

Vol. 253  
No.10



Thursday,  
11<sup>th</sup> February, 2021  
22 Magha, 1942 (Saka)

PARLIAMENTARY DEBATES

# RAJYA SABHA

OFFICIAL REPORT (FLOOR VERSION)  
(PART-II)

CONTENTS

Papers Laid on the Table (pages 1-7)

Report of the Committee on Government Assurances - *Presented* (page 7)

Reports of the Department-Related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Agriculture  
- *Laid on the Table* (pages 7 - 9)

Reports of the Department-Related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Chemicals  
and Fertilizers - *Laid on the Table* (pages 9 - 10)

Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on External  
Affairs - *Laid on the Table* (page 10)

Report of the Department-Related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Labour -  
*Laid on the Table* (page 11)

[P.T.O]

©  
RAJYA SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI

PRICE: ₹ 100.00

Motion for Election to the Committee on Official Language - *Adopted* (page 11)

Matters raised with Permission -

Need for use of Hindi and other languages in the Supreme Court and High Courts (pages 11 - 13)

Need for introduction of new railway line in Santir Bazar and Sonaichari Belonia Sub-Divisions in Tripura (page 13)

Problems being faced by daily commuters in Delhi/NCR (pages 13 - 14)

Need to extend benefits under special category to Saharia tribals living in Sagar and Bhopal divisions in Madhya Pradesh (pages 14 - 15)

Unfair fixed charges on account of Renewable Energy Purchase Obligation (pages 15 - 16)

Ex-Gratia Commission to war widows in Armed Forces (pages 16 - 17)

Need for autonomous status to Kannada, Classical Language Institute (pages 18 - 19)

Need to waive NOC for construction work in Defence Establishment area in West Hill (pages 19)

Need to establish a National Chilli Research Centre in Guntur district in Andhra Pradesh (pages 19 - 20)

Need to fill vacant posts of the Commissioner for Persons with Disabilities and the Chairman of the National Trust and Rehabilitation Commission (pages 20 - 21)

Need for inclusion of "Gondi" language in Eighth Schedule (pages 21 - 22)

Need for financial help to people affected by the disaster in Chamoli District of Uttarakhand (pages 22 - 23)

Special Mentions - *Laid on the Table*

Demand for approval and release of funds for the Ram Van Gaman Path Project in Chhattisgarh (pages 23 - 24)

Concern over dismal state of National Highways in North Bengal (page 24)

Demand to construct Satyagrah Sthal at Pusad, Yavatmal, Maharashtra (page 25)

[P.T.O]

Demand to provide adequate allocation to National Infrastructure Pipeline (NIP) (page 25 - 26)

Demand for budgetary allocation for research, documentation, translation and promotion of Odia language (page 26)

Demand to extend welfare benefits to MGNREGA workers under the Building and Other Construction Workers Act (pages 26 - 27)

Oral Answers to Questions - (pages 27-74)

*[Answers to Starred and Unstarred Questions (Both in English and Hindi) are available as Part-I to this Debate, published electronically on the Rajya Sabha website under the link <https://rajyasabha.nic.in/Debates/OfficialDebatesDateWise> ]*

Statement by Minister -

Present situation in Eastern Ladakh (pages 74 - 80)

The Union Budget, 2021-22 (pages 80 - 82, pages 84 — 109 and pages 109 - 160)

Remarks by the Chairman regarding clarification on the Statement by the Minister (pages 83 - 84)

Recommendations of the Business Advisory Committee (page 109)

## RAJYA SABHA

*Thursday, the 11<sup>th</sup> February, 2021/22 Magha, 1942 (Saka)*

*The House met at nine of the clock,*

*MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.*

### PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

#### **Notification of the Ministry of Law and Justice**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN): Sir, on behalf of Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad, I lay on the Table, under sub-section (3) of Section 169 of the Representation of the People Act, 1951, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Law and Justice (Legislative Department) Notification No. S.O. 3667 (E), dated the 19<sup>th</sup> October, 2020, publishing the Conduct of Elections (Amendment) Rules, 2020.[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3125/17/2021]

- I. **Report and Accounts (2018-19) of NHDC, Lucknow and related papers**
- II. **Reports and Accounts (2019-20) of CWDB, Jodhpur, Rajasthan, NIFT, New Delhi and ISEPC, New Delhi and related papers**

SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN: Sir, on behalf of Shrimati Smriti Zubin Irani, I lay on the Table—

- I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act 2013:—

- (a) Thirty-sixth Annual Report and Accounts of The National Handloom Development Corporation Limited (NHDC), Lucknow, for the year 2018-19, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.2979/17/2021 and No.L.T.2980/17/2021]

- II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Central Wool Development Board

(CWDB), Jodhpur, Rajasthan, for the year 2019-20, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Board.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3347/17/2021]

- (ii) (a) Thirty-fourth Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute of Fashion Technology (NIFT), New Delhi, for the year 2019-20, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3346/17/2021]

- (III) (a) Thirty-seventh Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Silk Export Promotion Council (ISEPC), New Delhi, for the year 2019-20, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Council.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3345/17/2021]

**I. Report (2019-20) of NSC, New Delhi and related papers**

**II. Report and Accounts (2019-20) of ISI, Kolkata and related papers**

SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN: Sir, on behalf of Rao Inderjit Singh, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- I. (a) Fourteenth Annual Report of the National Statistical Commission (NSC), New Delhi, for the year 2019-20.
- (b) Action Taken Report on the recommendations contained in the above Report.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3150/17/2021]

- II. (a) Eighty-eighth Annual Report of the Indian Statistical Institute (ISI), Kolkata, for the year 2019-20.
- (b) Eighty-eighth Annual Accounts of the Indian Statistical Institute (ISI), Kolkata, for the year 2019-20, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (c) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3149/17/2021]

- I. Notifications of the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions**
- II. Report and Accounts (2019-20) of IREL, Mumbai and related papers**
- III. Reports and Accounts (2019-20) of various Institutes and related papers**

SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN: Sir, on behalf of Dr. Jitendra Singh, I lay on the Table—

I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions (Department of Personnel and Training), under Section 61 of the Lokpal and Lokayuktas Act, 2013:—

(1) G.S.R. 733 (E), dated the 25<sup>th</sup> November, 2020, publishing the Lokpal (Staff Car Driver) Recruitment Rules, 2020.

(2) G.S.R. 793 (E), dated the 23<sup>rd</sup> December, 2020, publishing the Lokpal (Finance and Account) Rules, 2020.

(3) G.S.R. 6 (E), dated the 5<sup>th</sup> January, 2021, publishing the Lokpal (Multi-Tasking Staff, Group 'C' posts) Recruitment Rules, 2021. .

[Placed in Library. For (1) to (3) See No.L.T.3166/17/2021]

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act 2013:—

(a) Seventieth Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Rare Earths Limited (IREL), Mumbai, for the year 2019-20, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Company.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3159/17/2021]

III. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

(i) (a) Sixty-sixth Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Institute of Public Administration (IIPA), New Delhi, for the year 2019-20, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3164/17/2021]

- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Harish-Chandra Research Institute (HRI), Prayagraj, for the year 2019-20, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3160/17/2021]

- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Institute for Plasma Research, (IPR), Gandhinagar, for the year 2019-20, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3161/17/2021]

- (iv) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Saha Institute of Nuclear Physics (SINP), Kolkata, for the year 2019-20, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3162/17/2021]

- I. **Notifications of the Ministry of Communication**
- II. **Reports and Accounts (2018-19) of IISER, Tirupati, IISER, Thiruvananthapuram and IISER, Berhampur and related papers**
- III. **Reports and Accounts (2019-20) of TCIL, New Delhi and TRAI, New Delhi for the year and related papers**
- IV. **Reports and Accounts of various Institutes, Centres and Councils for various years and related papers**
- V. **MoU between the Gol and TCIL**

SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN: Sir, on behalf of Shri Dhotre Sanjay Shamrao, I lay on the Table—

- I. (1) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Communications (Department of Posts) Notification No. G.S.R. 744 (E), dated the 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2020, publishing the Indian Post Office (Amendment) Rules, 2020, under sub-section (4) of Section 74 of the Indian Post Office Act, 1898.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3192/17/2021]

- (2) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Communication (Department of Telecommunications), Notification No. 301-20/2020-F&EA, dated the 30<sup>th</sup>

September, 2020, publishing the Telecom Consumers Protection (Eleventh Amendment) Regulations, 2020, under Section 37 of the Telecom Regulatory Authority of India Act, 1997.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3191/17/2021]

(3) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Communications (Department of Telecommunications) Notification No. G.S.R. 694 (E), dated the 10<sup>th</sup> November, 2020, publishing the Temporary Suspension of Telecom Services (Amendment) Rules, 2020, under sub-section (5) of Section 7 of the Indian Telegraph Act, 1885.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3190/17/2021]

II. (1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (4) of Section 22 of the National Institute of Technology, Science Education and Research Act, 2007:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report of the Indian Institute of Science Education and Research (IISER), Tirupati, for the year 2018-19.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the Indian Institute of Science Education and Research (IISER), Tirupati, for the year 2018-19, and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3551/17/2021]

- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Institute of Science Education and Research, Thiruvananthapuram, for the year 2018-19, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3592/17/2021]

- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Institute of Science Education and Research (IISER), Berhampur, for the year 2018-19, together with the Auditor's Report on the Account.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (2) Statements (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) (i) (a), (ii) (a) and (iii) (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3583/17/2021]



III. (1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act, 2013:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Telecommunications Consultants India Limited (TCIL), New Delhi, for the year 2019-20, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of above Company.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3187/17/2021]

(2) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (4) of Section 23 and sub-section (3) of Section 24 of the Telecom Regulatory Authority of India Act, 1997:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Telecom Regulatory Authority of India (TRAI), New Delhi, for the year 2019-20, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Authority.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3188/17/2021]

III. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Central Institute of Classical Tamil (CICT), Chennai, for the year 2016-17, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.
- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Central Institute of Classical Tamil (CICT), Chennai, for the year 2017-18, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. For (i) and (ii) See No.L.T.3552/17/2021]

- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Centre for Development of Telematics (C-DOT), New Delhi, for the year 2019-20, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.2961/17/2021]

- (iv) (a) Annual Report of the Indian Institute of Science (IISc), Bangalore, for the year 2018-19.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the Indian Institute of Science (IISc), Bangalore, for the year 2018-19 and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3560/17/2021]

- (v) (a) Annual Report of the National Council of Educational Research and Training (NCERT), New Delhi, for the year 2018-19.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the National Council of Educational Research and Training (NCERT), New Delhi, for the year 2018-19, and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Council.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3031/17/2021]

- V. Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Department of Telecommunications, Ministry of Communications) and the Telecommunications Consultants India Limited (TCIL), for the year 2020-21.

[Placed in Library. See No.L.T.3189/17/2021]

---

## REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENT ASSURANCES

SHRI A. NAVANEETHAKRISHNAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I present the Seventy Fourth Report (in English and Hindi) of the Committee on Government Assurances.

---

## REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON AGRICULTURE

**श्रीमती छाया वर्मा (छत्तीसगढ़):** महोदय, मैं विभाग संबंधित कृषि संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति (2020-21) के निम्नलिखित प्रतिवेदनों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखती हूँ:-

- [illegible]

- (x) खाद्य प्रसंस्करण उद्योग मंत्रालय की 'अनुदान मांगों (2020-21)' के संबंध में विभाग संबंधित कृषि संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति के तेरहवें प्रतिवेदन में अंतर्विष्ट समुक्तियों/सिफारिशों पर सरकार द्वारा की गई कार्रवाई के संबंध में तेईसवां प्रतिवेदन।

---

**REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON CHEMICALS AND FERTILIZERS**

SHRI ARUN SINGH (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Chemicals and Fertilizers:—

- (i) Ninth Report on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in its Second Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants 2019-20' of the Ministry of Chemicals and Fertilizers (Department of Chemicals and Petrochemicals);
- (ii) Tenth Report on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in its Third Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants 2019-20' of the Ministry of Chemicals and Fertilizers (Department of Fertilizers);
- (iii) Eleventh Report on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in its Fourth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants 2019-20' of the Ministry of Chemicals and Fertilizers (Department of Pharmaceuticals);
- (iv) Twelfth Report on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in its Fifth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Study of System of Fertilizer Subsidy' of the Ministry of Chemicals and Fertilizers (Department of Fertilizers);
- (v) Thirteenth Report on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in its Sixth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants 2020-21' of the Ministry of Chemicals and Fertilizers (Department of Chemicals and Petrochemicals);

- (vi) Fourteenth Report on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in its Seventh Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants 2020-21' of the Ministry of Chemicals and Fertilizers (Department of Fertilizers); and
- (vii) Fifteenth Report on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in its Eighth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants 2020-21' of the Ministry of Chemicals and Fertilizers (Department of Pharmaceuticals).

---

### REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON EXTERNAL AFFAIRS

SHRI K. J. ALPHONS (Rajasthan): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on External Affairs (2020-21):—

- (i) @ Fourth Report on Action Taken by Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in its Twenty-third Report on 'Issues relating to migrant workers including appropriate legislative framework and skill development initiatives for prospective emigrants';
- (ii) Fifth Report on Action Taken by Government on the observations/recommendations contained in its First Report on 'Demands for Grants' of the Ministry of External Affairs for the year 2019-20;
- (iii) Sixth Report on the 'Anti-Maritime Piracy Bill, 2019'; and
- (iv) Seventh Report on Action Taken by Government on the observations/recommendations contained in its Second Report on 'Demands for Grants' of the Ministry of External Affairs for the year 2020-21.

---

@ The Fourth Report was presented to the Hon'ble Speaker, Lok Sabha on 9<sup>th</sup> September, 2020 under Direction 71 A of the Directions by the Speaker, Lok Sabha and the same was also placed before the Hon'ble Chairman, Rajya Sabha for his perusal.

## REPORT OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON LABOUR

DR. BANDA PRAKASH (Telangana): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Sixteenth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on 'Social Security and Welfare Measures for Inter-State Migrant Workers'.

---

### MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE COMMITTEE ON OFFICIAL LANGUAGE

**गृह मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री नित्यानन्द राय) :** महोदय, मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूँ:-

"कि राजभाषा अधिनियम, 1963 (1963 का 19) की धारा 4 की उप-धारा (2) के अनुसरण में, यह सभा एकल संक्रमणीय मत प्रणाली द्वारा आनुपातिक प्रतिनिधित्व पद्धति के अनुसार, सभा के सदस्यों में से एक सदस्य को राजभाषा समिति का सदस्य होने के लिए निर्वाचित करने की कार्यवाही करे।"

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

**श्री सभापति :** नित्यानन्द जी, आपको नित्य आनन्द भी होता है या सिर्फ नाम ही आनन्द है।

**श्री नित्यानन्द राय :** जी, सर, दोनों हैं, नित्य भी है और आनन्द भी है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nityanand means happiness always. What a great thing! ..(व्यवधान)... सदानंद जी आज नहीं हैं, नित्यानन्द भी हैं, सदानंद भी हैं, आनन्द-आनन्द ..(व्यवधान)... राम, जयराम, ऐसा नहीं होना चाहिए - राम राम। जीरो ऑवर, श्री हरनाथ सिंह यादव।

---

### MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION

#### Need for use of Hindi and other languages in the Supreme Court and High Courts

**श्री हरनाथ सिंह यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** माननीय सभापति जी, आज़ादी के 74 वर्षों के बाद भी हम देश की न्याय व्यवस्था में देश के नागरिकों को अपनी भाषा में न्याय उपलब्ध कराने में समर्थ नहीं हो सके हैं। विधि आयोग के 216वें प्रतिवेदन को सुनकर आप चौंक जाएंगे, आयोग ने क्या कहा -

‘सर्वोच्च न्यायालय व उच्च न्यायालय की कार्यवाही हिन्दी भाषा में सम्पादित करना अव्यावहारिक है।’ कुछ भी हो उच्चतर न्यायपालिका के न्यायाधीशों को किसी भाषा के लिए दबाव डालना अनुचित है। यह आयोग में बैठे कुछ व्यक्तियों की राय हो सकती है, परन्तु यह विधिसम्मत नहीं है।

महोदय, 18 जनवरी, 2016 को भारत के मुख्य न्यायाधीश ने सरकार को सूचित किया कि उच्चतम न्यायालय व उच्च न्यायालयों में हिन्दी तथा अन्य प्रादेशिक भाषाओं में कार्यवाही सम्पादित करने का प्रस्ताव अस्वीकृत कर दिया गया है। मैं विधि आयोग के प्रतिवेदन और सर्वोच्च न्यायालय के आदेश से हतप्रभ हूँ। लोकतंत्र की अवधारणा में जनता सर्वोपरि होती है। देश की समस्त संवैधानिक संस्थाएँ, चाहे वह सर्वोच्च न्यायालय हो या विधि आयोग हो, सभी जनता के प्रति उत्तरदायी होती हैं, न कि किसी संस्था अथवा व्यक्तियों के लिए। देश की 98 प्रतिशत आबादी हिन्दी तथा अन्य क्षेत्रीय मातृभाषाओं में संवाद करती है। अतः देश के लोगों को उनकी अपनी भाषा में न्याय मिलना चाहिए, ताकि लोग न्यायालयों में अधिवक्ताओं द्वारा दिये गये तर्कों तथा न्यायालयों के निर्णयों को अच्छी तरह से समझ सकें और न्यायिक व्यवस्था में पारदर्शिता बढ़ सके।

महोदय, मातृभाषा का कोई विकल्प नहीं हो सकता। अतः मैं लोकतंत्र की पवित्र धारणा व जन आवश्यकता को सर्वोच्च मानकर सर्वोच्च न्यायालय की कार्यवाही राजभाषा हिन्दी तथा उच्च न्यायालयों की कार्यवाही क्षेत्रीय मातृभाषाओं में करने हेतु सरकार से अविलम्ब कानून बनाने की मांग करता हूँ।

**श्री सभापति:** हरनाथ सिंह जी, आपका समय समाप्त हो गया है।

**श्री ओम प्रकाश माथुर (राजस्थान):** महोदय, मैं माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाये गये विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

DR. FAUZIA KHAN (Maharashtra): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member.

DR. AMAR PATNAIK (Odisha): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member.

DR. SASMIT PATRA (Odisha): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURE AND FARMERS WELFARE (SHRI PARSHOTTAM RUPALA): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI JUGALSINH MATHURJI LOKHANDWALA (Gujarat): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member.

**श्री सभापति:** श्रीमती झरना दास बैद्य। आप बैठकर बोल सकती हैं, माइक कनेक्ट होगा। आप बैठकर भी बोल सकती हैं, खड़ी होना चाहें तो खड़ी हो जाएं।

#### **Need for introduction of new railway line in Santir Bazar and Sonaichari Belonia Sub-Divisions in Tripura**

SHRIMATI JHARNA DAS BAIDYA (Tripura): Sir, I would like to bring to your kind notice a very urgent demand of the two localities of South Tripura district. It is for introduction of new train services in Santirbazar Subdivision and Sonaichhari of Belonia Subdivision. Both are tribal inhabited areas having population about more than 10,000 in each area, but they cannot avail the rail services as the railway stations from their locality are at a far distance. The people, mostly tribals, of both the areas have to travel about eight to nine kilometres to reach railway station on either side. It would be very helpful for the patients intending to go to Ratanpur PHC if a halting station is set up at Sonaichhari. Sir, I want to know: how much time will it take to complete the Akhaura Gangasagar Project via Bangladesh? I request the Government to look into the matter urgently. Thank you.

DR. SASMIT PATRA: Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member.

#### **Problems being faced by daily commuters in Delhi/NCR**

**श्री नारायण दास गुप्ता** (राष्ट्रीय राजधानी क्षेत्र, दिल्ली): महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से दिल्ली एनसीआर में कार्य करने वाले दैनिक यात्रियों की समस्या उठाना चाहता हूँ। कोरोना काल के कारण सब प्रकार के सार्वजनिक...

**श्री सभापति:** माइक प्लीज़, नारायण दास जी को माइक दीजिए।

**श्री नारायण दास गुप्ता:** महोदय, कोरोना काल के कारण सब प्रकार के सार्वजनिक परिवहन पर रोक लग गई थी, धीरे-धीरे यह व्यवस्था पटरी पर लौट रही है। मेट्रो ने अपना परिचालन शुरू कर दिया है, लेकिन अधिकतर मेट्रो स्टेशंस में आने-जाने हेतु एक ही गेट खोला जाता है, जबकि हरेक मेट्रो स्टेशन पर चारों दिशाओं में गेट होते हैं। महोदय, उनका एक ही गेट खोला जाता है, जिससे लम्बी-लम्बी कतारें लग जाती हैं। इससे सुबह-शाम के समय लम्बी-लम्बी लाइनें लग



जाती हैं, विशेष कर केन्द्रीय सचिवालय, पटेल चौक इत्यादि मेट्रो स्टेशंस में नयी संसद भवन के निर्माण के कारण भी आवाजाही में प्रतिबंध है। सर, मैं आपको बताऊँगा कि हमारे मुख्य मंत्री श्री अरविंद केजरीवाल के प्रयासों से पिछले दिनों में कोरोना का एक भी केस नहीं आया है। अतः सरकार से मेरा निवेदन है कि वह इस समस्या का समाधान करे। ठीक इसी प्रकार से लोकल ट्रेन्स में भी परेशानी है, उन पर भी सरकार ध्यान दे, धन्यवाद।

DR. AMAR PATNAIK: Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

DR. SASMIT PATRA: Sir, I too associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

DR. FAUZIA KHAN: Sir, I too associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

**Need to extend benefits under special category to Saharia tribals living in Sagar and Bhopal divisions in Madhya Pradesh**

**श्री दिग्विजय सिंह** (मध्य प्रदेश): सभापति महोदय, देश में अनुसूचित जनजातियों में, विशेषकर अति पिछड़ी विशेष जनजातियों के लिए अलग से योजना बनायी जाती है। उसके अन्तर्गत मध्य प्रदेश में सहरिया जाति को अति पिछड़ी विशेष जनजाति में शामिल किया गया है, लेकिन उसको केवल मध्य प्रदेश के चम्बल और ग्वालियर सम्भाग में ही लाभ मिल रहा है, जबकि वह सागर सम्भाग, भोपाल सम्भाग और सम्पूर्ण बुन्देलखंड में भी रहती है। इसलिए आपके माध्यम से माननीय अनुसूचित जनजाति कल्याण मंत्री से मेरा अनुरोध है कि सहरिया जाति को सागर सम्भाग और भोपाल सम्भाग में भी वही लाभ मिले, जो उन्हें चम्बल और ग्वालियर सम्भाग में मिल रहा है, धन्यवाद।

**श्री सभापति:** ठीक है। इसकी प्रक्रिया आपको मालूम है। पहले विधान सभा प्रस्ताव पास करे, फिर स्टेट गवर्नमेंट रिकमंड करे और उसके बाद वह सेन्ट्रल गवर्नमेंट के पास आये।

**श्री दिग्विजय सिंह:** महोदय, वह सब हो चुका है। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, वे सारे प्रस्ताव आ चुके हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** ठीक है, आप देख लीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री दिग्विजय सिंह:** केन्द्र सरकार के पास लम्बित है। ...(व्यवधान)... मैं आपके माध्यम से अनुरोध करूँगा कि ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** आपने कह दिया, मैंने स्वीकार किया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री दिग्विजय सिंह:** महोदय, आपने सहयोग किया, उसके लिए धन्यवाद। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री सभापति:** मैं इस पर ध्यान देने के लिए मंत्री जी को बोल रहा हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, he is responding. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री सभापति:** वे respond कर रहे हैं।

**सामाजिक न्याय और अधिकारिता मंत्री (श्री थावरचन्द गहलोत):** महोदय, इस सम्बन्ध में राज्य सरकार से हमारे पास अभी तक कोई प्रस्ताव नहीं आया है। ऐसी स्थिति में हम उस पर विचार कैसे करेंगे?

**श्री दिग्विजय सिंह:** महोदय, ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री सभापति:** वे कह रहे हैं कि यह बहुत लम्बे समय से पेंडिंग है। वे ऐसा बता रहे हैं, देख लीजिए।

SHRI RAJEEV SATAV (Maharashtra): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

**श्री राजमणि पटेल (मध्य प्रदेश):** महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ संबद्ध करता हूँ।

DR. SASMIT PATRA: Sir, I too associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

### **Unfair fixed charges on account of Renewable Energy Purchase Obligation**

DR. AMAR PATNAIK (Odisha): Sir, I want to raise the issue of unfair fixed charges on account of Renewable Energy Purchase Obligations which have been recently fixed by the Government of India. As we know, all the States do not have the same potential for generating all kinds of renewable energy. Some States have higher potential for solar, some have high wind intensity and some have high hydro potential but the recent circular, which has been issued, fixes and mandates that all of them would be put together under an RPO trajectory including solar, non-solar, hydro, wind and applied it to the entire country, to all the States. For example, it has been

fixed for Odisha that 41 per cent RPO target to be achieved by 2030. In Odisha, solar energy cannot come out as much as probably hydro power energy. In some other State, the situation may be different. So, to have one-size-fit-all strategy for all the States and to mandate them to pay fixed charges, if they cannot even generate that much of energy, it is highly unfair. So, I would request the Government, through you, Sir, to reconsider this particular thing and allow the States to determine their own kind of renewable energy source that they want to exploit and contribute to the national grid.

DR. SASMIT PATRA: Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI MUZIBULLA KHAN (Odisha): Sir, I too associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI SUBHASH CHANDRA SINGH (Odisha): Sir, I too associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR (Odisha): Sir, I too associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

DR. AMEE YAJNIK (Gujarat): Sir, I too associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRIMATI PRIYANKA CHATURVEDI (Maharashtra): Sir, I too associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

DR. FAUZIA KHAN: Sir, I too associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

#### **Ex-Gratia Commission to war widows in Armed Forces**

ले. जनरल (डा.) डी.पी. वत्स (रिटा.) (हरियाणा): माननीय सभापति जी, मैं आपके माध्यम से 'Ex-gratia Commission to war widows in Armed Forces' - यानी भारतवर्ष पूरी दुनिया को वीर नारियों के संदर्भ में लीड करता है, यानी यहाँ war widows बहुत हैं। उनमें से जो eligible war widows हैं, जो 35 की उम्र से कम हैं और ग्रेजुएट हैं, उनको direct Services Selection Board में appear होने की अनुमति दी जाती है। ...(व्यवधान)... उनमें से 5 दिन के gruelling

selection process, यानी screening, group testing, interview and psychology test को पार करते हुए कुछ वीर नारियाँ qualify कर जाती हैं। मगर खेद की बात यह है कि qualify करने के बाद भी उनमें से कुछ नारियाँ vacancy की कमी की वजह से रह जाती हैं, जबकि फौज में कई हजार ऑफिसर्स की vacancies हैं। Sir, so, it is quite disheartening. मैं आपके माध्यम से मिनिस्ट्री ऑफ डिफेंस से दरखास्त करूँगा कि इसमें vacancies बढ़ाई जाएं और वीर नारियों को निराश न किया जाए।

सभापति जी, कुछ स्टेट गवर्नमेंट्स भी ऑफिसर्स कैडर में *ex-gratia* employment incentives देती हैं। उनमें से कुछ की performance excellent है, जबकि कुछ up-to-the mark नहीं हैं। मैं आपके माध्यम से स्टेट गवर्नमेंट्स से यह भी दरखास्त करूँगा कि वे भी इसमें बढ़-चढ़ कर incentives दें और वीर नारियों को *ex-gratia* employment incentives दें। बहुत-बहुत शुक्रिया, सभापति जी।

**श्री सभापति :** धन्यवाद, ले. जनरल साहब।

LT. GEN. (DR.) D.P. VATS (RETD.): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I compliment you also कि आप गोल्फ कैप में बहुत अच्छे लग रहे हैं।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

DR. SASMIT PATRA: Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

DR. AMAR PATNAIK: Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI SUBHASH CHANDRA SINGH: Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

DR. FAUZIA KHAN: Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member.

SHRIMATI PRIYANKA CHATURVEDI: Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Next is, Dr. L. Hanumanthaiah from Gallery 5.

### **Need for autonomous status to Kannada Classical Language Institute**

DR. L. HANUMANTHAIHAH (Karnataka): Sir, I have been demanding Autonomous Status to Kannada Classical Language which was awarded in 2008. The Government of Karnataka, the writers and the activists of Kannada are also demanding for the autonomous status for Kannada Classical Language Institute.

Sir, the recent proposal from the Union Ministry of HRD is to convert the Central Institute of Indian Languages (CIIL) at Mysuru into *Bharatiya Bhasha Vishwavidyalaya* (BBV), along with Indian Institute of Translation and- Interpretation (IITI). The terms of reference given to the committee under the Chairmanship of N. Gopalaswami, is to give the opinion about Classical Language Institute also. The problem is that we are demanding for autonomy and on independent Institute of Classical Language but the Government is trying to put this classical language under the *Bharatiya Bhasha Vishwavidyalaya* (BBV) or the Indian Classical Institute. Sir, I, myself, in fact, in a delegation had come from Karnataka to meet three Ministers when Shrimati Smriti Irani was there, Shri Prakash Javadekar was there and the present HRD Minister. All of them have assured that we are going to give you the autonomous status. But, so far, it has not been given. Unless it is given an autonomous status, the classical language work cannot be done properly. It is because the best example in front of us is of Tamil language. An autonomous status has been given to it and they have done wonderful work in that. But, the other classical languages which were awarded in 2008, so far, the autonomy is not given. I do not know as to what is the problem with the Government. Why are they not doing it? They should give the reason also as to why they cannot do it.

That is what I requesting the Government. I request, through you, to please take a decision at the earliest to give the autonomous status to Kannada Classical Language Institute.

DR. SASMIT PATRA: Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

DR. AMAR PATNAIK: Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Right. In any way, it is an important issue. I have visited the Tamil Classical Language Institute. As you said that they are doing a wonderful work. Is it because of lack of autonomy or anatomy of the institute there? Shri Hanumanthaiah,

you study this. This is a matter of interest to me also and the entire country. But, let us discuss it in a non-partisan manner. The Government have told me that they have not taken up the final decision. Next is, Shri Elamaram Kareem.

**Need to waive NOC for construction work in Defence Establishment area in West Hill**

SHRI ELAMARAM KAREEM (Kerala): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I wish to raise an issue about thousands of residents staying near the Military Establishments, West Hill Barracks and the Military Ground in West Hill area of Kozhikode, Kerala who are struggling a lot due to the ban on construction or any renovation and repair works imposed by the Military authorities. Construction works near the notified Military establishments are restricted by the Ministry of Defence and proper guidelines for obtaining NOC for the same has been released by the Government of India. As per the amended guidelines released by the Ministry of Defence dated 21<sup>st</sup> October, 2016, there are 193 stations where an NOC is needed for construction works within 100 meters from the outer wall of the Defence establishments. In Kerala, only the Kannur station is included in it and the Military Establishment in West Hill, Kozhikode is not there in the list of 193 stations. So, there should not be any restriction in construction existing in that area. But the Military authorities of Kozhikode station are not allowing people for construction, repair or renovation of their own houses or buildings. Sir, this is a serious issue. This is a densely populated and crowded residential area with more than 3,000 residents staying since long. As per the official circulars of the Ministry of Defence, it is clear that the military authorities of West Mill Barracks do not have any right to restrict the construction works. So, I urge upon the Government to intervene in this issue urgently and instruct the military authorities of this Military Establishment in Kozhikode to step back from preventing the people from construction and imposing NOC for the same.

DR. SASMIT PATRA: Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

**Need to establish a National Chilli Research Centre in Guntur district in Andhra Pradesh**

SHRI G.V.L. NARASIMHA RAO (Uttar Pradesh): Thank you, Sir, for giving me the opportunity. My Zero Hour mention is about the need to establish a National Research Centre for Chilly Crop because India is the largest grower of chilly,

accounting for 40 per cent of the world production. We account for more than 50 per cent of world chilly exports in the last five years. I would like to compliment the hon. Prime Minister and the Government because the chilly exports have more than doubled, from Rs.2,772 crores in 2013-14 to Rs.6,221 crores in the last year. So, certainly there is every need to encourage the cultivation of this crop. And, this Government has also been promoting cultivation of cash crops. The farmers suffer on account of lack of disease resistant varieties, mainly, leaf curls virus resistant varieties. They also suffer on account of lack of adequate knowledge and post-harvest technologies. Therefore, it is incumbent upon this Government to encourage farmers and also promote high value cultivation of this high value crop. Andhra Pradesh alone accounts for 40 per cent of India's production. Therefore, I urge upon the Government to set up a National Research Centre under the aegis of ICAR, Ministry of Agriculture in Guntur District of Andhra Pradesh, which is the centre of chilly cultivation in this country. This will help not only in development of new varieties but also in extension and creation of knowledge about post-harvest technologies.

DR. SASMIT PATRA: Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

**Need to fill vacant posts of the Commissioner for Persons with Disabilities and the Chairman of the National Trust and Rehabilitation Commission**

**श्री राजीव सातव (महाराष्ट्र):** सभापति महोदय, मैं यहाँ पर देश के तीन करोड़ से ज्यादा दिव्यांग भाई-बहनों की बात रखना चाहता हूँ। हमने "विकलांग व्यक्तियों के अधिकार विधेयक, 2016" पास किया, लेकिन इसका execution चीफ कमिशनर पर टिका है। जब तक वहाँ पर फुल टाइम चीफ कमिशनर appoint नहीं होगा, तब तक हम दिव्यांग भाई-बहनों को सही मायने में पूरी तरह से अधिकार नहीं दे सकते हैं। वे बहुत कठिनाइयों का सामना कर रहे हैं। दूसरा, नेशनल ट्रस्ट और पुनर्वास आयोग का अध्यक्ष पद भी रिक्त है और इन दोनों पदों पर Secretary of Department of Empowerment of Persons with Disabilities बहुत सालों से काम कर रहे हैं। मेरा आपके माध्यम से सरकार से अनुरोध है कि यह तीन करोड़ से ज्यादा लोगों का सवाल है, सरकार Chief Commissioner of Department of Empowerment of Persons with Disabilities और नेशनल ट्रस्ट और पुनर्वास आयोग के अध्यक्ष की फुल टाइम नियुक्ति तुरंत करे।

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद (उत्तर प्रदेश):** महोदय, मैं माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

**डा. फौजिया खान:** महोदय, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करती हूँ।

DR. SASMIT PATRA: Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

DR. AMAR PATNAIK: Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI SUBHASH CHANDRA SINGH: Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

DR. AMEE YAJNIK: Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

**श्री उपसभापति :** मंत्री जी, आप नोट कर लीजिए। श्रीमती सम्पतिया उड़के।

#### **Need for inclusion of "Gondi" language in Eighth Schedule**

**श्रीमती सम्पतिया उड़के (मध्य प्रदेश):** माननीय सभापति महोदय, आपने मुझे बोलने का मौका दिया, इसके लिए आपका धन्यवाद।

महोदय, गोंडी (पारसी) भाषा अनुसूचित जनजाति की भाषा है। यह एक बहुत ही प्राचीन भाषा है। समय के साथ इस भाषा का रूपांतरण अन्य भाषाओं में भी हो रहा है। गोंडी भाषा ने तेलुगू, तमिल, मलयालम, संस्कृत, कन्नड़, मराठी, ओड़िया, हिन्दी और अनेक भाषाओं का रूप धारण कर लिया है। भारत में मध्य प्रदेश, छत्तीसगढ़, महाराष्ट्र, ओडिशा, आंध्र प्रदेश और कर्णाटक के लाखों लोगों के द्वारा यह भाषा दैनिक बोलचाल के रूप में इस्तेमाल में लाई जाती है, लेकिन इस भाषा का सरकारी तौर पर इस्तेमाल न होने के कारण एक आदिम और प्राचीन भाषा खत्म होने की कगार पर जा सकती है। पूर्व की सरकारों ने अनुसूचित जनजातियों के नाम पर, अनुसूचित जनजातियों की बोली भाषा के संरक्षण के नाम पर लंबे समय तक शासन किया, किंतु इसका परिणाम क्या रहा? माननीय सभापति महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से अपनी सरकार से कहना चाहूंगी कि ऐसे लाखों-करोड़ों आदिवासियों की भावनाओं का ध्यान रखा जाए। चूँकि, आज पंडित दीनदयाल उपाध्याय जी की पुण्यतिथि है और पंडित दीनदयाल उपाध्याय जी हमेशा कहते थे कि अंतिम छोर के व्यक्ति का उदय होना चाहिए। आज देश के अंदर साढ़े 12 करोड़ अनुसूचित जनजाति के लोग हैं। महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार से प्रार्थना करती हूँ कि इस अबोली भाषा को जरूर मान्यता मिले। \*

---

\* Hon. Member spoke in Gondi.



**श्रीमती छाया वर्मा** (छत्तीसगढ़): महोदय, मैं स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ संबद्ध करती हूँ।

**श्रीमती फूलो देवी नेतम** (छत्तीसगढ़): महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ संबद्ध करती हूँ।

**श्री राजमणि पटेल**: महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ संबद्ध करता हूँ।

DR. SASMIT PATRA: Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by hon. Member.

**श्री सभापति** : यह अच्छा हो गया, गोंडी में भी बोल दिया। अर्जुन जी, गोंडी जानते हैं न! देख लीजिए। श्री संजय सिंह।

#### **Need for financial help to people affected by the disaster in Chamoli District of Uttarakhand**

**श्री संजय सिंह** (राष्ट्रीय राजधानी क्षेत्र, दिल्ली): मान्यवर, आपने मुझे चमोली, उत्तराखंड में आई त्रासदी के विषय में अपनी बात रखने का मौका दिया, इसके लिए आपका धन्यवाद।

महोदय, सबसे पहले मैं इस त्रासदी में मारे गए उन 34 लोगों के प्रति अपनी श्रद्धांजलि अर्पित करता हूँ, जो इस प्राकृतिक आपदा के शिकार हुए। वहाँ से जो खबरें आ रही हैं, उनके अनुसार एनडीआरएफ के जवान बहुत परिश्रम करके, दिन-रात मेहनत करके सुरंग में फँसे हुए लोगों को बचाने का प्रयास कर रहे हैं, लेकिन मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार से अनुरोध करना चाहूँगा कि चूंकि वहाँ 173 लोग अभी भी लापता हैं, तो उसमें अपने स्तर पर और तेजी लाने की आवश्यकता है, उस पर सरकार ध्यान दे।

सर, आपके माध्यम से सरकार से मेरा दूसरा अनुरोध यह भी है कि मृतकों के परिवारों तथा घायलों को जो मुआवजे की राशि दी गई है, वह बहुत अपर्याप्त है। उन्हें अब तक दो लाख रुपये राज्य सरकार की ओर से तथा दो लाख रुपये केन्द्र सरकार की ओर से देने की घोषणा की गई है, जबकि यह राशि कम से कम 25 लाख रुपये होनी चाहिए। उसमें राज्य और केन्द्र कितना-कितना सहयोग कर सकते हैं, यह देखने की आवश्यकता है।

अंत में, मैं एक बात और कहूँगा कि इस त्रासदी में जिनके मकान टूटे हैं, जिनका नुकसान हुआ है, उनकी भरपाई के लिए भी सरकार योजना बनाए। वहाँ 13 गाँवों का अभी भी संपर्क टूटा हुआ है, वहाँ संपर्क स्थापित नहीं हो पा रहा है।

मान्यवर, इस मौके पर मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार से यह भी अनुरोध करना चाहूँगा कि हमारे देश के लिए विकास और तरक्की निश्चित रूप से जरूरी है, लेकिन नदियों का प्रवाह रोककर जो बाँध बनाए जाते हैं, उनके कारण भी ये आपदाएँ आती हैं। मैं इस मौके पर प्रोफेसर जी.डी. अग्रवाल जी को श्रद्धांजलि देना चाहूँगा, जिन्होंने इस आपदा को रोकने के लिए लड़ाई लड़ी थी और अपनी शहादत दी थी, धन्यवाद।

**प्रो. मनोज कुमार झा (बिहार):** महोदय, मैं स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ संबद्ध करता हूँ।

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद:** महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ संबद्ध करता हूँ।

**श्री राजमणि पटेल:** महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ संबद्ध करता हूँ।

DR. SASMIT PATRA: Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by hon. Member.

DR. AMAR PATNAIK: Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by hon. Member.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by hon. Member.

DR. FAUZIA KHAN: Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by hon. Member.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, we shall take up the Special Mentions.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shrimati Chhaya Verma.

