

Vol. 259  
No. 12



Tuesday,  
14<sup>th</sup> March, 2023  
23 Phalguna, 1944 (Saka)

PARLIAMENTARY DEBATES

# RAJYA SABHA

OFFICIAL REPORT (FLOOR VERSION)

(PART-II)

CONTENTS

Felicitations by the Chair (pages 1 - 17)

Papers Laid on the Table (pages 17 - 22)

Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Agriculture,  
Animal Husbandry and Food Processing - *Laid on the Table* (page 23)

Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Social  
Justice and Empowerment - *Laid on the Table* (pages 23 - 24)

Motion for Election to the Post-Graduate Institute of Medical Education and Research  
(PGIMER), Chandigarh - Adopted (page 24)

Recommendations of the Business Advisory Committee (pages 24 - 25)

©

RAJYA SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI

Regarding notices received under Rule 267 and various other matters (pages 25 - 28)

Supplementary Demands for Grants, 2022-23 - *Laid on the Table* (page 29)

Supplementary Demands for Grants of Union Territory of Jammu and Kashmir, 2022-23 - Laid on the Table (page 29)

Budget of Union territory of Jammu and Kashmir, 2023-2024 - Laid on the Table (page 29)

Regarding Privilege notice and various other issues (pages 30 - 34)

*[Answers to Starred and Un-starred Questions (Both in English and Hindi) are available as Part – I to this Debate, published electronically on the Rajya Sabha website under the link <https://rajyasabha.nic.in/Debates/OfficialDebatesDateWise>]*

Website : <http://rajyasabha.nic.in>  
<http://parliamentofindia.nic.in>  
E-mail : [rsedit-e@sansad.nic.in](mailto:rsedit-e@sansad.nic.in)

## RAJYA SABHA

Tuesday, the 14<sup>th</sup> March, 2023 / 23 Phalguna, 1944 (Saka)

*The House met at eleven of the clock,*

MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

### FELICITATIONS BY THE CHAIR

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, the 95<sup>th</sup> Academy Award function at Los Angeles was a moment of glory for us. ‘The Elephant Whisperers’, Ms. Kartiki Gonsalves’ debut film, won the Best Documentary Short Film Oscar and the song “*Naatu Naatu*”, composed by Shri M.M. Keeravaani with the lyrics by Shri Chandrabose from Shri S.S. Rajamouli’s film ‘RRR’ won the Oscar Best Original Song.

Hon. Members, the wins for ‘The Elephant Whisperers’ and ‘RRR’ mark a new recognition of full spectrum of cinema that India produces. This will further the internationalisation of India’s film industry. These achievements also reflect global appreciation of vast talent, immense creativity and committed dedication of Indian artists, indeed another facet of our global rise and recognition.

On my own behalf and on behalf of this august House, I congratulate the entire team of artists, everyone associated with this positive venture, ‘The Elephant Whisperers’ and the movie ‘RRR’ for the well-earned recognition. Now, the Leader of the House.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka): No, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI SHAKTISINH GOHIL (Gujarat): No, Sir....*(Interruptions)*..

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will allow you too.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL): Mr. Chairman, Sir, it is also very interesting ...*(Interruptions)*..

MR. CHAIRMAN: One second. ...*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Only on this point, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*.. On the award, Sir...*(Interruptions)*..

MR. CHAIRMAN: One second. ..(*Interruptions*)...Shaktisinhji, your smile is full of *shakti*, captivating.

Hon. Members, there are some occasions when we must be only in one mode and that is the mode of happiness and appreciation. It is an occasion where I would plead with the hon. Members, I will give you some time to reflect. Please confine yourselves only to paying our tribute on these great achievements. Do not digress. Now, the Leader of the House. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, what I was trying to do, I wanted to share with the House that this 'The Elephant Whisperers' has been made by two women of eminence.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. It is significant.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: It is about gender. It is a respect for our women of India that both ladies associated with 'The Elephant Whisperers' are eminent women, and it is a great mark of recognition for India's women that 'The Elephant Whisperers' has got. ....(*Interruptions*)...

One more thing. It is about sustainability, and it also shows that the world today is recognizing that sustainability has become core to our philosophy. ....(*Interruptions*)...

And, finally, Sir, 'RRR', the script-writer, is an hon. Member of Parliament, Mr. V.V. Prasad. I think, we all owe a debt of gratitude to acknowledge Mr. V.V. Prasad's contribution. ....(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One second. ....(*Interruptions*)... Hon. Members, I am so happy that Leader of the House has confined only to the issue. I will now call upon the Leader of the Opposition, and, Khargeji, I am told by the Leader of the House that the script-writer is our Member. ....(*Interruptions*)... We need to congratulate him. He is a Member of the House of Elders, the Upper House. Hon. Leader of the Opposition.

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA (Chhattisgarh): Sir, is he here? ....(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Rajeevji, 'presence' is always impactful. Sometimes, 'absence' is equally impactful. Hon. Leader of the Opposition.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE): Sir, I also join to congratulate both the awardees. Particularly, first time, such an award is given to

'Naatu Naatu' and also to 'The Elephant Whisperers.' Both of them come from South India. It is a great pride for us. We are very proud and whatever you have told, we are with you. But my only request is that the Ruling Party should not take credit that 'we have directed it, we have written the poem.' ....(Interruptions)... 'Modiji has directed this film; they should not say that.' ....(Interruptions)... That is my only request. ....(Interruptions)... It is the contribution of the country. ....(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, please don't expunge his remarks. ....(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Well, I have had the occasion, hon. Members, this morning to read several newspapers, and there is extensive coverage. It was very enlightening and it is a shift; it is a recognition, we must all take pride. After all, we are proud Indians, take pride ... ....(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, in 1984, we won an Oscar... ....(Interruptions)...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, in 1984, it was not an ... ....(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One second. ....(Interruptions)... One second. ....(Interruptions)... Let Mr. Jairam Ramesh speak. ....(Interruptions)... One second. ....(Interruptions)... Mr. Jairam Ramesh, confine to this issue and say a few words. ....(Interruptions)...

SHRI P. BHATTACHARYA (West Bengal): Sir, this is not a subject of debate. Make it very clear. ....(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Jairamji, what do you want to say? ....(Interruptions)... Have you to say anything on this point? ....(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, this is an occasion for collective celebration, not for narrow partisan points scoring like the Leader of the House is doing. ....(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are being unfair. He was not partisan. And the Leader of the Opposition had elevated it to a very high level. We all must enjoy it, relish it. Would any other Member of the House like to reflect before I give the floor to Dr. Amar Patnaik? ....(Interruptions)...

श्री राजीव शुक्ला : सर, जया बच्चन जी को बोलना है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, Madam. And mind you, hon. Members, we have one of the greatest artists as Member of the Upper House and a global authority who can reflect on our great achievement. She herself has to her credit inspirational contributions. Madam Jaya Bachchan, on this.

SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, I am so happy and I am so glad that we are discussing the most important ambassadors of this country, the film folks. It does not matter whether they are from the North, East, South or West. They are Indians. I am so happy that while thanking the President, I did mention this point in my speech and I feel vindicated today. I stand here with pride and with dignity for my film fraternity who have represented this country a number of times and have won a number of awards, starting from Shri Satyajit Ray and others. I also want to contribute and say that I know Mr. Rajamouli very well. नीरज जी, आप क्यों बीच-बीच में इतना जोर-जोर से बोलते हैं? ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, Ma'am.

SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN: The writer is not only the script writer but the story writer as well. He is a Member of this House and it is a great honour. There have been many, many such people from the creative world who have been Nominated to this House, पहले भी और आज भी। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, यह क्रॉनिक डिज़ीज़ होता जा रहा है। ...(व्यवधान)... यह देखिए! ...(व्यवधान)... आवाज़ हमारे पास भी है, हम भी बोल सकते हैं, मगर जब कोई सभ्यता की बात होती है, तो असभ्य व्यवहार मत करिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : मैडम, आपकी आवाज़ नहीं है, बुलंद आवाज़ है। You have the distinction of belonging to a family that has a terrific DNA for creativity in the film industry.

SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN: Sir, I thank you for your kind words.

मैं यह कहना चाहती हूँ कि यह शुरुआत है। मैं भारत देश की जनता को धन्यवाद देना चाहती हूँ कि उनकी खातिर विदेश के लोग आज हमारी जनता को रिकोगनाइज़ कर रहे हैं। The market of cinema is here. It is not in America. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Amar Patnaik.

DR. AMAR PATNAIK (Odisha): Sir, while I join the House in complimenting this tremendous achievement that both the films have achieved, there are a couple of things which come out and which have to be noted. In 'The Elephant Whisperers' the kind of relationship that human beings have with nature, with the animal world, has been depicted very beautifully. I think that is a part of the Indian ethos, Indian culture and that is what we have communicated to the world. I think we must appreciate this particular fact. The second thing is that this movie came from the OTT platform. That basically means that the way we are going ahead, India is going ahead, in digitalization, in using digital platforms in creativity, is something that needs to be commended and noticed as well. As I read in the newspapers, the two characters in that movie still do not know the entire ramification of the fact that they won the Oscar. They have been given a new orphaned elephant to rear up. They have left the two that are already there.

