

Vol. 260
No. 16



Thursday,
10th August, 2023
19 Sravana, 1945 (Saka)

PARLIAMENTARY DEBATES

RAJYA SABHA

OFFICIAL REPORT (FLOOR VERSION)
(PART-II)

CONTENTS

Birthday Greetings (page 1)

Papers Laid on the Table (pages 1 - 11)

Statement by Minister Correcting Answer to Question—*Laid on the Table* (page 11)

Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on
Commerce-*Presented* (page 11)

Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Science
and Technology, Environment, Forest and Climate Change-*Presented* (pages 11 -
12)

Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport,
Tourism and Culture -*Presented* (pages 12 - 13)

[P.T.O]

©

RAJYA SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

Report of the Committee on Petitions-*Presented* (page 13)

Report of the Joint Committee on Offices of Profit- *Laid on the Table* (page 13)

Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Agriculture, Animal Husbandry and Food Processing-*Laid on the Table* (page 14)

Statements of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Agriculture, Animal Husbandry and Food Processing-*Laid on the Table* (page 15)

Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Communications and Information Technology -*Laid on the Table* (page 16)

Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Defence - *Laid on the Table* (pages 16 - 17)

Statement of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Petroleum and Natural Gas-*Laid on the Table* (page 17)

Report of the Committee on Empowerment of Women- *Laid on the Table* (page 17)

Reports of the Committee on Public Accounts- *Laid on the Table* (pages 17 - 18)

Statements by Ministers —

Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the 336th Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Science and Technology, Environment, Forests and Climate Change- *Laid on the Table* (page 18)

Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the 313th Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport, Tourism and Culture- *Laid on the Table* (page 18)

Notices received under Rules 267, 176 and 167 (pages 19 - 37)

Website: <http://rajyasabha.nic.in>
<http://parliamentofindia.nic.in>

E-mail: rsedit-e@sansad.nic.in

Government Bills-

The Chief Election Commissioner and other Election Commissioners (Appointment, Conditions of Service and Term of Office) Bill, 2023- *Introduced* (pages 37 - 38)

The Post Office Bill, 2023- *Introduced* (page 38)

The Pharmacy (Amendment) Bill, 2023- *Passed* (pages 38 - 40)

[Answers to Starred and Un-starred Questions (Both in English and Hindi) are available as Part-I to this Debate, published electronically on the Rajya Sabha website under the link <https://rajyasabha.nic.in/Debates/OfficialDebatesDateWise>]

RAJYA SABHA

Thursday, the 10th August, 2023 /19 Sravana, 1945 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock,

MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

BIRTHDAY GREETINGS

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I take the opportunity to wish birthday greetings to hon. Member of Parliament, Shri Nabam Rebia. A prominent political personality from Arunachal Pradesh, Shri Rebia served in Rajya Sabha earlier in 1996 and 2002. It is his third term in this august House since June, 2020. He had been a Member of Arunachal Pradesh Legislative Assembly for two terms, 2009-14 and 2014-19, and had served as the Speaker of the Assembly from June 2014 to 2016. He had also been the Political and Legal Adviser to the Chief Minister of Arunachal Pradesh. He is married to Shrimati Nabam Dumsap and have two sons, Nabam Takar and Nabam Legia, and two daughters, Nabam Kasmin and Nabam Ninung. On my and your behalf, I wish him a long, healthy and happy life, and extend our greetings to his family and friends.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Papers to be laid on the Table.

Notifications of the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions

कार्मिक, लोक शिकायत और पेंशन मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (डा. जितेन्द्र सिंह) : महोदय, मैं अखिल भारतीय सेवा अधिनियम, 1951 की धारा 3 की उप-धारा (2) के अधीन कार्मिक, लोक शिकायत और पेंशन मंत्रालय (कार्मिक एवं प्रशिक्षण विभाग) की निम्नलिखित अधिसूचनाओं की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:—

- (1) G.S.R. 555 (E), dated the 26th July, 2023, publishing the Indian Police Service (Fixation of Cadre Strength) Second Amendment Regulations, 2023.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9948/17/23]

- (2) G.S.R. 556 (E), dated the 26th July, 2023, publishing the Indian Police Service (Pay) Second Amendment Rules, 2023.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9949/17/23]

- (3) (3) G.S.R. 562 (E), dated the 28th July, 2023, publishing the All India Services (Leave) Amendment, Rules, 2023.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9946/17/23]

I. Notifications of the Ministry of Law and Justice

II. Report and Accounts (2020-21) of the Sangeet Natak Akademi, New Delhi and related Papers

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN): Sir, on behalf of my colleague, Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal, I lay on the Table: -

I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Law and Justice (Department of Legal Affairs), under Section 32 of the India International Arbitration Centre Act, 2019:—

- (1) G.S.R. 108 (E), dated the 17th February, 2023, publishing the New Delhi International Arbitration Centre (Number of Posts and Recruitment of Registrar, Counsel and other Officers and Employees) Amendment Rules, 2023.
- (2) G.S.R. 109 (E), dated the 17th February, 2023, publishing the New Delhi International Arbitration Centre (Terms and Conditions and the Salary and Allowances payable to Chairperson and Full-time Members) Amendment Rules, 2023.
- (3) G.S.R. 110 (E), dated the 17th February, 2023, publishing the New Delhi International Arbitration Centre (Form of Annual Statement of Accounts) Amendment Rules, 2023.
- (4) G.S.R. 111 (E), dated the 17th February, 2023, publishing the New Delhi International Arbitration Centre (Travelling and other Allowances Payable to Part-time Members) Amendment Rules, 2023.
- (5) No. A-60011/3/2023-IIAC, dated the 31st March, 2023, publishing the India International Arbitration Centre (Transaction of Business) Regulations, 2023.

- (6) No. A-60011/3/2023-IIAC, dated the 31st March, 2023, publishing the India International Arbitration Centre (Criteria for Admission to the Panel of Arbitrators) Regulations, 2023.

[Placed in Library. For (1) to (6) See No. L.T. 10054/17/23]

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Sangeet Natak Akademi, New Delhi, for the year 2020-21, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Akademi.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 10055/17/23]

I. Notifications of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change

II. Report and Accounts (2021-22) of IPIRTI, Bengaluru and related Papers

पर्यावरण, वन और जलवायु परिवर्तन मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री अश्विनी कुमार चौबे): महोदय,
मैं निम्नलिखित पत्र सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:—

I. (i) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change, issued under sub-section (1) and clauses (v) and (xiv) of sub-section (2) and sub-section (3) of Section 3 of the Environment (Protection) Act, 1986, along with Delay Statements:—

1. S.O. 27 (E), dated the 3rd January, 2019, notifying a certain area from the boundary of Aner Dam Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Aner Dam Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
2. S.O. 213 (E), dated the 17th January, 2022, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Bor Tiger Reserve, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Eco-sensitive Zone.
3. S.O. 668 (E), dated the 28th February, 2017, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Lonar Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Lonar Wildlife Sanctuary, Eco-sensitive Zone.
4. S.O. 837 (E), dated the 16th March, 2017, notifying a certain area around the boundary of the Umred Karhandla Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Umred Karhandla Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
5. S.O. 918 (E), dated the 25th February, 2021, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Tamhini Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Tamhini Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.

6. S.O. 1175 (E), dated the the 13th April, 2017, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Bhamragarh Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Bhamragarh Wildlife Sanctuary Eco sensitive Zone.
7. S.O. 1196 (E), dated the 12th March, 2021, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Katepurna Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Katepurna Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
8. S.O. 1221 (E), dated the 8th March, 2019, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Yawal Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Eco-sensitive Zone.
9. S.O. 1222 (E), dated the 8th March, 2019, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Sunabeda Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Odisha, as the Eco-sensitive Zone.
10. S.O. 1311 (E), dated the 26th April, 2017, notifying a certain area from the boundary of the Keibul Lamjao National Park, in the State of Manipur, as the Keibul Lamjao National Park Eco-sensitive Zone.
11. S.O. 1367 (E), dated the 28th April, 2017, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Kalsubai Harishchandragad Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Kalsubai Harishchandragad Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
12. S.O. 1565 (E), dated the 15th May, 2017, notifying a certain area from the boundary of Yashvantrao Chavan Sagarshwar Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Yashvantrao Chavan Sagarshwar Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
13. S.O. 1603 (E), dated the 17th May, 2017, notifying a certain area from the boundary Phansad Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Phansad Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
14. S.O. 1604 (E), dated the 17th May, 2017, notifying a certain area from the boundary of the Dyanganga Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Dyanganga Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
15. S.O. 1654 (E), dated the 19th May, 2017, notifying a certain area on the landward side of the Balukhanda-Konark Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Odisha, as the Balukhanda-Konark Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
16. S.O. 1751 (E), dated the 31st May, 2017, notifying a certain area from the boundary of Yedshi Ramling Ghat Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Yedshi Ramling Ghat Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
17. S.O. 1752 (E), dated the 31st May, 2017, notifying a certain area around the

