

Vol. 259
No. 25



Thursday,
6th April, 2023
16 Chaitra, 1945 (Saka)

PARLIAMENTARY DEBATES

RAJYA SABHA

OFFICIAL REPORT (FLOOR VERSION)

(PART-II)

CONTENTS

Papers Laid on the Table (pages 1 - 10)

Statement by Minister—

Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the 368th Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Science and Technology, Environment, Forests and Climate Change-*Laid on the table* (pages 10 -11)

Leave of Absence - *Granted* (pages 11 - 12)

Private Members' Resolutions - *Lapsed* (page 12)

Regarding Point of Order under various Rules and other issues (pages 12 - 20)

Announcement by the Chair (pages 20 - 21)

[P.T.O.]

Valedictory Remarks (pages 21 - 22)

National Song (page 22)

[Answers to Starred and Un-starred Questions (Both in English and Hindi) are available as Part -I to this Debate, published electronically on the Rajya Sabha website under the link <https://rajyasabha.nic.in/Debates/OfficialDebatesDateWise>]

Website : <http://rajyasabha.nic.in>
<http://parliamentofindia.nic.in>
E-mail : rsedit-e@sansad.nic.in

RAJYA SABHA

Thursday, the 6th April, 2023 / 16 Chaitra, 1945 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock,

MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

MR. CHAIRMAN: Papers to be laid on the Table. ...*(Interruptions)*...

Notifications of the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS (DR. JITENDRA SINGH): Sir, I lay on the Table:-

(i) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions (Department of Personnel and Training), under sub-section (2) of Section 3 of the All India Services Act, 1951:—

- (1) G.S.R. 929 (E), dated the 30th December, 2022, publishing the Indian Administrative Service (Fixation of Cadre Strength) Fourth Amendment Regulations, 2022.
- (2) G.S.R. 930 (E), dated the 30th December, 2022, publishing the Indian Administrative Service (Pay) Fourth Amendment Rules, 2022.
- (3) G.S.R. 96 (E), dated the 14th February, 2023, amending the Schedule to the Notification No. G.S.R. 35 (E), dated the 21st January, 2022, by substituting certain entries, as mentioned therein, in that Notification.
- (4) G.S.R. 97 (E), dated the 14th February, 2023, amending the Schedule II to the Notification No. G.S.R. 36 (E), dated the 21st January, 2022, by substituting certain entries, as mentioned therein, in that Notification.
- (5) G.S.R. 98 (E), dated the 14th February, 2023, publishing the Indian Administrative Service (Pay) Amendment Rules, 2023.
- (6) G.S.R. 99 (E), dated the 14th February, 2023, publishing the Indian Administrative Service (Fixation of Cadre Strength) Amendment Regulations, 2023.
- (7) G.S.R. 133 (E), dated the 24th February, 2023, publishing the Indian Police Service (Fixation of Cadre Strength) Amendment Regulations, 2023.

- (8) G.S.R. 134 (E), dated the 24th February, 2023, publishing the Indian Police Service (Pay) Amendment Rules, 2023.

[Placed in Library. For (1) to (8) See No. L.T. 9392/17/23]

- (9) G.S.R. 177 (E), dated the 13th March, 2023, publishing the Indian Police Service (Probation) Amendment Rules, 2023

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9443/17/23]

(ii) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions (Department of Personnel and Training) Notification No. G.S.R. 92 (E), dated the 13th February, 2023, publishing the Union Public Service Commission (Exemption from Consultation) Amendment Regulations, 2023, under clause (5) of Article 320 of the Constitution of India.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9444/17/23]

Notifications of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN): Sir, on behalf of Shri Ashwini Kumar Choubey, I lay on the Table—

(i) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change, under sub-section (1) and clauses (v) and (xiv) of sub-section (2) and sub-section (3) of Section 3 of the Environment (Protection) Act, 1986, along with Delay Statement:—

- (1) S.O. 4027 (E), dated the 14th December, 2016, notifying a certain area of Bandhavgarh National Park and Panpatha Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as Eco-sensitive Zone.
- (2) S.O. 4031 (E), dated the 14th December, 2016, notifying a certain area around the boundary of the Ghatigaon Hukna Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as Ghatigaon Hukna Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
- (3) S.O. 4029 (E), dated the 14th December, 2016, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Gandhi Sagar Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as the Gandhi Sagar Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
- (4) S.O. 2538 (E), dated the 9th August, 2017, notifying a certain area from the boundary of Core Critical Tiger Habitat of the Satpura Tiger Reserve, in the

