project (IFDP) of Government of Kerala and NCDC has sanctioned the proposal of Shri Mahavir Macchimar Sahakari Mandali Limited, Gujarat for purchasing 30 deep sea trawlers with a block cost of Rs.36.00 crores.
54. **Refund to Investors of Sahara Group of Societies:** A portal has been launched for making payments to the genuine depositors of the cooperative societies of Sahara Group in a transparent manner. Disbursements have already started after proper identification and submission of proof of their deposits and claims.

**डा. सिकंदर कुमार:** माननीय सभापति महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय सहकारिता मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि हिमाचल प्रदेश की सहकारी संस्थाओं और समितियों के उत्थान और सशक्तिकरण के लिए मंत्रालय ने क्या कदम उठाए हैं? दूसरा, हिमाचल प्रदेश की और देश की सहकारी प्राइमरी एग्रीकल्चर कोऑपरेटिव सोसाइटीज़ (पीएसीएस) के उत्थान के लिए सहकारिता मंत्रालय ने क्या कदम उठाए हैं, धन्यवाद।

**श्री सभापति:** माननीय मंत्री जी।

**श्री मुरलीधर मोहोल:** माननीय सभापति महोदय, सहकारिता मंत्रालय ने हिमाचल प्रदेश के सहकारी संस्थाओं और समितियों के उत्थान और सशक्तिकरण के लिए बहुत सारे कदम उठाए हैं। सहकारिता मंत्रालय द्वारा राष्ट्रीय सहकार विकास निगम के माध्यम से हिमाचल प्रदेश में विभिन्न सहकारी समितियों के विकास के लिए मार्केटिंग और इनपुट्स के लिए 218 करोड़ 46 लाख रुपये, इंडस्ट्रियल एंड सर्विस को-ऑपरेटिव को 300 करोड़ 38 लाख रुपये, आईसीडीपी के तहत 308 करोड़, 32 लाख रुपए सहित आज तक कुल लगभग 973 करोड़, 50 लाख रुपए से भी अधिक की वित्तीय सहायता प्रदान की गई है। सहकारिता मंत्रालय की केंद्रीय प्रायोजित परियोजना, पैक्स के तहत कंप्यूटराइजेशन के लिए हिमाचल प्रदेश से 870 पैक्स के प्रस्ताव स्वीकृत किए गए हैं।

हार्डवेयर की खरीद और डेटा के डिजिटलाइजेशन और सपोर्ट सिस्टम स्थापित करने के लिए भारत सरकार के हिस्से के 16 करोड़, 88 लाख रुपये भी अभी तक हिमाचल प्रदेश को जारी किए गए हैं। सहकारिता मंत्रालय ने हिमाचल प्रदेश के कृषि और ग्रामीण विकास बैंकों के ऑपरेशंस में सुधार लाने हेतु एआरडीबी के कंप्यूटराइजेशन की परियोजना के लिए भी अभी आर्थिक मदद की है।

माननीय सदस्य का दूसरा सवाल यह था कि पैक्स के लिए सहकारिता मंत्रालय ने क्या-क्या कदम उठाए हैं? मैं यहाँ निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि सहकारिता मंत्रालय ने देश में "सहकार से समृद्धि" की परिकल्पना को साकार करने के लिए 54 नए इनीशिएटिव्स लिए हैं। इनमें पैक्स को सशक्त करने के लिए जो काम करना चाहिए, उस पर जोर दिया गया है। पैक्स कंप्यूटराइजेशन, जिससे सभी कार्यशील पैक्स को ईआरपी आधारित सीएनएस पर लाकर राज्य सहकारी बैंक तथा जिला सहकारी बैंक के माध्यम से नाबार्ड से लिंक करना शुरू किया गया है। पैक्स के लिए मॉडल बाई लॉज तैयार किए गए हैं, जिससे वे अभी 25 से भी अधिक इकोनॉमिक एक्टिविटीज़ कर सकते हैं और अपने व्यवसाय में विविधता लाकर आर्थिक प्रगति कर पाएँगे।

पैक्स को सीएससी के रूप में कार्य करने के लिए सक्षम किया गया है, जिससे ग्रामीण जनता बैंकिंग, बीमा, आधार नामांकन, स्वास्थ्य आदि 300 से भी अधिक कानूनी सेवाएं प्राप्त कर सकती हैं। पैक्स अब प्रधान मंत्री किसान समृद्धि केंद्र के द्वारा फर्टिलाइजर्स और कीटनाशक वितरित कर सकेंगे और प्रधान मंत्री भारतीय जन औषधि केंद्र के रूप में जेनेरिक औषधि की उपलब्धता भी सुनिश्चित करेंगे। पैक्स ग्रामीण नल जल आपूर्ति योजना के तहत पानी समिति के रूप में भी कार्य कर सकते हैं। ऐसे अनेक कार्य सहकारिता मंत्रालय के द्वारा देश के ग्रामीण अर्थव्यवस्था को मजबूत करने हेतु किए जा रहे हैं।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Second Supplementary; Dr. Sikander Kumar.

**डा. सिकंदर कुमार:** सर, मेरा प्रश्न हो गया है।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Third Supplementary; Shrimati Rajani Ashokrao Patil.

**श्रीमती रजनी अशोकराव पाटिल:** सर, हिमाचल में सबसे ज्यादा सेब की मार्केट है। मंत्री जी हमारे महाराष्ट्र स्टेट से आते हैं। मैं आपके माध्यम से उनसे पूछना चाहती हूँ कि यह सेब की मार्केट एक ही इंडस्ट्रियलिस्ट के हाथ में है - अडाणी। क्या मंत्री जी उस मार्केट को सहकारिता के क्षेत्र में लाने के लिए कुछ प्रयास करेंगे?

**श्री सभापति:** माननीय मंत्री जी। यह एक रोचक प्रश्न है।

**श्री मुरलीधर मोहोल:** मैं रजनी ताई से...(व्यवधान)...

**श्रीमती रजनी अशोकराव पाटिल:** सर, ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** नहीं, आगे नहीं। I am on the murmur. ...(*Interruptions*)... माननीय मंत्री जी।

**श्री मुरलीधर मोहोल:** माननीया रजनी ताई हमारे महाराष्ट्र से आती हैं। मैं उनसे बाद में बात करके सभी डिटेल्स उनको दे दूँगा।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Fourth Supplementary; Dr. V. Sivadasan.

DR. V. SIVADASAN: Respected Mr. Chairman, Sir, in our nation, co-operative sector has given great contribution to the development of rural and urban areas. In the Yuva Sahakar Scheme, NCDC has sanctioned only Rs. 45 crores across the country. They told us about the scheme that there are 14,000 beneficiary members and released only Rs.2 crore 48 lakhs. This is a very pathetic situation. So my question is: Do you have any plan to give financial assistance to the State Government for supporting the cooperative sector in our nation?

**श्री मुरलीधर मोहोल:** महोदय, सहकारिता मंत्रालय द्वारा 54 नई पहलें, जिन पर हम काम कर रहे हैं, मुझे लगता है कि सहकारिता के माध्यम से हर एक क्षेत्र में अलग-अलग 54 पहलें जो हैं, उनमें बैंक, PACS, डेयरी, फिशियरीज आदि सभी क्षेत्रों को सक्षम करने के लिए एक योजना बनाई गई है। यहां मेरे पास डिटेल है, मुझे लगता है कि इस पर विस्तृत बात करनी पड़ेगी। मैं इसे पटल पर रखता हूँ और आपको भी ...(*व्यवधान*)...

DR. V. SIVADASAN: Sir, ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MURLIDHAR MOHOL: Okay. One minute. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Member, the hon. Minister is responding.

**श्री मुरलीधर मोहोल:** आपने यहां युवा सहकार योजना के बारे में जानकारी मांगी है, इस योजना के अंतर्गत कोई भी सहकारी समिति, जो innovative और मूल्य श्रृंखला बढ़ाने वाली परियोजना में कार्यरत है, वित्तीय सहायता प्राप्त कर सकती है। युवा सहकार योजना के तहत शहरी आवास को छोड़ कर NCDC को दी गई किसी भी व्यवसाय योजना आधारित गतिविधि के लिए सहायता प्रदान की जाती है। उदाहरण स्वरूप कृषि प्रसंस्करण आपूर्ति श्रृंखला, मूल्यवर्धन, logistic, कृषि यांत्रिकीकरण, खुदरा खाद्यान्न के विपणन, निवेश, आपूर्ति, वृक्षारोपण, बागवानी, ग्रामीण आवासीकरण, कमजोर वर्ग के लिए कार्यक्रम, आदिवासी सहकारी समितियां, डेयरी, कीटपालन, पशुधन, मत्स्य, हथकरघा, क्वायर, जूट, कोष, कीट पालन, कम्प्यूटरीकरण, वस्त्र, पैक्स के बुनियादी ढांचे, विपणन सहकारिता की अवसंरचना, कृषि बीमा, जल संरक्षण कार्य सेवाएं,

पर्यटन, अतिथि, परिवहन, अस्पताल, योग वैलनेस सुविधा, शिक्षा, बिजली उत्पादन तथा वितरण, ऊर्जा के गैर-पारम्परिक और नवीकरणीय स्रोत का उत्पादन तथा वितरण आदि के लिए सहायता प्रदान करता है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ms. Dola Sen; fifth supplementary.

MS. DOLA SEN: Sir, I want to know from the hon. Minister as to whether there is any statistics or data of the Union Government that through the Cooperative Ministry and NCDC how many have become independent to run the show in the last five years.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Member, the question is on Yuva Sahakar Scheme in Himachal Pradesh. So you have to confine to that.

**सुश्री दोला सेन:** ठीक है, कोई बात नहीं, आप हिमाचल प्रदेश का डेटा ही दे दीजिएगा।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Quick response! Hon. Minister.

**श्री मुरलीधर मोहोल:** महोदय, मैं आपके सामने राष्ट्रीय सहकारी विकास निगम NCDC की व्यापकता और पहुंच का बड़ा ही विस्तारपूर्वक जवाब रखूंगा। NCDC ने विभिन्न क्षेत्रों में नई योजना शुरू की है, जिससे स्वयं सहायता समूह के लिए 'स्वयंशक्ति सहकार', दीर्घकालिक कृषि ऋण के लिए 'दीर्घावधि कृषक सहकार' और डेयरी के लिए 'डेयरी सहकार'। वित्तीय वर्ष 2023-2024 में NCDC द्वारा 60 हजार करोड़ रुपये की वित्तीय सहायता का संवितरण किया गया है। वित्तीय वर्ष 2024-25 में NCDC ने 19,287.17 करोड़ रुपये का संवितरण किया है। भारत सरकार ने NCDC को विनिर्दिष्ट नियमों और शर्तों पर, सरकारी गारंटी के साथ 2 हजार करोड़ रुपये मूल्य के बॉन्ड जारी करने की अनुमति प्रदान की है। इसके अलावा, NCDC द्वारा पूर्वोत्तर के 6 राज्यों - अरुणाचल प्रदेश, मेघालय, मिजोरम, मणिपुर, नागालैंड और त्रिपुरा, में उप-कार्यालय स्थापित किये जा रहे हैं। जिनका उद्देश्य विभिन्न राष्ट्रीय योजनाओं को, उनकी सहकारी समितियों को, door step पर ले जाना है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Question No. 19. Shrimati Mahua Maji.

### Monitoring of fire safety standards

\*19. SMT. MAHUA MAJI: Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

<sup>†</sup> Original notice of the question was received in Hindi.

- (a) whether Government has taken any strict stand towards tightening the safety standards and preventing negligence to avert the increasing incidents of fire in multi-storey building in the country, if so, the details thereof and if not, the reasons therefor;
- (b) whether the Central Government proposes to provide assistance to the States to expand and modernize the fire services across the country;
- (c) if so, the details thereof, State-wise; and
- (d) if not, the reasons therefor?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI NITYANAND RAI): (a) to (d) A statement is laid on the table of the House.

### **Statement**

Fire Services is a State subject and has been included as a Municipal function in the XII Schedule of the Constitution of India under Article 243 (W). It is the primary responsibility of the State Governments to take necessary measures for strengthening and equipping Fire Services and to avert the fire incidences in multi-storey buildings in the area of their jurisdiction. However, from time to time, advisories have been issued by Directorate General (Fire Services, Civil Defence and Home Guards) under Ministry of Home Affairs on 18.04.2017, 31.08.2017, 04.06.2019 and 02.08.2023 for prevention and fire safety measures in High rise buildings. In addition, many advisories have been issued to States for undertaking prevention and fire safety measures.

The Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs have framed Model Building Bye Laws 2016, for guiding the States/UTs for revising their respective Building Bye Laws. It also contains a Chapter on fire protection and fire safety requirements which prescribes the norms and standards for fire protection. Its effective enforcement is in the domain of the States/UTs.

In addition, Bureau of Indian Standards had also published National Building Code of India, 2016. It covers the detailed guidelines for construction, maintenance and fire safety of the structures. It also lays down a provision for Fire and Life Safety Audit for all buildings having a height of more than 15 meters.

The Central Government has launched a "Scheme for Expansion and Modernization of Fire Services in the States" on 04.07.2023 from the Preparedness and Capacity Building Funding Window under the National Disaster Response Fund

(NDRF) for strengthening fire services in the States in the five years (2021-22 to 2025-26) with a total Central outlay of Rs. 5,000 Crore.

The State-wise details of funds allocated to the States under the scheme, on cost sharing basis, is annexed. The identified activities under the scheme have been broadly categorized under expansion of fire services and modernization of fire services in the States. The measures included in the scheme provides setting up of new fire stations, strengthening of State Training Centres and capacity building, provisions for modern fire-fighting equipment, strengthening of State Headquarters and Urban Fire Stations, technological upgradation and installation and augmentation of online system etc. In addition, an amount of Rs. 500 crore, out of the total outlay, is available to incentivize the States for adoption of legal and infrastructure based reforms.

### Annexure

Rs. in Crore

Sl. No	List of States	Central Share	State Share	Total Allocation
1	Andhra Pradesh	189.7	63.23	252.93
2	Arunachal Pradesh	57.57	6.39	63.96
3	Assam	96.73	10.74	107.47
4	Bihar	255.69	85.23	340.92
5	Chhattisgarh	110.82	36.94	147.76
6	Goa	31.63	10.54	42.17
7	Gujarat	254.27	84.75	339.02
8	Haryana	87.48	29.16	116.64
9	Himachal Pradesh	58.8	6.53	65.33
10	Jharkhand	111	37.00	148.00
11	Karnataka	247.42	82.47	329.90
12	Kerala	122.41	40.80	163.21
13	Madhya Pradesh	298.15	99.38	397.54
14	Maharashtra	461.61	153.87	615.48
15	Manipur	40.5	4.50	45.00
16	Meghalaya	39.94	4.43	44.37
17	Mizoram	36	4.00	40.00
18	Nagaland	36.05	4.00	40.05
19	Odisha	150.83	50.27	201.10



20	Punjab	98.67	32.89	131.56
21	Rajasthan	293.73	97.91	391.64
22	Sikkim	29.03	3.22	32.25
23	Tamil Nadu	280	93.33	373.33
24	Telangana	142.61	47.53	190.14
25	Tripura	38.15	4.23	42.38
26	Uttar Pradesh	577.43	192.47	769.90
27	Uttarakhand	71.03	7.89	78.92
28	West Bengal	282.57	94.19	376.76
	Total	4499.84	1387.99	5887.83

**श्रीमती महुआ माजी:** माननीय सभापति महोदय, देश में बढ़ती अगलगी की घटनाओं से लगातार निर्दोष लोगों के जान-माल की क्षति होती जा रही है। गुजरात के राजकोट के गेम जोन में लगी आग से 27 निर्दोष लोगों की जान चली गई। दिल्ली के विवेक विहार स्थित baby care centre में सात नवजात शिशुओं की मौत हो गई। सिर्फ देश की राजधानी दिल्ली की ही बात करें, तो नवभारत टाइम्स में...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Your supplementary!

SHRIMATI MAHUA MAJI: Yes, Sir. इस बार गर्मियों में 50 दिनों में 4,000 ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Madam, please ask your supplementary.

SHRIMATI MAHUA MAJI: Yes, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are giving facts. Ask your supplementary.

**श्रीमती महुआ माजी:** हमारे देश के छोटे-बड़े, अगड़े-पिछड़े तमाम राज्यों के शहरों में बहुत तेजी से बहुमंजिला भवनों का निर्माण हो रहा है।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Member, you are reading.

SHRIMATI MAHUA MAJI: This is my question, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please ask your supplementary.

**श्रीमती महुआ माजी:** क्योंकि अग्निशमन विभाग direct Ministry of Home Affairs के अंडर आता है, तो आप यह कहकर कि यह स्टेट का अफेयर है, अपनी जिम्मेदारी स्टेट पर ही नहीं डाल सकते। मेरा सवाल यह है कि...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your supplementary, Madam?

SHRIMATI MAHUA MAJI: Yes, Sir. अत्याधुनिक अंतरराष्ट्रीय मानकों के अनुरूप स्टेट अग्निशमन कर्मचारियों के लिए कितनी स्पेशल ट्रेनिंग की व्यवस्था केंद्र की पहल पर पिछले दो वर्षों में की गई है?...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Madam, I will have to ask... I am afraid, don't force me. What is your supplementary? Please rise and ask supplementary.

**श्रीमती महुआ माजी:** सर, मेरा यही सवाल है।

**श्री सभापति:** मैडम, पहले एक सवाल पूछ लीजिए, फिर दूसरा सवाल भी आ जाएगा।

**श्रीमती महुआ माजी:** सर, यही पहला सवाल है कि अत्याधुनिक अंतरराष्ट्रीय मानकों के अनुरूप स्टेट अग्निशमन कर्मचारियों के लिए कितनी स्पेशल ट्रेनिंग की व्यवस्था केंद्र की पहल पर पिछले दो वर्षों में की गई है?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Madam, I expect a better supplementary. Please go ahead, hon. Minister.

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय:** महोदय, आपदा प्रबंधन राज्य का विषय है, लेकिन केंद्र सरकार और गृह मंत्रालय अपनी जिम्मेदारियों से भागते नहीं हैं। जो भी नुकसान होता है, वह भारत देश के लोगों का होता है और हम सब मिलकर आपदा के प्रबंधन में एक साथ काम करें, इस नीति से हम सब काम करते हैं और राज्यों के साथ हम अच्छे से कोऑर्डिनेशन करते हैं। सर, जहां तक अग्निशमन का विषय है, तो पहले भी राज्यों से अनुरोध किया गया है और एक मॉडल अग्निशमन बिल लाया गया है, जिसके तहत अग्निशमन सेवाओं की बदहाली और बढ़ती हुई भूमिका को ध्यान में रखते हुए केंद्र तथा राज्यों के मार्गदर्शन के लिए एक संशोधित मॉडल अग्निशमन बिल, 2019 में लाया गया था। इस बिल के बारे में हम इसलिए कहना चाहेंगे, क्योंकि बहुमंजिला बिल्डिंगों के विषय में कहा गया है, तो मैं उनको बताना चाहूंगा कि कितनी ट्रेनिंग और किस प्रकार से हम उनकी मदद कर रहे हैं। एक बार हम मॉडल बिल के संबंध में यहां जानकारी दे देना मुनासिब समझते हैं। इस बिल में भवनों, संरचनाओं के निवारक उपाय, अग्नि सुरक्षा उपायों का प्रवर्तन जैसी बहुमंजिला इमारतें, जो 15 मीटर की ऊंचाई के लिए अनिवार्य हो, प्रावधान आग बुझाने के लिए स्वचालित sprinkler system, fire alarm और अग्निशामक यंत्रों की व्यवस्था के प्रावधान का आग्रह किया

गया है। इसमें आग से होने वाली दुर्घटनाओं के मामलों को ध्यान में रखते हुए बहुमंजिला और विशेष भवनों के उपप्रबंध किए गए हैं।

महोदय, नागपुर में भारत सरकार के गृह मंत्रालय का एक एनएफएससी सर्विस कॉलेज है, जिसने पिछले पांच वर्षों में 2,274 अग्निशमन सेवाओं अधिकारियों को प्रशिक्षित किया है और 300 से अधिक बी.टेक इंजीनियर्स तैयार किए हैं। पिछले पांच वर्षों में प्रशिक्षण पाठ्यक्रमों और डिग्री कार्यक्रमों में भागीदारी भी बढ़ाई है। सर, बी.टेक इंजीनियर्स का, डिवीजनल अधिकारी का, स्टेशन अधिकारी का और एसओ एवं उपअधिकारियों का का विवरण अलग-अलग है और जो टेबल है, तो वह टेबल हम आपको प्रस्तुत कर देंगे। इसमें जो अग्निशमन का मॉडल बिल है, उसको अभी तक दस राज्यों ने अपनाया है और 17 राज्य इस प्रक्रिया में आ गए हैं। लेकिन जहाँ से माननीय महोदय आती हैं, वह झारखंड राज्य अभी तक इस पर एक कदम भी आगे नहीं बढ़ा है। महोदय, मेरा इनसे आग्रह है इस मॉडल अग्निशमन बिल को ध्यान में रखते हुए एक बार अपनी राज्य सरकार से कहें, ताकि अग्निकांड से वहाँ पर कोई नुकसान न हो, इसलिए इस मॉडल बिल को वहाँ अपनाएं - महोदय, मेरा उनसे ऐसा आग्रह है। माननीय गृह मंत्री जी भी खुद इसके लिए कई बार आग्रह कर चुके हैं। 2023 में जो बैठकें हुई थीं, उन्होंने उनमें भी आग्रह किया था।

महोदय, 2023 के छठे माह में बैठक हुई थी, सातवें माह में माननीय गृह मंत्री द्वारा सभी मुख्य मंत्रियों को पत्र लिखे गए थे। सभापति महोदय, मेरा माननीय महोदय से निवेदन है कि एक बार अपने प्रांत में मॉडल अग्निशमन बिल को अपनाने की और उसके प्रावधानों में आने की कृपा करें।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ask your second supplementary.

**श्रीमती महुआ माजी:** सभापति महोदय, मेरा दूसरा सवाल यही था कि दुर्घटना कम करने हेतु कब-कब उच्च स्तरीय बैठकें हुई हैं, उसकी एक डिटेल्ड उपलब्ध कराई जाए।

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय:** सभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्या उच्च स्तरीय बैठकों के बारे में प्रश्न पूछ रही हैं, इसके लिए मैं उन्हें बताना चाहता हूँ कि बहुत बार बैठकें हुई हैं। एक बार घटनाओं में कमी आए, आपदा प्रबंधन ठीक से हो, इसके लिए माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने दस सूत्रीय एजेंडा, 2016 में नई दिल्ली में आयोजित आपदा जोखिम न्यूनीकरण पर एशियाई मंत्री स्तरीय सम्मेलन में जो एजेंडा दिया था, हम उस पर साल में कई बार बैठते हैं और कई स्तर पर बैठते हैं। हम वहाँ पर मंत्री स्तर पर भी बैठते हैं और इसमें हमारे सचिव भी बैठते हैं। ये घटनाएं कम करने के लिए प्रधान मंत्री जी ने जो सूत्र दिए थे, वह एक समावेशी एजेंडा है, जिससे महिलाओं की सहभागिता हो। हमारे पास जो लोकल संसाधन हैं, उनका डेटा और समय पर उस डेटा का उपयोग, "आपदा मित्र" के लिए 1 लाख लोगों को ट्रेनिंग देने के लिए लिया गया था, जिसकी ट्रेनिंग लगभग पूरी हो गई है। हमने यहाँ पर alert system रखा है। महोदय, जो common alert system है, जो निश्चित रूप से आपदाओं को पहले alarm करता है, हम उस पर काम करते हैं। न्यूयार्क में संयुक्त राष्ट्र जलवायु कार्रवाई शिखर सम्मेलन - महोदय, आपदा पर प्रश्न पूछा है, सिर्फ अग्निशमन पर नहीं पूछा है, इसलिए मैं बोल रहा हूँ कि जलवायु कार्रवाई शिखर सम्मेलन में प्रधान मंत्री जी द्वारा आपदा प्रतिरोधी संरचना संगठन, सीडीआरआई का शुभारंभ भी किया गया। अभी तक उनतालीस

देश और सात अन्य संगठन इसके सदस्य बने हैं, जो भारत के आपदा प्रबंधन और दृष्टिकोण के संबंध में एक बड़ी उपलब्धि है।

महोदय, राष्ट्रीय रिमोट सेंसिंग सेंटर द्वारा अधिक और कम बाढ़ वाले क्षेत्र का एटलस जारी किया गया है। चक्रपात जोखिम शमन और मोचन के लिए एक वेबसाइट आधारित Dynamic Composite Risk Atlas एवं Decision Support System विकसित किया गया है। गृह मंत्रालय के तहत Standing Fire Council की बैठक हर साल की जाती है, जिसमें सभी राज्यों के अग्नि सेवा अध्यक्ष भाग लेते हैं। जो फायर से संबंधित संस्थाएं हैं, वे सभी इसमें भाग लेती हैं। महोदय, मैं इनसे यह जरूर कहना चाहूंगा कि जो सिस्टम यहाँ पर अपनाया गया है, उसमें हमें बहुत सारी उपलब्धियाँ प्राप्त हुई हैं और आपदा प्रबंधन के लिए सरकार ने उसके प्रबंधन में राशि को भी महत्व दिया है। ....(व्यवधान)... महोदय, मैं लास्ट बात बताना चाहता हूँ। ....(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Sanjay Singh, third supplementary. You have given a very comprehensive answer, a very comprehensive answer.

**श्री संजय सिंह:** सभापति महोदय, आपका बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद कि आपने अलाऊ कर दिया है। सर, उन्होंने कहा है कि अग्निशमन राज्यों का विषय है और माननीय मंत्री जी ने 28 राज्यों का ब्योरा दिया है, इसलिए मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूँ कि क्या देश की राजधानी दिल्ली में नागरिक नहीं रहते हैं, क्या देश की राजधानी दिल्ली में अग्निशमन सेवा के लिए आपकी ओर के किसी तरह के सहयोग की कोई जरूरत नहीं है, क्या आप दिल्ली के नागरिकों को नागरिक नहीं समझते हैं?

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय:** सभापति महोदय, मैंने पहले ही कहा है कि हम अपनी जिम्मेवारी से भागते नहीं हैं, लेकिन यह राज्य का विषय है और हम उन्हें सहयोग करते हैं। सर, हम राज्यों को कैसे सहयोग करते हैं, मैं उसके बारे में बताना चाहता हूँ। अभी मैं यही बता रहा था कि किस प्रकार से 33,581 करोड़ के वित्तीय प्रावधान को बढ़ाकर 4 गुना किया गया है...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House stands adjourned to meet at 2.00 p.m.

*[Answers to Starred and Un-starred Questions (Both in English and Hindi) are available as Part — I to this Debate, published electronically on the Rajya Sabha website under the link <https://sansad.in/rs/debates/officials>]*

*The House then adjourned for lunch at one of the clock.*

*The House reassembled after lunch at two of the clock,*

MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

**GENERAL DISCUSSION****\*The Union Budget, 2024-25****&****\*The Budget of Union territory of Jammu and Kashmir, 2024-25**

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Union Budget 2024-25 and the Budget of Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir 2024-25 to be discussed together.

I call upon former Finance Minister, Shri P. Chidambaram, to raise the discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*....

AN HON. MEMBER: The best Finance Minister ever! ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I want to thank the hon. Finance Minister for the Employment-Linked Incentive Scheme and other ideas incorporated in the early part of her speech. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please hear him patiently. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: I am particularly happy that she had an opportunity to read the Congress Manifesto and she picks the good ideas on page 11, page 30, and page 31. I would respectfully urge my hon. friends in the Treasury Benches, especially the External Affairs Minister, to read the Congress manifesto so that in your party meetings you can persuade the hon. Prime Minister and the hon. Finance Minister to take some more ideas from our manifesto. We will be very, very happy to support you if you take those ideas. Copying is not prohibited in this House. In fact, copying is encouraged, copying is rewarded in this House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. If you will address the Chair, it will give a soothing feeling to me also. And, that will be more appropriate, Mr. Chidambaram. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Copying is encouraged and copying is rewarded in this House. So, please copy a little more.

---

\* Discussed together.

Sir, I have four major things. And, I think, I should be able to complete my submissions on each of these things in about four or five minutes. The first is jobs. Unemployment is the biggest challenge today. The Centre for monitoring Indian economy has estimated all-India unemployment rate, in June 2024, as 9.2 per cent. It may have come down. Earlier, there was a Production-Linked Incentive. When you introduce the Employment-Linked Incentive, it must be for some reason. And, I suspect, the reason was that the Production-Linked Incentive Scheme did not create the kind of jobs that you wanted to create. So, will the hon. Finance Minister tell this House what is the outcome of the PLI? Once we know the outcome of the PLI, we can look ahead to what can be expected of the ELI. In fact, from paragraphs 20, 21, and 22, read with paragraph 51 of her speech, neither I nor any of my learned colleagues are able to get a whole picture of the ELI. It seems to us that paragraph 20 talks about the same target industries, like paragraph 21. And, paragraph 21 talks about the same target industries as paragraph 22. But in paragraph 51, we were suddenly let down when you said, "Only 500 industries are selected." The numbers do not gel; the numbers do not match. Anyway, you have a ELI. It is an interesting idea, but it does not inspire confidence and let me go on record to say it does not inspire confidence that you will be able to place 290 lakhs people under the ELI, that you have described. It should not turn out to be another election *jumla* like your two crore jobs a year. ...*(Interruptions)*.. Now, look at the magnitude of the unemployment problem. The Uttar Pradesh Police Department conducted an examination for 60,244 vacancies. About 48 lakh persons applied and wrote that examination. It was cancelled a couple of days later. The Air India wanted to fill 2,216 vacancies for handyman to do diverse jobs like repair and maintenance. About 25,000 people thronged Mumbai airport for a walk-in interview and the police had been called to restore law and order. A private company in Gujarat sought to fill five positions. About 1,000 persons barged into that company. Madhya Pradesh advertised 15 low-skilled Government jobs; 11,000 applications were received. Among them were post-graduates, engineers, MBAs and I am sad to say, even one of them was a person who had just written an examination to be a judge in the Madhya Pradesh Courts. The best illustration is of the Staff Selection Commission. There are Staff Selection Commissions of the Centre and the States. Uttar Pradesh conducted an examination for 7,500 posts. About 24,74,030 people applied for those jobs. And, yet, the RBI, about two or three weeks ago said, "There is no job crisis in India". Exact words are "No job crisis in India." Why didn't anyone from the Ministry or any officer stand up and say, we reject this statement! The RBI is supposed to be cautious, conservative and neutral. You are cautious, you are conservative but you are not neutral at all. I

suggest that unemployment be taken seriously, and we will wait for the outcome of your ELI scheme. It is an interesting scheme. At the moment, I am not impressed, I am not convinced; the outcome alone will judge whether your intentions are good, whether you really want to tackle unemployment.