- boundary of Gangewadi New Great India Bustard Wildlife Sanctuary, in the state of Maharashtra, as the Gangewadi New Great India Bustard Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
18. S.O. 1814 (E), dated the 7th June, 2017, notifying a certain area from the boundary of Debrigarh Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Odisha, as the Debrigarh Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 19. S.O. 1816 (E), dated the 7th June, 2017, notifying a certain area from the boundary of Nongkhylllem Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Meghalaya, as the Nongkhylllem Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 20. S.O. 1966 (E), dated the 14th June, 2019, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Pualreng Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Mizoram, as the Eco-sensitive Zone.
 21. S.O. 1967 (E), dated the 14th June, 2019, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Tawi Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Mizoram, as the Eco-sensitive Zone.
 22. S.O. 2146 (E), dated the 6th July, 2017, notifying a certain area of Jiri-Makru Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Manipur, as the Jiri-Makru Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 23. S.O. 2165 (E), dated the 27th June, 2019, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Thorangtlang Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Mizoram, as the Thorangtlang Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-Sensitive Zone.
 24. S.O. 2202 (E), dated the 12th July, 2017, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Jaikawadi Bird Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Jaikawadi Bird Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 25. S.O. 2358 (E), dated the 4th July, 2019, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Murlen National Park, in Champhai district in the State of Mizoram, as the Eco-sensitive Zone.
 26. S.O. 2359 (E), dated the 4th July, 2019, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Lengteng Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Mizoram, as the Eco-sensitive Zone.
 27. S.O. 2407 (E), dated the 18th June, 2021, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Karanja Sohal Blackbuck Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Eco-sensitive Zone.
 28. S.O. 2519 (E), dated the 15th July, 2019, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Dampa Tiger Reserve, in the State of Mizoram, as the Eco-sensitive Zone.
 29. S.O. 2539 (E), dated the 9th August, 2017, notifying a certain area around the

- boundary of Kuldiha Wildlife Sanctuary in the State of Odisha as the Kuldiha Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
30. S.O. 2633 (E), dated the 6th August, 2020, notifying a certain area around the boundary of the Bhimashankar Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Bhimashankar Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 31. S.O. 2906 (E), dated the 9th September, 2016, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Chandaka Dampara Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Odisha, as the Chandaka Dampara Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 32. S.O. 2942 (E), dated the 6th September, 2017, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Narpuh Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Meghalaya, as the Narpuh Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 33. S.O. 3029 (E), dated the 13th September, 2017, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Pench National Park and Mansinghdeo Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Pench National Park and Mansinghdeo Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 34. S.O. 3149 (E), dated the 30th August, 2017, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Badrama and Khalasuni Wildlife Sanctuaries, in the State of Odisha, as the Eco-sensitive Zone.
 35. S.O. 3249 (E), dated the 11th September, 2019, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Tadoba-Andhari Tiger Reserve, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Tadoba-Andheri Tiger Reserve Eco-sensitive Zone.
 36. S.O. 3250 (E), dated the 11th September, 2019, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Tungareshwar Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Tungareshwar Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 37. S.O. 3307 (E), dated the 26th October, 2016, notifying a certain area around the boundary of the Kailam Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Manipur, as the Kailam Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 38. S.O. 3309 (E), dated the 26th October, 2016, notifying a certain area around the boundary of the Zeilad Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Manipur, as the Zeilad Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 39. S.O. 3310 (E), dated the 26th October, 2016, notifying a certain area around the boundary of the Yangoupokpi Lokchao Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Manipur, as the Yangoupokpi Lokchao Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 40. S.O. 3595 (E), dated the 30th November, 2016, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Painganga Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Painganga Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 41. S.O. 3630 (E), dated the 15th October, 2020, notifying a certain area around

- the boundary of Radhanagari Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Radhanagari Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
42. S.O. 3645 (E), dated the 5th December, 2016, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Sanjay Gandhi National Park, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Sanjay Gandhi National Park Eco-sensitive Zone.
 43. S.O. 3996 (E), dated the the 9th December, 2016, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Gautala Autramghat Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Gautala Autramghat Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 44. S.O. 4004 (E), dated the 5th November, 2020, amending the Principal Notification No. S.O. 3645 (E), dated the 5th December, 2016, by substituting certain entries, as mentioned therein, in that Notification.
 45. S.O. 4028 (E), dated the 14th December, 2016, notifying a certain area around the boundary of the Bunning Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Manipur, as the Bunning Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 46. S.O. 4205 (E), dated the 28th December, 2016, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Gugamal National Park, Melghat Sanctuary, Wan Sanctuary, Ambabarwa Sanctuary and Narnala Sanctuary, in the state of Maharashtra, as the Melaghat Tiger Reserve Eco-Sensitive zone.
 47. S.O. 4293 (E), dated the 14th October, 2021, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Thane Creek Flamingo Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Thane Creek Flamingo Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 48. S.O. 4372 (E), dated the 6th December, 2019, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Khawnglung Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Mizoram, as the Khawnglung Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 49. S.O. 4444 (E), dated the 11th December, 2019, notifying a certain area around the boundary of the Nandankanan Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Odisha, as the Nandankanan Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 50. S.O. 4892 (E), dated the 19th September, 2018, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Tipeshwar Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Maharashtra, as the Tipeshwar Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.

[Placed in Library. For (1) to (50) See No. L.T. 9884/17/23]

(ii) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change, under Section 26 of the Environment (Protection) Act, 1986:—

- (1) G.S.R. 522 (E), dated the 18th July, 2023, publishing a Corrigendum to the Notification No. G.S.R. 499 (3), dated the 11th July, 2023.
[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9885/17/23]
- (2) G.S.R. 500 (E), dated the 12th July, 2023, publishing the Hazardous and Other Wastes (Management and Transboundary Movement) Amendment Rules, 2023.
- (3) G.S.R. 534 (E), dated the 24th July, 2023, publishing the E-Waste (Management) Second Amendment Rules, 2023.
[Placed in Library. For (2) and (3) See No. L.T. 9979/17/23]
- (4) G.S.R. 282 (E), dated the 11th April, 2023, amending the Principle Notification No. G.S.R. 45(E), dated the 19th January, 2018, by substituting certain entries, as mentioned therein, in that Notification.
[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9760/17/23]
- (5) G.S.R. 373 (E), dated the 17th May, 2023, publishing the Environment (Protection) Amendment Rules, 2023.
- (6) G.S.R. 376 (E), dated the 19th May, 2023, publishing the Environment (Protection) Second Amendment Rules, 2023.
- (7) G.S.R. 414 (E), dated the 5th June, 2023, publishing the Environment (Protection) Third Amendment Rules, 2023.
- (8) G.S.R. 435 (E), dated the 14th June, 2023, publishing a Corrigendum to the Notification No. G.S.R. 373 (E), dated the 17th May, 2023.
- (9) G.S.R. 436 (E), dated the 14th June, 2023, publishing the Environment (Protection) Fourth Amendment Rules, 2023.
- (10) G.S.R. 499 (E), dated the 12th July, 2023, publishing the Environment (Utilisation of Crop Residue by Thermal Power Plants) Rules, 2023.
[Placed in Library. For (5) to (10) See No. L.T. 9759/17/23]
- (11) S.O. 3984 (E), dated the 24th August, 2022, publishing the Battery Waste Management Rules, 2022, along with Delay Statement.
[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9886/17/23]

(iii) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change Notification No. S.O. 6169 (E), dated the 30th December, 2022, amending the Principal Notification No. S.O. 5481 (E), dated the 31st December, 2021 by substituting/inserting certain entries in that Notification, issued under sub-

section (1) and clause (v) of sub-section (2) of Section 3 of the Environment (Protection) Act, 1986, along with Delay Statement.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9886/17/23]

(iv) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change Notification No. S.O. 1394, dated the 23rd March, 2023, issued under sub-section (2) of Section 1 of the Wild Life (Protection) Amendment Act, 2022 appointing the 1st day of April, 2023 as the date on which the said Act shall come into force.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9762/17/23]

(v) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change, under sub-section (2) of Section 63 of the Wild Life (Protection) Act, 1972:—

- (1) G.S.R. 501 (E), dated the 12th July, 2023, publishing the Wild Life Disposal of Wild Animal Article Rules, 2023.
- (2) S.O. 1950 (E), dated the 27th April, 2023, publishing the Breeders of Species Licence Rules, 2023.

[Placed in Library. For (1) and (2) See No. L.T. 9761/17/23]

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Plywood Industries Research and Training Institute (IPIRTI), Bengaluru, Karnataka for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9980/17/23]

Report and Accounts (2021-22) of SZCC, Thanjavur and related Papers

संस्कृति मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्रीमती मीनाक्षी लेखी) : महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्रों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखती हूँ:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the South Zone Cultural Centre (SZCC), Thanjavur, Tamil Nadu, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Centre.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9898/17/23]

Report and Accounts (2020-21) of NERAMAC, Guwahati and related Papers

उत्तर पूर्वी क्षेत्र विकास मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री बी.एल. वर्मा): महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्र सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ :—

- (1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act, 2013:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the North Eastern Regional Agricultural Marketing Corporation Limited (NERAMAC), Guwahati, Assam, for the year 2020-21, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.