Sir, this is a tremendous achievement and this is a celebration of the fact that we Indians can show to the world the sustainable way of living in this world. As for the song, I think it has caught the imagination of all sections of the society. As Madam Jaya Bachchanji said, this is creativity at its peak, being recognized globally, and I think we must all be very happy about it. We must celebrate it and we must compliment all the people involved and also those who are probably lurking somewhere, whom we must promote, so that we occupy the central place in the comity of nations. Thank you, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We have another distinguished artist, Dr. Sonal Mansingh.

**डा. सोनल मानसिंह (नाम-निर्देशित) :** धन्यवाद, सर। मैं दो बातें कहना चाहती हूँ।

पहली बात, सबके साथ, सबकी आवाज़ों के साथ मेरी भी आवाज़ आज के परफॉर्मिंग जगत से, नृत्य, संगीत के जगत से जा रही है - बहुत अभिनंदन, बहुत बधाई और धन्यवाद के साथ। मुझे इस बात को कहते हुए भी आनन्द है कि जो 'नाटू-नाटू' शब्द है, उसके बारे में यह चर्चा चली कि यह शब्द कहाँ से आया, तो कहते हैं कि यह शब्द 'नट' से आया, नटराज नृत्य से आया और यह नृत्य सबने देखा। अब पूरी दुनिया इस पर नाच रही है, यह हमारे लिए बहुत ही हर्ष की बात है।

सर, दूसरी बात यह है कि 'दि एलिफेंट व्हिस्पर्स' डॉक्यूमेंटरी को भी अवॉर्ड मिला है। मैं कहना चाहती हूँ कि गणेश जी हमारे आराध्य देव हैं, प्रथमेश हैं और हमारे लिए हाथी, हस्ती अत्यंत पूजनीय हैं, तो एक तरीके से उनको भी आदर दिया गया है, सम्मान दिया गया है। हम सबको इसके बारे में भी बहुत हर्ष होना चाहिए कि हमारे दोनों जो परम पूजनीय नटराज जी और गणेश जी हैं, उनका भी इसमें जिक्र है और इस बात को हम याद रखें। एक बार फिर से बधाई!

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Prashanta Nanda, another hon. Member from the industry.

DR. PRASHANTA NANDA (Odisha): Mr. Chairman, Sir, it is a great moment and a proud moment for our country. I am feeling so happy that I cannot express it. I have spent all my life making films. For sixty years, I have been making films. I have also got national and international awards, but this Oscar Award for a film on OTT platform is beyond my imagination. I hope that all Indians should feel proud. This is our day. Thank you very much.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members ....(Interruptions)...

**श्रीमती जया बच्चन** : सर, अगर ऑस्कर कभी परफॉर्मेंस की रिकोग्निशन को मिलेगा तो वह पार्लियामेंट के किसी मेम्बर को मिलेगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I feel the absence of legal giants who perform in Court. I wish they were also here to share our joy today. They are the members of my fraternity and the senior advocates. Now Dr. Santanu Sen; he is elegantly dressed.

DR. SANTANU SEN (West Bengal): Sir, I sincerely congratulate them. Definitely, it is a matter of great pride. It is an honour for the entire country. I sincerely endorse the statement made by our learned Member, Shrimati Jaya Bachchan that it is not the north or west or south or east, it is an achievement of our country at large. Thank you.

DR. JOHN BRITTAS (Kerala): Sir, it is a matter of great pride that we have won the Oscar. Many hon. Members were commenting about the OTT revolution that is happening in this country. It is a platform for national integration. Whenever we go to any place, people talk about Malayalam movies, Tamil movies or Telugu movies. There is another aspect which I would expect the Government to consider. Despite the fact that there is a lot of talk and discussion about the Indian movies, the contribution of media and entertainment industry to the GDP is less than one per cent as compared to other nations where it is more than four per cent. Also, there is a growing concern that a lot of offended people are growing in the country and a lot of censor cuts are happening to the movies. I would ensure that the House should be obviously together to ....(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay, John Brittasji; it is a moment of joy. ....(Interruptions)...



SHRI G.V.L. NARASIMHA RAO (Uttar Pradesh): Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Sir, for the opportunity. It is truly a moment of glory for the Indian cinema. The Director of this movie, Shri Rajamouli, is also a Director of Bahubali movie, which is another international success. Shri V. Vijayendra Prasad, a Nominated Member of this House, is also the story writer for Bahubali, apart from this movie. So, this is not a lone success. Shri V. Vijayendra Prasad, who is not here in the House now, is also a story writer of another successful movie 'Bajrangi Bhaijaan' and several other major hits. 'RRR' is a patriotic film; it is a film against colonialism and it also truly celebrates India's struggle for Independence. Apart from being an Indian, I think, it is a great moment of pride for all Telugus because the original film is Telugu and the song 'Naatu Naatu' is a Telugu song. So, I would like to add that additional moment of glory to this occasion. Thank you, Sir.

**श्री राजीव शुक्ला:** सर, सबसे पहले मैं आपको धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ कि आपने एक नई तरह की परम्परा शुरू की है। मुझे लगता है कि इस तरह की उपलब्धियों को सदन में डिस्कस करके उन कलाकारों को बधाई देना एक नया कार्य है और इसकी जितनी सराहना की जाए, उतनी कम है। जैसा कि जया जी ने कहा, मैं इस बात से पूरी तरह सहमत हूँ कि भारतीय सिनेमा जगत दक्षिण से लेकर उत्तर तक, जिस तरह से विश्व में बढ़ रहा है, वह दिन दूर नहीं है, जब भारतीय सिनेमा हॉलीवुड को पीछे छोड़ देगा। इसलिए इन सबको बधाई देते हुए मैं इस सदन के माध्यम से यह अपील करना चाहता हूँ कि जिस दिन ऑस्कर अवार्ड की ज्यूरी में भारतीय कलाकार और भारतीय लेखक होंगे, उस दिन शायद हमें सबसे ज्यादा प्रसन्नता होगी।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Prakash Javadekar. We will have three more speakers on this point and then come to the Agenda.

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR (Maharashtra): Mr. Chairman, Sir, the whole House is very happy and the whole country is happy for both the reasons. I will first talk about the documentary, 'The Elephant Whisperers'. This elephant, as Sonalji said, is our deity also. And, more importantly, we have more than 30,000 elephants in our country and we are, probably, the only country which worships trees, animals and nature. So, these are the ethos of our country - living in harmony with nature.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Great. Thank you. Now, Mr. Vaiko.

SHRI VAIKO (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Chairman, Sir, this is the happiest occasion. After a long time, we all join together in complimenting the composer and the singer of RRR

film. But, previously also, Mr. A.R. Rahman got the same award for his composition 'Vande Mataram'

MR. CHAIRMAN: It was 'Jai Ho'.

SHRI VAIKO: Yes, 'Jai Ho'. So, we are proud as this is the second time for music for Tamil Nadu. Therefore, I also wanted to recall what Music Director Mr. A.R. Rahman established and achieved. Thank you, Sir.

**श्री सभापति** : यदि मैं वकील नहीं बनता, तो कहीं न कहीं एक्टिंग जरूर करता। Now, Dr. M. Thambidurai.

**श्री मुकुल बालकृष्ण वासनिक** (राजस्थान): यदि आप यहां न होते तो हो सकता है कि जो भावनाएं आज हम यहां व्यक्त कर रहे हैं, आपके प्रति भी इसी तरह की भावनाएं हम व्यक्त कर रहे होते।

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I also join all my colleagues in appreciating and congratulating the awardees who got the Oscars. I would like to specially mention that the award-winning documentary 'The Elephant Whisperers' has been produced and shot in Tamil Nadu, in Ooty area. I am very proud of that. There is so much nature that we have in Tamil Nadu. This documentary has shown the Nilgiri Hills. Apart from that, the song from the movie RRR is a good song. We appreciate that and it is a credit given to our country.

I would like to say that the great leaders from our AIADMK Party, MGR and Jayalalithaaji, were also film actors. You know it very well. They are very popular. This movie talks about Dravidian movement. ....(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you, hon. Member.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI (Tamil Nadu): Therefore, we are very thankful for giving us an opportunity to appreciate this achievement. Thank you, Sir.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY (West Bengal): Sir, thank you for excluding me.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, Sukhenduji, I can't exclude you. अपना रिश्ता बहुत पुराना और गहरा है। Please take the floor. ....(Interruptions)... I would request Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray to take the floor.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: Sorry, Sir, I cannot speak.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take the floor.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: I cannot speak.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sukhenduji, we are discussing a very pleasant subject. What happened was that just when I took your name, I had indicated Dr. Sen, your colleague. I thought I must yield in favour of the black as compared to white at the moment. So, I am sure, you will take note of my special request and make your contribution. You come from a State that has a rich culture and has made significant contribution in the field. सुखेन्दु जी, आप में और हममें नाराज़गी का रिश्ता नहीं हो सकता है।

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: Sir, I would just like to remind you that as per the normal procedure of the House, firstly, the Leader of the House, then the Leader of the Opposition, then the leaders of the various political parties -- and, as it is a special occasion, then, obviously, the Members of the Parliament who are, by profession, performing artists -- should get the chance to speak. Anyway, it was not maintained. With this rider, I would like to submit before you that whatever has been stated by my hon. colleagues, I share their views, but, through you, I would like to request Shri Bhupender Yadav, the hon. Minister of Environment, Forest and Climate Change for organizing special film shows, particularly of the Elephant Whisperers, for the children, for the school-going boys and girls because day in and day out, the elephants are being killed by speedy trains and poachers. If we organize these shows, it will have a positive thought in the minds of our children. Thank you, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is a very constructive suggestion. Shri C.M. Ramesh.