---

### SPECIAL MENTIONS

#### **Demand for approval and release of funds for the Ram Van Gaman Path Project in Chhattisgarh**

**श्रीमती छाया वर्मा (छत्तीसगढ़):** महोदय, छत्तीसगढ़ सरकार ने राम वन गमन पथ निर्माण हेतु 75 स्थलों में से सबसे सुप्रसिद्ध 9 स्थलों को विकसित करने हेतु चयन किया है। देश-विदेश के राम भक्तों की भावनाओं का आदर करते हुए राम वन गमन पथ विकसित करके राज्य सरकार पर्यटन को बढ़ावा देना चाहती है। प्रभु श्रीराम का 14 वर्ष के वनवास काल में से 10 वर्ष का समय छत्तीसगढ़ राज्य में बीता, ऐसा त्रेतायुगीन शोध पत्रों, बाल्मीकि रामायण व अन्य अभिलेखों में दर्ज है। छत्तीसगढ़ सरकार द्वारा जिन स्थलों को राम वन गमन पथ पर्यटन परिपथ के रूप में विकसित करने की योजना है, उनमें सीतामढ़ी-हरचौका, जिला कोरिया, रामगढ़, जिला सरगुजा, शिवरीनारायण, जिला जांजगीर-चांपा, तुरतुरिया, जिला बलौदाबाजार, चंदखुरी, जिला रायपुर,

राजिम, जिला गरियाबंद, सिहावा-सप्तऋषि आश्रम, जिला धमतरी, जगदलपुर, जिला बस्तर, रामाराम, जिला सुकमा शामिल हैं, जिनकी निर्माण लागत 137.45 करोड़ रुपए है, जिसमें से छत्तीसगढ़ सरकार द्वारा निर्माण हेतु प्रारंभ में 15 करोड़ रुपए जारी कर कार्य प्रारंभ किया गया है। यह concept plan स्वदेश दर्शन योजना की रामायण सर्किट के अंतर्गत स्वीकृति हेतु भारत सरकार के संस्कृति मंत्रालय के समक्ष भेजा गया है, जिसकी मंजूरी अभी लंबित है। सदन के माध्यम से मेरी माँग है कि राम वन गमन पथ विकसित करने के छत्तीसगढ़ सरकार के इस प्रस्ताव पर केन्द्र सरकार, रामायण सर्किट योजना के अंतर्गत अविलम्ब अपेक्षित धनराशि उपलब्ध कराए, जिससे राम वन गमन पथ का निर्माण शीघ्र साकार हो सके।

**श्री राजमणि पटेल (मध्य प्रदेश):** महोदय, मैं स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ संबद्ध करता हूँ।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Abir Ranjan Biswas.

### **Concern over dismal state of National Highways in North Bengal**

SHRI ABIR RANJAN BISWAS (West Bengal): Sir, the National Highways in North Bengal, especially NH-31 and NH-34 are in poor shape and leading to traffic congestion in Dalkhola and Kanki in North Dinajpur District. Since these highways are narrow, filled with craters and poorly maintained, commuters are facing lots of trouble during their commute.

Three years ago, the NHAI had sanctioned an additional amount of Rs. 19 crores for the work to start on a 5.5 kilometers road for Dalkhola. This would have bypassed NH-34, making life easy for residents there. This project was initially approved in the year 2006 with a funding of Rs. 86 crores, but it was stalled for eleven years. I ask the Minister for Road Transport and Highways-what is the status of this bypass construction?

In July 2019, the Ministry had also said that 136 kilometers of National Highways in Bengal were being improved. Four laning of 30 kilometers of narrow highways in North Bengal was also to be taken up in 2019-20. I want to ask the Minister how much money has been allotted for these projects and how much work has been completed, as the estimated time of completion was December, 2021.

All of these works are important for the lives and livelihoods of our people in North Bengal. Already work is going on for the Bengal stretch of the East-West Corridor with the State Government and NHAI cooperating to finish it on time. I request the Government to take stock of other projects as well and intimate us of their status at the earliest.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Rakesh Sinha.

### **Demand to construct Satyagrah Sthal at Pusad, Yavatmal, Maharashtra**

**श्री राकेश सिन्हा** (नाम निर्देशित): महोदय, भारत स्वतंत्रता संग्राम की 75वीं वर्षगांठ में प्रवेश कर रहा है। यह अवसर है, इतिहास की उपेक्षित घटनाओं और स्वतंत्रता सेनानियों को उचित सम्मान देकर प्रकाश में लाने का। ऐसा ही एक पुसद सत्याग्रह स्थल है, जो सात दशकों से उपेक्षित है, लेकिन गौरतलब बात यह है कि तब भी प्रत्येक वर्ष देश भर से हजारों लोग इस स्थल को देखने आते हैं। 1930 में महात्मा गाँधी ने जब 'सविनय अवज्ञा आंदोलन' शुरू किया था, तब पुसद में ऐतिहासिक 'जंगल सत्याग्रह' हुआ था। इसका नेतृत्व डा. केशव बलिराम हेडगेवार ने किया था। वे विदर्भ कांग्रेस के पूर्व सचिव तथा राष्ट्रीय स्वयंसेवक संघ के आद्य सरसंघचालक थे। 14 जुलाई, 1930 को वे सैकड़ों सत्याग्रहियों के साथ नागपुर से रवाना हुए। वर्धा सहित अनेक स्थानों से होते हुए वे यवतमाल में पुसद पहुँचे। 21 जुलाई को सत्याग्रह की तिथि वार काउंसिल ने निश्चित की। उस दिन सत्याग्रह स्थल पर वे दस हजार लोगों के साथ पहुँचे। विदर्भ में 'सविनय अवज्ञा आंदोलन' 'जंगल सत्याग्रह' के रूप में आयोजित किया गया था। डा. हेडगेवार गिरफ्तार हुए, उन्हें एक वर्ष को सश्रम कारावास की सज़ा मिली। इस सत्याग्रह का महत्व इसलिए भी था कि इसने पहले चरण में मृतप्राय 'सविनय अवज्ञा आंदोलन' में जान फूंकने का काम किया। पूरे विदर्भ में डा. हेडगेवार के समर्थन में रैली निकाली गई। इसके बाद सत्याग्रहियों ने शराब की दुकान पर भी छापा मारना शुरू कर दिया। यह स्थल जंगल के बीच में सिर्फ एक साइनबोर्ड के साथ उपेक्षित है। यहाँ पर सत्याग्रह स्थल तथा 1930 के सत्याग्रह की यादों का म्यूजियम स्वतंत्रता की 75वीं वर्षगांठ के अवसर पर विकसित किया जाना उचित होगा।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Anil Desai; not present. The next Special Mention is of Ms. Dola Sen.

### **Demand to provide adequate allocation to National Infrastructure Pipeline**

MS. DOLA SEN (West Bengal): Sir, investments in infrastructure have a multiplier effect on economic growth. In April 2020, the task force for National Infrastructure Pipeline (NIP) submitted recommendations to the Finance Ministry earmarking a total investment of Rs. 110 trillion outlaying energy, roads, railways, and urban projects.

Envisaging that 50 per cent of the total funding for NIPs would come from Government, it is also assumed that the Government would increase the capital expenditure by 10 per cent each year. But Covid-19 has substantially affected the revenue flows of the Government leading to a paucity of fiscal potential for undertaking such investment expenditure as proposed. The various financiers of the NIP are themselves struggling which leaves NIP a utopia.

According to the Centre for Monitoring Indian Economy, new project announcements from the Government have decreased drastically since March, 2020.

Apart from Government, other primary sources of infrastructure financing are also suffering, for example, IL&FS downfall in 2018 because of issues like cost escalations and untimely completion of projects plaguing infrastructure financing system.

The States invest more in capital assets. The combined capital expenditure of States was 2.9 per cent of India's Gross Domestic Product (GDP), nearly twice that of the Centre at 1.6 per cent. But the lockdowns have disproportionately affected revenues of States. Delayed payments from the Centre as compensation under GST framework aggravated the problem.

Therefore, I would like the Government to provide sound allocation to NIPs and work towards issues of infrastructure funding.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Sujeet Kumar.

**Demand for budgetary allocation for research, documentation, translation and promotion of Odia language**

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR (Odisha): Sir, Odia is one the oldest languages in the country. The Government of India has recognised Odia as the sixth official classical language in 2014 to give impetus to scholarships in the language. However, Odia is yet to derive the benefits of classical language status. Neither any dedicated Centres of Excellence have been created nor is any dedicated budgetary allocation made for the promotion of the Odia language. It would be a gross injustice to the people of Odisha if they don't get their due share for the promotion of the Odia language. Hence, I request the Government of India to make necessary budgetary allocation for research, documentation, translation and promotion of the Odia language.

DR. FAUZIA KHAN (Maharashtra): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by Shri Sujeet Kumar.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Neeraj Dangi.

**Demand to extend welfare benefits to MGNREGA workers under the Building and Other Construction Workers Act**

श्री नीरज डांगी (राजस्थान): महोदय, श्रमिकों के अथक प्रयासों से केन्द्र सरकार द्वारा बिल्डिंग एंड अदर कंस्ट्रक्शन वर्कर्स हेतु एक अधिनियम 1996 में पारित किया गया और राज्य सरकारों को

इनके कल्याण हेतु बोर्डों के गठन के लिए निर्देशित किया कि निर्माण श्रमिक, जिन्होंने एक वर्ष में 90 दिन काम किया है, उन्हें निर्माण श्रमिक कल्याण बोर्ड में पंजीकृत किया जाए।

उच्चतम न्यायालय ने फरवरी, 2012 के अपने आदेश के तहत केन्द्र सरकार को राज्य सरकारों के building and other construction workers के सभी नियोक्ताओं से एक प्रतिशत उपकर एकत्रित कर कल्याण बोर्ड में जमा कराने एवं श्रमिकों के कल्याण हेतु विभिन्न योजनाएँ प्रारंभ करने के निर्देश दिए।

उक्त आदेशों का प्रभावी क्रियान्वयन नहीं होने पर निर्माण श्रमिक कल्याण बोर्ड में श्रमिकों का registration बहुत कम होने से तत्कालीन केन्द्र सरकार ने सभी राज्य सरकारों को मनरेगा श्रमिकों के registration के लिए विशेष अभियान शुरू करने के निर्देश दिए, जिससे लाखों 'मनरेगा' श्रमिकों को इस योजना का लाभ मिला।

10 फरवरी, 2017 को भारत सरकार के श्रम और रोजगार मंत्रालय के पत्र से केन्द्र सरकार ने इन निर्देशों को वापस ले लिया, जिससे 'मनरेगा' के लाखों श्रमिकों, जिनमें अधिकांश महिलाएँ एवं दलित हैं, उन्हें अपने बच्चों की चिकित्सा, शादी व घर की मरम्मत के लिए पैसा एवं कल्याण बोर्ड से अन्य मौद्रिक सहायता मिलनी बंद हो गयी है।

मेरी केन्द्र से 10 फरवरी, 2017 के पत्र को वापस लेने और राज्यों में बोर्ड अधिनियम, 1996 में 'मनरेगा' श्रमिकों को पंजीकृत करने हेतु निर्देशित करने की अपील है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Santanu Sen; not present. Time is over. We will now go to Question Hour.

---

## ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

### Inclusion of additional minor forest produce under MSP

\*106. SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: Will the Minister of TRIBAL AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

- (a) whether Government had included 23 additional Minor Forest Produce commodities for Minimum Support Price (MSP) during the COVID-19 lockdown period;
- (b) if so, the details thereof;
- (c) whether consultation with the concerned departments of State Governments were held;
- (d) if so, the details thereof; and
- (e) the financial allocation for the above programme and utilisation in past one year?

THE MINISTER OF TRIBAL AFFAIRS (SHRI ARJUN MUNDA): (a) to (e) A statement is laid down on the Table of the House.

### Statement

(a) to (d) The Ministry of Tribal Affairs revised MSP for MFP guidelines on May 1 2020 thereby increased the MSP of 48 MFPs. Further 37 new items were included in the list of MFPs thereby making the total number of MFPs under the scheme to 87 (enclosed as **Annexure**). This was done after due consultation with the States in which the following States have participated — Chhattisgarh, Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra, Andhra Pradesh, Odisha, Tamil Nadu, Rajasthan, Uttar Pradesh, Telangana, Jharkhand, Manipur, Nagaland, Tripura, Assam and West Bengal.

(e) The scheme of MSP for MFP is demand driven and funds are released for procurement of MFP based on the proposals received from State Governments. The budgeted expenditure and utilization of funds during 2019-20 is as under:

(All figures in crore rupees)

S. No.	Scheme	Budget	Expenditure
1	MSP for MFP	20.00	4.34

### Annexure

S. No.	Name of MFPs	MSP (Rs./Kg)	Category- F:Forest, A:Agriculture, S:Spice	Applicability
1	Tamarind (with seeds) (Tamarindus indica)	36	F	All India
2	Wild Honey	225	F	All India
3	Gum Karaya (Sterculia urenus)	114	F	All India
4	Karanj seed (Pongamia pinnata)	22	F	All India
5	Sal seed (Shorearobusta)	20	F	All India
6	Mahua seed (Madhuca longifolia)	29	F	All India
7	Sal leaves (Shorearobusta)	35	F	All India

8	Chironji pods with seeds (Buchananialanzan)	126	F	All India
9	Myrobalan (Terminalia chebula)	<u>15</u>	F	All India
10-A	Rangeeni Lac	<u>200</u>	F	All India
10-B	Kusumi Lac	<u>275</u>	F	All India
11	Kusum seeds (Schleicheraoleosa)	<u>23</u>	F	All India
12	Neem seeds (Azadirachta indica)	<u>27</u>	F	All India
13	Puwad seeds (Cassia tora)	<u>16</u>	F	All India
14	Baheda (Terminalia bellirica)	<u>17</u>	F	All India
15	Hill Broom Grass (Thysanolaena maxima)	50	F	All India
16	Dry Shikakai Pods (Acacia concinna)	50	F	All India
17	Bael pulp (Dried) (Aegle marmelos)	30	F	All India
18	Nagarmotha (Cyperus rotundas)	30	F	All India
19	Shatavari Roots (Dried) (Asparagus racemosus)	107	F	All India
20	Gudmar / Madhunashini (Gymnemasylvestre)	41	F	All India
21	Kalmegh (Andrographis paniculata)	35	F	All India
22	Tamarind (De-seeded) (Tamarindus indica)	63	F	All India
23	Guggul (exudates)	812	F	All India
24	Mahua Flowers (dried) (Madhuca longifolia)	30	F	All India
25	Tejpatta (dried) (Cinnamomum tamala and Cinnamomum sp.)	40	F	All India
26	Jamun dried seeds (Syzygiumcumini)	42	F	All India



27	Dried Amla pulp (deseeded) (Phyllanthus emblica)	52	F	All India
28	Marking Nut (Semecarpus anacardium)	9	F	All India
29	Soap Nut (dried) (Sapindusemarginatus)	14	F	All India
30	Bhava seed/ (Amaltas) (Cassia fistula)	13	F	All India
31	Arjuna Bark (Terminalia arjuna)	21	F	All India
32	Kokum (Dry) (Garcinia indica)	29	F	All India
33	Giloe (Tinospora cordifolia)	40	F	All India
34	Kaunch seed (Mucuna pruriens)	21	F	All India
35	Chirata (Swertia chirayita)	34	F	All India
36	Vaybidding / Vavding (Embeliaribes )	94	F	All India
37	Dhavaiphool dried flowers (Woodfordiaflobunda)	37	F	All India
38	Nux Vomica (Strychnosnux vomica)	42	F	All India
39	Ban Tulsi Leaves (dried) (Ocimumtenuiflorum)	22	F	All India
40	Kshirni (Hemidesmus indicus)	35	F	All India
41	Bakul (dried bark) (Mimusopselengii)	46	F	All India
42	Kutaj (dried bark) (Holarrhenapubescens/ H.aniidysenterical)	31	F	All India
43	Noni/Aal (dried fruits) (Morindacitrifolia )	17	F	All India
44	Sonapatha/ Syonak pods (Oroxylumindicum )	21	F	All India
45	Chanothi seeds	45	F	All India

	(Abrusprecatorius)			
46	Kalihari (dried tubers) (Gloriosa superba)	31	F	All India
47	Makoi (dried fruits) (Solanum nigrum)	34	F	All India
48	Apang plant (Achyranthes aspera)	28	F	All India
49	Sugandhmantri roots/ tubers (Homalomenaaromatica)	38	F	All India
50	Van Tulsi seeds	16	F	All India
51	Van Jeera	70	F	All India
52	Tamarind Seed	11	F	All India
53	Bamboo Brooms	60	F	All India
54	Dry Anola	60	F	All India
55	KachriBaheda	20	P	All India
56	KachriHarra	23	P	All India
57	Seed lac	677	FP	All India
58	Beetal nut raw	30	AP	N.E.States
59	Beetal nut Dry	200	A P	N.E.States
60	Mushroom (Dry)	300	A P	N.E.States
61	Black Rice	100	A	N.E.States
62	Johar Rice	50	A	N.E.States
63	King Chilli	300	A	N.E.States
64	Mustard	40	A	N.E.States
65	Raw Cashew	450	A	N.E.States
66	Cashew Nut	800	A P	N.E.States
67	Ginger dry	50	A P	N.E.States
68	Perilla	140	A	N.E.States
69	Rosella	200	A	N.E.States
70	Nutgall	150	A	N.E.States
71	Zanthoxylum Dried	200	A	N.E.States
72	Jack Fruit Seed	45	A	N.E.States
73	Tasar Cocoon (Chrysalis)		F/H	Jharkhand State
	Reeling Class Grade— I	Rs.3200/thousand number		
	(Specification - When Avg. Shell Weight 1.55 gram &			

	above )			
	Un-Reeling Grade -I (Specification - When Avg. Shell Weight 1.40 gram & above)	Rs.1500/thousand number		
74	Cashew Kernel ( <i>Anacardium occidentale</i> )	90	F/P	All India
75	Elephant Apple dry ( <i>Dillenia indica</i> )	120	F/H	North Eastern States
76	Bamboo shoot ( <i>Phyllostachys edulis</i> )	70	F	North Eastern States
77	Malkangni Seed ( <i>Celastrus paniculatus</i> wild)	100	F	All India
78	Mahul Leaves ( <i>Bauhinia vahlii</i> )	15	F	Odisha, Chhattisgarh, Madhya Pradesh, West Bengal
79	Nagod ( <i>Vitex negundo</i> )	20	F	All India
80	Gokhru ( <i>Tribulus terrestris</i> )	60	F	All India
81	Pipla/ Uchithi (dried berry) ( <i>Piper pedicellatum</i> )	120	F	All India
82	Gamhar/ Gamari , (dry bark) ( <i>Gmelina arborea</i> )	20	F	North Eastern States
83	Oroxylum indicum , (dry bark) ( <i>Oroxylum indicum</i> )	40	F	North Eastern States
84	Wild Mushroom dry ( <i>Agaricus</i> sp)	400	F	North Eastern States
85	Shringraj ( <i>Eclipta Alba</i> )	18	F /M	All India
86	Tree Moss ( <i>Bryophytes</i> )	350	F/P	Karnataka State

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to know from the Minister whether the local produce, according to each region, has been selected;

and, on what basis these 23 commodities have been selected. My second question is: Does the Government plan to add more produces in this list?

**श्री अर्जुन मुंडा :** सभापति महोदय, उत्तर स्पष्ट है। मैंने माननीय सदस्य को इस बात से अवगत करा दिया है कि भारत सरकार ने मंत्रालय के द्वारा न्यूनतम समर्थन मूल्य के बारे में राज्य सरकारों के माध्यम से या राज्यों और मंत्रालय की एक समिति है, उस समिति के माध्यम से चयन किया जाता है कि forest produce का नियंत्रण मूल्य किस तरह से तय हो और उसके बाद वह तय किया गया है। इसके अलावा भी समय-समय पर राज्य सरकार अनुशंसा करती है और समर्थन मूल्य तय करती है।

दूसरा प्रश्न जो माननीय सदस्य ने पूछा है, उसके उत्तर में मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि इसके अलावा भी यदि कोई इस तरह का विषय आएगा तो मंत्रालय उस पर ज़रूर विचार करेगा।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Second supplementary, Shri Subhas Chandra Bose.

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: No, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: He is saying if the proposal comes from the State Governments then they will examine it and decide.

DR. BANDA PRAKASH: Sir, I have a question to put to the hon. Minister. ... (Interruptions) ..

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. ... (Interruptions) ..

DR. BANDA PRAKASH: My question to the hon. Minister, through you, Sir, is that earlier we had only 48 items of the forest produces. In 2020, they added another 37 and now these are only 87. I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether a complete survey has been conducted of the forest produces of the country. Do you have any comprehensive list of what are produces that are available in the entire country? If you have a list of all the produces then you have to extend it to all the produces. I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether any attempt is being made to do a survey throughout the country.

**श्री सभापति :** माननीय सदस्य यह पूछ रहे हैं कि क्या बाकी produce को भी इसमें लाने का प्रस्ताव है?

**श्री अर्जुन मुंडा :** सभापति महोदय, देश में कुछ ऐसे उत्पाद हैं, जिनको पूरे देश के लिए लागू किया गया है और कुछ राज्यों के लिए भी लागू किया गया है। महोदय, समय-समय पर राज्यों के साथ जैसे वार्ता होती है, उसी क्रम में जिस राज्य का उत्पाद और वह तय करने की जो समिति है, उसकी अनुशंसा के आलोक में किया जाता है। जब भी ऐसा कोई मामला आएगा, तो हम उस पर विचार करेंगे।

**श्री सभापति :** डा. अमर पटनायक, ट्राइबल कनेक्टेड इलाके के लोगों के ज्यादा प्रश्न हैं।

DR. AMAR PATNAIK: Sir, my question is: When was the last time the MSP of the minor produce revised and by how much in respect of the top ten items?

**श्री अर्जुन मुंडा :** सभापति महोदय, पिछले लॉकडाउन के समय हम लोगों ने इस पर बहुत ज्यादा परिश्रम किया और जितनी जल्दी हो सकता है, उतनी तीव्रता के साथ काम किया है। Minor forest produce की यह योजना वर्ष 2013-14 में शुरू हुई थी। उसके बाद 2017-18 में हम लोगों ने एक बंधन केन्द्र के माध्यम से, हमारी एक संस्था TRIFED है, उसके माध्यम से इस योजना को प्रारंभ किया। आपको यह जानकर खुशी होगी कि इस बार लॉकडाउन के समय में हमने इसको बहुत अच्छे ढंग से मॉनिटर किया है। उस समय क्योंकि बाजार की बहुत कठिनाई थी, तो सरकारी स्तर पर राज्यों के माध्यम से और जो प्राइवेट खरीदार हैं, उनके माध्यम से दर तय करने की वजह से उन लोगों को बहुत फायदा हुआ है। जो राशि राज्यों को आवंटित revolving fund के रूप में दी गई थी, उसका utilization नहीं हो पाता था, हमने इस लॉकडाउन के समय में उसको करवाया।

**डा. विकास महात्मे :** महोदय, मेरा सवाल यह है कि यह महुआ forest produce जो है, महाराष्ट्र में गढ़चिरौली, मेलघाट और बूंदिया में, वैसे ही छत्तीसगढ़ और बाकी स्टेट्स में बहुत मात्रा में उपलब्ध है। इसका बहुत सारा उपयोग भी होता है और यह मेडिसिनल प्लांट के नाम से भी जाना जाता है, इसलिए मेरा सवाल यह है कि forest produce पर प्रक्रिया करके, जो forest में रहते हैं, उनको उचित दाम मिलने चाहिए। क्या इसके लिए सरकार की तरफ से कोई कदम उठाए गए हैं और इसको बढ़ावा देने के लिए भी क्या कोई विशेष प्रोग्राम है?

**श्री अर्जुन मुंडा :** सभापति महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय सदस्य को यह जानकारी देना चाहता हूँ कि महुआ के ऊपर जितने भी value addition हो सकते हैं, वह काम IIT दिल्ली को रिसर्च के लिए दिया है और उन्होंने कई सुझाव दिए हैं। उनके आधार पर manufacturing भी शुरू हुई है, ताकि value addition के आधार पर इसकी अच्छी मार्केट मिले।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, the other day I had been to Aadi Mahotsav. It is really very interesting to see. TRIFED is promoting tribal products and marketing them. They are doing a great job. One should really use all those things in our life.

That too, in times of Corona, the original products from forest produces have become more valuable now. Please try to use them. Now, Q.No. 107.

### **Assessment of progress made under Poshan Abhiyaan**

\*107. DR. AMEE YAJNIK: Will the Minister of WOMEN AND CHILD DEVELOPMENT be pleased to state:

- (a) whether an assessment of progress made towards achieving targets by 2022 set out under the Poshan Abhiyaan has been carried out;
- (b) if so, the details thereof including the progress made under each indicator; and
- (c) if not, the reasons therefor?

THE MINISTER OF WOMEN AND CHILD DEVELOPMENT (SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI): (a) to (c) A statement is laid on the Table of the House.

### **Statement**

(a) to (c) POSHAN Abhiyaan focuses on Jan Andolan to ensure enhanced participation and nutritional outcomes. Under the programme, month of September is celebrated as Poshan Maah across the country. Similarly, 8-22 March is celebrated as Poshan Pakhwada.

Outreach has been strengthened with the continued focus on spreading awareness. The number of activities carried out has gone up from 22.58 lakhs activities conducted during Poshan Maah, 2018 to 13.9 crore activities (approx.) during Poshan Maah 2020. Other activities carried out during Poshan Maah centered around identification of children suffering from Severe and Acute Malnutrition (SAM), prevention of anaemia and diarrhoea, hygiene, overall nutrition, breastfeeding, setting up of *Poshan Vatikas*, etc. across 36 States/UTs. Poshan Pakhwada was also celebrated in March 2019 and 2020 with a total of 82.75 lakh activities (in 2019) centering on interpersonal communication and home visits, anaemia camps, Defeat Diarrhoea Campaigns, Kitchen Gardens, Poshan melas/workshops etc.

Government has engaged with State Governments on a sustained basis to ensure nutritional quality, strengthening of delivery system, transparency and leveraging of technology for effective programme management.

DR. AMEE YAJNIK: Mr. Chairman, Sir, the answer provided by the Minister is absolutely unsatisfactory and very vague. I have asked regarding assessment of the progress made under POSHAN Abhiyaan. The Ministry, in February 2021, has provided us data showing under-utilisation of funds as low as 52 per cent. I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether there are any plans to utilize the funds completely. If yes, what are those plans?

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: Sir, the thrust of the question, asked by the hon. Member was with regard to POSHAN Abhiyaan, and as has been addressed in the answer, it is a programme which is predominantly a Jan Andolan Programme. As for the reference to the utilization of the funds, the hon. Member is also aware that the scheme is implemented by the State Governments. We have engaged, throughout the past financial year with the Governments across the country with regard to utilization of funds, in procurement of devices and Jan Andolan activities irrespective of the Pandemic that was thrust upon our country. I would like to highlight to the hon. Member, through you, Sir, that I personally undertook a video-conference with each State on every aspect of the expenditure, especially under POSHAN Abhiyaan, in the month of December. We have been assured by the States across the country that not only will they ensure utilization of funds but also they will ensure that there is enhanced participation in the coming year. I would, on behalf of the States across the country, highlight here that since it is a Jan Andolan campaign, most of the States could not perform up to the measure because Anganwadis were shut due to the lockdown.

DR. AMEE YAJNIK: Sir, there is an expert panel set up by the NFHS-5. Is the Ministry expecting recommendations soon? Or, is the Ministry going to give more and more plans like Jan Andolan, which I am unable to understand in this POSHAN Abhiyaan?

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: Sir, the desire to ensure that there is a *Jan Andolan* is because ICDS, as a complement to the nutrition programme across the country, which is over four decades old, was not able to materialise and was not a beneficial prospect for mothers and children across the country. That is why, while on the one hand, we had the nutrition programme, on the other hand, there was an increased need to engage more and more with our citizens across the country. In the recent Budget pronouncements there was a pronouncement by the Finance Minister with regard to *POSHAN 2.0* which is an amalgamation of efforts under the nutrition programme and with regard to *Jan Andolan*. However, as the Member has directed

or for that matter sought an answer as to how we respond to the Committee under the NHFS, I would like to here say that under the *POSHAN Abhiyaan*, we are collaborating with 16 Ministries across Government of India. One of the examples that I could give here is the *Jal Jeevan Mission*. We have reached out to the Ministry of Jal Shakti in every State to ensure that drinking water facilities are provided in every *anganwaadi*, including convergence of efforts under MGNREGA, to ensure that infrastructure is adequately provided and that is why, through you, I want to tell the hon. Member that *POSHAN 2.0*, which is a pronouncement in the recent Budget, is trying to effectively address these challenges that emanate from operations which are undertaken in silos in States.

**श्रीमती प्रियंका चतुर्वेदी :** सर, आपके माध्यम से मंत्री जी मेरा सवाल यह होगा कि पोषण अभियान से जुड़ा हुआ एक written reply मुझे भी मिला है। जहां पर 'आईसीडीएस स्कीम' के अंतर्गत मैंने पूछा था कि decline in beneficiaries अगर हम आंकड़े देखते हैं, तो उसमें 2014 से 2020 तक children between six months and six years, pregnant and lactating mothers, children and pregnant and lactating mothers सब का टोटल मिलाएंगे, तो उसमें गिरावट आई है। क्या मंत्री जी ने इसके बारे में कोई रोडमैप बनाया है? खासकर यह मार्च, 2020 के आंकड़े हैं। उसके बाद ही लॉकडाउन के काफी इम्पैक्ट लोगों के बीच आए हैं।

**श्री सभापति :** Okay. The question has to be very sharp.

**श्रीमती प्रियंका चतुर्वेदी :** सर, इसी से related सवाल है।...(व्यवधान)...सर, चाइल्ड मैरिजेज इसी से related हैं।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, you have to put just one supplementary. Try to understand. Now, Mantriji.

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: As has been asked by the hon. Member, I would like to here highlight that the ICDS scheme is implemented by States wherein the States identify beneficiaries, block-wise, district-wise, village-wise and also in the urban areas. I have ensured that there is digitisation of records and hence, when anomalies have been found or duplications have been found, then, States themselves have corrected those beneficiary lists. We, time and again, in our conversations with States and our engagement with State Governments and administration, appeal to them to ensure that beneficiaries across the board are identified and reported to the Government of India so that we can provide adequate financial support. We do so on request and add the numbers as has been sent to us by the States themselves.



MR. CHAIRMAN: Q. NO. 108.

**Mechanism to deal with cases of corruption against Judges**

\*108. SHRI K.T.S. TULSI: Will the Minister of LAW AND JUSTICE be pleased to state:

(a) The steps taken by Government to put in place an effective and transparent mechanism to deal with cases of corruption against the Judges of the constitutional courts in the country including the Supreme Court; and

(b) if so, the details thereof?

THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD): (a) and (b) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

**Statement**

(a) and (b) The issue of checking corruption in the Higher Judiciary is largely to be addressed by the Higher Judiciary as it is an independent organ under the Indian Constitution. Accountability in Higher Judiciary is maintained through “in-house mechanism”. The Supreme Court of India, in its full Court meeting on 7<sup>th</sup> May, 1997, adopted two Resolutions namely (i) “The Restatement of Values of Judicial Life ” which lays down certain judicial standards and principles to be observed and followed by the Judges of the Supreme Court and High Courts (ii) “In-house procedure” for taking suitable remedial measure against Judges who do not follow the universally accepted values of judicial life including those included in the Restatement of Values of Judicial Life.

As per the established “in-house mechanism” for the Higher Judiciary, the Chief Justice of India is competent to receive complaints against the conduct of Judges of the Supreme Court and the Chief Justices of the High Courts. Similarly, the Chief Justices of the High Courts are competent to receive complaints against the conduct of High Court Judges. The complaints/representations received are forwarded to the Chief Justice of India or to the Chief Justice of the High Court concerned, as the case may be, for appropriate action.

Administrative control over the members of the subordinate judiciary in the States vests with the concerned High Court.

To ensure greater accountability and transparency in the Higher Judiciary, a bill titled, “the Judicial Standards and Accountability Bill”, was introduced in the Lok Sabha on 01.12.2010. The Bill laid down Judicial Standards, derived from the Restatement of Values in Judicial Life, 1997. It made it mandatory for Judges to declare their assets and liabilities as well as that of their spouses and dependent children. It also provided for a comprehensive mechanism for handling complaints made by citizens on alleged misbehavior and incapacity against judges of the Supreme Court and High Courts and for taking action against those found guilty after investigation. The Bill along with proposed amendments was considered and passed by Lok Sabha on 29.03.2012. The Bill could not be discussed in Rajya Sabha and lapsed consequent to the dissolution of the 15<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha.

SHRI K. T. S. TULSI: Sir, I find that the answer has restricted itself only to in-house mechanism, but it has been agreed in various quarters that there needs to be a transparent mechanism and it is for this purpose that Judicial Standard and Accountability Bill, 2010 was introduced to lay down judicial standards and simpler processes for removal of judges. I don't know what happened to that.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: As regards the statement that only in-house procedure has been highlighted, if we would appreciate, acknowledge and respect the independence of judiciary, this will have to be entrusted primarily to them. I wish to say it on the floor of the House that one sitting judge has been prosecuted by the CBI also with proper sanction of the leaders of India and even the hon. President also. One retired Chief Justice of High Court has been arrested also. Therefore, we give due credence and respect to the decision of the judiciary. As regards the Bill in question is concerned, yes it was passed before we came to power. It was pending before the Lok Sabha, but because of the dissolution of the Lok Sabha, it lapsed. There have also been some concerns from the judiciary that some provisions impinge upon its independence. That is the question we have to agree.

As far as removal part is concerned, I wish to apprise the senior Member who is also an eminent lawyer that we came with the National Judicial Appointment Commission and passed it unanimously by both the Houses. But, ultimately, the

Supreme Court repealed it on grounds and reasons which I wish to say very clearly that we don't appreciate. Sir, it is the law of the land.

As regards the appointing authority, I also wanted to convey to the hon. House with fully authority, while we respect the institution of collegium, as a Government, we are also a stakeholder and we continue to insist that.

SHRI K.T.S. TULSI: Sir, I am sure, the hon. Minister is aware that judiciary itself is an institution whose foundations are based on honesty and integrity. This is what a Three-Judge Bench of the Supreme Court said and another Bench, in 2018, consisting of Justice Madan Lokur, Justice Kurian Joseph and Justice Deepak Gupta, said that if judicial discipline and propriety are not maintained the institution itself will go forever. This is a procedure where the complaint is against the institution and the institution itself has to decide. Let them be part of this. But, the legislation which was enacted sought to balance public interest.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Tulsiji, you have to ask only your supplementary. We are not having a discussion. Discussion can be held separately.

SHRI K.T.S. TULSI: But, Sir, I have not got any reply as to what happened to the Judicial Standards and Accountability Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Minister has given reply that the Lok Sabha was dissolved and hence the Bill had lapsed. This is what he has said.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I am very clear. My answer is in two parts. I have explained factually what had happened to the Bill. But, I have also stated that there were concerns in the elements of judiciary on some of the provisions which impinge upon its independence. Sir, the question of dialogue and consultation is going on. On the larger issue of appointment and need for oversight mechanism, we have clearly insisted and some of those have been addressed by the National Judicial Appointment Commission which, for reasons already stated, was struck down by the court.

SHRI SATISH CHANDRA MISRA: Sir, I wish to ask the hon. Minister one thing. As my learned senior colleague, Shri K.T.S. Tulsi put it, the reply I just wanted to have is this. Sir, the National Judicial Standards and Accountability Bill which the hon. Minister himself explained in his reply has the mechanism and there are certain things

which you have appreciated. But, Sir, it was passed by the Lok Sabha; it had not lapsed due to dissolution of Lok Sabha. It could not be passed by the Rajya Sabha. So, since the Lok Sabha was dissolved, the Bill lapsed. Why is the Government not thinking and why is the Government not bringing such a laudable Bill which the hon. Minister himself lauded in his reply itself? You have majority in the Lok Sabha and everybody in the Rajya Sabha will pass it. The mechanism which presently being followed is that wherever there is a substantive complaint against a sitting High Court Judge in some High Courts, they are simply transferred to another High Court and mostly to Allahabad High Court considering it is a big High Court and from Allahabad High Court they are transferred to Lucknow Bench which has a very small number of Judges as if it is a dumping ground.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your question?

SHRI SATISH CHANDRA MISRA: So, the entire Bench suffers. Therefore, the specific question I would again ask the hon. Minister is whether the Government is intending to bring this Bill which lapsed due to dissolution of the Lok Sabha again.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I think, I had very clearly conveyed to the House that when we had discussion, there were certain issues on the Bill which were brought earlier by the UPA Government on which they have reservations. And, they have some valid points, because it may impinge upon the independence of judiciary while adhering to the norm of transparency and accountability. This question has been worked out. But, I would, again, repeat that we are in dialogue with judiciary. And, of late, whenever serious cases of misdemeanour have come to light, the judiciary has responded. It was rarely heard that a sitting Judge of a High Court would be charge-sheeted by the CBI with proper sanction from the Chief Justice of India and the President of India. It is rarely heard that a retired Chief Justice of a High Court would be arrested. Therefore, these are positive moments. I agree with you that there is a need to strengthen the mechanism on which we are working. But, the entire architecture of law needs some further clarity from the judiciary.

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is a matter for detailed discussion, as and when you get an opportunity. We can't sort it out in Question Hour because there are very important issues involved on both sides. We have to keep in mind the sentiments of Judiciary; also, at the same time, what is happening in reality and also the concerns of the people.

**श्री शक्तिसिंह गोहिल:** सभापति महोदय, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी के जवाब के लास्ट पैराग्राफ से ही सवाल करना चाहता हूँ। इसमें मंत्री जी ने साफ लिखा है कि उच्चतर न्यायपालिका में बृहत् उत्तरदायित्व और पारदर्शिता सुनिश्चित करने के लिए "न्यायिक मानक और उत्तरदायित्व विधेयक" - तो इसका Objects and Reasons आपके जवाब से ही मिलता है कि यह बहुत जरूरी था। जब लोकतंत्र के अंदर न्यायतंत्र के ऊपर थोड़ा सा भी शक होगा, तो पूरा लोकतंत्र खतरे में आ जाता है। आप इस बिल को लेकर आइए। आपके ही जवाब से मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि आपने जब कहा कि एक सिटिंग जज, रिटायर्ड जज...

**श्री सभापति:** सवाल पूछिए।

**श्री शक्तिसिंह गोहिल:** एक सिटिंग जज, रिटायर्ड जज सीबीआई के दायरे में आए, तो इसका मतलब यही है कि विधेयक की जरूरत है। माननीय सभापति महोदय, मेरा लास्ट क्वेश्चन यह है कि इसी हाउस के एक Nominated Member, जो सर्वोच्च पद पर रहे हैं, उन्होंने एक स्टेटमेंट में कहा है - हमारे रूल्स में provision है कि कोई भी मेम्बर कोई detail reveal करता है... उन्होंने कहा कि कितना-कितना करप्शन कहां कॉरपोरेट्स का चलता है...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please; please. I am not allowing a discussion. ...(*Interruptions*)...

**श्री शक्तिसिंह गोहिल:** इससे डिटेल लेकर आप इन्क्वायरी कराना चाहते हैं या नहीं?

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Minister, do you want to say anything?

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद:** सभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्य के इस प्रश्न के बारे में मैंने पूर्व में उत्तर दिया है। सर, मैं एक ही बात कहना चाहूंगा कि इस पूरे विषय के तीन संवेदनशील पक्ष हैं। नम्बर एक - न्यायपालिका में प्रामाणिकता चाहिए, भ्रष्टाचार से मुक्ति चाहिए। नम्बर दो - जो मामले आएँ, उन पर कार्रवाई चाहिए, यह सरकार भी कहती है और कोर्ट ने भी किया है। सर, तीसरा विषय यह है कि इसको किस रूप में लाएंगे? सर, मैंने पहले भी कहा है कि न्यायपालिका में कुछ उनकी जो चिंताएँ हैं, उन चिंताओं का एक सार्थक निराकरण करके, क्योंकि हमारी सरकार - हमारे माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी की अगुवाई में न्यायपालिका की निष्पक्षता और स्वतंत्रता के प्रति हम लोग प्रतिबद्ध हैं, यह हम कहना चाहेंगे।

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question No. 109, Shri Vaiko. I think he had sought leave. So, the questioner is not present.

\*109 [*The Questioner was absent.*]

**Collision of Indian fishing boat with Sri Lankan naval craft**

\*109. SHRI VAIKO: Will the Minister of EXTERNAL AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

- (a) the number of fishermen who died in Sri Lankan waters recently due to collision between their vessel and Sri Lankan Naval craft;
- (b) the response of the Indian Government, including any strong protest, condemnation lodged with the Sri Lankan authorities;
- (c) whether any compensation or damage has been sought from Sri Lanka due to their deliberate act, resulting in death of fishermen;
- (d) if so, the details thereof; and
- (e) the measures taken to ensure that such incidents does not happen in future, including arrest and harassment of Indian fishermen by Sri Lanka, the details thereof?

THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (DR. SUBRAHMANYAM JAISHANKAR):

(a) to (e) A statement is laid on the table of the House.

**Statement**

(a) to (e) According to available information, on January 18, 2021, four fishermen lost their lives following a collision between their vessel and a Sri Lankan naval craft.

A strong protest in regard to this incident was conveyed by our High Commissioner to the Sri Lankan Foreign Minister. A strong demarche was also made to the Sri Lankan Acting High Commissioner in New Delhi.

Expressing Government's deep anguish at the loss of lives, we emphasized the need to deal with issues pertaining to fishermen in a humane manner. It was stressed that existing understandings between the two Governments in that regard must be strictly observed and utmost efforts should be made to ensure that there is no recurrence.

