

Vol. 260
No. 1



Thursday,
20th July, 2023
29 Ashadha, 1945 (Saka)

PARLIAMENTARY DEBATES

RAJYA SABHA

OFFICIAL REPORT (FLOOR VERSION)

(PART-II)

CONTENTS

National Anthem (page 1)

Obituary References (pages 1 - 2)

Birthday Greetings (page 3)

Panel of Vice-Chairmen (pages 3 - 4)

Resignation by Member - *Accepted* (page 4)

Regarding notices received under Rules 176 and 267 and other issues (pages 4 - 8)

Papers Laid on the Table (pages 8 - 10)

[P.T.O.]

©
RAJYA SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

Report of the Committee of Privileges - *Presented* (page 10)

Report of the Joint Committee on the Forest (Conservation) Amendment Bill, 2023 - *Laid on the Table* (page 11)

Record of Evidence of the Joint Committee on the Forest (Conservation) Amendment Bill, 2023 - *Laid on the Table* (page 11)

Statements by Ministers —

Status of implementation of recommendations/observations contained in the Two Hundred and Forty-first Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Home Affairs - *Laid on the Table* (page 11)

Status of implementation of recommendations/observations contained in the Three Hundred and Seventy-fifth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Science and Technology, Environment, Forests and Climate Change - *Laid on the Table* (pages 11 - 12)

Government Bills -

The Cinematograph (Amendment) Bill, 2019- *Withdrawn* (page 12)

The Cinematograph (Amendment) Bill, 2023- *Introduced* (pages 12 - 13)

[Answers to Starred and Un-starred Questions (Both in English and Hindi) are available as Part -I to this Debate, published electronically on the Rajya Sabha website under the link <https://rajyasabha.nic.in/Debates/OfficialDebatesDateWise>]

Website : <http://rajyasabha.nic.in>

<http://parliamentofindia.nic.in>

E-mail : rsedit-e@sansad.nic.in

RAJYA SABHA

ALPHABETICAL LIST OF MEMBERS

A

Abdul Wahab, Shri (Kerala)
Abdulla, Shri M. Mohamed (Tamil Nadu)
Agrawal, Dr. Anil (Uttar Pradesh)
Agrawal, Dr. Radha Mohan Das (Uttar Pradesh)
Ahmad, Dr. Faiyaz (Bihar)
Ali, Shri Gulam (Nominated)
Alla, Shri Ayodhya Rami Reddy (Andhra Pradesh)
Amin, Shri Narhari (Gujarat)
Anavadiya, Shri Dineshchandra Jemalbhai (Gujarat)
Arora, Shri Sanjeev (Punjab)
Athawale, Shri Ramdas (Maharashtra)

B

Bachchan, Shrimati Jaya (Uttar Pradesh)
Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad (Assam)
Bajpai, Dr. Ashok (Uttar Pradesh)
Bajpayee, Dr. Laxmikant (Uttar Pradesh)
Bakshi, Shri Subrata (West Bengal)
Balmik, Shrimati Sumitra (Madhya Pradesh)
Baluni, Shri Anil (Uttarakhand)
Bansal, Shri Naresh (Uttarakhand)
Bara, Shrimati Ramilaben Becharbhai (Gujarat)
Beeda, Shri Masthan Rao (Andhra Pradesh)
Bharti, Shrimati Misha (Bihar)
Bhattacharya, Shri P. (West Bengal)
Bhattacharyya, Shri Bikash Ranjan (West Bengal)
Bhonsle, Shri Chh. Udayanraje (Maharashtra)
Bhuyan, Shri Ajit Kumar (Assam)
Bishi, Shri Niranjana (Odisha)

(ii)

[RAJYA SABHA]

Biswas, Shri Abir Ranjan (West Bengal)
Bonde, Dr. Anil Sukhdeorao (Maharashtra)
Brijlal, Shri (Uttar Pradesh)
Brittas, Dr. John (Kerala)

C

Chadha, Shri Raghav (Punjab)
Chakraborty, Shri Subhasish (West Bengal)
Chandrasegharan, Shri N. (Tamil Nadu)
Chandrasekhar, Shri Rajeev (Karnataka)
Chandrashekhar, Shri G.C. (Karnataka)
Chaturvedi, Shrimati Priyanka (Maharashtra)
Chaudhary, Shri Jayant (Uttar Pradesh)
Chavan, Shrimati Vandana (Maharashtra)
Chhetri, Shrimati Shanta (West Bengal)
Chidambaram, Shri P. (Tamil Nadu)

D

Dangi, Shri Neeraj (Rajasthan)
Deb, Shri Biplab Kumar (Tripura)
Deo, Shrimati Sulata (Odisha)
Desai, Shri Anil (Maharashtra)
Dev, Ms. Sushmita (West Bengal)
Devegowda, Shri H.D. (Karnataka)
Dharmar, Shri R. (Tamil Nadu)
Divakonda, Shri Damodar Rao (Telangana)
Dubey, Shri Satish Chandra (Bihar)
Dwivedi, Shrimati Seema (Uttar Pradesh)

E

Elango, Shri N.R. (Tamil Nadu)

G

Geeta alias Chandraprabha, Shrimati (Uttar Pradesh)
Gehlot, Shri Rajendra (Rajasthan)
Girirajan, Shri R. (Tamil Nadu)
Gogoi, Shri Ranjan (Nominated)
Gohil, Shri Shaktisinh (Gujarat)
Goswami, Ms. Indu Bala (Himachal Pradesh)
Goyal, Shri Piyush (Maharashtra)
Gupta, Shri Narain Dass (National Capital Territory of Delhi)
Gupta, Shri Prem Chand (Bihar)
Gupta, Shri Sushil Kumar (National Capital Territory of Delhi)

H

Hanumanthaiah, Dr. L. (Karnataka)
Haque, Shri Mohammed Nadimul (West Bengal)
Harivansh, Shri (Bihar)
Hegde, Shri Aneel Prasad (Bihar)
Heggade, Dr. Dharmasthala Veerendra (Nominated)
Hooda, Shri Deepender Singh (Haryana)
Hussain, Shri Syed Nasir (Karnataka)

I

Ilaiyaraaja, Shri (Nominated)

J

Jaggesh, Shri (Karnataka)
Jain, Dr. Anil (Uttar Pradesh)
Jaishankar, Shri S. (Gujarat)
Jangra, Shri Ram Chander (Haryana)
Javadekar, Shri Prakash (Maharashtra)
Jethmalani, Shri Mahesh (Nominated)
Jha, Prof. Manoj Kumar (Bihar)

Joginipally Santosh Kumar, Shri (Telangana)

K

Kadadi, Shri Iranna (Karnataka)
Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar (Assam)
Kalyanasundaram, Shri S. (Tamil Nadu)
Kanakamedala Ravindra Kumar, Shri (Andhra Pradesh)
Karad, Dr. Bhagwat (Maharashtra)
Kardam, Shrimati Kanta (Uttar Pradesh)
Kareem, Shri Elamaram (Kerala)
Karim, Shri Ahmad Ashfaque (Bihar)
Ketkar, Shri Kumar (Maharashtra)
Khan, Dr. Fauzia (Maharashtra)
Khan, Shri Javed Ali (Uttar Pradesh)
Khan, Shri Muzibulla (Odisha)
Kharge, Shri Mallikarjun (Karnataka)
Kharlukhi, Dr. Wanweiroy (Meghalaya)
Konyak, Shrimati S. Phangnon (Nagaland)
Koragappa, Shri Narayana (Karnataka)
Krishnaiah, Shri Ryaga (Andhra Pradesh)
Kumar, Shri Mithlesh (Uttar Pradesh)
Kumar, Dr. Sikander (Himachal Pradesh)
Kumar, Shri Sujeet (Odisha)

