

Vol. 259  
No. 19



Friday,  
24<sup>th</sup> March, 2023  
3 Chaitra, 1945 (Saka)

PARLIAMENTARY DEBATES

# RAJYA SABHA

OFFICIAL REPORT (FLOOR VERSION)

(PART-II)

CONTENTS

Papers Laid on the Table (pages 1 - 11)

Messages from Lok Sabha - *Reported*

The Appropriation Bill, 2023 (page 12)

The Finance Bill, 2023 (page 19-20)

Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on  
Commerce - *Presented* (pages 12 - 13)

Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport,  
Tourism and Culture - *Presented* (page 13)

Statements of the Committee on Public Undertakings - *Laid on the Table*  
(pages 13 - 14)

Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Consumer  
Affairs, Food and Public Distribution - *Laid on the Table* (page 14)

[P.T.O]

©

RAJYA SABHA SECRETARIAT

NEW DELHI

Reports of the Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes  
-*Laid on the Table* (pages 14 - 15)

Statement by Minister -

Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Twelfth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Water Resources-  
*Laid on the Table* (page 15)

Statement regarding Government Business (pages 16 - 18)

Private Members' Resolution-*Negatived/Lapsed*

Need to implement the recommendations of Sachar Committee report and other reports for improving educational and social backwardness of Muslims  
(page 19 and pages 20 - 23)

Observation by the Chair (pages 23 -24)

*[Answers to Starred and Un-starred Questions (Both in English and Hindi) are available as Part-I to this Debate, published electronically on the Rajya Sabha website under the link <https://rajyasabha.nic.in/Debates/OfficialDebatesDateWise>]*

Website: <http://rajyasabha.nic.in>  
<http://parliamentofindia.nic.in>  
E-mail: [rsedit-e@sansad.nic.in](mailto:rsedit-e@sansad.nic.in)

## RAJYA SABHA

Friday, the 24<sup>th</sup> March, 2023/3 Chaitra, 1945 (Saka)

*The House met at eleven of the clock,*

MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

### PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Papers to be laid on the Table.

#### Report and Accounts (2021-22) of NIFTEM-T, Thanjavur and related papers

खाद्य प्रसंस्करण उद्योग मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री प्रहलाद सिंह पटेल): महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्रों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ :-

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute of Food Technology Entrepreneurship and Management (NIFTEM-T), Thanjavur, Tamil Nadu, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9260/17/23]

#### Report and Accounts (2021-22) of BIS, New Delhi and related papers

उपभोक्ता मामले, खाद्य और सार्वजनिक वितरण मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री अश्विनी कुमार चौबे): महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्र सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-

(1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers under Section 23 of the Bureau of Indian Standards Act, 2016:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Bureau of Indian Standards, (BIS), New Delhi, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Bureau.

(2) Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the

papers mentioned at (1) (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9394/17/23]

**I. Report and Accounts (2021-22) of BPCL, Naini, Allahabad and related papers**

**II. Report and Accounts (2019-20) of HECL, Ranchi and related papers**

**भारी उद्योग मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री कृष्ण पाल):** महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्र सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-

I. (1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act, 2013: —

- (a) Fifty-second Annual Report and Accounts of the Bharat Pumps & Compressors Ltd. (BPCL), Naini, Allahabad, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9001/17/23]

II. (a) Annual Report and Accounts of Heavy Engineering Corporation Limited (HECL), Ranchi, Jharkhand, for the year 2019-20, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.

(2) Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) (ii) (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9212/17/23]

**I. Notification of the Ministry of Railways**

**II. Reports and Accounts (2021-22) of NHSRCL, New Delhi; NRTU and related papers**

**III. MoUs between the Government of India and various Corporations**

**रेल मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री दानवे रावसाहेब दादाराव):** महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्र सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-

- I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Railways Notification No.

G.S.R. 83 (E), dated the 7<sup>th</sup> February, 2023, publishing the Railways Red Tariff (Amendment) Rules, 2023, under Section 199 of the Railways Act, 1989.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9271/17/23]

II. (1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act, 2013

(i) (a) Sixth Annual Report and Accounts of the National High Speed Rail Corporation Limited (NHSRCL), New Delhi, for the year 2021-22, together with Auditors' Report on the Accounts and comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9273/17/23]

(ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the NRTU Foundation (NRTU), for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Foundation.