- (2) Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9906/17/23]

Reports of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India

वित्त मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री पंकज चौधरी): महोदय, मैं संविधान के अनुच्छेद 151 के खंड (1)के अधीन निम्नलिखित प्रतिवेदनों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-

- (i) Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India on Implementation of Phase-I of Bharatmala Pariyojana — Union Government — Ministry of Road Transport and Highways — Report No. 19 of 2023 (Performance Audit);
- (ii) Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India on Regional Connectivity Scheme — UDAN (Ude Desh Ka Aam Naagrik) — Union Government (Civil) Ministry of Civil Aviation — Report No. 22 of 2023 (Compliance Audit);

- (iv) Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India for the year 2021-22 Union Government — Accounts of the Union Government — Report No. 21 of 2023 (Financial Audit); and
- (v) Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India on Management of Infrastructure and Facilities Projects in DRDO — Union Government (Defence Services) — Defence Research and Development Organisation (DRDO) — Report No. 23 of 2023 (Performance Audit).

[Placed in Library. For (i) to (v) See No. L.T. 10054-A/17/23]

STATEMENT BY MINISTER CORRECTING ANSWER TO QUESTION

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF STATISTICS AND PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION; THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF PLANNING; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CORPORATE AFFAIRS (RAO INDERJIT SINGH): Sir, I lay a Statement (in English and Hindi) correcting the answer to Starred Question No. 223 given in the Rajya Sabha on the 21st March, 2023 regarding 'Pending Cases with NCLT'.

REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON COMMERCE

SHRI JUGALSINH LOKHANDWALA (Gujarat): Sir, I present the following Reports (in English and Hindi) of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Commerce:—

- (i) 181st Report on 'Development of Trade and Industries in North Eastern Region'; and
- (ii) 182nd Report on 'Ecosystem of Startups to benefit India'.

REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY, ENVIRONMENT, FORESTS AND CLIMATE CHANGE

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka): Sir, I present the following Reports (in English and Hindi) of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Science

and Technology, Environment, Forests and Climate Change:-

- (i) 380th Report on the action taken by the Department on the recommendations/observations contained in 373rd Report on the Demands for Grants (2023-24) of the Department of Atomic Energy;
- (ii) 381st Report on the action taken by the Department on the recommendations/observations contained in 374th Report on the Demands for Grants (2023-24) of the Department of Biotechnology;
- (iii) 382nd Report on the action taken by the Department on the recommendations/observations contained in 375th Report on the Demands for Grants (2023-24) of the Department of Scientific and Industrial Research;
- (iv) 383rd Report on the action taken by the Department on the recommendations/observations contained in 376th Report on the Demands for Grants (2023-24) of the Department of Science and Technology;
- (v) 384th Report on the action taken by the Department on the recommendations/observations contained in 377th Report on the Demands for Grants (2023-24) of the Department of Space;
- (vi) 385th Report on the action taken by the Government on the recommendations/observations contained in 378th Report on the Demands for Grants (2023-24) of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change; and
- (vii) 386th Report on the action taken by the Government on the recommendations/observations contained in 379th Report on the Demands for Grants (2023-24) of the Ministry of Earth Sciences.

**REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING
COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORT, TOURISM AND CULTURE**

श्री जुगलसिंह लोखंडवाला (गुजरात): महोदय, मैं परिवहन, पर्यटन और संस्कृति संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति के निम्नलिखित प्रतिवेदन (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) प्रस्तुत करता हूँ:-

- (i) Three Hundred Fifty Second Report on 'Functioning of Major Ports in the Country';
- (ii) Three Hundred Fifty Third Report on 'Issue of Fixing of Airfares'; and

- (iii) Three Hundred Fifty Fourth Report on the subject ‘Construction of Road-Over-Bridges (ROBs), Road-Under-Bridges (RUBs), Service Roads and Review of Road Survey Guidelines etc’.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Report of the Committee on Petitions, Shri Sujeet Kumar.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR (Odisha): Sir, Dr. L. Hanumanthaiah would place it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. L. Hanumanthaiah.

REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON PETITIONS

DR. L. HANUMANTHAIHAH (Karnataka): Sir, I present the One Hundred and Sixty-second Report (in English and Hindi) of the Committee on Petitions on the petition praying for comprehensive medical facilities to Central Government employees, pensioners and their dependants.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Report of Joint Committee on Offices of Profit, Ms. Dola Sen. Shrimati Sulata Deo.

MS. DOLA SEN (West Bengal): Sir, I am here.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am so sorry. You are not the one to be missed. *Sushri* Dola Sen.

REPORT OF THE JOINT COMMITTEE ON OFFICES OF PROFIT

MS. DOLA SEN (West Bengal): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Tenth Report of the Joint Committee on Offices of Profit (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on “Examination of election of one Member of Rajya Sabha to the Central Advisory Board on Disability constituted under the Rights of Persons with Disabilities Act, 2016”.

**REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING
COMMITTEE ON AGRICULTURE, ANIMAL HUSBANDRY AND FOOD
PROCESSING**

श्री कैलाश सोनी (मध्य प्रदेश): महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित प्रतिवेदनों पर सरकार द्वारा की गई आगे की कार्रवाई को दर्शाने वाले प्रतिवेदनों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-

- (i) Sixtieth Report on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Fifty-First Report of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2023-24)' pertaining to the Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (Department of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare);
 - (ii) Sixty-first Report on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Fifty-Second Report of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2023-24)' pertaining to the Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (Department of Agricultural Research and Education);
 - (iii) Sixty-second Report on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Fifty-Third Report of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2023-24)' pertaining to the Ministry of Fisheries, Animal Husbandry and Dairying (Department of Fisheries);
 - (iv) Sixty-third Report on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Fifty-Fourth Report of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2023-24)' pertaining to the Ministry of Fisheries, Animal Husbandry and Dairying (Department of Animal Husbandry and Dairying);
 - (v) Sixty-fourth Report on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Fifty-Fifth Report of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2023-24)' pertaining to the Ministry of Food Processing Industries; and
 - vi) Sixty-fifth Report on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Fifty-Sixth Report of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2023-24)' pertaining to the Ministry of Cooperation.
-

**STATEMENTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING
COMMITTEE ON AGRICULTURE, ANIMAL HUSBANDRY AND FOOD
PROCESSING**

श्री कैलाश सोनी (मध्य प्रदेश) : महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित प्रतिवेदनों पर सरकार द्वारा आगे की गई कार्रवाई को दर्शाने वाले विवरणों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ :-

- (i) Forty-third Report on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Twenty-ninth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on 'Pradhan Mantri Fasal Bima Yojana - An Evaluation' pertaining to the Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (Department of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare);
 - (ii) Forty-fourth Report on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Forty-first Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2022-23)' pertaining to the Ministry of Food Processing Industries;
 - (iii) Forty-sixth Report on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Thirty-seventh Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2022-23)' pertaining to the Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (Department of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare);
 - (iv) Forty-seventh Report on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Thirty-eighth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2022-23)' pertaining to the Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (Department of Agricultural Research and Education);
 - (v) Forty-eighth Report on the action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Thirty-ninth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2022-23)' pertaining to the Ministry of Fisheries, Animal Husbandry and Dairying (Department of Fisheries); and
 - (vi) Forty-ninth Report on the action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Fortieth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2022-23)' pertaining to the Ministry of Fisheries, Animal Husbandry and Dairying (Department of Animal Husbandry and Dairying).
-

**REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING
COMMITTEE ON COMMUNICATIONS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY**

श्री लहर सिंह सिरिया (कर्नाटक): महोदय, मैं विभाग संबंधित संचार और सूचना प्रौद्योगिकी संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति (2022-23) के निम्नलिखित प्रतिवेदनों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-

- (i) Forty-ninth Report on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations of the Committee contained in its Forty-third Report on 'Demands for Grants (2023-24)' relating to the Ministry of Communications (Department of Telecommunications);
- (ii) Fiftieth Report on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations of the Committee contained in its Forty-sixth Report on 'Demands for Grants (2023-24)' relating to the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting; and
- (iii) Fifty-first Report on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations of the Committee contained in its Forty-fourth Report on 'Demands for Grants (2023-24)' relating to the Ministry of Communications (Department of Posts).

**REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING
COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE**

LT. GEN. (DR.) D. P. VATS (RETD.) (Haryana): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Defence:—

- (i) Fortieth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Defence (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Twenty-sixth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on Defence on 'Demands for Grants' of the Ministry of Defence for the year 2022-23 on 'General Defence Budget, Border Roads Organisation, Indian Coast Guard, Defence Estates Organisation, Defence Public Sector Undertakings, Canteen Stores Department, Welfare of Ex-Servicemen and Defence Pension (Demand Nos. 19 and 22)'; and

- (ii) Forty-first Report of the Standing Committee on Defence (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Thirty-first Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on Defence on 'Assessment of Welfare Measures available to war widows/Families in Armed Forces'.