L

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey (Sikkim)
Laxman, Dr. K. (Uttar Pradesh)
Leishemba, Shri Maharaja Sanajaoba (Manipur)
Lokhandwala, Shri Jugalsinh (Gujarat)

M

Mahadik, Shri Dhananjay Bhimrao (Maharashtra)
Mahto, Shri Khiru (Bihar)

Maji, Shrimati Mahua (Jharkhand)
Mandaviya, Dr. Mansukh (Gujarat)
Mangaraj, Shri Manas Ranjan (Odisha)
Mani, Shri Jose K. (Kerala)
Mansingh, Dr. Sonal (Nominated)
Margherita, Shri Pabitra (Assam)
Mather Hisham, Shrimati Jebi (Kerala)
Meena, Dr. Kirodi Lal (Rajasthan)
Mittal, Dr. Ashok Kumar (Punjab)
Modi, Shri Sushil Kumar (Bihar)
Mohanta, Shrimati Mamata (Odisha)
Mokariya, Shri Rambhai Harjibhai (Gujarat)
Mopidevi, Shri Venkataramana Rao (Andhra Pradesh)
Muraleedharan, Shri V. (Maharashtra)
Murugan, Dr. L. (Madhya Pradesh)

N

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash (Himachal Pradesh)
Nagar, Shri Surendra Singh (Uttar Pradesh)
Nanda, Dr. Prashanta (Odisha)
Narzary, Shri Rwngrwa (Assam)
Nathwani, Shri Parimal (Andhra Pradesh)
Netam, Shrimati Phulo Devi (Chhattisgarh)
Nirmala Sitharaman, Shrimati (Karnataka)
Nishad, Shri Baburam (Uttar Pradesh)
Noor, Shrimati Mausam (West Bengal)

O

O' Brien, Shri Derek (West Bengal)
Oraon, Shri Samir (Jharkhand)

P

P, Shri Sandosh Kumar (Kerala)

Pandey, Ms. Saroj (Chhattisgarh)
Panwar, Shri Krishan Lal (Haryana)
Patel, Shri Praful (Maharashtra)
Patel, Shri Rajmani (Madhya Pradesh)
Patel, Shri Shambhu Sharan (Bihar)
Pathak, Shri Sandeep Kumar (Punjab)
Patidar, Ms. Kavita (Madhya Pradesh)
Patil, Shrimati Rajani Ashokrao (Maharashtra)
Patnaik, Dr. Amar (Odisha)
Patra, Dr. Sasmit (Odisha)
Pawar, Shri Sharad (Maharashtra)
Pilli, Shri Subhas Chandra Bose (Andhra Pradesh)
Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra (Madhya Pradesh)
Prakash, Shri Deepak (Jharkhand)
Prasad, Shri Aditya (Jharkhand)
Prasad, Shri V. Vijayendra (Nominated)
Pratapgarhi, Shri Imran (Maharashtra)
Puri, Shri Hardeep Singh (Uttar Pradesh)

R

Rahim, Shri A. A. (Kerala)
Rajbhar, Shri Sakaldeep (Uttar Pradesh)
Rajeshkumar, Shri K.R.N. (Tamil Nadu)
Ram Shakal, Shri (Nominated)
Ramadoss, Dr. Anbumani (Tamil Nadu)
Ramesh, Dr. C.M. (Andhra Pradesh)
Ramesh, Shri Jairam (Karnataka)
Ramji, Shri (Uttar Pradesh)
Rane, Shri Narayan (Maharashtra)
Ranjan, Shrimati Ranjeet (Chhattisgarh)
Rao, Shri G.V.L. Narasimha (Uttar Pradesh)
Rao, Dr. K. Keshava (Telangana)
Rathwa, Shri Naranbhai J. (Gujarat)
Raut, Shri Sanjay (Maharashtra)

Ray, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar (West Bengal)
Rebia, Shri Nabam (Arunachal Pradesh)
Reddy, Shri B. Parthasaradhi (Telangana)
Reddy, Shri K.R. Suresh (Telangana)
Reddy, Shri S Niranjan (Andhra Pradesh)
Reddy, Shri V. Vijayasai (Andhra Pradesh)
Rupala, Shri Parshottam (Gujarat)

S

Sahney, Shri Vikramjit Singh (Punjab)
Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad (Jharkhand)
Saini, Dr. Kalpana (Uttarakhand)
Scindia, Shri Jyotiraditya M. (Madhya Pradesh)
Selvaganabathy, Shri S. (Puducherry)
Selvarasu, Shri Anthiyur P. (Tamil Nadu)
Sen, Ms. Dola (West Bengal)
Sen, Dr. Santanu (West Bengal)
Shanmugam, Shri C. Ve. (Tamil Nadu)
Shanmugam, Shri M. (Tamil Nadu)
Sharma, Shri Kartikeya (Haryana)
Shekhar, Shri Neeraj (Uttar Pradesh)
Shukla, Shri Rajeev (Chhattisgarh)
Sibal, Shri Kapil (Uttar Pradesh)
Singh, Shri A. D. (Bihar)
Singh, Shri Ajay Pratap (Madhya Pradesh)
Singh, Shri Akhilesh Prasad (Bihar)
Singh, Shri Arun (Uttar Pradesh)
Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain (Bihar)
Singh, Shrimati Darshana (Uttar Pradesh)
Singh, Shri Digvijaya (Madhya Pradesh)
Singh, Shri Harbhajan (Punjab)
Singh, Dr. Manmohan (Rajasthan)
Singh, Shri Sanjay (National Capital Territory of Delhi)
Singh, Shri Sant Balbir (Punjab)
Singhvi, Dr. Abhishek Manu (West Bengal)

Sinha, Shri Rakesh (Nominated)
Sircar, Shri Jawhar (West Bengal)
Siroya, Shri Lahar Singh (Karnataka)
Siva, Shri Tiruchi (Tamil Nadu)
Sivadasan, Dr. V. (Kerala)
Solanki, Dr. Sumer Singh (Madhya Pradesh)
Somu, Dr. Kanimozhi NVN (Tamil Nadu)
Soni, Shri Kailash (Madhya Pradesh)
Sonowal, Shri Sarbananda (Assam)
Soren, Shri Shibu (Jharkhand)
Surjewala, Shri Randeep Singh (Rajasthan)

T

Tankha, Shri Vivek K. (Madhya Pradesh)
Tasa, Shri Kamakhya Prasad (Assam)
Tendulkar, Shri Vinay Dinu (Goa)
Thakur, Shri Ram Nath (Bihar)
Thakur, Shri Vivek (Bihar)
Thambidurai, Dr. M. (Tamil Nadu)
Tiwari, Shri Ghanshyam (Rajasthan)
Tiwari, Shri Pramod (Rajasthan)
Tomar, Shri Vijay Pal Singh (Uttar Pradesh)
Trivedi, Dr. Sudhanshu (Uttar Pradesh)
Tulsi, Shri K.T.S. (Chhattisgarh)