(2) Statements (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) (i) (a) and (ii) (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9274/17/23]

III. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:-

(i) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Railways) and the IRCON International Limited, for the year 2022-2023.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9264/17/23]

(ii) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Railways) and the Konkan Railway Corporation Limited (KRCL), for the year 2022-2023.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9266/17/23]

(iii) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Railways) and the Indian Railway Finance Corporation Limited (IRFCL), for the year 2022-2023.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9261/17/23]

- (iv) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Railways) and the Rail Vikas Nigam Limited (RVNL), for the year 2022-2023.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9265/17/23]

- (v) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Railways) and the Mumbai Railway Vikas Corporation Limited (MRVCL), for the year 2022-2023.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9262/17/23]

- (vi) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Railways) and the Braithwaite & Company Limited, for the year 2022-2023.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9268/17/23]

- (vii) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Railways) and the RailTel Corporation of India Limited, for the year 2022-2023.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9263/17/23]

- (viii) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Railways) and the RITES Limited, for the year 2022-2023.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9270/17/23]

- (ix) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Railways) and the Container Corporation of India Limited (CONCOR), for the year 2022-2023.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9269/17/23]

- (x) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Railways) and the Indian Railway Catering and Tourism Corporation Limited (IRCTCL), for the year 2022-2023.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9267/17/23]

#### **Notifications of the Ministry of Fisheries, Animal Husbandry and Dairying**

मत्स्यपालन, पशुपालन और डेयरी मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (डा. संजीव कुमार बालियान): महोदय, मैं पशुओं के प्रति क्रूरता का निवारण अधिनियम, 1960 की धारा 38क के अधीन मत्स्य

पालन, पशु पालन और डेयरी मंत्रालय (पशु पालन और दुग्ध उत्पादन विभाग) की निम्नलिखित अधिसूचनाओं की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-

- (1) G.S.R. 82 (E), dated the 6<sup>th</sup> February, 2023, publishing the Administrative (Committee for Control and Supervision of Experiments on Animals) Rules, 2023.
- (2) G.S.R. 139 (E), dated the 28<sup>th</sup> February, 2023, publishing the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (Egg Laying Hens) Rules, 2023.

[Placed in Library. For (1) and (2) See No.L.T.9355/17/23]

### **Report and Accounts (2021-22) of Pharmexcil, Hyderabad and related papers**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY (SHRIMATI ANUPRIYA SINGH PATEL): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (a) Eighteenth Annual Report and Accounts of the Pharmaceuticals Export Promotion Council of India, (Pharmexcil), Hyderabad, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Account.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Council.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9399/17/23]

### **Notifications of the Ministry of Electronics and Information Technology**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN): Sir, on behalf of my colleague, Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar, I lay on the Table a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Electronics and Information Technology, under Section 55 of the Aadhaar (Targeted Delivery of Financial and Other Subsidies Benefits and Services) Act, 2016:—

- (1) No. HQ-13011/2/2021-AUTH-II, dated the 27<sup>th</sup> February, 2023, publishing the Aadhaar (Authentication and Offline Verification) (Second Amendment) Regulations, 2023.

- (2) No. HQ-13062/4/2021-AUTH-II, dated the 27<sup>th</sup> February, 2023, publishing the Aadhaar (Pricing of Aadhaar Authentication Services) (First Amendment) Regulations, 2023.

[Placed in Library. For (1) and (2) See No.L.T.9250/17/23]

**Report and Accounts (2021-22) of NIPHM, Hyderabad and related papers**

**कृषि एवं किसान कल्याण मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री कैलाश चौधरी):** महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्रों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ :-

- (a) Annual Report of the National Institute of Plant Health Management, (NIPHM), Hyderabad, for the year 2021-22.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the National Institute of Plant Health Management, (NIPHM), Hyderabad, for the year 2021-22, and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above institute.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) and (b) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9562/17/23]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Smt. Darshana Vikram Jardosh. Not present.

**Reports and Accounts (2020-21 and 2021-22) of various NIDs and related papers**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY (SHRI SOM PARKASH): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute of Design (NID), Haryana, for the year 2020-21, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement giving reasons for delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9409/17/23]

- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute of Design (NID), Andhra Pradesh, for the year 2020-21, together with the Auditor's Report



on the Accounts.

- (b) Statement giving reasons for delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.
- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute of Design (NID), Andhra Pradesh, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement giving reasons for delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. For (ii) and (iii) See No.L.T.9410/17/23]

- (iv) (a) Sixty-first Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute of Design (NID), Ahmedabad, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement giving reasons for delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9408/17/23]

### **I. Notification of the Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare**

### **II. Report (2022-23) of ICAR, New Delhi and related papers**

**श्री कैलाश चौधरी:** महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्र सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (Department of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare) Notification No. G.S.R. 140 (E), dated the 28<sup>th</sup> February, 2023, publishing the Insecticides (First Amendment) Rules, 2023, under sub-section (3) of Section 36 of the Insecticides Act, 1968.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9364/17/23]

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (a) Annual Report of the Indian Council of Agricultural Research (ICAR), New Delhi, for the year 2022-23.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Council.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9365/17/23]

**Report and Accounts (2021-22) of IPPB, New Delhi and related papers**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATIONS (SHRI DEVUSINH CHAUHAN): Sir, I lay on the Table:-

(1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act, 2013:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the India Post Payments Bank (IPPB), New Delhi, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Company.