**STATEMENT OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING
COMMITTEE ON PETROLEUM AND NATURAL GAS**

श्रीमती कान्ता कर्दम (उत्तर प्रदेश): महोदय, मैं "चक्रवात ताउते के दौरान पश्चिमी अपतटीय दुर्घटना के विशिष्ट संदर्भ में सार्वजनिक क्षेत्र की तेल कंपनियों के तेल प्रतिष्ठानों की संरक्षा और सुरक्षा" के संबंध में विभाग संबंधित संसदीय स्थायी समिति के तेरहवें प्रतिवेदन (सत्रहवीं लोक सभा) में अंतर्विष्ट समुक्तियों/सिफारिशों पर सरकार द्वारा की गई कार्रवाई के संबंध में पेट्रोलियम और प्राकृतिक गैस संबंधी समिति (2022-23) के सोलहवें प्रतिवेदन (सत्रहवीं लोक सभा) में अंतर्विष्ट सिफारिशों/समुक्तियों पर सरकार द्वारा की गई कार्रवाई को दर्शाने वाले विवरण की एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखती हूँ।

REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON EMPOWERMENT OF WOMEN

SHRIMATI MAHUA MAJI (Jharkhand): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Eighth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on Empowerment of Women (2022-23) on 'Working of National Commission for Women and State Commissions for Women'.

REPORTS OF THE COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC ACCOUNTS

SHRI SHAKTISINH GOHIL (Gujarat): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports of the Public Accounts Committee (2023-24):-

- (i) Sixty-ninth Report on "Issues relating to Accounting of Cess/Levies";
- (ii) Seventieth Report on "Failure to Implement Ministry of Railway's orders resulted in Damage to Railway Cables: South Eastern Railway and West Central Railway";

- (iii) Seventy-first Report on "Implementation of USOF project (Phase 1) to provide mobile services in areas affected by Left Wing Extremism";
- (iv) Seventy-second Report on "Irregularities in Awarding of Major Works of SEEPZ, SEZ Authority, Mumbai"; and
- (v) Seventy-third Report on Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their 106th Report (16th Lok Sabha) on "Improper Management of Defence Land".

STATEMENTS BY MINISTERS

Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the 336th Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Science and Technology, Environment, Forests and Climate Change

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF ATOMIC ENERGY; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF SPACE (DR. JITENDRA SINGH):
 Sir, I lay a statement regarding Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the 336th Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Science and Technology, Environment, Forests and Climate Change on Demands for Grants (2020-21) pertaining to the Department of Scientific and Industrial Research (DSIR), Ministry of Science and Technology.

Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the 313th Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport, Tourism and Culture

रक्षा मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री; तथा पर्यटन मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री अजय भट्ट): महोदय, मैं पर्यटन मंत्रालय से संबंधित "विदेशी बाजारों में भारतीय पर्यटन को प्रोत्साहन - विदेश स्थित पर्यटक कार्यालयों और भारतीय दूतावासों की भूमिका" विषय पर विभाग-संबंधित परिवहन, पर्यटन और संस्कृति संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति के 313वें प्रतिवेदन में अंतर्विष्ट सिफारिशों के कार्यान्वयन की स्थिति के संबंध में एक वक्तव्य सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ।

NOTICES RECEIVED UNDER RULES 267, 176 AND 167

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members and hon. Leader of the Opposition, I have received notices under Rule 267, under Rule 176 and also under Rule 167. It is for the first time that notices under Rule 167 have been received. I would urge your patience. I will deal with them. First, Rule 267. Hon. Members, I have received 48 notices under Rule 267. Forty-five Members have demanded discussion on the ongoing situation of violence and unrest in Manipur. Shrimati Priyanka Chaturvedi and Shri Sushil Kumar Gupta have demanded discussion on situation in both Manipur and Haryana. Shri P. Wilson, Member, has demanded discussion on issue relating to Governors. As the notices are not in conformity with the rules and my ruling dated 8th December, 2022, I am unable to persuade myself to allow the notices received for today. Then, I have received 19 notices for Short Duration Discussion under Rule 176. Eighteen notices are on the issue of concern over pushing the agenda of the Communist Party of China by an Indian online news network and one is regarding concern over communal violence in parts of Haryana. And, I have received three notices under Rules 167 and 168 from Shri Tiruchi Siva, Shri Binoy Viswam and Shri Elamaram Kareem, Members, expressing their concern over prevailing situation in Manipur. Hon. Members, you may recall that discussion on the same subject was initiated in the Council on 31st July, 2023. There was disruption. It could not fructify. ...*(Interruptions)*... I do not wish to go into the background as to how the discussion could not take place. On Rule 167, without going into the conditions of admissibility, I would like to confer with the Leaders of the political parties as this may be an opportunity for us to find a way out and I will do it, at the earliest, at 1.00 p.m., today. Would you like to say something? ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL): Sir, as you are aware...
...*(Interruptions)*... Only on this issue. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Leader of the House, one minute. Precisely, I need your input on notices under Rule 167 for two reasons. One, I have got the formal notices for the first time, but, in public domain, in various newspapers, this issue has been coming up. Some of the news reports quoted that there has been consensus on the issue. I do not wish to go into that background. On these notices that I have received today, you may please indicate.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka): Sir, ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: One minute; let me speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... कभी तो बोलने भी दिया कीजिए!...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Neither you nor Jairam Ramesh can have the grievance of not being allowed to speak.

श्री पीयूष गोयल: सर, मैं आपके माध्यम से पर्सनली उनको यह बोल रहा हूँ। सर, मुझे विपक्ष के सीनियर लीडर्स की तरफ से एक रिक्वेस्ट आई थी कि मैं चार वरिष्ठ पार्टियों के वरिष्ठ नेताओं को चाय पर चर्चा करने के लिए बुलाऊँ और इस विषय में कोई मार्ग निकालूँ। सर, मैंने उन चारों से रिक्वेस्ट की और रिक्वेस्ट ही नहीं की, परसुएड करने की कोशिश की कि मेरे साथ आ कर चर्चा करें। एक-आध घंटे तक तो यही सिलसिला चलता रहा कि मेरे यहां आइए, बात करते हैं, आइए, बात करते हैं। इसके एक घंटे के बाद, उन चार सदस्यों में से एक सदस्य मेरे कमरे में आए और कहने लगे कि हम चारों तो आपके कमरे में नहीं आ सकते, आप भी लीडर ऑफ दि अपोज़िशन के यहां नहीं आइए!...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री पीयूष गोयल: सर, ये बातें सबको जानना जरूरी है!...(व्यवधान)... उन्होंने कहा कि हम सेंट्रल हॉल में मिलते हैं।...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, he is asking for... ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री पीयूष गोयल: सर, मैंने किसी का नाम नहीं लिया!...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will give you the floor to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will give you the floor. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री जयराम रमेश: ये सब irrelevant बातें हैं।

श्री पीयूष गोयल: मैंने किसी का नाम नहीं लिया है!...(व्यवधान)... सर, मैं आपका संरक्षण चाहता हूँ, यह बताना जरूरी है!...(व्यवधान)... मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि मानसिकता कैसी है!...(व्यवधान)... मानसिकता यह है, इन्होंने कहा कि हम आपके कमरे में नहीं आ सकते!...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members. ...*(Interruptions)*... Just a minute. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री जयराम रमेश: कौन कहां गया, किससे मिला, इन सब बातों का कोई रिलेवेंस नहीं है।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री पीयूष गोयल: क्या मैं लीडर ऑफ दि रूलिंग पार्टी नहीं हूँ? ...(व्यवधान)... मैं सभी के लिए काम कर रहा हूँ, लेकिन मुझे कहा गया कि हम आपके कमरे में नहीं आ सकते।...(व्यवधान)... हम भी एलओपी के कमरे में नहीं आएंगे, उनसे सेंट्रल हॉल में मिलें।...(व्यवधान)... मैंने उनसे कहा कि अगर आप मेरे यहां नहीं आ सकते हैं, तो मैं एलओपी के यहां आता हूँ।...(व्यवधान)... माननीय पार्लियामेंटरी अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर और मैं स्वयं एलओपी के कमरे में गए।...(व्यवधान)... हम स्वयं उनके साथ चर्चा करने के लिए गए।...(व्यवधान)... मैं सिर्फ इनकी मानसिकता के बारे में बता रहा हूँ।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members. ...(*Interruptions*)... Now, the Leader of the House.