U

Usha, Shrimati P. T. (Nominated)

V

Vaddiraju, Shri Ravichandra (Telangana)
Vaiko, Shri (Tamil Nadu)
Vaishnaw, Shri Ashwini (Odisha)
Vanlalvena, Shri K. (Mizoram)

Vasan, Shri G.K. (Tamil Nadu)
Vats (Retd.), Lt.Gen. (Dr.) D. P. (Haryana)
Vemireddy, Shri Prabhakar Reddy (Andhra Pradesh)
Venugopal, Shri K.C. (Rajasthan)
Verma, Shri B.L. (Uttar Pradesh)
Viswam, Shri Binoy (Kerala)

W

Wasnik, Shri Mukul Balkrishna (Rajasthan)
Wilson, Shri P. (Tamil Nadu)

Y

Yadav, Shri B. Lingaiah (Telangana)
Yadav, Shri Bhupender (Rajasthan)
Yadav, Shri Harnath Singh (Uttar Pradesh)
Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal (Uttar Pradesh)
Yadav, Shrimati Sangeeta (Uttar Pradesh)
Yajnik, Dr. Ameer (Gujarat)

(x)

[RAJYA SABHA]

RAJYA SABHA

THE CHAIRMAN

Shri Jagdeep Dhankhar

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN

Shri Harivansh

PANEL OF VICE-CHAIRMEN

1. Shrimati P. T. Usha
2. Shrimati S. Phangnon Konyak
3. Dr. Fauzia Khan
4. Shrimati Sulato Deo
5. Shri V. Vijayasai Reddy
6. Shri Ghanshyam Tiwari
7. Dr. L. Hanumanthaiah
8. Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray

SECRETARY-GENERAL

Shri P. C. Mody

STANDING COMMITTEES

Business Advisory Committee

Hon'ble Chairman — *Chairman*

Shri Harivansh

Shri Bhupender Yadav

Dr. Laxmikant Bajpayee

Shrimati Misha Bharti

Shri Prakash Javadekar

Shri Derek O' Brien

Shri Jairam Ramesh

Dr. K. Keshava Rao

Shri V. Vijayasai Reddy

Shri Sanjay Singh

Committee on Ethics

Shri Prakash Javadekar — *Chairman*

Shri Jairam Ramesh

Shri Derek O' Brien

Shri Tiruchi Siva

Shri Sanjay Singh

Dr. Sasmit Patra

Shri V. Vijayasai Reddy

Dr. K. Keshava Rao

Shri Prem Chand Gupta

Shri Elamaram Kareem

Shrimati Jaya Bachchan

Shrimati Misha Bharti

Shrimati P. T. Usha

General Purposes Committee

Hon'ble Chairman — *Chairman*

Shri Harivansh
Shri Tiruchi Siva
Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray
Shri Derek O' Brien
Shri Birendra Prasad Baishya
Shri Prabhakar Reddy Vemireddy
Shri Bhubaneswar Kalita
Shrimati Vandana Chavan
Dr. L. Hanumanthaiah
Shri Prem Chand Gupta
Dr. K. Keshava Rao
Shri Elamaram Kareem
Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav
Shri Mallikarjun Kharge
Shri Ram Nath Thakur
Shri Sushil Kumar Modi

Committee on Government Assurances

Dr. M. Thambidurai — *Chairman*

Shri Birendra Prasad Baishya
Shri Mohammed Nadimul Haque
Shri Hishey Lachungpa
Shri Akhilesh Prasad Singh
Shri Sakaldeep Rajbhar
Shrimati Ramilaben Becharbhai Bara
Shrimati Seema Dwivedi
Shri M. Mohamed Abdulla
Shri Gulam Ali

House Committee

Dr. C.M. Ramesh— *Chairman*

Shri P. Bhattacharya

Shri G.C. Chandrashekhar

Shri Prem Chand Gupta

Shrimati S. Phangnon Konyak

Shri Pabitra Margherita

Ms. Dola Sen

Shri Vijay Pal Singh Tomar

Shri Prabhakar Reddy Vemireddy

Shri B. Lingaiah Yadav

Committee on Members of Parliament Local Area Development Scheme

Shri Harivansh — *Chairman*

Dr. Laxmikant Bajpayee

Shrimati Phulo Devi Netam

Shrimati Mausam Noor

Shri P. Wilson

Dr. Ashok Kumar Mittal

Shrimati Sulata Deo

Shri Masthan Rao Beeda

Shri R. Dharmar

Shri G.K. Vasani

Shri Praful Patel

Shri Kartikeya Sharma

Dr. Dharmasthala Veerendra Heggade

Committee on Papers Laid on the Table

Shri Kamakhya Prasad Tasa— *Chairman*

Shri Bikash Ranjan Bhattacharyya

Shri Anil Desai

(xiv)

[RAJYA SABHA]

Shri Aneel Prasad Hegde
Shri Ram Chander Jangra
Shri Deepak Prakash
Shrimati Ranjeet Ranjan
Dr. Sudhanshu Trivedi
Shri Abdul Wahab
Shri Harnath Singh Yadav

Committee on Petitions

Shri Sujeet Kumar— *Chairman*

Shrimati Sumitra Balmik
Shri Rajendra Gehlot
Dr. L. Hanumanthaiah
Dr. Dharmasthala Veerendra Heggade
Shri Nabam Rebia
Shri Kartikeya Sharma
Shri Arun Singh
Shri Sanjay Singh
Shri Tiruchi Siva

Committee of Privileges

Shri Harivansh — *Chairman*

Dr. Anil Jain
Shri Elamaram Kareem
Shri Kumar Ketkar
Ms. Saroj Pandey
Shri Manas Ranjan Mangaraj
Shri G.V.L. Narasimha Rao
Dr. Abhishek Manu Singhvi
Shri Rakesh Sinha
Shri G.K. Vasani