DR. C.M. RAMESH (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, as it mainly concerns the Telugu film industry, kindly allow me to speak in Telugu. \* "Sir, the Telugu film industry has won an Oscar Award and is now winning accolades from the entire world. I congratulate music composer, Shri Keeravani, lyricist, Shri Chandrabose, director, Shri Rajamouli, actors, Shri Jr. N. T. Rama Rao & Shri Ram Charan and also the entire team associated with the song. If the House permits, I request your good self to permit this august House to felicitate the entire team after they return to India. Shri V. Vijayendra

---

\* English translation of the original speech delivered in Telugu.

Prasad is a Nominated Member of this august House. I thank the hon. Prime Minister for his foresight in recommending such eminent people to the Nominated Members list. Sir, Telugu people are feeling proud and elated with this success. Thank You."

**श्रीमती रंजीत रंजन (छत्तीसगढ़) :** सभापति महोदय, मैं सबसे पहले आपके माध्यम से फिल्म इंडस्ट्री को धन्यवाद देना चाहती हूँ, जिसके कारण आज पूरे सदन में मुस्कराहट फैली है, जो बहुत कम देखने को मिलती है। यहाँ बहुत सारी बातें की गई हैं और मुझे लगता है कि दो बातें अभी कहनी बाकी हैं। 'आरआरआर' और 'दि एलिफैंट व्हिस्परर्स' में दो चीजें, मां की ममता और हमारे कल्चर की सिम्प्लिसिटी बहुत अहम थी। उसमें जो डांस था, वह हमारे कल्चर का, हमारी सिम्प्लिसिटी का और मस्त होकर जो इंडिया के लोग डांस करते हैं, उसका प्रतीक है। हमने अपने कल्चर का सम्मान किया, तभी आज अंतरराष्ट्रीय स्तर पर सम्मान हुआ है। मुझे यह लगता है कि हम लोगों के लिए एक बहुत बड़ा लैसन है। सर, जो मां होती है - चाहे मनुष्य का बच्चा हो, जानवर का बच्चा हो या पंछी का हो - मां तो मां होती है और उसका प्यार सबके लिए एक जैसा होता है। हम सबके लिए यह बहुत बड़ा लैसन है। मैं आपके माध्यम से उनको बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद देती हूँ।

**श्रीमती प्रियंका चतुर्वेदी (महाराष्ट्र) :** सर, जैसे हमारे पार्लियामेंटेरियन्स ने बधाई दी, उसी तरह से मैं भी बधाई देना चाहती हूँ। मैं एक चीज़ और मेन्शन करना चाहूंगी कि वहाँ पर एक और इतिहास रचा गया है। वहाँ पर एक इंडियन एक्ट्रेस दीपिका पादुकोण ने 'नाटू नाटू' गाने को इंद्रोज्यूस किया था, उन्होंने भी ब्लैक ड्रेस पहनी हुई थी, तो मैं उनको भी बधाई देना चाहूंगी। सर, दीपिका पादुकोण से याद आया, मैं एक चीज़ और कहना चाहूंगी कि यह जो बॉयकॉट कल्चर है, अगर ऑस्कर जीतने के बाद सोशल मीडिया प्लेटफॉर्म पर बॉयकॉट कल्चर को खत्म करने का काम होगा, तो यह हमारे लिए सौभाग्य की बात होगी। And, Sir, because I am wearing black, I yield the space to Mahua Maji ji, who has been wanting to speak. Thank you so much.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The only culture I know is 'agriculture'.

SHRIMATI PRIYANKA CHATURVEDI: Of course, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: And, let us believe in that. Now, Shri Binoy Viswam.

SHRI BINOY VISWAM (Kerala): Sir, I add my humble voice to the emotionally-packed words of Shrimati Jaya Bachchan. She mentioned the feelings of this House in very beautiful words. This is the moment when we all join together to uphold our culture, its diversity, its richness and its aesthetics. It is no more a narrow one; it is a wide one, and that wideness is to be celebrated now. Sir, the tribes, the

underprivileged and their love for the nature is beautifully shown in the film called 'The Elephant Whisperers'. That film shows how great this country is. In the same way, the dance of 'Naatu Naatu' will always remain in our memory, and I believe that this country will celebrate that dance also. This is the moment that this country thinks about diversity and oneness. Our diversity is the cause of the oneness. It is not that one language is the answer for it. In several languages, North or South, India is one. Telugu or Hindi, India is one. Malayalam or Hindi, India is one. But that idea is not taken seriously by certain quarters.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

SHRI BINOY VISWAM: This is the reminder for most of them.

**श्री सभापति :** सबको 'हाथी मेरे साथी' की याद आ गई है। Now, Dr. Fauzia Khan. Briefly, Madam.

DR. FAUZIA KHAN (Maharashtra): Sir, a great Indian poet has said that if music be the food of joy, sharing makes it paradise. We are spreading the joy of creativity and we are sharing the glory of India here, across ideologies, across regions, across geographical boundaries. So, let's celebrate our diversity; let's celebrate our creativity. It is a proud moment for us. And let's celebrate our gender empowerment.

DR. K. KESHAVA RAO (Telangana): Sir, I don't want to be parochial, but I feel so happy when all of you say such words of praise, because the film is from my State. It is not of my State only; it is a universal film. But you have not taken one name. I am thankful to Dr. Ramesh. It is Keeravani who got the award. His name should be taken. He is the composer. The award is given in the category of 'Original Song'. There are many songs for which the Oscar is given, but there is one category known as 'Original Song', which takes the entire universe into itself. As you might have seen yesterday, all the other joined the dais. I also especially congratulate Mr. Prasad. He is not here. He is not directly associated with it, but he is associated with it in writing along with Mr. Rajamouli. Rajamouli is the writer and his son. Rajamouli and Keeravani along with the actors, whose names Mr Ramesh mentioned, are all from my State. But they are not from my State only; they belong to this country, although they are certainly from the southern region. Thank you very much.

**प्रो. मनोज कुमार झा (बिहार) :** सर, मैं अपने दल और अपने तमाम साथियों की ओर से आपकी और सदन की भावनाओं के साथ अपने आपको एसोसिएट करता हूँ। सर, यह सचमुच गर्व का क्षण है, लेकिन गर्व के ऐसे क्षण आने के लिए आवश्यक है - आप जिस राज्य से आए हैं, वहाँ कई वर्ष रहे - टैगोर साहब कहते थे, 'where the mind is without fear and the head is held high'. आर्ट और कल्चर को बंदिश-मुक्त करना होगा और आजादख्याली को प्रमोट करना होगा, तब हमारे पास ऐसे सैकड़ों ऑस्कर आएंगे। जय हिंद!

**श्रीमती सीमा द्विवेदी (उत्तर प्रदेश):** सभापति महोदय, मैं बहुत धन्यवाद देना चाहती हूँ कि आज आपने सदन को एक साथ करके इतना अच्छा माहौल बनाया है। अभी हमारे सभी सम्मानित सदस्यों ने अपनी तरफ से बधाई दी है और मैं भी सभी के साथ स्वयं को संबद्ध करते हुए बधाई देना चाहती हूँ।

महोदय, मैं एक बात कहना चाहती हूँ कि क्या पूरब क्या पश्चिम, क्या उत्तर क्या दक्षिण, यह सारा हिंदुस्तान ही अपना है और आज सारा हिंदुस्तान खुश है। महोदय, मैं आज यह कह सकती हूँ कि एक 56 इंच के सीने के नाते आज देश के सभी हिंदुस्तानियों का सीना 56 इंच का हो गया है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... महोदय, मैं बधाई देना चाहती हूँ और जिन दो महिलाओं को अवार्ड मिला है, उनके लिए मैं विशेष बधाई देना चाहती हूँ।

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS; THE MINISTER OF COAL; AND THE MINISTER OF MINES (SHRI PRALHAD JOSHI): Sir, I also associate with all the Members who have expressed their deep happiness regarding two Oscars at a time for India. It is really a very happy moment for all of us. One of the script writers is Mr. Vijayendra Prasad, who has been Nominated by the hon. President. It is also a very important thing to note how the hon. President is now Nominating Members who are illustrious in their own fields. That is a very important thing. I would like to congratulate him also. ....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, there have been....*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Jairam ji.

SHRI PRALHAD JOSHI: I am only appreciating Shri V. Vijayendra Prasad. ....*(Interruptions)*... Why Jairam ji is so agitated, I am not really able to understand. ....*(Interruptions)*.. Also there is 'The Elephant Whisperers'. Both the producers are women. This shows the *Nari Shakti* of our country. I congratulate both of them. I also express my happiness and I congratulate them.