Sir, the second broad subject is inflation. The hon. Finance Minister, in Para 3 of her speech dismissed the subject in ten words. And, I am not exaggerating. Please go through the speech - exactly 10 words. Is inflation such a trivial subject that you can deal with it casually and dismiss it in ten words? The WPI inflation is 3.4 per cent; the CPI inflation is 5.1 per cent and food inflation is 9.4 per cent. From where do you collect data? Mostly, along towns and villages abutting the national highway; at best, the State Highways and at best, the District Highway. But go into the hinterland of India, go into the KBK districts of Odisha, go into the interiors of Dharmapuri or Ramanathapuram, the inflation is much higher than your 3.4 per cent or 5.1 per cent or 9.4 per cent. And the Chief Economic Advisor who may be cautious, conservative -- he has a degree of autonomy which no other officer of the Government of India has -- said in his Economic Survey, "India's inflation continues to be low, stable and moving towards the four per cent target." It has been moving for the last four years. When will it arrive at the four per cent target? Is inflation low? Is it stable? Is it moving towards the four per cent target? If it is moving towards the four per cent target, why has the RBI not revised downward the bank rate fixed in June, 2023? This is the thirteenth month of a 6.5 per cent bank rate. Bank rate is the good measure of where inflation is moving. If inflation is moving towards the four per cent target, — four per cent target is actually four plus or minus two; it is not four per cent — assuming that four per cent is the target, why is the RBI keeping the bank rate at 6.5 per cent for the last thirteen months? Why is the MPC, the Monetary Policy Committee, not willing to revise it downwards? And, I think, what the Chief Economic Advisor said in his Economic Survey is injury, and the hon. Finance Minister, dismissing the subject in ten words, is adding insult to injury. Inflation is a humiliating situation because every family is hit by inflation. I warn this Government. You are taking inflation not seriously. The last set of by-elections punished you. You will not agree. But I think the last set of by-elections where out of 13 seats, 10 seats were won by the India bloc is a punishment, the warning administered to you, and if you don't take inflation seriously, you will be punished more. If you want to suffer the punishment, you are welcome to suffer the punishment. And, in this situation, you claim that the growth last year was 8.2 per cent, and, this year, it will be 6.5 per cent or 7 per cent. I am not going into the macro-economic analysis. Some of my colleagues will do that. I ask you, how do you arrive at this growth rate? You take the nominal growth rate and apply a deflator

and arrive at the GDP. Sir, the House and you must know that the deflator that they have adopted for the manufacturing sector for last year is 1.7. When wholesale inflation is 3.4, when CPI inflation is 5.1, food inflation is 9.4, how do you adopt a deflator of 1.7? In fact, I want the hon. Finance Minister to tell us what is the deflator you have adopted for manufacturing industry, what is the deflator you have adopted for industry and for agriculture and what is the deflator you have adopted for services. Nominal growth is measurable. But your GDP, in real terms, is simply by adopting a deflator. And if you adopt a deflator, which several knowledgeable economists and experts throughout the world have severely criticized for the last three or four years, you will arrive at this rosy picture. If you would have adopted a deflator less than 1.7, you would not have arrived at 8.2; you would have arrived at 9.2. If you adopt a deflator of 0.5, you will even cross 10 per cent. So, please tell us, what is the deflator you are adopting, why you are adopting it and tell us what is the nominal growth rate and how do you arrive at these growth rates. These growth rates cannot be seen, but these growth rates can be felt by the people. Anyone moving among the people will know. The growth rate can be felt by the people. When there is impressive growth, when there are more goods and services, when prices are affordable, when there is money floating around in the market, when your pockets are jingling with coins or currency notes, you get the feeling that things are going alright in this country. Do you get that feeling? I travel at least 500-1,000 kilometers every month by road; I don't get that feeling. Does any hon. Member from his constituency or State get the feeling, or do people tell him that 'things are very good', please go and tell the Prime Minister in Delhi that things are very good and we are very happy?' Does anyone get that feeling?

Sir, the third subject is wages. Now, this is a serious matter. The hon. Finance Minister said, 'I have given relief'. Who has she given relief to? I don't grudge the relief. She has given relief, but to whom? In 2022-23, the last figure I was able to access, the number of taxpayers was 7.4 crore. It may have increased to 8 or 8.5 crore. Out of that, 65 per cent had zero tax liability. They file a return, but no tax is paid. Assuming that the 65 per cent remains constant, out of, say, eight or nine crore tax payers today, five-and-a-half to six crore people would have zero tax liability. You have given relief to people who moved to the new tax regime. I have seen various calculations in the new tax regime. Each paper has got a calculation. I have a Chartered Accountant who has given me a calculation from Gujarat, and he is very knowledgeable. He says that the relief given is between Rs. 9,651 to Rs. 17,651. To whom -- to these two to three crore people. India does not consist of just these two to three crore people. There are 142 crore people in this country. Out of 142 crore



people, let us assume you have given relief to two-three crore people. What about the rest? Do you know the conditions of the rest? The household consumption expenditure survey of the Government of India, read with that the bottom 50 per cent have three per cent of the national wealth, 13 per cent of the national income, the monthly consumption of a person in the rural areas is Rs. 3,094. Multiply it by 12, you would arrive at about Rs. 37,000 a year. In urban areas it is Rs. 4,963. Multiply it by 12, it comes to Rs. 60,000 a year. So, we have 50 per cent of the population, that is 71 crore, having an annual consumption expenditure between Rs. 36,000 and Rs. 50,000. Are they rich or poor? This is the bottom 50, below the median. If you go down to the bottom 20, or go down to the bottom 10, they are even poorer. What is the relief for them? And, the Chief Executive Officer of the NITI Aayog says, India has virtually abolished poverty. Poverty cannot be more than five per cent. Poverty cannot be more than five per cent when you are talking about 71 crore people? Thankfully, 71 crore is not five per cent. Then India's population would be 1,400 crore. India's population is 142 crore. One-half is 71 crore, and they are below the median, and this is the median income. I ask the hon. Finance Minister: what is the relief given to them? Do you know that most of them are daily labourers? Thirty crore daily labourers are there in this country. The others are doing irregular jobs. The regular jobs are only for about 17 to 25 per cent people of this country. All the rest are doing irregular jobs or daily labour. What is the relief given to them? In the World Hunger Index of 125 countries, we are at 111<sup>th</sup> place. You may not accept the World Hunger Index, but the action that the Government has taken, namely, giving free foodgrain to 81 crore people, is a tacit admission that on the Hunger Index, we are very, very low. Look at the Hunger Index, your own action shows that 81 crore people cannot afford food.

Sir, my last subject is federalism. What do we see around this country? All-India Service officers defy the directions and orders of the Council of Ministers of an elected Government in Delhi. Funds are withheld from Kerala and West Bengal on one pretext or the other. Borrowing limits of non-BJP State Governments have been slashed. Tamil Nadu has been denied Disaster Relief Assistance. I ask: why does the UPSC have to play a role in the appointment of the DGP of a State? Why should a State Government not appoint the Vice-Chancellors of State Universities? And, how did this Government treat Andhra Pradesh, Bihar and Odisha before April? The same demand was there. The same Andhra Pradesh Re-organisation Act was there. The Chief Minister was a different person. The same Act was there, but for ten years, how did you treat them? For ten years, how did you treat Bihar? When a leader wears one cap, you treat him one way, but when he changes that cap and he wears another

cap, you treat him another way. I don't grudge at all if you are giving relief to Andhra Pradesh or Bihar, but what about the other States? We are a federal country. This is the death knell of federalism, if you pick and choose amongst the States. You are the Union of India. You are the Union Government. You are the Government of all the States. You cannot pick and choose one State and deny relief to another State.

Finally, I thought the hon. Finance Minister loved Tamil. I missed her quotes from either Thiruvalluvar or any another other classic literature. Maybe she did not have time to quote from a classic poet in Telugu or in Bhojpuri. Maybe she will quote in the course of time. I want her to remember that she was born in Madurai, she had her schooling in Villupuram and she did her college in Tiruchirappalli and it is very painful, as the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu pointed out, that not in one place in her 60-page speech, did she mention the word 'Tamil Nadu' or 'Tamil'. I am not saying, mention only Tamil Nadu; mention all the States or mention all the States grouped together. How many times have you mentioned Bihar? How many times have you mentioned Andhra Pradesh? I have no grudge, but please remember that there are other States in India. Other States have people. Other States elect other Governments. They voted against you. Please remember that.

Finally, Sir, I have five demands, and, I would urge the hon. Finance Minister to copy from our manifesto. Sir, I demand this and I respectfully ask the hon. Finance Minister to give us answers. If you do not answer this today or in the course of this Session or subsequently, it is not as if these demands will die down. These demands will echo everywhere in India where the INDIA bloc has the right to speak and write.

Our first demand is Minimum Wage of Rs. 400/- per day for every kind of employment. Two, we demand a legally-guaranteed MSP. Three, we demand a write-off of the unpaid balance of interest or instalment of educational loans given up to March, 2024. Four, we demand abolition, complete abolition, of the Agniveer Scheme, and, five, we demand that NEET be scrapped, and, if some States want to keep NEET, exempt all other States which do not want NEET. These five demands will echo not only in this Chamber but these will echo throughout the country until you concede these demands. I demand that the hon. Finance Minister reply to my demand that she should reply to these issues. Thank you, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Dr. Radha Mohan Das Agrawal.

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल (उत्तर प्रदेश):** माननीय सभापति महोदय, मैं माननीय राष्ट्रीय अध्यक्ष और सभा के नेता जगत प्रकाश नड्डा जी का आभारी हूँ, जिन्होंने मुझे पार्टी की ओर से विचार रखने की अनुमति प्रदान की है।

(उपसभापति महोदय पीठासीन हुए।)

महोदय, हम लोग जब वित्त के बारे में बोलना शुरू करते हैं, तो हमारे सामने बिम्ब होते हैं। एक बिम्ब होता है भारत का - वह भारत जिसे हम अपनी मां मानते हैं, जिसके बारे में हमारे शास्त्र कहते हैं -

"माता भूमिः पुत्रोऽहं पृथिव्याः।"

हज़ारों साल पहले जिसके बारे में लिखा गया -

"उत्तरं यत् समुद्रस्य हिमाद्रेश्चैव दक्षिणम्।  
वर्षं तद् भारतं नाम भारती यत्र सन्ततिः ॥"

समुद्र के उत्तर में और हिमालय के दक्षिण में जो देश है उसे भारत कहते हैं और हम भारत के पुत्र हैं, भारत के बच्चे हैं, इसलिए भारतीय कहे जाते हैं।

दूसरा बिम्ब होता है हमारे प्रधान मंत्री जी का। 26 मई, 2014 को उन्होंने पहली बार शपथ ली और हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि दुनिया की अकेली शख्सियत स्वर्गीय नेहरू जी के बाद, जिन्होंने लगातार तीसरी बार शपथ लेने का काम सफलता के साथ किया। महोदय, माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी जब शपथ ले रहे थे, तो दो प्रकार की शपथ ले रहे थे। एक संवैधानिक शपथ, जो इस देश के महामहिम राष्ट्रपति दिलवा रहे थे, एक दूसरी भी शपथ वे ले रहे थे - मैं अगर प्रधानमंत्री बना हूँ तो मेरे काम करने की दृष्टि क्या होगी, मेरी आर्थिक नीतियां क्या होंगी - और वह शपथ उन्हें नरेंद्र नाम का एक दूसरा नौजवान दिला रहा था, उसका नाम था नरेंद्रनाथ दत्त विवेकानंद। विवेकानंद बोल रहे थे और माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी मन में ही उनके शब्दों को दोहरा रहे थे। प्रधान मंत्री जी कह रहे थे, 'मैं नहीं भूलूंगा कि मेरा विवाह, कि मेरी संपत्ति, कि मेरा जीवन मेरे व्यक्तिगत भोग विलास के लिए या इंद्रिय सुखों के लिए हुआ है, मेरे व्यक्तिगत सुख के लिए हुआ है, मैं नहीं भूलूंगा कि मेरा यह समाज उस विराट महामाया की एक छाया मात्र है, मैं नहीं भूलूंगा कि भारत के जितने भी नागरिक हैं, चाहे वे अशिक्षित हों, गरीब हों, दलित हों, पिछड़े हों - मैं भारतवासी हूँ और ये सारे नागरिक भारतवासी हैं, ये हमारे परिवार के सदस्य हैं, इनका सुख और दुःख हमारा सुख और दुःख होगा। मैं नहीं भूलूंगा इस बात को कि जब तक यह जीवन है, यह धरती हमारे लिए स्वर्ग है और भारत का कल्याण ही हमारा कल्याण है।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज़ सीट पर बैठ कर न बोलें।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** इसी सपने को लेकर मैं गर्व के साथ कह सकता हूँ जिस यात्रा को माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने वर्ष 2014 में शुरू किया, हम गर्व के साथ कहते हैं कि तब से 2024 तक वह यात्रा उनकी अनवरत जारी है। महोदय, आज माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी बात कर रहे थे। आज से 60 साल पहले रामधारी सिंह दिनकर ने देश की अर्थव्यवस्था के बारे में कि लिखा था कि-

"कुछ समझ नहीं पड़ता, रहस्य यह क्या है!  
 जानें, भारत में बहती कौन हवा है  
 धरती के सब पेड़ दीन-दुर्बल हैं  
 गमलों के ही पेड़ सुदम्य-सुदल हैं,  
 जब तक है यह वैषम्य समाज सड़ेगा,  
 किस तरह एक हो कर यह देश लड़ेगा।  
 सबसे पहले यह दुरित-मूल काटो रे!  
 समतल पीटो, खाइयां-खड़ पाटो रे!  
 बहु पाद बटों की शीरा शोर छांटों रे।  
 जो मिले अमृत, सब को समान बांटो रे!"

माननीय पूर्व वित्त मंत्री भाषण दे रहे थे। वे वर्तमान की नीतियों के बारे में बता रहे थे। 1960 में रामधारी सिंह दिनकर भारत की स्थिति के बारे में बखान कर रहे थे और ऐसा लग रहा था कि वर्तमान से इनका कोई संबंध ही न हो। इन्होंने 65 साल राज किया। 65 सालों के रहते हुए रामधारी सिंह दिनकर की इस पीढ़ा को किंचित मात्र भी अगर इन्होंने बदला होता, तो शायद आज ये बातें इन्हें दोहराने की जरूरत नहीं पड़ती। इसलिए माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी जब सत्ता पर आए, तो उनकी प्राथमिकता थे- देश का गरीब हमारी प्राथमिकता होगी, देश का नौजवान हमारी प्राथमिकता होगा, देश की बहनें हमारी प्राथमिकता होंगी, देश का किसान हमारी प्राथमिकता होगा और हम सब गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि जितनी नीतियां उन्होंने बनाई, हम नाम पर नाम ले सकते हैं, उनकी उपलब्धियों को गिना सकते हैं। पहली बार जब वे 'जन धन योजना' लेकर आए थे, आप तो 65 सालों में नहीं ला पाए, आप तो इस बात की चिंता नहीं कर पाए कि इस देश में 53 परसेंट ऐसे लोग हैं, जिन्होंने बैंक का मुंह तक नहीं देखा था। इस देश को हमारे प्रधान मंत्री का आभारी होना चाहिए, जिन्होंने इस बात को तय किया कि भारत का एक भी नागरिक, जिसके पास एक पैसा नहीं होगा, हम उसे बैंक तक पहुंचाएंगे, बिना ब्याज के पहुंचाएंगे, जीरो बैलेंस पर अकाउंट खोलेंगे, उसके अकाउंट में पांच हजार रुपये डालेंगे, उसे बचत करने की कला सिखाएंगे और देश के विकास में उसकी हिस्सेदारी करेंगे!...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज, पीछे बैठकर न बोलें।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** सर, इन्होंने 65 सालों में अपने देश के नागरिकों को, बहनों को गांव में रात के अंधेरे में शौचालय में जाने के लिए मजबूर किया। अपनी इज्जत बचाने के लिए, विभिन्न प्रकार की समस्याओं का सामना करने के लिए मजबूल किया। आप इस मंच पर खड़े होकर आज भाषण देते हो। महिलाओं की जो बेइज्जती आपने 65 साल में इस देश में की है, तो भारत \* । आपको माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी का एहसान मानना चाहिए, जिन्होंने इस देश में 'स्वच्छ भारत योजना' प्रारंभ की और आज हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि भारत की कोई भी

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

महिला, कोई भी बच्चा, कोई भी बूढ़ा आज अपने घर से निकलकर रात के अंधेरे में सड़कों पर शौचालय जाने के लिए बाध्य नहीं हो सकता है। आपको \* आनी चाहिए, आप 65 साल सत्ता में रहे। सर, 3,70,000,00 ऐसे घर थे, जिन तक आप पीने का पानी पहुंचा सके। आप बात करते हैं आधे लोगों की, आप 140 करोड़ जनसंख्या की बताते हैं। आपने 3,70,000,00 घरों को पीने का पानी पहुंचाया था। आपको प्रधान मंत्री जी का आभारी होना चाहिए, जिन्होंने 'जल जीवन मिशन' शुरू किया। जिनके नेतृत्व में आज हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि 14 करोड़ घरों में हमने पीने का पानी पहुंचाने का काम किया है। आपको \* नहीं आती कि इस देश की 90 प्रतिशत जनता ईलाज नहीं करा पाती थी, चिकित्सा तक उसकी पहुंच नहीं होती थी। ईलाज कराने में वह गरीबी रेखा के नीचे चली जाती थी, उनके घर तक बिक जाते थे, उनकी जमीने बिक जाती थी। आप उनकी चिंता नहीं करते थे। अगर किसी ने चिंता की, तो भारत के प्रधान मंत्री, नरेन्द्र मोदी जी ने की। जिन्होंने यह तय किया कि इस देश का कोई भी गरीब पैसे की कमी के नाते नहीं मरेगा। उसके लिए 'आयुष्मान भारत' योजना शुरू हुई। 50 करोड़ नागरिकों को आच्छादित किया गया और हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि पिछले पांच सालों के अंदर 7 करोड़ 34 लाख लोगों ने अस्पताल में अपना ईलाज करवाया।

महोदय, मैं आपके सामने एक रिपोर्ट प्रस्तुत करता हूं। यह रिपोर्ट Standard & Poor की है। जब चुनाव चल रहे थे और निर्णय आने वाला था, तो 29 मई को यह रिपोर्ट आई थी। यह छोटी-मोटी संस्था नहीं है। पूर्व वित्त मंत्री जी इसको नकार नहीं सकते हैं। महत्वपूर्ण यह नहीं है कि उन्होंने भारत की रेटिंग बढ़ा दी। 2009 में भारत की रेटिंग -BBB थी, जब आपकी सरकार थी। 2012 में भारत की रेटिंग -BBB थी, जब भी आपकी सरकार थी। वर्ष 2014 में नरेन्द्र मोदी जी सरकार में आये और आते ही भारत की रेटिंग चार महीने के अंदर बदल गई तथा यह बीबी माइनस से बीबी स्टेबल हो गई। हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि 29 मई, 2014 को Standard and Poor's ने घोषणा की और भारत की रेटिंग बीबी माइनस, बीबी स्टेबल से बदलकर बीबी पॉजिटिव हो गई। महोदय, यह महत्वपूर्ण नहीं है, महत्वपूर्ण यह है कि ऐसा करते हुए, Standard and Poor's ने अपनी रिपोर्ट में क्या कहा। मैं उस रिपोर्ट को पढ़ना चाहूंगा। उन्होंने लिखा कि भारत के मजबूत आर्थिक विकास ने, भारत की ऋणग्राहिता पर सकारात्मक प्रभाव डाला है। इस सुदृढ़ आर्थिक ढांचे का आने वाले दो-तीन सालों में विकास की गति पर बहुत प्रभावी असर पड़ने वाला है। उन्होंने लिखा कि सरकार ने अपने खर्च के स्वरूप और उसके वितरण को पूरी तरह से बदल दिया है और बढ़ता हुआ हिस्सा, अवस्थापन विकास पर खर्च किया जा रहा है। आने वाले समय में यह भारत की जड़ता को समाप्त कर देगा और भारत को विकास की बहुत ऊंचाइयों पर लेकर जाएगा। उन्होंने लिखा कि लगातार नीतिगत स्थायित्व से, गहराते हुए आर्थिक सुधारों से और उच्च दर की अवस्थापन सुविधाओं के निवेश से, भारत लम्बे समय तक विकास की संभावनाओं को बनाता रहेगा। भारत की अर्थव्यवस्था का पहला तमाचा, जो आपके ऊपर है, जो आरोप आप लोग हमारे ऊपर लगाते हैं, उस कम्पनी ने लिखा है कि भारत की अर्थव्यवस्था ने कोविड की आपदा के बाद बहुत प्रभावशाली ढंग से वापसी की है। पिछले तीन साल में भारत के

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

वास्तविक आर्थिक विकास की दर और सकल घरेलू उत्पादन के क्षेत्र में सर्वाधिक 8.1 प्रतिशत की औसत से वृद्धि हुई है। भारत एशिया पैसिफिक क्षेत्र में सर्वाधिक विकासशील है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज, सीट पर बैठकर बात न करें। प्लीज, अपनी-अपनी सीटों पर जाकर बैठ जाइए।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** आने वाले तीन सालों में यह विकास की दिशा और गति बनी रहेगी। भारत 7 प्रतिशत की विकास दर से विकास करता रहेगा। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please move to your seats. This is my request. आप बैठकर आपस में बात न करें। Please go to your seat. Priyanka ji, go to your seat. Please go to your seat.

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** भारत के सकल घरेलू उत्पादन और ऋण के अनुपात में इसका प्रभावी प्रभाव पड़ेगा। महोदय, दूसरा तमाचा इनके गाल पर Standard and Poor's ने मारा है। उसने लिखा है, यह उनके शब्द हैं, वर्ष 2024-25 में मोदी सरकार ने अवस्थापना के विकास में 11 लाख 11 हजार करोड़ रुपए खर्च किए हैं अर्थात् जीडीपी का 3.4 परसेंट है। अगला वाक्य उन्होंने लिखा है, यह हम नहीं कह रहे हैं, भारतीय जनता पार्टी के लोग नहीं कर रहे हैं, हमारे अर्थशास्त्री नहीं कह रहे हैं, Standard and Poor's ने लिखा, आज से 10 साल पहले किसकी सरकार थी, आप ध्यान दीजिएगा। आज से 10 साल पहले खर्च से यह साढ़े चार गुना अधिक है और भारत इमर्जिंग एंड डेवलपिंग इकोनॉमी का 'Best Performing State' है। उनकी अगली टिप्पणी यह थी कि आप ईपीएफओ को नहीं मानते, आपको एक निजी संस्था सीएमआई की रिपोर्ट समझ में आती है। मुझे आश्चर्य होता है कि आप भारत सरकार के वित्त मंत्री रहे हैं, आपने शासन किया है, लेकिन आप आरबीआई को नकारते हैं। उसी आरबीआई के सहारे, वे वित्त मंत्री बने रहे होंगे। आज कितनी अनैतिकता है कि उसी आरबीआई के आधार पर — इन्होंने ही आरबीआई के गवर्नर बनाए होंगे, आज उसी आरबीआई की रिपोर्ट को चुनौती दे रहे हैं। आरबीआई और ईपीएफओ आज रोजगार की बात करते हैं। वर्ष 2017 के पहले यह सरकार रोजगार की गणना ही नहीं कराती थी, वे सामने बैठे हैं, हिम्मत होगी तो खुद ही जबाव देंगे। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री जयराम रमेश (कर्नाटक):** सर, वे गलत बोल रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** आप चेयर को एड्रेस करिए।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** पांच साल में एक बार रोजगार की गणना होती थी। ...(व्यवधान)...

आज हम गर्व कर सकते हैं।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** सिर्फ डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल जी की बात रिकॉर्ड पर जाएगी।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** 2017 के बाद भारत के प्रधान मंत्री जी ने तय किया कि हर तीन महीने में रोजगार की गणना की जाएगी। ईपीएफओ के आंकड़ों को आप निकालिएगा। Standard and Poor's की रिपोर्ट को दुनिया की सारी संस्थाएं मानती हैं। वे सीएमआई के फर्जी आंकड़ों को नहीं मानती, वे ईपीएफओ के आंकड़ों को ही मानती हैं। उन्होंने ईपीएफओ के आंकड़ों के आधार पर लिखा कि ईपीएफओ के आंकड़े से पता चलता है, आप ध्यान से सुनिएगा, ईपीएफओ के आंकड़े से पता चलता है कि मजदूरों की शक्ति बढ़ी है, फारमर्स के रोजगार में 11.4 प्रतिशत की वृद्धि हुई है। स्वाभाविक रूप से आने वाले समय में भारत की मांग बढ़ने वाली है। महोदय, मैं अब चौथी टिप्पणी पर कहूंगा।

महोदय, जीएसटी लाने वाले ये ही थे। ये लागू नहीं कर पाए, हमने लागू कर दिया, तो आज जीएसटी को विकास विरोधी बताते हैं। क्या कहा था स्टैंडर्ड्स एंड पुअर्स ने? उसने जीएसटी की आलोचना करने वालों को सही जवाब दिया। भारत ने 2017 में जीएसटी इम्प्लिमेंट किया और तब से इसका मीठा फल खा रहा है। 2024 में 11.07 प्रतिशत की वृद्धि से 20 लाख करोड़ रुपये जीएसटी में इकट्ठा हुआ है, यह राजस्व बढ़ता रहेगा और भारत का विकास भी बढ़ता रहेगा। माननीय पूर्व वित्त मंत्री महोदय PLI स्कीम पर टिप्पणी कर रहे थे। स्टैंडर्ड्स एंड पुअर्स में पीएलआई (Productivity Linked Incentive) का उल्लेख किया है। उन्होंने लिखा है कि पीएलआई स्कीम ने भारत में electronics, information technology, automobile और उसके कंपोनेंट पर बहुत अधिक धन आवंटित किया है। इससे भारत के उत्पादन सेक्टर में विदेशी निवेश बढ़ा है और बहुत-सी विदेशी फर्में भारत की ओर आकर्षित हुई हैं। उन्होंने भारत के आपदा काल के बारे में लिखा है। आप भारत के फिस्कल डेफिसिट की चिंता कर रहे थे, 2012-13 में, जब आपने वित्त मंत्री के रूप में सरकार छोड़ी थी, तो भारत का फिस्कल डेफिसिट 10.05 परसेंट था। आपको आंकड़े बहुत याद रहते हैं, इसलिए आप याद कीजिएगा कि 2012-13 में भारत का फिस्कल डेफिसिट 10.05 परसेंट था। यदि नहीं होगा, तो आप खड़े होकर चुनौती दीजिएगा। महोदय, उन्होंने लिखा है कि भारत का फिस्कल डेफिसिट आपदा काल में 9 से 13 परसेंट था, 2024 में 5 से 5.07 परसेंट हुआ, 2025 में 5.01 परसेंट और 2028 तक 4.05 परसेंट होगा और लगता है कि 2028 में यह घाटा घटकर 4.02 प्रतिशत हो जाएगा।

उपसभापति महोदय, इनकी एक और बहुत प्रिय संस्था है। 1991 में जब इनकी सरकार थी, तब उसी सत्ता के दबाव में इन्होंने क्या-क्या पाप किए थे, इतिहास इसका गवाह है। वह भारत के इतिहास का सबसे काला दिन था, जो हममें से किसी भी नागरिक को नहीं भूलना चाहिए। महोदय, कांग्रेस की सरकार थी, एक सरकार इन्होंने चन्द्रशेखर जी के साथ चलाई, जैसी इनकी आदत है, चार महीने बाद उनको \* दे दिया। इन्होंने दूसरी सरकार नरसिम्हा राव जी की चलाई और जैसी इनकी आदत है, बेचारे नरसिम्हा राव मरे, उनकी शवयात्रा निकली, कांग्रेस के कार्यालय के गेट पर आधे घंटे तक खुली खड़ी रही, लेकिन इन लोगों ने अपने प्रधान मंत्री की लाश को अपने कार्यालय के अंदर नहीं घुसने दिया। ...**(व्यवधान)**... इतिहास के पन्ने गवाह हैं, जवाब देना पड़ेगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

उपसभापति महोदय, यह IMF अर्थात् International Monetary Fund की रिपोर्टिंग है। IMF ने भारत की मजबूत आर्थिक उपलब्धि की प्रशंसा की है। Asia Pacific के निदेशक श्री कृष्णा श्रीनिवासन ने कहा कि भारत के macro fundamentals बहुत अच्छे हैं, देश की अर्थव्यवस्था बहुत अच्छा परफॉर्म कर रही है, 6.08 प्रतिशत की विकास दर बहुत अच्छी है। आप ध्यान से सुनिएगा - महंगाई पर नियंत्रण हो रहा है - यह भारत सरकार नहीं कह रही है, बल्कि वह संस्था कह रही है, जिसके दबाव में आकर आपने भारत को गिरवी रख दिया था। महोदय, मैं उस विषय पर आने वाला हूँ।