**Committee on Information and Communication Technology Management in
Rajya Sabha**

Shri Narain Dass Gupta — *Chairman*

Shri Rakesh Sinha

Shri Deepender Singh Hooda

Shri Abir Ranjan Biswas

Shri R. Girirajan

Shri Muzibulla Khan

Shri Venkataramana Rao Mopidevi

Shri K.R. Suresh Reddy

Shrimati Misha Bharti

Dr. John Brittas

Shri Ram Nath Thakur

Committee on Rules

Hon'ble Chairman — *Chairman*

Shri Harivansh

Shri Anil Baluni

Shri N.R. Elango

Shri Narain Dass Gupta

Shri Ilaiyaraaja

Shri Kanakamedala Ravindra Kumar

Dr. K. Laxman

Shri Sushil Kumar Modi

Shrimati Mamata Mohanta

Shri Parimal Nathwani

Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray

Shri B. Parthasaradhi Reddy

Shri Digvijaya Singh

Shri Ghanshyam Tiwari

Shri Bhupender Yadav

Committee on Subordinate Legislation

Dr. Laxmikant Bajpayee — *Chairman*

Shri Raghav Chadha

Shri Jayant Chaudhary

Shrimati Vandana Chavan

Ms. Sushmita Dev

Shri R. Dharmar

Shri Mahesh Jethmalani

Shri Surendra Singh Nagar

Dr. Amar Patnaik

Shri G.V.L. Narasimha Rao

Shri S Niranjan Reddy

Shri K.R. Suresh Reddy

Shri Neeraj Shekhar

Shri Vivek K. Tankha

Shri K. T. S. Tulsi

DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEES

Committee on Commerce

Dr. Abhishek Manu Singhvi— *Chairman*

RAJYA SABHA

Shri Ayodhya Rami Reddy Alla

Shrimati Priyanka Chaturvedi

Shri Jayant Chaudhary

Shri Jugalsinh Lokhandwala

Shri Dhananjay Bhimrao Mahadik

Shri Deepak Prakash

Shri Vikramjit Singh Sahney

Shri K. Vanlalvena

LOK SABHA

Shri Prasun Banerjee
Shri Raju Bista
Shri Rajkumar Chahar
Shrimati Kalaben Mohanbhai Delkar
Shri Rameshbhai Lavjibhai Dhaduk
Shri Arvind Dharmapuri
Dr. Nishikant Dubey
Shri Santosh Kumar Gangwar
Shri Srinivas Kesineni
Shri Manoj Kishorbhai Kotak
Shri Ajay Kumar Mandal
Shrimati Manjulata Mandal
Shri Nakul K. Nath
Dr. Gautham Sigamani Pon
Dr. Manoj Rajoria
Shri Nama Nageswara Rao
Shri Ashok Kumar Rawat
Shri Magunta Sreenivasulu Reddy
Shri Prajwal Revanna
Shri Gowdar Mallikarjunappa Siddeshwara
Shri Arvind Ganpat Sawant

Committee on Health and Family Welfare

Shri Bhubaneswar Kalita — *Chairman*

RAJYA SABHA

Dr. Anil Agrawal
Shri Sanjeev Arora
Dr. L. Hanumanthaiah
Shri Shambhu Sharan Patel
Shri Imran Pratapgarhi
Shri B. Parthasaradhi Reddy

Shri S. Selvaganabathy

Dr. Santanu Sen

Shri A. D. Singh

LOK SABHA

Shrimati Mangal Suresh Angadi

Ms. Bhavana Gawali (Patil)

Shri Maddila Gurumoorthy

Ms. Ramya Haridas

Shri K. Navas Kani

Dr. Amol Ramsing Kolhe

Shri C. Lalrosanga

Dr. Sanghamitra Maurya

Shri Arjunlal Meena

Shrimati Pratima Mondal

Dr. Pritam Gopinath Rao Munde

Dr. Lorho S. Pfoze

Adv. Adoor Prakash

Shri Haji Fazlur Rehman

Dr. Rajdeep Roy

Dr. DNV Senthilkumar S.

Dr. Jadon Chandra Sen

Shri Anurag Sharma

Dr. Mahesh Sharma

Dr. Sujay Radhakrishna Vikhepatil

Dr. Krishnapal Singh Yadav

Committee on Home Affairs

Shri Brijlal — *Chairman*

RAJYA SABHA

Shri P. Bhattacharya

Shri Biplab Kumar Deb

Shri N.R. Elango
Dr. Anil Jain
Shri Sujeet Kumar
Shri Derek O' Brien
Shri Neeraj Shekhar
Shri Digvijaya Singh
Shri Rakesh Sinha

LOK SABHA

Shri Sanjay Bhatia
Shri Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury
Dr. (Shrimati) Kakoli Ghosh Dastidar
Shri Dilip Ghosh
Shri Dulal Chandra Goswami
Shrimati Kirron Kher
Thiru Dayanidhi Maran
Shri Raja Amareshwara Naik
Shri Ranjeetsingh Naik Nimbalkar
Shri Jamyang Tsering Namgyal
Shri Gajendra Singh Patel
Shri Lalubhai Babubhai Patel
Shri R.K. Singh Patel
Shri Vishnu Dayal Ram
Shrimati Sarmistha Kumari Sethi
Shri Rahul Ramesh Shewale
Shri Ravneet Singh
Dr. Satya Pal Singh
Shrimati Geetha Viswanath Vanga
Shri Dinesh Chandra Yadav

Committee on Education, Women, Children, Youth & Sports

Shri Vivek Thakur — *Chairman*

RAJYA SABHA

Dr. Faiyaz Ahmad
Shri Bikash Ranjan Bhattacharyya
Ms. Sushmita Dev
Dr. K. Keshava Rao
Shri Akhilesh Prasad Singh
Dr. Kanimozhi NVN Somu
Dr. M. Thambidurai
Shri Ghanshyam Tiwari
Shrimati Sangeeta Yadav

LOK SABHA

Shri Rajendra Agrawal
Dr. T. R. Paarivendhar
Dr. Dhal Singh Bisen
Shri Sangamlal Kadedin Gupta
Shri Sri Krishna Devarayalu Lavu
Shri Ghanshyam Singh Lodhi
Shri Sadashiv Kisan Lokhande
Dr. Jaisiddeshwar Shivacharya Mahaswamiji
Shri Asit Kumar Mal
Shri Anubhav Mohanty
Shri Balak Nath
Shri Chandeshwar Prasad
Shri T.N. Prathapan
Shri Ratansinh Magansinh Rathod
Shri Jagannath Sarkar
Dr. Arvind Kumar Sharma
Shri Vishnu Datt Sharma

Shri Dharambir Singh
Shrimati Pratibha Singh
Shri S. Venkatesan

Committee on Industry

Shri Tiruchi Siva— *Chairman*

RAJYA SABHA

Shri Birendra Prasad Baishya
Shrimati Sulata Deo
Shri Mithlesh Kumar
Shri Sandosh Kumar P
Shri Hishey Lachungpa
Shri Rajeev Shukla
Dr. Ameer Yajnik
Dr. Sikander Kumar

LOK SABHA

Shri Hanuman Beniwal
Ms. Mimi Chakraborty
Shri Bharatsinhji Shankarji Dabhi
Shri Hemant Tukaram Godse
Dr. S.T. Hasan
Shri Mohanbhai Kalyanji Kundariya
Shri Ravindra Kushawaha
Shrimati Poonamben Hematbhai Maadam
Shri Bidyut Baran Mahato
Shri Ramprit Mandal
Shri Vincent H. Pala
Shri Chirag Paswan
Shri T.R.V.S. Ramesh
Shri Y. S. Avinash Reddy
Shrimati Gomati Sai
Shri Ravi Kishan Shukla

Shri Sunil Soren
Shri Sunil Dattatray Tatkare
Shri Su. Thirunavukkarasar
Shri Vijayakumar (Alias) Vijay Vasanth
Shri Kumbakudi Sudhakaran

Committee on Personnel, Public Grievances, Law and Justice

Shri Sushil Kumar Modi — *Chairman*

RAJYA SABHA

Shrimati Vandana Chavan
Shri Mahesh Jethmalani
Shri Kanakamedala Ravindra Kumar
Shri Sanjay Raut
Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray
Shri K.R. Suresh Reddy
Shrimati Darshana Singh
Shri Vivek K. Tankha
Shri P. Wilson