SHRI G.K. VASAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, congratulations to the winners of Oscars. We are proud Indians. I would like to request the Central Government and the State Governments that in hilly terrains where schools are there, 'The Elephant Whisperers' should be screened, so that the students are aware of the nature and the silent intelligence of the elephants which is a must. I request the Central and State Governments to consider this screening for the students in hilly areas.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, before I call three or four Members to contribute significant points to it, I have to inform you that this morning I got good input from very senior people in the film industry and in the field of culture. They said that the Upper House must help develop an ecosystem, so that exploitation of such talent takes place, so that everyone can totally use talent and potential, and wherever there are handicaps, wherever there are hiccups, wherever there are problems, we need to overcome them. I am sure we will have some kind of a discussion during the Session so that we can wholesomely motivate such kind of emergence of an ecosystem.

Shrimati Mahua Maji.

**श्रीमती महुआ माजी** (झारखंड) : धन्यवाद, माननीय सभापति महोदय। सबसे पहले तो मैं ऑस्कर अवार्ड लाकर हमारे पूरे देश को गौरवान्वित करने वाली पूरी टीम को धन्यवाद देती हूँ, उनको हार्दिक बधाई देती हूँ। मैं एक अहम मुद्दे की तरफ भी ध्यान आकर्षित करना चाहती हूँ कि अभी दो-तीन दिन पहले ही साहित्य अकादमी अवार्ड दिया जा रहा था, उसमें 24 स्टेट्स के कलाकार साहित्यकारों में से चुनकर आये हैं, लेकिन उनकी एक समस्या यह है कि उनके लिए सरकार कोई ऐसी पॉलिसी नहीं लाई है ...(व्यवधान)... मैं बताना चाहती हूँ कि उनको फ्री मेडिकल की सुविधा होनी चाहिए। महोदय, आज के दिन जिनके कारण हम गौरवान्वित हो रहे हैं, उनकी होल लाइफ के लिए फ्री मेडिकल की सुविधा होनी चाहिए, क्योंकि उनके पास पैसे नहीं होते हैं, वे बहुत ही आर्थिक कमी से जूझ रहे हैं, इसलिए इस तरफ मैं आपका ध्यान दिलाना चाहती हूँ, धन्यवाद।

SHRI P. WILSON (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I congratulate the awardees who have won Oscars. I am really happy to say that the film was shot in Ooty which is the Queen of Hills and where elephants are protected. In fact, we have an elephant corridor there. Our Chief Minister, Mr. M.K. Stalin, is taking all the steps to protect the elephants, so that they can freely move and they are not disturbed. The whole of India takes pride in this movie. In 1960s, our then Chief Minister, Dr. Kalam, wrote script for *Parasakthi* in Tamil. That film ran for one year and Sivaji Ganesan became popular because of that film. We Indians have talent, and we should be proud that the whole world knows about our talent. Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The hon. Minister, Shri Anurag Singh Thakur.

**सूचना और प्रसारण मंत्री; और युवक कार्यक्रम और खेल मंत्री (श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर):** चेयरमैन सर, सबसे पहले तो मैं आपका आभारी हूँ कि आपने मुझे अपनी बात कहने का अवसर दिया। भारतीय फिल्म जगत की देश और दुनिया भर में जो धूम मची है, 'आरआरआर' के 'नाटू-नाटू' ने न केवल देश, बल्कि दुनिया का दिल जीतने का काम किया है। यह भारत के लिए गौरव की बात है कि ऑस्कर-95 में भारतीय फिल्म इंडस्ट्री ने एक नहीं, बल्कि दो-दो अवार्ड्स पाने का काम किया है। सर, फिल्म की धूम तो यहाँ पर थी ही, लेकिन इंडियन फिल्म कंटेंट को आज दुनिया ने सराहा है, और मैं कहूँ कि Brand India has arrived, and it is just a beginning. India has the potential to become the content hub of the world. Let us work together to make India the content hub of the world. Nothing is regional today. The Prime Minister says 'local to global'. Our regional has become international. That is a big achievement for India. सर, इसमें बड़ी बात यह है कि 'नाटू नाटू' तेलुगू भाषा में गाया गया था, यह बहुत सारी भाषाओं में डब हुआ, लेकिन मैं कह सकता हूँ कि 30 क्या, आज दुनिया के करोड़ों लोगों के दिलों में 'नाटू नाटू' बज रहा है, तो भारत के संगीत की धुन आज दुनिया भर में बज रही है।

सर, तमिल भाषा में फिल्म बनी - 'दि एलिफैंट व्हिस्परर्स'। यह छोटी बात नहीं है। यह छोटे बजट के साथ बनी, यह एक स्मॉल डाक्युमेंटरी थी, लेकिन आज उसको भी जो मुकाम हासिल हुआ है, उसके लिए मैं अपनी ओर से उन्हें बधाई देता हूँ। चूँकि यह जिम्मेदारी मोदी जी की सरकार में मुझे मिली है, हम कह सकते हैं कि हमने लगातार इसके लिए प्रयास किया। जब टोरोंटो फिल्म फेस्टिवल हुआ, तब राजामौली जी और उनकी पूरी टीम ने उस समय वहाँ पर वर्ल्ड प्रीमियर करने का काम किया, हमने भारतीय फिल्मों को आगे बढ़ाने के लिए मंच दिया। कान फिल्म फेस्टिवल में भी जब भारत और फ्रांस ने अपने डिप्लोमैटिक टाइज़ की 75वीं वर्षगाँठ मनाई, तो जब पहली बार किसी देश को कंट्री ऑफ ऑनर मिला, वह पिछले वर्ष यहाँ भारत को मिला। सर, एक के बाद दूसरा वह क्षेत्र है, जहाँ पर भारत ने फिल्मों के क्षेत्र में अच्छा काम किया है।

**श्री सभापति :** आप समाप्त कीजिए।

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** सर, मैं बस दो मिनट में अपनी बात खत्म कर रहा हूँ।

**श्री सभापति :** एक मिनट।

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** सर, मैं एक मिनट में अपनी बात खत्म कर दूँगा।

सर, अभी पिछले साल सेंट्रल एशिया का युवाओं का डेलिगेशन आया था। मुझे इस पूरे सदन के सामने यह कहते हुए प्रसन्नता होती है कि जब शाम को भोजन का समय था, तो उन्होंने कहा कि हम कुछ कल्चरल प्रोग्राम करना चाहते हैं। मुझे लगा कि वे अपने देश के गाने बजाएँगे। सर, भारतीय फिल्मों की धुन और उनको गाने का काम उन सेंट्रल एशिया के युवाओं ने किया।



और बात भी कब की! राज कपूर जी की फिल्मों के गाने गाए गए। मिथुन चक्रवर्ती का गाना - 'जिम्मी, जिम्मी, जिम्मी, आ जा, आ जा, आ जा', उस पर आज के युवा डांस कर रहे हैं। That is the impact of the film industry. यह मैं इसलिए कह रहा हूँ कि आज 'आरआरआर' ने जो काम किया है, उसके पीछे स्टोरी लिखने वाले, पटकथा लिखने वाले विजयेन्द्र प्रसाद जी इस सदन के सदस्य भी हैं। यह हमारे लिए सबसे बड़े सौभाग्य की बात है कि उन्होंने केवल स्टोरी ही नहीं लिखी, वे एक अच्छे व्यक्ति भी हैं। एक अच्छे व्यक्ति को चुन कर इस सदन का हिस्सा बनने का अवसर दिया गया, उसके लिए भी मैं बहुत आभार प्रकट करता हूँ। हम सबकी ओर से 'आरआरआर' और 'दि एलिफेंट व्हिस्परर्स' के सभी लोगों को बहुत-बहुत बधाई और शुभकामनाएँ!

**श्री सभापति :** श्री अब्दुल वहाब।

SHRI ABDUL WAHAB (Kerala): Sir, I congratulate all the artists and even the हाथी मेरा साथी, वह रोज हमारे घर में आता है। Sir, I have a special request to you. Why can't we, MPs, have *Naatu Naatu* in front of Rashtrapati Bhavan? उन्होंने यूक्रेन के प्रेसिडेंट हाउस के सामने यह किया है, तो हम हमारी द्रौपदी मुर्मू जी के निवास के सामने नाटू नाटू करेंगे। Thank you, Sir.

SHRI RAVICHANDRA VADDIRAJU (Telangana): Sir, I would like to associate myself with this issue of Oscar Awards.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Jaggesh. I am sure that he is from the industry. I had an interaction with him; it was an extremely lively interaction. Please go ahead.

SHRI JAGGESH (Karnataka): Sir, I thank you for giving me an opportunity. I would like to reintroduce myself and my career. I started my cinema career in 1980. I have done about 150 movies in Kannada as a hero. We were very unlucky in those days. When we acted, even the next State could not watch it because there was no internet, media, etc. Only print media was there. Today's generation is very lucky. If you do anything, immediately, it can be watched by many people, even in overseas places. That is the time which has been created in modern India. So, in this period, I would thank our M.P., who is also one of the best writers. We have stepped into Oscar Awards. This is a dream for every cinema artist to get an award in Oscars. I am very grateful because Modiji used to tell one word that all the Indian languages are *atma* of *Bharat*. He used to say that like that, we Indians have started taking awards outside. This is the stepping stone of success which we have started now. In future

days, I think, we Indians would rock everywhere, in every field. That is my feeling. I once again congratulate my dear friend. Thank you for giving me time.