(2) Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9568/17/23]

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am requesting the Leader of the House to ensure that when issue arises of laying Papers on the Table of the House or attending parliamentary proceedings, the presence of those concerned must be invariably secured and, if there is any variation, the change be indicated.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL): Sir, I deeply regret that. We will make sure it is followed. Sir, the hon. Minister has come.

**I. Report and Accounts (2021-22) of JCI, Kolkata and related papers**

**II. Reports and Accounts (2021-22) of various Associations and related papers**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF TEXTILES (SHRIMATI DARSHANA VIKRAM JARDOSH): Sir, I lay on the Table—

I. (1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act, 2013:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Jute Corporation of India Limited, (JCI), Kolkata, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report

on the Accounts and the comments of Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.

(2) Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9403/17/23]

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

(i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Bombay Textile Research Association (BTRA), Mumbai, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Association.

(c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9563/17/23]

(ii) (a) Forty-second Annual Report and Accounts of the Man-Made Textiles Research Association (MANTRA), Surat, Gujarat, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

(b) Review by the Government on the working of the above Association.

(c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9564/17/23]

(iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Northern India Textile Research Association (NITRA), Ghaziabad, Uttar Pradesh, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Association.

(c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9565/17/23]

(iv) (a) Seventy-second Annual Report and Accounts of the Synthetic and Art Silk Mills' Research Association (SASMIRA), Mumbai, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Association.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9402/17/23]

- (v) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Jute Industries' Research Association (IJIRA), Kolkata, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Association.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9566/17/23]

- (vi) (a) Fifty-seventh Annual Report and Accounts of the Wool Research Association (WRA), Thane, Maharashtra, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Association.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9567/17/23]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let me tell you, hon. Members; whenever I have sought briefing from a Minister and got inputs from the hon. Members, Darshanaji has always been, absolutely, very well involved. I know you are taking...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, you should not be briefed by them.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I remember an anecdote; when a judge got tired of the long-winded submissions of a lawyer, he asked the lawyer, "Can't you argue in brief?" ...*(Interruptions)*... The lawyer went out ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL): Sir, we have apologised. I also express my regret, and she also said sorry.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I know, I know.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: But, sadly, they don't have a big heart. What can we do about it?

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, you should not be briefed by them; you should direct them.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Where is that humour, where is that wit, where is that sarcasm which we don't share? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, very much, we want to share that, but you are directing us; you are not being briefed by them or by anyone.

**श्री सभापति:** देरेक साहब...

*"ताकत अपने लफ़्ज़ों में डालो, आवाज़ में नहीं,  
क्योंकि फसल बारिश से उगती है, बाढ़ से नहीं।"*

I will translate for you later.

**विपक्ष के नेता (श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे):** सभापति जी, यह तो ठीक है। आप कह रहे हैं कि हम हंस नहीं रहे हैं, लेकिन जब ड्राउट होता है, तो हंसने का सवाल ही नहीं आता है।

**श्री सभापति:** खरगे जी, क्या होता है?

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे:** सर, जब सूखा पड़ता है, तो कौन हंसता है? पूरे हाउस में सूखा पड़ा हुआ है और कोई बात करने के लिए तैयार नहीं है।...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री पीयूष गोयल:** सर, सूखा पड़े या बाढ़ आए, वह तो विधाता के हाथ में है, हमारे हाथ में नहीं है। जब हमारे हाथ में कुछ चीज़ें होती हैं, तो कम-से-कम उनमें हम सूखा न पड़ने दें, उनमें तो बारिश आए।

**श्री सभापति:** माननीय सदस्यगण, ऐसा नहीं है कि मैं कोई शायर हूँ, लेकिन

*"इतना मत बोलो कि लोग चुप होने का इंतज़ार करें,  
इतना बोलकर चुप हो जाओ कि लोग दोबारा बोलने का इंतज़ार करें।"*

---

**MESSAGES FROM LOK SABHA**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Message from Lok Sabha, Secretary-General.

**The Appropriation Bill, 2023**

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Sir, I have to report to the House the following message received from the Lok Sabha, signed by the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha: “In accordance with the provisions of rule 96 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to enclose the Appropriation Bill, 2023, as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 23<sup>rd</sup> March, 2023.

The Speaker has certified that this Bill is a Money Bill within the meaning of article 110 of the Constitution of India.”

Sir, I lay a copy of the Bill on the Table.