The Government attaches the highest priority to the safety and security of Indian Fishermen. As soon as reports of apprehension of Indian fishermen are received, the Government through diplomatic channels takes up the matter with the Government of Sri Lanka.

Issues relating to Indian fishermen have been raised at the highest level, including by our Prime Minister with the Sri Lankan Prime Minister during the Virtual Bilateral Summit held in September 2020. During my visit to Colombo from 5-7 January 2021, I met the Minister of Fisheries of Sri Lanka and discussed all issues related to Indian fishermen.

Following the 2+2 initiative in November 2016 when the Foreign and Fisheries Ministers of the two countries met in New Delhi, a bilateral Joint Working Group (JWG) mechanism and meeting of the Ministers for Fisheries of the two countries was institutionalized to address fishermen issues with Sri Lanka. On December 30, 2020, the 4th Round of the Joint Working Group (JWG) was concluded between the two governments where the entire gamut of issues related to fishermen were discussed.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Any supplementaries?

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I thank the hon. Prime Minister for taking a lot of efforts in getting released the Tamil Nadu fishermen arrested by the Sri Lankan Navy. At the same time, I would like to bring to his kind notice that till now the Sri Lankan Navy has killed 245 Tamil Nadu fishermen, apart from the recent ones. I would, through you, like to request the hon. Prime Minister and the hon. Minister to take necessary action and condemn the Government of Sri Lanka for these atrocities. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Put your question. You can speak in detail during the Budget discussion. ...(*Interruptions*)... What is your question? ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI: Just one minute, Sir. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, I am not going to allow for one minute. What is your question?

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI: Sir, I have just one question. But the matter is also before the Supreme Court. Somebody has gone to Supreme Court. I would like to know as to what sort of action the Government of India is going to take in this matter. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please try to understand my problem. Of course, this is a very important issue. But, this is Question Hour.

DR. S. JAISHANKAR: Mr. Chairman, Sir, the issue of our fishermen was taken up during my visit to Sri Lanka in early January. It was preceded by a Joint Working Group, set up between our Governments, which met there on 30<sup>th</sup> December. Unfortunately, on January 18<sup>th</sup>, we had this incident where four of our fishermen were killed as a result of a collision between their vessel and the Sri Lankan naval craft. We have very, very strongly protested to the Sri Lankans on this matter. In response to that, they have instituted an inquiry. We are awaiting the results of the inquiry. But, I wish to assure the hon. Member, through you, Sir, that we will take a very strong view on this matter. We want to hold the Sri Lankans to their commitment not to use force under any circumstances on this issue.

DR. SASMIT PATRA: Mr. Chairman, Sir, my specific question arises from the answer given by the hon. Minister. Have there been any specific measures undertaken after the fourth round of the Joint Working Group to reduce the incidents of collision by Indian fishing boats in international waters, as mentioned in the question?

SHRI S. JAISHANKAR: Sir, right now, our Coast Guards are in touch, both through the diplomatic channels and through other mechanisms. We have procedures by which we will try and avoid this collision. So, this is something which should be a subject of even greater attention and recommendation.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, collision between the two vessels is the version of the Sri Lankan Navy. This incident is not the first one; it is one of the recurring incidences. The Sri Lankan Navy not only manhandles our fishermen, they also shoot at them. They also seize their boats and keep them exposed in hard Sun and rain. My question is: Has the Government taken initiatives to get back the boats or to get compensation for those boats or the lives that have been lost by way of shooting by the Sri Lankan Navy?

SHRI S. JAISHANKAR: Sir, we give the utmost attention both for the release of fishermen and for the release of boats which are taken into custody by Sri Lanka. Right now, there are no Indian fishermen in the custody of Sri Lanka. There were nine till recently; they have been released. As of now, there are 62 Indian boats which we are trying to get released from Sri Lankan custody. Previously, there were 173 boats,



out of which 36 were salvageable. So, the auction procedures for the unsalvageable boats are currently under discussion. Our endeavour would be, whatever can be returned, we will get returned and whatever can be salvaged, we will expedite the salvage.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Q. NO. 110.

### **e-Waste Management**

\*110. SHRI DINESH TRIVEDI: Will the Minister of ELECTRONICS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY be pleased to state:

- (a) whether Government is aware that a majority of India's e-waste is recycled in the informal sector;
- (b) the steps undertaken by Government to ensure the safety of e-waste workers;
- (c) the steps undertaken by Government to develop solutions for e-waste management; and
- (d) whether Government has invested in developing product design that is not hazardous?

THE MINISTER OF ELECTRONICS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY (SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD): (a) to (d) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

### **Statement**

(a) The subject matter pertains to Ministry of Environment and Forests and Climate Change (MoEF & CC). The management of E-Waste is regulated under the framework of E-Waste (Management) Rules, 2016 and amendments there off. The Rules are effective from 01-10-2016. Central Pollution Control Board (CPCB) and State Pollution Control Boards (SPCBs)/Pollution Control Committees (PCCs) are the regulators.

Government is alive to the fact that the recycling of E-Waste is carried out in informal sector, which is illegal and a criminal offence. CPCB has time to time advised SPCBs/PCCs to carry out regular drives for checking E-Waste processing in informal sector and reports are obtained quarterly. Actions, such as, constitution of teams for

carrying out drives, issuing of notices, closure of operation, seizing the E-Waste against the informal processing are being taken by the SPCBs/PCCs. Seventeen SPCBs/ PCCs have started the drive during FY 2020-2021 (till second quarter), where twelve have reported that no activities were found during this period and five have taken action against the offenders. Details are given at **Annexure – I**.

(b) The E-Waste (Management) Rules, 2016 sub rule 12 (2) provides for recognition and registration of workers and their skill development. It also provides for monitoring and ensuring safety and health of workers involved in dismantling and recycling of E-Waste.

Under Awareness Programme on Environmental Hazards of E-Waste, a specific training manual (available at [www.greene.gov.in](http://www.greene.gov.in)) for informal sector has been developed, which includes safety of E-Waste workers. A number of trainings have been organized for E-Waste workers across the country with CPCB/SPCB.

(c) The management of E-Waste under the Rules is primarily based on the principle of Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR). Under EPR, the producers of Electrical and Electronic Equipment (EEE) listed in the Schedule-I of the said rules have been given annual collection targets based on generation and sales, as the case may be, and have to manage their E-Waste in an environmentally sound manner through their authorized entities only, such as Recyclers/ Dismantlers/ Producers Responsibility Organizations (PROs) as the case may be. So far, 1678 Producers have obtained EPR Authorization. 44 PROs have obtained registration. 407 dismantlers/recyclers of E-Waste have authorization and their annual processing capacity is 110103.22 tonne.

For enforcement of the E-Waste (management) rules, 2016 in the country, an Action Plan is in place and the same is being implemented by all SPCBs/PCCs in their respective states/UTs. SPCBs/PCCs are submitting quarterly progress report as envisaged in the Action Plan through a web portal made operational for this purpose.

Under the Government sponsored research programme a cost effective and environmentally acceptable technologies have been developed for recovery of precious metals from printed circuit boards (PCBs) with a capacity of 1000 kg per day and 100 kg/ per batch and also technology for converting majority of E-Waste plastic products to virgin plastic products. These technologies have been transferred for commercialization.

Government has established a Centre of Excellence on E-Waste Management at Hyderabad, jointly with Government of Telangana and participation of industry to develop cost effective recycling solutions for PCBs, lithium ion batteries, magnets, Florescent Lamps for extraction of precious metals and transfer to industries/ start-ups.

(d) The designs of electric and electronic product contain various raw materials for specific functional requirements. Some of them are hazardous. With a view to reduce the use of hazardous substances in the manufacture of Electrical and Electronic Equipment and their components or consumables or parts or spares following limits have been prescribed in the E-Waste (Management) Rules, 2016.

- i. Lead (Pb) - 0.1% by weight in homogeneous material
- ii. Mercury (Hg)- 0.1% by weight in homogeneous material
- iii. Cadmium (Cd) - 0.01% by weight in homogeneous material
- iv. Hexavalent chromium (Cr6+) - 0.1% by weight in homogeneous material
- v. Polybrominated biphenyls (PBB) - 0.1% by weight in homogeneous material
- vi. Polybrominated diphenyl ether (PBDE) - 0.1% by weight in homogeneous material

A Government Testing and Certification facility for hazardous raw materials used for electronic products is operational at Centre for Materials for Electronics Technology (C-MET), Hyderabad.

#### **Annexure – I**

<b>S.No.</b>	<b>SPCBs/PCCs</b>	<b>Action taken</b>
1.	Jammu and Kashmir	Notices have been issued to 22 scrap dealers for checking informal trading, storage, dismantling & recycling of E-Waste.
2.	Kerala	Kerala SPCB has seized 207.5 tonnes of E-Waste from informal operators/sector during drive against illegal operators and got it recycled through authorized recycler.
3.	Delhi	Delhi Pollution Control Committee (DPCC) has reported for the quarter ending 30 <sup>th</sup> September 2020 that for Trans Yamuna area the District Administration under respective Sub-Divisional Magistrates has constituted 9 teams as

		<p>these areas have large concentration of illegal E-Waste handling units. These teams have inspected 130 premises and found that 31 premises are storing/handling E-Waste and had closed these 31 units and imposed Environmental Compensation (EC) charges. 14 units have deposited the requisite EC and undertook not to carry out illegal activities.</p> <p>For checking informal trading of E-Waste, directions u/s 5 of Environment (Protection) Act 1986 have been issued on 28.05.2019 to all the local bodies/ Delhi Development Authority regarding stoppage of illegal activity of informal trading, dismantling and recycling of E-Waste in their respective areas of jurisdiction. Till 28/09/2020, 124 informal units have been identified and the closures will be carried out only after inventorisation.</p>
4.	Puducherry	Puducherry PCC, reported that it has closed one illegal dismantling and recycling unit.
5.	UP	<p>UP State Pollution Control Board (UPSPCB) reported that one hundred and twenty (120) illegal melting furnace units were found operating in the area around Sewadham, BehtaHazipur, Krishna Vihar of Loni District of Ghaziabad by a joint team of District Administration Ghaziabad, Ghaziabad Development Authority, Ghaziabad Police, Nagar Pallika Parishad, Loni &amp; U.P. Pollution Control Board during November, 2019. All these one hundred and twenty (120) illegal units were dismantled and FIR was lodged against 16 persons and 12 units.</p> <p>UPSPCB further informed that in the Moradabad district, 6.850 tonnes of E-Waste were seized and District Administration sealed 05 illegal godowns. Environmental Compensation of 60 Lakhs has been imposed and closure orders have been issued against 04 illegal E-Waste Processing Units.</p>

In addition to the above five SPCBs/PCCs, twelve other SPCBs/PCCs namely, Andhra Pradesh, Chandigarh, Goa, Gujarat, Himachal Pradesh, Manipur, Meghalaya, Odisha, Tamil Nadu, Telangana, Tripura and West Bengal have reported that they have started the drive against informal recycling and reported that during this period no such activity was found in their States/UTs.

SHRI DINESH TRIVEDI: Sir, first of all, I would like to thank the hon. Minister for a detailed answer. As you are aware, modern times have modern problems, whether it is the space debris or e-waste. In India, about 90 per cent of the e-waste is processed through unauthorised sector. At the moment, India has about 407 authorised processing centres. I know the work is in progress. My question is: What are your plans and how long would it take to increase these authorised processing centres?

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I appreciate his comments about the detailed reply I have given. Let me convey to this House that e-waste has two components. One is informal handling by people in a manner not very responsible. The other e-waste is something which emanates in the manufacturing process. Through the State Pollution Board and the National Pollution Board, the Ministry of Information Technology coordinates so that action is taken on both the grounds. On the informal sector, what action we have taken, I have already explained in Annexure-I. That is a work in progress which we monitor; the Pollution Control Board monitors skilling etc. FIRs have been lodged and people have been arrested. As regards manufacturing, we have told the manufacturing system to have a proper mechanism in dismantler, have authorised representative; we get them certificates, etc. That is also going on. But, lastly, I must also flag to this House, with great respect, that India is emerging as a big digital power. We want to make India a big hub of electronic manufacturing globally. In mobile, we have done so well. We will have to have a proper balance so that our manufacturing prowess does not get diminished while emphasizing the need for e-waste management.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Second supplementary.

SHRI DINESH TRIVEDI: Sir, I am fully in agreement with the hon. Minister. But,...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Once you agree, then, how can there be a question again? ..(*Interruptions*)..

SHRI DINESH TRIVEDI: Supplementary, Sir, and giving him an opportunity to answer. Sir, जो बच्चे हैं, वे ragpickers हैं, and there are health issues involved. The hon. Prime Minister yesterday mentioned, and it was very impressive, that India has youth and the best talent in the world. I have no doubt about it. Would the Minister consider making this informal sector into a formal? I want to know whether he would consider that because they already know the job; they can get employment and India can also show the way to the world at large.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, it is a suggestion for contemplation and possible action with two *caveats*. Safety and security have to be there. We are promoting the skilling part in a big way. We will further take this suggestion on the ground. The State Governments have to play a role, but there should be no compromise on safety relating to hazardous waste. That we will have to keep in mind.

10.00 A.M.

**श्री सुशील कुमार मोदी :** सभापति महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री जी से कहना चाहता हूँ कि in his detailed reply, he has mentioned about taking action against illegal processors. Under Section 21, there is a provision for 'liable to pay financial penalty for any violation of the provisions', and under Section 14, there is a power to suspend or cancel an authorization but it has failed to comply with any of the conditions. So, I would like to know from the Minister how many penalties have been collected and how many actions have been taken to suspend or to cancel the authorization.

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** सर, अगर माननीय सदस्य मेरे उत्तर के पैराग्राफ 'सी' की ओर ध्यान देंगे, तो manufacturing sector में इस दिशा में जो कार्रवाई हुई है, उसके बारे में पूरे कितने टन का dismantling process आरम्भ हो गया है, यह विस्तार से दिया हुआ है। अगर आप Annexure-I देखेंगे, तो विभिन्न प्रदेशों में informal sector में कितनी FIRs हुई हैं, बाकी कार्रवाई हुई है या नहीं हुई है, उसका विस्तार से जिक्र किया हुआ है। जहाँ तक उन्होंने penalty के बारे में एक विशेष प्रश्न किया है, मैं इसके details प्राप्त करके उनको बता दूँगा। श्री राजीव सातव। ... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI SUSHIL KUMAR MODI: Sir, my question was regarding ...

**श्री सभापति :** आपका प्रश्न हो गया है, supplementary के ऊपर supplementary नहीं हो सकता है। श्री राजीव सातव।

**श्री राजीव सातव :** सभापति महोदय, यह बहुत important सवाल है। मंत्री जी ने यहाँ पर जो जवाब दिया है, इसमें स्पष्ट दिखता है कि Central Pollution Control Board की तरफ से जो guidelines जा रही हैं, State Pollution Control Board की तरफ से उन guidelines का पूरी तरह से पालन नहीं हो रहा है। आपने इसमें कहा है कि 17 Pollution Control Boards ने यह drive किया है और 12 Pollution Control Boards को कुछ नहीं मिला है।

**श्री सभापति :** आपका सवाल क्या है?

**श्री राजीव सातव :** सर, इसमें सवाल इतना ही है कि क्या सरकार e-waste management में और strict provisions लाने के बारे में सोच रही है, क्योंकि जो काम होना चाहिए, वह काम अभी तक उतना आगे नहीं बढ़ पा रहा है?

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** सर, मैंने कल ही इस प्रश्न की तैयारी के समय इस पर बैठक की थी। मैं माननीय सदस्य को यह बताना चाहूँगा कि हम कल ही इस दिशा में निर्देश दे चुके हैं कि हमारे IT विभाग को, Environment Protection Department को और Pollution Control Board को मिल कर बहुत प्रभावी तरीके से काम करना है। मैं आपको यह स्पष्ट करना चाहूँगा। सर, मेरे पास अभी यह खबर आ गई है, जैसा मैंने कहा था कि U.P. Pollution Control Board ने 60 लाख रुपए का fine लगाया है, यह मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूँ।

**श्री सभापति :** प्रश्न संख्या 111.

#### **Eligibility in reserved constituencies**

\*111. SHRI G.V.L. NARASIMHA RAO: Will the Minister of LAW AND JUSTICE be pleased to state:

(a) Whether Scheduled Caste voters who have converted to Christianity or Islam religion are eligible to contest from reserved assembly and Parliamentary constituencies, if not, legal basis for this position;

(b) the provisions in the election laws or rules which ensure that the converted scheduled Caste voters do not contest from SC reserved seats;

(c) Whether Government is considering amending Representation of People's Act and election rules expressly stating that Dalits converting to Christianity or Islam are ineligible to contest from SC reserved constituencies; and

(d) if so, details of likely amendments to RP Act or election rules and if not, the reasons therefor?

THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD): (a) to (d)  
A statement is laid on the Table of the House.

### **Statement**

(a) and (b) Eligibility to contest from reserved Assembly and Parliamentary Constituencies is as under:-

(i) Concerned citizen must be a member of Scheduled Caste, as notified under Article 341 of the Constitution;

(ii) In the Constitutional Scheme, upliftment of SC/ST and their wellbeing has been considered as an important parameter by the founding fathers of our Constitution.

(iii) Untouchability was abolished under article 17 of the Constitution (Fundamental Right).

(iv) SC/ST's were given reservations in Education, Employment, etc. But, for SC/ST's only political reservation has been provided for contesting in Lok Sabha and State Assembly elections.

(v) However, the Constitutional framers are equally discriminated the SC's which was unfair and wrong tradition of Hindu Society which needs Constitutional correction.

(vi) Therefore, para 3 of the Constitution (Scheduled Castes) Order, 1950 outlines the State wise list of the Scheduled Castes, wherein it has been clearly stated as follows:—

“3. Notwithstanding anything contained in paragraph 2, no person who professes a religion different from the Hindu, the Sikh or the Buddhist religion shall be deemed to be a member of a Scheduled Caste.”



(vii) As per the provisions of Section 4(a) of the Representation of the People Act, 1951, for contesting election to Parliament in case of a seat reserved for the Schedule Caste in any state, he shall be a member of any of the Schedule Castes, whether of that State or of any other State and is an elector for any Parliamentary Constituencies;

(viii) As per the provisions of Section 5(a) of the Representation of the People Act, 1951, for contesting election to the Legislative Assembly from a seat reserved for the Schedule Caste, he shall be a member of any of the of Scheduled Caste of that State and is an elector for any Assembly Constituencies in that State;

(ix) A candidate with valid Scheduled Caste certificate is eligible to contest from Scheduled Caste reserved seats.

(c) No sir. At present, no such proposal is under consideration of the Government.

(d) Does not arise.

SHRI G.V.L. NARASIMHA RAO: Sir, the hon. Minister has replied that as per part 3 of the Constitution (Scheduled Castes) Order, 1950, 'No person who professes a religion different from the Hindu, the Sikh or the Buddhist religion shall be deemed to be a member of the Scheduled Caste.' So, indirectly, he has answered my question that people, erstwhile Scheduled Castes, who converted to Christianity or Islam are ineligible to contest from reserved seats. My question is, when you say, 'profess', a large number of elected representatives, MLAs, MPs, Ministers who got elected from reserved seats, they openly state that 'we practice, we profess Christianity.'

MR. CHAIRMAN: Right. Question, please.

SHRI G.V.L. NARASIMHA RAO: They even practice it. They even propagate it. Therefore, I would like to ask the hon. Minister, as a Government that is interested in protecting and promoting the interests of Scheduled Castes, what protection can you give to Scheduled Castes who belong to Hindu, Sikh and Buddhist religions to get elected from these reserved seats? Thank you.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I must begin with a word of apology. In part (v) of this answer, there is some grammatical error. I sincerely apologize. I had given

instructions. It should be read as 'However, as Constitutional framers, were keen to end the discrimination against SCs which was unfair and a wrong tradition of Hindu Society which needed Constitutional correction.' This should be the right approach. I will make a proper request for that.

Sir, let me share with this House, when the question of reservation and empowerment of our Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe brethren and sisters came about, they were aware for the rationale for which this reservation has to be given. The Scheduled Caste discrimination was a wrong practice of Hindu society. They were aware. And our tribal friends were away from the society in jungles; they needed to be brought in the mainstream. Therefore, it is only these two communities, who apart from reservation in education, employment, have been given political reservation. Therefore, the 1950 Scheduled Castes Order clearly states, 'this shall be available only to Hindus', and later Buddhists and Sikhs were added because in the Constitution they are part of the same rubric. The law is very clear and we uphold this law. We don't want to dilute this law. We don't want to make any compromises. If any specific question of any specific MP's behaviour, MLA's behaviour is there, that can be looked into.

But the status of law is clear and the Representation of the People Act is also clear that you must be a proper Scheduled Caste assigned under Article 341 of the Constitution in a particular State.

SHRI G.V.L. NARASIMHA RAO: Since there is a gross misuse of constitutional provision, I request the hon. Minister to consider having a special provision under Part 2 of the Representation of the People Act dealing with disqualification because such a mention will actually empower the Courts and even the Election Commission of India to adjudicate on matters concerning the ineligibility of some candidates who get elected from reserved seats but have converted to other religions like\*.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Don't mention religion.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, as far as this particular part is concerned, there is a robust provision of challenging an election under the election laws of India. If a person wrongly claims to be one belonging to Scheduled Caste or Scheduled Tribe and has taken the benefit to get elected, his election can be set aside. It has been set aside because a proper and robust mechanism is there. At the time of nomination

---

\* Not recorded.

also, objection can be filed before the Returning Officer and if there is no proper certificate, his candidature can be rejected. I think there has to be greater awareness, but I take his point that the Government and the Election Commission need to work together to ensure greater awareness about this.

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, I am very happy that the hon. Minister has corrected the answer in para (v) of (a) and (b). But I would like him to look into the issue and the person, who is responsible for this, should be punished. My question, through you, is: Is it a fact that Justice Ranganath Commission Report had specifically mentioned the discriminatory behaviour about the brazen acts that the Muslims and the Christians would be denied the right if they are converted to Christianity or Islam amongst the Scheduled Castes. There are Hela communities amongst the Muslims who are doing the scavenger task also. But they are denied the SC status.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your question?

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: My question is: Is it a fact that Justice Ranganath Commission Report had recommended that these too should also be included in the Scheduled Castes?

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** महोदय, मैं बहुत विनम्रता से हमारे वरिष्ठ सदस्य, श्री दिग्विजय सिंह जी की बात का उत्तर देना चाहूंगा। रंगनाथ मिश्र जी की अनुशंसाओं पर हमारी गंभीर आपत्ति है, क्योंकि उस समय जब संविधान बना और 1950 का आदेश बना, उस समय हम नहीं थे। उस समय \* के वरिष्ठ नेता...(व्यवधान)

**श्री सभापति :** आप पार्टी की बात छोड़ दीजिए।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** सर, मुझे बात कंप्लीट तो करने दीजिए।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति :** नहीं, आप पार्टी की बात छोड़ दीजिए।

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Okay; I withdraw. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have already said it. ...(*Interruptions*)... Digvijayaji, I have already said it. ...(*Interruptions*)... Once I say something, Member should not

---

\* Withdrawn by the hon. Minister.

...(Interruptions)... The Chair has already said it. ...(Interruptions)... He also said that he agreed to withdraw.

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** उस समय देश के महान नेता श्री नेहरू जी, राजेन्द्र बाबू, सरदार पटेल, डा. अम्बेडकर और मौलाना आज़ाद, इन सबने मिलकर निर्णय लिया कि इसके लिए हमें यह करना है कि...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, my question is different. ...(Interruptions)... You say, 'Yes' or 'No'.

MR. CHAIRMAN: If you are not satisfied with the answer, then, there is a different procedure. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** सर, उत्तर तो मैं अपने तरीके से ही दूंगा।

**श्री सभापति :** हां, ठीक है।

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** 60-70 साल तक देश में consensus रहा है कि यह सिर्फ हिन्दू सोसाइटी की एक पीड़ा है, discrimination है, इसका रास्ता constitutional correction mechanism है। इस तरह उन्होंने पूरा इस consensus को तोड़ कर, बाकी बात कह दी। सर, अब मैं उस प्रश्न में नहीं जाऊंगा कि conversion किस कारण से हुआ, क्या-क्या inducement हुआ। कहा यह गया कि हमारे यहां सबको equal treat करते हैं, तो अगर आपके यहां सबको equal treat करते हैं, तो फिर discrimination कहां पर है? इस तरह इस पर बहुत लम्बी बहस हो जाएगी।

**श्री समीर उरांव :** सभापति महोदय, मैं इस प्रश्न के सन्दर्भ में यह जानना चाहता हूं कि केरल बनाम चन्द्रमोहन और नॉर्थ-ईस्ट के केस में सुप्रीम कोर्ट का 2014 का एक निर्णय आया था। उस निर्णय में स्पष्ट रूप से यह बताया गया था कि जिस जनजाति समुदाय ने वर्षों-वर्षों से अपने धर्म, संस्कृति, परम्परा, आस्था, विश्वास, विधि-विधान और रूढ़िवादी मान्यता को त्याग दिया है, वह जनजाति समुदाय का सदस्य नहीं हो सकता है। सभापति महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से जानना चाहता हूं कि जनजाति समुदाय के सदस्य के द्वारा आस्था, विश्वास को नहीं मानने के कारण क्या यह सरकार इसे आगे लागू कर सकती है?

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** सर, माननीय सदस्य का प्रश्न बहुत संवेदनशील प्रश्न है। इस मामले में कोर्ट के कई निर्णय हैं। मैं एक बात कह देता हूं, सोसाई बनाम स्टेट ऑफ तमिलनाडु - उसमें पहले एक दलित समाज के भाई थे, बाद में वे क्रिश्चियन हो गये। उन्होंने आरक्षण के नाम पर नौकरी लेने की बात की। सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने कहा - जब तक आप यह नहीं कहेंगे कि बदली हुई परिस्थिति में आप उसी पीड़ा और विषमताओं से पीड़ित हैं, तब तक आपको आरक्षण का लाभ नहीं

मिल सकता। अब वहां जो उन्होंने बात कही है, सुप्रीम कोर्ट और कई कोर्ट्स के और भी फैसले हैं कि अगर आप अपने ओरिजनल फेथ में वापस जाते हैं और आपकी उन मान्यताओं को जनता स्वीकार करती है तो आपको इसका लाभ मिल सकता है। आपने जो एक स्पेसिफिक केस की बात कही है, मेरा ऐसा स्पष्ट रूप से मानना है कि हमारे संविधान के बनाने वाले महान लोगों ने इस पूरे विषय पर बहुत गम्भीरता से विचार किया और फिर इसके दो ही उद्देश्य थे, अपने जो वनवासी जंगल में हैं, उनको समाज की मूल धारा में लाना है, इसलिए वहां पूजा पर कोई नियंत्रण नहीं है, लेकिन जो हमारे दलित बंधु हैं, उनके प्रति हिन्दू समाज में एक दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण विषमता थी, इसलिए उसमें करेक्शन करना जरूरी है, इसलिए उन्हें आरक्षण का लाभ दिया गया। इस प्रिंसिपल को हमें ध्यान रखना जरूरी है।

**श्री सभापति:** समीर जी ऐसे क्षेत्र से आते हैं, जहां यह समस्या गम्भीर है। प्रश्न संख्या-112

### **Memorandum of Understanding with Japan**

\*112. SHRI MAHESH PODDAR: Will the Minister of ELECTRONICS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY be pleased to state:

- (a) the details of the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) signed with Japan by India;
- (b) the specific ways in which the MoU will contribute towards the extension of broadband and internet connectivity in remote areas;
- (c) the specific ways in which the MoU will bolster Government's Smart Cities project; and
- (d) the details of funding-related aspects, if any, under the MoU with Japan?

THE MINISTER OF ELECTRONICS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY (SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD): (a) to (d) A statement is laid on the Table of the House.

### **Statement**

(a) India and Japan share a strategic relationship which is based on appreciation of each other's capabilities and strengths. To extend the India-Japan cooperation activities, a Memorandum of Cooperation (MoC) has been signed between the Ministry of Communications of India and the Ministry of Internal Affairs

and Communications of Japan on 15<sup>th</sup> January 2021 for cooperation in the field of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs). Under the MoC, both sides envisage expansion of the range of cooperation in ICT within the scope of available resources. The MoC promotes cooperation between the two countries in the following areas of ICTs:

- (i) 5G Network
- (ii) Telecom Security
- (iii) Submarine cable technologies
- (iv) Utilization of latest Wireless Technologies and Information and Communication Technologies (ICT)
- (v) Standard certification of communication equipment
- (vi) Public Protection and Disaster Relief (PPDR)
- (vii) ICT capacity building
- (vii) Artificial Intelligence (AI) / Block Chain
- (ix) Spectrum Management
- (x) Cooperation on Multilateral platforms
- (xi) Support for activities of industry partners in the field of ICTs in both the countries
- (xii) Cooperation activities between both sides as decided mutually

Another Memorandum of Cooperation on India-Japan Digital Partnership (IJDP) was signed between Ministry of Electronics and IT (MeitY) of India and Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry (METI) of Japan on 28<sup>th</sup> October 2018. This MoC is aimed at extending cooperation between India and Japan in areas of India-Japan

Startup Initiatives, Digital Corporate Partnership, Electronics Ecosystem, Digital talent, R&D cooperation and Security for future networks. MeitY and METI are nodal agencies to coordinate the implementation of MoC. Under such MoC, MeitY Startup Hub & JETRO have signed a partnership agreement to strengthen the Indian & Japanese tech startup ecosystem. Further, Indo-Japanese economic partnership has been strengthened by investments made by Japanese companies in electronics ecosystem.

(b) The cooperation activities envisaged under the MoC facilitate exchange of best practices in the areas of submarine cables and other communication technologies that are relevant for the extension of broadband and internet

connectivity in remote areas. One of the highlights of Indo-Japan cooperation in this field has been the Chennai - Andaman Nicobar Islands Submarine Cable Project under which a submarine Optical Fibre Cable of 2300 km length connecting Chennai to Port Blair and other islands of Andaman & Nicobar was completed.

(c) India has flagship programmes like “Digital India”, “Smart City” and “Start-up India” and Japan has the concept of “Society 5.0” to promote “Ease of Living” with focus on next-generation technologies such as Artificial Intelligence (AI), Big Data and IoT (Internet of Things) etc. In view of these complementarities, both the ICT and Digital Cooperation MoC promote mutual cooperation towards realization of smart cities by utilizing state-of-the-art wireless technologies and other emerging technologies.

(d) The activities mentioned in these Memorandum of Cooperation are implemented by both sides within the limits of available resources and in accordance with applicable laws and regulations of their respective countries.

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद:** सर, मुझे एक मिनट दे दें, आज मेरे कई सवाल हैं, इसलिए थोड़ा सा समय दे दें।

**श्री सभापति:** आप जवाब अच्छा देते हैं, इसलिए सवाल भी ज्यादा होते हैं।

**SHRI MAHESH PODDAR:** Sir, while complimenting the Government for entering into Memorandum of Cooperation (MoC) with Japan on Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs), I would like to ask the hon. Minister, through you, whether this MoC will contribute towards more investment from Japan in Internet connectivity, digital health services, etc., where they have the global lead.

**SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD:** Sir, I must thank the hon. Member for asking a very relevant question. Japan is our strategic partner and, therefore, this partnership is not only strategic but also in the vast field of technology. The first MoU we had in the field of IT and the second in the field of telecom, and we are working in a very robust manner with Japanese company. Of late, India has become a big centre of electronic manufacturing, consumer electronics, mobile electronics, laptop, etc., and Japanese companies are coming. Automobile electronics have also come in a very big way. Similarly, in technology also, for 5G, for artificial intelligence, Japanese companies have achieved a great mark. There is enough scope to work, and I think these two

traditional democratic societies have a very healthy relationship which got reinforced under the leadership of hon. Prime Minister, Shri Narendra Modi, over the years. There is enough scope to work more comprehensively which we will continue to do.

SHRI MAHESH PODDAR: What are the takeaways from this Memorandum of Cooperation which may serve as an example or standards for future bilateral negotiations with other countries towards technical innovations and financing the same?

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: I think the hon. Member would agree that Digital India Programme today is being talked about globally, and, therefore, countries in the world are very keen to work with India in the field of digital inclusion and digital delivery of services. I will convey to the hon. Member the countries with which we have MoUs, but as far as Japan is concerned, our relationship is very robust, very effective and mutually beneficial.

SHRI K.J. ALPHONS: Sir, the biggest Internet digital revolution in the world is happening in India and I compliment the Government for that. But, Sir, the heart of all this is the micro-processor and most of the research in the world on micro-processor is happening in India, but, unfortunately, we are manufacturing none. I think this is a huge failure on the part of India. While we have succeeded greatly in the Internet revolution, what is the Government doing about it because we have failed in our traditional incentive systems?

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I would like to tell the hon. Member who has worked with me in this Ministry that Koo, a Made in India micro blogging platform today has become a big toast of success, who are not only using Indian technology, Indian server. Let us salute the extraordinary courage of our start up movement leaders. But I take your point that there is a need to make more and more processor and we are addressing those areas of interest and concern both.

**श्री सभापति:** फौजिया खान जी, आप सवाल पूछिए। ...(Interruptions)... आप बैठ जाइए। You please sit down and ask the question.

DR. FAUZIA KHAN: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to ask the Minister, and, fortunately, hon. Prime Minister is also present in the House, whether the Government is planning to innovate newer technologies of its own like the Li-Fi, the



Light Fidelity, which is being developed around the world, whether this is included in the MoU with Japan, and, whether the Government is exploring collaboration with foreign companies like Starlink for low latency broadband to stay in competition in the world.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Our R&D in the field of electronic manufacturing is getting robust traction day by day. The hon. Member has asked about a specific product, Li-Fi. I will have to acquire the facts and I will revert to her but let us all acknowledge that in many of these R&Ds globally, it is the Indian scientists who are working there, and, India also is becoming a big centre of R&D of foreign companies in India itself, whether it is Mumbai, whether it is Pune, whether it is Chennai. Therefore, for me, it is a great pleasure..

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Bengaluru and Hyderabad.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Yes, yes. Bengaluru and Hyderabad. I always get educated by the hon. Member, Jairam Ramesh ji. ... (Interruptions)... There is no problem.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The problem is that he is highly educated.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Therefore, for me, it is a matter of great pride to see Indians heading so many big multinational technological companies and whenever I meet them, I feel very great pride. On the specific query of the hon. Member regarding the particular product, I will get the facts and revert to her. We are promoting broadband mission in a very big way. Hon. Prime Minister launched it and we are going to expand broadband connectivity in every nook and corner of the country.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Whenever we talk about IT, names of cities like Hyderabad and Bengaluru naturally come to mind. Q. No. 113.

### Report on Media Manipulation survey

\*113. SHRI SUSHIL KUMAR GUPTA: Will the Minister of ELECTRONICS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to a report about media manipulation survey from University of Oxford Institute stating that social media manipulation of public opinion is a growing threat to democracies, including that of India;

(b) the steps that are being taken to ensure that people are able to rely on trustworthy information about Government policies and activities; and

(c) the steps being taken to save people from becoming target of disinformation and misinformation campaigns launched by some of the neighbouring countries?

THE MINISTER FOR ELECTRONICS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY (SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD): (a) to (c) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

#### Statement

(a) There had been media reports that Oxford University has published a survey report entitled “Industrialized Disinformation 2020 : Global Inventory of Organized Social Media Manipulation”. The report highlights the recent trends of computational propaganda across 81 countries and the evolving tools, capacities, strategies, and resources used to manipulate public opinion around the globe.

(b) and (c) Government has taken several steps to ensure about trustworthy information about Government policies and activities and safeguard people from becoming target of disinformation and misinformation campaigns, These, *inter alia*, include :

(i) Government has set up a portal **india.gov.in** to disseminate trustworthy Government policies and activities. The Portal provides a single window access to the information and services being provided by the Indian Government for citizens and other stakeholders. The Portal endeavours to provide comprehensive, accurate, reliable and one-stop source of information about India and its various facets and links to other Indian Government Portals/websites, which are also working on “gov.in” domain.

(ii) Government actively participated in a Committee specially constituted by Election Commission of India to address the issue of misuse of digital and social media in particularly for the last general election campaign in 2019. Based on the

recommendations of the Committee, the Election Commission has worked closely with the industry. A code of commitment was developed. Both Election Commission and social media platforms worked as per the code of commitment for speedy removal of any objectionable or unlawful content.

(iii) Ministry of Information and Broadcasting has set up a dedicated cell (Counter Misinformation Unit) under Press Information Bureau (PIB) as a measure to counter fake news on policies, schemes, programs etc. by Government of India.

The Unit has a presence on prominent social media platforms like Twitter, Facebook and Instagram. The unit takes *suo moto* cognizance of fake news going viral on social media and also on basis of outside complaints.

(iv) Ministry of Electronics & Information Technology (MeitY) and Ministry of Home Affairs (MHA) as well as Police are in regular touch with various social media platforms to effectively address the issue of removal of objectionable content.

(v) Ministry of Home affairs (MHA) and MeitY has issued a number of advisories which includes advisory on untoward incidents in the name of protection of cows dated 09.08.2016, advisory on cyber-crime prevention and control dated 13.01.2018, advisory on incidents of lynching by mobs in some States fueled by rumors of lifting/kidnapping of children dated 04.07.2018, advisory. MeitY on 20.03.2020 issued an advisory to major social media platforms urging them to:

- initiate awareness campaign on their platforms for the users not to upload/circulate any false news/misinformation concerning corona virus which are likely to create panic among public and disturb the public order and social tranquility;
- take immediate action to disable /remove such content hosted on their platforms on priority basis;
- promote dissemination of authentic information related to corona virus as far as possible.

(vi) MeitY regularly interacts with social media platforms on issues related to spread of fake news, misinformation/disinformation on Internet. Government takes appropriate action as per law against the non-compliance by social media platforms. Social media platforms have implemented a number of steps to address the issue of fake news propagated using their platform.

(vii) Section 69A of the IT Act, 2000 empowers Government to block any information generated, transmitted, received, stored or hosted in any computer resource in the interest of sovereignty and integrity of India, defence of India, security

of the State, friendly relations with foreign states or public order or for preventing incitement to the commission of any cognizable offence relating to above.

(viii) MeitY through a program, namely, Information Security Education & Awareness (ISEA), has been creating awareness among users highlighting the importance of following the ethics while using Internet and advising them not to share rumors/fake news. A dedicated website for information security awareness (<https://www.infosecawareness.in>) provides relevant awareness material.

**श्री सुशील कुमार गुप्ता:** सभापति महोदय, जैसा कि मंत्री जी ने अपने जवाब में बताया, ऑक्सफोर्ड यूनिवर्सिटी की रिपोर्ट के अनुसार 81 देशों में सोशल मीडिया के माध्यम से हालिया रुझानों और सार्वजनिक राय को हेराफेरी करने के लिए यूज किया गया। भारत के निर्वाचन आयोग ने भी 2019 के आम चुनाव में सोशल मीडिया के दुरुपयोग को रोकने के लिए एक कमेटी का गठन किया, ताकि चुनाव में उसका दुष्प्रचार जो हो रहा था, उसके ऊपर एक्शन लिया जा सके। माननीय सभापति जी, मैं आपके माध्यम से मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूँ कि सरकार ने झूठी सोशल मीडिया को रोकने के लिए क्या-क्या कानून बनाये हैं और क्या-क्या कानून बनने की प्रक्रिया में हैं?

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद:** सर, यह एक बहुत ही संवेदनशील प्रश्न है। मैं आपसे कृपापूर्वक अनुमति चाहूँगा कि मुझे थोड़ा सा elaborate करने का अवसर दें, क्योंकि इसके माध्यम से मुझे एक संदेश भी देना है।

सर, हम सोशल मीडिया का बहुत सम्मान करते हैं। सोशल मीडिया ने आम लोगों को empower किया है। 'डिजिटल इंडिया' प्रोग्राम में सोशल मीडिया की भी बहुत बड़ी भूमिका है। हम आलोचना के अधिकार का भी सम्मान करते हैं। प्रधान मंत्री से लेकर सरकार तक की आप आलोचना कर सकते हैं, क्योंकि ये संविधान का अंग हैं, लेकिन अगर सोशल मीडिया का दुरुपयोग हिंसा, fake news, वैमनस्य बढ़ाने के लिए किया जायेगा, तो कार्रवाई होगी, यह मैं बहुत विनम्रता से कहना चाहता हूँ।

सर, दूसरी बात, हम भारत के चुनाव की प्रक्रिया को बहुत ही आदर से लेते हैं और चुनाव आयोग ने बहुत ही बढ़िया काम किया है। अगर सोशल मीडिया का दुरुपयोग करके कोई चुनाव को भ्रष्टाचार से प्रभावित करने की कोशिश करेगा, तो सख्त कार्रवाई की जायेगी, यह भी मैं कहना चाहता हूँ। उसमें चुनाव आयोग के साथ-साथ सरकारें भी काम करेंगी।

सर, जहाँ तक fake news का सवाल है, मित्रवर प्रकाश जी यहाँ बैठे हुए हैं, हमने fake news को burst करने के लिए एक platform बनाया हुआ है और जो fake news डालता है, तुरंत उसका correction भी यहाँ आ जाता है। मैं आज इस सदन के माध्यम से, चाहे वह Twitter हो, चाहे वह Facebook हो, चाहे वह LinkedIn हो, चाहे वह WhatsApp हो या कोई हो, मैं विनम्रता से आग्रह करूँगा कि आप भारत में काम करिए, आपके करोड़ों followers हैं, हम उसका सम्मान करते हैं, पैसे भी कमाइए, लेकिन आपको भारत के संविधान का पालन करना होगा, भारत के कानून का पालन करना होगा - यह हम कहना चाहते हैं।

**श्री सुशील कुमार गुप्ता :** सर, स्वीडन के V-Dem Institute की साल 2020 की डेमोक्रेसी रिपोर्ट में कहा गया है कि नरेन्द्र मोदी सरकार में मीडिया, नागरिक समाज और विपक्ष के लिए कम होती जगह के कारण भारत ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति :** यह क्या सवाल है? यह कौन-सी रिपोर्ट है?