**श्री मुजीबुल्ला खान (ओडिशा) :** सर, आज एक कलाकार के नाते मुझे बहुत गर्व महसूस हो रहा है कि हमारा देश दो-दो ऑस्कर जीत कर आया है। मैं सदन के सभी सदस्यों की बात से सहमत हूँ और सारे देश को फिर से बधाई देना चाहता हूँ, बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri V. Vijayasai Reddy and, then, I would take up the next Agenda.

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, one issue, which we have conveniently forgotten, is when a cinema or documentary of artistic nature of such a magnitude is produced, it is not because of one person or two persons but it is because of the hard work that has been put in by hundreds of people, be it technicians, artists etc..

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes.

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Therefore, the appreciation, that is being offered or conferred on this, should go to everyone who has worked for the film or the documentary, as the case may be. Further, irrespective of the language, irrespective of the religion, caste, creed, there are artists everywhere and, therefore, these regional feelings or sub-regional feelings or linguistic feelings should not be there while appreciating this. Thank you very much, Sir.

**डा. सुधांशु त्रिवेदी (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** सर, आज जब कला की इस अभिव्यक्ति के संदर्भ में सुन्दर समन्वय दिखा, तो मेरे मन में एक तथ्य आया और मैंने सोचा कि उसे सदन के पटल पर रख दूँ।

जैसा माननीय सदस्या, डा. सोनल मानसिंह जी ने कहा कि 'नाटू' शब्द की उत्पत्ति 'नट' से हुई है और भारतीय संस्कृति में जो सबसे बड़ा ग्रंथ है, वह भरत मुनि का नाट्यशास्त्र ही है, जिसमें नौ रस हैं। एक शांत रस का प्रयोग इसलिए नहीं किया जाता, क्योंकि नाट्य में उसकी अभिव्यक्ति सम्भव नहीं है, इसलिए आठ रस ही प्रयोग किए जाते हैं। यह दक्षिण भारत की दो फिल्मों से गौरव का अवसर है। तमिल संस्कृति में नाट्य के लिए एक तोल्काप्पियम् ग्रंथ है, जो उसी के समकक्ष है। उसमें भी ठीक वैसे ही नौ रस बताए गए हैं एवं उसमें भी शांत रस की ही अभिव्यक्ति नहीं होती है। इसके साथ उसमें भी आठ रस ठीक उसी सीक्वेंस में हैं, जैसे भरत मुनि के नाट्यशास्त्र में हैं। इसलिए मुझे लगता है कि इस 'नाटू' शब्द की शास्त्रीय उत्पत्ति जिस शब्द से है, उसमें दक्षिण से उत्तर का एक सुन्दर समन्वय दिखता है, जो अमृत काल के लिए बहुत सकारात्मक संदेश है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, before I call for Papers to be Laid on Table, I have felt the sense of the House. The hon. Minister, who is present here, and we gave him the floor also, would organize for the Members of Parliament and their families screening of these two movies by getting in touch with the Leader of the House and the Leader of the Opposition. That would be a good step. I am sure the hon. Minister would do it after consulting both of them in a time-bound manner and effectively.

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** सर, मैं मानता हूँ कि हम लोगों के लिए इससे बड़ा सौभाग्य और क्या हो सकता है।

सर, मैं माननीय खरगे जी एवं माननीय पीयूष जी के साथ निमन्त्रण लेकर आपके पास आने ही वाला हूँ।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Papers to be Laid on Table.

---

### PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

#### Report and Accounts (2021-22) of IICA, Gurugram and related papers

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CORPORATE AFFAIRS (RAO INDERJIT SINGH) : Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Institute of Corporate Affairs (IICA), Gurugram, Haryana, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9076/17/23]

#### Notification of the Ministry of Power

**विद्युत मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री कृष्ण पाल) :** महोदय, मैं विद्युत अधिनियम, 2003 की धारा 179 के अधीन केंद्रीय विद्युत प्राधिकरण (कोयला आधारित ताप विद्युत उत्पादन इकाइयों का लचीला संचालन) विनियम, 2023 को प्रकाशित करने वाली विद्युत मंत्रालय की अधिसूचना सं. सी.ई.ए.-टी.एच. 17-13/4/2022 टी.ई.टी.डी. प्रभाग, दिनांक 30 जनवरी, 2023 की एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ।

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9499/17/23]

**Notifications of the Ministry of Finance**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (DR. BHAGWAT KISHANRAO KARAD): Sir, I lay on the Table:-

(i) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Economic Affairs), under Section 12 of the International Financial Services Centres Authority Act, 2019 and Section 4 of the Securities Contracts (Regulation) Act, 1956:-

- (1) No. 329/IFSCA/Bullion MIs/2021-22, dated the 9th December, 2022, granting the renewal of recognition to the India International Bullion Exchange IFSC Limited, Gujarat for one year, in respect of bullion spot delivery contract and bullion depository receipt with underlying bullion, subject to conditions specified by IFSCA from time to time.
- (2) No. IFSCA/2020-21/India INX/120, dated the 23rd December, 2022, granting the renewal of recognition to the India International Bullion Exchange (IFSC) Limited, Gandhinagar for one year, in respect of contracts in securities, subject to conditions specified by IFSCA from time to time.

(ii) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Economic Affairs) Notification No. IFSCA/2020-21/India ICC/126, dated the 23<sup>rd</sup> December, 2022, under Section 12 of the International Financial Services Centres Authority Act, 2019 and sub-section (4) of Section 8A of the Securities Contracts (Regulation) Act, 1956, granting the renewal of recognition to the India International Clearing Corporation (IFSC) Limited, Gandhinagar for one year, in respect of contracts in securities, subject to conditions specified by IFSCA from time to time.

(iii) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Economic Affairs), under Section 29 of the International Financial Services Centres Authority Act, 2019:-

- (1) No. IFSCA/2022-23/GN/REG028, dated the 13th January, 2023, publishing the International Financial Services Centres Authority (Appointed Actuary) Regulations, 2022.
- (2) No. IFSCA/2022-23/GN/REG029, dated the 13th January, 2023, publishing the International Financial Services Centres Authority (Insurance Products and Pricing) Regulations, 2022.

- (3) No. IFSCA/2022-23/GN/REG030, dated the 13th January, 2023, publishing the International Financial Services Centres Authority (Investment by International Financial Service Centre Insurance Office) Regulations, 2022.
- (4) No. IFSCA/2022-23/GN/REG031, dated the 13th January, 2023, publishing the International Financial Services Centres Authority (Maintenance of Insurance Records and Submission of Requisite Information for Investigation and Inspection) Regulations, 2022.
- (5) No. IFSCA/2022-23/GN/REG032, dated the 13th January, 2023, publishing the International Financial Services Centres Authority (Manner of Payment and Receipt of Premium) Regulations, 2022.
- (6) No. IFSCA/2022-23/GN/REG033, dated the 13th January, 2023, publishing the International Financial Services Centres Authority (Preparation and Presentation of Financial Statements of International Financial Service Centre Insurance Offices) Regulations, 2022.

[Placed in Library. For (i) to (iii) See No.L.T.9082/17/23]

(iv) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Economic Affairs), under Section 3A of the Government Savings Promotion Act, 1873:-

- (1) G.S.R. 52 (E), dated the 27th January, 2023, publishing the Kisan Vikas Patra (Amendment) Scheme, 2023.
- (2) G.S.R. 53 (E), dated the 27th January, 2023, publishing the National Savings Time Deposit (Amendment) Scheme, 2023.
- (3) G.S.R. 54 (E), dated the 27th January, 2023, publishing the National Savings Certificates (VIII Issue) (Amendment) Scheme, 2023.
- (4) G.S.R. 55 (E), dated the 27th January, 2023, publishing the National Savings (Monthly Income Account) (Amendment) Scheme, 2023.
- (5) G.S.R. 56 (E), dated the 27th January, 2023, publishing the Senior Citizens' Savings (Amendment) Scheme, 2023.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9022/17/23]

(v) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Economic Affairs) Notification No. SEBI/LAD-NRO/GN/2022/111, dated the 2nd January, 2023, publishing the Securities and Exchange Board of India (Employees' Service) (Third Amendment) Regulations, 2022, under Section 31 of the Securities and Exchange Board of India Act, 1992.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9081/17/23]

**Report and Accounts (2021-22) of SECI, New Delhi and related papers**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN): Sir, on behalf of my colleague, Shri Bhagwanth Khuba, I lay on the Table:-

(1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act, 2013:—

(a) Eleventh Annual Report and Accounts of the Solar Energy Corporation of India Ltd. (SECI), New Delhi, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.