- State of Madhya Pradesh, as the Satpura National Park, Pachmarhi Wildlife Sanctuary and Bori Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
- (5) S.O. 2605 (E), dated the 11th August, 2017, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Ratapani and Singhori Wildlife Sanctuary as the Eco-sensitive Zone.
 - (6) S.O. 2811 (E), dated the 29th August, 2017, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Sanjay National Park and Sanjay Dubri Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh and Chhattisgarh, as the Sanjay National Park and Sanjay Dubri Wildlife Sanctuary Eco sensitive Zone.
 - (7) S.O. 3027 (E), dated the 13th September, 2017, notifying a certain area from the boundary of the Madhav National Park, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as the Madhav National Park Eco-sensitive zone.
 - (8) S.O. 3028 (E), dated the 13th September, 2017, notifying a certain area from the boundary of the Bagdara Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as the Bagdara Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 - (9) S.O. 2669 (E), dated the 17th August, 2017, notifying a certain area from the boundary of Dinosaur National Park, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as the Dinosaur National Park Eco-sensitive Zone.
 - (10) S.O. 3064 (E), dated the 18th September, 2017, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Ghughua Fossil National Park, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as the Ghughua Fossil National Park Eco-sensitive Zone.
 - (11) S.O. 3082 (E), dated the 21st September, 2017, notifying a certain area from the boundary of Ken Gharial Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as the Ken Gharial Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 - (12) S.O. 3133 (E), dated the 27th September, 2017, notifying a certain area from the boundary of Nauradehi Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as the Nauradehi Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 - (13) S.O. 3777 (E), dated the 30th November, 2017, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Van Vihar National Park as the Eco-sensitive Zone.
 - (14) S.O. 35 (E), dated the 3rd January, 2018, notifying a certain area from the periphery of Orchha Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as Orchha Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 - (15) S.O. 1902 (E), dated the 14th May, 2018, notifying a certain area from the periphery of Kheoni Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as the Kheoni Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
 - (16) S.O. 3689 (E), dated the 27th July, 2018, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Narsinghgarh Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh,

as the Narsingharh Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.

- (17) S.O. 4009 (E), dated the 6th November, 2019, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Pench Tiger Reserve, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as the Pench Tiger Reserve Eco-sensitive Zone.
- (18) S.O. 796 (E), dated the 21st February, 2020, notifying a certain area around the boundary of National Chambal Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as the National Chambal Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
- (19) S.O. 2935 (E), dated the 28th August, 2020, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Kharmor Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as the Eco-sensitive Zone.
- (20) S.O. 1198 (E), dated the 12th March, 2021, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Kanha National Park, the Buffer Zone, and the Phen Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as the Kanha National Park and the Phen Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
- (21) S.O. 1192 (E), dated the 12th March, 2021, amending the Principal Notification No. S.O. 2538 (E), dated the 9th August, 2017, by substituting certain entries in that Notification.
- (22) S.O. 3653 (E), dated the 9th September, 2021, amending the Principal Notification No. S.O. 1198 (E), dated the 12th March, 2021, by substituting certain entries in that Notification.
- (23) S.O. 4617 (E), dated the 9th November, 2021, notifying a certain area around the boundary of Veerangana Durgawati Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as the Veerangana Durgawati Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.

[Placed in Library. For (1) to (23) See No. L.T. 9316/17/23]

(ii) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change, under sub-section (1) and clauses (v) and (xiv) of sub-section (2) of Section 3 of the Environment (Protection) Act, 1986, along with Delay Statement:-

- (1) S.O. 4030 (E), dated the 14th December, 2016, notifying a certain area from the boundary of Son Gharial Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as the Son Gharial Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.
- (2) S.O. 3063 (E), dated the 18th September, 2017, notifying a certain area from the boundary of Karera Wildlife Sanctuary, in the State of Madhya Pradesh, as the

Karera Wildlife Sanctuary Eco-sensitive Zone.