महोदय, महंगाई पर नियंत्रण हो रहा है, अपने इस टारगेट के भीतर भारत को स्वयं को और लाना होगा। मेरा अगला शब्द यह है कि 2023, यानी पिछले वर्ष, वित्त मंत्री जी बैठी थीं और 2023 की दूसरी छमाही में हुई आर्थिक वृद्धि ने सबको आश्चर्यचकित कर दिया। भारत की मजबूत घरेलू मांग आर्थिक गति को बढ़ा रही है। उन्होंने कहा कि भारत के विकास के अनुपात को बदलना होगा। उन्होंने अप्रैल में भारत की विकास दर 6.05 प्रतिशत से बढ़कर 6.08 प्रतिशत की थी। ये जीडीपी को चुनौती देने बैठे हैं, सात साल रहे हैं, इसी जीडीपी को बनाते रहे हैं और इसी पर भाषण देते रहे हैं। आईएमएफ ने कहा कि हम दोबारा भारत के अनुमान को बदल रहे हैं और भारत की विकास दर को 6.08 प्रतिशत के बढ़ाकर सेव कर रहे हैं।

उपसभापति महोदय, उन्होंने सिर्फ भारत का ही विकास नहीं बताया, बल्कि उन्होंने पूरी दुनिया के विकास का खाका खींच दिया। अमरीका की विकास दर 2.07 परसेंट, जर्मनी की विकास दर 0.02 परसेंट, फ्रांस की विकास दर 0.07 परसेंट। इटली की विकास दर 0.7 प्रतिशत, स्पेन की विकास दर 1.9 प्रतिशत, यूके की विकास दर 0.5 प्रतिशत, जापान की विकास दर 0.9 प्रतिशत, रूस की विकास दर 3.2 प्रतिशत, ब्राजील की विकास दर 2.2 प्रतिशत, मेक्सिको की विकास दर 2.4 प्रतिशत, साउथ अफ्रीका की विकास दर 0.9 प्रतिशत और हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि भारत की विकास दर को आईएमएफ की संस्था ने सात प्रतिशत का आंकड़ा दिया है। यह आईएमएफ कौन है? प्रमोद जी, 1991 में आप ही की सरकार थी। आपके पास तीन हफ्ते का फोरन रिज़र्व नहीं था, आपके पास तीन हफ्ते का पैसा नहीं था। मूडीज़ ने आपको डाउनग्रेड कर दिया था। आईएमएफ ने आपको लोन देने से मना कर दिया था। वर्ल्ड बैंक ने आपका पैसा रोक लिया था। आपके पास पूरी की पूरी व्यवस्था फेल कर रही थी। आप मजबूर हुए। आपने दो बार - एक जुलाई और तीन जुलाई को भारत की मुद्रा का उन्मूलन किया और सबसे घटिया काम किया। सोना गिरवी रखा तो रखा, लेकिन अगर आपका दिल साफ था, तो खुलेआम सामने से रखते। चोरी से सोना गिरवी रखने काम दुनिया की किसी सरकार ने किया, तो भारत सरकार ने किया ...**(व्यवधान)**... भारत का 67 टन सोना इन लोगों ने दो बार - एक बार 20 टन सोना, एक बार 43 टन सोना... **(व्यवधान)**... मुझे कोई असर नहीं पड़ता है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... बैठ जाइए, नहीं तो चिल्लाते रह जाओगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज़ आप चेयर को एड्रेस करिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** एक बार 20 टन सोना और एक बार 43 टन सोना इन लोगों ने गिरवी रखा। ...**(व्यवधान)**... रात के अंधेरे में रखा। ...**(व्यवधान)**... उपसभापति महोदय, हुआ



क्या? एक बहुत नामी पत्रकार हैं - शंकर अय्यर। वे बेचारे किसी काम से एयरपोर्ट गए थे। उन्होंने देखा कि एक ट्रक का पहिया फट गया है। जब पहिया फट गया, तो वे देखने पहुंचे और पता चला कि उसके अंदर सोना भरा हुआ है, तब जाकर दूसरे दिन खबर छपी कि भारत ने अपने 142 करोड़ नागरिक, जिनकी चर्चा कर रहे हैं, उनसे छिपाकर भारत का सोना गिरवी रख दिया। हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि हमारे पास एक प्रधान मंत्री हैं। यह चुनाव की गहमागहमी में छिप गया। 31 मई, 2024 को हमारे मोदी जी के नेतृत्व में इस देश ने अपना सौ किलो टन सोना भारत में वापस मंगवाया है और उसे भारत के स्वर्ण भंडार में रखा गया है।

उपसभापति महोदय, ये आर्थिक आंकड़ों की चर्चा कर रहे थे, तो मैं भी इन्हें कुछ आंकड़े बता देना चाहता हूँ। इन्होंने ऋण के ऊपर चर्चा की। आज भारत का ऋण जीडीपी का 85 परसेंट है, यह मैं मानता हूँ। पूरी दुनिया के क्या आंकड़े हैं? अमेरिका का ऋण जीडीपी का 129 परसेंट है। जापान का ऋण जीडीपी का 264 परसेंट है। इटली का ऋण 142 परसेंट ऑफ जीडीपी है। फ्रांस का ऋण 112 परसेंट ऑफ जीडीपी है। यूके का ऋण 97 परसेंट ऑफ जीडीपी है। भारत का ऋण 85 परसेंट ऑफ जीडीपी है। पूरी दुनिया में भारत ने विकास भी सर्वाधिक गति से किया है और भारत की ऋण ग्रस्तता भी पूरी दुनिया में उसके सकल घरेलू उत्पादन के मुकाबले सबसे कम है। यह विकास हमने तब किया है, जब हम इस देश के नागरिकों से सबसे कम टैक्स लेते हैं। आप इनकम टैक्स की बात कर रहे हैं! हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि भारत अकेला ऐसा देश है, पूरी दुनिया का अकेला देश है, जो पूरी दुनिया में अपने नागरिकों से सबसे कम टैक्स लेने का काम करता है। ब्रिटेन अपने नागरिकों से 33 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। नॉर्वे 31 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। ऑस्ट्रेलिया 30 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। स्विट्ज़रलैंड साढ़े 27 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। इजरायल 24 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। यूरोपियन यूनियन 26 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। जर्मनी 22 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। स्वीडन 21 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। अमेरिका साढ़े 16 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है और हमने पूरी दुनिया में जो यह ऐतिहासिक विकास की गति पाई है, वह सिर्फ और सिर्फ 7.6 परसेंट टैक्स ऑफ जीडीपी के आधार पर पाई है। उपसभापति महोदय ...(व्यवधान)... सर, अभी रुकिए, बैठिए ...(व्यवधान)... ये आरबीआई की रिपोर्ट ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल जी, आप चेयर को संबोधित कीजिए।  
...(व्यवधान)...

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** पूर्व वित्त मंत्री आरबीआई की अधूरी रिपोर्ट पेश कर रहे थे  
...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** आपस में बात मत कीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... प्लीज़, चेयर को संबोधित कीजिए।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** उपसभापति महोदय, मैं पूरी रिपोर्ट पेश कर देता हूँ।  
...(व्यवधान)... 2011 में भारत के नागरिकों की जीडीपी की नेट वर्थ 85.7 प्रतिशत था। ये आंकड़े हैं, आपने क्वोट किया है, तो आप पूरी तरह इन्हें पढ़िएगा। मार्च 2014 में तीन साल के कार्यकाल में यह 85.7 परसेंट से घटकर 78.5 प्रतिशत आ गया। तीन साल के अंदर आपने देश के नागरिकों

की 7 प्रतिशत पूंजी \* ली। हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि मार्च 2014 में मोदी जी सरकार आई और हमारा नेट फैमिली वर्थ 78.5 प्रतिशत से बढ़कर 97.2 परसेंट हो गया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You will get opportunity to speak. ...**(Interruptions)**...

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** अर्थात् कुल मिलाकर हमने 19 परसेंट अतिरिक्त पूंजी इस देश के नागरिकों की जेब में पहुंचाने का काम किया है। 2014 में इनकी सरकार थी, तो प्रति व्यक्ति आय 86 हजार थी। ये आपके आंकड़े हैं, महाशय! 50 परसेंट नागरिक, 70 परसेंट नागरिक - जब उस समय आंकड़े देते थे, तो आपको 50 परसेंट और 70 परसेंट नहीं दिखता था! उस समय आपको औसत दिखता था! आपने 86 हजार की आय देकर छोड़ा था। आज भारत की प्रति व्यक्ति आय कितनी है - कहां आपने 86 हजार पर छोड़ा था और हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि आज भारत का आम नागरिक 2 लाख 12 हजार रुपया कमाता है। 2 लाख 12 हजार रुपये इस देश की प्रति व्यक्ति आय है। ये गरीबों की बात कर रहे थे, ये बात कर रहे थे देश की आर्थिक व्यवस्था की, ये बात कर रहे थे कि लोगों के पास धन नहीं है कि वे बेचारे खर्च कर सकें। उपसभापति महोदय, मैं आपके संज्ञान में सिर्फ एक आंकड़ा लाना चाहता हूँ। आरबीआई, वे माने या न माने, सरकार तो वे उसी से चलाते थे। आरबीआई, देश के पास कितना पैसा है, कितना पैसा खर्च करती है, नागरिकों को अपने विकास का अंदाजा कैसे लगता है, उनके पास पैसा नहीं है, तो वे काम कैसे करते हैं, इसीलिए वे हाई-फ्रीक्वेंसी इंडिकेटर्स निकालते हैं। ये वहीं आंकड़े हैं, जिनके बारे में अपनी सरकार में रहते समय ये भाषण देते रहते होंगे। मैं इन्हें इनके चेहरे पर दिखा देता हूँ। ग्रामीण एरिया में टू व्हीलर्स की सेल 21.3 परसेंट बढ़ गई। क्या यह बिना पैसे के बढ़ गई? थ्री व्हीलर्स की सेल 12.3 प्रतिशत बढ़ गई। ...**(व्यवधान)**... क्या आपने जेब में पैसा डाला था? ट्रैक्टर की सेल 3.7 परसेंट बढ़ गई। आदमी के पास पैसा नहीं था, तो क्या वह ट्रैक्टर खरीद रहा था? टोल कलेक्शन पिछले एक साल में 37.5 परसेंट बढ़ा है। क्या ये गाड़ियां बिना पेट्रोल, बिना डीजल के चलती हैं? अभी आपने कितना किलोमीटर बताया - 5000 in one month. My God! He only can move, nobody else can move. Nobody else can move. He only can move. मैं तो आश्चर्यचकित हूँ! ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please.

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** उपसभापति महोदय, टोल कलेक्शन 37 परसेंट बढ़ गया। पैसेंजर व्हीकल की सेल 4.9 प्रतिशत बढ़ गई। डोमेस्टिक एयर ट्रैफिक 6.6 प्रतिशत बढ़ गया। डोमेस्टिक एयर कारगो ट्रैफिक 6.7 प्रतिशत बढ़ गया। इंटरनेशनल पैसेंजर्स 13.2 प्रतिशत बढ़ गए। रेलवे फ्रेट ट्रैफिक 10.1 प्रतिशत बढ़ गया। होटल ऑक्यूपेंसी 60 परसेंट बढ़ गई। सीमेंट का प्रोडक्शन 10.6 परसेंट बढ़ गया। मकान नहीं बन रहे थे, निर्माण नहीं हो रहा था, तो सीमेंट का क्या कर रहे थे, महाराज! कभी तो इन आंकड़ों को देखने की कोशिश करिए। स्टील का प्रोडक्शन 19.1 प्रतिशत

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

बढ़ गया। ऑटोमोबाइल की सेल 18.2 प्रतिशत बढ़ गई। कॉमर्शियल व्हीकल की सेल 3.5 परसेंट बढ़ गई। ...**(व्यवधान)**... जीएसटी का ई-वे बिल 16.3 परसेंट बढ़ गया। जीएसटी का कलेक्शन 11.4 परसेंट बढ़ गया। उपसभापति महोदय, नागरिकों के पास पैसा नहीं था - मकान की खरीद नागरिकों के बीच में 33 परसेंट बढ़ गई। 33 परसेंट अधिक लोगों ने इस साल अतिरिक्त मकान खरीदे हैं। ये कहते हैं कि देश में पैसा नहीं है! आप देख नहीं पाते, देखना नहीं चाहते, jaundiced eye है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... ठीक है, ठीक है।

उपसभापति महोदय, इनका एक दूसरा आर्थिक आँकड़ा आता है, वह जानना बहुत जरूरी है। उस आँकड़े को कहते हैं - Purchasing Managers' Index. इस बार इन्होंने अपने भाषण में नहीं कहा, लेकिन पिछली बार जब ये खड़े हुए थे, तो Purchasing Managers' Index की बात कर रहे थे। इनका जवाब देते समय मैंने कहा था कि आप \* बोल रहे हैं, आपने गलत आँकड़े प्रस्तुत किए हैं। आज मैं सही आँकड़ा प्रस्तुत कर देता हूँ।

**श्री उपसभापति:** कृपया बोलते वक्त संसदीय शब्द का इस्तेमाल करें।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** हाँ, इसको असत्य कह लीजिए, भ्रम कह लीजिए, जो चाहे कह लीजिए।

उपसभापति महोदय, मैनुफैक्चरिंग क्षेत्र में Purchasing Managers' Index देख लीजिए। Purchasing Managers' Index का मतलब होता है कि देश की विकास गति...**(व्यवधान)**... समझ लीजिए, नहीं तो फिर ये लोग उल्टा बोलेंगे। समझाना भी तो जरूरी है न! इसका मतलब होता है कि विकास की धारा कैसी है!

**श्री उपसभापति:** डा. अग्रवाल, आपके पास एक मिनट समय है।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** अगर यह 50 से नीचे है, तो इसका मतलब देश का विकास कम हो रहा है और अगर यह 50 से ऊपर है, तो इसका मतलब देश का विकास बढ़ रहा है। माननीय नेता प्रतिपक्ष, 24 घंटे तो आप बोलते हैं, कभी हम लोगों को भी बोलने का मौका दे दीजिए। मैनुफैक्चरिंग में Purchasing Managers' Index, ऑस्ट्रेलिया का मूल्य है 47.2; जापान का मूल्य है 50; अमेरिका का मूल्य है 51; चीन का मूल्य है 51; यूनाइटेड किंगडम का मूल्य है 50; दुनिया का औसत है 50 और मैनुफैक्चरिंग के क्षेत्र में भारत का Purchasing Managers' Index 58.3 प्रतिशत है। यह किस बात का द्योतक है!

उपसभापति महोदय, ...**(समय की घंटी)**... ऐसे ही सर्विस के क्षेत्र में एक Managers' Index निकाला जाता है। पिछले भाषण में इन्होंने उसको भी quote किया।

**श्री उपसभापति:** आपका समय खत्म हुआ, अब आप जो भी बोलेंगे, उसका समय पार्टी के टाइम में से जाएगा।

\* Withdrawn by hon. Member.

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** उपसभापति जी, मेरे नेता यहाँ बैठे हैं, वे मुझे जितना समय देंगे, मैं बोल लूँगा और आदेश होते ही मैं बैठ जाऊँगा। उपसभापति महोदय, यह भाजपा का समय है।

महोदय, एक सर्विस मैनुफैक्चरिंग इंडेक्स होता है। इस बार इन्होंने नहीं बोला, क्योंकि थोड़ा पढ़-लिख लिए होंगे, जान गए होंगे कि पिछली बार \* बोल दिया था। मैं उसका आँकड़ा बता देता हूँ।

**श्री उपसभापति:** कृपया संसदीय शब्द का ही इस्तेमाल करें।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** हाँ, उपसभापति महोदय, \* शब्द हटा दीजिएगा। बोलने के क्रम में आ गया होगा, मैं उसे वापस लेता हूँ। सर्विस क्षेत्र में रूस का Purchasing Managers' Index 47.6; जापान का 49.4; यानी सब 50 से कम; ऑस्ट्रेलिया का ... (व्यवधान)... #

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज़। व्यक्तिगत टिप्पणी रिकॉर्ड पर नहीं जाएगी। प्लीज़, आप चेयर को देख कर बोलें।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** महोदय, ऑस्ट्रेलिया 51 परसेंट; चीन 51 परसेंट, यूनाइटेड किंगडम 52 परसेंट, यूएसए 53 परसेंट, जबकि उपसभापति महोदय, भारत के सर्विस क्षेत्र का PMI 60.5 प्रतिशत है, जो पूरी दुनिया में अकेला है।

महोदय, एक तीसरा आँकड़ा भी है, जिसके बारे में ये पिछली बार नहीं बोले थे- Composite Managers' Index. जापान 49.7, अब ये लोग सुन नहीं रहे हैं। सुन सब रहे हैं, लेकिन न सुनने का नाटक कर रहे हैं। इन्होंने कान इधर कर लिए हैं और मुँह उधर कर लिए हैं।

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज़, प्लीज़। डा. साहब, आप अपने समय से अधिक बोल रहे हैं, आप पार्टी का अधिक समय ले रहे हैं।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** जापान 49.7; रूस 49.7; ऑस्ट्रेलिया 50 परसेंट, यूनाइटेड किंगडम 52 परसेंट; पूरी दुनिया का औसत 53 परसेंट और भारत का 60.9 प्रतिशत का आँकड़ा है।

उपसभापति महोदय, कुछ और बातें हैं। ...( समय की घंटी)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** ऑलरेडी, आपकी पार्टी ने जो समय दिया था, आप उससे अधिक बोल चुके हैं। Please conclude.

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** उपसभापति महोदय, एक दूसरा आर्थिक आँकड़ा निकलता है, जिसे ये निकाला करते थे। ये भी 7 साल वित्त मंत्री रहे हैं, हालाँकि ये टुकड़े-टुकड़े में रहे हैं।

\* Withdrawn by hon. Member.

# Not recorded.

हमारी वित्त मंत्री तो लगातार हैं, एक continuity है। ये बेचारे आते थे, भगा दिए जाते थे। ये रह-रह कर रहते थे, इसलिए इनका स्थायित्व नहीं आ पाता था। हमारी वित्त मंत्री का 7 साल का स्थायित्व है।

उपसभापति महोदय, Professional Forecasters का assessment किया गया है। सारे के सारे आँकड़े तैयार हैं।

3.00 P.M.

उपसभापति महोदय, real GDP 6.8 per cent - IMF मानेगा, Standard and Poor मानेगा, भारत सरकार मानेगी, World Bank मानेगा, भारत के लोग मानेंगे, लेकिन अगर नहीं मानेंगे, तो यही बेचारे नहीं मानेंगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**... Private Final Consumption Expenditure, 6 per cent; Gross Fixed Capital Formation, 8.6 per cent; Gross Value Added, 6.6 per cent. महोदय, इनके कार्यकाल में Current Account Deficit (CAD) 4.5 per cent था। कल हमारी वित्त मंत्री जी ने बजट प्रस्तुत किया। हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि हमारा CAD 4.5 प्रतिशत से घट कर 0.7 प्रतिशत पर आ गया है।

उपसभापति महोदय, ये लोग एक और आंकड़ा निकलवाते हैं। ये वित्त मंत्री रहे हैं। ये भूल गये होंगे। इनको याद करा देना जरूरी है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... महोदय, इनको याद करा देना जरूरी है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... इनको अपने जमाने का सब याद रहता था। महोदय, actually जब ये लोग अंग्रेजी में बोलते हैं, तो हम उत्तर भारत के लोग थोड़ा दब-दब से जाते हैं।

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज़, आप सब्जेक्ट पर बोलिए।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** ये ज़रा हिन्दी में सुन लें और हिन्दी में जवाब दे देंगे। RBI ने calculation किया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**एक माननीय सदस्य:** वे भोजपुरी में भी जवाब दे सकते हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** हम तो उनके दे ली, मनोज झा के, उनके त देवे के पड़ी। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज़।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** Current Situation Index - भारत का Current Situation Index, जो रोजगार के आधार पर बनता है, आर्थिक परिस्थितियों के आधार पर बनता है, मूल्य के आधार पर बनता है, आय के आधार पर बनता है और नागरिकों के खर्च करने की क्षमता के आधार पर बनता है, 100 के मुकाबले इसका मूल्य 97.1 प्रतिशत है। एक साल बाद भारत की आर्थिक व्यवस्था कैसी होगी, इन विशेषज्ञों के मन में आज से आने वाले एक साल के बाद भारत आर्थिक रूप से

कैसा मजबूत होगा, उसके लिए वे लोग Future Expectation Index निकालते हैं। महोदय, 100 के Index में भारत का मूल्य 124.7 प्रतिशत है। ...**(समय की घंटी)**...

उपसभापति महोदय, ये गरीबी की बात कर रहे थे। \* ये per capita income से गरीबी देखते हैं। भारत के प्रधान मंत्री ने तय किया। वे गरीबी से उठे थे। उन्हें मालूम था कि अगर गरीबों की आय थोड़ी सी बढ़ा दी जाए, तो भी आर्थिक सुविधाओं तक उनकी पहुँच नहीं होती, सामाजिक सुविधाओं तक उनकी पहुँच नहीं होती, शैक्षणिक सुविधाओं तक उनकी पहुँच नहीं होती। उसकी जेब में पैसा होता है, लेकिन विभिन्न सामाजिक पूर्वाग्रहों के नाते इन सुविधाओं को वह खरीद नहीं पाता। इसलिए आपने गौर किया होगा कि माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने गरीबों के अमीर बनने का इंतजार नहीं किया, उनकी जेब में पैसा आएगा, तब वे यह सुविधा पाएँगे, इसका इंतजार नहीं किया। उन्होंने उनको 4 करोड़ मकान बनाकर दे दिए, निःशुल्क दे दिए; घरों में शौचालय दे दिए, निःशुल्क दे दिए; घरों में बिजली दे दी, निःशुल्क दे दिया; बीमारों का इलाज करा दिया, निःशुल्क करा दिया; गैस दे दिया, निःशुल्क दे दिया और फिर, आय को 86,000 से बढ़ा कर 2 लाख 12 हजार कर दिया। ...**(समय की घंटी)**... महोदय, मैं समाप्त कर रहा हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं समाप्त कर रहा हूँ।

महोदय, ये नीति आयोग की आलोचना कर रहे थे। ये क्या करें? ये प्लानिंग कमीशन चलाया करते थे। \* हमारी सरकार आई, तो हमने तय किया। हम federal cooperation में विश्वास करते हैं। हम प्रधान मंत्री हैं, तो हमारा मुख्य मंत्री भी अपने प्रदेश का सम्मानित अधिकारी है। हम अपने अधिकारियों को, हम अपने मुख्य मंत्रियों को और राजनैतिक जनप्रतिनिधियों को IAS और PCS के अधिकारियों के सामने attendance लगाने के लिए मजबूर नहीं करेंगे। प्लानिंग कमीशन को समाप्त करके माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने इस देश के हरेक मुख्य मंत्री के सम्मान की रक्षा की है। ...**(समय की घंटी)**... महोदय, नीति आयोग का एक Multi-dimensional Poverty Index है, जो यह बताता है कि पिछले 10 सालों में हमने 24 करोड़ 10 लाख लोगों को सिर्फ गरीबी रेखा से ऊपर ही नहीं उठाया है, बल्कि जीवन की जितनी जरूरतें होती हैं - आप लोग तो अमर्त्य सेन के बहुत बड़े भक्त हैं, चूँकि वे भाजपा के विरोधी हैं। आप लोग अमर्त्य सेन का गुण गाते हैं। अमर्त्य सेन भी Multi-dimensional Poverty Index को लेकर आए थे। आपने नहीं लागू किया, क्योंकि आपका चेहरा बेनकाब हो जाता। आपने नागरिकों को सुविधाएँ दी नहीं थीं, खाली फर्जी पर-कैपिटा, पर-कैपिटा बताया करते थे, इसलिए आपने इस देश में मल्टीडायमेंशनल पॉवर्टी इंडेक्स को कभी नहीं लागू किया। भारत के प्रधान मंत्री ने यह काम किया, नागरिकों तक सुविधा पहुँचाई। चुनाव चुनौती के साथ उन्होंने कहा कि जब तक एक-एक नागरिक के चेहरे पर खुशी नहीं आएगी, गाँधी जी का वह सपना पूरा नहीं होगा कि जब तुम नीतियाँ बनाते हो, तो यह देखो कि तुम्हारी नीतियों से गरीबों के आँसू साफ होते हैं या नहीं।...**(समय की घंटी)**... हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि पिछले दस सालों में हमने 24 करोड़, 10 लाख नागरिकों के आँसू पोंछे।...**(समय की घंटी)**... उपसभापति महोदय, मैं अभी बहुत कुछ कहना चाहता था, लेकिन आपने रोका है, इसलिए मैं रुक रहा हूँ, मौका दीजिए, तो फिर अपनी बातें रखूँगा, धन्यवाद।

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

**श्री उपसभापति:** डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल जी, आपने अपने लिए तय समय से जितना अधिक समय लिया, वह समय आपकी पार्टी से जाएगा। माननीय श्री जवाहर सरकार। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY (West Bengal): Sir, I invite your kind attention to Rule 261. Rule 261 says, "If the Chairman is of opinion that a word or words has or have been used in debate which is or are defamatory or indecent or unparliamentary or undignified, he may in his discretion, order that such word or words be expunged from the proceedings of the Council."

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It has already been done.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: Sir, only one word, आदरणीय राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल जी जोश से बोल रहे थे, तो उस जोश में यह लफ़्ज आ गया - 'आप लोग \* रहे थे', This is unparliamentary, according to the Parliamentary publications book on Unparliamentary Expressions, 2021.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is right. ...*(Interruptions)*... यह असंसदीय शब्द है, इसलिए वह निकलेगा। आप यह सही कह रहे हैं।

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: I am referring to a book. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are right. I have already indicated. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: Sir, I am referring to a book which is a publication of the Parliament.

**श्री उपसभापति:** आप सही हैं।

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: The name of the book is Unparliamentary Expressions, 2021. उसको जरा आप देख लीजिए।

**श्री उपसभापति:** माननीय सुखेंदु शेखर रॉय जी, you are correct, I have already instructed about it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

The next speaker is Shri Jawhar Sircar; you have fifteen minutes.

SHRI JAWHAR SIRCAR (West Bengal): Sir, I would like... please आप बैठें।  
...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** यह सिर्फ दो शब्दों पर था, जो उन्होंने कहा है।...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI JAWHAR SIRCAR: Sir, I would like to thank you first. I would like to thank the Chairperson of our party. I would like to thank the National General Secretary and the Leader of the House for giving me an opportunity to state certain facts. Before that, I would like to make one comment to my hon. Friend. He has mentioned 'paisa' around 40 times in his speech. 'पैसा' डा. अग्रवाल नहीं जानेंगे, तो कौन जानेंगे?

Secondly, he has made a lot of statements that are really defamatory in nature. I would say if he really believes, if he really believed in... ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have to speak on the subject, Mr. Jawhar Sircar. ... (Interruptions)...

**श्री जवाहर सरकार:** सर, इनकी बात छोड़िए।...(व्यवधान)... मुझे अपनी बात पर आने दीजिए।  
...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have taken his name. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI JAWHAR SIRCAR: Sir, I would like to start by expressing my deep sorrow at the wasted opportunity of a Finance Minister who has been there for seven years. I came into the Budget process some 21 years ago and have drawn and helped execute budgets. I have not seen such a lacklustre budget, such an absolutely atrocious Budget. This is the Budget that is a fig leaf for plutocracy and for a rule by the rich. I will give just a few examples. Hon. Finance Minister starts off by saying, 'I let off gold, silver and platinum.' This is a fact. Sir, gold, silver and platinum is her priority! When I talk of silver, the first thing that comes to my mind is a scandal in the GIFT City, in a particularly favoured State. There is a huge scandal about import of silver. Then she says, 'I let off cruise ships.' सर, बजट में लग्जरी कूज शिप्स की भी कोई बात होती है! I gave up the Angel Tax. Angel Tax, Sir, is meant for high investment by high investors. This has nothing to do with the common man. She said, 'I removed the Angel Tax.' तो हमारे लिए क्या Devil Tax है, बाकी क्या devil tax छोड़ा? She has let off Angel Tax! Have you thought even once about small savings? Sir, there is not a word about small



savings! Not a word about the common man. The tragedy of the hon. Finance Minister is that she does not understand the subject and rains from a high hog!

She has, deliberately, avoided the names of all the important States that voted against her. Sir, West Bengal has not been uttered once; Punjab never, Tamil Nadu never; Kerala never and none of the States she uttered! We do not exist in her scheme of things. That is what I am trying to say.

She starts up saying, 'We are the fifth largest GDP.' हम यह कब तक सुनेंगे? You are supposed to have made it US\$5 trillion by this year. You have not; so, you have \* to the nation. You have not been able to manage even US\$4 trillion. As Mr. Chidambaram said, it is all jugglery of deflation. If you have come to close to US\$4 trillion, it is not thanks to you, it has happened because of the people of India. As people say, it happened in spite of the Government; it didn't happen because of the Government.

Sir, her Economic Survey suddenly brings out one word of truth. I am quoting that sentence. It says, 'The Indian corporate sector profits are at a fifteen year high.' I don't grudge it. I grudge the 75 year low through which the poor are going. That is what my grudge is.

The Budget talks of youth, women, poor and farmer. But, what did it do in reality? In reality, it has turned itself into a user-friendly political weapon. It has created monopolies and oligopolies. It has created crony raj and we can go on giving a number of examples, whether it be airport, port, coal, solar and even foreign contract dalal.

Now, I come back to taxation structure. It was always around 40 per cent of the personal income tax of poor people and 60 per cent was from corporate tax. Sir, 60 per cent used to be the corporate tax. Today, they are equal. Now we are totally unequal. Personal income tax has gone up from 40 per cent to 55-60 per cent and corporate tax has come down/slashed down deliberately, to give them some benefit which they never returned to the nation through any investment. The present calculation is that the present hon. Finance Minister and the hon. Prime Minister have let off Rs. 8 lakh crores — it is a lot of money - it is the Budget of five States put together — of corporate tax, along with a write-off of Rs. 16 lakh crores of banks' bad debt! Sir, out of Rs. 16 lakh crores of banks' bad debt (NPAs), she has given me, in writing, that around Rs. 9 lakh crores are on account of Modi, — sorry, Nirav Modi — on account of Jatin Shah, and on account of other big frauds and corporate losses.