(2) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9167/17/23]

**I. Notifications of the Ministry of Finance**

**II. Reports and Accounts (2021-2022) of IFCI Limited, New Delhi and IRDAI, Hyderabad and related papers**

DR. BHAGWAT KISHANRAO KARAD : Sir, I lay on the Table:-

I. (i) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Financial Services) Notification No. IRDAI/RI/1/189/2023, dated the 31<sup>st</sup> January, 2023, regarding Obligatory Cession for the Financial Year 2023-24, under sub-section (6) of Section 101A of the Insurance Act, 1938.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9099/17/23]

(ii) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Financial Services) Notification No. G.S.R. 79 (E), dated the 1<sup>st</sup> February, 2023, publishing the Debts Recovery Tribunals and Debts Recovery Appellate Tribunals Electronic Filing (Amendment) Rules, 2023, under sub-section (3) of Section 36 of the Recovery of Debts and Bankruptcy Act, 1993.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9098/17/23]

II. (A) (1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers under sub-

section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act, 2013:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the IFCI Limited, New Delhi, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
  - (b) Report on the performance of the above Corporation, for the year 2021-22.
- (2) Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9097/17/23]

(B) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Annual Statement of Accounts of the Insurance Regulatory and Development Authority of India (IRDAI), Hyderabad, for the year 2021-22, and the Audit Report thereon, under sub-section (4) of Section 17 of the Insurance Regulatory and Development Authority Act, 1999.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9100/17/23]

**Reports and Accounts (2021-2022) of NIMHANS, Bengaluru; CNCI, Kolkata; and LGBRIMH, Tezpur and related papers**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (DR. BHARATI PRAVIN PAWAR): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute of Mental Health and Neuro Sciences (NIMHANS), Bengaluru, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9202/17/23]

- (ii) (a) Annual Report of the Chittaranjan National Cancer Institute (CNCI), Kolkata, West Bengal, for the year 2021-22.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the Chittaranjan National Cancer Institute, (CNCI), Kolkata, West Bengal, for the year 2021-22, and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at

(a) and (b) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9203/17/23]

- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Lokopriya Gopinath Bordoloi Regional Institute of Mental Health (LGBRIMH), Tezpur, Assam, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9201/17/23]

**Reports and Accounts (2021-2022) of NPCC, New Delhi and WAPCOS Limited, New Delhi and related papers**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF JAL SHAKTI ( SHRI BISHWESWAR TUDU): Sir, I lay on the Table a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act, 2013:—

- (i) (a) Sixty-fifth Annual Report and Accounts of the National Projects Construction Corporation Limited (NPCC), New Delhi, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9066/17/23]

- (ii) (a) Fifty-third Annual Report and Accounts of the WAPCOS Limited, New Delhi, for the year 2021-22, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Company.

- (iii) Statements giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) (i)(a) and (ii) (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.9065/17/23]

---



**REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON AGRICULTURE, ANIMAL HUSBANDRY AND FOOD  
PROCESSING**

**डा. अनिल सुखदेवराव बोंडे** (महाराष्ट्र) : महोदय, मैं विभाग संबंधित कृषि, पशुपालन और खाद्य प्रसंस्करण संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति (2022-23) के निम्नलिखित प्रतिवेदनों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ: -

- (i) Fifty-first Report on Demands for Grants (2023-24) pertaining to the Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (Department of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare);
- (ii) Fifty-second Report on Demands for Grants (2023-24) pertaining to the Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (Department of Agricultural Research and Education);
- (iii) Fifty-third Report on Demands for Grants (2023-24) pertaining to the Ministry of Fisheries, Animal Husbandry and Dairying (Department of Fisheries);
- (iv) Fifty-fourth Report on Demands for Grants (2023-24) pertaining to the Ministry of Fisheries, Animal Husbandry and Dairying (Department of Animal Husbandry and Dairying);
- (v) Fifty-fifth Report on Demands for Grants (2023-24) pertaining to the Ministry of Food Processing Industries; and
- (vi) Fifty-sixth Report on Demands for Grants (2023-24) pertaining to the Ministry of Cooperation.

**REPORT OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT**

**श्रीमती सुमित्रा बाल्मीक** (मध्य प्रदेश) : महोदय, मैं जनजातीय कार्य मंत्रालय की अनुदान मांगों 2023-24 के संबंध में विभाग संबंधित सामाजिक न्याय और अधिकारिता संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति के चवालीसवें प्रतिवेदन की एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखती हूँ।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Motion for election to the Post-Graduate Institute of Medical Education and Research, Chandigarh. ....(Interruptions)...

SHRI NARANBHAI J. RATHWA (Gujarat): Sir, Reports of the Department-Related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Rural Development and Panchayati Raj!

MR. CHAIRMAN: It will come. Dr. Bharati Pravin Pawar to move a motion for election of one member to the Post-Graduate Institute of Medical Education and Research, Chandigarh. Yes, please.

---

**MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE POST-GRADUATE INSTITUTE OF MEDICAL  
EDUCATION AND RESEARCH (PGIMER), CHANDIGARH**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (DR. BHARATI PRAVIN PAWAR): Sir, I move the following Motion:—

"That in pursuance of clause (g) of Section 5, read with sub-section (1) of Section 6 of the Post-Graduate Institute of Medical Education and Research, Chandigarh, Act, 1966 (No. 51 of 1966), this House do proceed to elect, in the manner as directed by the Chairman, one Member from among the Members of the House, to be a member of the Post-Graduate Institute of Medical Education and Research, Chandigarh."

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

---

**RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE BUSINESS ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have to inform Members that the Business Advisory Committee in its meeting held on the 13<sup>th</sup> of March, 2023, has allotted time for Government Business as follows:—

- |   |                                   |
|---|-----------------------------------|
| <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Time allotment for discussion on the working of each of the following Ministries during the second part of the Budget (259<sup>th</sup>) Session:—</li> </ol> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(i) Skill Development and Entrepreneurship;</li> <li>(ii) Rural Development;</li> <li>(iii) New and Renewable Energy;</li> <li>(iv) Cooperation;</li> <li>(v) Textiles;</li> <li>(vi) Fisheries, Animal Husbandry and Dairying; and</li> <li>(vii) Railways</li> </ol> | <p><b>Four Hours<br/>each</b></p> |
|---|-----------------------------------|

- |    |   |                                   |
|----|---|-----------------------------------|
| 2. | Consideration and return of the Appropriation Bill relating to second and final Batch of Supplementary Demands for Grants for 2022-23, after it is passed by Lok Sabha.   | <b>Six Hours</b>                  |
| 3. | General Discussion on the Budget for the Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir for the year 2023-24.   | <i>(to be discussed together)</i> |
| 4. | Consideration and return of the Appropriation Bills relating to the following Demands, after they are passed by Lok Sabha:-<br>Supplementary Demands for Grants for the Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir for the financial year 2022-23 from the 1 <sup>st</sup> April, 2022 to 31 <sup>st</sup> March, 2023.<br>Demands for Grants for the Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir for the financial year 2023-24 from the 1 <sup>st</sup> April, 2023 to 31 <sup>st</sup> March, 2024. | <i>(to be discussed together)</i> |
| 5. | Consideration and return of the Appropriation Bill relating to Demands for Grants for 2023-24, after it is passed by Lok Sabha.   | <b>Four Hours</b>                 |
| 6. | Consideration and return of the Finance Bill, 2023, after it is passed by Lok Sabha.  |                                   |

2. The Committee also considered the issue of inviting Leaders of Parties, which are not represented at the moment in the Business Advisory Committee, as Special Invitees to its meetings. This issue was brought to my notice by several Members. The Committee, after discussion and deliberation, authorized the Chairman to take a decision in the matter. That shall be conveyed.

---

### REGARDING NOTICES RECEIVED UNDER RULE 267 AND VARIOUS OTHER MATTERS

MR. CHAIRMAN: Selected notices have been received to be raised during Zero Hour. Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham. ....(*Interruptions*)....

SHRIMATI JEBI MATHER HISHAM (Kerala): Sir, ... ....(*Interruptions*)...

**सभा के नेता (श्री पीयूष गोयल) :** सर, आज पूरी दुनिया देख रही है कि इस बहुत ही शर्मनाक घटना के लिए भारत कैसे रेस्पॉन्ड करेगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह बहुत दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण स्थिति है कि इतने गम्भीर विषय को कांग्रेस पार्टी और बाकी विपक्ष नज़रअंदाज़ कर रहा है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... आखिर यह पार्लियामेंट का अपमान है, किसी व्यक्ति का अपमान नहीं है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह उच्च सदन का अपमान है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... दोनों सदनों को मिला कर पार्लियामेंट माना जाता है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... किसी दूसरे देश में जाकर ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. ....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHAKTISINH GOHIL (Gujarat): Sir, my notice. ....*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री जयराम रमेश (कर्नाटक) :** सर, शक्तिसिंह जी का नोटिस है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One second. ...*(Interruptions.)*...

**श्री जयराम रमेश :** सर, शक्तिसिंह जी का नोटिस है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, please take your seat. Hon. Members, to err is human. Am I right? And sometimes it does take place. We had such a seamless session because there was recognition to us all through great feats at Oscars. I thought this will be a day when notices may not be taken up, but now that I have been reminded--to err is human. ....*(Interruptions)*... Wait! ....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, Shri Shaktisinh Gohil has given notice.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I have received notices under Rule 267. Shri Pramod Tiwari has given notice and there are similar notices by his colleagues...*(Interruptions)*...

PROF. MANOJ KUMAR JHA (Bihar): Sir, what is the subject?

MR. CHAIRMAN: I would read the subject. I will tell you, I will read the subject because one of the very senior Members of Parliament indicated to me that whatever view you take on a particular notice, it is imperative that through the Chair, the House and the people should come to know what issue the Member seeks to raise. But since Shri Pramod Tiwari is in sound company of other six-seven Members, who have raised the same issue, I am giving out their names and then I will read the subject.