[Placed in Library. For (1) and (2) See No. L.T. 9316/17/23]

(iii) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change Notification No. S.O. 5481 (E), dated the 31st December, 2021, under sub-section (1) and clause (v) of sub-section (2) of Section 3 of the Environment (Protection) Act, 1986, regarding ash utilization from coal or lignite thermal power plants, along with Delay Statement.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 8580/17/23]

(iv) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change Notification No. S.O. 1317 (E), dated the 21st March, 2023, under sub-section (3) of Section 3 of the Environment (Protection) Act, 1986, constituting the Kerala Coastal Zone Management Authority for a period of three years.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9416/17/23]

Reports and Accounts (2019-20 and 2021-22) of various Museums, Libraries and Institutes and related papers

SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN: Sir, on behalf of Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal, I lay on the Table a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Indira Gandhi Rashtriya Manav Sangrahalaya (IGRMS), Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Sangrahalaya.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9420/17/23]

- (ii) (a) Fifty-sixth Annual Report and Accounts of the Nehru Memorial Museum and Library (NMML), New Delhi, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Museum.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9418/17/23]

- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Maulana Abul Kalam Azad Institute of Asian Studies, (MAKAIAS), Kolkata, West Bengal, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9419/17/23]

- (iv) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Sahitya Akademi, New Delhi, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Akademi.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 8585/17/23]

- (v) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Sangeet Natak Akademi, New Delhi, for the year 2019-20, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Akademi.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9417/17/23]

- (vi) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Salar Jung Museum, Hyderabad, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Museum.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9318/17/23]

- (vii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National Museum Institute of History of Art, Conservation and Museology, New Delhi, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.

- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9317/17/23]

Notification of the Ministry of Railways

रेल मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री दानवे रावसाहेब दादाराव) : महोदय, मैं रेल अधिनियम, 1989 की धारा 199 के अधीन रेलवे रेड टैरिफ (द्वितीय संशोधन) नियम, 2023 को प्रकाशित करने वाली रेल मंत्रालय की अधिसूचना सं. सा.का.नि. 225(अ), दिनांक 27 मार्च, 2023 की एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ।

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9445/17/23]

Reports and Accounts (2021-22) of IICT, Bhadohi; SITRA, Coimbatore; ATIRA, Ahmedabad and related papers

SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN: Sir, on behalf of Shrimati Darshana Vikram Jardosh, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Institute of Carpet Technology(IICT), Bhadohi, Uttar Pradesh, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9405/17/23]

- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the South India Textile Research Association (SITRA), Coimbatore, Tamil Nadu for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Association.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9406/17/23]

- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Ahmedabad Textile Industry's Research Association (ATIRA), Ahmedabad, Gujarat, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Association.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9407/17/23]

Report and Accounts (2021-22) of the Dattopant Thengadi National Board for Workers Education and Development, New Delhi and related papers

श्रम और रोजगार मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री रामेश्वर तेली) : महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्रों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ :-

- (a) Sixty-third Annual Report and Accounts of the Dattopant Thengadi National Board for Workers Education and Development (erstwhile Central Board for Workers Education), New Delhi, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Board.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9427/17/23]

Reports and Accounts (2020-21 and 2021-22) of various corporations and related papers

कृषि एवं किसान कल्याण मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री कैलाश चौधरी) : महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्र सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ :-

(1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act, 2013:—

- (i) (a) Fifty-ninth Annual Report and Accounts of the National Seeds Corporation (NSC) Limited, New Delhi, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9369/17/23]

- (ii) (a) Fifty-fifth Annual Report and Accounts of the Punjab Agro Industries Corporation Ltd., Chandigarh, for the year 2020-21,

together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9368/17/23]

- (iii) (a) Fifty-first Annual Report and Accounts of the Himachal Pradesh Agro Industries Corporation Ltd., Shimla for the year 2020-21, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9367/17/23]

- (iv) (a) Fifty-second Annual Report and Accounts of the Andhra Pradesh State Agro Industries Corporation Ltd., Vijaywada, Andhra Pradesh for the year 2020-21, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.