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Sir, with a cumulation of such a plutocratic, such an absolutely openly capitalist Budget, we have landed into an inequality that is one-and-a-half times worse than colonial times. ...*(Interruptions)*... अगर इनके पास इतना पैसा है, तो कैपिटल फॉर्मेशन तो करें। But, the Private Capital Formation has declined steadily during this regime. Let them contest it. Those officers, who give them such papers, should also give them such truths, once in a while ताकि अपने खाब तो तोड़ें। This has happened consistently.

This Budget is the most anti-federal Budget that we have seen in the last 20 years. The most deliberate anti-federal Budget. I will come to my State. They declared an economic war on Bengal because Bengal refuses to subscribe to their principle of hatred. We do not believe in the hatred against minorities. आप हमें मार डालिए, फिर भी हम minority के खिलाफ कोई काम नहीं करेंगे। We do not believe in casteism. So, don't come and introduce the poison of casteism in my State and say, "हमें वोट दो - हमें वोट दो।" And, for that, we have to pay a penalty that is higher than many other States. We have been stopped funding on MNREGA, Aawas Yojana, Gram Sadak Yojana, and even on health to the poorest. And, our dues are Rs. 1.72 lakh crores. ...*(Interruptions)*... 1.72 lakh crores! We are doing Awaas Yojana on our own. We are doing MNREGA on our own. नरेगा पर इतना गुस्सा क्यों है, उसका नाम बदल दीजिए न, महात्मा गांधी जी का नाम हटा कर किसी और का नाम रख दीजिए, पर पैसा तो दीजिए। उसको नरेन्द्र मोदी रूरल डेवलपमेंट बनाइए। West Bengal is the only State that has been deprived for three years. You have declared a special war of vendetta. The Prime Minister and the Finance Minister have declared a special war against us. Please, please look at history. In this sub-continent, if you take out a particular region or a particular State and declare a war of vindictiveness, you are playing with fire. You are playing with fire, with the emotions of the people. You have even stopped kerosene quota. यह क्या हो रहा है? You talk of giving e-vouchers for financial support to one lakh students. Bengal has already given it to eleven lakh students. आप हमें क्या सिखाएंगे? On Finance Commission grants, as you know, there are no conditions possible. But, you have started putting conditions here too. You have started it and it is anti-federal because you are you increasing your tax budget through surcharges and additional duties. And, you are not distributing this. You are keeping this to reward those States that prop you up.

You have talked of inflation. The one that matters the most is the food inflation, which is over nine per cent — 9.2 to 9.5 per cent. Vegetable market is on fire. But, you look only at the fire of the stock market.

(MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*)

Now, I come to the household consumption expenditure. Your report will not show that 43 per cent Indians are skipping a meal. Your national account 36 or 24 shows that household incomes have crashed by rupees nine lakh crores in two years. I am repeating, crashed by nine lakh crore rupees in two years! The household savings have come down as a percentage of GDP. The household consumption expenditure has been shattered because of inflation.

We come to Budget. When you talk of so many things that you are giving, you are not mentioning that this is on borrowed money. Never before have we relied on rupees fourteen lakh crores of borrowal. You are putting the nation into a debt. Remember, 67 years and 13 Prime Ministers borrowed 55.8 lakh crores of rupees. But, one Prime Minister alone has borrowed three times more. It is a fact; let them refute it. And, now you talk of increased budget, मैं यह दे रहा हूँ, वह दे रहा हूँ। Our debt, as a part of the GDP, you say, is lower than that of the USA or Japan. उनके पास क्षमता है। They have the capacity to repay. They do not have such a huge burden of the poor to carry on. So, do not compare incomparables.

You have cut down even on subsidy. You have cut down even on subsidy on every account. On unemployment, you are on complete denial mode. Unemployment has already burnt you. The gentleman who spoke before me, his State has come down to half, where his party is concerned. When I talk, my State, my party has gone up by 20 per cent in my State. So, these are the results. Do not fool yourself. Unemployment will blow up on your face.

The labour force reports are based on mythical things. You worked for one hour, it is taken as a week employment. You worked for one month, it is taken as your annual employment. अपने आपसे असत्य बोलना बंद कीजिए और कभी-कभी सच का मुंह देखिए। Now, employment linked subsidy is a new step. Before I come to that, I will tell you that we demand a White Paper on PLI. On PLI, I feel there is something that we all need to look at because almost all of it is going to one State. In that State, Micron industry charges Rs. 3.2 crores per job. This is a racket. You have to take a look into it. And, if the Government has the capacity, let it put up a white paper on who got PLI, where and for what purpose, in which State, cornering of all industries into one State, just one State, favouring a couple of other States.

On health, our Budget has slashed. We need three per cent of the GDP, we are spending less than one. (*Time-bell rings.*) सर, यह क्या हो रहा है? इतनी बड़ी-बड़ी बातें करते हैं कि मैं यह कर रहा हूँ, वह कर रहा हूँ। On health alone, we have crashed. On education, we have crashed. From our six per cent of GDP target, we are nowhere near three percent.

This is a Budget meant for the rich, only for the rich and it is a completely anti-federal, anti-poor Budget and needs to be junked out. I completely believe that this is a motivated one that is meant against the poor man, against the citizens. Look at small savings, look at the over-centralisation of the NEET, look at the over-centralisation at every level and you know what I mean. With these words, Sir, I strongly condemn the Budget and the points that I have raised, I hope, the hon. Finance Minister replies in a soft, decent manner with logical facts, not in anger. Thank you, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Now, Shri N.R. Elango. You have 12 minutes.

SHRI N.R. ELANGO (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I thank you for this opportunity. My response on this Budget is going to be only political, not on any finance, economy or data because the Budget itself is political, not on any finance or economy. The Tamil Nadu had so many demands. We were expecting so many things. We were hopeful of something from the Government but we got nothing. That is because the BJP got nothing from Tamil Nadu. Sir, I have read in the newspapers, the hon. Prime Minister spoke to the Press saying and I quote: "Now it is the responsibility of all elected representatives and of all political parties who have fought for their respective parties, that now for the next five years, we have to fight for the country and strive for it." Unfortunately, this was not brought to the knowledge of the hon. Finance Minister. This Budget, in my opinion, is not for the country but it is to appease very few. This Budget is not for the stability of the country but for the stability of this Government. I want to refer to only two portions of the Budget speech. The first line says, 'the people of India have reposed their faith in the Government and elected it for the third term.' With great respect to the Finance Minister, I say, it is not correct. Only two persons have reposed faith on you; only two persons. And, you say that 'you are grateful for their support.' This is correct because you are grateful to those two who are supporting you, and nobody else.

Sir, the fault in the Budget is that it has great amount of regional disparities. Purvodaya Project is covering Bihar, Jharkhand, West Bengal, Odisha and Andhra Pradesh. The height of the tragedy is that you have included Andhra Pradesh in the Eastern region. Maybe, because the rising Sun is shining well in the South, you thought, Andhra Pradesh is in the East. We don't envy these States. They are our brothers. But we strongly condemn the step-motherly attitude of the Union. Our leader, great *arignar* Anna said, 'North flourishes and South deteriorates'. Because of the well-planned governance of our leader, Dr. Kalaignar, and Mr. Muthuvel

Karunanidhi Stalin, Tamil Nadu is performing as one of the best States in terms of every parameter. But we are punished for our best performance. Our contributions are not even returned by due devolution of funds. Now, it may be not wholly unjustified if we say, North is flourishing because of the South.

Sir, Tamil Nadu is excelling in industry, in agriculture and in every other field. As per Niti Aayog's report, 2023-24, in achieving the goals of low poverty, zero hunger, good health and well-being, quality education, gender equality, clean water and sanitation, clean energy and every other field, Tamil Nadu has excelled the average of India. Sir, the overall performance of Tamil Nadu was at 74 per cent in 2020-21, and India was at 68 per cent. Tamil Nadu is at 78 per cent in 2023-24, and India is at 71 per cent. For the information of my learned friend, Dr. Radha Mohan Das Agrawal, I may have to say that these figures were only at 60 per cent and 67 per cent during the period 2020-21 and 2023-24 respectively for the State of Uttar Pradesh.

Sir, Tamil Nadu being one of the well developed States often receives less Central transfers compared to the less-developed States. Regarding the infrastructure projects, as far as the Metro Rail Phase-2 Project is concerned, the Metro Rail Project Phase-2, is on the 50:50 contribution of the State and the Centre. Though approval of every stage was granted, now the project is awaiting CCEA approval from the Central Cabinet. It is not being given. The State has commenced its work. We are having funds' deficiency. I request the Union to consider this and to give the CCEA approval and to release necessary funds. The four new rail projects are imminent for the State and we request the Union to consider them and clear those projects expeditiously.

Sir, two disasters happened in Tamil Nadu -- one, in Chennai and neighbouring districts; and number two, in the Southern-most part of the State. We requested about Rs. 37,907 crores as relief but the Centre, so far, released only Rs. 276 crores, a meagre sum of Rs. 276 crores. The State is fighting very much financially to take the relief measures. We request the Union to immediately release Rs. 3,000 crores towards this disaster management. Sir, as far as *Samagra Siksha* is concerned, Tamil Nadu has its own reservations about the New Education Policy. Though we have contributed our 40 per cent towards this project, the Centre is not releasing its share of 60 per cent, which is around Rs. 2,152 crore. We have our own reservations about the New Education Policy, but that is the State's autonomy. You cannot withhold funds because of that. On the education front, we have been opposing NEET right from its introduction. Now it is very clear that the NEET examinations are not being conducted properly, that NEET is not really required and there is a great scam involved. Hence, we would request that the Bill that was

unanimously passed in the State Legislature and pending assent by the President of India, should be cleared by the Union Government at the earliest.

Sir, it is important to note that the financial relationship between the Central Government and the State is dynamic and can change based on various factors including economic conditions, political alignments and policy priorities. We, being a significant economic contributor, urge the Union Government to give a fair share and greater autonomy to us in financial matters. The attitude of the Union is leading to doubts about fiscal federalism. Moreover, we call for a broader reassessment of fiscal federalism in India. The current trend of centralization is unsustainable and detrimental to the diverse needs of our States.

Sir, let us remember that India's strength lies in its diversity. Our federal structure is not a weakness to be overcome, but strength to be harnessed. By empowering States, we empower India. Never forget, by penalizing the people of Tamil Nadu for not voting for you, you are derailing federalism and the nation as well.

Sir, to conclude, this Budget missed a great opportunity to strengthen our federal structure and to drive equitable growth across all regions. We, in Tamil Nadu, stand ready to contribute our fair share but we also demand our fair due. It is time for a new fiscal federalism that respects State autonomy, rewards performance and works towards the collective progress of our nation. Let us work together to build an India where every State can thrive, where diversity is celebrated and where the spirit of cooperative federalism truly prevails.

Sir, you have forgotten Tamil Nadu, Tamil and *Thirukkural* because the elections are over. Since the Prime Minister and the hon. Finance Minister were fond of *Thirukkural* before the Elections, I would like to conclude by quoting *Thirukkural*. Recently, everybody talked about *Sengol*, the scepter. Somebody has misinformed them that the scepter is translated into Tamil as *Sengol*. That is not so. Scepter is only known as *kol*. If they actually read chapters 55 and 56 of the *Thirukkural*, they would find the words *sengol* and *kodungol*. When you deliver a good government, it is called *sengol*. If you deliver a bad, worse or tyrannical government, it is called *kodungol*. Sir, let me quote, with your permission, one *Thirukkural* -- the English translation of which says: "the Government of a nation would get spoilt every day if the Government does not do justice every other day." In the matter of finance, in the matter of governance, in every walk of life, if the Government does not act in a just manner, the Government will be spoilt every day.

Sir, I want to bring one more thing to the attention of the Chair. On page 2, paragraph 4 -- I would be finishing it, Sir -- there is a sentence. It is mentioned in the interim Budget, on page 2, first line. It reads, "We need to focus on four major

castes, namely, poor, women, youth and farmers." These are not castes. These are the sections of people. I do not know how the Finance Ministry terms them as 'castes' of this country. I conclude by saying that the Budget and the attitude of the Union Government show who you are. The people of India will decide whether you are having a Sengol or kodungol. According to us, your rule is a Kodungol. People will teach a proper lesson to you. Thank you, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Sanjeev Arora. You have five minutes.

SHRI SANJEEV ARORA (Punjab): Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Sir, for giving me a chance to speak on the Budget, especially today. I would like to speak on health sector vis-a-vis this Budget. India is ranked at 158<sup>th</sup> place out of 196 countries on Government health expenditure. The source of this information is the 134<sup>th</sup> Report of the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare. If we see globally, healthcare expenditure in most of the countries, on an average, is 8-12 per cent of the GDP, whereas we, in India, where it is needed the most, are still below two per cent. It goes up to 17 per cent in the U.S.A. There could be some exceptions. I have taken most of the countries in the world where expenditure on health is 8-12 per cent. It was NDA Government's target in 2017 that by 2025, the expenditure on health would be 2.5 per cent of the GDP, and it was also mentioned in the National Health Policy drafted by the NDA Government. But, here we stand in 2024-25, and it is still less than 2 per cent.

Then, out-of-pocket expenditure, as per Government record or Government report, is around 50 per cent. This is as per the National Health Accounts Estimates, but this is far from truth for one reason that there is much of expenditure being incurred in the form of OPD charges, radiology, pathology and purchase of medicines which happens in cash, which is not reported, but the other part is reported fully. So, there is a private report which states that if we take into account all these expenditures, the total out-of-pocket expenditure comes to 60 per cent, which is very high. The world average of out-of-pocket expenditure is 18 per cent. In a State like Uttar Pradesh, which is bigger than many countries, the out-of-pocket expenditure - - this is again as per a Government report - - is more than 70 per cent. So, in India, out-of-pocket expenditure is more than three times than the global average, which is pushing many people into poverty.

Now, coming to the allocation for health in Budget, in 2023-24, the Budget Estimate was Rs.86,175 crores, whereas the Revised Estimate was Rs.77,624 crores, which means, as it is, it is less than 2 per cent of the GDP and then the amount being

spent is even lesser than what is being shown in the Budget. It is not like Rs.1,000 or Rs.500 crore less, but it is a gap of Rs.10,000 crores. This time, the Budget Estimate for 2024-25 is Rs.87,656 crores which is only 1 per cent increase in the total health expenditure from the last year's Budget. I mean, it is not even close to the inflation.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have used 80 per cent of your time already.

SHRI SANJEEV ARORA: Why Sir?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Only one minute is left.

SHRI SANJEEV ARORA: No, Sir, don't say that. Sir, your clock runs fast.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are talking of those figures and you are losing your own track. Please conclude.

SHRI SANJEEV ARORA: I will be quick. I am thankful to Shri Sanjay Singh. He gave me his turn. I do not want to take much time and I will be quick.

Coming to the issue of Research and Development in the medical field, we need to spend a lot because some of the medicines, which are being imported, cost crores of rupees. ...(*Time-bell rings*)... Forget about cancer medicines, there are many other medicines. Sir, under Pradhan Mantri Ayushman Bharat Health Infrastructure Mission, the Budget Estimate of last year was Rs. 645 crores and only Rs. 200 crores were spent. Why is it that in the health sector, which is required the most, the amounts are not being spent?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Arora, you are already over time.

SHRI SANJEEV ARORA: I am concluding, Sir. I have not finished all my points but I am concluding. I will straightway come to the last point.

To take care of all the issues, which I mentioned and which I could not, the only way forward is to increase the Budget allocation for health sector and make healthcare affordable for all. To begin with, I would request the hon. Finance Minister to increase Budget allocation to 2.5 per cent as mentioned in 2017 Report of National Health Policy.

Sir, I would also like to request the hon. Health Minister, Nadda ji, to use his good offices and get the needful done for ailing health care sector. Thank you.



MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Sujeet Kumar. You have 25 minutes.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR (Odisha): Mr. Chairman, Sir, at the outset, I would like to convey a message from my Party President, Shri Naveen Patnaik, with regard to the Budget, and, I quote: "BJP had put Special Category Status in their manifesto as a promise to the people of Odisha. However, this promise has not been considered for Odisha whereas special packages allocating crores of rupees have been announced for Andhra Pradesh and Bihar. Along with this, the demand of Odisha for revision of coal royalty, which has been pending for years with the Central Government, has been rejected, because of which the State will lose thousands of crores of revenue every year. During the election campaign, a lot of big promises were made to the people of Odisha in different sectors, especially, agriculture, MSME and industry. There is no mention of any promise being fulfilled in this Budget. This is a complete neglect of Odisha and its people. Today, the most serious issue being faced by the common public is inflation or price rise and unemployment. This Budget does not have any considerable intervention to address these two major issues. I am happy to see that there is a focus on tourism in Odisha. I hope, this is substantial and we shall await the details. I would say that along with people of Odisha, I feel disappointed at the continued neglect of Odisha while the State contributes so much to the country.

Sir, people across the country are feeling disappointed with this Budget, and, particularly, the people of Odisha are feeling let down with this Budget pronouncement. Andhra Pradesh and Bihar have received huge Budget bonanza. Let me give you some examples. An outlay of Rs. 26,000 crore has been given to Bihar for road projects. About Rs. 15,000 crores this fiscal -- and more in the coming years -- has been given for the development of capital city of Amravati.

The Central Government has announced that it will support loans from multilateral agencies for Bihar and Andhra Pradesh. The Minister has also announced a Backward Region Grant for three Districts of Odisha. Lest I am misunderstood, I would like to clarify that we do not grudge this Budget bonanza for Bihar and Andhra Pradesh. In fact, we are happy for our brothers and sisters of Andhra Pradesh and Bihar that they have got this budgetary support. But why has this step-motherly treatment given to Odisha? Why have we been neglected? Are we not part of '*Purvodaya*', which the hon. Prime Minister has been talking about? Why is this appeasement to allies at the cost of States like Odisha, Jharkhand and others? Can we have a *Viksit Bharat* without having a *Viksit Odisha and Viksit Jharkhand*?

Sir, a mention was made of the KBK region of Odisha. I come from that part of Odisha, which is probably as backward as the three Districts for which special grant

has been announced in this Budget. Why is there no special grant for the KBK? Don't other States need loans and support from multilateral agencies? Will the Central Government support the other States also when they apply for loans from multilateral bodies?

Sir, I shall be failing in my duty if I do not share the concerns that I have from this Budget. Because this is the Council of States, it is my duty to also highlight the concerns and the neglect of Odisha in the Budget of 2024-25. The first concern that I have is regarding R&D. As a nation, we spend less than 0.7 per cent of our GDP on R&D, which is abysmally low. In comparison to this, China spends 2 per cent, the USA spends 3.06 per cent, South Korea spends 4.6 per cent and Israel spends 4.9 per cent of its GDP on R&D. How can we become a *Viksit Bharat* without focussing on innovation and R&D? I am so disappointed that this Budget does not have adequate focus and priority for R&D.

The second concern I have is with regard to education. When it comes to spending on education and health, I am reminded of the French Literature Laureate, Andre Gide, who said, "Everything that needs to be said has already been said but since no one was listening, everything must be said again."

[THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON, (DR. KANIMOZHI NVN SOMU) *in the Chair.*]

In her Budget speech last year, the hon. Finance Minister listed out seven priorities, which she called *Saptarishis*. I was very disappointed last year as well, Madam, that Education was not one of the *Saptarishis*. This year, she has articulated nine priorities, and again, Education is not one of the priorities in her list. We all know that investment in Education is the foundation of a nation. Way back, in the 1960s, the Kothari Commission and now the New Education Policy of 2020 have been talking of investing at least 6 per cent of our GDP on Education. We are nowhere close to that. We are, at best, spending 3 per cent of our GDP. If you add the State Budget, it will probably become 4 per cent of the GDP. But it is nowhere near 6 per cent of the GDP, which has been recommended by the Kothari Commission and also our New Education Policy. Madam, a small State like Odisha, last year, under the leadership of the then Chief Minister, Shri Naveen Patnaik, allocated 13.2 per cent of the State's GDP on Education, which shows the commitment of the BJD Government and conviction of the BJD party towards Education. Madam, let me quote a few lines from the New Education Policy itself. "The aim must be for India to have an education system by 2040 that is second to none with equitable access to the highest quality education for all learners regardless of socio-economic background." Inadequate

allocation to education does not match with these lofty goals of the NEP. I am afraid that the journey to 2040, which the NEP talks about, has started with a fractured leg. Instead of galloping to 2040, we will probably limp to 2040.

Again, the Government has grossly under-prioritized spending on food and nutrition, particularly for children. "PM POSHAN 2" and "Saksham Anganwadi" are two of the flagship schemes of the WCD Ministry of the Government of India. The Revised Estimates for the financial year 2023-24 was Rs. 21,523 crore for these two flagship schemes, which has been reduced to Rs. 21,200 crore in this year's Budget Estimates, a deduction of over Rs. 300 crore from last year's allocation. Will this not show up in poorer learning and education outcome? If you reduce the allocation for the Mid Day Meal Scheme for POSHAN, for Saksham Anganwadi, will that not reflect in poor learning outcome for our children?

The third concern that I have is regarding Defence. As a regional party, Biju Janata Dal, and our party president, Shri Naveen Patnaik, have always stood with successive Governments when it comes to the nation's security, unity and integrity. We have always stood with the Government in Delhi when it comes to defending our borders, when it comes to the unity and integrity of our country. Madam, at 6.22 lakh crore which is roughly 75 billion US dollar, the total allocation for Defence marks a marginal hike of 4.79 per cent from the BE of last year. According to the Stockholm-based policy think tank called SIPRI, China spends over 300 billion dollars on defence every year. And this is not even the official number. Because the official numbers from China are unreliable. They are fudged. Unofficial estimates claim that China spends over 700 billion dollars on Defence. That is the difference we are talking about. The number is 75 billion dollars for India whereas for China, it is over 300 billion dollars officially and unofficially it is 700 billion dollars. This accounts for less than two per cent of our GDP. Less than two per cent of the GDP is spent on Defence. Many Parliamentary Standing Committees on Defence have recommended that as a nation we should spend at least over three per cent of our GDP on Defence. We are extremely proud of our Armed Forces who are guarding our borders and giving us this safety net. Our Armed Forces have to be battle ready. They have to be constantly ready to meet any eventuality, particularly when we have a very belligerent, aggressive and hostile nation called China in our Indo-Tibet border. This is why I urge the Finance Minister to ensure that adequate funding is allocated to the Defence. I hope that they have done the math but I want to ensure that adequate funding is allocated to the Defence.

My fourth concern is with regard to sports. At Rs.3,442.32 crore, the budget for the sports Ministry has been marginally hiked by 45.36 crore from the previous

year. It is only a marginal increase of 45 crore. With this lousy focus on sports, no wonder we are not in the top 30 sporting countries in the world. A country aspiring to be a five-trillion dollar economy spending less than half a billion dollar on sports is certainly not encouraging. We are talking of becoming a five-trillion dollar economy in the next one or two years but we are spending less than half a billion dollars on sports. It would not be out of place to bring to the attention of this House how Odisha has emerged as the sports hub of the country. Under the leadership of our visionary former Chief Minister, Shri Naveen Patnaik, Odisha successfully hosted two Men's Hockey World Cups twice in a row. We built the world's largest hockey stadium, in terms of seating capacity, called the Birsa Munda Hockey Stadium in Rourkela which has made the entire nation proud. Odisha is the first and the only State to sponsor both the men's hockey team and the women's hockey team of the country.

The fifth concern is with regard to unemployment. Unemployment, as everyone would agree, is a very urgent and pressing issue facing the country. In fact, the Economic Survey, which came out a couple of days ago, has estimated that the Indian economy needs 78.5 lakh jobs every year on an average until 2030 in the non-farm sector to cater to the rising workforce. We need 78.5 lakh jobs every year in the non-farm sector to meet the rising demand of employment. Which sector creates jobs? It is the MSMEs that create jobs for the country. It is the MSMEs that create wealth for the country. But, unfortunately, we did not see adequate focus on MSMEs in this Budget. I will give you some examples, Madam. I am happy that MUDRA Loan ceiling has been hiked from Rs.10 lakh to Rs.20 lakh. But talk to any rural entrepreneur and talk to any woman entrepreneur in the country, you will come to know how difficult it is to access a MUDRA loan. They will tell you horror stories. It is so difficult to access MUDRA loan. So this hike in ceiling from Rs.10 lakh to Rs.20 lakh unfortunately will not do much for rural entrepreneurs and women entrepreneurs. We recommend that the Government should give preference to local MSMEs in Government contracts and tenders up to Rs.20 crore. That will boost the local economy and the local ecosystem. We urge the Government of India to hike the GST waiver for companies, which is Rs.20 lakh now, to Rs.2 crore. MSMEs need relief from the compliance burden that they face. I am so glad that the hon. Finance Minister spoke about Jan Vishwas Bill 2.0. I request her and the Government to expedite such a Bill which will ensure that our MSMEs are not burdened with compliances.

Madam, I would like to make a mention of gig workers. Today, we have about 15 million gig workers in the country. Some estimates say that by 2030, we will have 90 million, that is, nine crore gig workers in the country. We were expecting that in the

Budget Speech, hon. Finance Minister will announce a platform for gig workers, a fund for gig workers, where gig workers can register themselves. Today, we do not know because companies are not mandated to register gig workers. Companies like Zomato, Ola, Uber, etc. are not mandated to register gig workers. So, we do not know whether gig workers are employed or not. I sincerely had hoped that the hon. Finance Minister would have announced a fund and a platform where gig workers could have been registered. If numbers are to be believed, today, less than nine lakh gig workers are registered whereas we have about 1.5 crore which will increase to about nine crore by 2030. The reason I speak about gig workers is because they not only help generate employment but the best part is that they bridge the gap in terms of gender unemployment. Because of the flexible working hours, more women are able to join as gig workers. And if we focus on such a database or on a fund for gig workers, then I think we can empower more women to enter our workforce.

Madam, the sixth concern I have is with regard to internship and CSR issue. In the Budget Speech, the hon. Finance Minister called for Top 500 Corporations to bear 10 per cent of the internship cost from CSR kitty. This is neither desirable nor is it acceptable from a legal point of view because internship is something which benefits the company directly or indirectly. To allow a company to adjust that amount against CSR fund is not ethical. It is not desirable because less money will be available from CSR kitty to be spent on social sector, charitable activities, etc. So, if you allow a company, which will benefit from internship, to adjust that CSR money, then less money will be available for other activities, which is not desirable. Again, from a legal point of view, I think, there is an ambiguity in the legal regime. I would read the General Statutory Rules, 2021. It says, "The CSR projects or programmes or activities that benefit the employees of a company and their families shall not be considered as CSR activities in accordance with Section 135 of the Companies Act." I am reading from the General Statutory Rules of 2021. Section 135 of the Companies Act is very clear that anything that benefits the employees of the company or their family members cannot be considered as CSR. So, I do not know how this budgetary pronouncement will be on the right side of the law. Rather, what the Government could have done is to mandate that the companies contribute from their actual salary expenditure and could have paid the interns.

Madam, the seventh concern that I have is with regard to tourism. Now, all of us know that tourism is a growth engine of the economy; tourism creates jobs; it brings in foreign exchange; it has multiplier effect. Some studies have estimated that it contributes about 2.8 per cent to our GDP directly and close to nine per cent to our GDP indirectly. About four crore jobs are generated because of tourism industry

which is roughly eight per cent of the total employment of the country. I am also heartened to note that the hon. Finance Minister spoke of Odisha. She spoke of the abundant natural beauty; she spoke of the rich cultural legacy in Odisha, majestic temple architecture, classical dance, music, pristine beaches, wildlife, etc. So, I would really thank her on behalf of the people of Odisha for that. But similar to the announcement for Bihar, we were expecting a specific and structured package for development of tourism in Odisha which was not there in the Budget. I have a couple of suggestions.

#### 4.00 P.M.

First is about the Bali Yatra. Madam, the erstwhile name of Odisha is Kalinga and Kalinga had a very rich and illustrious tradition of maritime history. The seafarers of Kalinga used to go as far as Java, Sumatra and Bali to trade and to commemorate this glorious tradition of maritime history, every year, in the month of November, a festival called Bali Yatra is celebrated in the historic city of Cuttack. Our leader, Shri Naveen Patnaik, has many a time urged the Centre to accord the status of national maritime heritage to Odisha's Bali Yatra festival. In fact, when hon. Prime Minister was in Bali for the G-20 Summit in 2022, he made a mention of Bali Yatra. So, that is the importance and significance of this festival but it has not been accorded the status of national maritime heritage festival. I urge the Government to consider this request.

Second is Dhanu Yatra. Dhanu Yatra is the world's largest open air theatre. It is a theatrical festival celebrating *Ras Leela*, celebrating the life of Lord Krishna and it is the world's largest open air theatre. It should be recognized as a national festival and included in the list of fairs and festivals of India.

Odisha is the place that gave birth to a new religious cult called the Mahima Dharma which talks of international well being. It was popularized by Sant Bhima Bhoi with his immortal words "Witnessing the plethora of plights on earth how one could bear with; let the world get redeemed at my cost." It means, "how could one witness and bear with the plethora of plights of fellow human beings? Let the world get redeemed at my cost." Madam, these immortal words are inscribed on the walls of the United Nations in different languages. So, the place of birth of Sant Bhima Bhoi should also be developed.

India is the origin of Buddhism. We all know and we are proud of this fact that India is the motherland of Buddhism. There are many Buddhist sites in India like

---

\* English translation of the original speech delivered in Odia.

Lalitgiri, Udayagiri and Ratnagiri where you had Pushpagiri and Parimalgiri Universities as recorded by the Chinese Scholar Hiuen Tsang. Now, this could be developed to attract tourists from East Asia and South East Asia particularly. Also, a Central University for the study of Buddhism and Buddhist philosophy should be established in Odisha.

Madam, my eighth concern is with regards to fiscal federalism. A lot has already been said about it but I would just quickly repeat. The size of the divisible pool of taxes has been going down. The Fifteenth Finance Commission had recommended that 41 per cent of the divisible pool should be devolved to the States but the actual share received by the States has been decreasing. In F.Y. 2022-23, it was 35.1 per cent. In the R.E. of F.Y. 2023-24, it was 36 per cent. In this year's B.E., it is 35.5 per cent which is against the spirit of the federal structure of the Constitution.