**श्री सुशील कुमार गुप्ता :** सर, स्वीडन के V-Dem Institute की रिपोर्ट है।

**श्री सभापति :** स्वीडन के V-Dem Institute का यहाँ से क्या संबंध है? उनसे हमारा क्या संबंध है? You are quoting some report from somewhere. These are all political. वह अपनी ओर देखे। The countries which are commenting about the internal affairs of India, they should look inward and then talk about these things. Please don't encourage such people.

**श्री सुशील कुमार गुप्ता :** सर, मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि पड़ोसी देशों के द्वारा जो झूठे प्रचार किए जा रहे हैं, उनको रोकने के लिए भारत सरकार क्या कदम उठ रही है? इसके साथ ही सोशल मीडिया के माध्यम से जो झूठी खबरें देश के अंदर फैलाई जा रही हैं, उनके खिलाफ कितने मुकदमे दर्ज हुए हैं?

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** सर, मैं यह बताना चाहूँगा कि अभी हमने Twitter को बाकायदा ब्लैक किया है, चूँकि हमारे विभाग के लोग बातचीत में हैं, इसलिए मुझे यह सदन में नहीं बोलना था, बाहर नहीं बोलना था। अभी आपने बहुत अच्छी टिप्पणी की। सर, ऐसा क्या है कि जब Washington के Capitol Hill पर ransacking होती है, पुलिस को कार्रवाई करनी पड़ती है, तो कुछ micro blogging कंपनीज़ उसके साथ खड़ी हो जाती हैं और जब यहाँ पर लाल किले पर हमला होता है, जो भारत की गरिमा का प्रतीक है, तो वे उसके विरोध में खड़े हो जाते हैं? यह डबल स्टैंडर्ड नहीं चलेगा, इसको सारी कंपनियाँ जान लें। भारत के संविधान में Freedom of Speech है, लेकिन 19(2) में यह भी लिखा हुआ है, 'it is subject to reasonable restrictions because of sovereignty and integrity of India.' यह क्या मज़ाक है कि आप Narendra Modi, massacre of kisan' hashtag करते हैं? इसका मतलब क्या है?

सर, मैं इन लोगों से यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि आप वैमनस्य न फैलाएँ, आप हिंसा न फैलाएँ, झूठी खबरें न फैलाएँ और भारत के संविधान तथा भारत के कानून का पालन करें। इसके लिए हम बहुत ही सख्त रहेंगे।

**डा. विनय पी. सहस्त्रबुद्धे :** सभापति महोदय, सोशल मीडिया और मीडिया में एक महत्वपूर्ण फर्क यह है कि सोशल मीडिया में हमें अपनी जो बात कहनी है, उसकी पूरी स्वाधीनता होती है, मगर जब खुद को platform कहने वाले सोशल मीडिया संस्थान, 'मैंने क्या कहना, कहना या नहीं

कहना', इस पर नियंत्रण लाते हैं, तो वह एक दृष्टि से मीडिया होता है। अगर वह मीडिया की पद्धति से काम करता है, तो क्या सरकार Press Council का कानून या फिर Foreign Direct Investment के संबंध में जो नियम हैं, उनको सोशल मीडिया प्लेटफॉर्म पर लागू करने के बारे में सोचेगी, क्योंकि इस विषय में Electronics and Telecommunications की संसदीय स्थाई समिति ने भी recommendations की हुई हैं।

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** सर, मुझे उस स्टैंडिंग कमेटी की अनुशंसाओं का ज्ञान है, मैं इतना कहूँगा कि मित्रवर प्रकाश जावडेकर और मैं, हम दोनों पूरी गाइडलाइन्स को revisit कर रहे हैं और जैसे ही हम लोगों का फाइनल मंतव्य बन जाएगा, तब हम इस पर बताएँगे और उसकी प्रति सदन में भी रखेंगे।

सर, माननीय सदस्य ने जो एक बात कही है, वह बहुत ही महत्वपूर्ण बात है कि जब आप एक प्लेटफॉर्म बनते हैं, तो आप अपना स्वयं का एक कानून बनाते हैं कि हम उसी से जाँचेंगे कि क्या सही है, क्या गलत है और उसमें भारत के संविधान तथा भारत के कानून की कोई जगह नहीं होगी, यह तो नहीं चलेगा। आप यहाँ पर हैं, आप आइए, आपके काम का सम्मान है, आप जो अच्छा काम कर रहे हैं, उसका सम्मान है, आप व्यापार करिए, एफडीआई लाइए, पैसे लाइए, लेकिन आपको भारत के संविधान और भारत के कानून का सम्मान करना पड़ेगा - यह हम बहुत स्पष्टता से कहना चाहेंगे।

SHRI SYED NASIR HUSSAIN: Sir, European Union DisinfoLab has published a report on news agencies like ANI for spreading disinformation in order to portray a positive image of the Government. I just heard the Minister mentioning that they have created a mechanism to burst the fake news. I just want to ask the Minister whether they are also taking action against those channels who are spreading fake news and who are giving wrong facts even in the media channels.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, my Department takes action from time to time. Especially details, I will convey. Shri Prakash Javadekar's Information and Broadcasting Ministry also takes action from time to time. Sir, today, I seek your permission to make one statement with the greatest of respect. This Government is led by leaders who have fought for the freedom of individuals, freedom of the media and independence of the judiciary, particularly during the emergency days. It includes the Prime Minister. It includes you. It includes Raj Nath ji. It includes Prakash Javadekar ji. It includes me also. Our commitment to the freedom of the media, rights of individuals and independence of judiciary is complete and total. But we are equally concerned about safety, security and sovereignty of India.

SHRI N.R. ELANGO: Sir, what are the steps taken to protect the privacy of individuals in this area?

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, privacy is a very important right. The Supreme Court has held that privacy is a fundamental right. Many areas of gap which you have in mind will be addressed when we come with the new guidelines in the appropriate time. It is a work in progress. Today, I would also like to gently convey this to these media platforms. Freedom is important. But when you abuse it in such a manner that you are showing revenge sex videos, you are showing porn in unbridled way, you are showing fight on the streets designed to ignite super-violence in an unbridled way.. Please. Family issues on the social media! I would urge the social media, if you have certain internal guideline, please measure these unbridled exposure on the standards of your own guidelines and take action.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Q.No.114.

#### **Funds for various schemes in Andhra Pradesh**

\*114. SHRI KANAKAMEDALA RAVINDRA KUMAR: Will the Minister of TRIBAL AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

- (a) the details of funds allocated/granted under various schemes of the Ministry to the State of Andhra Pradesh during the last three years;
- (b) the details of funds released under such schemes to the State during the last three years;
- (c) the details of funds yet to be released/ due to the State; and
- (d) the fixed time-frame by which these funds would be released to the State?

THE MINISTER OF TRIBAL AFFAIRS (SHRI ARJUN MUNDA): (a) to (d) A statement is laid on the table of the house.

#### **Statement**

(a) to (c) The Statement showing details of funds granted, released and due to the State of Andhra Pradesh during the last three years under various schemes of Ministry of Tribal Affairs is at **Annexure-I**.

(d) No funds is due for release to the State of Andhra Pradesh out of the funds granted during the last three years.



**Annexure-I****(Rs. in Crores)**

S. No.	Schemes	2017-2018			2018-2019			2019-2020		
		Funds granted	Funds released	Pending release	Funds granted	Funds released	Pending release	Funds granted	Funds released	Pending release
1.	Aid To Voluntary Organisations Working For The Welfare Of Scheduled Tribes*	0.664	0.664	0.00	1.471	1.471	0.00	1.037	1.037	0.00
2.	Development Of Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups	20.76	20.76	0.00	18.37	18.37	0.00	37.134	37.134	0.00
3.	Grants Under Proviso To Article 275 (1) Of The Constitution (including EMRS)	45.911	45.911	0.00	63.908	63.908	0.00	89.424	89.424	0.00
4.	Minimum Support Price For Minor Forest Produce(MSP For MFP)	3.000	3.000	0.00	7.095	7.095	0.00	--	--	--
5.	National Fellowship And Scholarship For Higher Education Of ST Students#	0.146	0.146	0.00	0.136	0.136	0.00	0.122	0.122	0.00
6.	Post Matric Scholarship Tribal	82.691	82.691	0.00	139.450	139.450	0.00	77.971	77.971	0.00
7.	Pre Matric Scholarship Tribal	52.829	52.829	0.00	12.108	12.108	0.00	7.363	7.363	0.00
8.	Special Central Assistance To Tribal Sub Schemes	36.248	36.248	0.00	56.174	56.174	0.00	124.705	124.705	0.00
9.	Support to Tribal Research Institutes	9.404	9.404	0.00	7.496	7.496	0.00	5.00	5.00	0.00

\*Under this scheme funds have been released directly to the organization working in the State of Andhra Pradesh.

# Funds have been directly transferred to the beneficiaries through DBT.

SHRI KANAKAMEDALA RAVINDRA KUMAR: Sir, education is an important tool for emancipation of the downtrodden. Three districts in the State of Andhra Pradesh have high ST population. They are: Visakhapatnam, Vizianagaram and SRSP Nellore. I would like to know from the Minister whether any special focus has been given to these districts and high allocation of fund has been proposed under the Eklavya Model Residential School so that more and more tribal students are brought under formal education system and whether the State Government has sent any specific proposal for this purpose.

**श्री अर्जुन मुंडा :** सभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्य को पूरे तरीके से उत्तर दे दिया है, लेकिन इसके अलावा भी इन्होंने कुछ जिलों के बारे में कहा है। मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि राज्य सरकार की तरफ से ऐसे जो भी प्रस्ताव आते हैं, उन पर राज्य और मंत्रालय के साथ मिलकर PAC की बैठक होती है और उस बैठक के माध्यम से उन महत्वपूर्ण योजनाओं को, चाहे वे शिक्षा के क्षेत्र में हों या स्वास्थ्य के क्षेत्र में हों, उनको स्वीकृत किया जाता है और उनके लिए पर्याप्त राशि दी जाती है। इससे पहले जो माननीय सदस्य ने पूछा था, उसकी पूरी सूचना दे दी गई है। स्टेट गवर्नमेंट को जितनी भी उनकी स्कीम्स से रिलेटेड राशि की आवश्यकता थी, वह सारी राशि उपलब्ध करा दी गई है।

SHRI KANAKAMEDALA RAVINDRA KUMAR: Sir, the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment in its Twelfth Report submitted in September 2020 noted with concern that during the last three years only 30 students joined the universities abroad under the National Overseas Scholarship Scheme. I would like to know the reasons from hon. Minister for very poor enrolment of tribal students in the universities abroad. Is it because of lack of funds or lack of universities?

**श्री अर्जुन मुंडा :** सभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्य ने यह विषय उठाया है, मैं आपके माध्यम से बताना चाहता हूँ कि हम इसमें सीमित हजार स्टूडेंट्स को उपलब्ध कराते हैं। इसके अलावा भी अतिरिक्त होता है, तो उसे उपलब्ध कराने की कोशिश की जाती है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Q.No.115.

**Rise in crimes against women**

\*115. SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: Will the Minister of WOMEN AND CHILD DEVELOPMENT be pleased to state:

- (a) whether it is a fact that over the last few years, crimes against women have been consistently rising in the country including Uttar Pradesh, including the horrific Hathras case;
- (b) if so, the reasons for huge rise in crimes against women in the country including UP;
- (c) whether the Central Government has sought an explanation as to why the State administration has failed to create a safe environment for women;
- (d) whether any specific measure has been taken to address the issue of women safety across the country; and
- (e) if so, the details thereof?

THE MINISTER OF WOMEN AND CHILD DEVELOPMENT (SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI): (a) to (e) A statement is laid on the table of the House.

**Statement**

(a) and (b) National Crime Records Bureau (NCRB) compiles and publishes statistical data on crimes in its publication "Crime in India". Published reports are available till the year 2019. Analysis of this data for cases registered under various heads of crimes against women do not show any uniform trend.

(c) to (e) 'Police' and 'Public Order' are State subjects under the Seventh Schedule to the Constitution of India. The responsibility to maintain law and order, protection of life and property of the citizens including women are with the respective State Governments. The State governments are competent to deal with such offences under the extant provision of law.

The Government has taken a number of initiatives to address the issue of women safety across the country. These include legislations such as 'The Criminal Law (Amendment) Act, 2018', 'The Criminal Law (Amendment) Act, 2013', 'The Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act, 2013', 'The Protection of Women from Domestic Violence Act, 2006', 'The Dowry Prohibition Act, 1961', etc. The Criminal Law (Amendment) Act,

2018 was enacted to prescribe even more stringent penal provisions including death penalty for rape of a girl below the age of 12 years. The Act also inter-alia mandates completion of investigation and trials in two months respectively.

The major schemes/ projects pertaining to safety and security of women and girls include implementation of One Stop Centres (OSCs), Universalisation of Women Helplines (WHL), Emergency Response Support System (ERSS) which is a pan-India single number (112)/ mobile app based system for emergencies like police, ambulance and fire, a cyber-crime reporting portal to report obscene content, safe city projects in 8 cities, training and skill development programs for Investigation Officers, Prosecution Officers and Medical Officers, distribution of Sexual Assault Evidence Collection (SAEC) Kits to States/ UTs, establishment of state of the art DNA Laboratory at CFSL, Chandigarh, assistance to 20 States/ UTs to strengthen Forensic Science Laboratories, setting up/ strengthening of Anti Human Trafficking Units (AHTUs) in all districts of the country, setting up/ strengthening of Women Help Desks (WHDs) at Police Stations etc. The government also assists the States/ UTs for setting up of 1023 Fast Track Special Courts (FTSCs) for speedy disposal of cases of rape and cases under POCSO Act. Ministry of Home Affairs (MHA) has launched the 'National Database on Sexual Offenders (NDSO)' on 20.09.2018 to facilitate investigation and tracking of sexual offenders across the country by law enforcement agencies. MHA has also launched an online analytic tool 'Investigation Tracking System for Sexual Offences' on 19.02.2019 to facilitate them to monitor and track time bound investigation in sexual assault cases in accordance with Criminal Law (Amendment) Act, 2018.

In addition, Ministry of Women and Child Development, from time to time, has issued advisories to all State Governments/ UT Administrations to ensure effective implementation of the Acts and schemes administered/ implemented by the Ministry. Meetings/ Video conferences have also been held with all State Governments/ UT administrations in this regard.

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे :** सर, मैंने एक क्वेश्चन पूछा था, whether it is a fact that over the last few years, crimes against women have been consistently rising in the country including Uttar Pradesh, including the horrific Hathras Case. यह हमने पूछा था। मेरे प्रश्न (a) से (e) तक के लिए उन्होंने उत्तर दिया है, जिसमें हाथरस इंसिडेंट हो या यूपी के इंसिडेंट्स हों...

**श्री सभापति :** क्वेश्चन पूछिए, टाइम खत्म हो रहा है। आप सवाल पूछिए, because the Minister will answer. टाइम खत्म हो गया है, otherwise मुझे कोई आपत्ति नहीं है।

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे :** सर, मैंने जो क्वेश्चन पूछा था, उसका उत्तर इसमें नहीं है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, time is over. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे :** सर, इसमें मेरे क्वेश्चन का उत्तर ही नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What can I do? ...(Interruptions)... Time is upto 10.30. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे : \***

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no, it is not going on record. ...(Interruptions)... Mallikarjun Khargeji, you are very senior. Now, Question Hour is over. ...(Interruptions)... What can I do? ...(Interruptions)... You may get another opportunity. ...(Interruptions)... Please. ...(Interruptions)... Now, Statement by the Defence Minister. ...(Interruptions)... आप लोग प्लीज सुनिए। ...(व्यवधान)... Half-an-hour or whatever it is, what can I do? ...(Interruptions)... Question Hour is Question Hour. ...(Interruptions)... You have to send notice to me if at all you want an extra discussion.

*[Answers to Starred and Unstarred Questions (Both in English and Hindi) are available as Part-I to this Debate, published electronically on the Rajya Sabha website under the link <https://rajyasabha.nic.in/Debates/OfficialDebatesDateWise>]*

---

## STATEMENT BY MINISTER

### Present situation in Eastern Ladakh

**श्री सभापति :** राजनाथ सिंह जी, क्या आपके वक्तव्य की कॉपी सब को वितरित कर दी गई है?

**रक्षा मंत्री (श्री राजनाथ सिंह) :** जी हाँ, कर दी गई है।

---

\* Not recorded.

**श्री सभापति :** यहाँ नहीं आई है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... By the time the Minister start speaking, it is better that Members have the Statement in their hands. यह बहुत महत्वपूर्ण मामला है, sensitive मामला है, कृपया ध्यान दें।

**श्री राजनाथ सिंह :** आदरणीय सभापति महोदय, पिछले साल सितम्बर में इस गरिमामयी सदन के समक्ष मैंने एक विस्तृत वक्तव्य ईस्टर्न लद्दाख में भारत-चीन सीमा पर हुई developments के बारे में दिया था। मैंने यह बताया था कि चीन द्वारा पिछले वर्ष अप्रैल-मई, 2020 के दौरान ईस्टर्न लद्दाख की सीमा के समीप भारी संख्या में सशस्त्र बल तथा गोला-बारूद आदि इकट्ठा कर लिया गया था। चीन द्वारा LAC के आस पास कई बार transgression का प्रयास भी किया गया था। हमारी सशस्त्र सेनाओं ने उन सभी प्रयासों के दृष्टिगत उपयुक्त जवाबी कार्रवाई की थी। राष्ट्र के साथ इस सदन ने भी उन वीर भारतीय सैनिकों को श्रद्धांजलि दी थी, जिन्होंने भारत की सीमा की रक्षा करते हुए अपना बलिदान दिया था। आज मैं इस सदन को कुछ और महत्वपूर्ण developments के बारे में बताना चाहता हूँ।

सभापति महोदय, पिछले वर्ष सितम्बर से दोनों पक्षों ने एक-दूसरे के साथ military और diplomatic channels द्वारा संवाद स्थापित कर रखा है। हमारा यह लक्ष्य है कि LAC पर disengagement तथा यथास्थिति हो जाए, ताकि peace and tranquility पुनः स्थापित हो सके।

सभापति महोदय, मैं संक्षेप में वहाँ की ground situation के बारे में सदन को दोबारा अवगत कराना चाहता हूँ। सदन को ज्ञात है कि चीन ने अनधिकृत तरीके से लद्दाख केन्द्र शासित प्रदेश के लगभग 38,000 वर्ग किमी पर 1962 के संघर्ष के समय से कब्जा बना लिया है। इसके अतिरिक्त, पाकिस्तान ने अनधिकृत तरीके से Pak-occupied Kashmir में भारत की लगभग 5,180 वर्ग किमी भूमि तथाकथित Sino-Pakistan Boundary Agreement, 1963 के तहत चीन को दे दी है। इस प्रकार, चीन का 43,000 वर्ग किमी से ज्यादा भारतीय भूमि पर अनधिकृत कब्जा है। चीन पूर्वी क्षेत्रों में भी अरुणाचल प्रदेश की सीमा पर करीब 90,000 वर्ग किमी भूमि को अपना बताता है। भारत ने इन unjustified claims तथा अनधिकृत कब्जे को कभी भी स्वीकार नहीं किया है।

सभापति महोदय, मैं सदन को यह भी बताना चाहता हूँ कि भारत ने चीन को हमेशा यह कहा है कि bilateral relation दोनों पक्षों के प्रयास से ही विकसित हो सकते हैं। साथ ही, सीमा के प्रश्न को भी बातचीत के ज़रिए ही हल किया जा सकता है। परंतु, LAC पर peace and tranquility में किसी प्रकार की प्रतिकूल स्थिति का हमारी bilateral ties पर बुरा असर पड़ता है। इससे चीन भी अच्छी तरह से अवगत है। कई high level joint statements में भी यह जिक्र किया गया है कि LAC तथा सीमाओं पर peace and tranquility कायम रखना bilateral relation के लिए अत्यंत आवश्यक है। माननीय सभापति महोदय, पिछले वर्ष से चीन के द्वारा उठाए गए कदमों के कारण peace and tranquility पर प्रतिकूल असर पड़ा है। इसके फलस्वरूप चीन और भारत के संबंधों पर भी प्रभाव पड़ा है। उच्च स्तर पर चीन के साथ कई बार बातचीत के दौरान, जिसमें मेरे द्वारा चीनी रक्षा मंत्री के साथ पिछले सितम्बर की बैठक, मेरे सहयोगी विदेश मंत्री, श्री जयशंकर जी की चीनी विदेश मंत्री के साथ तथा NSA, श्री अजीत डोभाल जी की अपने चीनी counterpart के साथ बातचीत शामिल है, हमने यह स्पष्ट कर दिया है कि यह अत्यंत आवश्यक

है कि LAC के सभी friction Points पर disengagement किया जाए ताकि peace and tranquility पुनः स्थापित हो सके।

सभापति महोदय, पिछले वर्ष मैंने इस सदन को अवगत कराया था कि LAC के आस-पास Eastern Ladakh में कई friction areas बन गए हैं। चीन ने बड़ी संख्या में सेना एवं गोला-बारूद आदि भी LAC के आस-पास तथा उसके पीछे अपने क्षेत्रों में इकट्ठा कर लिया है। हमारी सशस्त्र सेनाओं द्वारा भी भारत की सुरक्षा की दृष्टि से adequate तथा effective counter deployment किए गए हैं।

सभापति महोदय, मुझे यह बताते हुए गर्व महसूस हो रहा है कि भारतीय सेनाओं ने इन सभी चुनौतियों का डट कर सामना किया है तथा अपने शौर्य एवं बहादुरी का परिचय Pangong Tso के south एवं north bank पर दिया है। सामरिक दृष्टि से महत्वपूर्ण कई क्षेत्रों को चिन्हित कर हमारी सेनाएं कई पहाड़ियों के ऊपर तथा हमारे दृष्टिकोण से उपयुक्त अन्य क्षेत्रों पर मौजूद हैं। भारतीय सेनाएं अत्यंत बहादुरी से लद्दाख की ऊंची दुर्गम पहाड़ियों तथा कई मीटर बर्फ के बीच में भी सीमाओं की रक्षा करते हुए अडिग हैं और इसी कारण हमारा edge बना हुआ है। हमारी सेनाओं ने इस बार भी यह साबित करके दिखाया है कि भारत की सम्प्रभुता एवं अखंडता की रक्षा करने में वे सदैव हर चुनौती से लड़ने के लिए तत्पर हैं और अनवरत कर रही हैं।

माननीय सभापति महोदय, पिछले वर्ष से military and diplomatic स्तर पर चीन के साथ हमारा संवाद बना रहा है। इस बातचीत में हमने चीन को यह बताया है कि तीन सिद्धांतों के आधार पर हम इस समस्या का समाधान चाहते हैं:

- (i) दोनों पक्षों द्वारा LAC को माना जाए और उसका आदर किया जाए।
- (ii) किसी भी पक्ष द्वारा unilaterally status quo बदलने का प्रयास नहीं किया जाए।
- (iii) सभी समझौतों का दोनों पक्षों द्वारा पूर्ण रूप से पालन किया जाए।

Friction क्षेत्रों में disengagement के लिए भारत का यह मत है कि 2020 की forward deployments, जो एक-दूसरे के बहुत नजदीक हैं, वे दूर हो जाएं और दोनों सेनाएं वापस अपनी-अपनी स्थाई एवं मान्य चौकियों पर लौट जाएं।

माननीय सभापति महोदय, बातचीत के लिए हमारी strategy तथा approach माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी के इस दिशा-निर्देश पर आधारित है कि हम अपनी एक इंच जमीन भी किसी और को नहीं लेने देंगे। हमारे दृढ़ संकल्प का ही यह फल है कि हम समझौते की स्थिति पर पहुंच गए हैं।

महोदय, इन दिशा-निर्देशों के दृष्टिगत सितम्बर, 2020 से लगातार military and diplomatic स्तर पर दोनों पक्षों में कई बार बातचीत हुई है कि इस disengagement का mutually acceptable तरीका निकाला जाए। अभी तक Senior Commanders के स्तर पर 9 rounds की बातचीत हो चुकी है। राजनयिक स्तर पर भी WMCC (Working Mechanism for Consultation and Coordination on India-China Border Affairs) के तहत बैठकें होती रही हैं।

माननीय सभापति महोदय, मुझे सदन को यह बताते हुए खुशी हो रही है कि हमारी इस approach तथा sustained talks के फलस्वरूप चीन के साथ Pangong Lake के north एवं south bank पर disengagement का समझौता हो गया है। इस बात पर भी सहमति हो गई है कि Pangong Lake से पूर्ण disengagement के 48 घंटे के अंदर Senior Commanders स्तर की बातचीत हो तथा बाकी बचे मुद्दों पर भी हल निकाला जाए। सभापति महोदय, Pangong Lake

area में चीन के साथ disengagement का जो समझौता हुआ है, उसके अनुसार दोनों पक्ष forward deployment को phased, coordinated and verified manner में हटाएंगे। चीन अपनी सेना की टुकड़ियों को north bank में Finger 8 के पूरब की दिशा की तरफ रखेगा। इसी तरह भारत भी अपनी सेना की टुकड़ियों को Finger 3 के पास अपने permanent base धन सिंह थापा पोस्ट पर रखेगा। इसी तरह की कार्रवाई south bank area में भी दोनों पक्षों द्वारा की जाएगी। ये कदम आपसी समझौते के तहत बढ़ाए जाएंगे तथा जो भी निर्माण आदि दोनों पक्षों द्वारा अप्रैल, 2020 से north and south bank पर किया गया है, उसे हटा दिया जाएगा और पुरानी स्थिति कायम कर दी जाएगी।

सभापति महोदय, यह भी तय हुआ है कि दोनों पक्ष north bank पर अपनी सेना की गतिविधियां, जिसमें परंपरागत स्थानों की patrolling भी सम्मिलित है, को अस्थायी रूप से स्थगित रखेंगे। Patrolling तभी शुरू की जाएगी जब सेना एवं राजनयिक स्तर पर, यानी diplomatic level पर आगे बातचीत करके समझौता बनेगा। इस समझौते पर कार्रवाई कल से north and south bank पर प्रारंभ हो गई है। यह उम्मीद है कि इसके द्वारा पिछले साल के गतिरोध से पहले जैसी स्थिति बहाल हो जाएगी।

सभापति महोदय, मैं इस सदन को आश्वस्त करना चाहता हूं कि इस बातचीत में हमने कुछ भी खोया नहीं है। मैं सदन को यह जानकारी भी देना चाहता हूं कि अभी भी LAC पर deployment तथा patrolling के बारे में कुछ outstanding issues बचे हुए हैं। इन पर हमारा ध्यान आगे की बातचीत में रहेगा। दोनों पक्ष इस बात पर सहमत हैं कि Bilateral Agreements तथा Protocol के तहत पूर्ण disengagement जल्द से जल्द कर लिया जाए। अब तक की बातचीत के बाद चीन भी देश की सम्प्रभुता की रक्षा के हमारे संकल्प से पूरी तरह और अच्छी तरह अवगत है। हमारी यह भी अपेक्षा है कि चीन द्वारा हमारे साथ मिलकर बचे हुए मुद्दों को हल करने का पूरी गंभीरता से प्रयास किया जाएगा।

माननीय सभापति महोदय, मैं इस सदन से आग्रह करना चाहता हूं कि मेरे साथ संपूर्ण सदन हमारी Armed Forces की इन विषम एवं भीषण बर्फबारी की परिस्थितियों में भी शौर्य एवं वीरता के प्रदर्शन की भूरि-भूरि प्रशंसा करे। सभापति महोदय, मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं कि जिन शहीदों के शौर्य एवं पराक्रम की नींव पर यह disengagement आधारित है, उन्हें देश सदैव याद रखेगा।

माननीय सभापति महोदय, मैं बात पर भी पूरी तरह आश्वस्त हूं कि यह पूरा सदन, चाहे कोई किसी भी दल का क्यों न हो, देश की सम्प्रभुता, एकता, अखंडता और सुरक्षा के प्रश्न पर एक साथ खड़ा है और एक स्वर से समर्थन करता है कि यह संदेश केवल भारत की सीमा तक ही सीमित नहीं रहेगा, बल्कि पूरे विश्व को जाएगा, यह बात मैं विश्वास के साथ कह सकता हूं। धन्यवाद। जय हिंद।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Defence Minister.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We are going to discuss Budget. Shri Subhas Chandra Bose Pilli was speaking, and now he will continue. It has been decided today in the BAC



meeting... *...(Interruptions)...* No; please. This is an issue of national unity, integrity, security and safety of the country. *...(Interruptions)...* Let us not have this thing.

SHRI SATISH CHANDRA MISRA (Uttar Pradesh): Sir,...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No; please. *...(Interruptions)...*

**श्री सतीश चन्द्र मिश्रा:** सर, मैं राजनाथ सिंह जी को पूरे हाउस की तरफ से बधाई देना चाहता हूँ।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay, all good. Thank you.

SHRI A.K. ANTONY (Kerala): Sir, what is this?

MR. CHAIRMAN: No; please. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI A.K. ANTONY: This is nothing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Right. *...(Interruptions)...* That is your thing. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI A.K. ANTONY: We want a clarification.

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL (Rajasthan): Sir, we want a clarification.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No; please. *...(Interruptions)...* This is a matter of national unity, safety and security. *...(Interruptions)...* Discussions are going on please. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka): Sir, ... *.....(Interruptions)...*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Today morning, it was decided... *...(Interruptions)...* Please sit down. *...(Interruptions)...* Let us not send wrong signals. *...(Interruptions)...* Let us not send wrong signals. *...(Interruptions)...* The entire House should be seen speaking in one voice. *...(Interruptions)...* Then, please. *...(Interruptions)...* Right. Please. *...(Interruptions)...* No, no, please. *...(Interruptions)...* Please sit down. *...(Interruptions)...* This is not the way. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, what kind of clarification is this? You are not allowing a clarification. You are not allowing a clarification.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There have been precedents earlier. ...(*Interruptions*)... There were precedents earlier, in the matters of national unity, safety and security of the country. ...(*Interruptions*)... When the discussions are going on since the last 48 hours and would continue tomorrow, and then, discussions with Chinese, now, and we want to create controversies! ...(*Interruptions*)... This is not good. It is not in the interest of the country. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)... Now, Shri Subhas Chandra Bose Pilli. ...(*Interruptions*)... In the morning, as I told you, it was decided...(*Interruptions*)... It was decided that we will be continuing the Budget discussion, that we will continue it today up to 3 o'clock also and then it will get concluded tomorrow and the reply also...(*Interruptions*)... Now, Shri Subhas Chandra Bose Pilli. ...(*Interruptions*)... कृपया देश के हित में आप लोग बैठ जाइए। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे (कर्नाटक):** सर, देश के हित में ...(*व्यवधान*)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (Himachal Pradesh): Sir, just one clarification. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI A.K. ANTONY: Sir, one clarification. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing shall go on record other than what is permitted. ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD): They are making only positive clarifications. ...(*Interruptions*)... They are not making anything negative...(*Interruptions*)...only positive clarifications. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: These sort of scenes will not be appreciated by the people. Please, I have told you. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, what happened to your directions of 17<sup>th</sup> of September? You ask the Defence Minister to have in camera...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Whatever needs to be shared with the country and the House, the Minister, after discussion, has made a statement. ...(*Interruptions*)... Now the suggestion again is to have an in-camera meeting. ...(*Interruptions*)... We will get it examined. Please sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)... I will keep that in mind. This suggestion that has come now also, I will keep it in mind. ...(*Interruptions*)... The Minister is in touch with me. He met me also in between. He explained to me the situation there, and then it was decided. We will wait for some time. ...(*Interruptions*)... I have conveyed it to certain leaders also. Then, today, the Minister wanted to take the House into confidence. He has made a statement. Let us not create controversies and unnecessarily send wrong signal from the country. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: We are not creating any controversy. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall keep this in mind about people who want to meet the Minister in camera. I shall keep it in mind. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please. ...(*Interruptions*)... Now, Shri Subhas Chandra Bose Pilli. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, he is the former Defence Minister....(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. ...(*Interruptions*)... He knows, he understands, others need not. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please. ...(*Interruptions*)... Now, Shri Subhas Chandra Bose Pilli. ...(*Interruptions*)...

---

### THE UNION BUDGET, 2021-22\*

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI (Andhra Pradesh): Mr. Chairman, Sir, thank you for giving me this opportunity...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka): Sir, he was the Defence Minister for seven years ...(*Interruptions*)...

---

\* Further discussion continued from 10<sup>th</sup> February, 2021.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)... I have taken note of it. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI A.K. ANTONY (Kerala): Sir, I was the Defence Minister for seven years. ...(*Interruptions*)... I used to respond to clarifications in the House...(*Interruptions*)... I used to always answer....(*Interruptions*)....

MR. CHAIRMAN: Antonyji, please. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI A.K. ANTONY: In the history of Parliament ...(*Interruptions*)... I used to answer the questions posed by Members. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Antonyji, please cooperate and understand. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: Sir,...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have said...(*Interruptions*)...Yes, I have taken note of it. I have told you also that Minister came and explained to me. And now, you are again saying it. I shall keep it in mind and try to take the view of the Government. ...(*Interruptions*)... But for the time being, when the talks are going on, please cooperate. ...(*Interruptions*)... No; there were occasions. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: Sir, ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: We will keep in mind how to deal with that. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: Sir, ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, what happened to the your directions given on the 17<sup>th</sup> of September? ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have already responded...

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: \* "Sir, Rs.1,11,500 crores were allocated towards MNREGA for the financial year 2020-21; for the present financial year, the

---

\* English translation of the original speech delivered in Telugu.

allocation has shrunk to Rs.73,000 crores. Fund for the MGNREGS has shrunk by 34.5 percent."

MR. CHAIRMAN: Subhas Chandra Bose Pilliji, you have nine minutes to speak.  
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: \* "As of December 2020, there were nearly 38.7 million unemployed people from the rural areas in our country. This scheme provides work to the unemployed rural people of our country. Instead of increasing allocation of funds to this scheme, funds were reduced by 34.5 percent; this is very unfortunate. It never happened in the past that such a large percentage of funds were reduced in case of this scheme."

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, please resolve this before going into the Budget discussion.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Budget discussion is already on. We will try to resolve it.  
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, you are not allowing me. You have made a commitment on the 17<sup>th</sup> of September. You tell the Defence Minister...  
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: \* "This is injustice towards the people of rural India. Sir, through you, I request the Hon'ble Minister to reconsider it."

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. ...(Interruptions)... Shall I make an appeal?  
...(Interruptions)... I am aware... ...(Interruptions)... Subhas Chandra Bose Pilliji, sorry to stop you.

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: Okay, Sir.

---

---

\* English translation of the original speech delivered in Telugu.

## REMARKS BY THE CHAIRMAN REGARDING CLARIFICATION ON THE STATEMENT BY MINISTER

MR. CHAIRMAN: I know the convention. There were occasions and statements were made; clarifications were sought subsequently also, not just immediately. There are instances. Let us not be selective on that. Secondly, I also remember what Jairam Rameshji, time and again, is trying to remind me. I have taken up the matter with Defence Minister. He came and met me. He told me, 'Sir, discussions are going on with our neighbour and these are at very delicate stage. Just let us wait.' Then, again, the other day, when I met some leaders, -- I don't want to name the Opposition leaders -- I told them also that this is what the Defence Minister has told me. To make it brief, thirdly, again yesterday, the Defence Minister met me. We discussed it. Then, the Defence Minister said, 'I want to now share with the Parliament some of the details of the discussions that are going on between both the countries'. Now, after consultations between the Ministry of Defence and the Ministry of External Affairs, and then with officers, he has come with a statement. Yesterday night, he called me and told me, 'I want to take the House into confidence today'. I said, 'Okay'. Then, I permitted him. He made, to my knowledge, a fairly, elaborative statement. I never deny that there is no right to the Members to ask any supplementaries on any issue. But, let us keep in view the sensitivity of the situation, because the talks are going on, Commander level talks are going on over the last 48 hours and tomorrow also another level of talks is to go on. The Minister has taken the House into confidence. Now, also some Members are suggesting, 'Sir, why not at least in-camera' and some Members are saying, 'No, no; permit us to seek clarifications, etc. I want to make only one appeal to the entire House, to all parties; this is not a political matter. It is in national interest. Let it be seen that we are speaking with one voice and then move... *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka): Sir, we are speaking with one voice. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. *...(Interruptions)...* Is it one voice? *...(Interruptions)...* Let us not make... *...(Interruptions)...* When the Chair is on his legs, *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SHAKTISINH GOHIL (Gujarat): Sir, there is only one voice... *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI RAJEEV SATAV (Maharashtra): Sir, *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. CHAIRMAN: If you don't want to respect the appeal also, then I will leave to your better sense. ...(*Interruptions*)... You want to question; you want to ask of the Minister. ...(*Interruptions*)... And, you want to ask of the Chair also. ...(*Interruptions*)... I am telling you.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, we are seeking clarifications ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have said it. ...(*Interruptions*)... I understand. ...(*Interruptions*)... I have that much understanding. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please. We all respect him, irrespective of how many years, is not the issue. He is knowledgeable.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, the rules permit clarification. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: He is knowledgeable; he is a very important person. There were occasions I have told you. If you want me to quote, then, there were occasions where clarifications were sought subsequently also. I remember that also. So, let me apply my mind, talk to the Government and then come to a final conclusion.

Now, Mr. Subhas Chandra Bose Pilli...(*Interruptions*)... There is no discussion now as such. ...(*Interruptions*)... No, no Antonyji, please. ...(*Interruptions*)... I have already clarified. After the Chair, this is not fair. After the Chair, it is not fair, please. ...(*Interruptions*)... No, no, I have not denied it totally.

---

#### THE UNION BUDGET 2021-22 - *Contd.*

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI (Andhra Pradesh): \* "Privatization of Visakhapatnam Steel Plant is at present a burning issue in Andhra Pradesh. It is understood that the Central Cabinet has prepared a roadmap for this and my party, YSRCP opposes this move. After the bifurcation of Andhra Pradesh, Visakhapatnam Steel Plant is the only large Navratna Public Sector Undertaking that remains with the State. It is the largest Steel Plant in Southern India. After a prolonged agitation lasting for ten years and sacrifices by 38 persons, we were successful in getting the Steel Plant in the State. "Visakha Ukku, Andhrula Hakku" slogan evokes a strong sentiment

---

\* English translation of the original speech delivered in Telugu.

which is deeply rooted in the hearts of the people of Andhra Pradesh. Visakhapatnam Steel Plant is a matter of pride for the people of the State. Sir, this is the only large Public Sector Undertaking in the State and if this is also privatised, Andhra Pradesh will be left with nothing.

Sir, massive movement took place in those days. I was studying pre-university during those days. I participated in this movement. Sir, you were also part of this movement. The decision to privatize the Steel Plant will bring down the confidence of people of Andhra Pradesh. Sir, I request the Hon'ble Prime Minister to reconsider his decision regarding this".

MR. CHAIRMAN: We have been conducting ourselves in an exemplary manner. This is an appreciation.

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: \* "The steel produced by the Visakhapatnam Steel Plant, which directly and indirectly employs millions of people, is hailed as the highest quality steel in global market. The people of Andhra Pradesh are outraged by the decision to privatize the Visakhapatnam steel plant, which has been generating profits for many years and generating billions in revenue to the State and the Central Governments in the form of taxes and dividends."

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. Shall I tell the people, who are in the Lobbies, not to create sound?

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: \* "Sir, Hon'ble Chief Minister of Andhra Pradesh wrote a letter to the Hon'ble Prime Minister suggesting few measures.

- 1) Steel Plant Reconstruction and Restoration should be undertaken in three phases;
- 2) The Central Government should declare waiver of interest on loan for the plant;
- 3) For Financial Restructuring, loan by the Plant should be converted into equity;
- 4) Allocate Captive Iron Ore Mine to Steel Plant.

As proposed by our Hon'ble Chief Minister Shri Y. S. Jagan Mohan Reddy, the allocation of captive mines in Orissa to the Steel Plant should also be considered. Sir, these are the suggestions made by our Hon'ble Chief Minister Shri Y. S. Jagan

---

\* English translation of the original speech delivered in Telugu.



Mohan Reddy. Sir, the Visakhapatnam Steel Plant is established after several protests and now it should not be privatized.