श्री पीयूष गोयल : एक तरफ बोलते हैं कि चर्चा करने आइए, वरना हम आते हैं, आप हमें चाय पर बुलाइए।...(व्यवधान)... जब मैं उनको बुलाता हूँ, तो कहते हैं कि हम आपके कमरे में नहीं आएंगे।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Leader of the House, please take your seat. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please, please. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री पीयूष गोयल: क्या चर्चा इस तरीके से होती है? ...(व्यवधान)... क्या कंसेंसस इस तरीके से बनता है? ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I appreciate... ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री पीयूष गोयल : सर, मैं आपका संरक्षण चाहता हूँ।...(व्यवधान)... क्या यही तरीका है, जिससे हम आगे हाउस चलाने वाले हैं? ...(व्यवधान)... दूसरी एक और बात है।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. ...(*Interruptions*)... I quite appreciate what has come from Dr. Keshava Rao and Mr. Tiruchi Siva as to who those four leaders are. But, let me tell you, hon. Members. I have had a practice that in my capacity as Chairman, I will deal with floor leaders of all the parties. Now, how political parties behave is between them. To the extent the Chair is concerned, if I have the benefit of one-to-one interaction with the Leader of the Opposition, I reach out to other leaders also. So, I have a practice that I will be conferring with all the floor leaders; in respect of talks with political parties, the mechanism may be different. So, this can't be an issue here. ...(*Interruptions*)... Let us hear him. ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. K. KESHAVA RAO (Telangana): Sir, as a Chairman, you have a right to call anybody, we understand. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are trying to build a confidence mechanism, we understand. You can call anybody. But, the Leader of the House selectively asking four people to reach him is something with which we object to. It is a privilege issue as far as we are concerned.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: First of all, at the outset, I have already said, I never initiated it. I received a request whether I can call one, two, three or four for a *chai*? मुझे चर्चा का विषय भी नहीं मालूम था।...*(व्यवधान)*... अगर कोई एक व्यक्ति मुझे कहता है कि हम लोग आपसे मिलना चाहते हैं, चाय पर चर्चा करना चाहते हैं और मैं चारों को बुला लेता हूँ ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: So, Dr. Keshava Rao, it is a new twist now. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री पीयूष गोयल : सर, आप बताइए कि इसमें क्या प्रिविलेज है? ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sir, one at a time. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री पीयूष गोयल : माननीय सभापति जी, अगर मैं अपने कमरे में किसी को बुलाऊँ, तो क्या इसमें भी मुझे पहले सबकी परमिशन लेनी पड़ेगी? ...*(व्यवधान)*... क्या मुझे पहले यह देखना पड़ेगा कि मैं चारों को नहीं बुला सकता।...*(व्यवधान)*... मैंने तो इनिशिएट भी नहीं किया था।...*(व्यवधान)*... मुझे सब्जेक्ट भी नहीं मालूम था।...*(व्यवधान)*... मेरे पास तो रिक्वेस्ट आई थी और उसी रिक्वेस्ट के तहत मैंने उन सभी माननीय सदस्यों को बुलाया था।...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please settle down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री पीयूष गोयल : जब मैंने उन सभी माननीय सदस्यों को बुलाया, तो एक माननीय सदस्य आ कर बोले कि हम लोग आपके कमरे में नहीं आएंगे।...*(व्यवधान)*... देखिए, क्या हालत है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री जयराम रमेश : सर, मणिपुर के सब्जेक्ट पर भी डिवाइड एंड रूल और यहां पर भी डिवाइड एंड रूल! ...*(व्यवधान)*... सब जगह डिवाइड एंड रूल की बात नहीं चलेगी।...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Leader of the House, I am in the Chair.*(Interruptions)*. Please listen. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Allahabad High Court is a very premier High Court of the country. When it had centennial celebrations, it came out with two

volumes. The situation was so cool, खसखस लगी हुई थी, पानी गिर रहा था, रूम का टेम्परेचर डाउन था. It was soothing and one of the judges went to sleep. The junior judge was a very disciplined judge, he followed his senior. The difficulty with the lawyer was, how does the lawyer invite attention of the Bench? The books used to be very heavy during those days. So, he managed to ensure that the book falls on the ground from the table. They said, "Yes, Mr. so and so, what happened"? And the response was, 'My lords, one at a time'. Now, I plead with you, let it be one at a time and I have enough time. Mr. Tiruchi Siva, ...(*Interruptions*)...let him speak.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, the logjam is prevailing for more than fourteen to fifteen days and the Members of Opposition are insisting upon Rule 267, Adjournment Motion, and the Treasury Benches are insisting upon Rule 176, a Short Duration Discussion. We are not able to arrive at a common point and in pursuance of your repeated appeal, Sir, as I.N.D.I.A. alliance, we have evolved an alternative route, i.e. Rule 167, that on a substantive motion, we can discuss the issue on Manipur, and you have very, very magnanimously accepted it. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: No; it had not been accepted. Sir, he is giving a ruling on your behalf.

MR. CHAIRMAN: He says that I have agreed to consider. ...(*Interruptions*)... Mark his words.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: We have given notice to hon. Chairman and it is under his consideration. That is what we are telling. ...(*Interruptions*)... We want to have a discussion on Manipur. So, we do not want to stick on to one particular level. ...(*Interruptions*)... Let them also not stick to that level. So, we request you, Sir, kindly consider this and accept it. We can start the discussion any time, now or at 2 p.m. We can start it anytime. Thank you very much. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, the nation has a right to know what has happened. मुझे बोला गया था कि हम तो आपके कमरे में नहीं आएँगे। ...(*व्यवधान*)... वे हमारे कमरे में नहीं आएँगे, तो सेंट्रल हॉल में मिलते हैं। ...(*व्यवधान*)... मैं ऐसा व्यक्ति नहीं हूँ जो पूरे टाइम सेंट्रल हॉल में जाकर - वॉक आउट करके सेंट्रल हॉल में जाकर बैठता हूँ। ...(*व्यवधान*)... मैंने कहा कि पार्लियामेंटरी अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर और मैं आपके कमरे में आएँगे। ...(*व्यवधान*)... सर, हम दोनों एलओपी के कमरे में बाइज्जत गए। ...(*व्यवधान*)... हम वहाँ इज्जत के साथ गये, हमने कॉफी माँगी और पी। ...(*व्यवधान*)... सर, अब विषय समझिए। ...(*व्यवधान*)... वहाँ पर यह जो

घमंडिया गठबंधन है, इस घमंडिया गठबंधन के सब लोग थे। ...**(व्यवधान)**... वहाँ यह प्रस्ताव हमारे समक्ष रखा गया और साथ में एक कंडीशन लगायी गयी। ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, साथ में एक कंडीशन लगायी गयी।...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश): सर, माननीय सदन के नेता ...**(व्यवधान)**... उन चार लोगों का नाम किसने दिया, हमें यह जानने की आवश्यकता तो है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... Who has given the names of four leaders? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री पीयूष गोयल: सर, ...**(व्यवधान)**... अगर वे कहते हैं कि मैं ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप देखिए कि वहाँ क्या हो रहा है? ...**(व्यवधान)**... अगर वे कहते हैं, दिग्विजय सिंह जी जो बोल रहे हैं, मुझे पूरा करना चाहिए, तो नाम ले सकता हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति: एक सेकंड। ...**(व्यवधान)**... प्लीज़, प्लीज़। ...**(व्यवधान)**... Hon. Members, when we interact informally, we share many secrets. I would not appreciate either side to reveal details thereof. I would request the Leader of the House and this side also. If you have to find out the four names, please do it informally outside the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... I do not appreciate any Member, this side or that side, revealing content of a discussion which has taken place outside the House. You are required to deal strategically, diplomatically, politely and persuasively, and that must be kept outside the House because every Member is entitled to this respect.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, I have kept the decorum. I did not take any name. But, if Digvijaya Singhji insists, if the Leader of the Opposition asks me, I am ready to say the name right now. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: If hon. Leader of Opposition wants, I am happy to give the name. But the important point is, you are calling a meeting just now. I would like to know from you, Sir, लीडर ऑफ दि हाउस की क्या क्रेडिबिलिटी है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री जयराम रमेश : सर, एलओपी बोलना चाहते हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री पीयूष गोयल : सर, यह alliance, they are claiming that they are an alliance, ...*(Interruptions)*... तो झगड़ा क्यों कर रहे हैं, अगर उन्होंने कहा था कि हमारे चार लोगों को बुलाएँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Member, one minute. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री पीयूष गोयल : अगर उनका alliance है, तो फिर एक-दूसरे पर विश्वास करें। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members... ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री पीयूष गोयल: सर, उस मीटिंग में कई नेता बैठे थे।...*(व्यवधान)*... सर, उस मीटिंग में उनके द्वारा यह condition लगाई गई कि पीएम साहब को बोलने के लिए आना चाहिए।...*(व्यवधान)*... ऐसा नहीं है कि हम रूल 167 के लिए तैयार हैं।...*(व्यवधान)*... चूँकि मि. जयराम रमेश ने अभी कहा कि Leader of the House has agreed. ...*(Interruption)*... सर, मैं उसको correct कर रहा हूँ। ...*(व्यवधान)*... मैं यह बताना चाहता हूँ कि आप लोगों ने कहा कि प्राइम मिनिस्टर साहब होने चाहिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... उस पर प्रहलाद जी और मैंने refuse किया। ...*(व्यवधान)*... सर, ये यहाँ पर गलत बोल रहे हैं कि मैंने एग्री किया था। ...*(व्यवधान)*... सर, मैंने एग्री नहीं किया था। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members... ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री पीयूष गोयल : सर, ये गलत बोल रहे हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... ये मेरे ऊपर आरोप लगा रहे हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Goyal, you have made your point. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री पीयूष गोयल : सर, फिर उन्होंने कहा कि आप पाँच मेम्बर्स की ड्राफ्टिंग कमेटी बनाइए और हम आपको एक प्रस्ताव देंगे।...*(व्यवधान)*... मैंने एक वरिष्ठ सदस्य को, जो उनकी पार्टी के नहीं हैं, बल्कि दूसरी पार्टी से हैं, उनको फोन किया कि वे प्रस्ताव सहित resolution में आएँ। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have made your point, Mr. Goyal. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री पीयूष गोयल : सर, आज तक वे भी नहीं आए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... सर, फिर उन्होंने कहा कि हमारे पाँच लोग उनके साथ मिल कर ड्राफ्ट करेंगे। ...*(व्यवधान)*... हमारे पाँच लोगों को बुलाया नहीं गया और ये अपने आप 167 ले आए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Goyal, you have made your point. Please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री पीयूष गोयल : सर, यह क्या है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, Mr. Tiruchi Siva... ...**(Interruptions)**...