Madam, finally, I would come to the neglect of Odisha. My Party President Shri Naveen Patnaik has time and again raised these issues of negligence with the past and the present Central Government when it comes to tele-density, national highways, coastal highways, railway, banking and cutting of funds for the scheduled areas and for KBK. We have been urging that special consideration should be given to Odisha when it comes to the Disaster Response Fund. It is a known fact that almost every year now Odisha witnesses super cyclones or cyclones. So, we request that the sharing pattern under the Disaster Response Fund should be 90:10 at par with the Himalayan States against the 60:40 that is there today. Secondly, the Finance Commission has also recommended that a devolution of Rs.100 crores toward Odisha for drought prevention measures and Rs. 800 crores for strengthening the Early Warning System should be sanctioned.

Number two demand from Odisha is this. We have a 480 kilometres long coastline but today we have only three ports, a major port in Paradeep and two minor ports in Gopalpur and Dhamara. There is possibility of developing many other ports, particularly, in places like Astaranga, Subarnarekha and a riverine port in Mahakalpada. This would boost the economy of the State hugely and also stimulate and create jobs.

The third demand is with regard to the GST on *Kendu* leaves. *Kendu* leaf, under the Forest Right Act of 2006, can be collected by the tribal population. It has been categorized as a Minor Forest Produce (MFP). Sir, today 18 per cent GST is levied on *Kendu* leaf which is putting a huge burden on the *Kendu* leaf pluckers, on the seasonal workers and on the binders who are largely tribals. Ten lakh tribal population is dependent on these *Kendu* leaf economy. We demand that this 18 per cent GST should be waived off on *Kendu* leaves and this demand has also been

raised many a times by our hon. Party President in different fora. He has also written to the Union Government many a times on this.

Madam, the fourth demand is with regard to revision of coal royalty. Odisha being a coal-bearing State is at the forefront of coal production in the country thereby, helping and assisting in the energy security for our nation. But, I am sorry to point out that the coal royalty rate has remained struck at 14 per cent since May of 2012. For the last 12 years, there has been no revision in the coal royalty despite the inflation and despite the changing economic circumstances. Many a time, Shri Naveen Patnaik has written to the Union of India and many a time, he has spoken to different Union Ministers for revision in the coal royalty structure but it has fallen into deaf ears. Hence, it is urgently essential that we need to revise and review this coal royalty structure.

Madam, regarding banking facilities today, 65 per cent of Gram Panchayats in Odisha do not have a banking facility. If I talk of the KBK region from where I come from, close to 75 per cent of the Gram Panchayats (GPs) do not have banking facility. We need support there.

Madam, regarding Railways, you will be shocked to know that the rail density in Odisha is 18 whereas the national rail density is close to 22. Our neighbouring States have much better rail density. We are very happy for them. But, we also demand that railway network should be enhanced in Odisha. East Coast Railways generate Rs. 20,000 crore revenue from Odisha but still our rail density is much lower and I come to the KBK area which is a cluster of eight districts, seven of which are part of the Aspirational District Programme of NITI *Aayog*. These eight districts are largely tribal and largely LWE -affected. (*Time-bell rings.*) The rail density is less than ten in single digit.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (DR. KANIMOZHI NVN SOMU): Please wind up. Your time is over.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Madam, I will wind up in one minute. So, I and my party demand that there should be massive expansion of the rail network in Odisha and in the KBK region particularly. It is because connectivity is the lifeline of a nation and connectivity is the backbone of the economy.

Now, Madam, we have some specific demands with regard to Railways, Malkangiri to Bhadrachalam, Jeypore-Malkangiri, Jeypore-Nabrangpur, Theruvali-Gunupur, Kantibanji to Jeypore, Bargarh to Nuopada and Lanjigarh road to Phulbani are some of the railway projects that need immediate attention.



THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (DR. KANIMOZHI NVN SOMU): Kindly wind up. (*Time-bell rings.*)

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Madam, last point. I am winding up. There is an announcement of construction of a Loco workshop in a place called Narla in Kalahandi District. We are clueless as to what is happening with that. There is no progress on that. So, that is the final request.

Madam, I conclude by saying that in the last two decades, Odisha has witnessed remarkable transformation, remarkable socio-economic transformation but we are still not getting our dues. (*Time-bell rings.*)

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (DR. KANIMOZHI NVN SOMU): Shri Sanjay Yadav. He is not present. Shri Birendra Prasad Baishya. He is not present. Now, Shri Milind Murlu Deora; you have five minutes to speak.

SHRI MILIND MURLI DEORA (Maharashtra): Madam, for the time, from the hon. Parliamentary Affairs Minister, from the BJP's time, they have agreed to give me some time. Time is very flexible. ...(*Interruptions*)... महोदया, आपने मुझे इस वर्ष के केंद्रीय बजट पर बोलने का मौका दिया, इसके लिए मैं आपको धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ। क्योंकि समय कम है, इसलिए मैं अपने भाषण के माध्यम से सरकार को महत्वपूर्ण सुझाव देना चाहूंगा, बहुत ही प्वाइंटेड सजेशंस देना चाहूंगा। During the Motion of Thanks Speech, all of us spoke on various issues which were very political in nature. I would like to be very specific on issues going beyond politics. I am giving some very valuable suggestions to the Finance Ministry on issues that concern everybody in this House. For one, in my opinion, I firmly believe that every expenditure incentive subsidy of the Government of India should be directed towards one goal of achieving three very, very important objectives. The first objective is to create as much employment as possible, to on shore jobs that were lost to China and bring them to India. मैं मानता हूँ कि रोजगार ऐसा मुद्दा है, जिस पर पूरे सदन में आम सहमति या सर्वसम्मति होगी। Everybody wants to ensure we get the youth of India employed as quickly as possible. The second strategic objective for India in my opinion is to rework our supply chains and, again, reduce our dependence on countries that can become hostile towards us. The third very crucial objective is, while achieving and solving the unemployment problem, and while reworking and bringing supply chains to India, simultaneously, greening our economy. People have spoken about, in the Budget as well and in the Economy Survey also, how supply chains are being brought back. Madam, world over, the western countries which for the last two or three decades, moved their manufacturing

to a country like China are now adopting what is called the 'China Plus One' strategy. They are adding countries like India to their manufacturing mix. They are also adopting something called 'ABC' 'Anywhere But China'. ...(*Interruptions*)...

Madam, my limited point is, bringing manufacturing to India is very, very crucial. Yesterday in television debates, even some Members of the Opposition praised PLIs. With regard to PLIs or Production Linked Incentives, statistics aside, if you look at one important example, a company like Apple which manufactures iPhones, today, 14 per cent of Apple's global production worth 14 Billion Dollars is happening in India; thanks to Production Linked Incentives. Therefore, suggestion number one is, we must direct Production Linked Incentives to industries that create the maximum amount of employment. I also congratulate this Government for various initiatives that have led to the increase of women in the workforce. As a woman, you will also appreciate, from 23 per cent seven years ago, today, the number of women in our workforce has gone up to 37 per cent. People spoke about competitive federalism. I also believe this is very, very critical. The more is the competition between States, the more India will become competitive globally. Artificial Intelligence/data revolution is another area we need to focus on. I believe if we use incentives in the right direction, we can create indigenous capabilities in Artificial Intelligence and we can also green our economy. With regard to green transition-- Bhpender Yadavji is here--I would like to say that while India's goal is to become net zero by 2070, how do we use these incentives to benefit industries like offshore wind energy? Green data centres will be a game-changer. I am also glad that the Finance Minister spoke about investing in small modular reactors. Nuclear energy is an area we should all be open-minded about. Every country in the world, from western countries to China, to green their economy, are increasingly now going nuclear. In fact, one eye-opening statistics is, by 2035, China will double its share of nuclear power in electricity generation, and by 2060, it will reach almost 20 per cent. A very good example of that is a country called Sweden. Thirty years ago, they began greening their economy. Everyone said, "You would lose jobs". In three decades, they have reduced their carbon emissions by 80 per cent and they have also grown their economy two-fold.

Madam, I have a few quick suggestions. I come from Mumbai, which is the financial, commercial capital of this country. Today, increasingly, young people, some of whom who have no idea, have no investing experience, are increasingly investing in the F&O (Futures & Options) segment of the Indian stock market. SEBI, which is the regulator, has made repeated warnings that nine out of ten trades will lose money. I believe a better way to incentivize people to invest for the long term

and not to become day traders, is to reduce the Long-Term Capital Gains. One suggestion that I would give to this Government and to the hon. Finance Minister, LTCG or Long-Term Capital Gains have been increased from 10 to 12.5%. I would urge the Finance Minister to review that.

An important point I would like to make again about Mumbai. मैं सबसे पहले महाराष्ट्र की ओर से गर्वनमेंट ऑफ इंडिया और खासकर कैबिनेट कमेटी को बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ कि गर्वनमेंट ऑफ इंडिया ने 76 हजार करोड़ रुपये की वधावन पोर्ट को मंजूरी दी है। This will be an economic game changer for Maharashtra, for the Mumbai metropolitan region. But, I would like to say that today GIFT City in Gujarat is growing well. We are all very happy about it. But I firmly believe that today India has the depth to have another international finance center in a city like Mumbai. This is very important for us to understand that cities like Mumbai and GIFT are not competing against Bengaluru or against Hyderabad or against Chennai. Our competition is Dubai to the West and Singapore to the East. One last point very quickly. We talk about investments, we talk about statistics, we are talking about creating jobs. I want to give one very good example. In the last few years, and I have seen this with my own eyes in the last few months, मैं महाराष्ट्र गर्वनमेंट के मुख्य मंत्री और उप मुख्य मंत्री जी को बधाई देना चाहूंगा। मैं Home Minister को बधाई देना चाहूंगा, Gadchiroli was a naxal hotbed. Today, because of the efforts of the Government of India and the State Government, recently a *bhumi puja* was done for a 10,000 crores steel project, which will bring 7,000 jobs to Gadchiroli. It is very easy to talk about development; it is very easy to talk about creating jobs, but how you actually implement it, is very important. And, these are my limited suggestions. I was hoping to give more suggestions. But, I hope the Finance Minister will take these suggestions up. One is LTCG, second is Mumbai, the third is again to use all our incentives, expenditures, subsidies to achieve three primary objectives - creating jobs, reworking our supply chains and greening our economy. Thank you very much.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (DR. KANIMOZHI NVN SOMU): Thank you very much.

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. BHAGWAT KARAD) *in the Chair.*]

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. BHAGWAT KARAD): First of all, I thank hon. Chairman and our House leaders for giving me this opportunity. The next speaker is Mr. Birendra Prasad Baishya. You have five minutes to speak.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA (Assam): Sir, I, on behalf of my party, Asom Gana Parishad and President of my party, Shri Atul Bora, rise here to welcome the Budget and to support the Budget proposed by the hon. Finance Minister. I must compliment hon. Finance Minister for her presentation of Budget continuously for the seventh term. This is the achievement of the Madam Finance Minister. Sir, we are getting very little time. I hope BJP will give me some extra time.

Sir, I would like to draw the attention to the few points of this Budget. Firstly, everyone who has assembled here must admit that this Budget is for mothers and sisters of our country because this Budget proposes three lakhs crores for the beneficiaries of women and girls of our country. Secondly, success of any economic policy depends upon the three factors - agriculture, service and manufacturing. Under the leadership of Shri Narendra Modi's Government, this Government equally give importance to manufacturing sector, agricultural sector and servicing sector. So, we have continuously achieved seven per cent growth. This Budget is for the welfare of the farmers. It is the farmer's friendly Budget. This Budget has allocated Rs. 1.27 lakh crores for the farmers' welfare and the agriculture sector of our country. Sir, this Budget is a job-oriented budget. This Budget is going to invest Rs. 2.78 lakh crores for the infrastructure development, for the road and transport development of our country. This Budget has proposed Rs. 2.55 lakh crores for the development of Railways. It means more money will be flowing in the market and capital expenditure will increase. Capital expenditure increase means new Railway Stations will come, new jobs for Railway porters will come, new routes will come up and that means job creation is also coming up in our country. This Budget has given equal importance to job creation in our country.

Sir, one of the basic things that I have seen in this Budget is that this Budget has proposed to give Rs. 6000 per month to 1.5 crore youths to get the training for skill development. It will be helpful to reduce the unemployment in our country. Sir, I would like to draw the attention of this House to one more thing which is very important. Many people have talked about federalism; yes, this Budget has given Rs. 1.27 lakh crores as interest-free loans to the State Government for their infrastructure development. This is the spirit of federalism which is supported by the Narendra Modi Government. Sir, I am very happy that Madam Finance Minister announced in the House that this Government is going to help the flood-affected people of Assam. Madam Finance Minister in her Budget speech categorically said that they will help the flood situation in Assam. The per capita income of Assamese people has been higher than any part of the country before Independence. But, due to floods, our economy is going down. So, we want permanent solution for floods. During the discussion on

Motion of Thanks on the President's Address also, I have spoken about this issue that we want long-term and short-term projects from the Government to resolve the flood situation.

Sir, I know that long-term projects will take time. Recently, a steel plant is coming up in Assam. Thirty four districts of Assam are flood-affected, 34 districts of Assam today are under floods. Out of 34 districts, 7,279 villages of Assam are badly affected. The roads, the school and the colleges all are badly affected. So, this is the worst situation in Assam. But, I am very grateful to hon. Chief Minister of my State. (*Time-bell rings.*)

THE VICE CHAIRMAN (DR. BHAGWAT KARAD): Thirty seconds left, four-and-a half minutes of your time have been finished.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (DR. L. MURUGAN): Sir, give some more time to the hon. Member.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA: Sir, hon. Chief Minister of my State, Shri Himanta Biswa Sarma, has physically visited each and every relief camp not aerially, but physically. So, this is the spirit of the State Government and State Government is taking all the possible measures to help the flood-affected people. I humbly request Government of India to look after the issue and give us handsome money to help the poor and flood-affected people.

Secondly, hon. Finance Minister categorically said in the House that flood is due to overseas issue. This flow of water is coming from China. So, a permanent solution is required. I request Government of India to include External Affairs Ministry and take up the issue with the Government of China to help us, to protect us from the floods. Sir, I must compliment Shri Narendra Modi because, for the first time, this Government is going to invest more than Rs. 27,000 crores for semiconductor in Assam. This is the first time it is going to happen in Assam. Sir, Rs. 27,000 crores are going to be invested.

I would like to say one more thing. This is the Government, under the leadership of Shri Narendra Modi, invested Rs. 35,000 crore for petroleum sector development in Assam. We are here for the development of Assam.

Sir, one of the major problems that Assam is facing today is relating to Assam Tea. Sir, Assam Tea is known to everybody. To boost our economy and to earn foreign exchange, Assam Tea industry plays a very important role in our country. This

tea industry, today, is suffering with a lot of problems. We are getting challenge from Kenya and Sri Lanka. So, to boost and save the tea industry of Assam, the Government of India should give some special package.

I would like to say one more thing. Small-tree growers play a very important role in addressing unemployment issue. They play a very important role. But, these small tea-growers, today, face serious problem. So, I would like to request, in the interest of unemployment situation in the country, because they are small tea-growers who play a very important and significant role not only in Assam's economy but also provide self-employment, help from the Government of India. The Government of Assam is making some better arrangement. It has already done some better arrangement to resolve the issue.

Another issue is that the Government of Assam is introducing mobile tea testing labs. Sir, small people cannot set up tea testing units. So, they are suffering a lot. And, without testing, their tea is not taken by big companies. So, I request the hon. Minister of Commerce and Industry give some money to permanently set up tea testing laboratories in the interest of small tea-growers. I hope this Government will provide this benefit as it will help to resolve the problem.

With these words, I thank you very much again for giving me this opportunity to speak on the Budget.

**श्री दीपक प्रकाश (झारखंड):** उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, आपका बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद कि आपने मुझे महत्वपूर्ण विषय पर बोलने का अवसर प्रदान किया। सबसे पहले मैं अच्छा बजट, संतुलित बजट लाने के लिए देश के यशस्वी प्रधान मंत्री, नरेन्द्र मोदी जी का और वित्त मंत्री, निर्मला सीतारमण जी का दिल की गहराई से अभिनन्दन करना चाहता हूँ और उनको साधुवाद देना चाहता हूँ। यह बजट 144 करोड़ जनता की आकांक्षा का प्रतीक है। यह बजट अमृत काल में समाज के सभी वर्गों में अमृत वर्षा करने वाला बजट है। यह बजट विकसित भारत की नींव का पत्थर साबित होगा। यह विकसित भारत का रोडमैप है और यह बजट देश को आगे बढ़ाने वाला बजट साबित होगा। यह बजट नेशन फर्स्ट की भावनाओं से ओत-प्रोत बजट है। मैं इस सदन में स्वामी विवेकानन्द जी को स्मरण करना चाहता हूँ। 125 वर्ष पहले मिशिगन विश्वविद्यालय में स्वामी विवेकानन्द जी ने कहा था कि यह सभी आपका है, लेकिन 21वीं सदी भारत की होगी। यह सौभाग्य की बात है और ईश्वरीय प्रदत्त चीज़ है कि स्वामी विवेकानन्द का भी नाम नरेन्द्र था और नरेन्द्र मोदी जी का नाम भी नरेन्द्र है। इसलिए स्वामी विवेकानन्द ने भारत के बारे में संकल्प लिया था और उस संकल्प को नरेन्द्र मोदी जी ने सिद्धि तक पहुंचाने का काम किया है। इसीलिए मैं नरेन्द्र मोदी जी का दिल की गहराई से अभिनन्दन करना चाहता हूँ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं जिस पार्टी का कार्यकर्ता हूँ, उस पार्टी की देश को समृद्धशाली बनाने की प्रतिबद्धता है। यह संकल्प कोई भारतीय जनता पार्टी के कालखंड में नहीं लिया गया है। जनसंघ के 1954 के अधिवेशन में भारत को समृद्धशाली बनाने का प्रस्ताव पारित होता है। 1969 में जनसंघ का जब अधिवेशन होता है, तो उसमें भारत को आर्थिक और सामाजिक दृष्टिकोण से

मजबूत बनाने का संकल्प लिया गया। जब 1980 में भारतीय जनता पार्टी की स्थापना होती है, तो भारत को समृद्धशाली, समर्थ भारत, स्वाभिमानी भारत और आत्मनिर्भर भारत बनाने का संकल्प भारतीय जनता पार्टी के स्थापना काल में लिया जाता है। इसलिए भारतीय जनता पार्टी के नेतृत्व में जब सरकारें रहती हैं, तब वे भारत का मान, सम्मान और स्वाभिमान बढ़ाने का काम करती हैं। कोरोना कालखंड के बाद से दुनिया की अर्थव्यवस्था वास्तव में बद से बदतर हो गई है। ऐसी विपरीत परिस्थिति में न केवल हमारे भारत ने स्थिति को संयम से संभाला, बल्कि आर्थिक गति को दशा और दिशा देते हुए देश की उन्नति का मार्ग प्रशस्त करने का कार्य सफलतापूर्वक किया और इस काम को करने वाले दुनिया के सर्वाधिक लोकप्रिय नेता का नाम नरेन्द्र मोदी जी है।

महोदय, आज देश की 144 करोड़ जनता का मान, सम्मान और स्वाभिमान केवल भारत में ही नहीं बढ़ा है, बल्कि दुनिया आज हर भारतीय को अच्छी नजर से देखने का काम करती है। यह है भारत का सामर्थ्य और इस सामर्थ्य को अगर किसी ने पहचाना है, तो देश के यशस्वी प्रधान मंत्री नरेन्द्र मोदी जी ने पहचाना है। केवल देश ही नहीं, बल्कि दुनिया की कई संस्थाएं भारत की अर्थव्यवस्था के संदर्भ में जो विचार प्रकट करती हैं, तो उससे देश की 144 करोड़ जनता का मस्तक ऊंचा हो जाता है। महोदय, मैं कुछ बातों को आपके सामने रखना चाहता हूँ। भारत में विश्व बैंक के जो केंद्रीय डायरेक्टर हैं - Auguste Tano Kouamé, उन्होंने कहा कि भारतीय अर्थव्यवस्था - भारी दबावों के बावजूद भारत के सेवा निर्यात में वृद्धि जारी है और चालू खाते का घाटा कम हो रहा है। इसके अलावा वर्ल्ड बैंक ने अपनी एक रिपोर्ट में कहा है कि दक्षिण एशिया की कुल अर्थव्यवस्था में भारत की अर्थव्यवस्था सबसे बड़ी है। भारत की विकास दर में सबसे अहम सेवा क्षेत्र और औद्योगिक विकास होगा।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, इंटरनेशनल मॉनिटरी फंड ने क्या कहा - राजकोषीय अनुशासन बनाए रखने के लिए भारतीय अर्थव्यवस्था की सराहना की जानी चाहिए और क्या कहा - भारत वैश्विक वृद्धि में 17 प्रतिशत का योगदान करेगा। भारत में महंगाई लगातार कम हो रही है। भले ही उनको जानकारी नहीं हो, लेकिन दुनिया को मालूम है कि कांग्रेस को छोड़कर, विपक्षियों को छोड़कर दुनिया मानती है कि दुनिया में महंगाई बढ़ रही है और भारत में महंगाई दर कम हो रही है। **...(व्यवधान)...** आईएमएफ ने और क्या कहा? आईएमएफ ने दुनिया में भारत की अर्थव्यवस्था को स्टार परफॉर्मर की संज्ञा दी।

डिजिटलीकरण और बुनियादी ढाँचे जैसे प्रमुख क्षेत्रों में आर्थिक सुधारों के कारण भारत की विकास दर मजबूती से बनी हुई है। आईएमएफ का और भी कहना है कि भारत में घरेलू माँग लगातार मजबूत बनी हुई है, नौजवान आबादी बढ़ रही है, जो उत्पादन बढ़ाने में सहयोग देगी और भारत को आर्थिक विकास करने से कोई रोक नहीं सकता है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से कुछ योजनाएँ, जो बजट में आई हैं, उनका अभिनंदन करना चाहता हूँ। मैं झारखंड का निवासी हूँ और मुझे गर्व है कि मैं झारखंड का निवासी हूँ। भारत सरकार ने झारखंड को आगे बढ़ाने में कोई कसर नहीं छोड़ी है और उसके तहत बजट में जो 'पूर्वोदय योजना' है, उस 'पूर्वोदय योजना' के लिए प्रधान मंत्री जी का अभिनंदन करना चाहता हूँ। इस योजना के द्वारा झारखंड सहित पूर्वी भारत के विकास को बढ़ावा मिलेगा, जिससे बुनियादी ढाँचे, उद्योग तथा अन्य योजनाओं से विकास की किरणें तेज होंगी और झारखंड ही

नहीं, बल्कि पश्चिमी बंगाल, बिहार, ओडिशा जैसे राज्य, जहाँ कांग्रेस के कालखंड में विकास की किरणें पहुँच नहीं पाई थीं, वहाँ इस बजट के माध्यम से विकास की किरणें धरातल तक पहुँचेंगी।

मैं आपके माध्यम से कहना चाहता हूँ कि इस बजट में संघीय ढाँचे के बारे में उल्लेख किया गया है, राज्य के आर्थिक विकास में संघीय सहायता का उल्लेख किया गया है, राज्यों के लेनदेन की प्रणाली को लचीला बनाया गया है। मेरी सरकार की मान्यता है, केंद्र सरकार की मान्यता है, मोदी जी की सरकार की मान्यता है कि केंद्र और राज्य, दोनों एक दूसरे के पूरक हैं और दोनों के संबंध अन्योन्याश्रय होने चाहिए। किंतु उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, आज मुझे बड़ी पीड़ा हुई। आज सुबह जब मैं यहाँ पर आया, तो एक प्रकार से कांग्रेस और विपक्षी दलों की भूमिका देखने से हमारे जैसे लोगों की आत्मा को वास्तव में बहुत तकलीफ हुई। मैं इस बात का उल्लेख करना चाहता हूँ कि इस बजट में देश के सभी राज्यों को आर्थिक सहायता देने का उल्लेख किया गया है। बिहार को अगर सड़कों के निर्माण के लिए कुछ अलग से योजना दी गई है, तो विपक्षियों को भी खुशी होनी चाहिए, लेकिन जिस प्रकार से कांग्रेसियों ने बिहार को आर्थिक सहायता देने पर सदन से वॉकआउट करने का काम किया, उससे वास्तव में बिहार के सभी बिहारी ही नहीं, बल्कि देश के अंदर जो बिहार के निवासी हैं, कांग्रेस ने उनकी आत्मा पर प्रहार करने का काम किया है। इसलिए बिहार के निवासी और बिहार के वे लोग, जो दूसरे प्रदेश में रहते हैं, कांग्रेस ने उनकी आत्मा पर जो प्रहार करने का काम किया है, यह सबसे दुखद बात है। अगर बिहार को कोई अतिरिक्त सहायता मिलती है, तो आपको परेशानी किस बात की है! आपके कलेजे पर साँप क्यों लोटता है! और तो और, जब मैं बिहार जाता हूँ, तो वहाँ पर आपके दल के लोग कहते हैं, ...**(व्यवधान)**... आपके दल के लोग कहते हैं, ...**(व्यवधान)**... आपके दल के लोग कहते हैं, ...**(व्यवधान)**... कहते हैं कि केंद्र सरकार से क्या सहयोग मिला। जब केंद्र की सरकार सहयोग करती है, तो आपके पसीने क्यों छूटते हैं? 'पसीना' शब्द तो unparliamentary नहीं है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... साँप भी नहीं है। यह मुहावरा है। बहुत ही आपत्तिजनक है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... इसी कारण से आज आप उस पक्ष में हैं और हम इस पक्ष में हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

महोदय, इस बजट में रोजगार के संदर्भ में - वास्तव में यह पहली सरकार है, केन्द्र में मोदी जी की सरकार, जो रोजगार देने के लिए कृतसंकल्प है। मेरे ख्याल से शायद यह पहली बार हुआ होगा कि रोजगार पाने वाला भी लाभार्थी होगा और रोजगार देने वाला भी लाभार्थी होगा। यह इस बजट का सबसे बड़ा खूबसूरत पहलू है। नौकरी में प्रवेश करने वाले 50 लाख युवाओं को 1 महीने का PFI - क्या यह कोई छोटी बात है? 25,000 नौजवानों को जॉब की ट्रेनिंग दी जाएगी। क्या यह कोई छोटी बात है? अपने कालखंड में तो आपने इसका विचार नहीं किया। पहली बार जो नौकरी पाएगा, उसको 1 महीने का वेतन - मुझे तो 1974 के आंदोलन को पढ़ने पर स्मरण आता है कि उस वक्त देश की जनता ने आपके खिलाफ बेरोजगारी के सवाल पर, महंगाई के सवाल पर, भ्रष्टाचार के सवाल पर आंदोलन किया था और साथ-साथ तानाशाही के खिलाफ आंदोलन किया था।

इस बजट में मोदी जी की सरकार ने आर्थिक विकास के संदर्भ में भी एक लक्ष्य रखने का काम किया है। इसमें आर्थिक विकास को 10.5 प्रतिशत तक बढ़ाने का लक्ष्य रखा गया है। इस बजट के अंदर निवेश को बढ़ाने का संकल्प है और इस बजट में निवेश को बढ़ा कर, व्यापार को



सुगम बनाकर, रोजगार का सृजन करने का संकल्प लिया गया है। यह एक ऐसी पहली सरकार है, जो मोदी जी की सरकार है।

महोदय, मैं आपसे निवेदन करते हुए कुछ तुलनात्मक विवरण भी रखना चाहता हूँ। आपके कालखंड में जीडीपी का जो रेट था, जो विकास दर थी, वह 6.7 परसेंट थी और आज जब एनडीए की सरकार है, तो यह 7.3 प्रतिशत है। आपके पूर्व वित्त मंत्री जी ने इन्फ्लेशन के बारे में खूब भाषण दिया। असत्य आंकड़े खड़ा करने का काम किया। मैं मुद्रास्फीति के बारे में उल्लेख करना चाहता हूँ। इन्फ्लेशन का जो रेट यूपीए के कालखंड में 10.1 प्रतिशत था, आज एनडीए गठबंधन की सरकार में, मोदी जी के सरकार के नेतृत्व में इन्फ्लेशन का रेट 4.6 प्रतिशत है। ये आंकड़े हमारे नहीं हैं, ये आंकड़े आपके भी नहीं हैं, ये स्टैटिस्टिकल आंकड़े हैं। आंकड़े सच बोलते हैं और आपको इन आंकड़ों का सामना करना पड़ेगा। अगर आपके समय के इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर की बात की जाए, तो सड़कों के निर्माण में, आपके समय में प्रत्येक दिन 12 किलोमीटर सड़क बनाने का काम होता था, यह आपने किया था और आज एनडीए के सरकार में, वर्तमान में प्रत्येक दिन 28 किलोमीटर सड़क बनती है। यूपीए के कालखंड में आपने एलपीजी के एक करोड़ कनेक्शंस का वितरण किया था और एनडीए की सरकार में, मोदी जी की सरकार में 13 करोड़ एलपीजी कनेक्शंस हमारी माताओं और बहनों के घरों तक पहुंचाने का काम किया गया। ...**(व्यवधान)**... हाँ, आप ठीक कह रही हैं, उनके घरों में भी पहुंचा। ...**(व्यवधान)**... अटल जी के शासन के बाद आप सत्ता में आए और आपको तो एक अच्छी विरासत मिली थी।

**(सभापति महोदय पीठासीन हुए)**

उस समय आपको एक अच्छी अर्थव्यवस्था विरासत के रूप में मिली थी, लेकिन आपने 2014 में मोदी जी को एक ऐसी अर्थव्यवस्था विरासत में देने का काम किया, जिसके बारे में बोलने में भारत का हर व्यक्ति शर्मसार होता है। आपने भारत को पूरी तरह से घोटालों का देश बनाने का काम किया। आपने जंगल, जमीन तथा आकाश से लेकर पाताल तक घोटालों का रिकॉर्ड खड़ा करने का काम किया। आपके शासन काल में पूरी तरह से financial anarchism था। बैंकिंग सिस्टम पूरी तरह से collapsed था और आज भारत का बैंकिंग सिस्टम पूरी दुनिया में सबसे बेहतर है। आपने इसको किस हाल में छोड़ दिया था? आपके मंत्री तथा आपके लोग पूँजीपतियों को चुटके देते थे और चुटकों के सहारे आप लोगों ने बैंक को खाली करने का काम किया, इसलिए आज आप पर से लोगों का विश्वास उठ चुका है।

महोदय, यह बजट ज्ञान पर आधारित है और गरीब, यूथ, अन्नदाता, नारी और मध्यम वर्ग पर आधारित है। यह बजट वास्तव में एक अनोखा बजट है और इस बजट में मैनुफैक्चरिंग, इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर और सर्विस सेक्टर के माध्यम से, सस्टेनेबल डेवलपमेंट, सस्टेनेबल ग्रोथ के माध्यम से समाज के सभी वर्गों का उत्थान करने का लक्ष्य रखा गया है।...**(समय की घंटी)**...