---

**REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON COMMERCE**

SHRI DHANANJAY BHIMRAO MAHADIK (Maharashtra): Sir, I present the following Reports (in English and Hindi) of the Department Related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Commerce:-

- (i) 176<sup>th</sup> Report on action taken by Government on the recommendations/observations of the Committee contained in its One Hundred and Seventy Second Report on 'Promotion and Regulation of E-Commerce in India';
- (ii) 177<sup>th</sup> Report on action taken by Government on the recommendations/observations of the Committee contained in its One Hundred and Seventy First Report on 'Issues Affecting the Indian Tea Industry especially in Darjeeling Region';
- (iii) 178<sup>th</sup> Report on action taken by Government on the recommendations/observations of the Committee contained in its One Hundred and Seventieth Report on 'Implementation of Districts as Export Hubs (DEHs) including One District One Product (ODOP) Initiatives';

- (iv) 179<sup>th</sup> Report on Demands for Grants (2023-24) (Demand No. 10) of Department of Commerce, Ministry of Commerce and Industry; and
- (v) 180<sup>th</sup> Report on Demands for Grants (2023-24) (Demand No. 11) of Department for Promotion of Industry and Internal Trade, Ministry of Commerce and Industry.

---

**REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORT, TOURISM AND CULTURE**

**श्री जुगलसिंह लोखंडवाला** (गुजरात): महोदय, मैं विभाग संबंधित परिवहन, पर्यटन और संस्कृति संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति के निम्नलिखित प्रतिवेदन (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) प्रस्तुत करता हूँ:-

- (i) Three Hundred Forty Fourth Report on action taken by Government on the recommendations/observations of the Committee contained in its Three Hundred Thirteenth Report on 'Promotion of Indian Tourism in Overseas Markets – Role of Overseas Tourist Offices and Indian Embassies;
- (ii) Three Hundred Forty Fifth Report on action taken by Government on the recommendations/observations of the Committee contained in its Three Hundred Nineteenth Report on 'Progress made in implementation of Sagarmala Projects';
- (iii) Three Hundred Forty Sixth Report on action taken by Government on the recommendations/observations of the Committee contained in its Three Hundred Twenty Third Report on 'Commission of Railway Safety'; and
- (iv) Three Hundred Forty Seventh Report on action taken by Government on the recommendations/observations of the Committee contained in its Three Hundred Twenty Sixth Report on 'Role of Indian Missions Globally for the growth of Tourism in India'.

---

**STATEMENTS OF THE COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC UNDERTAKINGS**

**डा. अनिल जैन** (उत्तर प्रदेश): महोदय, मैं सरकारी उपक्रमों संबंधी समिति के निम्नलिखित की गई कार्रवाई संबंधी प्रतिवेदनों में अंतर्विष्ट समुक्तियों/सिफारिशों पर सरकार द्वारा की गई कार्रवाई को दर्शाने वाले विवरणों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-

- (i) 10<sup>th</sup> Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on action taken by Government on the observations/recommendations contained in its 1<sup>st</sup> Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Airports Authority of India (AAI)';
- (ii) 11<sup>th</sup> Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on action taken by Government on the observations/recommendations contained in its 2<sup>nd</sup> Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Central Coalfields Limited (CCL)';
- (iii) 12<sup>th</sup> Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on action taken by Government on the observations/recommendations contained in its 3<sup>rd</sup> Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Food Corporation of India (FCI)';
- (iv) 13<sup>th</sup> Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on action taken by Government on the observations/recommendations contained in its 8<sup>th</sup> Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'National Thermal Power Corporation (NTPC) Limited';
- (v) 14<sup>th</sup> Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on action taken by Government on the observations/recommendations contained in its 4<sup>th</sup> Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Hindustan Antibiotics Limited (HAL)'; and
- (vi) 15<sup>th</sup> Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on action taken by Government on the observations/recommendations contained in its 5<sup>th</sup> Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'NBCC (India) Limited'.

---

**REPORT OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AFFAIRS, FOOD AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION**

**श्री बाबू राम निषाद** (उत्तर प्रदेश): महोदय, मैं उपभोक्ता मामले, खाद्य और सार्वजनिक वितरण मंत्रालय (खाद्य और सार्वजनिक वितरण विभाग) की "गुणवत्ता नियंत्रण प्रकोष्ठ (क्यूसीसी)" विषय पर समिति के बीसवें प्रतिवेदन (सत्रहवीं लोक सभा) में अंतर्विष्ट समुक्तियों/सिफारिशों पर सरकार द्वारा की गई कार्रवाई के संबंध में विभाग संबंधित उपभोक्ता मामले, खाद्य और सार्वजनिक वितरण संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति (2022-23) के छब्बीसवें प्रतिवेदन की एक प्रति (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ।