LOK SABHA

Shri Manickam Tagore B.
Shri Kalyan Banerjee
Shri Pradan Baruah
Shri Venkatesh Netha Borlakunta
Shri Vinod Chavda
Shrimati Veena Devi
Shri Jasbir Singh Gill
Shri Choudhury Mohan Jatua
Shri Raghu Ramakrishna Raju Kanumuru
Shri Jyotirmay Singh Mahato

Shri Malook Nagar
Dr. Ramesh Pokhriyal "Nishank"
Shri Suresh Kumar Pujari
Shri A. Raja
Shri Omprakash Bhupalsingh *alias* Pavan Rajenimbalkar
Shri Upendra Singh Rawat
Shrimati Sandhya Ray
Shri Kuldeep Rai Sharma
Shri Mahendra Singh Solanky
Shri Rajan Baburao Vichare

Committee on Science and Technology, Environment, Forests and Climate Change

Shri Jairam Ramesh — *Chairman*

RAJYA SABHA

Shri Anil Baluni
Shri Niranjana Bishi
Shrimati Seema Dwivedi
Ms. Indu Bala Goswami
Shri Joginipally Santosh Kumar
Shri Jose K. Mani
Shri Parimal Nathwani
Shri Nabam Rebia
Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav

LOK SABHA

Shrimati Sajda Ahmed
Shri Guharam Ajgalley
Shri Jaswantsinh Sumanbhai Bhabhor
Dr. Dhal Singh Bisen
Shri Sudarshan Bhagat
Shri Sunny Deol
Shri Anantkumar Hegde

Shrimati Jyotsna Charandas Mahant
Dr. Swami Sakshi Ji Maharaj
Shri Asaduddin Owaisi
Shri Kotha Prabhakar Reddy
Dr. Jayanta Kumar Roy
Shri Mahesh Sahoo
Dr. M. P. Abdussamad Samadani
Shri Francisco Cosme Sardinha
Shri Anurag Sharma
Shri Kirti Vardhan Singh
Dr. Ramapati Ram Tripathi
Shri Mansukhbhai Dhanjibhai Vasava
Shri Ram Shiromani Verma

Committee on Transport, Tourism and Culture

Shri V. Vijayasai Reddy — *Chairman*

RAJYA SABHA

Shri Mohammed Nadimul Haque
Shrimati S. Phangnon Konyak
Shri Jugalsinh Lokhandwala
Shri Manas Ranjan Mangaraj
Dr. Sonal Mansingh
Shrimati Rajani Ashokrao Patil
Shri A. A. Rahim
Dr. C.M. Ramesh
Shri Vinay Dinu Tendulkar

LOK SABHA

Shri Anto Antony
Shri Ram Margani Bharat
Shri Tapir Gao
Shri Rahul Kaswan

Shri Ramesh Chandra Majhi
Shri Sunil Baburao Mendhe
Shri K. Muraleedharan
Shri S.S. Palanimanickam
Shri Chhedi Paswan
Shri Kamlesh Paswan
Shri Sunil Kumar Pintu
Shri Prince Raj
Shri Tirath Singh Rawat
Shrimati Mala Roy
Shri Rajiv Pratap Rudy
Shri Dushyant Singh
Shri Rajbahadur Singh
Shri Ramdas Chandrabhanji Tadas
Shri Manoj Kumar Tiwari
Shri Krupal Balaji Tumane
Shri Dinesh Lal Yadav "Nirahua"

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA**Cabinet Ministers**

Shri Narendra Modi	The Prime Minister and also <i>in-charge</i> of the following Ministries/Departments:- i) The Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions; ii) The Department of Atomic Energy; iii) The Department of Space; All important policy issues; and All other portfolios not allocated to any Minister
Shri Raj Nath Singh	The Minister of Defence
Shri Amit Shah	The Minister of Home Affairs; and The Minister of Cooperation
Shri Nitin Jairam Gadkari	The Minister of Road Transport and Highways
Shrimati Nirmala Sitharaman	The Minister of Finance; and The Minister of Corporate Affairs
Shri Narendra Singh Tomar	The Minister of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare
Shri S. Jaishankar	The Minister of External Affairs
Shri Arjun Munda	The Minister of Tribal Affairs
Shrimati Smriti Zubin Irani	The Minister of Women and Child Development; and The Minister of Minority Affairs
Shri Piyush Goyal	The Minister of Commerce and Industry; The Minister of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution; and The Minister of Textiles
Shri Dharmendra Pradhan	The Minister of Education; and The Minister of Skill Development and Entrepreneurship

Shri Pralhad Joshi	The Minister of Parliamentary Affairs; The Minister of Coal; and The Minister of Mines
Shri Narayan Rane	The Minister of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises
Shri Sarbananda Sonowal	The Minister of Ports, Shipping and Waterways; and The Minister of AYUSH
Dr. Virendra Kumar	The Minister of Social Justice and Empowerment
Shri Giriraj Singh	The Minister of Rural Development; and The Minister of Panchayati Raj
Shri Jyotiraditya M. Scindia	The Minister of Civil Aviation; and The Minister of Steel
Shri Ashwini Vaishnaw	The Minister of Railways; The Minister of Communications; and The Minister of Electronics and Information Technology
Shri Pashu Pati Kumar Paras	The Minister of Food Processing Industries
Shri Gajendra Singh Shekhawat	The Minister of Jal Shakti
Shri Kiren Rijju	The Minister of Earth Sciences
Shri Raj Kumar Singh	The Minister of Power; and The Minister of New and Renewable Energy
Shri Hardeep Singh Puri	The Minister of Petroleum and Natural Gas; and The Minister of Housing and Urban Affairs
Dr. Mansukh Mandaviya	The Minister of Health and Family Welfare; and The Minister of Chemicals and Fertilizers
Shri Bhupender Yadav	The Minister of Environment, Forest and Climate Change; and The Minister of Labour and Employment

(xxviii)

[RAJYA SABHA]

Dr. Mahendra Nath Pandey	The Minister of Heavy Industries
Shri Parshottam Rupala	The Minister of Fisheries, Animal Husbandry and Dairying
Shri G. Kishan Reddy	The Minister of Culture; The Minister of Tourism; and The Minister of Development of North Eastern Region
Shri Anurag Singh Thakur	The Minister of Information and Broadcasting; and The Minister of Youth Affairs and Sports

Ministers of State (Independent Charge)

Rao Inderjit Singh	The Minister of State of the Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation; The Minister of State of the Ministry of Planning; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Corporate Affairs
Dr. Jitendra Singh	The Minister of State of the Ministry of Science and Technology; The Minister of State in the Prime Minister's Office; The Minister of State in the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions; The Minister of State in the Department of Atomic Energy; and The Minister of State in the Department of Space
Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal	The Minister of State of the Ministry of Law and Justice; The Minister of State in the Ministry of Parliamentary Affairs; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Culture

Ministers of State

Shri Shripad Yesso Naik	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Ports, Shipping and Waterways; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Tourism
Shri Faggansingh Kulaste	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Steel; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Rural Development
Shri Prahalad Singh Patel	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Jal Shakti; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Food Processing Industries
Shri Ashwini Kumar Choubey	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change
General (Retd.) V. K. Singh	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Road Transport and Highways; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Civil Aviation
Shri Krishan Pal	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Power; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Heavy Industries
Shri Danve Raosaheb Dadarao	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Railways; The Minister of State in the Ministry of Coal; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Mines
Shri Ramdas Athawale	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment
Sadhvi Niranjan Jyoti	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Rural Development