12.00 Noon

Shri Pramod Tiwari, Shri Akhilesh Prasad Singh, Shri Syed Nasir Hussain, Shri K.C. Venugopal, Shri Kumar Ketkar, Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham, Dr. Ameer Yajnik, Shri Neeraj Dangi; they all have raised an issue to discuss the Government's failure to constitute a Joint Parliamentary Committee to investigate the charges of fraud, corruption and financial mismanagement done by Adani Company of Group. ....(Interruptions)...

The issue has been raised also by Dr. K. Keshava Rao - 'demand to discuss Hindenburg Report on M/s. Adani Enterprises and other companies of the group', and this has also been raised by Shri Sanjay Singh. Shri P. Wilson has raised the issue to discuss 'return of Tamil Nadu Prohibition of Online Gambling and Regulation of Online Games Bill, 2022 by the Governor of Tamil Nadu'. ....(Interruptions)...

**एक माननीय सदस्य :** सर, यह इम्पोर्टेंट है।

**श्री सभापति :** यह इम्पोर्टेंट है! Gentlemen, I can tell you. ....(Interruptions)...

**श्री संजय सिंह (राष्ट्रीय राजधानी क्षेत्र, दिल्ली):** सर, मेरा सब्जेक्ट नहीं बताया गया। ....(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have the same subject as Dr. K. Keshava Rao, I said. ....(Interruptions).... Mr. Sanjay Singh, your subject is the same as that of Dr. K. Keshava Rao and it is not coincidence. ....(Interruptions)....

**श्री संजय सिंह :** सर, अब आप इस पर डिस्कशन एलाउ कर दीजिए।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Binoy Viswam has raised an issue to discuss the post-poll violence in Tripura, the one which has also been sought to be raised by Shri Sandosh Kumar P. Hon. Members, the issues you have raised are the ones that can be agitated upon by other means. That being the situation, I am unable to persuade myself to accede to the same. ....(Interruptions).... Hon. Members, please. ....(Interruptions).... Please take your seats. ....(Interruptions).... Take your seats. ....(Interruptions).... The Leader of the House wants to say something. ....(Interruptions)....

**श्री पीयूष गोयल:** सर, कल मैंने बहुत महत्वपूर्ण विषय उठाया था, जो देश की अस्मिता के साथ जुड़ा हुआ है और खास तौर पर पार्लियामेंट तथा हम सभी के स्वाभिमान के साथ जुड़ा हुआ है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... जिस प्रकार से विदेशी धरती पर जाकर भारत का अपमान किया गया, भारत के सब संस्थानों का अपमान किया गया और विशेष कर पार्लियामेंट का अपमान किया गया, ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, पार्लियामेंट यानी लोक सभा और राज्य सभा, दोनों सदन मिल कर पार्लियामेंट है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... पार्लियामेंट का हिस्सा देश की महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी भी हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मुझे लगता है कि शायद यह पहली बार हुआ है कि पार्लियामेंट यानी दोनों सदन, महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी - इन सबके ऊपर इस प्रकार के आरोप लगाए गए, इस प्रकार के निराधार शब्द इस्तेमाल किए गए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... बहुत अपमानजनक शब्द इस्तेमाल किए गए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... माननीय सभापति जी, आपने भी इस बात की निन्दा की। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, take your seats. ....*(Interruptions)*... And, I can tell you Members, Shaktisinhji is not hard of hearing. ....*(Interruptions)*... Shaktisinhji is not hard of hearing. Very frequently, Shaktisinhji recollects his role as the Leader of the Opposition. I would persuade him to forget that. ....*(Interruptions)*... Take your seats. ....*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री पीयूष गोयल :** आपने भी इस बात की निन्दा की है और आपने भी कहा कि ऐसे विषय पर आप भी क्वाइट नहीं रह सकते हैं, साइलेंट नहीं रह सकते हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... खास तौर पर, जब एक माननीय सदस्य देश के बाहर जाकर, अपनी पार्लियामेंट के बारे में ऐसे उल्टे-सीधे बयान करें, शायद मोटिवेटेड है, यह भी एक शंका आती है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... कॉन्स्टिट्यूशनल प्रोविज़ंस भी कहते हैं कि हम सबको इस बात की निन्दा भी करनी पड़ेगी और उन्हें यहाँ पर आकर माफी भी माँगनी पड़ेगी, क्योंकि पार्लियामेंट में कभी-भी माइक्स को ऑफ नहीं किया गया। ...**(व्यवधान)**... माननीय स्पीकर साहब ने, चेयरमैन होने के नाते आपने और माननीय डिप्टी चेयरमैन ने भी अपने वक्तव्य में इस बात की पुष्टि की है कि इनके नौ वर्ष के पार्लियामेंट के करियर में कभी यह काम नहीं हुआ। ...**(व्यवधान)**... माननीय सभापति जी, मैं तो बाकी पार्टीज़ के नेताओं को लेकर हैरान हूँ कि कैसे वे ऐसे काम के ऊपर, ऐसे वक्तव्य के ऊपर उनका साथ दे रहे हैं! ...**(व्यवधान)**... कई विपक्षी पार्टियों के नेताओं द्वारा ऐसे विषय पर अपनी चिन्ता न व्यक्त करना, यह वास्तव में खतरे का विषय है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं तो सभी पार्टीज़ से अपील करूँगा कि वे इस बात की निन्दा करें कि एक सीनियर मेम्बर ऑफ पार्लियामेंट ने पार्लियामेंट की अवहेलना की है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... विदेशी धरती पर जाकर पार्लियामेंट को बदनाम करने की कोशिश की है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House stands adjourned to meet at 2.00 p.m. today.

*The House then adjourned at seven minutes past twelve of the clock.*

*The House reassembled at two of the clock,  
MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.*

**SUPPLEMENTARY DEMANDS FOR GRANTS, 2022-23**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Supplementary Demands for Grants, 2022-23, Shri Pankaj Chaudhary.

**वित्त मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री पंकज चौधरी) :** महोदय, मैं अनुपूरक अनुदान मांगों, 2022-23 को दर्शाने वाला विवरण (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI K. C. VENUGOPAL (Rajasthan): Sir, what happened to our motion?  
...**(Interruptions)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Supplementary Demands for Grants of Union Territory of Jammu And Kashmir, 2022-23. ....**(Interruptions)**...

---

**SUPPLEMENTARY DEMANDS FOR GRANTS OF UNION TERRITORY OF JAMMU  
AND KASHMIR, 2022-23**

**वित्त मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री पंकज चौधरी) :** महोदय, मैं वर्ष 2022-23 के लिए जम्मू और कश्मीर संघ राज्यक्षेत्र (विधान मंडल सहित) की अनुपूरक अनुदान मांगों को दर्शाने वाला विवरण (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Budget of Union Territory of Jammu And Kashmir, 2023-2024.  
Shri Pankaj Chaudhary.

---

**BUDGET OF UNION TERRITORY OF JAMMU AND KASHMIR, 2023-2024**

**वित्त मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री पंकज चौधरी) :** महोदय, मैं जम्मू और कश्मीर संघ राज्यक्षेत्र (विधान मंडल सहित) की अनुमानित प्राप्तियों और व्यय (2023-24) को दर्शाने वाला विवरण (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ।

---

## REGARDING PRIVILEGE NOTICE AND VARIOUS OTHER ISSUES

SHRI SHAKTISINH GOHIL (Gujarat): Sir, my privilege notice is pending.  
...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Leader of the House.

**सभा के नेता (श्री पीयूष गोयल) :** ऑनरेबल चेयरमैन सर, मैं समझता हूँ कि यह बहुत गंभीर विषय है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... इसके ऊपर पूरा देश बहुत आक्रोश में है, माननीय सदस्य भी आक्रोश में हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... पार्लियामेंट की जो अवमानना की गई है, जिस प्रकार से देश की अस्मिता को आहत पहुँचाई गई है, मैं समझता हूँ कि यह बहुत ही गंभीर विषय है।...*(व्यवधान)*... जिन नेताओं ने भारत की छवि खराब करने का काम किया, जिन लोगों ने भारत के बाहर विदेशी भूमि में भारत के ऊपर आक्रमण किया, भारत की पार्लियामेंट के ऊपर, भारत के सदन, पार्लियामेंट के बारे में जो गलतफहमियाँ बनाई हैं, बहुत ही ओछे तरीके से हमारे सदन के बारे में, स्पीकर और चेयरमैन के बारे में और एक प्रकार से भारत के लोकतंत्र के बारे में जिस प्रकार से एक नेता ने हस्तक्षेप किए हैं, यह बहुत ही गंभीर विषय है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... इस पर उनको भारत के सदन में आकर माफी माँगनी चाहिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI K. C. VENUGOPAL (Rajasthan): Sir, Shri Gohil has given a privilege notice.  
...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री पीयूष गोयल :** माननीय सभापति जी, एक तरफ पूरी दुनिया इस देश का गुणगान कर रही है, दूसरी तरफ जी20 होने जा रहा है, जिसमें हमारी प्रेसिडेंसी है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... आज पूरे विश्व को अलग-अलग गंभीर समस्याओं की चिंता है और पूरा विश्व भारत की तरफ देख रहा है कि भारत उनसे निपटने में उनका नेतृत्व करे। ...*(व्यवधान)*... आज पूरे विश्व के देशों के नेताओं की आशाएँ प्रधान मंत्री नरेन्द्र मोदी जी के ऊपर टिकी हुई हैं, क्योंकि वे विश्व की समस्याओं का समाधान करने में जुटे हुए हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... वे पूरे विश्व के लिए एक प्रकार से रोल मॉडल हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... यहाँ तक कि इटली की प्रधान मंत्री भी कहती हैं कि विश्व के सबसे लोकप्रिय नेता, माननीय प्रधान मंत्री नरेन्द्र मोदी जी हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... आज अगर कोई भी विदेश में जाए, तो वह देखेगा कि वहाँ भारत का कितना मान है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... ऐसे में, अगर एक वरिष्ठ नेता विदेश जाकर भारत, भारत के सदन, भारत की पार्लियामेंट, भारत की सभी संस्थाओं, चाहे वह इलेक्शन कमीशन हो या हमारे न्यायालय, ज्यूडिशियरी हो, हरेक के बारे में इस प्रकार से वक्तव्य दे, इस प्रकार के प्रेजेंटेशंस दे, तो मैं समझता हूँ कि यह देश के लिए बहुत दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण स्थिति है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... सर, उन्हें माफी माँगनी चाहिए, सदन के अंदर आकर देशवासियों से माफी माँगनी चाहिए, चेयर से माफी माँगनी चाहिए और हम सब मेम्बर्स का अधिकार है, हम सबका भी प्रिविलेज है कि भारत की पार्लियामेंट की रिस्पेक्ट की जाए। मैं आपसे अनुरोध करूंगा कि आप चेयर से डायरेक्ट करें कि उन्हें सदन में आकर माफी माँगनी चाहिए।