सभापति महोदय, मुझे एक मिनट का और समय दीजिए। मैं मानता हूँ कि जिस प्रकार से भारत ने हेल्थ सेक्टर में एक युगांतकारी परिवर्तन लाने का काम किया है, उसी तरह से स्वास्थ्य सेवाओं को और बेहतर करने के लिए केन्द्र की सरकार लगातार काम कर रही है, लेकिन मैं आज इस सदन में एक रोचक प्रसंग रखना चाहता हूँ। वह रोचक प्रसंग यह है कि मैं झारखंड से आता हूँ

और वहाँ पर कोडरमा जिला है और उस जिला में एक महिला को 12 बार बच्चा होना दिखाया गया है।...**(समय की घंटी)**... महोदय, सामाजिक सुरक्षा अभियान का कैसा लूट-पाट होता है, मैं उस संबंध में झारखंड की एक प्रसंग का उल्लेख करके अपनी बात खत्म करूँगा।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, you are already over time.

**श्री दीपक प्रकाश:** सर, मैं अपनी बात खत्म कर रहा हूँ। झारखंड में 'जननी सुरक्षा योजना' का किस प्रकार से लूट-पाट है, वह मैं बताना चाहता हूँ। वहाँ पर काँग्रेस की सरकार है, झारखंड मुक्ति मोर्चा की सरकार है, आरजेडी की सरकार है। वहाँ पर एक महिला को एक दिन में 12 बार बच्चा पैदा होना दिखाया गया है। इतना ही नहीं, बल्कि एक पुरुष को भी बच्चा पैदा होना दिखाया गया है। इससे दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण और क्या हो सकता है? यह इनकी सरकार, झारखंड की सरकार का कृत है। कमाल है, कई वैज्ञानिक आज इस खोज में लगे हुए हैं, लेकिन झारखंड की सरकार...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, you were concluding; you were concluding. Please conclude. Take half a minute.

**श्री दीपक प्रकाश:** सर, मैं आधा मिनट में अपनी बात समाप्त करता हूँ। मैं मानता हूँ कि देश की आजादी के बाद जब 1951 में फर्स्ट फाइव ईयर प्लान बना था, उसी में कहीं न कहीं खोट था।...**(समय की घंटी)**... सर, इसी के साथ मैं अपनी बात समाप्त करता हूँ, धन्यवाद।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. No, you are not rounding up. Hon. Members, after Shrimati Sagarika Ghose concludes her address, we will be taking up all the Special Mentions. Shrimati Sagarika Ghose - 15 minutes.

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE (West Bengal): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I rise to speak on behalf of my Party, the All-India Trinamool Congress, on the Union Budget presented by the hon. Finance Minister.

Inequality, inequality, inequality - this is the fundamental crisis facing our country today. This inequality crisis has not been addressed by this Budget, nor has it been addressed by the previous 10 Budgets of this Government. The Government is constantly telling us that it is pushing us into more and more growth, but it is pushing us into more and more inequality. This Government is pushing us into what I call "The Inequality Trap". The Paris-based World Inequality Lab has said, in its 2024 Report, that India's 'Billionaire Raj' has replaced the 'British Raj'. India is more unequal now than what it was in 1920s, in the colonial period. Sir, I want to repeat that India in 2024 is more unequal than what it was under the colonial rule in the 1920s. That is the catastrophe of inequality facing us. That is why the Budget needs to be about the real

people, the real India, the real issues and not about fantasy land, not about Disney land.

Here are some facts about inequality. The top one per cent of India controls 40 per cent of the country's wealth. Real earnings of regular salaried and self-employed have declined or remained stagnant. The hon. Finance Minister claimed that the GST has benefited the common man. But the truth is that 67 per cent of the GST is paid by the poorest 50 per cent of India. India is a country where 800 million people still depend on free food. The Budget needed to challenge, needed to address this inequality trap. It needed to tackle The Inequality Trap. It has failed to do so.

I wanted to present five examples of the inequality trap. The first is The Inequality Trap with regard to the States. The second is The Inequality Trap with regard to the rural areas. The third is The Inequality Trap with regard to jobs. The fourth is The Inequality Trap with regard to wealth and income. And, the fifth is The Inequality Trap with regard to health and education. First, I will speak regarding inequality trap on States. This is a Union Budget meant for 28 States and 8 Union Territories, but a specific focus on Andhra Pradesh and Bihar shows that this Government is looking to appease its new-found allies. Look at the allotments made for Andhra Pradesh. The allotments made for Bihar and the huge financial package for Andhra Pradesh. We wish the people of Bihar and Andhra Pradesh the best, but can you discriminate against some States and make special provision only for two States simply because you have forged a coalition with these States at the Centre? I have to remind that this is the same Government that went back on its promise of special status for Andhra Pradesh and Bihar. Now, for political convenience, the Government is bestowing largesse on these States. ...*(Interruptions)*... This unequal allotment is against constitutional democracy. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is constitutionally immoral. It is ethically repugnant. It is economically ruinous. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is not co-operative federalism. This is discriminatory federalism.

The Finance Minister talked about *Purvodaya*, Look East, Act East. But what is the Government doing in the largest State of eastern India? Bengal is under siege. Bengal is facing an economic blockade. Bengal has not received NREGA funds since December 26, 2021. A massive amount of over rupees one lakh crore is due from the Centre to Bengal. The Finance Minister talked about the PM Awas Yojana, but for Bengal, funds have been withheld under the PM Awas Yojana for 11 lakh sanctioned homes. An amount of Rs.7,000 crore has been withheld from Bengal under the National Food Security Act simply because the Centre wants certain pictures and logos on those centres. Why this economic siege of Bengal? It is not just about Bengal -- my friends from the DMK are here -- it is about Tamil Nadu, it is about

Karnataka, it is about Kerala. My friends from the Shiv Sena (Uddhav Thackeray faction) are here. It is also about Maharashtra. Every citizen, whether he is from Manipur, Maharashtra, Punjab or Kerala, has equal rights on the funds of the Government of India. Why is the federal spirit being compromised? I would like to make a suggestion here. What is needed is a time-bound transparent audit of all the Centrally-sponsored Schemes of the Centre. ...*(Interruptions)*... Will the Government give an assurance to this House of a transparent time-bound audit of all Centrally-sponsored schemes across States? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Samik Bhattacharya, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE: Sir, the second example of the inequality trap is... ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is this? ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Samik Bhattacharya. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE: Sir, the second example of the inequality trap ...*(Interruptions)*... The inequality trap in the rural areas... ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, when the Government is asked about legal guarantee for the Minimum Support Price... ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Samik Bhattacharya. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE: The Government's economic managers say that it will cost 17 lakh crore of rupees. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One second. Hold on. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE: Sir, no viability concerns are made ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Samik Bhattacharya. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Samik Bhattacharya. I urge the hon. Minister of Parliamentary Affairs to control the Member. This is not the way. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Member, please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is not the way. Why are you interrupting? ...*(Interruptions)*... I do not appreciate interruption. This will not happen. This will

not happen from either side. Please go ahead. She is making her point. It is a well-prepared speech. We may agree, we may not agree. Please go ahead.

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE: When the Government is asked about the legal guarantee for the Minimum Support Price, the Government's economic managers say, we can't do this; it will cost 17 lakh crores of rupees. But what about the fact that in 2019, the Government gave corporate India tax relief of about one lakh crore of rupees per year. The Home Minister is urging people to invest in the stock market but the poor labourer in Bengal is waiting for his NREGA wages. He does not get his NREGA wages.

No practical steps have been taken in this Budget to make agriculture buoyant. Allocations to agriculture and allied sectors have been reduced to only 3.15 per cent of the total Budget. Subsidies on fuel, food and fertilizers have been slashed. No permanent structure has been created for debt-relief for the farmers. When farmers agitated for the Minimum Support Price, the Government refused to have a dialogue with them. Mr. Chairman, Sir, do you know that just this year alone, 1,200 farmers in Maharashtra have committed suicide and have lost their lives. Why does the Finance Minister not recognize this reality? Today, in spite of the Jal Jeevan Mission hype, 22.5 per cent of the rural households only have access to piped water within their plot and yards throughout the year.

Sir, the third example of The Inequality Trap is jobs and unemployment. It has taken ten years for the Government to wake up to the reality of unemployment. *Amrit Kaal* and *Viksit Bharat* cannot happen without *rojgar*. In this speech, the hon. Finance Minister mentioned 'employment' 23 times. In the Budget for the year 2023-24, she had mentioned 'employment' just three times. At last, she has mentioned the word 'employment'. This is what a rebuff from the voter can do. Since the 2020 lockdown, millions have lost jobs but the Government is in a '*sab changa hai*' mindset. The internship and skilling programme is simply not good enough. It is way too inadequate. It does not address the scale of the problem. A Centrally-sponsored scheme for providing paid internship opportunities in 500 top companies or some rupees as benefit to first time employees is pure advertising and tokenism. It is not going to solve this mammoth problem of unemployment.

Sir, 42 per cent of graduates under the age of 25 can't find a job. The youth make up 80 per cent of India's unemployed. This year, as the hon. Member, Mr. Chidambaram also said, 47 lakh candidates applied for 60,000 constable jobs and 27,000 candidates applied for 600 jobs in Air India. There has not been no massive

push on education to make sure that money is pumped into education, without which lakhs of Indians will remain unemployed.

Sir, hatred, religious hatred is bad for the economy. Religious hatred cannot produce growth. Recently, orders were given to deny livelihood to people on the basis of food habits.

### 5.00 P.M.

The Supreme Court has struck it down, but India can only provide jobs when we build social harmony. Joblessness is very high among the disadvantaged communities, among *dalits*, among Muslims. In under privileged groups, joblessness is skyrocketing. There is nothing in this Budget that provides an assurance that the Government of India is standing by India's most disadvantaged citizens. This brings me to my fourth inequality trap, inequality of wealth and income. The Government talks of competition, but we only have oligarchy. We have a booming airline industry but only two operators of note; over a billion mobile subscribers but only three telecom companies. Sir, the rich have lavish celebrations, the rich have lavish weddings, lasting days. But only 50 per cent Indians can afford three square meals. We are at 142 out of 197 in per capita income. The biggest catastrophe of this Government has been the systematic destruction of the MSME sector. According to the Government's own data, more than 35,000 MSMEs have closed down since the Covid pandemic. How does the Government intend to address the income gap when those who are the most vulnerable to changing economic tides are the least protected? What protection is there for the MSMEs in this Budget? None! There has been no change or relief on the 45-day payment rule which is hurting MSMEs, as it is leading to cancellation of orders. Other than a sketchy sentence on rationalizing GST rates, no specific measure has been outlined in this Budget for the revival of the MSMEs. What stops the Government from cushioning MSMEs the way it is cushioning India's top corporates? Income will not rise until the unorganized sector is given the greatest, the top, foremost priority. Prioritize the unorganized sector now. Do it now.

To add to the woes of the ordinary citizens, the Budget has abolished the benefit of indexation, which now means a huge tax burden on all assets acquired before 2001. The burdens of real people have only increased. Wage earners and salaried taxpayers have been given little relief. Three words are not mentioned in this Budget — Railways, minimum support price for farmers and MGNREGA. Why has the Finance Minister not mentioned these three words fundamental to the real people of

India -- MGNREGA, Railways and minimum support price? I propose, as a solution, a dignity index. Let the Government create a dignity index to measure how many are living a life of dignity and aim to create an economy where the maximum number can live a life of dignity.

Sir, the fifth Inequality Trap is of health and education, stagnating or declining allocations to health and education. Health at one per cent and education hovering around two per cent of the GDP. In this Budget, health and education allocations have only gone down. Sir, a shocking statistics for you! The UNICEF has said that India is the second largest country with zero vaccinated children. In 2023, 1.6 million children did not receive any vaccine at all. ...*(Interruptions)*... A UNICEF Report says India is the second largest country of zero vaccinated children. On education, the state of education report says that 25 per cent of 14 to 18 year olds cannot read class 2 texts. An eighteen year old cannot read a class 2 text. That is the reality of education. The Budget shows no awareness of this demographic disaster that is threatening to take over our demographic dividend. Sir, Amartya Sen has said that economic development cannot be sustained without an educated and healthy workforce. A Budget is much more than just numbers. A Budget should reflect the ideals of this august House. This august House reflects the ideals of the constitution of dignity and equality of all. *(Time-bell rings.)* In Bengal, we are respecting dignity, but the Government is not. The Government has to wake up from this bubble and smell the coffee, or rather the *chai*, but without sugar because Indians cannot afford sugar. Sir, we were wanting a Budget for the people. We have got a Budget for the privileged. *(Time-bell rings.)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE: This Budget, the Budget of 2024, remains trapped in the inequality trap. Thank you, Sir.

---

### SPECIAL MENTIONS

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Special Mentions. Shri H.D. Devegowda. Concern over natural calamities in Karnataka, its neighbouring States and other parts of our country. Shri H.D. Devegowda.

**Concern over natural calamities in Karnataka, its neighbouring States and other parts of the country**

SHRI H.D. DEVEGOWDA (Karnataka): Mr. Chairman, Sir, with your kind permission, I would like to mention about the natural calamity that occurred not only in Karnataka but also in other parts of the country.

In this particular incident, nine people died in Shirur village in Ankola Taluk in Karnataka last week. When this incident took place -- my Congress friends are there -- no Government Minister went to this place. When people died, nobody went there and there was traffic jam. I was watching the proceedings of the House since morning. Sir, I don't want to raise the issue of politics. Politics is a different matter. Tomorrow, I will speak on how coalition Governments functioned in the past. I draw the attention of the House, since you are all elders, only to this issue. Sir, I requested you that tomorrow I will speak on the Budget. Because today I wanted to raise this issue. My friends are sitting here. Today, in the morning, one issue was raised with your kind permission. Somebody raised a point of order. Your good self has said, 'I will give the ruling tomorrow'. I know why you have permitted and with what background, and for the ruling which you are going to give tomorrow, we are waiting. When the hill collapsed, nine people died. It blocked the entire highway. Nobody from the State Government went there for six days. The Heavy Industries and Steel Minister of the Union Government went there. After his visit, the Military was sent by the Union Government. Then the Indian Navy, Fire Brigade, SDRF, NDRF and all these organisations were sent there after the Union Minister visited that part. Sorry! My friends are there. I am not blaming them. You are equally interested. Kharge ji is not here. No State Government Minister went to that part. ...*(Interruptions)*... Only the Union Minister went there with all these organisations and sent them there to remove the dead bodies after the sixth day. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka) : Sir, he is making a political speech here. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H.D. DEVEGOWDA: The Chief Minister of Karnataka, after six days, went there. ...*(Interruptions)*... See the fun! This is how Karnataka is functioning. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am not blaming you. I am sorry. ...*(Interruptions)*... I would like to request the hon. Members. You are all senior leaders. You must ask your leader, Khargeji. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is not for me. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is how the Government is functioning.



MR. CHAIRMAN: Sir, we will hear you tomorrow on Budget.

SHRI H.D. DEVEGOWDA: Now, my friends, I would like to tell you very frankly that it is not politics. ...*(Interruptions)*... When people died, what was the State Government doing? ...*(Interruptions)*... What is the State Government doing? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sir, we will hear you tomorrow. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री ईरण्ण कडाडी (कर्नाटक):** वही तो बोल रहे हैं। ..*(व्यवधान)*..

SHRI H.D. DEVEGOWDA: I thank the Union Government for sending all the NDRF, Indian Navy, fire brigade, etc. ...*(Interruptions)*... I thank the Union Government for taking necessary steps for the people who were suffering and to have the dead bodies removed. ...*(Interruptions)*... Today evening, it has been allowed after ten days. This is the position. ...*(Interruptions)*... Through hon. Chairman, Sir, I would like to bring this to the notice of the hon. House. I am grateful to you for having allowed me to speak. Thank you very much. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The hon. Member, Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha) associated himself with the Special Mention raised by the hon. Member, Shri H.D. Devegowda. ...*(Interruptions)*...

I will allow you. ...*(Interruptions)*... First, everyone has to take seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please take your seats. I will call you. Mr. Tiruchi Siva wants to raise a point of order. Please raise it.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, Special Mention means that we have to give it in writing well before and it is vetted and approved by the Secretariat. No word other than what is there in the admitted Special Mention should be read or spoken but he is giving a speech. All those things should be expunged other than what has been in the Special Mention.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी (राजस्थान):** सभापति जी, इस पर एक स्पेसिफिक प्रोविज़न है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: You read the provision. Mr. Pramod Tiwari, you raise your point of order and read the provision which you are invoking.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** ठीक है।

सभापति जी, मैं सिर्फ यह कह रहा हूँ कि मैंने जो बुक में पढ़ा है, वही बता रहा हूँ।

MR. CHAIRMAN: You will have to read. ...*(Interruptions)*... Pramodji, you will have to. ...*(Interruptions)*... Okay. He is raising a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Saket, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Are you raising a point of order?

SHRI SANDOSH KUMAR P (Kerala): Sir, actually, I would like to associate myself with Mr. Tiruchi Siva. Provisions and procedures are equal to all the Members. What is so special about the former Prime Minister? When the question of Special Mention comes, it is equally applicable to all the Members and we all follow that.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your point of order?

SHRI SANDOSH KUMAR P: Sir, I am just associating myself with Mr. Tiruchi Siva.

MR. CHAIRMAN: So, it is very simple. You are supporting Mr. Tiruchi Siva, a senior Member of the House. So, this is not a point of order. This can be summarily decided right now. ...*(Interruptions)*... No. Mr. Randeep, you will have to avail the opportunity in your own right. You are getting a support. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA (Rajasthan): Sir, you said that you will give me a chance. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA: With your kind permission, Sir, .....*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes; one minute. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE (WEST BENGAL): Sir, point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: He is raising first. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA: Sir, we all respect the office of the former Prime Minister.....*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute. Mr. Randeep, you are raising a point of order.

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA: Absolutely, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Raise the point of order.

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA: Yes, Sir. Sir, my point of order...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Number one, specify the rule and give the situation. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, you know the rule, you know the situation. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA: Sir, with your kind permission, we all respect the office of the former Prime Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*... In this case, he has been elected with the support of the Congress Party. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is an allegation. ...*(Interruptions)*... Don't make.. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, Mr. Surjewala. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA: \*

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record unless you raise a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Surjewala, you will have to raise the point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA: \*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes, Mr. Pramod Tiwari. ...*(Interruptions)*... He is on his

---

\* Not recorded.

legs. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sit down, I am here. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI: Sir, Rule 180A. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI: Sir, it is Rule 180A. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please take the book. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The book is with me, Mr. Tiwari. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI: Sir, please read Rule 180.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, Rule 180.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** "कोई सूचना ग्राह्य हो सके, इसके लिए उसमें निम्नलिखित शर्तें पूरी की जाएंगी, अर्थात् :

- (i) इसके साथ विशेष उल्लेख का पाठ, जो कि 250 शब्दों से अधिक न हो, संलग्न होगा;
- (ii) वह किसी ऐसे विषय से संबंधित नहीं होगा जो मुख्यतः भारत सरकार का विषय न हो;
- (iii) उसमें किसी ऐसे विषय का उल्लेख नहीं होगा जिस पर उसी सत्र में चर्चा हो चुकी हो अथवा जो सत्र के दौरान इस नियम के अधीन किसी सदस्य द्वारा पहले ही उठाये गये... "

MR. CHAIRMAN: You come to the point. I have read the Rule. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI: Let me read, Sir. You insisted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, I insisted. You have indicated the Rule. Now, come to the fact situation. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will give you opportunity. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** सर, आपकी रूलिंग सबके ऊपर होती है। इस पर भी आपकी रूलिंग रही है कि जो लिखा गया है, सिर्फ वही पढ़ा जाएगा। न उसमें कुछ ऐड किया जा सकता है, न डिलीट किया जा सकता है। मान्यवर, मैं बड़ी देर से, ध्यान से फॉर्मर प्राइम मिनिस्टर को सुन रहा था। जो लिखा है, वह उन्होंने पढ़ा नहीं। \*

---

\* Not recorded.

MR. CHAIRMAN: This will not go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Pramodji. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** मेरा मेन ऑब्जेक्शन यह है कि जो लिखा नहीं था, वह पढ़ कैसे रहे थे?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. ...*(Interruptions)*... Do you want to say? ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** दूसरी बात, स्टेट गवर्नमेंट के बारे में है। How can he mention? मेरा एक अनुरोध है कि इसे एक्सपंज किया जाए, कार्यवाही से निकाला जाए।

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... You have had your way and say, both. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** ठीक है, सर।

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have had your way and say, both. Now, Mr. Saket Gokhale, before you use your lung power and vocal chords.....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: No, no. I have a mic now.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do one thing. Specify a rule.

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: Yes, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: And, in all dignity, raise your point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: Sir,.....*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will decide. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will decide, don't bother. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am getting everybody's views. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री साकेत गोखले:** सर, आप मुझे बोलने से पहले करेक्ट करते हैं। बोलने के बाद कीजिए न।

**श्री सभापति:** मेरे को डायरेक्शन मत दीजिए न! It will be better for you to go by my direction. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: Sir, Rule 180B. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Rule 180B? Is it the same as Mr. Pramod Tiwari read?  
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: No, no. I am coming to a specific point, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes. Which provision of it are you invoking?

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: It is the first one, the sub-clause (i).

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes.

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: It is about Special Mentions: "It shall be accompanied by a text of the special mention not exceeding 250 words." That is (i) I am referring to. उसके बाद में number (iv), "It shall not raise more than one issue and the issue shall not pertain to trivial matters;"

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, fine.

**श्री साकेत गोखले:** उसके बाद में number (v), "It shall not contain arguments, inferences, ironical expressions, imputations, epithets or defamatory statements;"

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have read it. Come to your point now.

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: Now, the point is, in terms of average word per minute of an average speaker, 250 words is roughly about four minutes.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Three.

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: It is two to three minutes. This is number one. Number two, about the text, we all submit Special Mentions. The text has to be adhered too. So, with due respect, I would like to request you to kindly expunge the remarks made by the hon. former Prime Minister, Mr. Devegowda.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Is it a point of order?

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: Yes, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay, heard it. Now, Shri Bhupender Yadav, hon. Minister. Bhupenderji, Shri Pramod Tiwari, a very experienced Member, has made his reflections. I expect on an issue.... *...(Interruptions)...* One minute. *...(Interruptions)...* Can't you have patience? I allowed all who wanted to speak. Hon. Minister, I said... *...(Interruptions)...* Mr. Tiruchi Siva has raised a point which is very important that an hon. Minister of the Union cannot, even with the permission of the Chair, reflect on an issue. *...(Interruptions)...* So, I have called him. Yes, Mr. Bhupender Yadav. *...(Interruptions)...*

**पर्यावरण, वन और जलवायु परिवर्तन मंत्री (श्री भूपेन्द्र यादव) :** सर, आप बहुत अच्छे तरीके से संचालन करते हैं और आप एक लंबे समय के लिए नियम प्रतिपादित कर सकते हैं। मैं आपसे निवेदन करने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूँ। सर, रूल 235 से 238 में यह बताया गया है कि सदस्य जब बोलें, तो कैसा व्यवहार करना चाहिए। जो खुद ही किसी सदस्य को डिस्टर्ब कर रहे हों, क्या उनको प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर मांगने का अधिकार है, इसको स्पष्ट कीजिए।

MR. CHAIRMAN: One second.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** सर, जो मैंने बोला है, वह आपकी परमिशन से बोला है। किसी मंत्री को यह अधिकार नहीं है कि वह चेयरमैन की रूलिंग पर सवाल उठाए। ये आपकी रूलिंग पर, जो आपने परमिट किया था और बोला था, उस पर सवाल उठा रहे हैं। इसलिए आप इनको डांटिए। *...(व्यवधान)...* सर, इनको डांटिए।

MR. CHAIRMAN: You want me to decide this also! *...(Interruptions)...*

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** साहब, इनको डांटिए। *...(व्यवधान)...*

MR. CHAIRMAN: No; Mr. Tiwari, you want me to decide this also. One second. *...(Interruptions)...* Yes, Devegowdaji. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI H.D. DEVEGOWDA: The hon. Minister will co-operate.

**श्री सभापति:** देवेगौड़ा जी, आप बैठकर बोलिए, we have respect for your age.

SHRI H.D. DEVEGOWDA: Sir, with your kind permission... *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. CHAIRMAN: But, please speak while sitting. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI H.D. DEVEGOWDA: Sir, in the 60 years of political career, I have never used unparliamentary language either in the Assembly or in the Lok Sabha or in the Rajya Sabha. I know my limitations. I have not hurt anybody. I have only spoken facts. ...*(Interruptions)*... Even after six days, the State Government, the Chief Minister or the Minister nobody has gone there. Is it an unparliamentary word? Let the hon. Chairman give the ruling on this issue. If at all, I have made any mistake, I withdraw. I have no hesitation. I don't want to learn from these friends. Let me be honest. I know my limitations. I never hurt anybody. I only mention the facts. I have never used unparliamentary words. I am so sorry. I would like to submit this for your kind permission. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: \*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will be going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

Mr. Nagar, don't address the Chair while sitting. You are a physically fit person and you have on your right side someone who knows the rules in and out. So, please don't. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is a serious matter. Therefore,... ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, Mr. Tiruchi Siva.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, we have not said that he has mentioned any unparliamentary words. We said that it didn't confine with the rules. Rule 180B (v) says, "It shall not contain arguments, inferences, ironical expressions, imputations, epithets or defamatory statements." That is Special Mention. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I have looked into everything and hon. Members are, particularly, agitated on one aspect that Special Mention is a mechanism whereby a Member has to adhere to the script. What hon. Members, perhaps, missed in this case, you will get in my decision on this point of order. Secondly, all Members of this House are respectable. They deserve respect. But to make an observation at former Prime Minister is unfortunate. We have leaders in all parties, we respect them. We respect them not because others are not equal to them. We respect them; we have a civilization, we believe in a culture. If Mr. Pramod Tiwari rises, I look at him because he has nine years continued membership in the Assembly and here. I look at Mr. Mukul Wasnik. I look at Mr. Digvijaya Singh as Chief Minister for ten years. I look at Mr. Praful Patel having had...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Jairam is

---

\* Not recorded.



young. Mr. Jairam is young enough not to get into this big league. ...*(Interruptions)*... As a matter of fact, this issue was raised, in my Chamber and otherwise, by Mr. Raghav Chadha, who is raising the hand, and he wanted to claim parity. Now, let me tell you with my little experience. All are equal in the family also. All are equal when you go to cast vote also. But in the family, you know whose respect is more. You don't expect me, when the hon. former Prime Minister, before saying anything, had sought my leave. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, he sought my leave and he is fully aware of the authority of the Chairman. Now I will give my ruling. I *prima facie* find no transgression. But I will give my ruling when I have to tie my hands and tie my feet and run this House, even when I feel that there is a person of stature. There are occasions when ignoring the rule and invoking my authority, I granted permission to Khargeji. Now would you ask me under what rule, I granted him permission today? ...*(Interruptions)*... It was not a point of order. It was granted because he is entitled, and this is what I had said in the very beginning. So hon. Members, bear with me. You will get a ruling day after. Now Shri Ayodhya Rami Reddy Alla; demand for unified law on industrial accidents in India.

### **Demand for Unified Law on Industrial Accidents in India**

SHRI AYODHYA RAMI REDDY ALLA (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, industrial workers are the backbone of industrialized India, and their safety must be a top priority. The consequences of industrial accidents are devastating, including loss of life, environmental damage, economic disruptions and psychological trauma.

(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*)

Incidents like the Bhopal Gas Tragedy and the recent Thane explosion that claimed eleven lives underscore the need for a comprehensive regulatory reform. According to the National Disaster Management Authority (NDMA), there have been over 130 significant chemical accidents in the last decade, resulting in more than 250 fatalities. These incidents reveal serious gaps in our safety regulations and enforcement. Currently, industrial safety is governed by 15 acts and 19 rules, leading to overlapping jurisdictions and weak enforcement. This fragmented approach results in significant gaps in oversight and safety measures. Moreover, the absence of a comprehensive chemical risk database hampers effective hazard assessment and the development of safety protocols. Insufficient worker training and poor investment in safety infrastructure, often due to cost-cutting measures, further exacerbate the

problem. I urge upon the Government to create a unified law on industrial accidents. This law should streamline existing regulations, establish a centralized database for chemical risks, and ensure stringent enforcement of safety standards. It should also mandate proper training for workers and adequate investment in safety infrastructure. We owe it to our hardworking industrial workforce to ensure their safety and well-being.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by the hon. Member, Shri Ayodhya Rami Reddy Alla: Shri Sandosh Kumar P (Kerala), Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Shri Sujeet Kumar (Odisha), Shri R. Girirajan (Tamil Nadu), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shri Haris Beeran (Kerala), and Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu).

Now Shri Neeraj Dangi.