श्री पीयूष गोयल : सर, न हमारे लोगों को बुलाया गया, न हमारे साथ चर्चा की गई, न कोई common resolution बनाया गया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Leader of the House, please take your seat. ...**(Interruptions)**...

श्री पीयूष गोयल : सर, इन्होंने ये commitments खुद ही किये थे। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I don't appreciate ...**(Interruptions)**... Please ask them to take their seats. ...**(Interruptions)**...

श्री पीयूष गोयल : सर, अब ये तय करें और इस सदन को गुमराह करना बंद करें तथा दूसरों के साथ क्या बात हुई, उसको misrepresent करना, जयराम रमेश जी बंद करें। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Piyush Goyal, please take your seat. ...**(Interruptions)**... All of you, please take your seats. ...**(Interruptions)**... Dr. Bajpai, please take your seat. ...**(Interruptions)**... Mr. Tiruchi Siva has raised a valid point that this stalemate or logjam is not earning us any respect. Further, we are not able to debate Manipur. He has come out with a way. ...**(Interruptions)**... We may accept it or we may not accept it. I, personally, feel that the two sides have taken a rigid stand, one on Rule 267 and the other on Rule 176. Now, if there can be a meeting ground, when something has emanated, I only want the hon. Members to respond to that limited point. Now, the Leader of the Opposition. ...**(Interruptions)**... Please, let there be no disturbance. I will name the Member who disturbs, this side or that side. Have it from me! ...**(Interruptions)**... Please take your seat. Only the Leader of the Opposition will speak now. I request you to focus on Rule 167. The rest is your discretion. But, right now, please focus on Rule 167.

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे) : सर, लीडर ऑफ दि हाउस मेरे रूम में आए थे। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : यह ठीक नहीं है।

श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे : सर, वे मेरे रूम में आए थे। वे यह चाहते थे कि किसी तरीके से रूल 176 ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : रूल 167. ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे : नहीं, नहीं, 167 तो अब की बात है। पहले तो उन्होंने माना था कि आप रूल 176 के तहत चर्चा कीजिए, हम sufficient time देने के लिए तैयार हैं। इस पर हमारे लोगों ने यह कहा कि आप लोग रूल 267 के तहत चर्चा को नहीं मान रहे हैं और हम लोग रूल 176 के तहत चर्चा को नहीं मान रहे हैं, इसलिए इसके लिए कोई वाया-मीडिया, मध्य मार्ग निकालना चाहिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... पहले उन्होंने allow किया था, कौन सा किया था? ...**(व्यवधान)**... तो फिर? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please ...**(Interruptions)**... Mr. Goyal, see to it that there is order in the House.

श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे : सर, वह कौन सा मध्य मार्ग हो सकता है? ...**(व्यवधान)**... मध्य मार्ग के संबंध में किसी ने कुछ कहा, किसी ने कुछ और कहा, लेकिन चूँकि मुझे कुछ काम से urgently जाना था, इसलिए मैंने उनको बोला कि मेरा ऑफिस खुला हुआ है, आप इस्तेमाल कीजिए। आप सब बात कर लीजिए, यहाँ चाय-पानी, जो कुछ भी चाहिए, वह उपलब्ध है। वे लोग बात करते रहे और मैं चला गया। सर, मैं वहाँ से चला गया था। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैंने उनसे रिक्वेस्ट की कि आप सभी बैठकर तय कर लीजिए कि किस रूल के तहत चर्चा होनी चाहिए, तो उन्होंने चर्चा की कि हम रूल 167 के तहत चर्चा कर सकते हैं। अब इसमें दिक्कत क्या है? आप ही ने माना, आप ही ने proposal दिया, लेकिन मेरे रूम से बाहर आकर यहाँ कुछ और बोल रहे हैं। इसलिए मेरी आपसे रिक्वेस्ट है कि आप रूल 167 को मान्यता दीजिए, चर्चा होने दीजिए और प्रधान मंत्री जी को आने दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... हम उनके सामने अपने विषय रखेंगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**... प्रधान मंत्री जी के आने से क्या होने वाला है? ...**(व्यवधान)**... क्या परमात्मा हैं ? ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह सदन है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... क्या परमात्मा हैं? ...**(व्यवधान)**... क्या वे परमात्मा हैं? ...**(व्यवधान)**... यहाँ कोई भगवान नहीं है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House will meet at 2 p.m.

The House then adjourned at thirty-six minutes past eleven of the clock.

The House reassembled at two of the clock,

MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

SHRI K. VANLALVENA (Mizoram): Hon. Chairman, Sir. ...**(Interruptions)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Go to your seat first. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please go to your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Are you not going to your seat? ...*(Interruptions)*... Are you not aware that you can speak only from your seat? ...*(Interruptions)*... Go to your seat first. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please go to your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... You must have the minimum courtesy to the Chair and some respect for the rules. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sit down. I will call you. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, after adjourning the House in the pre-lunch session, I had the benefit of interaction with the floor leaders. There was wholesome interaction and everyone contributed. There were three issues before us. One was notices under Rule 267. Second, notices under Rule 176 were accepted by me and the discussion was also slated. But then, there was a stalemate and no further progress was being made. Then came notices under Rule 167. There could be a way out was the impression of most leaders because before the notices actually came to me for consideration, there was enough in the public domain indicating that there could be a meeting ground. The discussions ended that the parties concerned will engage into discussion and come out with a mechanism so that a discussion/debate can fructify with respect to Manipur issues. I am extremely optimistic. The hon. Leader of the Opposition had his preoccupations. He was good enough to send his two representatives and they also made their point well known. I hope things will take a positive turn and we will be able to justify our oath and contribute, as Members of Parliament, for welfare of society at large. I do hope, in the afternoon, initiative will be taken by the Leader of the House, the Leader of the Opposition and other floor leaders. They will spare time, at my suggestion, workout a mechanism so that we can engage in a fruitful discussion that will enlighten the entire nation and give a soothing heal to the situation in Manipur. I am sure, you all will reflect and go in that direction with expedition.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, you fix the time. Only one day is left. Fix the time when we can have the discussion.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I request the floor leaders of political parties, Leader of the House and the Leader of the Opposition to take steps during the course of the day and fructify a discussion, so that we debate it at the earliest. As Chairman, Rajya Sabha, once I get their feel, I will give it the highest priority and take it way forward. There has been a major agreement according to me — my perception may not be right — and certain issues are to be thrashed out. I had always been indicated that I am not focusing on the ‘centre.’ But, the ‘centre’ has brought about such a good way out —

Rule 167. It has emanated from the 'centre.' So, I do hope, neither 'right' nor 'left', but the 'centre' has taken the lead.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, they are trying to divide. ...*(Interruptions)*... The गड़बड़िया गठबंधन ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I can tell the Leader of the House that I have suffered far more severe accusations in my life. ...*(Interruptions)*... Just one minute. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA (Rajasthan): The Leader of the House has to withdraw his words. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सैयद नासिर हुसैन (कर्नाटक) : महोदय, ये हमें घमंडिया बोलते हैं।...*(व्यवधान)*... यह बात करने का तरीका कोई नहीं है।...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री शक्तिसिंह गोहिल (गुजरात): ये चर्चा नहीं करना चाहते हैं।...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: If I smile at you, you should take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am giving floor to Mr. Derek O'Brien. ...*(Interruptions)*... I can assure the hon. Members, if you address through the Chair, you will be extremely impactful. I have indicated on several occasions that I am a very good reflector. ...*(Interruptions)*... No directions, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Derek O'Brien, do you have a point of order?