(2) Statements (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) (i)(a) to (iv)(a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9366/17/23]

I. Notification of the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting

II. Report and Accounts (2021-22) of BECIL, New Delhi and related papers

III. Report and Accounts (2020-21) of the Prasar Bharati, New Delhi and related papers

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (DR. L. MURUGAN): Sir, I lay on the Table—

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting Notification No. G.S.R. 123 (E), dated the 23rd February, 2023, publishing the All India Radio Assistant Director (O.L.) Recruitment Rules, 2023, under Section 34 of the Prasar Bharati (Broadcasting Corporation of India) Act, 1990.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9382/17/23]

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act, 2013:—

- (a) Twenty-seventh Annual Report and Accounts of the Broadcast Engineering Consultants India Limited (BECIL), New Delhi, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Company.
- (c) Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9619/17/23]

III. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) of Section 31 of the Prasar Bharati (Broadcasting Corporation of India) Act, 1990:—

- (a) Annual Report of the Prasar Bharati, New Delhi, for the year 2020-21.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above corporation
- (c) Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9620/17/23]

...(Interruptions)...

STATEMENT BY MINISTER

Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the 368th Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Science and Technology, Environment, Forests and Climate Change

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY; THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF EARTH SCIENCES; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF ATOMIC ENERGY; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF SPACE (DR.

JITENDRA SINGH): Sir, I lay a statement regarding Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the 368th Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Science and Technology, Environment, Forests and Climate Change on Demands for Grants (2022-23) pertaining to the Department of Scientific and Industrial Research (DSIR).

...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I have received six notices. ...(Interruptions).... It is such a good sight. Digvijaya Singh ji is in black today. But others are not. ...(Interruptions)... You have been singled out. ...(Interruptions)... You have been singled out. ...(Interruptions)... White is everywhere. ...(Interruptions)... Hon. Members, there are six notices under Rule 267. ...(Interruptions)... Shri Mallikarjun Kharge, Shri Pramod Tiwari and Shri K.C. Venugopal; 'to discuss Government's failure and inaction to constitute a JPC to investigate serious charges levelled against Adani Group of Companies.' ...(Interruptions).... Dr. Amee Yajnik; 'to discuss misuse of autonomous institutions like ED and CBI against political opponents.' ...(Interruptions)... Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham; 'to discuss the worrying trend of declining freedom of speech and expression in the country.' ...(Interruptions)... Shri Sanjay Singh - not present; 'to discuss Government role in wrongdoings'....(Interruptions)... Please maintain order....(Interruptions)... Please be on your seats. ...(Interruptions)...

The House stands adjourned to meet at 2 p.m. today.

The House then adjourned at six minutes past eleven of the clock.

The House reassembled at two of the clock,

MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

LEAVE OF ABSENCE

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have to inform Members that a letter has been received from Dr. Manmohan Singh, Member of this House, stating that he is unable to attend the sittings of Rajya Sabha from 13th March to 6th April, 2023 on medical grounds.

Does he have the permission of the House for remaining absent from sittings of the House from 13th March to 6th April, 2023?

(No hon. Member dissented.)

MR. CHAIRMAN: We wish him good health and speedy recovery. Permission to remain absent is granted.

PRIVATE MEMBERS' RESOLUTIONS

MR. CHAIRMAN: Private Members' Resolutions, Shri Raghav Chadha. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka): Sir, LoP. ...*(Interruptions)*... सर, एलओपी कुछ बोलना चाहते हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Raghav Chadha is not present in the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... Observation by Chair. ...*(Interruptions)*...

REGARDING POINT OF ORDER UNDER VARIOUS RULES AND OTHER ISSUES

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I am on a point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, go ahead.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, yesterday, you gave a ruling about the point of....*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sorry. There can be no point of order on my decision. ...*(Interruptions)*... There can be no point of order on a decision given by the Chair. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: No, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHAKTISINH GOHIL (Gujarat): Sir, it is a point of clarification. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, it is on a point of order raised by him. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, it is on a point order raised by hon. Leader of the Opposition. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, it is on a point of order raised by him. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members.....*(Interruptions)*... One at a time! ...*(Interruptions)*... Do not make it chorus. ...*(Interruptions)*... For a change, take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... You would be comfortable. ...*(Interruptions)*... You would be comfortable, please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... First, the House has to be in order. ...*(Interruptions)*... One second.....*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ... *(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members.....*(Interruptions)*... One second; then I would call you. I will call you. Hon. Members, I do not have an agent in the House who will tell me: "Allow this one to speak and not to speak." This is not a wholesome practice. I find quite embarrassing someone telling me, "Please allow the Leader of Opposition to speak." That is an insult to the Chair and also to the Leader of the Opposition. Someone will say, allow.. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka): Sir, you are not allowing.....*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is not good. ...*(Interruptions)*... No. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will.....*(Interruptions)*... I know, I know. ...*(Interruptions)*... Take your seat. I am talking only to adopt legally sound, rationale approach. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Yes, Sir. We too.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Every Member in the House is entitled to audience as per rules and he or she does not need any recommendation or support from anyone. ...*(Interruptions)*... Anyone.....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: But you are not giving.....*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One second. ...*(Interruptions)*... If anyone were to indicate to me that "Please allow Mr. Tiruchi Siva to speak", he is doing two things. An insult to the stature which Mr. Tiruchi Siva has, that, on his own, he cannot handle it and, secondly, that I can be so persuaded by someone else. Mr. Tiruchi Siva, before you speak, crystallize your point of order with respect to a rule. Spell out a rule and indicate.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, I am to raise a point of order under Rule 258. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One second. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, I want to get clarified and enlightened on some genuine things.