(xxx)

[RAJYA SABHA]

Dr. Sanjeev Kumar Balyan	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Fisheries, Animal Husbandry and Dairying
Shri Nityanand Rai	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Home Affairs
Shri Pankaj Chaudhary	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Finance
Shrimati Anupriya Singh Patel	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Commerce and Industry
Prof. S. P. Singh Baghel	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare
Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Skill Development and Entrepreneurship; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Electronics and Information Technology
Sushri Shobha Karandlaje	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare
Shri Bhanu Pratap Singh Verma	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises
Shrimati Darshana Vikram Jardosh	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Textiles; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Railways
Shri V. Muraleedharan	The Minister of State in the Ministry of External Affairs; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Parliamentary Affairs
Shrimati Meenakashi Lekhi	The Minister of State in the Ministry of External Affairs; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Culture
Shri Som Parkash	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Commerce and Industry
Shrimati Renuka Singh Saruta	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Tribal Affairs
Shri Rameswar Teli	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas; and

[20 July, 2023]

(xxxix)

	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Labour and Employment
Shri Kailash Choudhary	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare
Shrimati Annpurna Devi	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Education
Shri A. Narayanaswamy	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment
Shri Kaushal Kishore	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs
Shri Ajay Bhatt	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Defence; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Tourism
Shri B. L. Verma	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Development of North Eastern Region; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Cooperation
Shri Ajay Kumar	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Home Affairs
Shri Devusinh Chauhan	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Communications
Shri Bhagwanth Khuba	The Minister of State in the Ministry of New and Renewable Energy; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Chemicals and Fertilizers
Shri Kapil Moreshwar Patil	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Panchayati Raj
Sushri Pratima Bhoumik	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment
Dr. Subhas Sarkar	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Education
Dr. Bhagwat Karad	The Minister of State in the Ministry of Finance
Dr. Rajkumar Ranjan Singh	The Minister of State in the Ministry of External Affairs; and The Minister of State in the Ministry of Education

(xxxii)

[RAJYA SABHA]

Dr. Bharati Pravin Pawar

The Minister of State in the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare

Shri Bishweswar Tudu

The Minister of State in the Ministry of Tribal Affairs;
and

The Minister of State in the Ministry of Jal Shakti

Shri Shantanu Thakur

The Minister of State in the Ministry of Ports, Shipping and Waterways

Dr. Munjapara Mahendrabhai

The Minister of State in the Ministry of Women and Child Development; and

The Minister of State in the Ministry of AYUSH

Shri John Barla

The Minister of State in the Ministry of Minority Affairs

Dr. L. Murugan

The Minister of State in the Ministry of Fisheries, Animal Husbandry and Dairying; and

The Minister of State in the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting

Shri Nisith Pramanik

The Minister of State in the Ministry of Home Affairs;
and

The Minister of State in the Ministry of Youth Affairs and Sports

THE PARLIAMENTARY DEBATES

OFFICIAL REPORT

IN THE TWO HUNDRED AND SIXTIETH SESSION OF THE RAJYA SABHA

Commencing on the 20th July, 2023/29 Ashadha , 1945 (saka)

RAJYA SABHA

Thursday, the 20th July, 2023 / 29 Ashadha, 1945 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock,

MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

(The National Anthem, 'Jana Gana Mana', was played)

OBITUARY REFERENCES

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I refer with profound sorrow to the passing away of a sitting Member of this house, Shri Hardwar Dubey and former Members, Shri Dawa Lama, Shrimati Usha Malhotra and Shri Solipeta Ramachandra Reddy.

Shri Hardwar Dubey passed away on the 26th of June, 2023. He represented the State of Uttar Pradesh in this august House. He was barely halfway through his term since its commencement in November, 2020.

I share a personal bond with him. We both belong to the legal fraternity. Shri Dubey was a passionate conservationist at heart, his deep commitment towards protection of wildlife and natural heritage was always reflected in his participation in the House.

Born on 1st June, 1949, at Husainabad in Ballia District of Uttar Pradesh, Shri Dubey took special interest in eradicating social problems affecting the society. He served as a Member of Uttar Pradesh Legislative Assembly for two terms and was also Minister of Finance in the Government of Uttar Pradesh.

In the passing away of Shri Hardwar Dubey, the country has lost an able administrator, dedicated environmentalist and a committed parliamentarian.

Shri Dawa Lama, a former Member of this House, who represented the State of West Bengal, from April 1996 to 2002, passed away on the 3rd of April this year. Shri Lama also served as a Member of West Bengal Legislative Assembly and as Minister of State in the Government of West Bengal, holding various portfolios.

Born on 18th August, 1929, at Chong Tong Tea Estate in Darjeeling, West Bengal, Shri Lama worked assiduously for the upliftment of poor peasants and tea garden workers.

In the passing away of Shri Dawa Lama, the country has lost a dedicated social worker, whose commitment to the cause of the upliftment of the most downtrodden was reflected equally both inside and outside this House.

Shrimati Usha Malhotra passed away on the 6th of April, 2023. She represented the State of Himachal Pradesh in this august House from April, 1980 to 1986.

Born on 6th August, 1933, in Lahore, undivided India, Shrimati Usha Malhotra was actively associated with the Indian Red Cross Society and women's welfare activities. An ardent advocate of women empowerment, she broke gender stereotype in public life. She also represented the nation at various conferences in Geneva, Moscow and Brighton.

With the loss of Shrimati Usha Malhotra, the country has lost an ardent advocate of gender justice and a face of women empowerment.

Shri Solipeta Ramachandra Reddy who passed away on 27th June, 2023 represented the State of Andhra Pradesh from April 1996 to 2002. Shri Reddy also served as a Member of the Andhra Pradesh Legislative Assembly from 1972 to 1978.

Born on 17th May, 1935 in Siddipet District of the present State of Telangana, Shri Reddy worked relentlessly for the cause of farmers, workers, women and always advocated for greater harmony among fellow citizens.

In the passing away of Shri Solipeta Ramachandra Reddy, the country has lost a committed soul who represented the interests of the most downtrodden in this House.

We deeply mourn the passing away of Shri Hardwar Dubey, Shri Dawa Lama, Shrimati Usha Malhotra and Shri Solipeta Ramachandra Reddy.

I request Members to rise in their places and observe silence as a mark of respect to the memory of the departed.

(Hon. Members then stood in silence for one minute)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Secretary-General will convey to the members of the bereaved families our sense of profound sorrow and deep sympathy.

As a mark of respect to the memory of Shri Hardwar Dubey, sitting Member, the House stands adjourned to meet at 12.00 noon.

The House then adjourned at eight minutes past eleven of the clock.

*The House reassembled at twelve of the clock,
MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.*

BIRTHDAY GREETINGS

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, first, a pleasant duty to greet our hon. Members on their birthday.

I take this opportunity to wish birthday greetings to the hon. Members of Parliament, Shri Rajmani Patel; Dr. Laxmikant Bajpayee; and Shrimati Sangeeta Yadav.

Hon. Members, Shri Rajmani Patel has been a Member of this august House since April 2018. He had also been a Member of the Madhya Pradesh Legislative Assembly for four terms from 1972 to 2003. He has served the society in the role of a farmer, journalist, writer and social worker. He is associated with politics since long.