---

**REPORTS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED CASTES  
AND SCHEDULED TRIBES**

**श्री कामाख्या प्रसाद तासा** (असम): महोदय, मैं अनुसूचित जातियों और अनुसूचित जनजातियों के कल्याण संबंधी समिति (2022-23) के निम्नलिखित प्रतिवेदनों की एक- एक एक प्रति (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-



- (i) Twenty-second Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Thirtieth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on "Examination of Annual Reports of National Commission for Scheduled Castes (NCSC) presented under Article 338(5)(d) of the Constitution of India and the measures that should be taken by the Union Government in respect of matters within the purview of the Government";
- (ii) Twenty-third Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on "Review of Functioning of National Scheduled Castes Finance and Development Corporation (NSFDC)"; and
- (iii) Twenty Fourth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Seventeenth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on "Role of autonomous bodies/educational Institutions including Central Universities, Engineering Colleges, IIMs, IITs, Medical Institutes etc. in socio-economic development of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes with special reference to pre-matric/post-matric scholarships in Navodaya Vidyalayas/ Kendriya Vidyalayas."

---

### STATEMENT BY MINISTER

#### **Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Twelfth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee On Water Resources**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF JAL SHAKTI (SHRI BISHWESWAR TUDU): Sir, I lay a Statement regarding Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Twelfth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Water Resources (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on "Flood Management in the country including International Water Treaties in the field of Water Resource management with particular reference to Treaty/Agreement entered into with China, Pakistan and Bhutan", pertaining to the Ministry of Jal Shakti.

---

**STATEMENT REGARDING GOVERNMENT BUSINESS**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN): With your permission, Sir, I rise to announce that Government Business for the remaining part of the 259<sup>th</sup> Session of Rajya Sabha will consist of:

1. Consideration of any item of Government Business carried over from today's Order Paper:- [it contains - (i) Further discussion on the working of the Ministry of Skill Development and Entrepreneurship; (ii) Discussion on the working of the Ministry of Textiles; (iii) Discussion on the working of the Ministry of Fisheries, Animal Husbandry and Dairying; (iv) Discussion on the working of the Ministry of Rural Development; (v) Discussion on the working of the Ministry of Cooperation; and (vi) Discussion on the working of the Ministry of Railways.]
2. Discussion on the working of the Ministry of New and Renewable Energy.
3. General Discussion on the Budget of Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir for 2023-24.
4. Consideration and return of the Appropriation Bills relating to following Demands, *as passed by Lok Sabha*:-
  - (i) Demands for Grants for the Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir for the financial year 2023-24 from 1<sup>st</sup> April, 2023 to 31<sup>st</sup> March, 2024; and
  - (ii) Supplementary Demands for Grants for the Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir for the financial year 2022-23 from 1<sup>st</sup> April, 2022 to 31<sup>st</sup> March, 2023.
5. Consideration and return of the Appropriation Bill relating to Second and Final Batch of Supplementary Demands for Grants for 2022-23, *as passed by Lok Sabha*.
6. Consideration and return of the Appropriation Bill, 2023, *as passed by Lok Sabha*.

7. Consideration and return of the Finance Bill, 2023, *after it is passed by Lok Sabha.*
8. Consideration and passing of the following Bills, *as passed by Lok Sabha:-*
  - (i) The Constitution (Scheduled Tribes) Order (Third Amendment) Bill, 2022; and
  - (ii) The Constitution (Scheduled Tribes) Order (Fifth Amendment) Bill, 2022.
9. Consideration and passing of the following Bills, *after they are passed by Lok Sabha:-*
  - (i) The Repealing and Amending Bill, 2022;
  - (ii) The Competition (Amendment) Bill, 2022; and
  - (iii) The Biological Diversity (Amendment) Bill, 2022.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I have received 14 notices under Rule 267 for suspension of rules. Shri Kumar Ketkar and Shri Syed Nasir Hussain seek to discuss the need to constitute a JPC to investigate the charges of corporate fraud, political corruption, stock market manipulation and financial mismanagement against Adani Group. Shri Pramod Tiwari seeks to discuss the Government's failure to constitute a JPC to investigate the charges of corporate fraud, political corruption, stock market manipulation, financial mismanagement and allegations made by Hindenburg Report against Adani Group. Shrimati Ranjeet Ranjan and Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham seek to discuss the Government's role in promoting business interest of Adani Group, including through inaction on serious charges of corporate fraud, political corruption, stock market manipulation, financial mismanagement, illegal coal mine allocation, amending rules and regulations to allow bidding of six airports. Shri K.C. Venugopal seeks to discuss the silence of the Government on the serious charges including fraud, stock market manipulation and corruption levelled against the Adani Group, further promoting business interest of the Adani Group through negotiation with foreign countries from big budget projects and more. Dr. Ameer Yajnik seeks to discuss the Government's failure in constituting a JPC to investigate serious charges of corporate fraud, political corruption, stock market manipulation, financial mismanagement against Adani Group, and Government's questionable role in promoting business. Similar notice has been given by Shri Neeraj Dangi also. Shri Abdul Wahab seeks to discuss the issue of Adani Group corruption, stock market