**श्री नीरज डांगी:** उपसभापति महोदय, बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद। सर, मेरा माइक ऑन नहीं है।

**श्री उपसभापति:** आपके पीछे माइक ऑन है। आप जहाँ से बोल रहे हैं, वहाँ भी माइक ऑन है। आप जहाँ खड़े हैं, वहाँ भी माइक ऑन है।

**Demand to increase the amount of Member of Parliament Local Area Development Scheme i.e. 'MPLAD'**

**श्री नीरज डांगी (राजस्थान) :** उपसभापति महोदय, बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद, आपने एक महत्वपूर्ण विषय, जो इस ओर और उस ओर के सभी सांसदों के लिए महत्वपूर्ण है, इस विशेष उल्लेख के जरिए उठाने के लिए मुझे अवसर प्रदान किया है। संसद सदस्य स्थानीय क्षेत्र विकास योजना 'एमपीलैड' की शुरुआत 23.12.1993 को पूर्व प्रधानमंत्री श्री नरसिंह राव द्वारा सभी दलों के सांसदों के आग्रह पर 5 लाख रुपये प्रति सांसद की राशि से प्रारंभ की गई थी, जिससे सांसद अपने क्षेत्र में स्थायी सामुदायिक परिसंपत्तियों के निर्माण सहित जनता को बुनियादी सुविधाएँ प्रदान करने के लिए विकास कार्यों की सिफारिश कर सकें।

'एमपीलैड' फंड की राशि को वर्ष 1998-99 में 5 लाख से बढ़ाकर 2 करोड़ रुपये किया गया और 13 वर्ष पश्चात् वर्ष 2011-12 में सांसदों के आग्रह पर इसे बढ़ाकर प्रति वर्ष 5 करोड़ रुपये किया गया। वर्ष 2011-12 के बाद 13 वर्षों में इस राशि को बढ़ाने पर कोई पुनर्विचार नहीं हुआ।

महोदय, एक संसदीय क्षेत्र में लगभग 8 से 10 विधान सभा क्षेत्रों का समावेश होता है। राजस्थान, उत्तर प्रदेश, पंजाब और केरल जैसे राज्यों में 'विधायक स्थानीय क्षेत्र विकास योजना' के अंतर्गत राशि कई वर्षों से पांच करोड़ या 5 करोड़ रुपये से अधिक है। दिल्ली में यह राशि 10

करोड़ रुपये प्रति विधायक है। 'विधायक स्थानीय क्षेत्र विकास योजना' की राशि और 'सांसद स्थानीय क्षेत्र विकास योजना' की राशि लगभग समान हो गई है, जबकि आनुपातिक रूप से यह राशि लगभग 8 से 10 गुना होनी चाहिए। वहीं किसी राज्य सभा सांसद के लिए पूरे राज्य में विकास योजनाओं हेतु 5 करोड़ का सांसद स्थानीय क्षेत्र विकास कोष पर्याप्त नहीं है।

अतः आग्रह है कि 13 वर्ष पूर्व निर्धारित इस राशि पर पुनर्विचार करते हुए 'सांसद सदस्य स्थानीय क्षेत्र विकास योजना' की राशि को बढ़ाकर 15 करोड़ रुपये प्रति सांसद किया जाना चाहिए। महोदय, आपके माध्यम से मेरा सरकार से आग्रह है कि MPLADS की राशि 15 करोड़ रुपये करने पर विचार करें।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by the hon. Member, Shri Neeraj Dangi: Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala), Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Shri Sujeet Kumar (Odisha), A. A. Rahim (Kerala), Shri R. Girirajan (Tamil Nadu), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Shri K.R.N. Rajeshkumar (Tamil Nadu), Shrimati Sulata Deo (Odisha), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shri M. Shanmugam (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala), Shri Haris Beeran (Kerala) and Shri Sandosh Kumar P (Kerala).

**Government to intervene in the recent hike of import duty for exporters of oranges from Vidarbha region in Maharashtra to Bangladesh**

DR. ANIL SUKHDEORAO BONDE (Maharashtra): Sir, you are aware that in Maharashtra State, Amravati and Nagpur Division is recognized as Vidarbha. It is also the highest orange-fruit producer and exporter in the country. Total 1,26,000 hectares of area is occupied for production of Oranges in Amravati and Nagpur Division. Around seven lakh metric tonnes of Oranges are produced in the season of Ambiya and Mriga bahar. The farmers and producer company exporters of this Division have yearly been exporting around 1.25 to 1.50 lakh metric tonnes of Oranges to Bangladesh. But, due to hike in Import Duty by Bangladesh Government from Rs. 32 to Rs. 62 per Kg, the Orange export to Bangladesh has totally been stopped this season. Due to multiple-time hikes in Import Duty and devaluation of currency of Bangladesh, total Orange export from Vidarbha has suffered. I urge upon the Government to look into the matter and impress upon the Government of Bangladesh to reduce the Import Duty or support Orange exporters by providing 25 to 30 per cent subsidy to continue Orange export to Bangladesh.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with

the Special Mention made by the hon. Member, Dr. Anil Sukhdeorao Bonde: Shri Dhananjay Bhimrao Mahadik (Maharashtra), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala) and Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu).

**Demand for Tribal Circuit for Western Odisha under Swadesh Darshan Scheme  
(Kalahandi - Rayagada - Koraput – Kandhamal)**

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR (Odisha): Sir, Odisha has the third highest concentration of tribals in India. The tribes have highly developed artistic skills, which are evident in their body paintings, ornaments, weaving, and wall paintings. The Swadesh Darshan Scheme underlines the possibility of a huge potential for better livelihood opportunities and improved quality of life of the tribals. Spread across districts, waterfalls, temples and wildlife sanctuaries adorn the state. The Majhighariani Temple in Rayagada; Gupteshwar Temple in Koraput as well as the city of Jeypore which is the commercial centre of the district; Dokaridara, Gudahandi Caves and Phurlijharan Waterfall in Kalahandi; and Mandasaru Gorge are some notable tourist attractions that can form a successful tribal circuit. The tribes in these areas face various development challenges and have extremely low annual incomes while working in the unorganized sector. The establishment of a tribal circuit under the Swadesh Darshan Scheme would enhance the livelihood of the people around these tourist sites by generating local employment opportunities. This provision would also improve tourist infrastructure, including transportation facilities between districts. An influx of tourists would enable local artists to share their culture and heritage with a wider audience, greatly expanding their reach. Sir, I urge the Central government to enhance the implementation of this provision under the Swadesh Darshan Scheme. This will aid in the development of the area, promote tourism, and bring socio-economic benefits to the State.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by the hon. Member, Shri Sujeet Kumar: A. A. Rahim (Kerala), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala), Shrimati Sulata Deo (Odisha), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu) and Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu).

### **The issue of reconstitution of Marathwada Statutory Development Board**

DR. BHAGWAT KARAD (Maharashtra): Sir, the Constitution of India has, during its formation and various instances appreciated the need for targeted development activities in various regions of India. Thereby, Article 371 provided various States with the mandate to establish Statutory Development Boards. Through the hon. Governor, the State of Maharashtra has thus received the special responsibility of establishing the Marathwada, Vidharbha and Rest of Maharashtra Development Boards, respectively.

Established in 1994, these Boards undertook significant contribution towards development of the regions. Their work encompassed areas including MSME growth, investment boost and other infrastructure-related activities.

However, unfortunately, these Boards have not been functioning since June 2020. Through you, I seek to highlight before the House that these Boards undertake an extremely crucial function of ensuring equitable development across the regions. I belong to the region of Marathwada and had...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please follow the text strictly.

DR. BHAGWAT KARAD: ...witnessed firsthand, the impact of these Development Boards on ground. Thus, I seek to stress upon the urgency with which these Boards must be reconstituted to benefit the people of Marathwada, Vidharbha and other regions.

The Government has highlighted the importance of Sabka Saath and Sabka Vikas, under the leadership of hon. Prime Minister Shri Narendra Modi ji. The Statutory Development Boards will play an extremely important role in development in ensuring the same.

**श्री उपसभापति:** कृपया जो approved text है, वही पढ़ें।

**डा. भागवत कराड़:** सर, मैं वही पढ़ रहा हूँ।

**श्री उपसभापति:** नहीं, चेंज है।

DR. BHAGWAT KARAD: Sir, I urge the Government to take positive steps in this direction.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention raised by the hon. Member, Dr. Bhagwat Karad: Shri Dhananjay Bhimrao Mahadik (Maharashtra) and Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha).

माननीय श्री संजय सिंह।

### Concern over abuse of elders

**श्री संजय सिंह** (राष्ट्रीय राजधानी क्षेत्र, दिल्ली): मान्यवर, देश में बुजुर्गों के साथ दुर्व्यवहार और उन्हें अकेला छोड़ देने के मामले तेजी से बढ़ रहे हैं। जिसके चलते बुजुर्गों को वृद्ध आश्रम में रहने हेतु मजबूर होना पड़ रहा है। वृद्ध व्यक्ति समाज के लिए संपत्ति की तरह होते हैं। हमारी भारतीय संस्कृति में बुजुर्गों को बरगद की छांव का दर्जा दिया जाता है, लेकिन उसी समाज की एक कड़वी सच्चाई यह भी है कि वृद्ध लोगों के साथ दुर्व्यवहार एक गंभीर समस्या बन चुकी है। पिछले कुछ साल पहले दिल्ली के एक गैर-सरकारी संगठन 'एजवेल फाउंडेशन' ने देश के 20 राज्यों के 10 हजार बुजुर्गों पर एक सर्वेक्षण किया था। इसकी रिपोर्ट डराने वाली थी। रिपोर्ट के मुताबिक लगभग 23 फीसदी, यानी देश का हर चौथा बुजुर्ग देश में अकेला रहने को मजबूर है। यह बुराई केवल शहरों तक ही सीमित नहीं, बल्कि रिपोर्ट कहती है कि लगभग 21 फीसदी बुजुर्ग गांवों में, जबकि 25 फीसदी बुजुर्ग शहरों में अकेले रह रहे हैं। यही कारण है कि संयुक्त राष्ट्र भी जागरूकता के जरिए इसे रोकने के लिए प्रयासरत है। देश में बुजुर्ग मां-बाप या वरिष्ठ नागरिकों के साथ दुर्व्यवहार को रोकना हम सबकी सामाजिक जिम्मेदारी है।

महोदय, बुजुर्गों की यह स्थिति देखते हुए मैं सरकार से यह मांग करता हूँ कि बुजुर्गों और माता-पिता को छोड़ने और उनके साथ मारपीट से बचाव हेतु एक सकारात्मक प्रावधान लाया जाए और बुजुर्गों के सामाजिक और आर्थिक हित को सुनिश्चित किया जाए।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention raised by the hon. Member, Shri Sanjay Singh: Shrimati Sulata Deo (Odisha), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri A. A. Rahim (Kerala), Shri Sandosh Kumar P (Kerala), Shri Haris Beeran (Kerala), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala), Shri Sant Balbir Singh (Punjab), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Shri R. Girirajan (Tamil Nadu) and Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu).

### Demand for making tourism management simple and effective by using technology

**श्रीमती सुमित्रा बाल्मीक** (उत्तर प्रदेश): महोदय, भारत जैसे विशाल और विविधता से भरपूर देश में प्रौद्योगिकी से पर्यटन का प्रबंधन सरल और प्रभावी बनाया जा सकता है। रियल टाइम डेटा

एनालिटिक्स के माध्यम से विभिन्न पर्यटन स्थलों पर भीड़ का पूर्वानुमान लगाया जा सकता है और भीड़ को नियंत्रित करने के उपाय किए जा सकते हैं। मान्यवर, मोबाइल एप्स और वेबसाइट्स से पर्यटकों को वर्तमान स्थिति के बारे में सूचित करके उनकी यात्रा की योजना बेहतर बनाई जा सकती है। डिजिटल टिकटिंग सिस्टम और ऑनलाइन बुकिंग प्लेटफॉर्म के माध्यम से पर्यटन स्थलों पर लंबी कतारों को कम किया जा सकता है। क्यू आर कोड स्कैनिंग और ई-टिकट्स का उपयोग करके प्रवेश प्रक्रिया को सुव्यवस्थित किया जा सकता है, जिससे पर्यटकों का समय बचेगा और उनका अनुभव सुखद रहेगा। आर्टिफिशियल इंटेलिजेंस (एआई) और मशीन लर्निंग का उपयोग करके पर्यटन स्थलों की सुरक्षा बढ़ाई जा सकती है। निगरानी कैमरों और सेंसरों के माध्यम से संदिग्ध गतिविधियों की पहचान की जा सकती है और तुरंत कार्रवाई भी की जा सकती है। अंततः सोशल मीडिया और डिजिटल मार्केटिंग का उपयोग करके विभिन्न पर्यटन स्थलों को वैश्विक स्तर पर प्रमोट किया जा सकता है, जिससे स्थानीय अर्थव्यवस्था को बढ़ावा मिलता है और अंतर्राष्ट्रीय पर्यटकों की संख्या में वृद्धि होती है।

अतः मैं माननीय पर्यटन मंत्री जी से अनुरोध करती हूँ कि वे इस तरह की कोई व्यवस्था क्रियान्वित करें, जिससे पर्यटकों को सुगमता हो सके और पर्यटन स्थलों को भी पॉपुलेशन प्रेशर से मुक्त किया जा सके। महोदय, वर्ष 2047 तक विकसित भारत बनाने की मोदी जी की गारंटी में पर्यटन की अहम भूमिका होगी, धन्यवाद।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shrimati Sumitra Balmik: Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shrimati Sulata Dev (Odisha), Shri Abdul Wahab (Kerala) and Shri Dhanjay Bhimrao Mahadik (Maharashtra).

[उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्रीमती एस. फान्गानॉन कोन्याक) पीठासीन हुईं]

**Demand for reservation of seats for Limboo and Tamang Scheduled Tribe  
Communities in the Sikkim Legislative Assembly**

SHRI DORJEE TSHERING LEPCHA (Sikkim): Sir, Limboo and Tamang Communities were included in the list of Scheduled Tribes in the year 2003. These communities are constitutionally entitled to reservation in the Sikkim Legislative Assembly in terms of Article 332 read with Article 371F (f) of the Constitution. In the past the Government of Sikkim had taken several steps to get reservation of Limboo and Tamang communities in the Assembly and resolutions were also passed by the Assembly for the purpose.

On the direction of the Supreme Court in 2016, things started moving in positive direction but nothing had happened. Before the General Elections and Assembly Elections in Sikkim in 2019 this issue was under active consideration of the GOI and it was proposed to increase the seats of the Sikkim Assembly from 32 to 40 and provide reservation to the Limboo and Tamang. But the proposal did not move further even though it was at a very advanced stage.

Recently, the Supreme Court in case of Public Interest Committee for Scheduling Specific Areas Vs UoI 2023 has clearly said that Parliament is competent to provide necessary reservation to the Limboo and Tamang communities by amending the Representation of the People Act, 1950.

The Elections of 2024 have also passed. A thing which was appearing so close in 2019 could not be given in 2024. Sir, 21 years have passed but the Limboo and Tamang ST Communities have still not got their Constitutional rights. It is high-time that these communities are given representation in the Sikkim Assembly. I urge the Government to look into the matter.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (Shrimati S. Phangnon Konyak): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Dorjee Tshering Lepcha: Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shri Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu) and Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha).

Shri Ramji Lal Suman — hon. Member not present. Next, Shri P.L. Suneer.

### **Demand for holistic development of Kozhikode International Airport**

SHRI P.P. SUNEER (Kerala): Madam Vice-Chairman, The Kozhikode International Airport is an international airport serving the Malabar region, consisting of Kozhikode, Malappuram, Wayanad and Palakkad in Kerala. The Kozhikode International Airport is country's 21st busiest airport in terms of passenger traffic having handled 33,20,250 passengers in the year 2023-24. According to projections, the Kozhikode Airport will see growth both in terms of passengers and cargo volume in future and forward looking development of the airport is necessary to keep up with time and to serve the people better. The Kozhikode Airport serves as a major transport hub for the expatriate Malayali community from the districts of Kozhikode, Malappuram, Wayanad and Palakkad. It is the only airport in Kerala being operated by the Airport Authority of India (AAI). Despite its importance in serving the people of Malabar region, many facilities are lacking. International passengers often have to wait for the



lack of Immigration Officers. Being one of the rare airports in India with a table-top runway, the geographical challenges are also unique. In the light of the importance of Kozhikode Airport, international and domestic flights should be increased from all major cities of India and Gulf countries. Kerala Government has already acquired land for the expansion of airport and runway, with proper compensation to residents. The runway correction work should be concluded timely, keeping in mind the growth in the number of passengers and to enable large aircrafts land safely. The AAI should also focus on providing modern and passenger friendly services in both the terminals to make travel hassle free. I urge upon the Government to look into the matter.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (SHRIMATI S. PHANGNON KONYAK): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention raised by the hon. Member, Shri P.P. Suneer: Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Dr. John Brittas, Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala), Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala), Shri Haris Beeran (Kerala), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), and Shri Sandosh Kumar P. (Kerala).

Now, hon. Member, Shri A.D. Singh — not present. Next, Dr. Medha Vishram Kulkarni.

#### **Demand for conservation of Shaniwar Wada Architecture of Pune**

**डा. मेधा विश्राम कुलकर्णी** (महाराष्ट्र): माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदया, मैं आपका ध्यान पुणे के महत्वपूर्ण ऐतिहासिक स्थल शनिवार वाड़ा की ओर आकर्षित करना चाहती हूँ, जिसकी स्थिति वर्तमान में बहुत खराब है। यह ग्रेड ए हेरिटेज संरचना भारतीय पुरातत्व सर्वेक्षण (ASI) की देखरेख में है। वर्ष 1736 में मराठा साम्राज्य की विरासत के रूप में स्थापित किया गया यह वास्तु भारतीय इतिहास का महत्वपूर्ण हिस्सा है।

पेशवा बाजीराव प्रथम ने 1736 में इस महल का निर्माण शुरू किया, जो पेशवाओं का मुख्यालय था और भारतीय उपमहाद्वीप के सबसे शक्तिशाली केंद्रों में से एक था। हालांकि, वर्ष 1828 में एक भयानक आग ने इसका अधिकांश हिस्सा नष्ट कर दिया। यह महल ब्रिटिशों के आगमन से पहले के स्वदेशी साम्राज्य का प्रतीक है।

शनिवार वाड़ा की उचित देखभाल और रखरखाव ना होने के कारण इसकी स्थिति जर्जर हो गई है। इसके अधिकांश हिस्से कमजोर हो गए हैं और कभी भी गिरने का खतरा है। केंद्र सरकार ने स्मारक की बिगड़ती स्थिति को सुधारने का निर्देश दिया है, लेकिन कोई कार्य नहीं हुआ है। इस ऐतिहासिक स्थल की मरम्मत और संरक्षण बहुत ज़रूरी है, जिससे हमारी सांस्कृतिक धरोहर सुरक्षित रहे और पर्यटन को भी बढ़ावा मिले। शनिवार वाड़ा न केवल हमारे इतिहास का प्रतीक है, बल्कि आने वाली पीढ़ियों के लिए एक महत्वपूर्ण शैक्षिक संसाधन भी है।

अतः मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार से अनुरोध करती हूँ कि इस महल की मरम्मत और रखरखाव का कार्य जल्द किया जाए और एक समिति द्वारा इस स्थल की स्थिति का मूल्यांकन कर विशेष धन राशि का आवंटन किया जाए ताकि यह कार्य जल्दी संपन्न हो सके।

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (SHRIMATI S. PHANGNON KONYAK): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention raised by the hon. Member, Dr. Medha Vishram Kulkarni: Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), and Shri Dhananjay Bhimrao Mahadik (Maharashtra).

Now, hon. Member, Shri Satnam Singh Sandhu — not present. Next, hon. Member, Shri Abdul Wahab.

### **The issue of Life and Medical Insurance and Public Sector Insurance Companies**

SHRI ABDUL WAHAB (Kerala): Thank you, Madam, for giving me an opportunity to speak. I urge the Government to take following steps in the best interests of the people and the industry: First is removal of GST on Life and Medical Insurance Premiums. Presently, both life and medical insurance premiums attract a GST rate of 18 percentage, be withdrawn in the interest of the people and the industry.

Second is about re-introduction of Income tax deduction for health insurance premium. The deduction allowed under section 80 (D) towards health insurance premium has been discontinued in the new tax regime.

Third is about consolidation of Public Sector general insurance companies. The Public Sector general insurance companies have been recording reasonably good performance in spite of myriad challenges confronting them. There is an opinion of merit that these companies be merged into a single entity to form a single corporation so that they derive the economies of scale. I would like to request the Ministry of Finance to consider these important subjects and take a favourable decision on these suggestions. Thank you.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (SHRIMATI S. PHANGNON KONYAK): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by the hon. Member, Shri Abdul Wahab: Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri P.P. Suneer (Kerala), Shri Haris Beeran (Kerala), Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu, (Tamil Nadu), Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla, (Tamil Nadu), Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham, (Kerala) and Shrimati Sulata Deo (Odisha).

Now, hon. Member, Dr. Bhim Singh.

### **Demand to increase the number of beds in emergency ward of AIIMS, Patna**

**डा. भीम सिंह (बिहार):** महोदय, मौजूदा सरकार धन्यवाद की पात्र है, जिसने बिहार में एक एम्स के रहते दूसरा एम्स दिया। पहला एम्स तत्कालीन प्रधान मंत्री श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी जी की सरकार ने पटना में दिया। माननीय प्रधान मंत्री श्री नरेन्द्र मोदी जी ने दूसरा एम्स दरभंगा में दिया है। पटना एम्स जनता की सेवा में तत्पर है, परंतु जनप्रतिनिधि होने के नाते आए दिन सर्व साधारण से सूचना प्राप्त होती रही है कि एम्स पटना के इमरजेंसी विभाग में बेड की संख्या मांग की तुलना में काफी कम है। लिहाजा जरूरतमंद रोगियों की वहां भर्ती नहीं हो पाती और वे प्राइवेट अस्पतालों के चंगुल में फंसकर अपने जान-माल से हाथ धो बैठते हैं।

अतः मैं सरकार से मांग करता हूँ कि पटना एम्स के इमरजेंसी विभाग में बेड की संख्या बढ़ाई जाने के साथ-साथ वहां की अन्य सुविधाओं में भी बढ़ोतरी की जाए, ताकि बिहार की गरीब जनता को सुलभ एवं सस्ता ईलाज प्राप्त हो सके।

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (SHRIMATI S. PHANGNON KONYAK): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by the hon. Member, Dr. Bhim Singh: Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu, (Tamil Nadu), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla, (Tamil Nadu), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu) and Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha).

Now, hon. Member, Shri Haris Beeran.

### **Demand for Nipah viral testing facilities in Kerala**

SHRI HARIS BEERAN (Kerala): Madam, I wish to draw your attention to Nipah virus outbreaks in Kerala which has been declared as health emergency. The deadly virus resulted in the death of a 14-year-old boy last Sunday. Nipah virus outbreaks have haunted Kerala on four occasions in the past. Outbreaks of the virus were reported in 2018 and 2023 in Kozhikode and 2019 in Ernakulam. The Department of Health in Kerala has taken precautionary measures and multiple level surveillance mechanism is in place. But the biggest impediment being faced in such diseases outbreaks, which was seen also during Nipah virus outbreak, is the inadequacy of virus testing facilities in the country. Currently, for viral testing, the only centre in India is the National Institute of Virology in Pune. It is a matter of grave concern that there is only one advanced centre for virology testing catering to 140 million population of the country. It is highly inadequate in a country like India to have only one viral testing centre and this delays the detection and containment of the deadly infectious disease like NIPAH and other similar diseases. NIV Pune, the result has come after a week's time, which is causing delay in roll-out of strategy of containment of such deadly infectious

diseases. I, therefore, request the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare to take immediate steps to provide funding support to develop viral testing facilities in National Institute of Virology in Alappuzha and Institute of Advance Virology in Trivandrum and make them Center of Excellence to tackle such disease outbreaks. Thank you.

SHRI P. WILSON: Madam, we request you to extend the time till the completion of Special Mentions.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (SHRIMATI S. PHANGNON KONYAK): We will extend the time at 6.00 p.m.

The following Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by hon. Member, Shri Haris Beeran: Shri Sandosh Kumar P (Kerala), Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Shri P.P. Suneer (Kerala), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Shri P Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), and Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala).

Now, Shrimati Sagarika Ghose.

### **The need to ensure efficient implementation of MNREGS**

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE (West Bengal): Madam, I seek to draw attention to the urgent need to ensure efficient implementation of the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme.

The Budget Estimate for the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme was Rs. 60,000 crores for Financial Year, 2023-24. This had to be increased to Rs. 89,000 crores. The Union Government has been claiming that availability of funds shall not hinder the implementation of the NREGA. But the Government has already utilised 42 per cent of the funds allocated under the Interim Budget for Financial Year, 2024-25. Additionally, the Government is considering distributing excess rice for part-payment of the wages. Since most workers are PDS-beneficiaries, receiving rice during high inflation offers less flexibility and purchasing power than cash wages.

As of January 1, 2024, Aadhar Based Payment System has been mandated within the framework of NREGA. More than 1.5 crore workers are yet to be ABPS (Aadhaar Payment Bridge System) enabled. The opacity of the ABPS architecture makes it impossible for workers to track which account their payment has been deposited in, leading to diverted and misdirected payments. Any deviations or

inaccuracies could lead to a situation wherein rural workers may be deprived of their rightfully-earned wages, especially, people from marginalised backgrounds. There are concerns over mandatory digital attendance, deletions of job cards, delayed disbursements, and unresolved dues to States. MNREGA promises work, wages and dignity to millions of Indians.

I urge the Government to urgently address these issues to ensure efficient implementation of the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme. Thank you.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (SHRIMATI S. PHANGNON KONYAK): The following Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by hon. Member, Shrimati Sagarika Ghose: Shri Sandosh Kumar P (Kerala), Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri M. Shanmugam (Tamil Nadu), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala), Shrimati Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), and Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala)

Shri Narain Dass Gupta; not present. Now, Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu.

**Concern over access to washrooms, sanitation facilities like toilets in educational institutions and work places for women across the country**

DR. KANIMOZHI NVN SOMU (Tamil Nadu): Madam, my subject is, 'Concern over Access to Washrooms, Sanitation Facilities like Toilets in Educational Institutions and Workplaces for Women across the country.'

Madam, it is disheartening to see India's Nari Shakti being troubled due to the inadequate toilets and sanitation facilities at educational institutions and workplaces.

Although the number of women in the spheres of education and workforce is on the rise, the provision of sufficient and adequate toilet facilities for them is still sadly lacking.

[THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR) *in the Chair.*]

From Schools to colleges, banks to public offices, the women are forced to bear with the nature's call for long hours. This is absolutely ridiculous and shameful.

Madam, women workers form a large proportion of the workforce in the informal or unorganized sectors. Unfortunately, most workplaces and work activities in the informal sectors lack basic sanitation facilities and toilets.

The lack of access to proper sanitation facilities, separate, hygienic toilets and clean water not only affects the physical health of women, but also their self-esteem, dignity and safety, and makes it difficult for them to participate in the workforce and contribute to the economic development of the country.

Madam, lack of proper sanitation and hygiene facilities for working women in India is an urgent issue that needs to be addressed. Improving access to toilets and clean water and ensuring adequate hygiene facilities in workplaces would help to empower women and promote gender equality.

Therefore, I urge the Union Government to address this very sensitive women issue immediately in all the educational institutions and workplaces across the country. Thank you.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The following Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by hon. Member, Shrimati Kanimozhi NVN Somu: Shri Sujeet Kumar (Odisha), Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Shri K.R.N. Rajeshkumar (Tamil Nadu), Shri Sandosh Kumar P (Kerala), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri M. Shanmugam (Tamil Nadu), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala), Shri P.P. Suneer (Kerala), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Shrimati Sulata Deo (Odisha), Shri R. Girirajan (Tamil Nadu), Shri Haris Beeran (Kerala) and Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala)

**6.00 P. M.**

Hon. Members, it is now 6.00 p.m. If the House agrees, we may sit beyond 6.00 p.m. to take up the remaining permitted Special Mentions. Do I have the leave of the House to extend the sitting beyond 6.00 p.m.? Thank you. हम इसे कंटीन्यू करते हैं। Thank you. माननीय सदस्य, श्री दीपक प्रकाश जी।

### **Demand for change in the timing of Ranchi-Patna Jan Shatabdi Express**

**श्री दीपक प्रकाश (झारखंड):** आदरणीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदया, मैं आपके माध्यम से सदन के समक्ष एक महत्वपूर्ण विषय लाना चाहता हूँ। वर्तमान में सुबह के समय पटना से रांची के लिए दो संचालित ट्रेनें वंदे भारत एक्सप्रेस (22349) व जनशताब्दी एक्सप्रेस (12365) में से जनशताब्दी एक्सप्रेस को सुबह के समय रांची से पटना को संचालित किए जाने की आवश्यकता है। क्योंकि सुबह के समय मात्र एक घण्टे के अंतराल पर पटना से रांची के लिए दो एक्सप्रेस ट्रेनें संचालित हो रही हैं, जबकि रांची से पटना के लिए इसी समय कोई एक्सप्रेस ट्रेन नहीं है। महोदया, अगर जनशताब्दी एक्सप्रेस को सुबह के समय में रांची से पटना को संचालित किया जाता है, तो न सिर्फ

लोगो के आवागमन में सुविधा होगी, बल्कि रेलवे की आय में भी वृद्धि होगी। मैं सरकार से इस मामले पर गौर करने का आग्रह करता हूँ।

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (SHRIMATI KAVITA PATIDAR): The following Members associated with the Special Mention made by hon. Member, Shri Deepak Prakash: Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu) and Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha).

Hon. Member, Shrimati Sangeeta Yadav - not present. Hon. Member, Shri Sadanand Mhalu Shet Tanavade.

### **Demand for reservation for Scheduled Tribes in the Goa Legislative Assembly**

SHRI SADANAND MHALU SHET TANAVADE (Goa): Madam, I rise to draw the attention of this august House to an urgent and significant issue pertaining to the political representation of Scheduled Tribes in the Goa Legislative Assembly.