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN (West Bengal): Yes, Sir, it is a point of order. I will take just 90 seconds. I request you to please refer to page 90, Rule 259. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will only say three sentences after reading out the rule. I read the rule. Rule 259 says, "The Chairman shall preserve order and shall have all powers necessary for the purpose of enforcing his decisions." Sir, my request to you is, — that is why I said that I will say only three sentences — please help us as the Chairman to preserve order. The Government is responsible to the Parliament and the Parliament is responsible to the people. If order is not preserved and Parliament is disrupted, then, the Government is not responsible to the people. My charge is that the Government is disrupting Parliament because they don't want ...*(Interruptions)*... That is my charge. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, I strongly object to this. ...*(Interruptions)*... The total disruption has been by the Opposition. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Derek O'Brien has made his point. If you feel that you want to respond, seek my indulgence. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, I object to what Mr. Derek O'Brien has said. ...*(Interruptions)*... He is the person responsible for most of the disturbances in the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... For the approach he has taken ...*(Interruptions)*... And, here, he is trying to preach and become holier-than-thou. ...*(Interruptions)*... He is trying to say that you are responsible for the disorder. He is alleging that the Chair is not doing its duty. ...*(Interruptions)*... The fact is you, Mr. Chairman, as the Chair, Mr. Deputy Chairman, and other Vice-Chairmen have continuously made every possible effort, which is humanly possible, to maintain order in this House. It is this गड़बड़िया गठबंधन and this घमंडिया गठबंधन which has again and again disturbed the House and they do not allow the proceedings of the House to continue. ...*(Interruptions)*... ये गड़बड़ करते हैं और इनमें घमंड भी है कि जैसा हम कहते हैं, वही रूल होगा।...*(व्यवधान)*... ये चेयर की रूलिंग का अपमान करते हैं,...*(व्यवधान)*...चेयर का भी अपमान करते हैं।...*(व्यवधान)*... और फिर कहते हैं कि आपकी रिस्पॉसिबिलिटी है।...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, as I understood from the rule and from what he said, he has an expectation from the Chair that the Chair will ensure there is order in the House and, as you all know, the Chair is fully equipped to enforce it. We had, yesterday, a very unwholesome spectacle when an hon. Member of this House, Mr. Sushil Kumar Gupta, walked with a garland. I was absolutely in pain. This is not the conduct we need to show. ...*(Interruptions)*... I, therefore, interacted with leaders of the various political parties. I spelt out my mind to them that if we are to conduct ourselves in a manner contrary to what our ethics demands from us, we will be doing injustice to ourselves, our position as parliamentarians, as Members of this august House and sending a very unwholesome signal to the people at large. I can tell you, hon. Members, I was of the view to visit Mr. Gupta with severe consequences, but several leaders of the parties urged me...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Including me, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Everyone, as a matter of fact. As a matter of fact, all the leaders, while sharing my anguish, said, I should not go to the extreme limit. I am on a point

indicated by Mr. Derek O'Brien. I thought, if I do not take the right step, there will be no order in the House and we will be having many such ignoble milestones. But I, with utmost reluctance and pain, go by the wisdom, which is practical, I understand, of the floor leaders of various political parties. I severely reprimand and disapprove the conduct of Mr. Sushil Kumar Gupta, and I do hope, he will have wiser counsel from senior leaders. We have many veterans in the House who have the capacity to give direction even to me, informally. Where is the difficulty in younger Members of the House seeking direction from those who are experienced? You do not expect everyone to be fully aware of the rules on a first day, a second day or a first year. So, I bow down to the collective wisdom in unison of the floor leaders, but I will be helpless and be guided by only the Rule Book if there is ever a repetition of this kind. We cannot depend on the logic of past precedents. That is very dangerous. All sections of the House must be fully aware of it.

Now, the Leader of the Opposition; I had indicated to everyone that we had a good discussion. You were preoccupied with some pre-engagement. Shri Jairam Ramesh and Shri Tiwari had come, and it was consensus, from my perception, that all sides were keen to get to the table, discuss and deliberate a way out with respect to the notices that have come under Rule 167, that they will show priority to it and fructify their final outcome during the course of the day. You may speak on that.

श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे: सर, मैं आपकी मीटिंग में नहीं आ सका, क्योंकि हमारी एक इम्पोर्टेंट मीटिंग थी, मैं उसमें गया था। यहां पर आपने निर्णय लेकर यह कहा कि इस पर आप दोनों को मिलकर एक सॉल्यूशन निकालना चाहिए। मैं इसका स्वागत करता हूं, लेकिन जब दोनों को मिलकर निर्णय लेना है, तो बार-बार सरकारी लोगों का उठकर तंग करना ...**(व्यवधान)**... ये लोग बार-बार उठकर बोलने नहीं देते। ...**(व्यवधान)**...आप देख लीजिए। इससे यह ज़ाहिर होता है कि यह मक्तल बना है। ... **(व्यवधान)**...क्योंकि जो भी आता है... **(व्यवधान)**...खत्म करो। इसीलिए मुझे एक शेर याद आया। वे आते हैं मक्तल में ...**(व्यवधान)**...कुछ तो बोलो, कुछ तो समझो। ..**(व्यवधान)**...लेकिन मैं तुमसे ज्यादा अच्छा बोलता हूं। ...**(व्यवधान)**..

श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे : आप बैठिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

*"मक्तल में आते हैं वे लोग
खंजर बदल-बदल के।
या रब मैं कहाँ से लाऊँ
सर बदल-बदल के।"*

...**(व्यवधान)**...

महोदय, ये लोग खंजर बदल-बदल के आते हैं। मेरा एक ही सिर है, जिसे ये लोग काटना चाहते हैं, इसीलिए उनसे कहिए कि डेमोक्रेसी में एक ही सिर होता है, एक ही वोट होता है। ...**(व्यवधान)**..ये बार-बार उठकर बोलते हैं, इसलिए इसका कोई solution निकालिए, हम सभी उसे सपोर्ट करेंगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**....यह जो बार-बार उठने की आदत है,..**(व्यवधान)**..इसको बंद कीजिए, इस पर ज़रा रोक लगाइए। ...**(व्यवधान)**..भाषण सुनने के लिए प्रोत्साहित कीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I must tell you, we have had many heated moments in the House. But I have been greatly touched when in my Chamber, except for a few, the leaders have been fully composed, believing in the culture. But for some of the hon. Members, I had to say this. Do I get the same mechanism in my Chamber which I get here? Your cordiality in my Chamber has been of a very amazing level. You know it. I can share with you my pain when I said so about Shri Sushil Kumar Gupta. I have nothing against an individual. But the idea is that we rise to that level. इसलिए वह खंजर मेरे लिए रखिए। I am only one-headed person. ...*(Interruptions)*...

प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदय, आप खंजर मेरे लिए रखने की बात कह रहे हैं।**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is your special knowledge.

प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव : आप कह रहे हैं कि वह खंजर मेरे लिए रखिए, तो आप उधर इशारा कीजिए, इधर मत कीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे : महोदय,

*" मक्तल में आते हैं वे लोग
खंजर बदल-बदल के।
या रब मैं कहाँ से लाऊँ
सर बदल-बदल के।"*

...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, only a one-sentence response. This is a classic case of the pot calling the kettle black. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : ऐसा है कि शेर का मुकाबला शेर से ही होना चाहिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्रीमती सीमा द्विवेदी (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदय, मैं कुछ कहना चाहती हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**..

श्री सभापति : सीमा द्विवेदी जी बोलिए। ...(व्यवधान)..

श्रीमती सीमा द्विवेदी: सभापति महोदय, मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे साहब बहुत सीनियर सदस्य हैं, इन्होंने शायरी सुनाई है, इसलिए मैं भी इस पर जवाब देना चाहती हूँ।

"वे कत्ल भी करते हैं
तो रहते हैं गुमनाम,
और हम आह भी भरते हैं,
तो करते हैं बदनाम। "

...(व्यवधान)...

सभापति महोदय, अगर हम कहते हैं कि वंशवाद हटाओ, तो इसमें कौन-सी बुरी बात है?. .
...(व्यवधान)..

श्री सभापति : यह शायरी नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)..डॉ. सुधांशु त्रिवेदी, आप बोलिए।

डॉ. सुधांशु त्रिवेदी (उत्तर प्रदेश) : सर, उन्होंने सर बदलने की बात कही है, तो मैं कहना चाहूंगा कि ये चेहरे बदलते हैं।

"सच ज़रा सा घटे या बढ़े
तो सच सच न रहे।
मगर झूठ की तो कोई इतिहा नहीं।
लाख चेहरे बदल कर आ जाते हैं ये,
मगर आईना कम-बख्त झूठ बोलता ही नहीं।"

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Sudhanshu has changed it. ...(व्यवधान)....ज़रा सुन लीजिए। वे कह रहे हैं,

"चाहे सोने में जड़ दो, चाहे चाँदी में जड़ दो
आईना कभी झूठ नहीं बोलता।"

श्री प्रमोद तिवारी (राजस्थान): सभापति महोदय, आपका बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद कि आपने गुप्ता जी को उदारतापूर्वक माफ़ कर दिया।

श्री सुशील कुमार गुप्ता (राष्ट्रीय राजधानी क्षेत्र, दिल्ली) : सभापति महोदय, आपके गुस्से के लिए माफी ...(व्यवधान)..

श्री प्रमोद तिवारी : पर मैं चाहता हूँ कि इस मैटर को कन्क्लूड करते हुए ...(व्यवधान)... इसको छोड़िए। इसको कन्क्लूड करते हुए आप एक एन्क्वायरी कमिटी गठित कर दें कि इतने ढेर सारे टमाटर इनके पास आए कहाँ से, क्योंकि बाजार में तो यह 240 रुपए किलो में भी नहीं मिल रहा है। सर, इसकी एक एन्क्वायरी जरूर हो जाए। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The last one on the point.

श्री पीयूष गोयल : सर, टमाटर की कीमतें तो कम होनी शुरू हुई थीं, पर सडनली एक युवराज आजादपुर मंडी में पहुँचा, उसके बाद से तो पता नहीं टमाटर कहाँ गायब हो गया। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL(Rajasthan): Sir, what is this? This is the problem always. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will look into it. ... (Interruptions)... The hon. Law Minister.