manipulation and financial mismanagement. Shri Sanjay Singh seeks to discuss the allotment of coal mines to Adani Group in violation of the Supreme Court orders and rules of Government of India which has resulted in loss of lakhs of crores of rupees to the revenue and the fraud committed through shell companies opened in Mauritius. Shri Raghav Chadha seeks to discuss the withdrawal of red corner notice issued by Interpol in the name of fugitive economic offender, Mehul Choksi, who is involved in a fraud of Rs.13,500 crores on account of Indian Government's failure to put a strong case before Interpol and inability of Government in extraditing Mehul Choksi.

SHRI RAGHAV CHADHA (Punjab): Sir, you can start a new precedent by allowing me. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You already occupy enough space in social media. This may be a day of silence for you.

Shri Elamaram Kareem demands to suspend Rules 23, 24 and 38 to discuss the allegations levelled by Hindenburg Research against Adani Group and the need to constitute a JPC to investigate the same. Shri Binoy Viswam seeks to discuss Adani-related scam and the necessity to entrust a JPC to make a probe in order to alleviate the clouds that have loomed over the politics and economics of the country. Shri Sandosh Kumar P seeks to discuss the failure of the Government to constitute a JPC to probe into allegations of stock market manipulation and accounting fraud against Adani Group as revealed by Hindenburg Research Report. Hon. Members, I had indicated on the last occasion also. There has been part compliance of Rule 267. I can assure you that as and when there will be notice fully compliant with the requirement of Rule 267, it will, for sure, receive my earnest consideration and a deliberated response. In this situation, I am helpless and cannot accede to the request. ...*(Interruptions)*... The House is in disorder. ...*(Interruptions)*... The House is in disorder on both sides. ...*(Interruptions)*... The House stands adjourned to meet at 2.30 p.m. today. ...*(Interruptions)*...

*The House then adjourned at twenty minutes past eleven of the clock.*

---

*The House reassembled at thirty minutes past two of the clock,*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

**PRIVATE MEMBERS' RESOLUTION**

**\*Need to implement the recommendations of Sachar Committee report and other reports and take various measures to remove social and educational backwardness of Muslims - *Contd.***

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Further discussion on the Resolution regarding need to implement the recommendations of the Sachar Committee, help Madrasas to modernize, and enact legislation for Prevention of Atrocities Act against Minorities moved by Shri Abdul Wahab on 10<sup>th</sup> February. माननीय ए.ए. रहीमा ...(व्यवधान)... माननीय ए.ए. रहीमा ...(व्यवधान)... Hon. Members, please allow the discussion to continue. ...(Interruptions)... Since the House is in disorder, the House stands adjourned till 3.30 p.m. today.

*The House then adjourned at thirty-one minutes past two of the clock.*

---

*The House reassembled at thirty minutes past three of the clock,*

MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

**MESSAGES FROM LOK SABHA - *Contd.***

MR. CHAIRMAN: Message from the Lok Sabha.

**The Finance Bill, 2023**

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Sir, I have to report to the House the following message received from the Lok Sabha, signed by the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha:-

"In accordance with the provisions of rule 96 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to enclose the Finance Bill, 2023, as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 24<sup>th</sup> March, 2023.

---

\* Further discussion on the Resolution moved on 10.02.2023 continued.

2. The Speaker has certified that this Bill is a Money Bill within the meaning of article 110 of the Constitution of India."

Sir, I lay a copy of the Bill on the Table.

---

**PRIVATE MEMBERS' RESOLUTION - Contd.**

**\*Need to implement the recommendations of Sachar Committee report and other reports and take various measures to remove social and educational backwardness of Muslims**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Private Members' Resolution No.1. Further Discussion on the Resolution regarding need to implement the recommendation of Sachar Committee Report, help Madaras to modernize and enact a legislation for prevention of atrocities against minorities moved by Shri Abdul Wahab on the 10<sup>th</sup> February, 2023. Shri A.A. Rahim. He is not present. Shri Ajay Pratap Singh.