MR. CHAIRMAN: One second. Kindly read Rule 258.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Yes, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री जयराम रमेश : सर, 'वन्दे मातरम्' करा दीजिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति : हम सब रूल्स बता देंगे, कोई इश्यू नहीं छोड़ेंगे। ...*(व्यवधान)*... Nothing will be left open-ended. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes, Mr. Tiruchi Siva. I am on Rule 258. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please go ahead. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Thank you, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, the House has to be enlightened on certain points.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I can't take note of something being said by a Member, sitting on the seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... You can take the floor only when I allow. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती रंजीत रंजन (छत्तीसगढ़): सर, नौ महीने हो गए हैं, मुझे घर अलॉट नहीं हुआ है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Only when I allow. ...*(Interruptions)*... Only when I allow. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, Rule 258.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, the House has to be enlightened on certain very genuine issues.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are raising your point of order in relation to Rule 258!

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Yes, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What does it say?

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, it says, "Any Member may at any time submit a point of order for the decision of the Chairman, but in doing so, shall confine himself to stating the point."

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please state the point.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, the Leader of the House, Shri Piyush Goyal raised an issue about a senior leader...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No; what are you wanting at the end of the day? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, that is what I want to tell. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, very simple, he said that a senior leader has made disparaging remarks abroad. ...*(Interruptions)*... He didn't name anyone. ...*(Interruptions)*... He didn't name anyone. If he has not named anyone, from whom they were demanding apology. 'माफी माँगो, माफी माँगो' the House was being obstructed. When no name was mentioned, from whom have they demanded apology? Number two is this. They have authenticated. ...*(Interruptions)*... They have authenticated later. ...*(Interruptions)*... Authentication is to be to the concerned Minister as to the Chairman.

MR. CHAIRMAN: As to the!

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: As to the Chairman. And, he has stood with the concerned Minister. Who is the concerned Minister? We don't know it. What is the authentication? ...*(Interruptions)*... The House has to be enlightened on it. In what manner, it has been authenticated, we want to know. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are very, very well-versed in every rule, from Constitution to IPC, CrPC, CPC as well as the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Council of States. I would like to refer to Rule 157, Rule 169 (iii), Rule 177 and Rule 180 (B). ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One at a time. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Yes, Sir, Rule 157. Rule 157 (iv), "In order that a resolution may be admissible, it shall satisfy the following conditions."

MR. CHAIRMAN: One second. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Tiruchi Siva, you are a very senior Member of the House and I have no hesitation in saying that I am considerably benefited by the enlightened views but only when I am in my Chamber. When I come to this theatre, things are different. This rule applies in order that a resolution may be admissible. Mr. Siva, why do I read further?

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, you can read.... ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No. ...*(Interruptions)*... Why? ...*(Interruptions)*... It pertains to 'resolution'.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, nothing of it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: If I wish to take a train, I wouldn't go to airport. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, any reference in the House can't allow a person except in their official or public capacity.

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is a resolution. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, any reference made by any Member....

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Tiruchi Siva, at the cost and pain of repetition, this rule is specific to a resolution.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Yes, Sir; we are aware that if it is a resolution or a Short Duration Discussion or a matter of public importance.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I urge you. One second. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: One minute. Let me...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will give you the floor. I request you that you may have a very strong point which you will have, I am sure, with respect to the...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, you know that.