Dr. Laxmikant Bajpayee has been a Member of this House since July 2022 and was a Member of Uttar Pradesh Legislative Assembly for four terms. He distinguished himself by serving the society as medical practitioner (Ayurvedic), political and social worker, a trader and an industrialist. He is popular in society as 'स्कूटर वाले डॉक्टर साहब'.

Shrimati Sangeeta Yadav has been a Member of this august House since July 2022. She has been active in social service since long. She is working for the women empowerment as a Member of the Committee on Empowerment of Women and as a Member of the Committee on Education, Women, Children, Youth & Sports.

Hon. Members, on my own behalf and on your behalf, I wish them a long, healthy and happy life and to be ever in the service of the nation.

PANEL OF VICE-CHAIRMEN

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have to inform the hon. Members that Panel of Vice-Chairpersons has been re-constituted w.e.f., 17th of July, 2023, with the following Members:

1. Shrimati P.T. Usha
2. Shrimati S. Phangnon Konyak;
3. Dr. Fauzia Khan;
4. Shrimati Sulata Deo;
5. Shri V. Vijayasai Reddy;
6. Shri Ghanshyam Tiwari;

7. Dr. L. Hanumanthaiah;
8. Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray.

Hon. Members will be happy to note that fifty per cent of the Vice-Chairpersons happen to be women.

RESIGNATION BY MEMBER

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have to inform hon. Members that I have received a letter, dated 11th April 2023, from Shri Luizinho Joaquim Faleiro, hon. Member representing the State of West Bengal, resigning his seat in the Rajya Sabha. I have accepted his resignation w.e.f. 11th of April, 2023.

REGARDING NOTICES RECEIVED UNDER RULE 176 AND 267 AND OTHER ISSUES

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I have received 12 notices under Rule 176 for Short Duration Discussion, three notices on 'Concerns over recent train accidents and railway safety' from Shri A.D. Singh, Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham, Dr. Ameer Yajnik; one notice is over unemployment issue from Shri A.D. Singh, and remaining eight notices are on the issues in Manipur. They are from Shri Birendra Prasad Baishya, Shri Brijlal, Shri Rakesh Sinha, Shri A.D. Singh, Prof. Manoj Kumar Jha, Dr. John Brittas, Shrimati Ranjeet Ranjan...

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL): Sir, on behalf of the Government, we are ready for a discussion on Manipur. ...*(Interruptions)*.. And, there is, absolutely, no problem in accepting this notice. ...*(Interruptions)*..

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, Short Duration Discussion prescriptions are very clear — That any Member within his right can give notice to that effect; that notice is required to be considered by the Chairman whether it is to be admitted or not; and, thereafter in consultation with the Leader of the Council of States, time has to be fixed. Now, since the Leader of the House has volunteered that the Government is

keen...*(Interruptions)*.. for discussion on Manipur, I find the notice is in order.
...*(Interruptions)*.. One at a time. ...*(Interruptions)*.. Sit down. ..*(Interruptions)*...

श्री प्रमोद तिवारी (राजस्थान): सर, एलओपी को बोलने दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, as the Government is ready for a discussion on Manipur issues, and, as the Government has agreed... ..*(Interruptions)*..

श्री जयराम रमेश (कर्नाटक) : सर, एलओपी को बोलने दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, please take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*.. Hon. LoP, for a minute, please take your seat. ..*(Interruptions)*.. Please take your seats, all of you. ..*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI RANJEET RANJAN (Chhattisgarh): Sir, Rule 267...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will hear everyone. You see, Short Duration Discussion on Manipur issues has come to be demanded under Rule 176 by various Members. I have indicated their names to you. So, Members are keen to engage in discussion over Manipur issues.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN (West Bengal): Sir, Rule 267...*(Interruptions)*.. It is notice for Rule 267...*(Interruptions)*.. You rule on Rule 267. ...*(Interruptions)*..

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will come to...*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: No, no. Sir, you rule on Rule 267. ...*(Interruptions)*..

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will come to Rule 267 also. The next item is Rule 267. ..*(Interruptions)*..

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE): Please, one minute for me. I humbly request you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: One second. ...*(Interruptions)*.. Sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Leader of the Opposition, please. ...*(Interruptions)*.. Yes, go ahead.

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: Respected Sir, I am very sorry; you always speak about the procedure and all other things.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Is anything wrong with it?

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: No, no. I am telling you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Then, why are you sorry about it?

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: One minute.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Why should a senior Member like you be sorry about it? ..(*Interruptions*).. What is there to be sorry about it if I care about the procedure?

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: You allow me to complete, Sir. ...(*Interruptions*)..

MR. CHAIRMAN: But, don't be sorry about it. All of us must follow the procedure. We must believe in rule of law.

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: Sir, I am following; that is why, I kept quiet; I raised my finger.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are holding the floor. ...(*Interruptions*).. I allowed you to hold the floor. Continue, please.

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: How the Leader of the House suddenly got up and said, "we are ready"! It is because he has not read the Agenda fully as we have also given notice under Rule 267. We have also given notice under Rule 267 for 'Suspension of Business under Rule 267'. It is pertaining to that. Thus, you have to suspend all other Business and take up this, not Half-an-Hour. ...(*Interruptions*)... On Manipur issue(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members,(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: Let *Pradhan Mantri* give statement; we will discuss. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One second, please ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, we have the Listed Business; Rule 267 is the next item. I have to go sequentially. I will be taking up all issues. But let me tell hon. Members*(Interruptions)*... One second. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let me tell hon. Members*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI RANJEET RANJAN: Sir, it is very serious ...*(Interruptions)*... सर, कल जो वीडियो आया, वह सीरियस था। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Short Duration Discussion has three facets. One, every Member of the House is entitled to give notice for Short Duration Discussion. Hon. Members have availed that opportunity, and they have sent notices to me. I have considered those notices. The second stage is that under the Rule, under the mandate of the Rule, I have to consult date and time with the Leader of the House*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, I am on a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, my point of order is on only one thing. It is on Page 92, and the Rule here, Sir, is very clear.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Which Rule?

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: 'Rule 267.' I am reading Rule 267, the first line.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am on this Agenda.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Page 92 says, "Any rule may be suspended in its application to a motion related to the Business listed before the Council of that day, the rule in question shall be suspended for the time being." This means, no other Business till Rule 267 is first discussed. Where is Rule 176 coming to this? ...*(Interruptions)*... There is no Rule 176. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is on Rule 267, and we want a discussion here on Manipur. ...*(Interruptions)*... We want a discussion, * Manipur, Manipur, Manipur! * ...*(Interruptions)*...

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, on notice under Rule 176, the Government is keen and agreeable for a discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will have consultation with the Leader of the House and decide it accordingly. ...*(Interruptions)*... The House is adjourned to meet at 2.00 p.m. today.

The House then adjourned at thirteen minutes past twelve of the clock.

The House re-assembled at two of the clock,

MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

MR. CHAIRMAN: Papers to be laid on the Table. Secretary-General.