**श्री अजय प्रताप सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश):** माननीय सभापति महोदय, यह जो प्राइवेट मेम्बर्स बिल माननीय श्री अब्दुल वहाब जी ने प्रस्तुत किया है, यह सच्चर कमिटी और रंगनाथ मिश्र कमिटी के संदर्भ में है और मैं इस बिल के विरोध में हूँ। मेरे इस बिल के विरोध में होने के कई कारण हैं, जिनमें से कुछ कारणों का मैं जिक्र करना चाहता हूँ।

महोदय, सच्चर कमिटी का जो गठन है, सर्वप्रथम उस गठन को ही न्यायालय में चैलेंज किया गया है। जिस कमिटी की वैधानिकता पर ही प्रश्नचिह्न लगा हुआ है, उस कमिटी की रिपोर्ट को लागू करना किसी भी दृष्टि से न्यायोचित नहीं है। सच्चर कमिटी ने अपनी रिपोर्ट में जो बातें कही हैं, जो सिफारिशें दी हैं, वह बहुत पुराना एजेंडा है। अपनी रिपोर्ट में जो बातें उन्होंने कही हैं, वे इसलिए भी मानने योग्य नहीं हैं, चूंकि हमारे यहां एक कहावत है, 'दूध का जला छाछ भी फूँक-फूँक कर पीता है'। हिन्दुस्तान जला हुआ है।

सच्चर कमिटी ने जिन बातों की सिफारिशें की हैं, उन्हीं विषयों को लेकर 1947 में हिन्दुस्तान का विभाजन हुआ था, इसलिए सच्चर कमिटी की रिपोर्ट में जो सिफारिशें हैं, वे बिल्कुल भी मानने योग्य नहीं हैं। उन्होंने मुसलमानों के शैक्षणिक आधार पर पिछड़े वर्ग का मुद्दा उठाया है, साथ ही उच्च शिक्षा और माध्यमिक शिक्षा में उनकी जो उपस्थिति है, उस उपस्थिति की कमी की ओर भी इशारा किया है। महिलाओं के संदर्भ में भी उन्होंने कुछ बातें कही हैं। वे सारी बातें ऐसी हैं, जिनके लिए जिस सरकार ने इस कमिटी का गठन किया था, वह सरकार ही दोषी है। केवल मुसलमानों के संदर्भ में उनकी हमेशा से जो वोट बैंक बनाने की पॉलिसी रही है, उसी

---

\* Further discussion on the Resolution moved on 10.02.2023 continued.

पॉलिसी के अंतर्गत इस काम को भी किया गया था। ईमानदारी से न तो वे मुसलमानों का विकास करना चाहते हैं और न ही कल्याण चाहते हैं, इसलिए यह जो बिल आया है, मैं इसका विरोध करता हूँ और अपनी बात समाप्त करता हूँ, बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Ameer Yajnik. She is not present. The Minister may now make her intervention.

THE MINISTER OF MINORITY AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI): Sir, I stand today to speak on a Resolution that seeks to cast aspersions on citizens and the Constitution alike. Through this Resolution, an aspersion has been cast on one of the holiest of books for us as citizens, not just as Members of both Houses of Parliament, that our nation at large seeks to divide people on the basis of religion and deny access to a better life in the present and in the future to those who belong to the minority community.

Sir, for me this Resolution, which casts an aspersion of inequality, which casts an aspersion and, in fact, reduces it to a slur on the basis of religion, is a Resolution, which, I hope, this House unanimously rejects.

Sir, the Resolution says that women in the Muslim community are not given an equal opportunity to get educated. Sir, through your kind self, I would like to highlight here that after three decades, India now has a new National Education Policy. I had the greatest of privileges to help bring about the foundational document of the National Education Policy. Through this House, I wish to give my gratitude to the hon. Prime Minister of India, who then directed that let not a policy be written, which will determine the future of India, by only a few in the corridor of power in the national capital. For the first time, Sir, to ensure that the National Education Policy comes to life, the Government of India went to every Village Education Council in our country. The Government of India reached out to every district and to every educational institution which included districts, blocks, village panchayats which comprised our minority community. Through that resolution and their inputs in the National Education Policy, for the first time, comes the gender inclusion fund which looks at the possibility of enhancing infrastructure for women and their academic needs. Sir, today, I can say that the new National Education Policy looks after the needs of academics and women, academics and young children. The fact is that this Government institutionalized the first ever Ministry of Skill Development. This Government also addresses the needs for skilling for a new India. A new India that is envisaged cannot be broken down on the basis of religion. And that is why, Sir, through you, I would request the entire House to unanimously reject this Resolution