MR. CHAIRMAN: With respect to the order, please tell under which rule, you are holding the floor to raise an issue connected with my decision on a point of order.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Yes, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You may indicate that.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, if I have to be very precise...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Which rule?

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: It is Rule 238, Rule 238(A) and all.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, please go ahead.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: It is very much important. "I am of the firm view that there can be no issue or individual beyond the purview of discussion in the Rajya Sabha."

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have held it.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: If that be the case, Sir, I would like to know whether hereafter, Rule 238(i), Rule 238(ii) and Rule 238(v) will be off from the Rules Book.

...(Interruptions)...When you say, nothing will be out of the purview of the discussion, Rule 238 (i), 238(ii) and 238(v)... Sir, Rule 238(i) says, "refer to any matter of fact on which a judicial decision is pending".

MR. CHAIRMAN: You will get as many as you want, don't worry.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, so far, we were not in a position to discuss anything *sub-judice*. Rule 238(ii) says, "make a personal charge against a member". Rule 238(v) says, "reflect upon the conduct of persons in high authority unless the discussion is based on a substantive motion drawn in proper terms". So, Sir, by way of your ruling, will all these be go off from the Rules Book? Thank you, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Very good. Mr. Tiruchi Siva has raised a very important point and he has indicated...

SHRI SHAKTISINH GOHIL (Gujarat): Sir, can I add something?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Only with relevance to this.

SHRI SHAKTISINH GOHIL: On this point.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Go ahead. Limited to this.

श्री शक्तिसिंह गोहिल : सर, मैं बिल्कुल प्रिसाइज़ली कहूंगा। जो तिरुची शिवा जी ने कहा, उसी में मैं एक लाइन ऐड करना चाहता हूँ। आपका कोई भी आदेश है, वह हमारे रूल्स जो प्रोवाइड करते हैं, उससे बियॉन्ड ट्रैवल नहीं करे, इसके लिए तिरुची शिवा जी ने जो प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर उठाया है, उसके समर्थन में मैं सिर्फ यही कहता हूँ कि हमारे रूल में हम एक ऐसी परम्परा की ओर जाएंगे। हम आज हैं, कल नहीं होंगे, आप आज हैं, कल नहीं होंगे, लेकिन यह हाउस परमानेंट है। No one is permanent. हम जो परम्परा डालकर जाएंगे, उसका फार रीचिंग इफ़ैक्ट होगा। Our rule provides; one, as per your judgement, there is freedom of speech. We can speak anything against anyone whether it is Judiciary, whether it is a Member of another House, whether it is a leader, whether the person is not here to defend himself. We can talk anything whatever we want to. That is the outcome of that judgement which is travelling beyond the rules. So, whatever rules are quoted by Mr. Siva, I am in agreement with him and I am totally supporting his statement.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL): Sir, on this limited point...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Only on this point.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Only on this limited point. I think the hon. Member may also like to read the Explanation. Actually, he should be more concerned about the Explanation...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Are you supporting him or...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, the Chair should ...*(Interruptions)*... His point, in a way, is trying to suggest...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members. ..*(Interruptions)*... They are not interested in your point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*... They are not interested. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please. It is important. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please. ...*(Interruptions)*... One second. Please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI G.V.L. NARASIMHA RAO (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, the point of order...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let me deal with the point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*... Take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, we must give credit to Mr. Tiruchi Siva that he has raised issues pertaining to my decision on the point of order raised by the hon. Leader of the Opposition, and Mr. Tiruchi Siva has said three things in particular. It has been supplemented. Can this House deliberate the conduct of any individual on this planet and can this House deliberate any issue that arises on this planet and can this House, in particular, deal with a Member of Lok Sabha? These are the three. I have held, there is no individual on this planet or an issue which may arise anywhere on the planet, nothing is beyond the purview of discussion of this House. Now, why have I so decided? I have indicated the contours of that. Article 105 of the Constitution expressly indicates that there is...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, we have discussed this enough. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Would you take your seat? ...*(Interruptions)*... Would you take your seat? ...*(Interruptions)*... What is this? ...*(Interruptions)*... What is this, Mr. Tiruchi Siva? ...*(Interruptions)*... What is this? ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Tiruchi Siva,

you cannot persuade. ...*(Interruptions)*... You wear black, share the same dress and you cannot persuade them to listen! ...*(Interruptions)*... What is this? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, what we want is JPC. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are just repeating. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Tiruchi Siva, I appreciate that you have raised issues, and my input would have been extremely beneficial to the public at large. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: We will listen, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please observe silence and complete silence. ...*(Interruptions)*...