Statement showing Bills passed by the Houses of Parliament during the Two Hundred and Fifty-Ninth Session of the Rajya Sabha and assented to by the President

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Sir, I lay on the Table, a statement (in English and Hindi) showing the Bills passed by the Houses of Parliament during the Two Hundred and Fifty-ninth Session of the Rajya Sabha and assented to by the President:-

1. The Appropriation Bill, 2023
2. The Appropriation(No.2) Bill, 2023
3. The Jammu and Kashmir Appropriation (No.2) Bill, 2023
4. The Jammu and Kashmir Appropriation Bill, 2023
5. The Finance Bill, 2023
6. The Competition (Amendment) Bill, 2023

I. Notification of the Ministry of Science and Technology

II. Report (2022) of CVC, New Delhi

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY;
AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC
GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS (DR. JITENDRA SINGH): Sir, I lay on the Table:—

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Science and Technology Notification No. AI/18/11/SCTIMST/2022, dated the 17th March, 2023, publishing the

Sree Chitra Tirunal Institute for Medical Sciences and Technology, Trivandrum (Amendment) Regulations, 2022, under Section 33 of the Sree Chitra Tirunal Institute for Medical Sciences and Technology, Trivandrum Act, 1980.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9707/17/23]

II. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Fifty-ninth Annual Report of the Central Vigilance Commission (CVC), New Delhi, for the year ending on 31st of December, 2022, under sub-section (3) of Section 14 of the Central Vigilance Commission Act, 2003.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9706/17/23]

Reports and Accounts (2020-2021 and 2021-22) of the Centre for Cultural Resources and Training , New Delhi; the Indira Gandhi National Centre for the Arts, New Delhi and NSD, New Delhi and related papers

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN): Sir, on behalf of Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Centre for Cultural Resources and Training, New Delhi, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Centre.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9649/17/23]

- (ii) (a) Annual Report of the Indira Gandhi National Centre for the Arts, New Delhi, for the year 2020-21.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Centre.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9756/17/23]

- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National School of Drama (NSD), New Delhi, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above School.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9650/17/23]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Ashwini Kumar Choubey; not present. Shri V. Muraleedharan.

Government of National Capital Territory of Delhi (Amendment) Ordinance, 2023 promulgated by the President

SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN: Sir, I lay on the Table, under sub-clause (a) of clause (2) of article 123 of the Constitution, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Government of National Capital Territory of Delhi (Amendment) Ordinance, 2023 (No. 1 of 2023) promulgated by the President on the 19th of May, 2023.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9992/17/23]

Notifications of the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (DR. L. MURUGAN): Sir, I lay on the Table a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting, under Section 34 of the Prasar Bharati (Broadcasting Corporation of India) Act, 1990:—

- (1) G.S.R. 288 (E), dated the 13th April, 2023, publishing the All India Radio (Library posts) Recruitment Rules, 2023.
- (2) G.S.R. 293 (E), dated the 17th April, 2023, publishing the Doordarshan Assistant Director (Official Language) Recruitment Rules, 2023.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9693/17/23]

REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE OF PRIVILEGES

SHRI KUMAR KETKAR (Maharashtra): Sir, I present the Seventy-third Report (in English and Hindi) of the Committee of Privileges on breach of privilege arising out of allegedly casting aspersions on the hon. Deputy Chairman, Rajya Sabha by a Member.

**REPORT OF THE JOINT COMMITTEE ON THE FOREST (CONSERVATION)
AMENDMENT BILL, 2023**

डा. अशोक बाजपेयी (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदय, मैं वन (संरक्षण) संशोधन विधेयक, 2023 संबंधी संयुक्त समिति के प्रतिवेदन की एक प्रति (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ।

**RECORD OF EVIDENCE OF THE JOINT COMMITTEE ON THE FOREST
(CONSERVATION) AMENDMENT BILL, 2023**

डा. अशोक बाजपेयी (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदय, मैं वन (संरक्षण) संशोधन विधेयक, 2023 संबंधी संयुक्त समिति के साक्ष्य का अभिलेख सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ।

STATEMENTS BY MINISTERS

**Status of implementation of recommendations /observations contained in the Two
Hundred and Forty-first Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing
Committee on Home Affairs**

उत्तर पूर्वी क्षेत्र विकास मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री; तथा सहकारिता मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री **बी.एल.वर्मा**) : महोदय, मैं उत्तर पूर्वी क्षेत्र विकास मंत्रालय की अनुदान मांगों (2022-23) के संबंध में विभाग संबंधित गृह कार्य संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति के दो सौ इकतालीसवें प्रतिवेदन में अंतर्विष्ट सिफारिशों/समुक्तियों के कार्यान्वयन की स्थिति के संबंध में वक्तव्य सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ।

**Status of implementation of recommendations /observations contained in the Three
Hundred and Seventy-fifth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing
Committee on Science and Technology, Environment, Forests and Climate Change**

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY;
THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE; THE MINISTER OF
STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND
PENSIONS; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF ATOMIC ENERGY;
AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF SPACE (DR. JITENDRA

SINGH): Sir, I lay a statement regarding Status of implementation of recommendations/ observations contained in the 375th Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Science and Technology, Environment, Forests and Climate Change on Demands for Grants (2023-24) pertaining to the Ministry of Science and Technology.

GOVERNMENT BILLS

***The Cinematograph (Amendment) Bill, 2019**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Anurag Singh Thakur to move for leave to withdraw the Cinematograph (Amendment) Bill, 2019.

THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING; AND THE MINISTER OF YOUTH AFFAIRS AND SPORTS (SHRI ANURAG SINGH THAKUR): Sir, I move for leave to withdraw the Cinematograph (Amendment) Bill, 2019 further to amend the Cinematograph Act, 1952.

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

SHRI ANURAG SINGH THAKUR: Sir, I withdraw the Bill.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka): Sir, the LoP wants to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Cinematograph (Amendment) Bill, 2023. ...*(Interruptions)*...

The Cinematograph (Amendment) Bill, 2023

THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING; AND THE MINISTER OF YOUTH AFFAIRS AND SPORTS (SHRI ANURAG SINGH THAKUR): Sir, I move for leave to introduce the Cinematograph (amendment) Bill 2023 further to amend the Cinematograph Act, 1952. ...*(Interruptions)*...

* The Bill was introduced in the Rajya Sabha on 12th February, 2019

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

SHRI ANURAG SINGH THAKUR: Sir, I introduce the Bill. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Arjun Munda ...*(Interruptions)*... Take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let there be order in the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let there be order in the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE): Sir, I am raising my hand. I am not given chance to speak on Rule 267. On Rule 267, I have already given notice. In the morning at 9.00 o'clock or earlier, I sent my people to submit it because tomorrow you can say that I have not given the notice in time. So, I have made my full efforts to attract your attention and give notice. But, unfortunately, I am not allowed to raise this issue under Rule 267. * ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members ...*(Interruptions)*... I expect the Leader of the Opposition ...*(Interruptions)*... I will be constrained if the House is not in order. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let the House be in order. ...*(Interruptions)*... The House is not in order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: It is an insult to the Parliament; it is an insult to the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House stands adjourned to meet at 11.00 a.m. on Friday, the 21st July, 2023.

The House then adjourned at eight minutes past two of the clock till eleven of the clock on Friday, the 21st July, 2023.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

PUBLISHED UNDER RULE 260 OF RULES OF PROCEDURE AND CONDUCT OF
BUSINESS IN THE COUNCIL OF STATES (RAJYA SABHA)