With 20,000 direct employees and 40,000 indirect employees and taking their families into consideration, a total of nearly one lakh people are dependent on this Steel Plant. On behalf of the YSRCP, I request the Hon'ble Prime Minister not to privatize the Visakhapatnam Steel Plant. It should be run by the Government.

Our party strongly opposes the privatization of seven major ports in the country. Privatization of national assets is not the solution to economic problems. Rs. 2,000 crore proposed by the Centre for establishment of new Ports should be sanctioned to the States having major ports for their further development.

Sir, peculiar incidents are taking place these days in Andhra Pradesh i.e. attacks on temples. It is ridiculous that the ^ Members have raised the issue of attacks on temples in Andhra Pradesh in both the Houses of Parliament. During the five-year rule of the ^ the Government arbitrarily demolished temples. ^workers and sympathizers have been accused of vandalizing idols in the State with the nefarious intention of inciting sectarianism and gaining political advantage. However, ^MPs are creating issues about this without any shame."

MR. CHAIRMAN: No name of any political party will go on record, if it is there, it shall be removed from the record.

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: \* "Here are the details of the cases registered by the police in connection with the attacks on temples in Andhra Pradesh during the past six years: 228 attacks in 2020; 305 in 2019; 267 in 2018; 318 in 2017; 332 in 2016 and in the year 2015, 290 attacks took place in Andhra Pradesh. In 2016-2017, there were 332 and 318 attacks respectively. The number dropped to a record low of 228 in the year ^ Government took over. We strongly condemn the attacks on temples.

The State Government has set up a Special investigation team to probe the incidents. An investigation has been initiated and the accused have been arrested. Religious Harmony Committees have been set up across the State under the direction of Hon'ble Chief Minister Shri Y. S. Jagan Mohan Reddy with a view to long-term solution to the issue. This is more than the previous Government ever thought of. CCTV footage shows ^ leaders involved in some attacks on the temples. ^

---

^ Not recorded.

\* English translation of the original speech delivered in Telugu.

11.00 A.M.

MR. CHAIRMAN: \* "It is not allowed in this House to mention statements made by individuals who do not represent here. Please confine to the Budget".

**प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव** (उत्तर प्रदेश): सभापति जी, कोरोना खत्म हो जाए, तो सब यहाँ बैठ सकते हैं।

**श्री सभापति** : वही प्रॉब्लम है। जितनी जल्दी यह कोरोना समाप्त हो जाए, उतनी जल्दी सभी यहाँ बैठ सकते हैं।

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: \* "In the Budget, it was announced that national highway projects at a cost of thousands of crores would be sanctioned to the states of Tamil Nadu, Kerala, West Bengal and Assam. But no national highway project has been announced for Andhra Pradesh."

MR. CHAIRMAN: Right.

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: \* "Large scale Budget allocation was made for metro rail projects in Kochi, Bangalore, Chennai and Nagpur. But there is no mention in the Budget about the long-awaited Vijayawada and Visakhapatnam Metro Rail projects. There has been an extraordinary delay in the formation of the South Coast Railway Zone with Visakhapatnam as the headquarter. It is unfortunate that in the Budget, there is no mention of the establishment of a Railway Zone in Visakhapatnam, maintaining the Waltair Division, as it is the demand of the people of Andhra Pradesh over many years. This is proof that the Central Government is showing step-motherly love towards Andhra Pradesh.

Kisan Rails - Andhra Pradesh has got no new trains. Andhra's share in fruit and vegetable production in India is 11.8%. There is only one train from Ananthapuramu to Bengaluru for transporting fruits and vegetables. In the recent times, fruit and vegetable cultivation is taken up in large scale in the upland areas of Andhra Pradesh. Hence, I request the Central Government to increase the number of Kisan trains in the State. Guarantee of setting up of integrated steel plant at Kadapa is also pending."

---

\* English translation of the original speech delivered in Telugu.

MR. CHAIRMAN: \* "Please conclude Bose ji. You are not looking towards me. Please keep looking at me and listen to me too. Time allotted to you is over. Please conclude."

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: \* "Ramayapatnam port, Vizag-Chennai Industrial Corridor, Metro project between Vizag and Vijayawada are all pending. Sir, through you, I request the Central Government to implement them at the earliest. The inter-linking of rivers is a National Project and the flow of rivers should be checked every 15 days. Water should be distributed based on geographical area. The Central Government should allocate funds for huge infrastructure projects. Proposal for interlinking of rivers is very old. It was proposed by the renowned engineer Shri K. L. Rao. It is very unfortunate that the proposals put forward by him did not materialise yet."

MR. CHAIRMAN: Right.

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: \* "There is no mention of Women's Reservation Bill which is long pending since 2010. Only 13% of the total Members of both the Houses of Parliament are women. There is need for giving special assistance to backward districts."

MR. CHAIRMAN: Right. Please conclude. It is over now. Mr. Subhas Chandra Bose, we are going to the next speaker.

SHRI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE PILLI: \* "According to the Andhra Pradesh Reorganization Act, 2014 the package should be given to the backward districts in Andhra Pradesh on the lines of Bundelkhand in UP, MP areas and Koraput, Bolangir and Kalahandi districts in Odisha." Thank you, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Right. Thank you, Subhas Chandra Boseji. I would like to make one clarification and also a caution to all. Do not apply it to what Shri Subhash Chandra Bose said. Any Member, taking the name of any person, making an allegation, must give it in writing to me before hand. Otherwise, that will not be part of the record. Any

---

\* English translation of the original speech delivered in Telugu.

speech, in which some references are made, and if somebody objects then and there, that will be looked into. If people have not objected and it did not come to the notice of the Chair or was not properly understood then, then also, subsequently, if notice is given, that will be looked into. I got a notice the other day. That speech is also being examined. In the same way I would like to ask you to please confine to the issues of your State and what you have achieved; in that context if you want to take the name of anybody, I have no problem. But, if you want to make allegation and all, then it has to be given in writing and permission has to be taken. Please understand this.

**प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव :** सर, मैं एक बात जानना चाहता हूँ कि व्यक्ति के अलावा हम यदि किसी संस्था या और किसी की आलोचना करें, तब तो यह प्रश्न नहीं उठेगा?

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is in general; criticism is a part of democracy. But, the only thing is that if you start attacking an institution itself, like the Judiciary, then I have to be careful. My duty is to see that the House is utilized properly and fully. Members are also aware of it. I have no liking or disliking to this side or that side. I have only a liking for my Members, rules and regulations and procedures. Please understand. Now, Shri Vishambhar Prasad Nishad. Prasadji, you have 14 minutes.

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद (उत्तर प्रदेश):** माननीय सभापति महोदय, आपका बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद। आज मुझे हमारी समाजवादी पार्टी के संसदीय दल के नेता, आदरणीय प्रोफेसर साहब और समाजवादी पार्टी के राष्ट्रीय अध्यक्ष, माननीय अखिलेश यादव जी ने सामान्य बजट 2021-22 के ऊपर बोलने का मौका दिया है, मैं उनको धन्यवाद देता हूँ। चूँकि आज देश के प्रथम स्वतंत्रता संग्राम सेनानी, तिलका माँझी जी का जन्मदिवस है, जिन्होंने 1857 की क्रांति से पहले स्वतंत्रता संग्राम में भाग लिया था, मैं उनको शत-शत नमन करता हूँ। मान्यवर, ऐसे मौके पर बजट आया है और मुझे बोलने का मौका मिला है, जब देश का अन्नदाता दिल्ली के बॉर्डर्स पर जो तीन कृषि कानून बने हैं, उनके विरोध में, उनको वापस करवाने के लिए धरने पर बैठा है; वह MSP के ऊपर कानून बनाने की माँग कर रहा है और उसको जो सिविल कोर्ट जाने से बाहर कर दिया गया है, वह उसके बारे में बात कर रहा है।

**(उपसभापति महोदय पीठासीन हुए)**

मान्यवर, मैं ज्यादा आँकड़ों में नहीं जाऊँगा, कपिल सिब्बल साहब ने पूरे आँकड़े सहित सारा कुछ रख दिया है। चूँकि मैं उत्तर प्रदेश से आता हूँ, मैं उत्तर प्रदेश के बारे में बताना चाहूँगा कि उत्तर प्रदेश की सड़कों और पुलों के बारे में बजट में कोई स्थान नहीं दिया गया है। मैं देख रहा हूँ कि हमारे बाँदा-फतेहपुर के बीच यमुना नदी पर माननीय अखिलेश यादव जी की सरकार में

नदियों पर पुल बनाए गए थे। इसमें मरका घाट का पुल, औगासी घाट का पुल, दादौ घाट का पुल शामिल है। जो पुल यमुना नदी के ऊपर बन गए थे, जिनमें 75 परसेंट काम हो गया था, उन पर अभी तक काम शुरू करने के लिए बजट जारी नहीं किया गया है। इसी तरह से ममसी घाट पुल, बागै नदी और बाँदा शहर रिंग रोड बाईपास पुल-रेलवे पुल, केन नदी है। इसी तरह से झाँसी में हम बहुत दिनों से देख रहे हैं कि कम से कम 6 साल से सीपरी बाजार, जो झाँसी का एक शहर है, वहाँ अभी रेल ऊपरगामी पुल का निर्माण अधूरा है। एरच बाँध 75 परसेंट पूरा हो गया है, लेकिन उसका पैसा रोक दिया गया है और अभी तक काम पूरा नहीं हुआ है। इसी तरह से मैं बेतवा नदी पर कोटरा का पुल, ललितपुर में देवगढ़ रेलवे क्रॉसिंग का पुल देख रहा हूँ। चूँकि मैं फतेहपुर से लोक सभा सांसद भी रहा हूँ, अभी मैं वहाँ गया था। मान्यवर, हम उधर गए, तो नउवा बाग से राधानगर चौराहे तक इतने गड्ढे थे कि हमारी गाड़ी धँस गई थी। वहाँ बहुआ-गाजीपुर-विजयीपुर रोड बिल्कुल ध्वस्त हो गया है। मान्यवर, जो शेरशाह सूरी मार्ग है, हम सरकार से माँग करेंगे कि वह उसके लिए कब चार लेन की रोड बनाने का काम करेगी, चूँकि यह एक बहुत पुरानी रोड है, जो भोगनीपुर से चौडगरा को मिलाती है। मान्यवर, हमारे क्षेत्र में सड़कों की हालत बहुत खराब है, लेकिन उत्तर प्रदेश को सड़कों के लिए बजट नहीं मिला है। चूँकि वहाँ पर बालू मोरम का अवैध खनन हो रहा है, इससे overloaded ट्रकों के कारण सड़कों की बड़ी खस्ता हालत है। उसके लिए सरकार को ध्यान देना चाहिए और वहाँ के लिए व्यवस्था करनी चाहिए।

मान्यवर, इतना ही नहीं, अभी हाल ही में प्रयागराज के थाना नैनी के ग्राम ठकुरी के पुरवा, मोहब्बत गंज, बसवार में निषादों की सैकड़ों नावों को जेसीबी से तोड़ने का काम किया गया है, उनको बरबाद कर दिया गया है, उनके घरों में उनके बच्चों, उनकी औरतों को मारा-पीटा गया है और उनके ऊपर फर्जी मुकदमे लगाए गए हैं। मैं माँग करता हूँ कि उनके ऊपर लगाए गए फर्जी मुकदमों को वापस करके उनकी नावों की मरम्मत हेतु पैसा दिया जाना चाहिए।

मान्यवर, आज सरकार जो यह कह रही है कि हम किसानों की आमदनी दोगुनी करेंगे, मैं नहीं समझता कि सरकार इस कार्य को कर रही है। मान्यवर, मैं बुंदेलखंड से आता हूँ। वहाँ मैं देखता हूँ कि बहुत सारी सरकारी गौशालाएँ हैं। आप वहाँ का रिकॉर्ड देख लीजिए। पिछले तीन महीनों में इन सरकारी गौशालाओं में हजारों गाएँ मरी हैं। चूँकि उन गायों के लिए चारे-पानी की कोई व्यवस्था नहीं हो पा रही है, इसलिए एक-एक गौशाला में हर रोज़ दस-दस, बीस-बीस गाएँ मर रही हैं।

मान्यवर, सरकार किसानों की आमदनी दोगुनी करने की बात कह रही है, लेकिन आज धान और मक्के की कीमतों के क्या हाल हैं? इनको एमएसपी पर नहीं खरीदा जा रहा है। धान को 40% कटौती पर खरीदा जा रहा है और कहा जा रहा है कि इसमें 40% चावल भी नहीं निकलेगा। इस तरह किसानों की आमदनी दोगुनी कैसे होगी?

मान्यवर, इसी तरह से हमारे देश में जो आंगनवाड़ी वर्कर्स हैं, आशा वर्कर्स हैं, शिक्षा मित्र हैं, कोरोना काल में ये तमाम कोरोना योद्धा काम करते रहे हैं, लेकिन इनका मानदेय बढ़ाने के लिए बजट में कोई व्यवस्था नहीं की गई है।

इस देश में कई जातियों के बहुसंख्यक लोग हैं, जिनकी संख्या काफी ज्यादा है। आखिरी बार 1931 में हमारे देश में जातिवार जनगणना हुई थी, लेकिन देश की आजादी के बाद अभी तक जातिवार जनगणना नहीं हुई है। इसके कारण पिछड़े वर्ग के लोगों को सभी सेवाओं और सभी

संसाधनों में उचित भागीदारी नहीं मिल रही है। हम कहना चाहते हैं कि 2021 की जनगणना में जातिवार जनगणना करवाने के लिए Proforma के column को चेंज किया जाए। हम देखते हैं कि हमारे यहां कहार, कश्यप, केवट, मल्लाह, निषाद, कुम्हार, प्रजापति, धीवर, बिन्द, भर, राजभर, धीमर, बाथम, माँझी आदि 17 जातियां लम्बे समय से मांग करती आ रही हैं कि उनको अनुसूचित जाति में परिभाषित किया जाए। इन जातियों की माली हालत बहुत खराब है, लेकिन सरकार इस काम को नहीं कर रही है।

मान्यवर, आज सरकार जो बजट लाई है, उसमें वह देश के आधुनिकीकरण की बात कर रही है। हमारे क्षेत्र में किसान इस समय चौबीसों घंटे अपने खेतों पर बैठा है। एक मेंड़ पर किसान रखवाली करता है, तो दूसरी मेंड़ पर उसकी पत्नी रखवाली करती है। इस तरह ठंड की रातों में ये लोग रात भर अपने खेतों की रखवाली करते हैं, फिर भी अपनी फसल को नहीं बचा पाते हैं। अभी कल ही हमारे बाँदा ज़िले में जब एक किसान की पूरी फसल नष्ट हो गई, तो उसने अपने खेत में ही फांसी लगाकर आत्महत्या कर ली। हम मांग करते हैं, पशुओं या जंगली जानवरों से फसल का बहुत नुकसान हो जाता है, इसलिए इसको भी 'प्रधान मंत्री फसल बीमा योजना' में शामिल किया जाए। मैं उत्तर प्रदेश का हाल देख रहा हूँ।

मान्यवर, 2021 का यह जो बजट है, यह पूरी तरह से एक दिवालिया बजट है। सरकार के पास केन्द्रीय कर्मचारियों को देने के लिए पैसा नहीं है। यही हाल राज्यों में भी है। करीब 18 महीनों से उत्तर प्रदेश जल निगम के अधिकारियों और कर्मचारियों को पेन्शन और वेतन नहीं मिला है, जिसके लिए वे लोग वहां पर धरना दे रहे हैं और मांग कर रहे हैं। हर सेक्टर में इसी तरह का हाल है। केन्द्र सरकार हर सेक्टर में फेल रही है। पिछले पाँच सालों में सरकार के द्वारा जो भी घोषणाएं की गई थीं, उनमें से किसी को भी सरकार ने पूरा नहीं किया है। 'स्मार्ट सिटी मिशन' में आज तक एक भी शहर स्मार्ट सिटी नहीं बना है, बुलेट ट्रेन अभी तक नहीं चली है। इस सरकार की एक भी घोषणा अभी तक पूरी नहीं हुई है। नोटबंदी और जीएसटी के कारण देश की अर्थव्यवस्था की कमर टूट गई है।

मान्यवर, पाँच वर्षों के अन्दर रेलवे को, जो सबसे ज्यादा रोज़गार देने वाला संस्थान था, अब निजी हाथों में बेचा जा रहा है। एयर इंडिया को बेचा जा रहा है, बाकी के सरकारी उपक्रम निजी हाथों में बेचे जा रहे हैं। पिछले पाँच सालों में रोज़गार बढ़ने के बजाय घटे हैं। इस तरह यह बजट केवल आंकड़ेबाज़ी और असत्य का एक पुलिन्दा है। देश का नौजवान और किसान बजट से हताश और निराश है। घाटे की खेती होने के कारण हमारे बुंदेलखंड का किसान आत्महत्या कर रहा है।

मान्यवर, हमारे बुंदेलखंड में मानिकपुर तक एक उत्तर प्रदेश सम्पर्क क्रान्ति रेल चलती थी। रेल विभाग ने अभी तक उसको 31 मार्च तक के लिए आगे बढ़ाया है। मेरा निवेदन है कि इस ट्रेन को स्थायी किया जाए। वहां से जितने भी मज़दूर और गरीब लोग आते हैं, उनके लिए इस ट्रेन के अतिरिक्त कोई और साधन नहीं है। चित्रकूट में कमर्शियल हवाई अड्डा बनाने की मांग भी बहुत दिनों से चल रही है, लेकिन अभी तक सरकार ने इस पर कोई काम नहीं किया है।

मान्यवर, निज़ामुद्दीन से झाँसी के लिए गतिमान एक्सप्रेस चलती है, लेकिन वहां के लोग इस ट्रेन को खजुराहो तक बढ़ाने की मांग कर रहे हैं। उत्तर प्रदेश के बाँदा-खैरार रेलवे स्टेशन के बीच दुरेड़ी में नया रेलवे हाल्ट बनाए जाने की मांग भी बहुत दिन से चल रही है। झाँसी-उरई-

कानपुर-प्रयागराज के रास्ते छिवकी जाने वाली ट्रेनों को झाँसी-महोबा-बाँदा-मानिकपुर के रास्ते छिवकी चलाए जाने की मांग चल रही है। प्रयागराज से लोकमान्य तिलक टर्मिनस तक जाने वाली तुलसी एक्सप्रेस ट्रेन अभी सप्ताह में दो दिन चलती है। प्रतिदिन यात्री वहाँ जाते रहते हैं, इसलिए सप्ताह में दो दिन की जगह यह ट्रेन प्रतिदिन चलाने की व्यवस्था की जाए।

मान्यवर, बुंदेलखंड में चित्रकूट, बाँदा, महोबा, हमीरपुर, झाँसी, जालौन इत्यादि स्थानों पर खेतों में सिंचाई के लिए पर्याप्त साधनों का अभाव है। सिंचाई के साधनों का अभाव होने से वहाँ का किसान हताश और निराश रहता है। सबसे ज्यादा आत्महत्याएं बुंदेलखंड में होती हैं। हम सोचते थे कि बुंदेलखंड के विकास हेतु बजट में स्पेशल पैकेज दिया जाएगा, लेकिन बुंदेलखंड का किसान हताश और निराश हुआ है, उसके लिए बजट में कोई भी प्रावधान नहीं किया गया है।

महोदय, एमएसपी को लेकर आज किसानों के द्वारा जो आशंकाएं व्यक्त की जा रही हैं, वे पूरी तरह से सही हैं। जिस तरह से भारत को फिर से गुलाम बनाने के लिए उद्योगपतियों के इशारे पर जो किसान बिल बनाया गया है, जब किसान नहीं चाहते तो इसे उन पर जबरदस्ती क्यों थोपा जा रहा है? मैं समझता हूँ कि तीनों किसान बिल वापस लिए जाएं और किसानों की मांग है कि एमएसपी की गारंटी का कानून बनाया जाए।

महोदय, आज सैनिक स्कूलों में भी निजीकरण किया जा रहा है। इससे उनकी एजुकेशन की जो क्वालिटी है, वह घटेगी। भारतीय जीवन बीमा निगम को बरबाद करने के लिए 74 परसेन्ट शेयर्स बेचने की घोषणा की गई है, जो बीमाधारकों के लिए एक बुरी खबर है। जो 32 सरकारी उपक्रम हैं, वे निजी हाथों में बेचे जा रहे हैं - यह पूरी तरह से देश हित में नहीं है। जो सरकारी बैंक्स हैं, उन्हें प्राइवेट किया जा रहा है और प्राइवेट बैंको को बढ़ावा दिया जा रहा है। इसकी कोई गारंटी नहीं है, जब सरकारी बैंकों का पैसा लेकर नीरव मोदी और विजय माल्या जैसे लोग चले गये तो प्राइवेट बैंक अगर पैसा लेकर चले जाएंगे तो उसके लिए लोग क्या करेंगे?

महोदय, स्वदेशी के नारे का क्या हुआ? यह बजट अमीर और गरीब के बीच की खाई और बढ़ायेगा - इससे गरीब और गरीब हो जाएगा। बेरोज़गारों, नौजवानों, किसानों, छोटे व्यापारियों और अल्प आय वाले लोगों के लिए यह बजट बहुत निराशाजनक है। हम समझते थे कि शिक्षा के क्षेत्र में कुछ बजट बढ़ाया जाएगा, लेकिन गत बजट के मुकाबले इस बजट में 6 हजार करोड़ रुपये से ज्यादा घटाने का काम किया गया है। अब खेल विभाग को लीजिए - चूंकि जुलाई में ओलम्पिक खेल होने जा रहे हैं, लेकिन 230 करोड़ रुपये का बजट घटाने का काम किया गया है। इसी तरह से 'किसान सम्मान निधि' में 10 हजार करोड़ रुपये कम किये गये हैं।

महोदय, देश में एक मुख्य समस्या कैंसर है। कैंसर से पूरे देश में लोग मर रहे हैं - कैंसर लाइलाज बीमारी है। हम लगातार यहां रिजॉल्यूशन भी, संकल्प भी लाये और मांग की तथा पूरे सदन में उस पर चर्चा की। मेरी केन्द्र सरकार से मांग है कि कैंसर जैसी बीमारी के लिए बजट में निधि की व्यवस्था करनी चाहिए। गरीब आदमी इलाज के अभाव में दर-दर भटकता है - अपनी ज़मीन, ज़ेवर आदि सब कुछ बेच देता है, तब भी इलाज नहीं करा पाता है। इसलिए ऐसे गरीब लोग, जिनके पास पैसा नहीं है, सरकार को उनका निःशुल्क इलाज कराने के लिए बजट में व्यवस्था करनी चाहिए।

महोदय, 'सांसद आदर्श ग्राम योजना', जो माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने बनाई थी। उस 'सांसद आदर्श गांव योजना' में एक फूटी कौड़ी भी नहीं मिल रही है। कोरोना बीमारी में हमारी दो

साल की सांसद निधि ली गई है, वह ठीक है, लेकिन जो पिछली निधियां हैं, वे भी ले ली गईं। फिर 'सांसद आदर्श ग्राम योजना' का मतलब क्या है? हम लोग अपने पैसे को ही दे देते थे। मैं माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी से निवेदन करूंगा कि 'सांसद आदर्श ग्राम योजना', जो आपने बनाई है, इसे वापस ले लीजिए, पिछले 6-7 सालों में इसमें कोई काम नहीं हुआ है। इसमें केन्द्र सरकार ने एक भी पैसा जारी नहीं किया।

मान्यवर, कृषि कानूनों के खिलाफ जो आंदोलनकारी बैठे हैं, वहां जिन किसानों की मौतें हुई हैं, मैं समझता था कि सदन उस पर चर्चा करेगा, लेकिन किसान आज भी धरने पर बैठे हुए हैं, उनमें से जो किसान शहीद हुए हैं - हमारे माननीय प्रोफेसर साहब ने मांग की थी कि उन्हें बीस-बीस लाख रुपये की सहायता दी जाए।

आज देश में जो सबसे बड़ी दिक्कत है, वह ऊंच-नीच की खाई है। देश के संविधान के अनुच्छेद 21ए में व्यवस्था थी कि 6 साल से 14 साल के बच्चों को निःशुल्क और अनिवार्य शिक्षा प्रदान की जाएगी, सबको समान शिक्षा दी जाएगी। आजादी के इतने साल पूरे होने के बाद भी अभी तक शिक्षा के क्षेत्र में खास काम नहीं किया गया है। जबकि इस बारे में कानून भी बने हैं। आदिवासी और घुमन्तू जाति के बहुत से बच्चे ऐसे ही घूमते रहते हैं, उनके लिए पढ़ने-लिखने की कोई व्यवस्था नहीं है, इसलिए अनिवार्य और निःशुल्क समान शिक्षा लागू की जानी चाहिए।

एससी, एसटी और ओबीसी वर्ग के लोगों का कोटा समय पर पूरा नहीं किया जाता। मैं समझता हूं कि इनका कोटा भी पूरा किया जाना चाहिए।

महोदय, आज देश में जो कोरोना बीमारी चल रही है, हम लोग दूसरे देशों की तो बातें कर रहे हैं। मैं मांग करता हूं कि देश के हर व्यक्ति को कोविड-19 की वैक्सीन निःशुल्क लगानी चाहिए।

इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ मैं यह अपील करते हुए कि बजट में उत्तर प्रदेश पर कोई ध्यान नहीं दिया गया है, बल्कि मैं समझता हूं कि यह सब कुछ बंगाल के चुनाव के लिए किया गया है। इसके अलावा देश में जो अन्नदाता आंदोलन पर बैठे हैं, उनके लिए कंटीले तार और खाइयां खोद दी गई हैं, उनके लिए सरकार चिंता करे। इसके साथ ही मैं अपनी बात खत्म करता हूं, धन्यवाद।

**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह (बिहार):** सम्मानित उपसभापति महोदय, सबसे पहले मैं वित्त मंत्री को बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूं कि उन्होंने बहुत ही शानदार और विकासोन्मुख बजट प्रस्तुत किया है।

कल आदरणीय कपिल सिब्बल साहब बोल रहे थे, लेकिन आज वे नहीं हैं। उन्होंने कहा कि इस बजट का जो मुख्य विचार है, वह 'आत्मनिर्भर भारत' का है। इसके साथ ही उन्होंने यह कह दिया कि इस देश में कौन आत्मनिर्भर हुआ - उन्होंने किसान के बारे में चर्चा की कि वह हुआ कि नहीं, अल्पसंख्यक समाज के बारे में कहा कि वह हुआ कि नहीं, MSME के बारे में बोला कि वह हुआ कि नहीं, हमारे जितने छोटे व्यापारी हैं, वे हुए कि नहीं और हमारे जो अनुसूचित जाति के भाई लोग हैं, वे हुए कि नहीं। उन्होंने एक बात और कही कि कोई भी बजट होता है, वह context में होता है।

**श्री उपसभापति:** कृपया शान्ति बनाये रखें। कृपया अपनी-अपनी जगह पर बैठें।



**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह:** अगर इस बजट के context में ही देखें, तो सबसे पहले यह कितने बड़े गौरव की बात है कि जब पूरी की पूरी दुनिया कोरोना से प्रभावित रही, उस समय सबसे बड़ा लक्ष्य यह था कि कैसे अपने हिन्दुस्तान के लोगों की जान भुखमरी से और बीमारी से बचायी जाये। तो मैं तो केन्द्रीय सरकार को और आदरणीय प्रधान मंत्री जी को बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ कि जिस प्रकार की व्यवस्था की गयी, उसके चलते पूरे देश में कोरोना काल में भुखमरी से एक भी व्यक्ति की मृत्यु नहीं हुई। आज जब हमारे पास वैक्सीन आ गयी है तो पूरे देश में लोगों को वैक्सीन दी जायेगी। यह वैक्सीन पूरी तरह से हमारी अपनी वैक्सीन है, तो यह हमारे लिए, सबके लिए गर्व की बात है। एक मिनट के लिए सोचा जाए कि अगर यही कोरोना 1967 में आया होता, तो क्या होता? 1967 में अकाल पड़ा था। याद करिए, अनाज भी बाहर से आता था और जिसको विलायती दूध कहते हैं, वह भी बाहर से आता था, तब वह बच्चों को मिलता था और आज इतनी बड़ी त्रासदी हमारे यहाँ आयी, लेकिन हमें कहीं विदेश में झांकना नहीं पड़ा कि हमें अनाज चाहिए, हमें दूध चाहिए, हमें दवाइयाँ चाहिए। तो यह हमारा आत्मनिर्भर भारत है और इस पर सबको गर्व करना चाहिए। कृषि के क्षेत्र में तो आप जानते ही हैं। जब आप आत्मनिर्भर हुए हैं, तो हमारे किसान न सिर्फ अन्नदाता हैं, जो आप जानते ही हैं - ऊर्जादाता हुए ही हैं, वे रोजगारदाता भी हैं। उनके जितने प्रोडक्ट्स होते हैं, उन्हीं को आप value add करते हैं, तो कई लोगों को रोजगार मिलता है।

कपिल सिब्बल साहब कह रहे थे कि किसी भी विकास को growth और equity की दृष्टि से देखना चाहिए। मैं तो उनको याद कराना चाहूँगा कि उनके मुँह से equity की बात बड़ी अच्छी लगती है। वे वकील हैं, वहाँ क्या स्थिति है? \* हमारे मनरेगा का एक कार्यकर्ता साल भर काम करता है।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे (कर्नाटक):** सर, ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह:** वह साल भर काम करेगा, उसको 25 हजार रुपये मिलेंगे। वह 100 दिन काम करेगा।...(व्यवधान).... वह साफ काम करेगा।...(व्यवधान).... लेकिन आप ज़रा सोचिए।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please; please. He is not yielding. ...(Interruptions)... It will be seen, Khargeji. ...(Interruptions)... He is not yielding. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह:** \* यह कहाँ से equity हो गयी?...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री जयराम रमेश:** सर, ...(व्यवधान)...

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.



THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN): He is coming. ...(*Interruptions*).. He is here.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him speak. ...(*Interruptions*). He has come. ...(*Interruptions*).. Please, please. Let him speak. ...(*Interruptions*)..

**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह :** सर, मैं यह कह रहा था।...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN : Sir, the Lok Sabha and all these areas, are part of the proceedings. So, unnecessarily....(*Interruptions*)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please Jairamji, let him speak.

**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह :** सर, वे शिक्षा मंत्री रहे हैं, उन्होंने लेह में सेन्ट्रल यूनिवर्सिटी क्यों नहीं खोली? लेह कहाँ है? वह हमारा सबसे दूरस्थ इलाका है। Equity क्या माँग करती थी? वह यह माँग करती थी कि वहाँ सेन्ट्रल यूनिवर्सिटी खुलनी चाहिए थी। आप शिक्षा मंत्री थे।...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI SHAKTISINH GOHIL: Sir, I have a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is a point of order.

SHRI SHAKTISINH GOHIL: There is a provision in the rule. ...(*Interruptions*)..

**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह :** चूँकि आपने बात रखी है, इसलिए आपको सुनना पड़ेगा।...(**व्यवधान**)...

**श्री उपसभापति :** माननीय गोहिल जी, इसको लेकर already point of order उठाया गया था, उस पर मैंने यह कह दिया है कि examine होगा और देखा जाएगा।...(**व्यवधान**)... Please let him speak. ...(*Interruptions*).. Nothing is going on record. ...(*Interruptions*)..

**श्री शक्तिसिंह गोहिल :** \*

**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह :** आप यह देखिए, वे शिक्षा मंत्री रहे हैं।...(**व्यवधान**)...

**श्री शक्तिसिंह गोहिल :** \*

**श्री उपसभापति :** उसके बारे में कह दिया गया है।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह :** वे इस सदन के सदस्य हैं। अगर वे अभी नहीं हैं, तो क्या उनको सिर्फ भाषण देने का अधिकार है? उनको रहना चाहिए था।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री शक्तिसिंह गोहिल :** \*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have already said. ...(*Interruptions*)..

**वित्त मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री; तथा कारपोरेट कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर):** सर, माननीय आर.सी.पी. सिंह जी ने कहा कि माननीय सदस्य ने कुछ बात कही। चार बार के लोक सभा के सांसद के नाते जितना मेरा अनुभव है, उसके अनुसार जो भी पहला व्यक्ति या कोई भी अपना भाषण देता है, तो वह अगले तीन-चार भाषण तक सुनने के लिए इंतजार तो करता ही है। लेकिन इन्होंने जो बात उठाई, वह बहुत महत्वपूर्ण है। <sup>९</sup>...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति :** ठीक है, ठीक है। उस बहस को आगे नहीं ले जाना है।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** इसलिए यहाँ पर ज्यादा प्राथमिकता देने की बजाय कहीं और...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सैयद नासिर हुसैन (कर्नाटक):** सर, यह गलत बात है।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no; I am not allowing. ...(*Interruptions*)..

**श्री शक्ति सिंह गोहिल :** सर, यह गलत बात है।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सैयद नासिर हुसैन :** सर, यह बिल्कुल गलत बात है।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति :** मैंने कह दिया।...(व्यवधान).. Please, please. ठीक है, ...(*व्यवधान*)... I have already said. ...(*Interruptions*).. I am not allowing. ...(*Interruptions*).. Let him speak. ...(*Interruptions*).. He has not yielded. ...(*Interruptions*).. राम चन्द्र बाबू, आप continue करें। Please continue ...(*Interruptions*).. बैठ कर आपस में की हुई कोई भी बातचीत रिकॉर्ड पर नहीं जाएगी। कृपया आप बोलें।...(व्यवधान)...

---

\* Not recorded.

<sup>९</sup> Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह :** आप देखें कि growth और equity की बात हो रही है।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति :** कृपया बैठ कर आपस में बातचीत न करें।...(व्यवधान)... कृपया उन्हें बोलने दें।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह :** सर, growth और equity की बात हो रही है। जब कोरोना काल था, तब श्रीमान जी तो दिल्ली में थे, मैं तो 73 दिन अपने गाँव में था। जरा देखिए, किसकी चर्चा कर रहे हैं? आखिर जो पूरा का पूरा बजट है, वह किसके लिए होता है? गाँव में जाकर देखिए। जिस समय कोरोना काल था, उस समय जितने भी जनधन खाते गरीब महिलाओं के थे, उस समय मैं गाँव में था, उन सबके खाते में पाँच-पाँच सौ रुपए जा रहे थे? यह क्या था? सब लोगों को उनके घर पर फ्री में अनाज मिल रहा था। यह क्या था? हमारे बिहार के जितने श्रमिक साथी देश के अन्य कोनों में फंसे हुए थे, सबके खाते में हमारे नेता, नीतीश बाबू ने एक-एक हजार रुपए दिये और जब वे बिहार आए, तो उनके रहने की व्यवस्था की गई और एक-एक व्यक्ति पर 5,300 रुपए खर्च किये। यह क्या है? जब हमारे यहाँ इतनी बड़ी महामारी चल रही है, तब आप क्या डेटा दे रहे हैं? आप डेटा दे रहे हैं कि इंडस्ट्रियल ग्रोथ इतनी कम हो गयी, सारे उद्योग बंद हो गए। उस समय किस चीज़ का भय था? उस समय जान बचाना सबसे महत्वपूर्ण था। ऐसे समय में आप खोजेंगे कि सर, इंडस्ट्रियल ग्रोथ इतनी कम हो गई, जब उद्योग ही बंद हैं, तो नीचे जाएगा ही। सर, काम कहाँ हो रहा था? काम एग्रीकल्चर में हो रहा था, खेती में हो रहा था। गाँव में महामारी नहीं पहुँची थी, आप ज़रा वहाँ देख लीजिए कि इस कोरोना काल में भी हमारे कृषि क्षेत्र में कितना शानदार काम हुआ है। आज भी आपके पास सरप्लस अनाज है। किसान इतनी पैदावार कर रहे हैं कि वे सब जगह माँग करते हैं कि हमारी खरीदारी होनी चाहिए। यह जो पूरी सरकार है, इनका फोकस कहाँ रहता है?...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति :** प्लीज़, आपस में बैठकर टीका-टिप्पणी न करें।

**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह :** इनका फोकस वहीं रहता है।

(सभापति महोदय पीठासीन हुए)

**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह :** आप ज़रा शिक्षा के क्षेत्र में देख लीजिए कि हमारे स्कूल्स बंद रहे, लेकिन हमारे बिहार में जितने बच्चों को...

**श्री सभापति :** बाहर बहुत ज्यादा आवाज़ आ रही है, तो मैं हैरान होकर अंदर आया। मैंने सोचा कि राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह जी तो ऐसे नहीं बोल सकते हैं। Ravi also speaks loud. Some of the Bihar leaders ... ..(Interruptions)... अनुराग जी, बीच में मुझे बताया गया कि कोई

मिनिस्टर नहीं था। यह स्थिति नहीं होनी चाहिए। रुपाला जी, आप दोनों हैं। मेरे ख्याल से किशन जी भी हैं।

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** सर, मैं यहाँ हूँ।

**श्री सभापति :** आप आए हैं, तो ठीक है। Even otherwise, in Budget discussion, some senior Minister should always be there. The Minister of State for Finance takes care of the debate, etc., but others also ... Please, Ram Chandra Prasad Singhji.