विधि और न्याय मंत्रालय के राज्य मंत्री; संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री; तथा संस्कृति मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री अर्जुन राम मेघवाल) : सर, मुझे एक शेर याद आया। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, गालिब से किसी ने पूछा, ...(व्यवधान)... सर, गालिब से किसी ने पूछा कि समस्या का समाधान क्यों नहीं हो रहा है, तो गालिब ने कहा,

"उम्र भर इस भूल में जीते रहे गालिब,
धूल चेहरे पर थी और हम आईना ही पोंछते रहे।"

इसलिए गड़बड़ हो रही है। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : ऑनरेबल मिनिस्टर, यह डिस्प्यूटेड है। ...(व्यवधान)... नहीं, नहीं, जब मैंने हाउस में कहा, ...(व्यवधान)... Please take your seat. ... (Interruptions)... Let me tell you if the House is in order, when a Member rises to speak, we give a very good impression. And, let me tell you if we hear, for the rest of the day, every Member who rises with rapt attention, we will have wit, sarcasm and intellect fully exploited and a good message going outside. Now, the hon. Leader of the Opposition.

श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे: सर, रूलिंग पार्टी के लोग, नेतागण, लीडर ऑफ दि हाउस खूब कोशिश कर रहे हैं। मोदी जी,

"आप खूब कोशिश करो हमको मिट्टी में दबाने की,
लेकिन हम बार-बार उगते रहेंगे, क्योंकि हम बीज हैं।"

...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will come to you...*(Interruptions)*...

डा. सुधांशु त्रिवेदी : सर, मिट्टी में दबाने की जितनी कोशिश हुई, पिछले 20-25 सालों से लेकर 50-60 सालों तक, ...(व्यवधान)... सर, मिट्टी में दबाने की जितनी कोशिश हुई, तो उसका परिणाम क्या हुआ!

"मैं कहता हूँ, मैं बढ़ता हूँ"

यह अज्ञेय जी की कविता है।

"मैं उठता हूँ, मैं बढ़ता हूँ, मैं नभ की चोटी चढ़ता हूँ
कुचला जाऊँ यदि धूली-सा, आँधी सा पुनः उमड़ता हूँ।"

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Shaktisinh Gohil...*(Interruptions)*... Shaktisinhji, only *sher* so that the House does not plunge into disorder. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री शक्तिसिंह गोहिल: सर, मैं सिर्फ शेर कहूँगा। ...(व्यवधान)... कोई माहौल नहीं बिगड़ेगा, सुधरेगा। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, मेरा शेर सुनने के बाद माहौल सुधरेगा, बिगड़ेगा नहीं।
...(व्यवधान)...

"बहुत आसान है नशा पिला कर किसी को गिराना,
अरे, मज़ा तो तब है, जब गिरते हुए को सँभालो।"
"काश! मेरे मुल्क में ऐसी फिज़ा चले,
कि मंदिर जले, तो रंज मुसलमाँ को हो
और मस्जिद की आबरू पामाल न हो,
उसकी चिंता मंदिर के निगेहबान को रहे।"

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, under proviso to Rule 23 ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI K. VANLALVENA: Hon. Chairman, Sir, I am from the State of Mizoram. I am a tribal MP. The hon. Home Minister said that * ...*(Interruptions)*...

*Not recorded.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI K. VANLALVENA: *

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI K. VANLALVENA: *

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: *

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: *

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members... ...*(Interruptions)*... Let me make it very clear... ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: Sir, it is not fair. I request you to please allow him to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... He is a sufferer. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please allow him.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, it is a very sensitive matter. ...*(Interruptions)*... Listen to me. ...*(Interruptions)*... Every Member of the House... ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Listen to me first. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, I am saying something very significant. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please listen to me. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Every Member of this House, every Member of Parliament, is concerned with every inch of India. We cannot have an impression generated that a Member of Parliament from Madhya Pradesh is not concerned with Rajasthan or a Member of Parliament from West Bengal is not concerned with Tripura. We are all concerned. Our concern is equally serious. Therefore, if this august House will get into a situation that an hon. Member from a particular State or constituency is specially positioned, maybe for input, the concern is ours; it is everybody's concern. ...*(Interruptions)*...

*Not recorded.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Bills for introduction. The Chief Election Commissioner and Other Election Commissioners (Appointment, Conditions Of Service And Term of Office) Bill, 2023; Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal.

GOVERNMENT BILLS

The Chief Election Commissioner and other Election Commissioners (Appointment, Conditions of Service and Term of Office) Bill, 2023

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF LAW AND JUSTICE; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CULTURE (SHRI ARJUN RAM MEGHWAL): Sir, I move for leave to introduce a Bill to regulate the appointment, conditions of service and term of office of the Chief Election Commissioner and other Election Commissioners, the procedure for transaction of business by the Election Commission and for matters connected therewith or incidental thereto.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Notice has been given by Dr. John Brittas opposing the introduction of the Chief Election Commissioner and Other Election Commissioners (Appointment, Conditions of Service and Term of Office) Bill, 2023. ...*(Interruptions)*... Are you moving? ...*(Interruptions)*... Not moving! ...*(Interruptions)*...

The question is:

"That leave be granted to introduce a Bill to regulate the appointment, conditions of service and term of office of the Chief Election Commissioner and other Election Commissioners, the procedure for transaction of business by the Election Commission and for matters connected therewith or incidental thereto."

The motion was adopted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal to introduce the Bill.

SHRI ARJUN RAM MEGHWAL: Sir, I introduce the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Ashwini Vaishnaw to move for leave to introduce a Bill to consolidate and amend the law relating to Post Office in India and to provide for matters connected therewith or incidental thereto.

The Post Office Bill, 2023

THE MINISTER OF RAILWAYS; THE MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS; AND THE MINISTER OF ELECTRONICS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY (SHRI ASHWINI VAISHNAW): Sir, I rise to move for leave to introduce a Bill to consolidate and amend the law relating to Post Office in India and to provide for matters connected therewith or incidental thereto.

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Ashwini Vaishnaw to introduce the Bill.

SHRI ASHWINI VAISHNAW: Sir, I introduce the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Mansukh Mandaviya to move a Motion for consideration of the Pharmacy (Amendment) Bill, 2023. ...*(Interruptions)*... Get there. ...*(Interruptions)*... What are you doing? ...*(Interruptions)*... Get down. ...*(Interruptions)*... No. Go to your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*...

The Pharmacy (Amendment) Bill, 2023

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE; AND THE MINISTER OF CHEMICALS AND FERTILIZERS (DR. MANSUKH MANDAVIYA): Sir, I move:

"That the Bill further to amend the Pharmacy Act, 1948, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration."

The question was proposed.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Motion moved. There is one Amendment by Dr. V. Sivadasan for reference of Pharmacy (Amendment) Bill, 2023, as passed by Lok Sabha, to a Select Committee of Rajya Sabha. Dr. V. Sivadasan, are you moving your Amendment? ...*(Interruptions)*... Amendment not moved. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Motion for

consideration of the Pharmacy (Amendment) Bill, 2023 is now open for discussion. I call upon Members whose names have been received for participation in the discussion. Dr. Sasmit Patra. ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. SASMIT PATRA (Odisha): Sir, we support the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Ayodhya Rami Reddy. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI AYODHYA RAMI REDDY ALLA (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, we support the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri G.K. Vasan. ...(*Interruptions*)... Shri V. Vijayasai Reddy. ...(*Interruptions*)... Dr. M. Thambidurai. ...(*Interruptions*)... Dr. Mansukh Mandaviya to reply to the debate. ...(*Interruptions*)...

डा. मनसुख मांडविया : सर, मैं यह बिल कश्मीर के युवाओं के हित के लिए लाया हूँ।...(**व्यवधान**)... जब वहाँ आर्टिकल 370 हटा, उस वक्त वहाँ भारत सरकार का फार्मसी एक्ट लागू हुआ।...(**व्यवधान**)... उस वक्त वहाँ जो फार्मासिस्ट्स थे, उनको डीमड फार्मासिस्ट्स माना गया, लेकिन उनमें से कई लोग छूट गए थे।...(**व्यवधान**)... उनको फिर से शामिल करने के लिए एक साल का एक्सटेंशन माँगा गया है।...(**व्यवधान**)... एक साल का एक्सटेंशन मिलने से उसको continue किया जाएगा।...(**व्यवधान**)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is:

"That the Bill further to amend the Pharmacy Act, 1948, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration."

The motion was adopted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We shall now take up Clause-by-Clause consideration of the Bill.

Clause 2 was added to the Bill.

Clause 1, the Enacting Formula and the Titles were added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Mansukh Mandaviya to move that the Bill be passed.

DR. MANSUKH MANDAVIYA: Sir, I move:

That the Bill be passed.

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Repealing and Amending Bill, 2023. Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal. ...*(Interruptions)*... Not being taken up. ...*(Interruptions)*... Go to your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... Randeep Surjewala, this is not the conduct ...*(Interruptions)*... Venugopal ji,... ...*(Interruptions)*... The House is adjourned to meet at 11.00 a.m. on Friday, the 11th August, 2023.

The House then adjourned at thirty-five minutes past two of the clock till eleven of the clock on Friday, the 11th August, 2023.

PUBLISHED UNDER RULE 260 OF RULES OF PROCEDURE AND CONDUCT OF
BUSINESS IN THE COUNCIL OF STATES (RAJYA SABHA)