**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी** (राजस्थान): सभापति महोदय, मुझे सिर्फ यह कहना है कि हमारे साथी का प्रिविलेज नोटिस अपनी जगह है, पर अगर ये लोग चर्चा करना चाहते हैं तो \*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Shaktisinh Gohil seeks to raise a point of order. ....(Interruptions)...

**श्री शक्तिसिंह गोहिल** : सर, रूल 238ए ...(व्यवधान)... में प्रिविलेज पर बोल रहा हूँ। Rule 238A clearly says, 'No allegation of a defamatory or incriminatory nature shall be made by a member against any other member or a member of the House...' यहां के लीडर ऑफ दि हाउस जो कह रहे हैं, वह लोक सभा के मेम्बर को कह रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, मैंने प्रिविलेज नोटिस दिया है। मेरे प्रिविलेज नोटिस के अंदर मैंने पुराने किस्सों को क्वोट किया है कि यदि मेम्बर का नाम नहीं भी लिया हो ...(व्यवधान)... पर जनरल नेचर में लोक सभा के मेम्बर का यहां ज़िक्र नहीं हो सकता है। अगर इसी बात को लेना है तो \* ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You made your point. ....(Interruptions)... You made your point. ....(Interruptions)...

**श्री शक्तिसिंह गोहिल** : \* ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You made your point. ....(Interruptions)... You made your point. ....(Interruptions)...

**श्री शक्तिसिंह गोहिल** : सर, माइक ...(व्यवधान)... \*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, the Leader of the Opposition yesterday raised a point of order. I am seized of the matter. I have indicated that I will give my ruling today. I have had the benefit of interaction with the Leader of the Opposition today. I have also had the benefit of interacting with senior Members of the main opposition party and also the Treasury Benches. In this connection, we are also having a meeting at 2.30 p.m. I have indicated to the hon. Members who interacted with me that this is a very critical issue. We are required to give a final view to this, because this will define what we can debate and what we cannot debate. The issue has been

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

agitated by the Leader of the Opposition with clarity and it has been pointed out what the Leader of the House has said...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH (Madhya Pradesh): With clarity.

MR. CHAIRMAN: ...with clarity. The Leader of the House has been very focussed on what he said. ....(Interruptions)...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, it is repetition.

**श्री सभापति:** दिग्विजय सिंह जी, वकील की हैसियत से मैंने भी कई बार रेपिटिशन किया है। रेपिटिशन नहीं होना चाहिए, पर सभी ने कभी न कभी रेपिटिशन जरूर किया होगा।

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: He is repeating the same subject and same thing every time. ....(Interruptions)... He is repeating the same thing morning, afternoon, morning, afternoon, Sir. ....(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Digvijaya Singhji, you can be charged for repeating as Chief Minister for a second term. ....(Interruptions)... सर, रेपिटिशन तो होता है। Meaning thereby, repetition is healthy for democracy. ....(Interruptions)... Am I right? ....(Interruptions)... No; no, repetition ....(Interruptions)... Digvijaya Singhji is right ....(Interruptions)...

SHRI SHAKTISINH GOHIL: Our rules do not permit for repetition. ....(Interruptions)... Our rules say that repetition is not permitted in the House. ....(Interruptions)... This is what our rules say. ....(Interruptions)... रूल्स के अंतर्गत रेपिटिशन परमिसिबल नहीं है।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one second. Hon. Members, Shaktisinh Gohilji has sent a communication to me. Communication of every Member of Parliament is attended by me with expedition. I have gone through his communication. It is very well-worded. We have sought an input from him. And, we have requested him -- he must be getting a communication, if not already got it -- to make it available at the earliest. While the communication was very well premised, the factual part of it was not indicated there. So, we have requested him to give that. He will get a communication to this effect. I am seized of the matter. I can assure you, any issue raised by any Member, in any capacity whatsoever, will engage me with full involvement. And, I will

certainly take a call on it. I have devoted a major part, today and yesterday, in interacting with hon. Members. We will examine the situation -- the constitutional provisions, the rules we have framed, the directives that have been directed by earlier Chairmen, the directives that have been imparted in the Lok Sabha, the situation that is obtaining anywhere in the globe -- and, then, we will take a view. Suppose we hold today that even if the entire House is of one voice, but the rule comes in between for discussion, we will have to deal with that. So, we are meeting the floor leaders today at 2.30 p.m. And, I am sure, you will get my ruling at the earliest, maybe, during the course of the day or tomorrow because this is subject to interaction and being enlightened. I, on my own, cannot have a point of view. I will have a point of view after having collated all other points of view. And, then, I will take a call. I am seized of your matter. You have raised it very carefully, except on one point that you did not provide me the factual premise on which you seek intervention. You think, it is a part of proceedings. I have indicated in my response to you to please spell it out so that I have, before me, a factual matrix and, then, take a call. Now, Mr. Bhupender Yadav.

**पर्यावरण, वन और जलवायु परिवर्तन मंत्री; तथा श्रम और रोजगार मंत्री (श्री भूपेन्द्र यादव) :**  
चेयरमैन सर, संविधान के आर्टिकल 79 में...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Bhupenderji, please speak on this point only. No transgression from this side or that side. .... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BHUPENDER YADAV: Sure, Sir. I will speak only on this point and nothing else.

सर, संविधान के आर्टिकल 79 में 'पार्लियामेंट' शब्द का उपयोग किया गया है। पार्लियामेंट में राज्य सभा और लोक सभा दोनों आते हैं। मैं आपके सामने इस हाउस के दो इंसिडेंट्स के बारे में बताना चाहता हूँ।...(व्यवधान)... वर्ष 1957 में राज्य सभा की रूल बुक में लिखा गया है - उस समय लोक सभा के एक सदस्य एन. सी. चटर्जी होते थे, उन्होंने चेन्नई में जाकर हाउस के खिलाफ, हाउस के इनएक्शन के खिलाफ बोला। उनका राज्य सभा के अंतर्गत संज्ञान लिया गया और संज्ञान लेकर यह कहा गया, चूंकि यह हाउस की प्रोसिडिंग्स के खिलाफ बोला गया है, may be दूसरे हाउस का मेम्बर हो।...(व्यवधान)... ऐसे ही सेम 1987 में उनके बेटे सोमनाथ चटर्जी जी ने उस समय के तत्कालीन रक्षा राज्य मंत्री श्री अरुण सिंह, चूंकि वे राज्य सभा के सदस्य थे और प्रिविलेज लोक सभा का था, उसके लिए भी क्वेश्चन रैज किया। मेरा यह कहना है कि जो विषय \* ने कहा है, वह लंदन में जाकर पार्लियामेंट के लिए कहा है।...(व्यवधान)... पार्लियामेंट में दोनों हाउस आते हैं, इसलिए यदि कोई भी व्यक्ति जानबूझकर पार्लियामेंट की

---

\* Not recorded.

प्रोसिडिंग्स को रोकने का, पार्लियामेंट की प्रोसिडिंग्स को अपमानित करने का, पार्लियामेंट की प्रोसिडिंग्स में किसी विदेशी शक्ति के हस्तक्षेप करने की बात कहता है, तो निश्चित रूप से हमारे लीडर पीयूष जी ने जो विषय उठाया, वह एकदम सही उठाया है। वह अवमानना का विषय है और उनको देश से माफी मांगनी चाहिए।...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Raghav Chadha. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री राघव चड्ढा (पंजाब) :** सर, मैं आपका ध्यान रूल नम्बर 238ए की तरफ आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, रूल नम्बर 240 ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House stands adjourned to meet at 1100 hours on Wednesday, the 15<sup>th</sup> March, 2023. ...*(Interruptions)*..

*The House then adjourned at fifteen minutes past two of the clock till eleven of the clock on Wednesday, the 15<sup>th</sup> March, 2023.*