**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह :** महोदय, जबकि कोरोना काल में स्कूल्स बंद थे, लेकिन जिन बच्चों को साइकिल मिलनी थी, उसके पैसे उनके खातों में पहुंचा दिए गए। यह मैं इसलिए बता रहा हूँ, क्योंकि इस सरकार की सोच ही है कि जो भी हमारे सबसे अंतिम छोर पर गाँवों में रहते हैं, उन्हें विकास की सब चीज़ों का लाभ मिल जाए। आप कह रहे हैं कि साहब, सिर्फ बड़े लोगों के लिए काम हो रहा है। मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि एकलव्य स्कूलों में कौन पढ़ता है? जो हमारा आदिवासी इलाका है, वहाँ एकलव्य स्कूल में कौन पढ़ता है? उस एकलव्य स्कूल में और अच्छी पढ़ाई हो, और अच्छी व्यवस्था हो, इसके लिए इस बजट में प्रावधान है और आप कह रहे हैं कि सिर्फ बड़े लोगों के लिए काम करते हैं! 1,000 करोड़ की व्यवस्था किसके लिए की गई है? असम और बंगाल में जो हमारे टी वर्क्स हैं, जो महिलाएं हैं, उनके लिए यह व्यवस्था की गई है। यह क्या है? यही तो इक्विटी है, यही तो न्याय के साथ विकास की बात है कि सभी क्षेत्रों का विकास हो। सिर्फ इतना ही नहीं, आप देखिए कि आज जो पूरा एजुकेशन सेक्टर है, वह इस पूरे कोरोना काल में कितना प्रभावित हुआ, लेकिन मैं केंद्र सरकार को धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ कि इस कोरोना काल में भी ऑनलाइन पढ़ाई के लिए 30,00,000 से ज्यादा टीचर्स को ट्रेन किया गया, ताकि बच्चे पढ़ सकें। हमारे 92,00,000 ऐसे टीचर्स हैं, जिनको आगे इस तरह की ट्रेनिंग दी जाएगी कि वे ठीक से पढ़ा सकें। अब बताइए कि ग्रामीण स्कूल में कौन पढ़ता है - सब गरीब के बच्चे ही पढ़ते हैं और उन्हें इसका सीधा लाभ मिलेगा। इस सरकार की तो यह सोच ही है कि जो हमारे संसाधन हैं, उन पर सबसे पहला अधिकार किसी का है, तो गरीब का है, जो आपदा से प्रभावित है, जो महामारी से प्रभावित है।

सर, 30,00,000 करोड़ के आस पास बजट था, लेकिन मैं वित्त मंत्री जी को बधाई देना चाहता हूँ कि 34,00,000 करोड़ से ज्यादा खर्च किए। अब खर्च-खर्च कह रहे हैं! अब लोग कहेंगे कि फिस्कल डेफिसिट 9.50 परसेंट तक पहुंच गया है। जब हमारा revenue कम होगा, तब फिस्कल डेफिसिट तो इतना पहुंचेगा ही। हमारे सामने इतनी बड़ी समस्या है, तो क्या सरकार खड़ी रहेगी? सरकार को व्यवस्था करनी पड़ेगी कि चाहे पैसे जहाँ से भी आएँ, हमें जहाँ से भी borrow करना पड़े, लेकिन हमें हमारे लोगों के जीवन की रक्षा करनी है, हमें उन्हें सुरक्षित रखना है। जब कोरोना काल समाप्त हो जाएगा, तब हमारी इकोनॉमी फिर से ट्रैक पर आ जाएगी। वित्त मंत्री जी, आपने जो प्रयास किए हैं, इसके लिए मैं आपको बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद देता हूँ और बधाई भी देता हूँ।

सर, एक बात और है। सब लोग सोच रहे थे कि बजट आएगा, तरह-तरह के टैक्स लगाए जाएंगे, कोई नया टैक्स तो नहीं लगाया गया, लेकिन हाँ, मैं आपको बधाई देना चाहता हूँ कि आपने पूरे इनकम टैक्स में जो व्यवस्था है -- सर, हम आज़ादी के 75वें वर्ष की ओर जा रहे हैं, मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूँ कि जिन्होंने 75 वर्ष की आयु प्राप्त कर ली है, उनमें से जिनकी इनकम सिर्फ पेंशन और इंटरेस्ट से है, उन सबको आपने इनकम टैक्स रिटर्न फाइल करने से exempt कर दिया है। यह बहुत ही सराहनीय कदम है। मैं इसको थोड़ा-सा और पीछे ले चलने का अनुरोध करूँगा, क्योंकि कई प्रदेशों में सीनियर सिटिज़ंस की उम्र 65 साल होती है, तो कई जगह 60 साल होती है। इसलिए इसको 60 साल की उम्र वाले से ही देख लें, जिनके पास इनकम का सोर्स सिर्फ पेंशन है। उनके बैंक का जो इंटरेस्ट है, उस पर टीडीएस वहीं पर कट जाएगा। अगर आप इस सीमा को 60 साल तक कर देंगी, तो हमारे जो बहुत सारे सेवाकर्मी और सीनियर सिटिज़ंस हैं, उनको भी इसका लाभ मिल जाएगा।

आपको मैं इस बात के लिए भी बधाई देना चाहता हूँ कि पहली बार आपने हिम्मत की है कि एफसीआई को कितनी सब्सिडी दी जाती है, इसको आपने बजट में खोलकर दिखा दिया है। यही हाल फर्टिलाइज़र सब्सिडी का भी है। इस पर एक पूरी स्टडी की जरूरत है। हम जितनी फर्टिलाइज़र सब्सिडी फर्टिलाइज़र की कंपनियों को देते हैं, ज़रा उसकी असेसमेंट करा ली जाए। सभापति जी, यह सिर्फ नाइट्रोजन पर, यूरिया पर 70 परसेंट जाती है। इसका क्या दुष्प्रभाव होता है? एनपीके, जिसका कृषि उत्पादन के लिए बैलेंस होना जरूरी है, वह नाइट्रोजन की तरफ ज्यादा होता है, उसका बैलेंस खत्म हो जाता है।

सर, मैं कृषि में खासकर दो चीज़ों के लिए अनुरोध करना चाहूँगा। हम यह सब्सिडी उनको दे रहे हैं, जो हमारी फर्टिलाइज़र कंपनियाँ हैं। मैं चाहूँगा कि इसकी एक असेसमेंट करके इसको भी डीबीटी, यानी डायरेक्ट बेनिफिट ट्रांसफर के तहत, एक एकड़ तक सोच लें कि किसान को कितना खर्च होता है, उतना सीधे-सीधे उनके खाते में दे देंगे, तो यह लाभ किसानों को सीधे मिलेगा और जो efficiency है, वह भी बढ़ेगी।

दूसरी बात, हम लोग कृषि में सीड भी बाँटते हैं। मैं सीड के क्षेत्र में भी चाहूँगा कि सीड का जो भी अमाउंट है, वह उनके खाते में सीधे जाए, क्योंकि आज किसानों के नाम सब जगह दर्ज हैं। अगर आप बीज का पैसा उनके खाते में दे देंगे, तो वह किसानों के पास सीधा पहुँच जाएगा और हमारा काम यह सुनिश्चित करना होगा कि जो क्वालिटी बीज है, उसको वे मार्केट से ले लें। इससे निश्चित रूप से यह फायदा होगा कि हमारा जो क्वालिटी बीज है, वह भी उनके पास पहुँच जाएगा।

सर, ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों में एक समस्या खासकर labour component की आती है, जो कि हमारी खेती में होता है। मैंने इस पर पहले भी अनुरोध किया था और मैं फिर चाहूँगा कि हमारा जो पूरा का पूरा 'मनरेगा' है, उसमें अगर आप सभी स्टेट्स में देखिएगा, तो जितनी राशि दी जाती है, उतनी खर्च नहीं हो पाती, उसका नेशनल एवरेज 100 से कम होता है। ऐसा इसलिए होता है, क्योंकि उसमें आपने यह लिखवाया है कि 'मनरेगा' में ये-ये काम कराए जाने चाहिए। मेरा अनुरोध है कि 'मनरेगा' में एक काम अगर 'निजी भूमि पर कृषि कार्य हेतु' भी जोड़ दिया जाएगा, तो उसका जो labour component है, वह मिल जाएगा। इससे किसानों की आमदनी बढ़ेगी और 'मनरेगा' का भी सदुपयोग होगा।

मैं एक बार फिर से आपको अच्छा बजट लाने के लिए धन्यवाद देता हूँ। भारत को आत्मनिर्भर बनाने के लिए आप बजट लाई हैं, उसके लिए मैं सरकार को बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद देता हूँ।

**श्री सभापति :** राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह जी, मुझे बताया गया कि आपने एक दूसरे सदस्य का नाम लिया और उनके बारे में कुछ कहा। यह avoid करना चाहिए।

**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह :** सर, उन्होंने बोला था, इसलिए मैंने कहा। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री सभापति :** फिर भी...

**श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह :** उन्होंने हाउस के अंदर बोला था। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. That is not the way. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI SHAKTISINH GOHIL: He should not argue with the Chair. ...**(Interruptions)**...  
Don't argue with the Chair. ...**(Interruptions)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: So, this is my advice.

SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN: Sir, I am very happy that the Opposition has accepted that we should not argue with the Chair. ...**(Interruptions)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: They always cooperate, but once in a while they get a little...  
...**(Interruptions)**... Please, Shaktisinh ji. I am there to take care. Every Member is a respectable Member. Even if he goes wrong on facts, there is a way of saying it. As I said in the morning also, Members may give notice, etc. So, this reference to Shri Kapil Sibal is not going to be a part of the record now. Now, Shri Elamaram Kareem. करीम जी, आपके बाद श्रीमती झरना दास बैद्य जी का भी नाम है। Mr. Kareem, you have 14 minutes for the Party. You can share and be fair to the ladies.

SHRI ELAMARAM KAREEM (Kerala): Mr. Chairman, Sir, first of all, I would like to say that the Union Budget for 2021-22 is very disappointing and it has failed miserably in addressing the present situation. When the country is going through the worst crisis in its history, the hon. Finance Minister has presented a Budget that does not have any vision and programme to overcome it. The Budget is filled with proposals that will enable to implement its agenda of privatisation. It did not heed to the



suggestions of renowned economists saying that the Government should implement plans to reach money into the hands of people and increase their purchasing power to uplift Indian economy, which was on a verge of collapse much before COVID. The Budget is far away from the ground realities and cruelly insensitive to the sufferings of the toiling mass. It doesn't fulfil any of the needs of our nation and people in this pandemic time. There are no plans or announcements to help the millions of people who lost their jobs and income due to COVID. It is friendly to Indian and foreign corporates and continues to give huge concessions and reduction in tax for them while proposing increase in the cess for the common mass.

People's lives and livelihood got severely affected by the pandemic, unplanned and unprepared lockdowns, rise in prices of essential commodities, etc. The prices of petrol, diesel and cooking gas have been continuously hiked. India today has the highest rate of taxes on petroleum products in the world. We all expected that this year's Budget will have a proposal to reduce taxes on petrol and diesel. Instead the Government have geared up with imposing more on it. Unemployment is another biggest issue which is being faced by our nation. The Centre for Monitoring Indian Economy (CMIE) makes a conservative estimate that 14.7 million jobs in the organised sector have been lost. This is in addition to the destruction in informal sector and the large scale loss of livelihood for crores of people. Whether this Budget has any proposal to address such issues?

This Budget looks like a sales advertisement. Everything is for sale here. In its previous term, this Government used to tell about 'Make in India'. But now, we cannot find any mention of 'Make in India' anywhere in the Budget or the Minister's speech. Now, its slogan changed to 'Sell India'.

In the Budget speech, the hon. Finance Minister made an interesting argument that privatisation of Public Sector Undertakings and sale of national assets would help to expand the economy of the country. It continues the Government's policy of selling our Public Sector Banks, enhancing FDI in insurance sector to 74 per cent along with pushing through IPO in LIC, and pursuing privatisation in electricity distribution. All profit-making Public Sector Enterprises are to be sold or privatised, while announcing closure of loss-making PSUs. This makes serious repercussions among the lives of people and workers. Even Railways, urban transport, gas-pipe lines are to be privatised. I would like to draw the attention of this august House to the initiatives taken by the Government of Kerala in reviving the public sector. Central PSUs in Kerala which are decided to be sold off by the Central Government are being taken over by the State and are being operated efficiently. In each and every sector, the Left Democratic Front Government in Kerala is setting alternatives in front of the

nation. This difference in approach is because of the difference in ideology which is leading the Governments. The hon. Finance Minister previously announced a stimulus in the form of huge reduction in the corporate tax rate from 30 per cent to 22 per cent for domestic companies.

There are some other incentives also. Loss of revenue, on account of such measures, was compounded by the effects of the pandemic which induced 23 per cent contraction in GDP in the first quarter of the year 2020-21. And, in the second quarter, it was 7.5 per cent. The result has been a fall of 8.3 per cent in the Centre's net tax revenue over April to November, 2020, as compared to April to November, 2019. Income expected from disinvestment in 2020-21 was Rs.2.10 lakh crores, but the Government received only Rs.6,178.79 crores. It becomes clear that enhanced spending had to be financed with borrowing. It resulted in huge fiscal deficit. From April to November, 2020, it has risen by 33 per cent. In 2019-20, fiscal deficit was Rs.8,07,834 crores. In 2020-21, it is Rs.10,75,507 crores. Total expenditure over the first eight months of 2020-21 has risen by just 4.7 per cent in nominal terms as compared to corresponding months of 2019-20, allowing inflation to increase. Real expenditure has, in fact, fallen, not the right medicine in a year which is a like-never-before year. The Financial Year 2020-21 was a like-never-before year. It warranted a change in the stance of the Government with a shift-away from fiscal conservatism to a more proactive fiscal policy. There was widespread agreement that this was the way to go even among those who advocate a conservative fiscal stance in the normal times. But the Government has persisted with its neo-liberal fiscal stance resulting collapsing revenues and stagnant expenditure.

Under several heads, expenditure in 2020-21 was actually lower than budgeted. These include Agriculture, Education, Social Welfare, Women and Child Development, Scientific Departments, Urban Development, Pensions and Disability Affairs, etc. These cuts are being carried forward into the next year also. Even in the few heads of increased expenditure in 2020-21, like Health and Rural Development, the Budget proposes to cut down expenditures. The Budget allocation for Health for 2021-22 is Rs.74,600 crores only which is Rs.8,000 crores less than the last year's Revised Estimates.

The hon. Minister was vocal on the Government's commitment to people's wellbeing and livelihood in her speech. But it does not match with the actual allocations, particularly in the social sector and welfare-related expenditures like MNREGA, ICDS, Mid-Day Meal Scheme, jobs and skill development, etc. In MNREGA, the Budget drastically cut down allocation by 41 per cent of what the

Government actually spent last year in 2020-21, although the rural unemployment and joblessness have increased drastically. In Mid-Day Meal Scheme, allocation has been cut down by Rs.1,400 crores to what has been spent actually last year. In ICDS, the allocation has been reduced by 30 per cent compared to the allocation in the last year's Budget. In job and skill development, allocation has been cut down by 35 per cent compared to the allocation in the last Budget. There are many other examples. The Finance Minister also indicated the Government's move to "bring down the number of Centrally-Sponsored schemes" in line with the recommendation of the 15<sup>th</sup> Finance Commission.

In the run-up to the elections in five States, including Kerala, some announcements have been made in the Budget to mislead the people of those States. But it can be seen that the projects which are already underway have been included in the Budget again. In the State of Kerala, many of Kerala's age-old demands are still pending. The State was completely neglected in terms of Railway Development. Sir, Rs. 65,000 crores have been announced for the National Highways. It is only for ongoing projects. On the whole, this Budget does not provide anything for the people, did nothing to address severe unemployment problem, and, there is no relief for the people under severe distress through income and food support. It carries forward...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have already taken eleven minutes. Please.

SHRI ELAMARAM KAREEM: With this, I register my objection to the recommendations in the Budget. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I said, be fair to the women; not the Minister. That is about your colleagues and Members. Okay. Now, Prof. Manoj Kumar Jha. मनोज जी को समय के बारे में बताने की जरूरत नहीं है। He comes prepared and speaks within the time.

**प्रो. मनोज कुमार झा (बिहार):** शुक्रिया, सभापति महोदय। मैं आपके माध्यम से सबसे पहले मैडम फाइनेंस मिनिस्टर और एमओएस, फाइनेंस अनुराग जी, इन दोनों के लिए कुछ पंक्तियां समर्पित करना चाहता हूँ। "चमन में इखिलात-ए-रंग-ओ-बू से बात बनती है" - इसका मतलब यह है कि mingling of colours and fragrances;

*"चमन में इखिलात-ए-रंग-ओ-बू से बात बनती है"  
हम ही हम हैं, तो क्या हम हैं, तुम ही तुम हो, तो क्या तुम हो।"*

Why I said this because there has been a tendency, of late, from many sides, 'my way or highway'. हम जो कहें, वही सही है। कोई विकल्प सुनना ही नहीं चाहता है। लोग कहते हैं कि हम सुनना चाहते हैं, लेकिन earplug लगा कर क्या सुन रहे हैं? गाना सुन सकते हैं, लेकिन लोगों के संवाद नहीं सुन सकते हैं। Sir, last year also, I made an observation. मैडम फाइनेंस मिनिस्टर, आप सब इस किताब से वाकिफ होंगे। इसी किताब से संसद चलती है, हम लोगों की धड़कनें चलती हैं। यह Constitution of India की किताब है।

I would urge the Government, I mean, Madam Finance Minister and MoS, Finance and the entire Cabinet, to look at Articles 38 and 39. I won't read it because Sir पहले ही बता चुके हैं कि मेरा वक्त उसमें चला जाएगा। Read Articles 38 and 39, and, then, evaluate your Budget provisions as to what it is going to do in terms of equality. हमारी चिंता इस बात की है कि बजट, कभी आम बजट हुआ करता था। बीते कुछ वर्षों में, ऐसा नहीं है कि सिर्फ आपके आने के बाद ऐसा हुआ है, लेकिन बीते कुछ वर्षों में, खासकर 90 के बाद यह खास बजट हो गया। खास लोगों द्वारा, खास सरोकार के लिए, खास संदर्भ में, यह उचित नहीं है- इसे आम बजट ही रहने दीजिए, यह खास बन जाएगा, तो हमसे दूर हो जाएगा। वैसे ही बहुत दूर हो गया है, so, please read Articles 38 and 39.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to say that the two first paragraphs of the Budget Speech beautifully depict, painfully depict the kind of times we have passed through, Corona times. मैं आज अभी यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि मैंने लॉकडाउन में, उसके दौरान और उसके बाद आपके तमाम प्रेस कॉन्फ्रेंसेज़ देखी हैं। आपके चेहरे पर मैंने चिंता की लकीरें देखी हैं। मैं इस बात से इन्कार नहीं कर सकता। सिर्फ आलोचना के लिए कह दूँ कि आप लोग निश्चित हैं, तो ऐसा नहीं है, लेकिन चिंता की वे लकीरें बजट की लकीरों को बदल नहीं पाईं। इस बारे में मुझे बहुत अफसोस होता है। मैंने कल एक बिल के संदर्भ में कहा था कि कई दफ़ा, आपके कई फाइनेंस प्रपोज़ल्स और बिल्स को देखकर ऐसा लगता है कि लाभार्थी पहले से तय है, चीज़ें पहले तय हो गई हैं। मेरे पास रिप्रेजेंटेशन आ रही हैं। मैं एक छोटी पार्टी का अदना-सा सांसद हूँ। उसमें पांच सदस्य हैं, चूंकि हमारे अध्यक्ष के प्रति लोगों की आस्था है, तो हमारे पास एसोसिएशन से लोग आ रहे हैं। अभी ओडिशा से नीलांचल वाले लोग आए हैं, वाइज़ैग स्टील प्लांट से आए हैं। उनकी जो चिंताएं हैं, क्या उन चिंताओं को खारिज कर दें? सर, उनका जो ऐसेट है, वह इतना विशाल है कि न जाने कौन-सा अदृश्य व्यक्ति आएगा और उन प्लांट्स को ले जाएगा। नीलांचल में तो उनके पेमेंट के भी इश्यूज हैं। मैं यह सिर्फ इसलिए इस संदर्भ में आपके समक्ष रख रहा हूँ, क्योंकि निर्णय तो आप लोग ही लेंगे, क्योंकि आपके पास बहुत बड़ी मेजॉरिटी है। कल आप लोग मेरे एक चीज़ कहने पर नाराज़ हो गए थे। मैंने कहा था, democracy is not simply a number game. उसके नंबर के पीछे भी कुछ चीज़ें होती हैं, उनका ध्यान रहे। मैं लाइफ इंश्योरेंस के बारे में कुछ कहना चाहता हूँ। वे पूरे देश का जीवन सुरक्षित कर रहे थे, खुद का जीवन सुरक्षित नहीं कर पाए। अपना ही जीवन ensure नहीं कर पाए। आप एक बार जरूर सोचिएगा, हालांकि आप लोग फैसला वापस लेने में बहुत हठधर्मिता का परिचय देते हैं। सर, मुझे वक्त की जानकारी है। सर, जो यह तीसरा दरवाजा है, इसके गेट पर लिखा हुआ है - "सत्यं वद, धर्मं चर", यानी सत्य बोलिए और धर्म का आचरण कीजिए - वह वाला धर्म नहीं जो पूजा-

पाठ वाला होता है। हमारे यहां धर्म बहुत बड़ी चीज़ है। मंदिर, मस्जिद, गुरुद्वारे से ऊपर की चीज़ है, तो "सत्यं वद, धर्मं चर"। आंकड़े बनाइए मत, आंकड़ों की इज्जत कीजिए। आपको जो आंकड़े परेशान कर रहे हैं, उनको acknowledge करिए। कहिए कि हम फेल हुए हैं। आप मानना ही नहीं चाहते हैं। खैर, मैं अपने राज्य के बारे में क्या बोलूँ, मुझे कल से एक ख्याल आ रहा है, अब भाजपा वाले लोग ही मदद कर सकते हैं। सर, कुछ व्यवस्था करके हमारे यहां भी चुनाव अप्रैल-मई में करवा दीजिए, क्योंकि हम छूट जाते हैं। चुनाव अक्टूबर-नवम्बर में होता है। हमें तो कम से कम कहने के लिए भी लाखों करोड़ नहीं मिलते हैं, ताकि कम से कम कुछ हसीन सपने हम भी देख पाते, तो मैं भाजपा के मित्रों के ऊपर छोड़ता हूँ, क्योंकि कुर्सी के चारों पाये की चाबी भी आपके ही पास है।

माननीय सभापति महोदय, मुझे अपने राज्य की चिंता सिर्फ इसलिए नहीं है कि मैं वहां का सांसद हूँ, मुझे चिंता इस बात के लिए भी है कि देश के लिए बिहार चिंता का विषय होना चाहिए। मैंने पहले भी कहा था कि हम श्रम-आपूर्ति वाले राज्य में हैं, हमें लोग उसी स्वरूप में, उसी शक्ल में देखना चाहते हैं। सर, हम भी अपनी हकीकत बदलना चाहते हैं, हम भी अपना स्वरूप बदलना चाहते हैं, हम भी अलग विकसित राज्यों की श्रेणी में खड़ा होना चाहते हैं। हम आपसे दया नहीं चाहते, सहानुभूति नहीं चाहते, खैरात नहीं चाहते, हम आपसे एक अच्छा नज़रिया चाहते हैं, एक नज़र चाहते हैं, ताकि बिहार में उद्योग-धंधों और संसाधनों की कमी न हो। माननीय सभापति महोदय, आपसे आग्रह होगा कि मुझे दो मिनट पहले इशारा कर दीजिएगा। मैं एक चीज़ और कहना चाहता हूँ। किसान पर, किसान आंदोलनों पर तो काफी चर्चा हो चुकी है। किसान आंदोलन को लेकर भी जो नज़रिया है, उससे भी यह बात साबित होती है कि अक्सर उस शब्द का कई दफा बहुत अतिरेक में भी इस्तेमाल होता है, 'crony', लेकिन मैं उसमें नहीं जाना चाहता हूँ। मैं सिर्फ इतना कहना चाहता हूँ कि आपके बजट में अगर आप छोटे-मझोले किसानों के लिए एक सीमा से आगे पहलकदमी कर पाते, तो ज्यादा बेहतर होता। अभी Oxfam की एक रिपोर्ट आई है। माननीय सभापति महोदय, आपने भी देखा होगा, मैडम, आपने भी देखा होगा और अनुराग जी, आपने भी देखा होगा, वह रिपोर्ट सरकार के लिए नहीं, संसद के लिए चिंता का विषय होनी चाहिए। अगर एक प्रतिशत लोगों के हाथ में 50 से ज्यादा प्रतिशत संसाधन आते हैं, तो हम यह कौन सा देश बना रहे हैं? तालियां बजेंगी, मीडिया में बड़ी तारीफें होंगी, लेकिन मैं बार-बार दोहराता हूँ कि इतिहास इन तालियों और वाह-वाही को गुम कर देता है, dustbin of history में डाल देता है, कोई चर्चा भी नहीं करता। एक बार सोचिएगा कि संपत्ति का जो यह concentration है, यह हमें कहां ले जा रहा है। Pandemic के दौरान हम सबने खोया - आप सबने चैन खोया, हम सबने भी चैन खोया। हम सबने अपने देश की उन हकीकतों को देखा, जो हम जानते थे, लेकिन acknowledge नहीं करते थे। मैं खुद उस राज्य से आता हूँ, जहां माइग्रेशन का एक बहुत बड़ा और एक अलग किस्म का पैटर्न है और quantum बहुत ज्यादा है। जब मैंने सड़कों पर वह पीड़ा बहती हुए देखी, तो मेरे लिए भी वह झटका था, आपके लिए नहीं रहा होगा, यह मैं नहीं मानता हूँ। वह आपके लिए भी रहा होगा, लेकिन यहां पर उनकी चिंताएं क्यों नहीं आ रही हैं? The gap between the rich and the poor continues globally. हम सब जानते हैं Andre Gunder Frank, Samir Amin, Wallerstein, यह जो world systems theory थी, अब खारिज कर दीजिए कि ये लोग थोड़ा-बहुत कम्युनिस्ट थे। नहीं सर, संपत्ति का बंटवारा चाहते थे और जब

तक संपत्ति और संसाधनों का बंटवारा कम से कम equitable न हो, अगर equal न भी हो, equitable नहीं होगा, तो आपकी सारी समस्याएं और बढ़ी होती जाएंगी। सारी समस्याओं की जड़ में यह चीज है और मैं समझता हूं कि जैसे World systems theory is a kind of pattern which thrives on inequality, produces inequality, उसी तरह जैसे poor countries से rich countries, उसी तरह poor regions से rich regions में भी, उसी तरह से wealth का ट्रांसफर होता है और हम जैसे कुछ राज्य उसके विक्टिम हैं। Aristotle ने कहा था, 'the greatest crimes are not committed for the sake of necessity but for the sake of superfluity.'

## 12.00 Noon

मैडम, मैं दो-चार चीजें आपके समक्ष रखूंगा। एक तो reduction in spending on education है। अगर real terms में आप data को देखिए, there is a decline in education spending by Rs.6,076 crore in real terms. Approximately, six per cent this year. Both school education and higher education division have seen their budgets cut. Centrally Sponsored Scheme में school education and literacy, Rs.43,285 crore which is less than Rs.50,380 crore of the last Budget figure. मैडम, ये आपके आंकड़े हैं और मैं सिर्फ आपके आंकड़ों को सामने रखकर बताना चाहता हूं। फिर issue of re-enrollment है, जिसके बारे में कई survey reports आ चुकी हैं।

माननीय सभापति महोदय, इस पूरे कोरोना काल में access to technology बहुत महत्वपूर्ण रहा है, online चीजें चल रही हैं। उस पर कई survey हो चुके हैं कि इसने अवसर को limit कर दिया है और dropouts बढ़ रहे हैं। ये हमारी चिंता के विषय होने चाहिए कि कैसे उन हाथों तक, उन घरों तक, जो हाशिए के लोग हैं, हम कैसे मदद पहुंचा सकते हैं। बड़ा आसान है कई लाख करोड़ किसी का माफ करना, लेकिन उससे भी ज्यादा आसान है कुछ हजार घर तक पहुंचा देना, ताकि वे digital divide से लड़ पाएं और एक महफूज व्यवस्था में जी सकें।

एक और महत्वपूर्ण चीज शिक्षक नियुक्ति की है। यह भी चिंता का विषय है। अभी माननीय शिक्षा मंत्री जी यहां पर नहीं हैं। वे बड़ा ambitious plan NEP के माध्यम से विश्व गुरु का लेकर आए हैं। माननीय सभापति महोदय, अगर गुरु ही नहीं होगा, तो विश्व गुरु हम कैसे बनेंगे? चाहे यह उत्तर प्रदेश का मामला हो, मेरे राज्य का मामला हो, शिक्षा प्रेरक, अतिथि-अनुदेशक, शिक्षकों की नियुक्ति, मैं समझता हूं कि 17 परसेंट अभी भी gap है। माननीय वित्त मंत्री साहिबा, वहां पर आपको proactive initiative लेना होगा।

**श्री सभापति:** अभी आपके पास बोलने के लिए दो मिनट का समय है।

**प्रो. मनोज कुमार झा:** अच्छा सर। मैं सिर्फ इतना कहना चाहता था और MGNREGA को लेकर मेरे सारे साथी कह चुके हैं। सर MGNREGA को उस सदन में 'monumental failure' कहा गया था। आप दिल पर हाथ रखकर सोचिए कि अगर MGNREGA न हुआ होता, तो कोरोना काल में क्या हुआ होता? MGNREGA ने सांसें थाम लीं - लोगों की भी और आपकी भी। MGNREGA

को लेकर मेरा मानना है कि आप इसके allocation को, please revisit it. This is number one. Number of days को enhance करने के बारे में कुछ करना चाहिए और mandays, working days और wages जो कई राज्यों में वह minimum wage से नीचे है, उसके बारे में मैं समझता हूँ कि consultation करके, संभव हो तो उसको किया जाए।

सर, मैं Public Distribution System के बारे में कहना चाहता था और food security का मसला भी इससे जुड़ा हुआ है। मैडम, मैंने सिर्फ social sector की चीजें ली हैं। मैं आंकड़ों में उलझना नहीं चाहता था, कई लोग आंकड़ों पर बात करते हैं - मैं आंकड़ों के पीछे जो आंखें हैं, जो आंसुओं से तर हैं, नम हैं, उनके बारे में आपके समक्ष बात रखना चाहता था।

सर, मैं रेलवे के बारे में एक बात कहकर अपनी बात खत्म करूंगा। रेलवे के संबंध में मैंने पहले भी अलग फोरम पर मंत्री महोदया से बात की थी कि hundred per cent electrification का एक बार cost analysis कर लीजिए। Should it be a priority in a pandemic year? This is number one. Two, रेलवे को मेरी पार्टी के राष्ट्रीय अध्यक्ष ने चलाया है। मैं अचानक देख रहा हूँ कि रेलवे की परिस्थितियाँ ऐसी हो गई हैं - कर्मचारियों से बात होती है, वे कह रहे हैं कि पूरी दिशा ऐसी चल रही है, give a bad name to a dog and then kill him. सर, यह नहीं होना चाहिए। इसके बारे में मैं बार-बार कह रहा हूँ। हम लोग तो उस दौर के लोग हैं, जो कहते हैं - "गाड़ी बुला रही है, सीटी बजा रही है।" रेलवे हमारे लिए सिर्फ एक ऐसा उपक्रम नहीं था, जिसको एक अदृश्य नज़रिए से देखें।

**श्री सभापति:** राइट।

**प्रो. मनोज कुमार झा:** माननीय सभापति महोदय, बस एक छोटी टिप्पणी और करना चाहता हूँ। मेरे पास यह एक रिपोर्ट है। इसको एक छोटे गुप ने तैयार किया है। इसको गांव कनेक्शन कहते हैं, जो पूरे पेंडेमिक के दौरान हुआ है। गांव के बारे में हम सोचते हैं कि हम समझते हैं, हम जानते हैं, हम कितना कम जानते हैं - चाहे harvesting का मसला हो, जब वे अपने घरों को लौटकर गए, तब के जो मसले थे। मैं आपसे सिर्फ इतना आग्रह करूंगा - इसे मैं आपके पास भिजवा रहा हूँ, चूंकि यह एक छोटे गुप ने बनाया था, तो मैंने बहुत पैसे कंट्रिब्यूट करके इसे लिया था, लेकिन मैं आपको दूंगा। शायद आप एक बार फिर से नज़र डालें, तो आप यह सोचें कि यह आम बजट कैसे हो सकता है, गांव के लोगों की कोरोना काल में क्या पीड़ा रही, शिक्षा की क्या स्थिति रही, लेबर पैटर्न क्या रहा, migration के कितने दंश रहे, इन सबके माध्यम से कुछ बात हो पाएगी।

**श्री सभापति:** राइट, मनोज जी।

**प्रो. मनोज कुमार झा :** सभापति जी, यह आखिरी बात है, मुझे "जय हिंद" कर लेने दीजिए, बस एक छोटी टिप्पणी है। संसद में जब बजट पर बात होती है तो सिर्फ पार्टिज़न तरीके से नहीं होती, यह मैंने शुरू में ही कहा, मैं अपने दल की ओर से इस बजट के लिए चाहता हूँ कि यह आम अवाम का बजट हो, इस बजट में सिर्फ वैसी अदृश्य पाँच ताकतों का ज़िक्र न हो, उनकी मौजूदगी का ज़िक्र न हो, जिनकी वजह से हम चिंतित हैं और श्रम को हमेशा पूंजी के समक्ष नतमस्तक कराया

जाएगा, वह कभी भी नहीं होना चाहिए। सभापति जी, यह बात कह कर मैं अपनी स्पीच समाप्त करता हूँ - जय हिंद and thank you very much.

---

### RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE BUSINESS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, today morning, the Business Advisory Committee met, discussed and came to the conclusion that the discussion on Budget and reply will be completed by tomorrow. The sitting on Saturday will not be there. Third, there is no Private Members' Business Bill. Fourth, today, we will sit up to 3 o'clock so that Members may get an opportunity. Reply by the Minister will also be tomorrow so that Members may be ready. At what time exactly, we will decide. Then, about Discussion on Ministries. After tomorrow's sitting, there will be a gap and thereafter the House will meet again. Certain suggestions were given. They are being discussed with other parties. Who will initiate which subject is also under discussion. Once it is finalized, it will be informed.

---

### THE UNION BUDGET 2021-22 - *Contd.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Shrimati Vandana Chavan.

SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN (Maharashtra): Sir, this Budget 2021-22 comes at an extremely crucial time when the world and our country are going through very, very trying times.

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY) *in the Chair.*]

Sadly, the year 2020 was a complete washout and, therefore, the people of this country look at this Budget with great hopes and aspirations. Covid taught us several life lessons. At the same time, on the one side, we witnessed that nature was blooming because man was imprisoned in his own home; on the other side, in spite of being in our own homes, we saw that there were several climate events which happened in our country. Super cyclone Amphan had a speed of 260 kilometres per hour which actually razed Odisha, your State, and West Bengal. Then, there was Nisarga on western coast, having a speed of 118 kilometres per hour which affected Maharashtra and, Mumbai the most, where we had the maximum Covid cases in the country. There was an observation made by Yuval Noah Harari, the historian and



philosopher, and author of a famous book. I would like to quote him because I feel what he said is very relevant. During the lockdown, he said that the storm will pass but the choices we make now could change our lives for the years to come. I think as far as India is concerned, this Budget is the first ever document after Covid which really sets a roadmap as to how our country needs to go ahead and what are the choices that we are going to make.

Sir, climate change poses one of the biggest challenges to mankind. It challenges our very existence; our future is at stake. Countries all over the world are declaring climate emergencies. India is one of the hotspots and vulnerable to climate change. Sir, I feel sad that there is no mention of this impending danger in the Budget Speech or the book that we have got. In the short time that I have been allocated, I wish to focus my interventions on the issue of environment and climate change. I wish to flag four observations which go to expose our missing sensitivity to the impending issue and show that our choices are blatantly out of place. On the one side, where environment is failing us or we are failing the environment, it is an irony that we have reduced the Budget allocation for the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change. Sir, the total budgetary allocation for the Ministry is Rs.2,869.93 crore this year as against Rs.3,100 crore last year. So, there is a drastic reduction of Rs.230 crore. It is extremely disappointing.

The second point, which I want to make, is about air pollution. We know and keep reading that our cities, the Indian cities, are becoming gas chambers. According to the Lancet Planetary Health Report released in December, 2020, air pollution claimed 1.7 million lives in India in 2018. Another Report -- Global Burden of Disease Report in 2017 -- says that air pollution kills one child every three minutes in India. In this Budget, the Government has allocated Rs.2,217 crores to tackle pollution in 42 cities. Last year, it had accounted for Rs.4,400 crores for clean air. We do not know how that amount was utilized and even if it was utilized, it is sad to see that amongst the worst polluted countries over the world, 15 cities are housed in India. According to the Greenpeace India's Annual Report 2020, 231 out of 287 major cities, which were studied, had PM10 levels exceeding the 60 unit level prescribed by the CPCB under the National Ambient Air Quality Standards. So, we have 231 cities which are already killing people and, here, we only try to address 42 cities which, again, is a matter of great concern.

My third point, is regarding the loss of GDP. According to the Lancet Planetary Health Report, India has lost 1.4 per cent of the GDP due to premature deaths and morbidity from air pollution. To understand this better, because one does not understand how much 1.4 per cent of GDP means in monetary terms, this is

equivalent to Rs.2,60,000 crores in monetary terms. And to understand it still better, it means more than four times of the allocation for Healthcare in the last year's Budget. So, this is something again which is a matter of great concern. If we have to see the loss percentage of GDP in the States, U.P. tops it with 2.2 per cent loss and Bihar has 2 per cent loss of GDP.

Sir, my fourth point is regarding the economic loss due to climate change. According to the Global Climate Risk Index 2020, India suffered an economic loss of 37 billion dollars due to climate change in 2018 alone. Apart from several climate disasters in various parts of our country, the glaring ones were the worst ever flood in hundred years in Kerala which claimed 324 lives, damaged 20,000 houses and 80 dams. There was a migration of 2,20,000 people. They were forced to migrate out of their habitats. Losses due to these amounted to 2.8 billion dollars. In the same year, India also experienced heat waves with temperatures above 50 degree centigrade in various parts of our country. ...(Time bell rings)... Sir, I have some eight minutes, I was told.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY): No, no. It is seven minutes.

SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN: Sir, in how many minutes do I have to finish it?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY): Only one minute is left.

SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN: Sir, please let me finish it. Chennai, which has a million population, ran out of water and it had to be transported from outside. The message is loud and clear. We know that all these are results of reckless damage to the environment. We have been alarmed time and again by experts and scientists but sadly we do not pay heed. And worst, still we continue to carry destruction unabated even today. To cite a few projects, the Char Dham Pariyojana in Uttarakhand side, where a massive 900 kilometre length road is being made in the Himalayan ecological sensitive region with blatant violations of the law, the declassification of salt pans into wetlands. We are diluting the EIA norms, the NGT norms, the CRZ norms, the National Forest Policy. The dense forests in the country, especially, Chhattisgarh, are being opened up for coal mines. The Government is hoping to denotify the Kachhua Wildlife Sanctuary and several other sanctuaries. ...(Time- bell rings)...

Sir, this is my last point. I urge the Government to ponder, introspect, analyze and decide what is the path that we need to take. And this is something that is

absolutely important. I would end my speech by quoting a paragraph from the book 'Hot, Flat and Crowded' authored by Thomas Friedman. He says: "Imagine a world without forests. Imagine a world without corals. Imagine a world without fish. Imagine a world where rivers flow only in the rainy season. Not only is that possible in more and more places, it is possible in our lifetime."

So, Sir, I urge the Ministry and the Minister, let us wake up. Let us bring the issue of climate change at centre-stage. Only then the State Governments, local Governments, the private sector and individuals would really wake up to this need. There is no time to lose. We have to act now for the future of our generations. Thank you, Sir.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA (Assam): Thank you, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, for allowing me to speak on the Union Budget. Due to the effect of the COVID-19, the country is passing through a very critical time. Madam Finance Minister, I must compliment you in this critical juncture, you placed a wonderful and a good Budget. Madam Finance Minister and Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, the Budget is a growth-oriented Budget. The Budget is for *Atmanirbhar Bharat* Budget. The Budget is for infrastructural development in our country. The Budget is also going to give and create new job opportunities which should be helpful for the unemployment youth of our country. When Budget has decided to expand the capital expenditure, automatically, it will reduce inflation in our country. Madam Finance Minister, in her Budget, proposed 137 per cent hike in the health sector, and the Government is going to spend near about Rs. 2,23,846 crores in this year, which is higher by 137 per cent when compared with the previous year. Our India is a welfare country. It is the duty of the Government to protect life of every Indian citizen. Under the leadership of *Pradhan Mantri* Narendra Modi, the Government is working in this right direction.

Sir, I am Indian, and I am proud to be an Indian. Our Government is going to spend Rs. 35,000 crores for Covid vaccines, and fifty crore people of our country will be covered through the Covid vaccines, which are produced by our country. I remembered when Covid had started, people were trying to get masks and people were trying to get sanitizers, etc. But, today, India is not only producing masks, India is also exporting that, and India is also producing the Covid vaccine, and that is the great example of *Atmanirbhar Bharat*. So, I compliment the hon. Prime Minister, Shri Narendra Modi for this. Unemployment is one of the greatest challenges for the nation. The Government has decided to increase the capital expenditure. When the capital expenditure is going to be increased, automatically, there will be new railway stations, new airports and new shipping ports are coming up, which means,

automatically, jobs will be created there. When capital expenditure is increased, automatically, jobs will be there and, to some extent, it will be helpful in curbing unemployment in our country.

Sir, the capital expenditure is going up. When capital expenditure goes up, automatically inflation comes down. One of the great opportunities I have seen in this Budget is, the Government has given topmost priority for the infrastructure development of the country, for the road and transport development of the country. The National Infrastructure Pipeline project will be expanded to cover 7,400 projects and 217 projects have already been completed at the cost of more than Rs.1.10 lakh crores. Under the proposed Rs.5,35,000 crores Bharatmala Pariyojana, more than 13,000 kilometres of road will be constructed at the cost of Rs.3.3 lakh crores. Sir, I come from the State of Assam. I am very happy that in this Budget, the hon. Finance Minister has awarded Rs.34,000 crores to construct 1,300 kilometres of National Highway in Assam. I am very happy about it. In addition, Rs.1,000 crores is awarded for the infrastructure development of Assam. I welcome it, Assam is an economically backward State. Madam Finance Minister, I am happy that you successfully brought into focus the needs of the people of Assam. I now come to one more thing. We have talked a lot about the migrant workers. What is the Government doing for the migrant workers? During the Covid pandemic, we have seen what problems were faced by the migrant workers. They were not getting food. They were not getting shelter or home. But introducing 'One Nation One Ration Card' system will help the migrant workers. These migrant workers may be in Kerala, may be in Assam, wherever they may be or from whichever State they may have migrated, under this provision, he will get food at cheap price from any part of the country. This is a great goal of this Budget. I thank the Finance Minister for this. Sir, please give me two minutes more. I come from the north-eastern region and in the interest of the north-eastern region, please allow me to speak for two minutes more. Madam Finance Minister, through you, I would like to draw the attention of the hon. Railway Minister. Railway electrification is a dream of the people of north-eastern region. Forget about railway electrification, all parts of the north-eastern region are not yet connected with railways.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY): Please conclude.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA: Sir, give me one minute more. At various times, every Railway Minister has announced that there will be electrification of NF Railways. But no Government has done anything. But I am happy and I compliment the hon.

Railway Minister that in 2021, the Railway Ministry took an ambitious plan to electrify 50 per cent of the NF Railways, both the rail lines. I welcome it and I am sure that this target will be fulfilled within time. I am hopeful about it. Also, Sir, through you, I would like to draw the attention of the hon. Minister that according to the World Health Organisation, the highest numbers of cancer patients in our country come from the north-eastern region. So, this is in the interest of the cancer patients.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY): You are from the North-Eastern Region. That is why I have extended two minutes.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA: Sir, I would like to give one small example. Every day, hundreds of cancer patients visit Mumbai from Guwahati, from the north-eastern part to get Cancer treatment. Madam Finance Minister, through you, I request the hon. Railway Minister, in the interest of the Cancer patients, please give us a Bullet Train between Guwahati and Mumbai. There are more than 10,000 posts lying vacant in the NF Railways. I request the hon. Minister to fill up these posts from amongst the unemployed youth of the North-Eastern Region. Thank you very much.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY): Now, Shri P. Chidambaram.