so that we, who build the new India under the leadership of the hon. Prime Minister with the support of every citizen, can build it on issues of inclusion, on issues of equity and equality. Thank you, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Abdul Wahab to reply to the discussion; not present. I shall now put the Resolution to vote.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Private Members' Resolution No.2. Shri Shaktisinh Gohil to move a Resolution, urging the Government to provide all amenities for our soldiers and resolves to stand shoulder to shoulder with the soldiers of our country against the enemies of our country. Shri Shaktisinh Gohil; not present. Resolution is not moved; Resolution lapses. Private Members' Resolution No.3. Shri Vivek K. Tankha to move a Resolution, urging the Government, *inter alia*, to make suitable changes in the relevant rules for employees of Central Government/PSUs/Autonomous Bodies/Constitutional Bodies to avail 'Entrepreneurship leave' in order to pursue their entrepreneurial idea, for granting seed fund, incubation and other resources to the start-ups initiated by its employees and to make provisions for the parent organisation of the employee to hold equity in the start-up ventured by the employee. Shri Vivek K. Tankha; not present. Resolution is not moved; Resolution lapses.

Private Members' Resolution No. 4. Shri A.A. Rahim to move a Resolution urging the Government *inter-alia* to bring a legislation for setting up an Urban Employment Guarantee Scheme to cover all cities, to address the issue of migration, expand the public education, public healthcare, Public Distribution System and housing facilities, to ensure decent living conditions to migrants. Shri A.A. Rahim, not present. Resolution is not moved, Resolution lapses.

Private Members' Resolution No. 5. Dr. V. Sivadasan to move a Resolution urging the Government *inter-alia* to initiate steps to ensure that appropriate monitoring mechanisms are in place to protect the IT and ITeS employees by proper implementation of labour laws, establish institutional mechanisms to ensure strict monitoring of the observance of labour laws and take immediate steps to assist workers who are fighting for their legitimate rights. Dr. V. Sivadasan, not present. Resolution is not moved, Resolution lapses.

Private Members' Resolution No. 6. Shri Sushil Kumar Modi to move a Resolution urging the Government *inter-alia* to formulate a national menstrual leave policy for women and girls in educational institutions and workplaces, to encourage a



flexible working environment, generate sensitization towards menstruation, ensure access of women and girls to menstrual health products at their working space and to coordinate with the State Governments in this regard. Shri Sushil Kumar Modi, not present. Resolution is not moved, Resolution lapses.

---

### **OBSERVATION BY THE CHAIR**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, it is unwholesome state of affairs that we, in this temple of democracy, are facing a situation where dialogue, debate, discussion and deliberation is not taking place. It was great pain for me when there was the debate on the Address of the hon. President. In the Business Advisory Committee, the Members of the Committee persuaded me to earmark twelve hours. We could not utilize that. That was a valuable occasion for every section of the House to ventilate issues that are germane to public interest. Howsoever severe may be the differences, howsoever divisive may be the approach, howsoever conflicting points of view may be there, this House is called upon to rationalize them. This House is meant to ensure that on issues of national import, howsoever critical they may be, shorn of tempers, a resolution takes place here. The country is watching us. The world that is appreciating Indian democracy as never before is also looking at us. I would expect hon. Members of the House to introspect, reflect and as a way forward instance take this theatre as the main determining place for course of events.

Emotive outburst is a political weapon on which I have nothing to say. But, this is a place where in sobriety, in composed atmosphere, we have seen evolution of our Constitution. I reminded the hon. Members earlier that for three years, the Constituent Assembly Members met. They faced severe issues, contentious issues and divisive issues but there was never an occasion for them to generate disturbance in the House, disorder in the House, not to speak of ever going to the Well, shouting slogans or using placards. This place is not meant for political theatrics. That may be outside. This place is meant for resolution in larger public interest of the issues that face the nation because it is here that a Member has a right, not available to more than 130 crore people. Right of Expression here has an immunity cover from any civil and criminal prosecution. One cannot have a greater right to say anywhere else other than the Parliament where you are, of course, accountable, but you can make your point. If we do not use parliamentary theatres to voice public interest issues, the vacuum may be filled otherwise and that does not augur well for democracy. I am sure; there will be thinking people in the country who will generate a climate and

ecosystem, to persuade our Members of Parliament that they must take their job seriously in national public interest and participate in the proceedings. I am sure; there will be deep-thinking by everyone including Members of the House.

Hon. Members, in a helpless condition, when Friday's List of Business provides time to Private Members' Resolution from 2.30 p.m. onwards up to 5.00 p.m. that could not be taken up. I have seen hon. Members being extremely concerned with Private Members' day. They look forward to it. It allows them a rare platform to put across their points of view on which a debate takes place in a structured manner and the Government is called upon to respond. That being the situation, the House stands adjourned to meet on Monday, at 11.00 a.m., March 27, 2023.

*The House then adjourned at forty-nine minutes past three of the clock till eleven of the clock on Monday, the 27<sup>th</sup> March, 2023.*