Goa, with its rich cultural heritage and diverse population, is home to several Scheduled Tribes that have been integral to the social and economic fabric of the state. Despite their contributions, the Scheduled Tribes in Goa have not been adequately represented in the State's Legislative Assembly. The Indian Constitution guarantees political reservations for Scheduled Tribes to ensure their meaningful participation in the democratic process and to address their unique social, economic, and cultural challenges. However, in Goa, there is currently no political reservation for Scheduled Tribes in the State Assembly, which hampers their ability to influence policies and decisions that directly affect their lives. This lack of representation impedes the empowerment and development of the Scheduled Tribes in Goa. We must address this issue to ensure inclusive governance and equitable development.

I urge the Government to take immediate steps to amend the representation norms and provide political reservations for Scheduled Tribes in the Goa Legislative Assembly. This measure is essential to uphold the constitutional rights of Scheduled Tribes and to promote their active participation in the democratic process.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (SHRIMATI KAVITA PATIDAR): The following Members associated with the Special Mention made by hon. Member, Shri Sadanand Mhalu Shet Tanavade: Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu) and Shri Sandosh Kumar P (Kerala).

Hon. Member, Dr. Sasmit Patra.

### **Demand for inclusion of languages spoken in Odisha into the 8<sup>th</sup> Schedule of Constitution**

DR. SASMIT PATRA (Odisha): Hon. Vice-Chairman Madam, the Ho, Mundari, Bhumij, Kui, Saora and Kosli/ Sambalpuri languages spoken in Odisha are rich with their respective history, legacy, heritage, culture and literature. There are long-standing demands from the people of Odisha speaking these languages, for their inclusion in the 8<sup>th</sup> Schedule of the Indian Constitution. Despite several letters by then Chief Minister of Odisha to the Government of India and several demands placed in both Houses of Parliament by Members of Parliament, these languages have not yet been included in the 8<sup>th</sup> Schedule of the Constitution by the Union Government. The Odisha Cabinet has also resolved several times, through unanimous resolutions, for the inclusion of some of these languages in the 8<sup>th</sup> Schedule. Santhali language has been added to the 8<sup>th</sup> Schedule, but Ho, Mundari, Bhumij, Kui and Saoara, spoken by millions of tribal brothers and sisters in Odisha, have not been included in it. The Kosli/ Sambalpuri language spoken by the brothers and sisters of western Odisha is rich in literature, culture, history and heritage but that has also been kept waiting outside the 8<sup>th</sup> Schedule. I urge the Government of India to take necessary steps to ensure that Ho, Mundari, Bhumij, Kui, Saora and Kosli/Sambalpuri are included in the 8<sup>th</sup> Schedule of the Constitution. The official recognition of these languages by the Government of India through their inclusion in the 8<sup>th</sup> Schedule will go a long way in their development and growth.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by Dr. Sasmit Patra: Shri M. Shanmugam (Tamil Nadu), Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Shri Niranjan Bishi (Odisha), Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shrimati Sulata Deo (Odisha) and Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu).

### **Demand for awareness campaign of Central Government schemes through banks**

**श्री संजय सेठ** (उत्तर प्रदेश): उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदया, सरकार ने सबका साथ, सबका विकास, सबका विश्वास के मंत्र के साथ समाज के हर वर्ग के विकास के लिए बहुत सारी योजनाएं शुरू की हैं। बजट 2024 में भी रोजगार, कौशल प्रशिक्षण और अन्य अवसरों की सुविधा उपलब्ध कराने के लिए प्रधान मंत्री जी की पाँच योजनाओं के पैकेज की घोषणा की गई है, जिससे पाँच वर्ष की अवधि में 4.1 करोड़ युवाओं को लाभ होगा। मुद्रा योजना, स्टार्टअप इंडिया, स्टैंड अप इंडिया, प्रधान मंत्री स्वनिधि योजना जैसी विभिन्न योजनाएं हैं, जिससे हर वर्ग के नागरिक लाभान्वित हो सकते हैं



और इन योजनाओं के लागू होने से फाइनेंशियल इनक्लूजन और इकोनॉमिक डेवलपमेंट भी होता है।

सरकार योजनाओं को लागू करने का पूरा प्रयास कर रही है, लेकिन जमीनी स्तर पर इसके लाभ को पहुंचाने के लिए अत्यंत आवश्यक है कि हम लाभार्थियों को इसके प्रति जागरूक करें। इस जागरूकता अभियान में सबसे महत्वपूर्ण भूमिका हमारे बैंकों की हो सकती है। आज हमारे देश में 1,60,000 से भी अधिक बैंक शाखाएं हैं, जिनका अस्तित्व ग्रामीण इलाकों में भी है। मेरी सरकार से माँग है कि इन सभी बैंक शाखाओं में एक डेडिकेटेड हेल्प डेस्क की स्थापना हो, जो हमारी योजनाओं का प्रचार-प्रसार करे और लाभार्थियों को जागरूक करे कि किस प्रकार वे भारत सरकार की योजनाओं का लाभ ले सकते हैं। इन हेल्प डेस्क के गठन से हर नागरिक को उसका अधिकार मिलेगा और पंक्ति में खड़े अंतिम व्यक्ति के विकास और अंत्योदय के लक्ष्य को भी हम प्राप्त कर सकेंगे।

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by Shri Sanjay Seth: Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha) and Shri Sujeet Kumar (Odisha).

#### **Demand to expedite projects under Bharatmala in the State of Bihar**

**श्री शंभू शरण पटेल (बिहार):** आदरणीय प्रधान मंत्री, श्री नरेन्द्र मोदी जी के नेतृत्व में भारतमाला परियोजना भारत के 550 से अधिक जिला मुख्यालयों को छः लेन राजमार्गों के माध्यम से जोड़ने का कार्य हो रहा है। राजमार्गों और सड़कों के विकास के अलावा, परियोजना का एक मुख्य उद्देश्य राजमार्गों के माध्यम से माल टुलाई दक्षता में सुधार करना है। इसके अलावा, भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण का महत्वाकांक्षी छः लेन ग्रीनफील्ड वाराणसी-राँची-कोलकाता एक्सप्रेसवे बिहार के कैमूर, रोहताश, औरंगाबाद और गया जिलों से होकर गुजरेगा। 610 किलोमीटर लंबे वाराणसी-कोलकाता कॉरिडोर में से 162 किलोमीटर बिहार में होगा।

केंद्र सरकार ने पटना में एनएच 30 पर अनीसाबाद से गुरुद्वारा मोड़ तक 1,000 करोड़ रुपये की लागत से 15 किलोमीटर लंबी एलिवेटेड रोड बनाने का भी फैसला किया है।

वर्तमान में बिहार के कई जिलों में पुलों का निर्माण किया जा रहा है और केंद्र सरकार ने इन कार्यों को लिए 23,157 करोड़ रुपये आवंटित किए हैं। इसके अलावा, फतुहा, पटना में 100 एकड़ भूमि पर पहले मल्टी मॉडल लॉजिस्टिक पार्क के विकास के लिए काम किया जा रहा है। केंद्र ने इसके लिए 1,000 करोड़ रुपये का प्रावधान भी किया है।

महोदय, आपके माध्यम से माननीय केंद्रीय मंत्री जी से आग्रह है कि बिहार में अधिकांश जिले आकांक्षी हैं, इसीलिए इन सभी परियोजनाओं के कार्य में तेजी लाई जाए, ताकि बिहार में विकास जल्द हो और एनएच के दोनों तरफ जो अतिक्रमण है, उसे हटाया जाए। एनएच पर सोलर लाइट का भी इंतजाम किया जाए, जिससे कि एनएच पर होने वाली दुर्घटनाओं को कम किया जा सके।

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The hon. Member, Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), associated himself with the Special Mention made by the hon. Member, Shri Shambhu Sharan Patel.

Now, Shri P. Wilson. Concern over energy security projects in Tamil Nadu.

### **Concern over energy security projects in Tamil Nadu**

SHRI P. WILSON (Tamil Nadu): TANGEDCO, the Tamil Nadu State Power Utility, has initiated the development of a 2x800 MW Super Critical Thermal project at Uppur in Ramanathapuram District. Similarly, the 1,320 MW Udangudi Stage-I is nearing completion, with potential for further development of 2,640 MW through Udangudi Stage II & III. The State Government has granted administrative approval. Existing coal handling infrastructure, including a coal jetty and closed conveyor systems, are in place for all three stages.

Considering that the development of in-State projects is vital for the growth, it is proposed by state that NTPC and NLC undertake further development of these projects with an estimated cost of ₹30,000 crores. The electricity generated could be utilized by Tamil Nadu and other southern states, as the capacity of existing transmission lines is nearly maxed out, and establishing new lines could take 8-10 years.

Enabling these projects by NTPC and NLC will enhance the energy security of Tamil Nadu and other southern states. Additionally, the power demand in Tamil Nadu is increasing at a higher rate compared to other states, expected to cross a peak demand of 21,000 MW by 2025-26. Presently, Tamil Nadu receives only 55 per cent of power from Units I and II of the Kudankulam Nuclear Power Plant (KKNPP), roughly 1,150 MW. With Units III and IV expected to be completed by 2025, it is urged that 100 per cent allocation from Unit III and IV be granted to Tamil Nadu to meet the growing demand and make State of Tamil Nadu without power cuts.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by hon. Member, Shri P. Wilson: Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Shri R. Girirajan (Tamil Nadu), Shri M. Shanmugam (Tamil Nadu), Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), and Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala).

Now, Dr. Ashok Kumar Mittal. Concern over attacks by stray animals in the country.

### Concern over attacks by stray animals in the country

**डा. अशोक कुमार मित्तल** (पंजाब): उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदया, हम सब social media पर वीडियो देखते हैं, जहाँ आवारा पशु बच्चों और बुजुर्गों पर हमला करते हैं और बठिंडा में एक ऐसा मामला सामने आया, जहाँ एक 5 वर्ष की बच्ची पर stray animal ने हमला कर दिया, जिससे उसकी मृत्यु हो गयी। पूरे देश में dog bites के cases, जो 2022 में 21 लाख थे, वे 2023 में 28 लाख हो गए और WHO के अनुसार पूरे विश्व में 36 प्रतिशत rabies-related deaths भारत में होती हैं। इसका संज्ञान देश के High Courts और सुप्रीम कोर्ट द्वारा भी लिया गया है। UK के प्रतिष्ठित medical journal लांसेट के अनुसार हमारे देश में हर वर्ष 59,000 मृत्यु stray animal attack के कारण होती हैं। सरकार ने 2023 में Animal Birth Control Rules बनाए, जिनमें sterilization और population control की strategy का इस्तेमाल किया गया है और Animal Welfare Board द्वारा animal shelter बनाने के लिए आर्थिक सहायता भी देने की योजना है, लेकिन इन योजनाओं से जो परिणाम अपेक्षित थे, वे पूरे नहीं हुए हैं। मेरा सरकार से निवेदन है कि आवारा पशुओं के rehabilitation के लिए स्वच्छ भारत योजना के अंतर्गत एक dedicated strategy की शुरुआत करने की आवश्यकता है, जिससे ब्लॉक, वार्ड या तालुका स्तर पर आवारा पशुओं के लिए shelter का निर्माण किया जा सके और man-animal conflict के बढ़ते मामलों पर भी अंकुश लग सके। सरकार को स्वच्छ भारत में urban local bodies की रैंकिंग में stray animal management को भी एक criteria बनाना चाहिए, जिससे Urban Local Bodies बेहतर तरीके से बढ़ते मामलों को काबू कर सके।

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by hon. Member, Dr. Ashok Kumar Mittal: Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Shri Sant Balbir Singh (Punjab), Shri Abdul Wahab (Kerala), Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Shri Haris Beeran (Kerala), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu) and Shri M. Shanmugam (Tamil Nadu).

### Concern over difficulties faced by pilgrims in Char Dham Yatra in Uttarakhand

**डा. सिकंदर कुमार** (हिमाचल प्रदेश): मैडम, आपने स्पेशल मेंशन के तहत एक महत्वपूर्ण विषय पर बोलने का अवसर दिया, इसके लिए बहुत- बहुत धन्यवाद।

मैं आपका ध्यान उत्तराखंड राज्य में चार धाम यात्रा की समस्या की ओर दिलाना चाहता हूँ। उत्तराखंड के क्षेत्र में स्थित चार पवित्र हिंदू तीर्थ स्थल हैं। यह न केवल एक धार्मिक यात्रा है, बल्कि उत्तराखंड के लिए एक महत्वपूर्ण सांस्कृतिक और पर्यटन कार्यक्रम भी है, जो दुनिया भर से पर्यटकों को आकर्षित करती है। यह स्थानीय समुदायों के लिए महत्वपूर्ण है, जो रोजगार के अवसर प्रदान करती है। कोविड-19 के बाद यहाँ पर आने वाले श्रद्धालुओं की संख्या में बढ़ोतरी हुई

है, जिसके कारण चिकित्सा एवं स्वास्थ्य से लेकर परिवहन, आवास एवं शौचालय जैसी सुविधाओं के लिए सरकारी इंतजाम नाकाफी साबित हुए हैं और यात्रा पर आने वाले श्रद्धालुओं को रजिस्ट्रेशन, हेलीकॉप्टर बुकिंग, पार्किंग तथा ऑनलाइन बुकिंग में साइबर ठगों द्वारा लूटना तथा और भी परेशानियों का सामना करना पड़ा है, जिसके कारण बहुत से श्रद्धालुओं को बिना चार धाम यात्रा पूरी किए वापस लौटना पड़ा और कई श्रद्धालुओं की मृत्यु भी हुई है।

मेरा पर्यटन मंत्री से आग्रह है कि चार धाम यात्रा पर आने वाले श्रद्धालुओं की सुविधाओं से संबंधित अधिकारियों द्वारा आगामी वर्षों की चार धाम यात्रा के लिए उचित सुविधाओं के प्रबंध की समीक्षा पहले ही संपूर्ण कर ली जाए, जिससे चार धाम यात्रा में आने वाले श्रद्धालुओं को कोई परेशानी न हो। धन्यवाद।

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The hon. Member, Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), associated himself with the Special Mention made by hon. Member, Dr. Sikander Kumar.

#### **Need for Reconsideration of NCTE's oversight of NIOS D.El.Ed (ODL) programme**

PROF. MANOJ KUMAR JHA (Bihar): In a quest to uphold the Right to Education Act 2009, the National Council for Teacher Education issued a notification in 2010, requiring a minimum qualification of a two-year diploma in elementary education. After NCTE's 2014 regulations, the Ministry of Human Resource Development issued a letter on 03-08-2017 to all the Secretaries of States and UTs directing that all the teachers in Government Schools must possess minimum qualification as mandated under the RTE Act and a last chance was being given to all such teachers to acquire minimum qualification till 31-03-2019. In 2017, an opportunity arose for in-service untrained teachers of Government, Government Aided, Unaided Private Schools, classes I-VIII, to acquire Diploma in Elementary Education, D.El.Ed., from National Institute of Open Schooling in ODL mode in 18 months instead of two years. The Supreme Court ruling on November 28, 2023, emphasized that the entire scheme was only for the purpose of providing a window to the in-service teachers to prevent their dismissal. The delay in publishing notifications left approximately 14 lakh candidates in limbo, as the NCTE failed to publish the Gazette directed by the MHRD on September 22, 2017. States like Bihar and West Bengal have appointed teachers trained through the NIOS 18-month course.

I urge the Government to reconsider the NCTE's non-recognition of the NIOS 18-month D.El.Ed course, ensuring equal opportunities for the affected candidates at the earliest. Thank you, Madam.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by hon. Member, Shri Manoj Kumar Jha: Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Shri Haris Beeran (Kerala), Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala), Shri Abdul Wahab (Kerala), Shri M. Shanmugam (Tamil Nadu), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu) and Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha).

### **Demand for adequate budgetary allocation for ensuring safety of mining workers**

SHRI NIRANJAN BISHI (Odisha): Odisha has one of the highest coal reserves in the country at 48,572.58 million tonnes (measured) and 34,080.42 million tonnes (indicated), which increases the importance of ensuring the safety of the mining workers. However, in spite of the urgency of the matter, the budget for the Ministry of Coal has been declining for the past two years. It has fallen down to Rs. 547.88 crores (Revised Estimates) in 2022-23. Under-utilisation of funds is another cause of concern, reflective in how the utilisation of funds during the financial year 2021-22 was Rs. 360.97 crores (up to December, 2021) against the allocation of Rs. 644.09 crores at RE stage. Mining is an extremely hazardous profession and disasters in this area cause grave threat to human life and loss of economic resources. Inundation is a factor that is leading to a greater number of disasters in mines. Disasters occur at regular intervals. Fatalities due to roof collapse and dumpers at coal mines are major issues that need to be tackled for greater safety. Another cause of concern is the lack of detailed emergency rescue plan.

Training of personnel, implementation of Standard Operating Procedure, etc., need to be emphasized. Training is required to minimise human error. Madam, through you, I urge the Central Government to take its cognisance and provide adequate funding for research and infrastructure development among other processes and ensure proper mechanism for safety for mining workers.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by the hon. Member, Shri Niranjana Bishi: Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala), Shri Sandosh Kumar P (Kerala), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri Sujeet Kumar (Odisha), Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Shrimati Sulata Deo (Odisha), Shri Subhasish Khuntia (Odisha), Shri Muzibulla Khan (Odisha) and Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu).

### **Demand for bringing back the royal throne of Maharaja Ranjit Singh ji**

**श्री राघव चड्ढा** (पंजाब): महोदय, मैं एक ऐसे मुद्दे पर बोलने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूँ, जिससे सिर्फ पंजाब नहीं, बल्कि पूरे देश की भावनाएँ जुड़ी हुई हैं। मेरा सौभाग्य है कि मैं उस पंजाब से आता हूँ, जहाँ कभी शेर-ए-पंजाब महाराजा रणजीत सिंह जी का शासन था और महाराजा रणजीत सिंह जी का शासन असल मायनों में सुशासन था, जहाँ सबको न्याय मिलता था। वे ऐसे महान योद्धा थे, जिनके नाम से बड़े-बड़े सूरमाओं की रूह काँपती थी। महाराजा रणजीत सिंह जी युद्ध भूमि में शेर की तरह गरजते थे। सिर्फ शौर्य ही नहीं, महाराजा रणजीत सिंह जी ने इंसानियत का पैगाम भी दुनिया को दिया है। उनके शासन में धर्म, जात-पात के नाम पर कोई भेदभाव नहीं था। बीबीसी वर्ल्ड हिस्ट्री के एक सर्वे ने महाराज रणजीत सिंह जी को 'Greatest Leader of All Times' का खिताब दिया है। ऐसे महात्मा को मैं इस सदन में नमन करता हूँ।

मैं महाराजा रणजीत सिंह जी को याद करते हुए एक अहम माँग करना चाहता हूँ। लंदन के विक्टोरिया और अल्बर्ट म्यूजियम में महाराजा रणजीत सिंह जी का सोने का शाही सिंहासन रखा हुआ है। मैं भारत सरकार से यह माँग करता हूँ कि भारत सरकार diplomatic relations के ज़रिये UK सरकार से बात करे और उस सिंहासन को वापस लाने के लिए प्रयास करे। वह सिंहासन वापस हमारे देश में आना चाहिए और सबको उसके दर्शन का मौका मिलना चाहिए। महाराजा रणजीत सिंह जी के जीवन से हम सबको प्रेरणा और सीख लेनी चाहिए। साथ ही उनके शौर्य, इंसानियत और राज्य की नीति को बच्चों को किताबों में पढ़ाया जाए, जिससे बच्चों को सुशासन का असली मतलब पता लग सके।

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by the hon. Member, Shri Raghav Chadha: Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri Sant Balbir Singh (Punjab), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu) and Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu).

### **Demand for establishment of a multi-purpose industrial training centre and Hi-tech Trade Centre with Entertainment Park at North Chennai industrial cluster**

**SHRI R. GIRIRAJAN** (Tamil Nadu): Madam, North Chennai industrial cluster comprising Ennore, Tiruvottiyur, Manali, Korattur, Madhavaram, Ambattur, Avadi and adjoining District of Tiruvallur make this region a special industrial hub. It houses many large petrochemical industries and fertilizer units, Thermal Power Station (NCTPS) Stage I, NTECL, CPCL, TPL, MPL and MFL and more than 6,000 SMEs. This is a competitive industrial area where companies are fighting for skilled manpower. Thus the employment potential is high. There is a need for an advanced industrial training

centre and trade centre to harness the human resource. The picturesque location between Retteri and Madhavaram lakes is excellently suitable for the Integrated Industrial training complex. This will help hundreds and thousands of educated and skilled youth for getting hands on training in various industrial trades. This will be great boon for skill training and entrepreneurship development as well as promotion of trade and commerce. There is a huge potential and scope for creation of water theme park and entertainment park which will add advantages to this North Chennai Industrial hub.

The multi-varied industries at Ambattur, Madhavaram, Korattur, Manali and Ennore will get a much needed facelift and the overall trade will prosper. Productivity will grow. Employment opportunities for youth will be generated in huge numbers. Establishing a Multipurpose Industrial Training Centre with Trade Centre will definitely facilitate Tamil Nadu in achieving its target of one trillion economy very soon. Therefore, I urge the Government to establish a multi-purpose industrial training centre and Trade Centre to support North Chennai Industrial hub. Thank you.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by the hon. Member, Shri R. Girirajan: Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala), Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Dr. V. Sivadasan (Kerala), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri M. Shanmugam (Tamil Nadu), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu) and Shri Niranjan Bishi (Odisha).

### **Demand for formation of Greater Cooch Behar as a Union Territory**

SHRI NAGENDRA RAY (West Bengal): Madam, there has been a long pending demand of the Greater Cooch Behar People's Association since the year 2015 for formation of Greater Cooch Behar as a Union Territory by carving it out of the State of West Bengal. The Association has made a number of representations to the Government in the past to realize aspirations of its people. This Association has been against merger of the then Cooch Behar with the States of West Bengal and Assam as they considered it illegal, unconstitutional and against the wishes of the locals.

For the knowledge of my colleagues here, I would like to mention that the then Government was aware of the ground situation that merger of Greater Cooch Behar with West Bengal and Assam is very sensitive because of violation of the Instrument of

Accession of State of Cooch Behar signed between Maharaja Shri Jagaddipendra Narayan Bhup Bahadur and Lord Mountbatten, Governor General, Dominion Government of India, on 9th August, 1947 and Agreement Annexure — ‘A’ made on 28th and 30th August, 1949. Interestingly, Cooch Behar was shown as ‘C’ category State in the First Schedule of the Constitution adopted by Constituent Assembly on 26<sup>th</sup> November, 1949.

Therefore, I would sincerely request hon. Home Minister to undo the injustice done to the people of Cooch Behar by carving out it as a separate Union Territory. Thank you.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by the hon. Member, Shri Nagendra Ray: Dr. Parmar Jashvantsinh Salamsinh (Gujarat) and Shri Kesridevsinh Jhala (Gujarat).

#### **Demand to increase the One Stop Centres in Odisha**

SHRIMATI SULATA DEO (Odisha): Madam, violence against women persists as a distressing issue, demanding urgent and comprehensive solutions. The One Stop Centre (OSC) scheme led by the Central Government is commendable but needs expansion in Odisha, where the number of centres is significantly lower than in States like Madhya Pradesh and Uttar Pradesh.

In Odisha, the Government has established Sakhi centres to aid distressed women, yet the existing numbers fall short of meeting the extensive demand. Expanding One Stop Centres in Odisha is crucial to ensure comprehensive coverage and assistance for victims of violence. Through you, Madam, I respectfully request the Government to increase the number of centres in Odisha to provide support to more women in the State. Thank you so much.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by hon. Member, Shrimati Sulata Deo: Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri Niranjana Bishi (Odisha), Shri Subhasish Khuntia (Odisha), Shri Sujeet Kumar (Odisha), Shri Muzibulla Khan (Odisha) and Dr. John Brittas (Kerala).

Dr. Laxmikant Bajpayee, not present. Shri Muzibulla Khan.



### **Demand to establish more Kendriya Vidyalayas and Eklavya Schools in Odisha**

SHRI MUZIBULLA KHAN (Odisha): Madam, Odisha has been persistently advocating for the establishment of Kendriya Vidyalayas in every block across the state. These schools are crucial to providing quality education and ensuring educational access for students in remote areas. Additionally, there is a pressing demand for Eklavya Schools in Scheduled Areas and blocks with significant tribal populations. These specialized schools are essential for addressing educational disparities, promoting cultural preservation, and fostering socio-economic development among tribal communities in Odisha. Their establishment would not only improve educational outcomes but also empower marginalized groups by providing them with equitable opportunities for growth and development. I request the Government to take possible steps in this. Thank you, Madam.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by hon. Member, Shri Muzibulla Khan: Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Shrimati Sulata Deo (Odisha), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Shri Niranjana Bishi (Odisha) and Shri Subhasish Khuntia (Odisha).

### **Demand for effective flood management works in India**

**श्री नरेश बंसल** (उत्तराखण्ड): महोदया, अनिश्चित और लंबे मानसून के मौसम के कारण भारत बाढ़ के प्रति काफी संवेदनशील है। यह महत्वपूर्ण है कि भारत जान-माल के नुकसान को रोकने के लिए एक मजबूत बाढ़ आपदा प्रबंधन प्रणाली (Flood Disaster Management System) विकसित करे। उत्तराखण्ड, उत्तर प्रदेश, बिहार, असम, पश्चिम बंगाल, केरल और ओडिशा भारत के सबसे बुरी तरह बाढ़ प्रभावित राज्यों में से कुछ हैं। हर मानसून में बाढ़ की पुनरावृत्ति से जान-माल का भारी नुकसान होता है। बाढ़ नियंत्रण के लिए वनीकरण, ढलान के प्रवाह को रोकने के लिए छत की ढलान, बांधों का निर्माण और मानव बस्तियों में पानी आने से रोकने के लिए तटबंध, फ्लड पूफिंग और बाढ़ के मैदानों के ज़ोनिंग पर अधिक जोर दिया जाना चाहिए। वृक्षारोपण और वनस्पति के रोपण से मिट्टी को अतिरिक्त पानी को बनाए रखने और अवशोषित करने में मदद मिलेगी और इस प्रक्रिया से बाढ़ में कमी आएगी। बाढ़ प्रभावित क्षेत्रों से सूखे क्षेत्रों में अतिरिक्त पानी को चैनलाइज करने के लिए नहरों तथा फीडर नेटवर्क का निर्माण और वैज्ञानिक ढंग से जलाशयों और बांधों का निर्माण करना चाहिए, जिनका उपयोग बाढ़ के दौरान अतिरिक्त पानी को जमा करने के लिए किया जाए। बाढ़ से निपटने के लिए एक मास्टर प्लान चाहिए जो किसी विशेष क्षेत्र की जरूरतों के लिए विशिष्ट होना चाहिए। यदि इन कदमों को ठीक से लागू किया जाता है तो यह बाढ़ राहत, पूर्वानुमान आदि पर आवर्ती व्यय को कम कर सकता है। देश में

बाढ़ के प्रकोप से मानव जीवन, भूमि और संपत्ति की रक्षा के लिए प्रभावी बाढ़ प्रबंधन कार्य की आवश्यकता है।

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by hon. Member, Shri Naresh Bansal: Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha) and Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu).

### **Need to address the issues faced by Agricultural Workers**

DR. V. SIVADASAN (Kerala): Madam, agricultural and rural workers of India constitute the most deprived and marginalized classes in our society. They are suffering from low wages, lack of social security, lack of proper health care, malnutrition and lack of educational opportunities for their children. The agricultural workers, who are unable to work due to old age, are left with no support from the Government. Sir, there is a need to ensure that agricultural workers get a monthly pension of minimum 5000/- rupees and the funds for this money should be transferred to the States by the Union Government. There is a need to ensure that universal and free quality healthcare is provided to the agricultural workers. As per the NCRB data, the suicides among farm labourers is increasing and this shows the increase in rural distress. The report showed that in 2021, 5,563 farm labourers have committed suicide. This number has increased to 6,083 in 2022. This is the result of low wages and lack of employment opportunities for the rural poor. There is an urgent need to increase the amount allocated for employment guarantee schemes and strengthen social security.

I urge the Government to take steps to ensure that the right to a dignified life of the agricultural workers is protected. Thank you, Madam.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The following hon. Members associated themselves with the Special Mention made by hon. Member, Dr. V. Sivadasan: Shri Niranjana Bishi (Odisha), Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla (Tamil Nadu), Shri A.A. Rahim (Kerala), Shri R. Girirajan (Tamil Nadu), Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala), Shri Sandosh Kumar P (Kerala), Shri M. Shanmugam (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu (Tamil Nadu), Shri P.P. Suneer (Kerala), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha) and Dr. John Brittas (Kerala).

Now, hon. Member Shri Brijlal.

**Concern over high level of pollution in rivers flowing through Bagpat, Uttar Pradesh**

SHRI BRIJLAL (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, the status of the "Cancer River" in Bagpat, Uttar Pradesh, remains dire. The Krishna, Kali, and Hindon rivers, which flow through this region, are heavily contaminated with industrial pollutants, including heavy metals like mercury and lead. This pollution has severely impacted the health of local residents, leading to high rates of cancer, bone deformities, and other serious illnesses. Efforts by the National Green Tribunal (NGT) have highlighted the failure to address these issues effectively. Despite orders to provide clean drinking water and improve health monitoring, little progress has been made. Many residents continue to rely on contaminated water for daily use causing health problems. This has resulted in untimely death and a large number of other ailments. This problem has been there for over two decades and everyone has been highlighting the dangerous effects on the lives of residents and farmers of this area but little has been achieved. I earnestly urge the Central and State bodies involved in this area to make efforts to eradicate this problem by making war level efforts and save the lives of residents and the future generations. I also urge for a time-bound action on the issue as this problem is increasing despite making best efforts. Thank you, Madam.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (MS. KAVITA PATIDAR): The following hon. Member associated himself with the Special Mention made by hon. Member, Shri Brijlal: Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha).

The House stands adjourned to meet at 11.00 A.M. on Thursday, the 25<sup>th</sup> July, 2024.

*The House then adjourned at thirty-eight minutes past six of the clock till eleven of the clock on Thursday, the 25<sup>th</sup> July, 2024.*

---

PUBLISHED UNDER RULE 260 OF RULES OF PROCEDURE AND CONDUCT OF  
BUSINESS IN THE COUNCIL OF STATES (RAJYA SABHA)