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM (Maharashtra): Mr. Vice-Chairman, I am grateful to you for this opportunity. I am grateful to the hon. Finance Minister for being present here, when I have an opportunity to speak on the Budget. I will be very brief. Let me first recall about last year. Dr. Arvind Subramanian who had just demitted office as Chief Economic Adviser, said, 'Pre-Covid, Pre-Budget, the economy was in the intensive care unit'. Dr. Abhijit Banerjee, the Noble Laureate, said, 'Pre-Covid, pre-Budget, the economy was doing badly'. The country had witnessed eight quarters of slowdown. The eighth quarter was underway but we knew that the economy will slow down further. It started at 8 per cent in the beginning of 2018-19, and ultimately, it ended with 3 per cent or so in 2019. In my intervention last year, I had pointed out that. The Government was in denial. The Government was refusing to accept the reality of a slowing economy and the Government believed wrongly that the problem of India's economy was cyclical and not structural. The hon. Finance Minister and other spokespersons of the Government flatly refused to accept our arguments, brushed aside our contentions and continued to pretend that all was well. And, I remember the dates and the occasions when they said that the revival would happen

next quarter. Be that as it may, two years of slowdown is a reality. Then the Covid struck. We pleaded that while you addressed the basic issues that are afflicting the economy, please do two things. One, transfer money to the poor people; do a cash transfer. Secondly, use your mountains of foodgrain to give free rations to poor people. Even this morning, a distinguished economist has said, 'Whatever may be said about the Budget of 2021-22, it fails on the fact that even a small amount of cash transfer is not being given to the poor and the rations are not being continued for the poor'. Be that as it may, this Government continues to believe that supply side responses will turn the economy around. I think there are five fingers in one hand. I can count, who those supply side theorists are. One is the hon. Finance Minister herself. The other is the Chief Economic Advisor. The third is the distinguished economist who presides over the NITI Aayog. And, the fourth is the hon. Prime Minister's speech writer. And, I am still looking for the fifth who wants to be counted on that side. Every economist in the world has said, we have to stimulate demand. The best way to stimulate demand is to put money in the hands of the people. This Government has failed on that account. I repeat the charge, you are still not learning the lessons of the last thirty-six months and I am afraid, as a result of your not learning the lessons, another twelve months will be lost, where the poor will suffer and suffer greatly.

Sir, in the year 2004-05, in constant prices, the GDP was about Rs. 32.42 lakh crores. I will leave the decimals out; let us take as Rs. 32 lakh crores. In 2013-14, when UPA demitted office, it was Rs. 105 lakh crores, a little more than three times. Since then, what is happening? In 2017-18, it was Rs. 131 lakh crores; in 2018-19, it crept up to Rs. 139 lakh crores; in 2019-20, it was a slower crawl to Rs. 145 lakh crores and in 2020-21, the year which is about to end, in the first half, it was about Rs. 60 lakh crores and the year may end with about Rs. 130 lakh crores, which means we are back to where we were in 2017-18. Sir, three years of incompetent economic management and the hon. Finance Minister took exception to my using the word 'incompetent', I can't use a harsher word in Parliament. I am using the mildest word available to me. Three years of incompetent economic management will mean that at the end of the year 2021, we will be exactly where we were in 2017-18. Please remember, Sir, in the last year, not entirely because of the Government, because of the pandemic too, 120 million people lost their jobs, that is, 12 crore; 64.7 million dropped out of the labour-force and out of that, 22 per cent are women. Only one out of eleven jobs are held by women, but, four out of eleven who dropped out are women; 28 million people have today registered in the employment exchanges actively seeking jobs; 35 per cent of MSMEs are closed. Come to Tirupur, come to

my town, where is the bakery, closed; where is the workshop, closed; where is the laundry, closed. The reality is that there is no demand in the bulk of India. I am talking about a relatively advanced State like Tamil Nadu. Imagine what will be the situation in relatively backward States like Bihar, Uttar Pradesh, Odisha, etc. My heart pains for them. I am not happy they are backward, but, it will be worse in those States. Sir, the answer to India's economic situation is to take the advice of well-meaning critics, distinguished Indian economists, who may be in India or abroad, and address the structural issues facing the economy and immediately address the needs of the poor people. This is what my colleague, Mr. Sibal said yesterday. You have ignored the poor; you have ignored the unemployed; you have ignored those who have lost their jobs and still looking for those jobs; you have ignored the MSMEs which are closed down; you have ignored the jobs that were lost in the closed down MSMEs. If you ignore the bulk of India, then, who is this Budget for? Before I answer the question, 'who is this Budget for', let me give you some numbers. Sir, major numbers are suspect in this Budget, like last year's Budget. Of course, you will always say the numbers unravel because of the pandemic. You won't have the excuse this year. These numbers are going to unravel, and like last year, the Finance Minister will have to make mini Budgets.

Let us look at the reality of the numbers. You said that you raised about Rs.10 lakh cores for additional borrowing. Where does this additional borrowing go? On the capital account, you are spending Rs.27,078 crores. Let us add the grants-in-aid of capital investment, another Rs.23,876 crores, the total additional capital investment in the current year, which will end on 31<sup>st</sup> March is Rs.50,954 crore; let us say, Rs.51,000 crore. Where did the rest of money go? Not for new investment, not for capital investment, where did it go because you have three large holes? On the revenue side, your expenditure increased by Rs.3,80,997 crore. On the revenue side, you have a revenue shortfall of Rs.4,65,773 crore and in the disinvestment you have a shortfall of Rs.1,78,000 crores. That adds up to Rs.10,24,770 crores. So, your money that you borrowed is only going to fill the gaps. The huge craters that are there in the economy today, next year would not be any better. The additional borrowing will go under the same heads. Mark my words today, and we will come back next year. Mark my words, the revenue projections for next year are ambitious. There will be a shortfall. The disinvestment projections are ambitious. There will be a shortfall, and your revenue expenditure will increase more than what you have provided for because you have under-provided under a large number of heads, including defence and health. Next year the total expenditure increases only by Rs.32,931 crore. I have complimented you in writing and I compliment you here. You are spending on capital

account an addition of Rs.1,15,000 crore. But what is Rs.1,15,000 crore in a GDP which you estimate will be Rs.220 lakh crore? Your estimate says that your GDP next year will increase by Rs.28 lakh crore, but you are spending an additional only Rs.1,00,000 crore on capital account. While I have given you half a compliment and I have to hold back the other half of the compliment because just not enough is being spent on capital expenditure. Sir, let me point out another number that will unravel. You have projected a nominal GDP growth of about 14.8 or 14.9 per cent. Then you say, 'It will still grow by 11 per cent.' The math is bewildering. Inflation next year, will be, at least five per cent, maybe, even six per cent. If your nominal GDP growth is 14.4 per cent and inflation is 5 or 6 per cent, the arithmetic I have says that your growth will be only 9.4 or 8.4 per cent. This year will end at minus 10, minus 11 and next year will grow by 8 or 9. This is what Dr. Gita Gopinath said, it is mechanical. Don't claim credit for that growth. If the decline in the previous year is minus 10, the mechanical rise will be plus 8 or 9. So, don't go by boasting about these numbers. The real test is when will you come back to a constant GDP which is higher than your highest, namely, Rs.145 lakh crore. I am afraid, it will take you two to three years, which is why Dr. Gopinath said, 'to reach pre-COVID levels, we will have to wait until 2025.' There are three numbers on which I must comment. One is Defence. The first time, I think, in the history of Parliament, the word 'defence' was not mentioned in the Budget Speech. Please correct me, if I am wrong. The word 'defence' was not mentioned in the Budget Speech. On health, the numbers have unraveled again. Everybody has blown a hole into the numbers claimed by the Finance Minister that she had increased the health expenditure by an astronomical figure. The Budget Division which prepares 'Budget at a Glance' has blown a hole into that by revealing the true figures. The true figures are clear on page 10 of the 'Budget at a Glance'. For health, in the current year, the Revised Estimate is Rs.82,445 crores and, for the next year, it is only Rs.74,602 crores. You have actually reduced the allocation in the Budget, according to page 10 of the 'Budget at a Glance'.

The third is, 'petrol and diesel prices will not increase because you have reduced the excise and comparably increased the cess.' There is a proverb in Tamil, which means to say, "A bluff will only have a short life." The bluff has been called three days later. Prices of petrol are increased by 36 paise and 26 paise. Believe me, it will rise again. What you have done by imposing cess is to deny the State Governments their share. Many numbers will unravel. I don't want to alarm or disappoint the hon. Finance Minister for, I am afraid, many numbers will unravel.

Finally, Sir, I want to point out what the text of the speech is. The text is prosaic, bureaucratic. What is the pretext of the speech? The pretext is, 'We have a



pandemic.' Let me tell you, we don't hold you responsible for the pandemic afflicting India nor do we hold you responsible, nor give you credit for the pandemic leaving India. The Corona virus came to India and the Corona virus is leaving India. You don't take the blame for Corona virus coming into India and you don't take the credit for the Corona virus leaving India. But, that is a separate debate on a separate occasion. The pretext is, we have a pandemic and the answer is supply side measures. The context is a slowing down economy, pushed into a deep recession, minus 10 per cent, thanks to the Pandemic and thanks to incompetent economic management. But, more than the text, more than the pretext, more than the context, what is important is the sub-text. The sub-text is, this is a Budget prepared for the rich, of the rich and by the rich. This Budget has done nothing for the poor of India who continue to suffer. The unemployed, those who are looking for employment, those who have lost jobs, the MSMEs who have closed down, the migrant workers, those who are waiting for rations to be given to them for a few more months, all of them have been neglected in this Budget. The sub-text is, this is a Budget prepared for the rich, of the rich and by the rich.

We must, therefore, record our strongest protest and dissent against the Budget. Because we dissent, we will be called *Andolan Jeevi* and *Par Jeevi*. Who are the *Par Jeevis* of the country? The *Par Jeevis* of the country are those one per cent who control 73 per cent of India's wealth. This is a Budget for that one per cent who already control 73 per cent of India's wealth. We reject this Budget in the name of the people. We appeal to you to amend this Budget and provide cash transfers, rations and succour to the poor. You may get away with this kind of a Budget. But, as long as the poor continue to suffer, one day or the other, the poor will wake up and, in a non-violent, peaceful manner, show the Government what it has done and what it should have done. I don't know when that will happen, but it will happen. The poor continue to suffer before your Budget and after your Budget, and, therefore, we reject this Budget and record our strongest protest against the Budget.

**श्री अरुण सिंह** (उत्तर प्रदेश): उपसभापति महोदय, आपने मुझे बजट पर बोलने का मौका दिया, उसके लिए मैं आपको धन्यवाद देता हूँ।

महोदय, पहली बार जो पेपरलेस बजट पेश किया गया, वह पर्यावरण फ्रेंडली भी है। वास्तव में अगर देखा जाए, तो जिस प्रकार की विश्व की परिस्थिति बनी थी, वह अकल्पनीय थी। किसी ने कभी सोचा भी नहीं था कि कोविड-19 के दौरान इस प्रकार का दृश्य होगा और ऐसा दृश्य बनेगा। उसके दौरान भारत सरकार द्वारा FRBM को ध्यान में रखकर, fiscal deficit को ध्यान में रखकर, साथ ही देश की चुनौतियों और आवश्यकताओं को भी ध्यान में रखकर जिस प्रकार से बजट बनाया गया और बजट में घोषणाएं की गईं, वे प्रशंसनीय हैं। साढ़े पांच लाख करोड़ रुपये के

capital expenditure का allocation किया गया, ताकि देश का आर्थिक पहिया भी चलता रहे और लोगों को रोजगार भी मिलता रहे। लोगों के मन में आशंकाएं थीं, लोग अलग-अलग प्रकार की शंका लगा रहे थे कि इतना बड़ा संकट आया है तो किसी न किसी प्रकार से टैक्स जरूर लगेगा, लेकिन मैं वित्त मंत्री जी का अभिनन्दन करना चाहूंगा कि इस बजट के माध्यम से किसी भी प्रकार का एक रुपये का भी टैक्स नहीं लगाया गया।

महोदय, मैंने सोचा था कि मैं यूपीए के समय के बारे में चर्चा नहीं करूंगा, लेकिन कल जब उधर के एक वरिष्ठ सदस्य यूपीए के समय के आर्थिक कुप्रबंधन की गौरव गाथा कर रहे थे और अभी थोड़ी देर पहले भी उस समय के कुप्रबंधन की गौरवगाथा कर रहे थे, तो मुझे लगा कि उनके समय की भी थोड़ी बात करना जरूरी है। उस समय किस प्रकार से चारों ओर भ्रष्टाचार था, लोग जेल जा रहे थे, dispute के cases बढ़ते जा रहे थे, देश ही नहीं, बल्कि विश्व के लोग भी भारत में आने को मना कर रहे थे, साथ ही हमारा current account deficit -4.8 per cent में चला गया था। वर्ष 2009-2010 में inflation rate लगभग 13 per cent होता था और अभी जो माननीय सदस्य बोल रहे थे, उन्होंने लगातार इन दोनों सदनों में कहा कि हम महंगाई की दर को 100 दिनों में कम करेंगे, लेकिन वह कम नहीं हुई। वर्ष 2009-2010 का inflation rate लगभग 13 per cent ही रहा, वे उसको संभाल नहीं पाए। उस समय भयंकर भय का वातावरण था और उनके समय कोई निर्णय होता ही नहीं था। मान्यवर, मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि निर्णय लेने के लिए कोई अधिकृत नहीं था। 30 Groups of Ministers बने थे, Empowered Groups of Ministers, एक-एक मंत्री 7 से 27 गुप्स का मेम्बर होता था, लेकिन फिर भी उनको निर्णय लेने का अधिकार नहीं था, निर्णय कोई अदृश्य शक्ति लेती थी, बाहर से कोई व्यक्ति उसका निर्णय लेता था, यह स्थिति थी। उसका नतीजा यह हुआ कि झगड़े बढ़ते रहे, dispute बढ़ते रहे। गवर्नमेंट के जो सेंट्रल सेक्टर के 301 प्रोजेक्ट्स थे, जो डेढ़ सौ करोड़ रुपये से अधिक के प्रोजेक्ट्स थे, वे इतने delay हुए कि उस समय की Ministry of Statistical and Program Implementation की रिपोर्ट के अनुसार 1 लाख 74 हजार करोड़ रुपये की भारी-भरकम बढ़ोतरी हुई। इस प्रकार की स्थिति थी कि विवाद, कोर्ट में केसेज उलझते चले जा रहे थे। वर्ष 2011 में यूपीए के समय में इतने झगड़े होते थे कि 4.5 ट्रिलियन रुपये के केसेज कोर्ट में पेंडिंग थे और यही देखकर यहां के उद्योगपति उद्योग नहीं लगाते थे, साथ ही बाहर के लोग भी उद्योग लगाने के लिए और investment करने के लिए नहीं आते थे।

महोदय, मैं एक बात और बताना चाहूंगा कि नतीजा यह होता था कि अगस्त, 2013 में यूपीए की सरकार ने सोचा कि हम बाहर से कॉरपोरेट बॉन्ड्स के माध्यम से कुछ पैसा collect करते हैं। पैसा इकट्ठा करने के लिए उन्होंने एक व्यवस्था बनाई और टारगेट यह रखा कि हम फॉरेन से 25 बिलियन डॉलर कॉरपोरेट बॉन्ड्स के माध्यम से collect करेंगे। उस समय तो स्थिति बिल्कुल भिन्न थी और बाहर के लोग हम पर विश्वास ही नहीं करते थे। फिर स्थिति यह हुई कि उसमें यूपीए ने पूरी ताकत लगाई और उसके लिए मार्केटिंग भी की, लेकिन वे इन्फ्रास्ट्रक्चर बॉन्ड के लिए केवल 15 per cent ही पैसा जुटा पाए। यूपीए के समय में देश की यह हालत थी और आज मोदी गवर्नमेंट है। अभी आज के दिन में 74 बिलियन डॉलर देश में आया है -- highest ever! आज फॉरेक्स रिज़र्व भी 590 बिलियन डॉलर है। देश के इतिहास में आज यह सबसे अधिक रिज़र्व है। सर, यह उस समय का दौर था। PEW रिसर्च ग्रुप एजेंसी ने फरवरी, 2014 में व्यापक रिसर्च की और रिसर्च करने के बाद यह कहा कि आज भारत में दस में से सात लोग नाखुश हैं। वे इस

सरकार को पसंद नहीं करते हैं और इसकी नीतियों को भी पसंद नहीं करते हैं। इसी का यह नतीजा रहा कि 2014 में जब चुनाव हुए तो 70 per cent लोगों ने उस सरकार को reject कर दिया, तब एक स्थिति वह बनी थी। दूसरी, स्थिति आज की देखिए कि अभी पिछले महीने पूरे विश्व में रैंकिंग और रेटिंग की गई।

**(उपसभापति महोदय पीठासीन हुए)**

जब अप्रूवल रेटिंग हुई, तो उसमें हमारे प्रधान मंत्री जी को विश्व में नम्बर वन स्थान दिया गया। यह माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी की credibility और उनकी policy का ही नतीजा है।

महोदय, मैं एक चीज़ और कहना चाहूंगा। आपने बोला है, तो मैं यहां पर गरीब, किसान और देश के एक-एक वर्ग के लिए बताना चाहूंगा। यहां पर लोग बोलकर तो निकल जाते हैं, यदि कुछ सुनना ही है, तो कम से यह भी सुन लें। यदि वे महाज्ञानी हैं, तो उनको थोड़ा और ज्ञान मिल जाएगा, लेकिन सुनेंगे नहीं, क्या करें! महोदय, 2013-14 में किसानों की केवल 42 लाख हेक्टेयर ही भूमि सिंचित होती थी। 'Per Drop More Crop' के माध्यम से जो बजट में भी उसके लिए fund allocate किया जाता है, 56 लाख हेक्टेयर से अधिक किसानों के लिए भूमि सिंचित होती है। 'पीएम सम्मान किसान निधि' के लिए हमारे बजट में भी पैसे का प्रावधान है। आप एक बार 50 हजार करोड़ रुपए का किसानों का कर्जा माफ करने की घोषणा करके ढिंढोरे पे ढिंढोरा पीटते रहते हैं, वह भी चुनाव के समय में। हमारी सरकार ने चुनाव को ध्यान में रखकर नहीं, बल्कि हर वर्ष किसानों को 60 हजार करोड़ रुपए देने का वायदा किया है और दे भी दिया। आप कहते हैं कि आपने किसानों के लिए बहुत काम किया है, हमने तो कुछ काम किया नहीं है। महोदय, मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि जब यूपीए की सरकार थी, तो किसानों की जो ओवरऑल क्रेडिट लिमिट होती थी, वह केवल सात लाख करोड़ रुपए होती थी। आज यह सात लाख से दस लाख करोड़ रुपए नहीं, बल्कि आज उनकी जो ओवरऑल क्रेडिट लिमिट है, वह साढ़े 16 लाख करोड़ रुपए हो गई है। इस बजट में उसका उल्लेख किया गया है। आप बताइए कि किसान खुशहाल होंगे या नहीं होंगे? यदि कुल मिलाकर देखा जाए तो आप मध्यम वर्ग को ही ले लीजिए। आप कहते हैं कि मध्यम वर्ग भी नाराज़ है, मध्यम वर्ग की आमदनी भी नहीं बढ़ रही है। आप पचास-साठ साल से जोड़ लीजिए, मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि 2013-14 में इनकम टैक्स रिटर्न्स 1 करोड़, 31 लाख फाइल होती थीं, आज के दिन में 3 करोड़, 31 लाख से बढ़कर दो गुना, यानी 6 करोड़, 48 लाख रिटर्न्स फाइल होती हैं। अब बताइए कि मध्यम वर्ग के लोगों की आय बढ़ रही है या नहीं बढ़ रही है, वे खुश हैं या नहीं हैं? आप के लोग तो जनता को गुमराह करते हैं। जब भी स्थानीय निकाय के चुनाव होते हैं, चाहे प्रदेशों के चुनाव हों, उनमें भी आपको जनता गुमराह कर देती है और भारतीय जनता पार्टी को जीत दिला देती है! आप लंबे समय तक उनको गुमराह नहीं कर सकते हैं। अभी चिदम्बरम साहब चले गए हैं। मैं बताना चाहता हूं कि आपने वर्ष 2007-08 में यह कहा था कि जीएसटी ले आएंगे। चिदम्बरम साहब यहां बैठे थे, उन्होंने ही कहा था। फिर वर्ष 2013-14 के बजट में बड़े दुखी मन से यह कहा था कि वर्ष 2007-08 में हमने कहा था कि जीएसटी ले आएंगे। फिर हमने सोचा कि वर्ष 2010 आ जाएगा, लेकिन हम जीएसटी नहीं ला पाए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा** (हिमाचल प्रदेश): वह मोदी जी ने नहीं लाने दिया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री अरुण सिंह** : आप अगर-मगर ...**(व्यवधान)**... I am not yielding. ...**(Interruptions)**...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा**: मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूँ कि ...**(व्यवधान)**... उस समय के गुजरात के मुख्यमंत्री जी ने ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री अरुण सिंह** : सर, आप सुनिए तो...**(व्यवधान)**... आप सुनिए तो...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति**: कृपया आपस में बात न करें। ...**(व्यवधान)**... अरुण जी आप चेयर को एड्रेस करें।...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री अरुण सिंह**: सर, अगर-मगर कुछ नहीं...**(व्यवधान)**... आपका कारवां लुट गया।...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति**: कृपया आपस में बात न करें। ...**(व्यवधान)**... प्लीज़, बैठकर बात न करें।...**(व्यवधान)**...माननीय चेयरमैन साहब ने आप सबको कहा है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री अरुण सिंह**: अगर-मगर कुछ नहीं, इनका कारवां लुट गया। अगर-मगर करते रहेंगे, तो कुछ नहीं होगा। मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि हमारी मोदी सरकार जीएसटी ले भी आई और यह जीएसटी का ही नतीजा है कि सभी लोग ईमानदारी से रिटर्न फाइल कर रहे हैं। कोविड संक्रमण के बाद भी पिछले महीने 1,20,000 करोड़ रुपये का जीएसटी कलेक्शन हुआ है, जिसमें आपके प्रदेशों को भी पैसा मिलेगा। मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूँ कि आपका सपना क्या था। आपने वर्ष 2013-14 के बजट में क्या कहा था? आपने यह कहा था कि हम 10वीं largest Economy है। हम सातवीं हैं और आठवीं पर जाना चाहते हैं- ऐसा ही कहा था। आपने वर्ष 2013-14 के बजट में यह कहा था कि वर्ष 2025 तक हम पांचवीं अर्थव्यवस्था पर जाने का सपना देख रहे हैं। मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूँ कि 2025 तक नहीं, मोदी जी ने तो दो साल पहले ही भारत को पांचवी अर्थव्यवस्था बना दिया, यह स्थिति है।

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा**: क्या कह रहे हैं? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति**: प्लीज़, प्लीज़ आपस में बातचीत न करें।...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री अरुण सिंह**: मान्यवर, मैं रोजगार के बारे में जरूर बताना चाहूंगा। पहले की जो सरकारें थीं, वे 'मनरेगा' और दिहाड़ी को ही रोजगार मानती थीं। भारत सबसे युवा देश है। अगर विश्व का कोई सबसे युवा देश है, तो वह भारत है। भारत में रोजगार के अवसर उपलब्ध होने चाहिए।

केवल मजदूरी के रोजगार नहीं, बल्कि ऐसे रोजगार, जिनमें स्वरोजगार भी हो, जो दूसरों को भी रोजगार दे सकें और रोजगार के अवसर उत्पन्न करें, यह आवश्यक है। इस बात को यदि किसी ने महसूस किया, तो हमारे प्रधान मंत्री श्री नरेन्द्र मोदी जी ने महसूस किया। जब उन्होंने 'मुद्रा योजना' की शुरुआत की, तो मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि आज 25 करोड़ लोगों को 'मुद्रा योजना' के अंतर्गत लोन दिया गया है। अब जब 25 करोड़ लोगों को 'मुद्रा योजना' के अंतर्गत लोन दिया गया है, तो वे कहीं न कहीं दो, चार, छह लोगों को रोजगार देते ही होंगे। आप सोचिए कि रोजगार उत्पन्न हुआ या नहीं हुआ! सर, 66 लाख सेल्फ हेल्प ग्रुप्स से 7 करोड़ महिलाएं जुड़ी हुई हैं। मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूं कि 3,40,000 करोड़ रुपये 'सेल्फ हेल्प ग्रुप्स' को दिए गए हैं, जिससे 7 करोड़ महिलाओं को लाभ मिलता है। वे कुछ न कुछ तो रोजगार कर ही रहे होंगे। आप केवल लेबर को ही रोजगार मानते हैं। इसी के साथ-साथ माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने शुरू में कहा कि स्किल डेवपलमेंट को बढ़ावा देना चाहिए। भारत में जिस प्रकार प्रतिभावान और talented लोग हैं, वे विश्व में जाकर छा सकते हैं। आज यह बताते हुए हर्ष हो रहा है कि स्टार्ट-अप के क्षेत्र में थर्ड इको-सिस्टम अगर कोई है, तो वह भारत है। आज भारत में 27,000 नए स्टार्ट-अप्स लगे हैं। जब स्टार्ट-अप होगा, तो लोगों को रोजगार मिलेगा और वे औरों को रोजगार भी दे सकेंगे। मैं वित्त मंत्री जी को इसलिए भी बधाई देना चाहूंगा कि स्टार्ट-अप में जो पैसा लगाते हैं, उन पर कैपिटल गेन को exempt करने की घोषणा भी की गई है और उसके साथ-साथ स्टार्ट-अप का tax exemption भी एक साल के लिए बढ़ाया गया है, इसलिए मैं आपका अभिनन्दन करता हूं और माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी का भी अभिनन्दन करता हूं।

#### 1.00 P.M.

आप भारत की तस्वीर तो ज़रा देखिए। हम जानते हैं कि जब तक research innovation नहीं होगा, तब तक कोई देश बहुत आगे नहीं बढ़ सकता है। आज क्या स्थिति है? आपके समय से हमारे समय तक, इस वक्त चार गुणा पेटेंट बढ़ चुके हैं। ट्रेडमार्क में यह स्थिति है कि आज भारत में पांच गुणा से अधिक ट्रेडमार्क रजिस्टर हो रहे हैं। इसके साथ ही research को बढ़ावा देने के लिए R&D होना चाहिए, रिसर्च होनी चाहिए और रिसर्च में नई-नई चीज़ों का innovation होना चाहिए। National Research Foundation बनाने की घोषणा हुई है और कोई छोटा-मोटा नहीं, अगले पांच सालों में 50 हजार करोड़ रुपये खर्च होंगे, यह बजट में घोषणा की गई है। इसके माध्यम से रोजगार मिलेगा। देश भर में तीन करोड़ से अधिक CSCs हैं, उनके माध्यम से लोगों को रोजगार मिल रहा है। Stand-Ups, जिनमें मुख्य रूप से महिलाएं हैं, एससी, एसटी के लोग हैं, अगर उनको 24 हजार करोड़ रुपये से अधिक पैसा मिल रहा है, तो यह बताइए कि लोगों को, युवाओं को कुछ न कुछ काम करने के अवसर प्रदान हो रहे हैं या नहीं हो रहे हैं, इसलिए मैं कहना चाहूंगा कि स्थिति यही है। शुरू से प्रधान मंत्री जी युवाओं को आगे बढ़ाना चाहते हैं, युवाओं को अवसर देना चाहते हैं और अगर देश का युवा आज कहीं खड़ा है, तो वह नरेन्द्र मोदी जी और उनकी नीतियों के साथ खड़ा है। आपने एक बात कही कि गरीबों के लिए कुछ नहीं किया है। गरीबों के बारे में तो मैं बता ही दूंगा, हमारे बहुत सारे मित्र भी गरीबों के बारे में बोलेंगे और बताने के लिए बहुत कुछ है। अभी आप बोल रहे थे कि एमएसएमई के लिए कुछ नहीं किया। कैसे नहीं

किया? पिछले बजट में 7,572 करोड़ रुपया था। आप सब लोगों ने क्या किया - इस साल का बजट, जो असामान्य परिस्थितियों में बना, जिसमें सब कुछ बंद था, पूरे देश में, विश्व भर में लॉकडाउन था - उनके आंकड़ों को लेकर जादूगरी के हिसाब से आपने बोलने का काम किया है, तो यह बताइए कि आपने कौन सा तीर मार दिया? मतलब adverse स्थिति थी, स्थिति विषम थी, उसको लेकर कहा गया कि ऐसा किया है, वैसा किया है, आप खुद खुश हो जाइए, लेकिन देश की जनता तो आपके भाषणों से खुश होने वाली नहीं है। इसके बावजूद भी पिछले बजट में, इस सेक्टर के लिए जो 7,572 करोड़ रुपये रखे थे, उसे इस बजट में माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी ने डबल करके 15,700 करोड़ रुपये करने का काम किया है। लगातार एमएसएमई की definition बदलना - एमएसएमई सेक्टर जो है, छोटे और लघु उद्योगों को लगातार कुछ न कुछ राहत मिलनी चाहिए, ताकि उनके प्रति अन्याय भी न हो, उनको छूट का दायरा भी मिलता रहे, इसलिए लगातार उनकी definition बदलकर, उनको अधिक से अधिक छूट देने का काम किया है और compliances में भी उसको राहत देने का काम किया है। अभी 50 लाख से अधिक 2 करोड़ paid-up capital की जो घोषणा की है और 2 करोड़ से 20 करोड़ turnover की जो घोषणा की है, इससे हमारे एमएसएमई सेक्टर के जो लोग हैं, उनको बहुत बड़ा लाभ मिलेगा, क्योंकि जब turnover की सीमा बढ़ जाएगी, तो बहुत सारी छूट उनको मिलेगी और सारे compliances में भी उनको राहत मिलेगी। Emergency Credit Line Guarantee Scheme चल रही है, इस सेक्टर को अपनी property mortgage किए बिना लोन मिल रहा है। तीन लाख करोड़ रुपये की योजना है। एमएसएमई सेक्टर, स्मॉल और लघु उद्योग के जो लोग मुश्किल में हैं, उनको भी 20 हजार करोड़ रुपये से अधिक की राहत फंड के माध्यम से दी गई है। आप बताइए, आपने तो यह काम किया नहीं। हमारे इन छोटे और लघु उद्योगों को लाभ देने के लिए प्रधान मंत्री जी ने यह निर्णय लिया कि 200 करोड़ से जो कम के टेंडर होंगे, उसमें कोई विदेशी participate नहीं करेगा, उसमें केवल भारत के उद्योग participate करेंगे। हजारों की संख्या में ऐसे कानून थे, जो redundant थे, उन कानूनों का अता-पता ही नहीं था, लेकिन धीरे-धीरे करके हजारों की संख्या में उन कानूनों को समाप्त किया। उससे एमएसएमई सेक्टर को राहत मिल रही है। उसके अलावा कंपनीज़ ऐक्ट में बहुत सारे क्रिमिनल ऐक्ट्स थे, उनको decriminalisation करने का काम किया और इस बजट में जो बचे हुए भी थे, उसमें भी कहा गया है कि जो Limited Liability Partnership (LLP) Act, 2008 है, उसमें भी जो criminal Sections हैं, उनको भी हम decriminalisation करने का काम करेंगे। हमारा यह उद्देश्य है। प्रधान मंत्री जी ने लाल किले की प्राचीर से भी बोला था कि हमें वैल्यू क्रिएटर का सम्मान करना चाहिए। वैल्यू क्रिएटर लोगों को नौकरी देता है, देश के assets creation में अपना योगदान देता है।

**श्री उपसभापति:** माननीय अरुण जी, आपके बोलने का समय खत्म हो गया है, जो आपकी पार्टी ने दिया है। आप अपनी बात खत्म करिए।

**श्री अरुण सिंह:** मान्यवर, मेरे पास कहने को तो बहुत कुछ है, लेकिन मैं इतना कहना चाहता हूँ कि हम सभी को सम्मान देने का काम कर रहे हैं। इसके अलावा बहुत सारे रिफॉर्म्स हैं - faceless assessment के साथ-साथ अब फेसलेस इन्कम टैक्स का ट्रिब्यूनल भी होगा। मैं एक चीज़ और

बता देना चाहता हूँ कि इस बजट में आदिवासियों के लिए भी बहुत अधिक घोषणाएं हुई हैं। उनके लिए 750 एकलव्य विद्यालय बनाए जाएंगे। मान्यवर, मैं अंत में कहना चाहूंगा कि अगर पूरा बजट पढ़ेंगे, तो इसमें एक बात स्पष्ट है कि जो five trillion dollar इकोनॉमी का लक्ष्य माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने रखा है, उसको पूरा करने की दिशा में यह बजट है। हम आत्मनिर्भर भारत बने और आत्मनिर्भर भारत के साथ, नये भारत की संकल्पना भी पूरी हो, उसे हम इस बजट के माध्यम से अवश्य प्राप्त करेंगे, धन्यवाद।

**श्री उपसभापति:** धन्यवाद। श्री सुखेन्दु शेखर राय जी।

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY (West Bengal): Sir, according to me, this Budget reflects the bankruptcy in the state of economy of our country. सर, लोगों के मन में अच्छे सपने जगाने के लिए इस बजट में कुछ ऐसी बातें कही गई हैं, जिनको इकोनॉमिक सर्वे में भी नहीं बताया गया है। इकोनॉमिक सर्वे में 11 परसेंट ग्रोथ रेट वर्ष 2021-22 के लिए बताया गया है, लेकिन इस बजट में उससे भी आगे बढ़ गए हैं। बजट में 14.4 परसेंट का projection है। इस 14.4 परसेंट के आधार पर बजट में सारी कहानियां सुनाई गई हैं। इस पर हमें एक पुराना गीत याद आ रहा है। उसको लता जी और मुकेश जी ने अलग-अलग गाया था। मैं उस गीत के दो-चार लफ्ज़ बोलना चाहता हूँ। फिल्म का नाम 'शोर' था और म्यूज़िक डायरेक्टर लक्ष्मीकांत प्यारेलाल जी थे।

*"जिंदगी और कुछ भी नहीं, तेरी मेरी कहानी है।"*

इसमें न तो तेरी कहानी है और न मेरी कहानी है - आम जनता की कहानी इसमें नहीं है, बाकी जो है, वह सब दर्द भरी कहानी है। उसकी ही अब मैं चर्चा करना चाहता हूँ। पहले तो आपको बजट में यह बोलना जरूरी था कि आप जो बजट में 14.4 परसेंट ग्रोथ रेट बता रहे हैं, इसका बेसिस क्या है? अगर हम वास्तविक चित्र देखते हैं, तो in 2019-20, our economy contracted by 4.1 per cent, and it further contracted by 7.1 per cent in 2020-21. And, on 4<sup>th</sup> January, this year, the World Bank Global Report estimated India's GDP to plunge 9.6 per cent. However, the spokespersons of the Government say that such report should not be relied upon. हमें अभी तक Revised Estimate का कुछ पता नहीं है, तो कैसे हम वर्ल्ड बैंक की रिपोर्ट को खारिज करेंगे और कैसे आपके आंकड़ों पर भरोसा रखेंगे? खैर ये सारे statics कुछ भी हों, सरकार अपनी कहानी पर खड़ी है और 'आत्मनिर्भर भारत' का सपना भी लोगों को दिखा रही है कि "PLI schemes to create manufacturing global champions for Atmanirbhar Bharat. This will help bring scale and size in key sectors and provide jobs to our youth. It will provide jobs to our youth. आत्मनिर्भर भारत का जो प्रधान लक्ष्य है, उसमें यह भी बताया गया है, लेकिन सर, मेरे विचार से this is nothing but empty promises, क्योंकि एग्रीकल्चर के बाद सबसे ज्यादा MSME में जॉब क्रिएट होता है, लेकिन millions of MSMEs are still shut down. जैसा कि चिदम्बरम जी कुछ बता रहे थे, उसके बारे में सब जानते हैं, हर मेम्बर अपने-अपने क्षेत्र में देख रहा है कि MSME की हालत क्या है। The Government believes

that they would take loans from banks and start running their units once again as before. But loan off-take in the MSME sector even without any collateral guarantee is at a record low. सरकार बोल रही है कि आप आओ, लोन लेकर जाओ, आपको गारंटी नहीं देनी पड़ेगी, collateral नहीं देना पड़ेगा, लेकिन फिर भी लोन लेने के लिए कोई नहीं आ रहा है। बैंक ने दरवाज़ा खोलकर रखा है, ऐसी हालत हमारी है। यह वास्तविक चित्र है, इसको किसी को अस्वीकार नहीं करना चाहिए और कैसे सुधार लाना चाहिए, इसके बारे में ज्यादा ध्यान देना चाहिए।

महोदय, मैं आपको एग्रीकल्चर के बारे में क्या बताऊँ? आपकी पार्टी का 2014 का जो इलेक्शन मैनिफेस्टो था, आपने उसी में बताया था कि हम पाँच साल के अंदर किसानों की इनकम डबल कर देंगे, लेकिन आपने उसको 2022 तक फिर बढ़ाया है। अभी एक साल बाकी है, लेकिन आप समझ गए हैं कि आप किसान की इनकम एक साल में भी दोगुनी नहीं कर पाएंगे, इसलिए आपने क्या किया? आप तीन फार्म्स बिल्स लेकर आए और the whole agricultural sector would now be a playground of the corporates.

महोदय, हमारी आज़ादी को करीबन 75 साल हो गए हैं। In the last 75 years किसी ने कभी नहीं सोचा होगा कि एग्रीकल्चर सेक्टर का पूरा दरवाज़ा कॉरपोरेट के लिए इस ढंग से खोल दिया जाएगा कि जिसका reflection इन तीन किसान बिलों में दिख रहा है। आपने वह कर दिया है। तीन महीने से किसान हज़ारों की संख्या में, लाखों की संख्या में राजधानी दिल्ली के नज़दीक 2 डिग्री टेम्परेचर में अपने परिवार को लेकर, अपने बीवी, बच्चों को लेकर धरने पर बैठे हुए हैं। वहाँ कोई पोलिटिकल पार्टी नहीं है। उन्होंने साफ़ कह दिया है कि हमें किसी पोलिटिकल पार्टी की मदद भी नहीं चाहिए। सरकार ने अभी उनसे चर्चा शुरू की, लेकिन तारीख़ पर तारीख़, तारीख़ पर तारीख़ - जैसे अदालत में होता है, वैसे ही सरकार भी उनके साथ चर्चा करने के लिए, discussion करने के लिए तारीख़ पर तारीख़ दे रही है, जिसका कोई नतीजा नहीं निकला है। उसका कोई नतीजा निकला नहीं है, क्योंकि वे लोग इतने खफ़ा हैं और उनके खफ़ा होने के बहुत सारे कारण जायज़ हैं, क्योंकि जिस ढंग से इन बिल्स को बनाया गया, उन पर पहले किसी से कोई चर्चा नहीं हुई। रवि शंकर प्रसाद जी ने, कृषि मंत्री जी ने publicly बयान दिया कि लाखों आदमियों से चर्चा हुई है। इलेक्ट्रॉनिक मीडिया में एक RTI दी गई थी कि क्या किसान संगठनों के साथ सरकार ने कोई चर्चा की है या नहीं की है? अगर की है, तो उसका नाम दिया जाए? जो RTI Information Commissioner हैं, उन्होंने बताया कि हमारे पास कोई रिकॉर्ड नहीं है कि कोई चर्चा हुई है या नहीं हुई है। मैं किसकी बात को सच समझूँ? मंत्रियों की या RTI Information Commissioner की? यह सब चल रहा है। आप देखिए कि अगर देश के किसान इस तरह से खफ़ा होते हैं तो इसका हमारी economy पर क्या असर पड़ता है, मुझे यह समझाने की ज़रूरत नहीं है, क्योंकि हमारे आदरणीय वित्त मंत्री जी दुनिया के एक जाने-माने economist हैं, लेकिन मेरा अनुरोध है कि वे इस बारे में ज़रूर सोचें।

महोदय, "मनरेगा" की बात करें तो, in this Budget, Rs. 73,000 crores have been allocated for MNREGA, which is 34.52 per cent less than the Revised Estimate of Rs. 1,11,500 crore for 2020-21. "मनरेगा" के लिए पिछले साल से 1 लाख, 11 हज़ार, 5 सौ करोड़ घटा दिए गए हैं। ये बोल रहे हैं कि job creation होगा। इन्होंने लेबर लॉज को इस तरह से अमेंड



किया है कि जो 6 लेबर लॉज अमेंड किए गए हैं, that is an anti-labour step on the part of the Government because the labour laws have been amended to the benefit of the corporates, and the policy of hire and fire shall prevail upon the working conditions of the workers. Even the eight-hour duty at the working place shall be extended up to 12 hours at the diktats of the corporates. This is going to happen when the labour laws are implemented. वे बोलेंगे कि नहीं, वह तो लेबर की consent लेकर होगा। Consent कौन नहीं देगा? यदि वह consent नहीं देगा, तो उसको नौकरी से हटा दिया जाएगा। Amendment to labour laws हो गया।

महोदय, unemployment पर कहूं तो यह बताया गया था कि हम साल में 2 करोड़ job create करेंगे। हर साल 2 करोड़ बेरोजगार लोगों को रोजगार मिलेगा। छह साल तो बीत चुके हैं, अब सात साल होने वाले हैं, इस मई महीने में सात साल complete होंगे, इस बीच 14 करोड़ रोजगार सृजित हो जाने चाहिए थे। अभी चिदम्बरम जी ने आंकड़े दिए थे, वे सब जानते हैं। In April, 2020, 12 crore people lost their jobs due to the pandemic, and not just the pandemic, but also because of the recession that started from the time of announcement of *notebandi*. It started from there, and actually, the pandemic added salt to the injury. We are having this situation where a vast army of unemployed people is roaming around. हर जगह, आप किसी शहर में जाइए, गाँव में जाइए, जो मोहल्ले में बैठे हुए हैं, उनकी हताशा देखिए, सारे हिन्दुस्तान की यह जो हमारी स्थिति है, इसको आप कहाँ तक ले जा रहे हैं! अगले दिन law and order problem भी हो सकती है।

Roads and highways, infrastructure development के बारे में बताया गया। Some people say that whatever has been announced in regard to allocation of roads and highways infrastructure is essentially meant for the Assembly-poll-bound States of Assam, Kerala, Tamil Nadu and West Bengal. यह जो चुनाव होने वाला है, इसको मदेनजर रखते हुए इस बजट में roads and highways के लिए कुछ announcements की गई हैं and West Bengal has, as usual, got the lowest allocation of Rs.25,000 crore for 675 kilometers of Highway works. The Central Government failed to widen and maintain the National Highway Nos. 31 and 34 for the past one decade. They could not do anything, and now they say that they will spend Rs.25,000 crore for 675 kilometers of highway. But what has the Bengal Government done? The West Bengal Government has successfully constructed 88,841 kilometers of rural roads and 5,111 kilometers of State Highways in the past ten years. 10 साल में सिर्फ कोलकाता से सिलिगुड़ी का जो हाईवे है, केन्द्र सरकार उसको ठीक से maintain नहीं कर पाई, widen नहीं कर पाई, जबकि उसी 10 साल में हमारी राज्य सरकार ने 88,841 किलोमीटर रूरल रोड्स बनाई और 5,111 किलोमीटर स्टेट हाईवे बनाया। अभी चुनाव आ रहा है, तो the Centre is offering a lollipop of 675 kilometers highway works for West Bengal. महोदय, बंगाल के खिलाफ यह जो step-motherly attitude है, हम बंगला में कहते हैं - 'विमात्री सुलभ आचरण', यानी step-motherly attitude और यह writ large on the pages of this Budget. The devolution

of funds, till December last year, so far as West Bengal is concerned, had been Rs.10,000 crore less and there is no reflection about this in the Budget. Why is there less devolution of Rs.10,000 crore? There should be some justification, isn't it? No. Nothing has been murmured.