So, hon. Members, I have categorically held, 'discussion of no issue is beyond the purview of this House'. And, I have thereby fortified your right of expression. This is number one. ...*(Interruptions)*... Secondly, ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Tiruchi Siva, you will get response to everything if you read Rule 238A. This rule is... ...*(Interruptions)*... They cannot get out of it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, observation from the Chair. ...*(Interruptions)*...

ANNOUNCEMENT BY THE CHAIR

MR. CHAIRMAN: On 10th February, 2023, it was directed that Shrimati Rajani Ashokrao Patil be suspended for the remaining part of the current Session, subject to a Report being made available by the Committee on Privileges for consideration of this august House.

The Committee, in its meeting held on 27th March, 2023, recommended and I quote:

“Hon. Chairman, Rajya Sabha, may, accordingly, consider granting extension of time to the Committee to complete its investigation and examination of the instant matter related to Shrimati Rajani Ashokrao Patil, Member, till the first week of ensuing Monsoon Session i.e., 260th Session of the Rajya Sabha.

The Chairman may also consider making an announcement in this regard in the House.”

Taking note of the inputs from the Committee on Privileges, I find it expedient invoking Rule 266, read with Rule 256, that February 10, 2023, Suspension Order of Shrimati Rajani Ashokrao Patil may continue to be in force beyond the current Session and till the House has the benefit of recommendation by the Committee on Privileges. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka): Sir, how can it be? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHAKTISINH GOHIL (Gujrat): Sir, what is this? ...*(Interruptions)*... It is not proper. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL (Rajasthan): Sir, this is not acceptable. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is not fair, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती रंजीत रंजन (छत्तीसगढ़): चेयरमैन सर, हम इसको नहीं मानते हैं।...*(व्यवधान)*...

VALEDICTORY REMARKS

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, the 259th Session of Rajya Sabha comes to a close today, albeit, on a note of concern. ...*(Interruptions)*... Parliament is the watchdog of democracy and people are our watchdog and supreme masters. ...*(Interruptions)*... Our primary obligation is to serve them. ...*(Interruptions)*... The hallowed precincts of Parliament are for discussions and deliberations, debates and decisions for the holistic welfare of the people. ...*(Interruptions)*... How ironical disorder in Parliament is turning out to be a new order - a new norm that decimates essence of democracy. ...*(Interruptions)*...

How worrisome and alarming! Paramountcy of debate, dialogue, deliberation and discussion in Parliament has yielded to disruption and disturbance. ...*(Interruptions)*... Weaponising of politics by stalling function of Parliament is pregnant with serious consequences for our polity. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is to the utter dislike of the people at large. In public mind, we, as a class, are subject of disdain and ridicule. ...*(Interruptions)*...

We need to reflect our track record on the anvil-expectations of the people. ...*(Interruptions)*... Posterity will judge us not by the decibels generated in shouting slogans, but by our multifarious contributions towards strengthening the growth trajectory of our nation. ...*(Interruptions)*...

The productivity of the first part of the Budget Session was 56.3 per cent, while for the second part it plummeted to an abysmal 6.4 per cent! Cumulatively, the House productivity was only 24.4 per cent. ...*(Interruptions)*... Disruptions claimed 103 hours and 30 minutes of its time. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let us ponder over the dismal performance of the House and find a way out. ...*(Interruptions)*... I express my deep sense of gratitude to the hon. Deputy Chairman and the Panel of Vice-Chairmen, and also would like to thank the Secretary-General and his team of officials for their efforts in conducting the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... I take this opportunity to extend my greetings to you and your family members on the forthcoming festivals. ...*(Interruptions)*... Thank you, *Jai Hind!* ...*(Interruptions)*... National Song. ...*(Interruptions)*...

(The National Song, “Vande Mataram”, was then played.)

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House stands adjourned *sine die*.

The House then adjourned sine die at twenty-two minutes past two of the clock.