सर, पिछले साल, जबकि हम Corona pandemic में फँसे हुए थे, उसी समय अम्फान तूफान आया, सब जानते हैं। Odisha also partly damaged और वैस्ट बंगाल के चार जिलों में एकदम बरबादी हो गई। आदरणीय प्रधान मंत्री जी भी वहाँ देखने के लिए गए, उन्होंने खूब देखा। He visited the affected areas through aerial visit. उस समय एक हजार करोड़ interim relief announce की गई थी। उसके बाद आज तक केन्द्र सरकार ने अम्फान relief के लिए एक पैसा भी नहीं दिया, हालाँकि जो assessment हुआ था, वह यह था कि वहाँ जो क्षति पहुँची है, वह 1 लाख 2 हजार करोड़ की है। अम्फान में 1 लाख 2 हजार करोड़ की क्षति assess की गई थी, उसमें सिर्फ 1 हजार करोड़ की interim relief की घोषणा हुई। बस हो गया, उसके बाद अभी तक एक पैसा भी नहीं आया। No Government in free India had ever shown such cruelty to any State on the issue of natural calamity. This is the most unfortunate part.

इसके अलावा, Rs.85,700 crore is due to West Bengal on account of GST, 100-day work, infrastructure projects, ICDC, etc. इसके बारे में एक शब्द भी यहाँ पर नहीं बताया गया है।

Sir, at page 14, para 16, the hon. Finance Minister has said about natural gas. The heading is 'Petroleum and Natural Gas'. But I don't know why a single word has not been mentioned about petroleum. Not a single word! लेकिन हमारी इस सभा के एक पुराने नेता ने एक ट्वीट किया। उन्होंने ट्वीट करके जो बताया, सबने उसको देखा। लोग social sites पर इसको बहुत मज़ाक में ले रहे हैं, लेकिन यह मज़ाक की बात नहीं है। उन्होंने यह बात किस ढंग से बोली, यह मैं मेन्शन करना चाहता हूँ। 'राम के भारत में पेट्रोल 93 रुपये प्रति लीटर है, सीता के नेपाल में पेट्रोल 53 रुपये है और रावण की लंका में 51 रुपये है।' यह हकीकत है, लेकिन इसे किस ढंग से पेश किया गया, यह आप देखिए। In our neighbouring countries, the price of petrol is around Rs.51 or Rs.53 per litre, but in our country, it is around Rs.91 or Rs.93. इसमें एक संतोष की बात यह है कि रूलिंग पार्टी के किसी भी लीडर ने अभी तक उस नेता को, जिन्होंने यह राम-रावण वाली कहानी सुनाई, वहाँ जाकर बसने के लिए नहीं बोला है। एक बार पहले किसी ने इस तरह की बात बोली थी, तो उनको इन्होंने बोला था कि आप भी जाकर पाकिस्तान में बस जाओ। यह खुशी की बात है कि अभी तक उन नेता को यह नहीं बोला गया है कि आप नेपाल में या श्रीलंका में चले जाओ।

सर, बजट में बैंकों के बारे में बहुत चर्चा हुई है। 14 nationalised banks थे, इस बात को सब लोग जानते हैं, शायद अब इनकी संख्या 12 है। लेकिन जैसा hon. Finance Minister ने अपनी बजट स्पीच में बताया है, घटते-घटते अब केवल 2 nationalised banks रह जाएंगे। उन्होंने ठीक से यह नहीं बताया कि दो रह जाएंगे या चार रह जाएंगे, लेकिन जिस दिन बजट पेश हुआ, उससे अगले दिन हमारे जो Chief Economic Advisor हैं, उन्होंने 2 फरवरी को एक newspaper - 'Bloomberg' में एक इंटरव्यू दिया था, जिसमें उन्होंने बताया था, "Banking will

be a strategic sector where there will be four or less PSBs, but the rest will slowly be unwound and put into the private sector." इस तरह 12 से घटकर सिर्फ दो nationalised banks रह जाएंगे। यहां पर यह भी बताया गया है, 'Two public sector banks would be privatised in the upcoming financial year.' इस तरह बैंकों की संख्या को घटाते-घटाते ये दो या चार तक ले आएंगे और बाकी सब बैंकों को प्राइवेट सेक्टर को बेच देंगे। यह बात मैं नहीं कह रहा हूं, यह बात Chief Economic Advisor ने कही है।

हम लोग NPA के बारे में बहुत चर्चा करते हैं, उसके बारे में कहा गया है कि एक private bad bank बनाया जाएगा। हमने कभी अपनी पूरी जिन्दगी में यह नहीं सुना होगा कि यह bad bank क्या होता है? मैं economist तो नहीं हूं, लेकिन आजकल bad bank बनाने की बात कही जा रही है। जो लोग बैंकों का पैसा लेकर भाग गए हैं और बाहर जाकर पैसा इधर-उधर कर दिया है, उन सारे NPA accounts को bad bank में भेज दिया जाएगा। वे लोग यह तय करेंगे कि उस पैसे को किस तरह वसूल किया जाएगा या नहीं किया जाएगा। यह काम भी private sector के पास जाएगा, सरकार का उस पर कोई नियन्त्रण नहीं रहेगा। वह bad bank सरकार का नहीं होगा, वह bad bank भी private sector के हाथों में रहेगा और वही यह तय करेगा कि NPA को कैसे वसूल किया जाएगा। मुझे कुछ समझ में नहीं आ रहा है कि यह इस देश में क्या हो रहा है?

एक सदस्य ने बोला कि हमने Companies Act में decriminalisation किया है। ऐसा क्यों किया है? आप इतना सारा decriminalisation क्यों कर रहे हैं? जिन लोगों ने हमारी आम जनता का पैसा लूटा, they are criminals and criminal action should be taken against them. Why are you going for decriminalisation all the time? What for? आपको इस देश को यह बताना चाहिए कि आप किसके स्वार्थ की रक्षा करना चाहते हैं? आप आम जनता के हित की रक्षा करना चाहते हैं, जिनका रुपया अमानत के रूप में बैंकों में था और जिसे इन लोगों ने लूट लिया या फिर आप उन criminals के स्वार्थ की रक्षा करना चाहते हैं? यह one after another decriminalization करके तो आप उन लोगों को हेल्प कर रहे हैं। यह सिलसिला तीन-चार साल पहले शुरू हुआ था और अब तक चलता जा रहा है। आप उनके खिलाफ कोई criminal action नहीं ले सकते हैं, क्योंकि पैर से सिर तक आपका सब कुछ बिका हुआ है। आप कुछ नहीं कर सकते हैं, क्योंकि आप एक विक्रेता सरकार हैं। सर, public sector undertakings के बारे में मैं सिर्फ दो-तीन लाइनें बोलना चाहता हूं, क्योंकि मेरी पार्टी से अभी एक स्पीकर और हैं। Hon. Finance Minister has announced that there will be only four key strategic sectors and in these key segments, there will be a maximum of three or four public sector units. There are more than 400 public sector units and it will be reduced to three to four public sector units only. 1900 में जब बंगाल में ब्रिटिश लोगों के खिलाफ anti-partition movement शुरू हुआ था, उस समय एक scientist, एक Professor of Chemistry, Acharya Prafulla Chandra Ray ने अपने रोजगार से Bengal Chemicals & Pharmaceuticals Ltd. को बनाया था। सौ साल से ज्यादा पुरानी वह कम्पनी है - वह लॉस में किंग कम्पनी नहीं है। हर साल वह चार करोड़, पांच करोड़ और छः करोड़ रुपये का प्रॉफिट कर रही है, लेकिन उसे भी बेचने का निर्णय सरकार ले चुकी है, इसी साल उसे बेच दिया जाएगा, लिस्ट में उसका नाम है। देश की पहली स्वदेशी कम्पनी, उसे भी इन्होंने छोड़ा नहीं, क्यों? क्योंकि इस कम्पनी की मुम्बई के

प्रभादेवी में, उत्तर प्रदेश के कानपुर में और बंगाल की दो जगहों में बहुत सारी प्रॉपर्टी है - उस प्रॉपर्टी को बेचना है। वह 45 हजार करोड़ रुपये की प्रॉपर्टी है - उस 45 हजार करोड़ की प्रॉपर्टी को लूटने के लिए प्राइवेट कम्पनी ने जो नक्शा तैयार किया है, सरकार ने उसे मदद देने के लिए यह एलान किया है। अब चुनाव आ गया है, वे कुछ नहीं बोल रहे हैं। मैं चाहता हूँ कि ऑनरेबल फाइनेन्स मिनिस्टर इसके ऊपर कुछ हमें बतायें।

It further said, "In all other areas -- I mean, other than the four key strategic areas -- where there are PSUs, the Union Government will move out." नॉन-स्ट्रेटेजिक एरिया में यूनियन गवर्नमेन्ट नहीं रहेगी। महोदय, यह टाइम्स ऑफ इंडिया की न्यूज है, जो कि गवर्नमेन्ट सोर्स की बताई हुई है।

महोदय, अब मैं अपनी बात समाप्त करना चाहता हूँ, चूँकि हमारे दूसरे स्पीकर मेरे छोटे भाई जैसे हैं। Finance Minister quoted Rabindranath Tagore from 'Fireflies — A Collection of Aphorisms'. मैं भी टैगोर साहब की गीतांजलि से, जिस गीतांजलि के लिए उन्हें नोबल पुरस्कार मिला था, उसमें से दो-चार लाइनें बोलना चाहता हूँ।

*\* "Oh my wretched country!*

*You will be humiliated in the same way you humiliated others for so long.*

*Those whom you deprived of basic humanity*

*Whom you zealously excluded, despite being in the same boat*

*You will be humiliated in the same way you humiliated others for so long.*

*You ostracized and cornered them*

*With your own your own strength you labelled them with your disdain*

*You trampled them under your feet*

*You will have to come down to their status one day for salvation; there is no other way out*

*You too will have to experience their humiliation, one day."*

इसका मतलब है कि "Oh, my wretched country, you will be humiliated in the same way, you humiliated others for so long. You ostracized and cornered them, with your own strength, you levelled them with your disdain. You trampled them under your feet. You will have to come down to their status one day for salvation. There is no other way out. You too will have to experience their humiliation one day". Thank you.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Sukhendu Sekhar Ray ji. Now, Dr. M. Thambidurai.

---

\* English translation of the original speech delivered in Bangla.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I am very happy to participate in the discussion on the General Budget presented by the hon. Finance Minister. Sir, before starting the discussion, I would like to mention about the Covid issue because it is a pandemic and needs a mention. To begin with, I would say let us view this year's Budget considering that the entire world had been in the grip of Covid pandemic and every country on the world map had been taking measures to deal with this situation. It has already affected the world economy as also India's economy.

As far as vaccine is concerned, you will find that India's vaccine is much sought for throughout the world. I appreciate the scientific community for having come out with the vaccine within a short time. Sir, in this connection, I would like to appreciate the hon. Prime Minister. He has taken a lot of efforts. He visited all the vaccine-producing labs, taking the risk for the nation. Hon. Prime Minister has taken so many steps to see that we can get the Made in India vaccine quickly. Prime Minister always stresses the need of 'Make in India'. That is his slogan. On that basis, to solve the pandemic, he has taken a lot of efforts and visited the labs at a risk to his life to save the nation. We are proud that most of the countries of the world have sought the Indian vaccine. That is the contribution India has now made. Because of the hon. Prime Minister, we have achieved this.

Before coming to other issues, I want to say about the budget provided for Tamil Nadu. Our hon. Finance Minister hails from Tamil Nadu. I have to congratulate her and also thank her for giving so much importance to Tamil Nadu while allocating funds.

The Union Government has announced a package of Rs. 35,000 crores for nationwide vaccination programme to combat Covid-19. This will definitely help all the States, including Tamil Nadu, to recover from the pandemic. In this connection, I would request the Centre to enhance the financial assistance being provided to Tamil Nadu to continue our efforts to save the lives of the people.

There is an announcement in the Union Budget stating that 3,500 kilometres of national highways will be built in Tamil Nadu. The construction of the national highways at the cost of Rs. 1.03 lakh crore, which would include Madurai-Kollam and Chittoor-Thatchur, would boost economic growth in Tamil Nadu. In this regard, as assured by the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu, Mr. Edappadi Palaniswami, the Government would put in all the efforts to implement this project. While thanking the Centre for having approved the projects sent by the Government of Tamil Nadu to upgrade the fishing ports and for the establishment of seaweed park, I would further

request to give funds to Tamil Nadu to develop other small fishing ports in Tamil Nadu.

Sir, I was also the Surface Transport Minister in the Vajpayee Government when we had taken up so many projects in India. Connecting nationwide Golden Quadrilateral project was one of them. At that time, Vajpayee *ji* encouraged me to implement that project. I request the hon. Finance Minister now to take up one more project, which is connecting Coimbatore to Tiruchirappalli via Karur. Our hon. Finance Minister studied in Tiruchirappalli. She knows the importance of Tiruchirappalli and Coimbatore. Therefore, that corridor must be connected. That project has already been conceived by the National Highways Authority. We have been waiting for more than five years. Therefore, if you allocate the funds and take up the project, within two hours, we can go from Coimbatore to Tiruchirappalli. We can get that kind of a facility. I hope our hon. Finance Minister will consider this.

Coming to the metro rail project, as requested by the hon. Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu, I plead with the Central Government to immediately release 50 per cent share for expanding the second phase of the CMRL project. At the same time, I also request the Centre to accord approval for implementation of the new metro projects for the cities of Coimbatore and Madurai.

Sir, since she also presented the Rail Budget, I request her one more important project from Jolarpettai to Bengaluru via Krishnagiri. We have been waiting for this for a very long time. For 30-40 years, we have been fighting for that kind of a new railway line. I request the hon. Finance Minister, in consultation with the hon. Railway Minister, to take up this project connecting Jollarpettai-Bengaluru via Krishnagiri-Hosur because Hosur is a corridor now. Therefore, I request you to take up that kind of a project.

The Finance Minister announced a planned revamp of public transport system and allocated an amount of Rs. 18,000 crores to purchase 20,000 new buses. This is a welcome step. In Tamil Nadu, you will be very happy to know that the public transport facilities reach people at the power plant areas of the State. I request the Central Government to provide financial assistance to the Tamil Nadu State Transport Corporation.

I am thankful to the Union Government for making adequate financial allocation in the current Budget for scholarships for the students belonging to the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes. I am also thankful to you for having favourably considered the request of Tamil Nadu for schemes in higher education.

One very, very important thing that I want to say is this. The Government of Tamil Nadu headed by hon. Chief Minister Edappadi K. Palaniswami has already

waived the loans to the extent of about Rs.12,500 crore taken by the farmers from cooperative banks benefiting lakhs of farmers of Tamil Nadu. Similarly, I request the Central Government to waive the loans taken by the farmers from nationalised banks. It will be a great boon to the farmers who are hit hard by COVID pandemic and pushed to a low ebb.

Now I come to certain points which our hon. Finance Minister made in the Budget for 2021-22. The Budget rests on six pillars. She has said it very nicely. I appreciate that. First is, 'Health and Wellbeing'. Second is, 'Physical and Financial Capital and Infrastructure'. Third is, 'Inclusive Development for Aspirational India'. Fourth is, 'Reinvigorating Human Capital'. Fifth is, 'Innovation and Research and Development'. Sixth is, 'Minimum Government, Maximum Governance'. I differ with it. As you know, India is a developing country and it needs a lot of things. It is not like the United States where President Ronald Reagan in early 80s said about this concept of 'Minimum Government, Maximum Governance'. It won't suit us. It may be suitable for America. I can say that this concept of 'Minimum Government, Maximum Governance' is a borrowed concept. It won't suit Indian conditions. As you know very well, we cannot apply 'Minimum Government, Maximum Governance' blindly. We need 'Maximum Government' for poverty eradication, equality, social justice, transforming rural India, just to name a few, and the Central Government and the State Government must enable it rather than just regulate it. We have to think of poor people. The Government has come forward with many projects. Not just governance, the Government must come forward with many projects. You cannot close down the public sector immediately. That is what the Budget says. I differ with it.

I would like to quote Ramon Magsaysay, former President of the Philippines. He said, 'Those who have less in life should have more in the law.' How beautiful! In his memory, the Ramon Magsaysay Award, which is considered Asia's Nobel Prize, is given annually. We still have more than two-thirds of the poor people in the country. We are a developing country. We know about the sufferings of the people. We have to think of uplifting them. We have to think of their emancipation. And for that, we need 'Maximum Government'. The concept of 'Minimum Governance' will not help our country. We should constantly keep a watch so that 'social justice' is not compromised. It is important to remember that 'Minimum Government' is suffixed by 'Maximum Governance'. With India's level of per capita income, the Central Government and the State Governments cannot retreat together. The Government must, with enormous force, prevent exploitation of the majority of the poor by traditionally advantaged people. Ultimately, for the whole of India, the effect of

'Maximum Governance' comes from embracing 'cooperative and competitive federalism'. Unequal relationship between the Centre and the States will take us nowhere. Let us not forget that India is governed by States also.

Sir, most of the Members talked about MGNREGA. MGNREGA is very important. This project will give a lot of money flow to the rural areas. Poor will get money and the purchasing power will increase. There may be some kind of inefficiency also. I am not denying that. Because of that, we cannot neglect that project. You have to give more money. What does the Keynes theory say? It says that when you want to create demand, you have to pump more money. Then only, the purchasing power of the people will increase. And, your production will increase then. That is the economic theory; everybody knows that. Our Finance Minister is an economist. She has studied in Tiruchirappalli, JNU and London. She knows very well about the Indian economic conditions. She has to apply the theory that to create more employment, she has to spend a lot of money, especially for rural people.

Now, I come to MPLADS fund. I was Chairman of that Committee. Now, as Deputy Chairman of Rajya Sabha, you are the Chairman of MPLADS Committee. At that time, I was Deputy Speaker, Lok Sabha; so, I was Chairman of MPLADS Committee. Most of our MPs, irrespective of political parties, gave their signatures on a paper and demanded from our hon. Prime Minister to reconsider increasing the MPLADS fund, that instead of Rs.5 crore, it should be Rs.25 crore. Why am I saying this? MPLADS funds are not used by MPs. It is only for projects. In Tamil Nadu, for example, each MLA is getting Rs.5 crore from MLA funds. In Kerala, they are getting Rs.13 crore. It is for projects, earmarked projects; the Central Government which projects are there or are going to be implemented. Let MPs also play a role. MPs cannot come every day, sit here and make legislation. Those days have gone. We are in public life as MPs and we have to meet the public. They are asking for so many things to be done. Elections happen at different places and different times. There are Lok Sabha elections, State Assembly elections and local body elections. Whenever you go there, people ask what we have done. They are asking what we have done.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude, Dr. Thambidurai.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI: Sir, now, you are Chairman of MPLADS Committee. You may know that you are going to face the same problem. Our MPs are going to make the same demand. So, I request the hon. Finance Minister and the hon. Prime Minister to have a rethink over it. Don't give the money to us. You start these



projects. The Central Government is spending money. You are marking projects. MPs are recommending projects for roads, school buildings, water facilities, etc. Let them earmark so that this fund can be used. We would like that it is not given to MPs straightaway to sanction certain things. Anyhow, you are going to implement the projects.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude now.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI: Sir, I am concluding. Our Finance Minister hails from Tamil Nadu, like R.K. Shanmukham Chetty, who presented the first Budget in Parliament. Now, it is women's empowerment. After Shrimati Indira Gandhi, she is the first lady who has come from Tamil Nadu and presented the Budget many times. She knows about the household needs of a woman. I will not elaborate. I request once again to consider MGNREGA programme. Therefore, I appreciate.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you now.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI: Sir, I am concluding.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your time is over. I am calling the next speaker.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI: Sir, for the initiatives taken in the current Budget, once again, I thank the Finance Minister. Thank you.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Sujeet Kumar; you have ten minutes.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR (Odisha): Sir, it is indeed a great honour for a new Member like me to speak on a very important topic like Budget and for this, I thank you. I also profusely thank my leader, Shri Naveen Patnaik, for this opportunity.

Sir, at the outset, I would like to convey the message of the hon. Chief Minister of Odisha, who has appreciated the growth focus of this Budget. I quote him, "The Union Budget 2021-22 speaks of a medium to long term vision for self-reliant India, which is good for the country. The Union Government has presented the Budget 2021-22 in digital form for the first time. We welcome the green initiative as we have already switched over to digital mode of presentation of the Odisha Budget from last year itself." Sir, increased capital expenditure for improving the physical infrastructure in our country, higher priority to health and drinking water, higher allocation under

National Livelihood Mission, steps to boost the startup eco-system of the country, etc. are some of the very laudable and praiseworthy initiatives in this Budget which will definitely help India march towards prosperity. There are many more but I am limiting myself because of paucity of time. However, my Chief Minister has also flagged the inadequate support provided to Odisha in this Budget and I would like to share some of the concerns and disappointment of Odisha and its people.

Before I do that, I would like to highlight a small concern regarding very marginal hike in the Defence Budget. At Rs.4.78 lakh crore, the total Defence Budget Estimates, B.E. for F.Y.2021-22 is only 1.4 per cent higher over last year's Rs.4.71 lakh crore. While we face two hostile nations, Pakistan and China, Pakistan has increased its recent 2020-21 Defence Budget with 5 per cent hike in comparison to 2019-20 and China has increased its 2020-21 Defence Budget by 6.6 per cent compared to 2019-20. Defence accounted for 15.5 per cent of India's Budget Estimates last year but this year, it is only 13.9 per cent. Even as a percentage of GDP, it is quite low at only 2 per cent while Pakistan spends 3.9 per cent of its GDP on defence and, again, it is largely India-focused. China's Defence Budget in 2020 was declared as 179 billion US dollars which is three times than ours in absolute numbers. Independent sources like Stockholm Peace Research Institute put this number even higher at 240 billion US dollars which is four times our Defence Budget. Hon. Defence Minister, Raj Nath Singhji also spoke this morning about the behaviour of China which we know is very aggressive, expansionist and hostile. It is trying to bully us. I am aware that a large allocation to Defence would minimize investment in social sector. This is a tricky balance to achieve between the gun and the bullet, between the missiles and the mid-day meals. I am sure that while increasing the Defence Budget only modestly, the Government has adequately applied its mind and thought it through well enough. I just wanted to flag it, as the regional party, Biju Janata Dal and our hon. Party President, Shri Naveen Patnaik, have always stood with successive Governments in matters of national security, unity and integrity of our country.

Sir, I now share my concern about the reduced allocation for the education sector because it is an area which is of extreme interest and passion to me. Hon. Member Manoj Kumar Jha ji also flagged it off. We all know how Covid pandemic has severely affected and challenged the education ecosystem of our country because schools and colleges were closed for more than a year or have been closed for almost a year. There is a real risk of increase in school dropout, particularly, in rural India. Gap between children with access to digital learning aids and those without online learning opportunities cannot be starker. In this context, it is very surprising and

saddening to note that education allocation has been decreased in this Budget. Is it not ironical, especially, in a year when the new education policy, NEP, is to be rolled out? Let me quote a few lines from the NEP itself. "The aim must be for India to have an education system by 2040 that is second-to-none with equitable access to the highest-quality education for all learners regardless of their socio-economic background." It is a very lofty goal but does it match with the allocation? The Kothari Commission in 1964 had recommended allocation of 6 per cent of GDP on education. It has never happened so far. In this very first year of NEP and in the post-COVID scenario, the Education Budget has been reduced by 6 per cent over the last year. Sir, I feel the journey to 2040 has started with a fractured leg and I am afraid instead of galloping to 2040 we would all limp there. The saddest part is that out of Rs.6,000 odd crore of reduction over last year in education, Rs.5,000 crores have been deducted towards school education. And we all know, school education is the foundation of the education system. In fact, it is the foundation of a nation. What message are we giving? Does it not give the wrong signal that the Government is not serious about education and not serious about the implementation of NEP?

Sir, now, let me come to my home State Odisha. My Chief Minister has, time and again, raised issues of negligence with the past and present Central Governments, in areas of tele-density, banking, highways, coal royalty, drinking water and irrigation and cutting off funds for scheduled areas like the KBK Scheme. The funds meant for repair and renewal of national highways are routinely delayed. Sir, because of the paucity of time, I will not have the opportunity to dwell into all these areas, so, I restrict myself to just one aspect, that is, Railways. I would like to place some facts. There are six districts in Odisha with no Railways and it is not even a hilly State. It is not even a hilly terrain. In the last seven years, only one additional district of Odisha has got railway connectivity. In the last 7 years, Odisha has got only one new railway line. East Coast Railway does 70 per cent of its loading and unloading in Odisha making it one of the most profitable railway zones in the country. Odisha generates annually Rs. 20,000 crore for Indian Railways; yet the rail density in Odisha is only 15, when the national average is 19 and our neighbouring State of West Bengal has a rail density of 44. We do not grumble our neighbours having a better Railway density, indeed we are happy for them; but should we not also be given fair treatment?

The Odisha Government had requested for Rs. 7,200 crore in this year's Budget for Railways with a detailed analysis, break-up & justification; but we got only Rs. 5,528 crores. ...(Interruptions)... I could go on and on but I am constrained by time. So, all I will say is, I request the Government that there is an urgent need for

expanding rail network in the State to improve our rail density. The Government of Odisha is committed to extend all help to the Railway Ministry for implementation of Railway projects in the State, including filling the viability gap, offering free land, forming Special Purpose Vehicles (SPVs), if required, and so on.

Sir, now, I would like to talk about my favourite place on earth- a place called Kalahandi because it is my home district and I hail from Kalahandi. Many hon. Members here may have heard of Kalahandi. Let me take you to pre-2000. Kalahandi had shaken the nation's conscience because of absolute poverty, famine, starvation, inaccessibility and some of the worst socio- economic indicators in the country.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude now.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, give me two-three minutes more.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Not three minutes, but just one minute more.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, you had said I have ten minutes.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Only one minute.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, it has become infamous as the hunger capital of India. People compared Kalahandi with sub-Saharan Africa and the term 'Kalahandi Syndrome' was made popular in developmental studies. It was called the "BhokaraBhogala", meaning 'The Geography of Hunger'.

Sir, come Year 2021, you will be very happy to note that today Kalahandi has emerged as a remarkable development success story. The other day, hon. Member, Shri Rakesh Sinha, was mentioning about Kalahandi. I am not sure, if he has been there but, through you, I urge and invite all hon. Members to visit Kalahandi and see for yourself...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude now. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, give me one minute.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, time is over. ...(*Interruptions*)... I have already given you one minute.

**श्री सुजीत कुमार :** सर, 10 मिनट नहीं हुए।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, why I am talking about Kalahandi in this Budget discussion is because of two reasons. It is because the world must and, particularly, our nation must know about this Kalahandi model of Development; this amazing transformational story of last 20 years; and because how despite this remarkable journey, we are still not getting our due; instead of acknowledging our success and rewarding us, we have to struggle and fight for increased budgetary support.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Sujeetji. Thank you.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, I need thirty seconds more.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Sujeetji.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, we, the people of Kalahandi, and the wider KBK Region, of which Kalahandi is a part -- Kalahandi, Bolangir and Koraput are a cluster of 8 districts in western and southern Odisha -- are not stupid and are not lazy. We have been deprived of opportunities by successive Governments both Central and State.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Sujeetji.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Now, Sir, when we are trying to increase our infrastructure, we are not getting adequate support from the Central Government.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Sujeetji. I will be calling the next speaker.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, last line, before I conclude. The hon. Finance Minister herself mentioned "Inclusive Development for Aspirational India" as one of the 6 pillars of the Union Budget. Thank you, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you. I am calling the next speaker. Shri T.K.S. Elangovan.

SHRI T.K.S. ELANGO VAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I thank you for allowing me to speak on the Budget. I can understand the plight of any Finance Minister that during Covid time and the world's economic scenario, presenting the Budget is not an easy thing. She has tried to present a Budget which will do good to the nation. But I do not know whether this will bear fruit because there is a contradiction in the Government among the Ministers, among the Ministries. Yesterday, a Minister while talking about ports, he was telling that this Government could not give pension to the employees. So this Government has many difficulties. With these difficulties, I do not know how a Budget is going to help the people. The frontline workers of this country, the doctors, the nurses, have done a tremendous job during this pandemic and I join the hon. Finance Minister in praising their work because they even laid down their lives to save the citizens of India. But who are the most affected because of this pandemic? This Government has not cared about them. They are the daily wagers, who constitute about more than 60 per cent of our population. They are the most affected. What the Central Government, State Governments, individuals, MPs, political parties, could do is that they could feed them. They could give them rice, they could give them something to eat for a day. Eating is not the whole life. They need education. Their children have to be educated. They should be given healthcare. There are many things. What did the Government do? Even in this Budget, these daily wagers were not cared for, there is no programme at all in this Budget to take care of the daily wagers who had been suffering for the last one-and-a-half year and who will still continue to suffer. They constitute 60 per cent-plus population. The Budget should address the country's population. My dear colleague, Dr. Thambidurai, also spoke about minimum Government and maximum governance. He failed to tell one thing which I wanted to add, that is, minimum Government by the elected Government, maximum governance by the rich people of this country. He has not added that. That is the USA model. An eagle can fly high because it is an eagle. A peacock can only dance on its feet, which looks nice. We are the peacock and they are the eagle. Don't think that the eagle is flying high and so we must also fly high. This country needs care. The people of this country need care. The USA has an area that is three times that of India with a population of one-third of that of India. So in this condition, what the Government should do is to take care of the people of our country. Minimum Government and maximum governance: Who governs or by whom is the maximum governance? This is the question. For everything, the Government says, "We cannot do." One Minister says that this is not their duty; to run petroleum companies is not their duty. The other Minister says that insurance is not their duty. It was our duty. Without all these things, India would have gone elsewhere; India

would not have been a country like this. The Government protects its people. You are selling most of the things today, which were created 50-60 years back during the Congress Government. They created wealth by which this Government is gaining. The Budget will not deliver what the Government expects because the Government's attitude is different from what is present in this Budget. Sir, there are a few things which I wanted to point out; the increase in electronic gadgets. Hon. Prime Minister's slogan is 'Make in India'. There are companies coming from outside and most of the companies are electronic companies. There are certain products which have to come from outside.

## **2.00 P.M.**

If they have to pay more customs duty, the cost will be more. In China, the product costs very less. And, if in India, the product costs more, these companies will once again go out of India. So, you cannot achieve 'Make in India'. Secondly, about green energy, the Prime Minister's assurance is that by 2022, there will be the 120 gigawatts of green energy. But, you have increased tax, customs duty on solar panel, solar inverters, etc., which means by 2022, we cannot achieve that 120 gigawatts of green energy, solar energy or hydel energy. You cannot achieve that. So, what the Finance Minister says is not agreeable to even to the other Ministers and other Departments. There is no coordination amongst various Ministries in the Government. That is the problem here. Now, regarding air pollution, already the amount allocated for air pollution has decreased. This is one area where we have to take steps. We are keeping social distancing and all. Most of the hospital wastes; they are putting in the dustbins on the streets. There is no proper system of disposal of hospital wastes. The Environment Ministry had certain rules as to how to dispose of hospital wastes. But, hospitals are not following that. They are just throwing it in the dustbins which are bound to spread diseases. The Government should take steps to ensure that something is done in respect of disposal of hospital wastes. Last year, the National Sample Survey Organization had stated that domestic consumption has come down. The National Sample Survey Organisation is the Government Agency. They have stated that the domestic consumption has come down. Now, for MGNREGA, you have reduced the expenditure by around Rs.50,000 crores. Why has the allocation been reduced? What happens then? The domestic consumption will further go down. How will it help the people? Daily wagers are suffering. And, this will increase the suffering of the large number of daily wagers who are already suffering. The reduction in MGNREGA allocation will further increase the suffering of

the daily wagers. What is the use in giving money to the rich when the people could not purchase? Their purchasing capacity has come down. So, there is still a misunderstanding between this Ministry and that Ministry. Your plan should be targeted towards all people, not a few. Your plan should be targeted towards suffering people who have no money. You must help them. You must provide them employment or they should somehow be made to live comfortably. There are certain things which I think are just a make-up, like applying powder and all. This is the 75<sup>th</sup> year of Independence. And, we are helping the pensioners, people who are aged above 75 years, that they need not file return. Those who are getting pension and interest alone, need not file returns. But, the tax will be deducted by the bank itself. If there is a concession in tax rates, that is a help. That will make them celebrate. Already, there is a scheme for faceless filing of IT returns. Now, you say that they need not come to the IT office and file their returns.

There are two or three things which I wanted to list out. One is their Five Year Plans. Around Rs.64,000 crores has been allocated for PM Atmanirbhar Swasth Bharat Yojana. It is just to show that this Government is spending more on people. Likewise two or three things which I had seen. So, this Budget itself is to show that this Government is doing a lot to the people, but, ultimately, it does not do anything to the people. It is not helping the people at all.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude now; your time is over.

SHRI T.K.S. ELANGO VAN: I am completing, Sir. Minimum Governance by the elected people, people on whom the people of India had faith and elected them to the Government; maximum Governance by the people who are ruling them, who are the rich, who are affable, who can purchase anything; not by the representatives of the people. Sir, with these words, I conclude.

**श्री उपसभापति:** श्रीमती झरना दास बैद्य। आप बैठकर बोलें, आपकी आवाज़ आएगी। आपके पास बोलने के लिए तीन मिनट का समय है।

SHRIMATI JHARNA DAS BAIDYA (Tripura): Sir, the economy in India is in dire straits. I do agree with the opinion expressed by hon. Members that the Budget is a total failure in addressing the present economic crisis. Hon. Minister is giving more concessions to the rich. But, at the same time, you are not taking any step to enhance the purchasing power of the common people. The Budget reflects



intensification of neo-liberal policies and exploitation. It is a direct attack on the basic rights of women, and reflects the conservative and anti-women attitude.

The Budget has been formulated in the context of the worsening hunger and malnutrition which is reflected in the fall in ratings of India on the Global Hunger Index. Workers like Anganwadi, ASHA and Mid-Day Meal workers are the grass root level workers delivering the essential services to the people.

The Budget which was full of rhetoric about the 'Atmanirbhar Bharat' and the \$5 trillion economy has cut down the budget allocation for the Mid-Day Meal scheme by Rs.1,400 crores.

The allocation for MNREGA is reduced by 41 per cent from the last year's revised estimates. There is only a nominal increase in the allocation for National Health Mission.

Sir, considering the unemployment scenario in rural India....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude, Madam; please conclude; your time is over. Please conclude in one minute.

SHRIMATI JHARNA DAS BAIDYA: Yes, Sir. In order to strengthen the situation of the people of State, it is humbly requested to provide extra budget to Tripura Tribal Areas Autonomous District Council (TTAADC) so that State will witness maximum development throughout and to introduce special schemes to Tripura State tea workers, as there are 48 Tea Gardens in Tripura.

Altogether, there is no increase in other welfare schemes in the Budget. Their only objective is to help the corporates.

To sum up, this Budget clearly upholds the interests of the market. It has no place for women. It is once again a blatant attack on the poor and the oppressed. This is a budget to appease the rich accentuating the problems of unemployment and rising inequality.

SHRI ANIL DESAI (Maharashtra): Sir, the people of India had great hopes on the hon. Finance Minister, Shrimati Nirmala Sitharaman, when she presented the Union Budget for the year 2021-22. Sir, to put India back on a recovery path following a deep recession induced by COVID-19 and the consequent lockdowns, the Budget this year had to be one 'like never before' as was promised by the hon. Finance Minister. But the Budget has belied the expectations of the people of India. The Budget was presented in a new format with six pillars to create an Atamanirbhar Bharat. Huge outlay of expenditure has been made under these six pillars. Sir, my

State of Maharashtra was the worst hit State and Mumbai had the highest number of COVID afflicted cases as the pandemic had attacked India. But the way and with the deft hands, the hon. Chief Minister, Udhav Thakareji, handled the situation and controlled the pandemic from spreading further, it has been acclaimed by the WHO and Washington Post also took note of it and later on the surveys which were conducted all over the country, my Chief Minister happened to figure in the first five Chief Ministers of the country. Sir, now Rs.35,000 crores have been provided in this Budget for COVID-19 vaccine. It is expected by the States that they will be provided COVID-19 vaccine free of cost by the Central Government as most of the States are cash strapped due to the onslaught of pandemic. I hope the Finance Minister assures the House on this count in her reply. Under the head financial capital, all out support for the development of world class Fin-Tech hub at GIFT -IFSC has been declared under this Budget. Sir, initially Mumbai was declared and is still an international financial services centre as Mumbai is financial capital of the country and also globally known as India's financial centre. With great regret, I would mention here that it looks like with an objective to sideline Mumbai and deprive its pride of place, the Government seems to have accelerated the pace of developing IFSC at Ahmedabad which is reflected in this Budget. Further, the push to create new infrastructure is appreciable but certainly not at the cost of doing away with the national assets, that is, by selling or privatising profit-making public sector companies. It's shocking that the monetisation project included sale of valuable land held by public sector companies. The increase in FDI in insurance from 49 per cent to 74 per cent is highly objectionable. It is as good as handing over the profit-making insurance sector to foreign players and corporates. This step has resulted into a widespread anger and resentment among the insurance employees.

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA) *in the Chair.*]

I would urge upon the Government to review this decision in the interest of insurance industry and the people of India. Sir, disinvestment and strategic sale of BPCL, Air India, Shipping Corporation of India, Container Corporation of India, BEML and Pawan Hans, need to be reviewed by the Government. Similarly, the proposal to privatise two public sector banks and one general insurance company, should be scrapped as these are profit making national assets which also create job opportunities to the unemployed youth. The LIC is the richest corporation which has profit base and serves the interest of crores of Indian policy holders. It has been playing key role in the financial market and also pays handsome annual dividend to

the Government of India. The proposal to bring IPO in LIC would be an unwelcome step as it would lose its glory to the utter disappointment of lakhs of Indians. Sir, under inclusive development for aspirational India, agriculture credit target has been enhanced to 16.5 lakh crores, but this huge outlay is far from satisfying the expectation of farmers. All that the farmer needs is inclusion of MSP in the farm laws and not oral assurance. Farmers have been demanding the MSP based on Swaminathan Commission's formula of C2 plus 50 per cent. But ensuring 1.5 times the cost of production on crops will not help in addressing farmers' plight as it does not provide a remunerative price. Farmers demand that the farm laws enacted by the Government be withdrawn and they are given opportunity for hearing. I hope the Prime Minister would give them the opportunity and resolve their contentious issues as more than 75 days have gone and the farming community is agitating at the borders of Delhi. Sir, Rs.300 crores have been provided to the Government of Goa for Diamond Jubilee Celebrations of the State's liberation from Portuguese. Sir, my State of Maharashtra has just celebrated its Diamond Jubilee in 2020. So, why Maharashtra was dropped? Sir, during COVID pandemic, hon. Prime Minister had declared Rs.20,000 crore package to overcome the depressive situation in the country and revive the economy by creating jobs and giving thrust to MSMEs. But nothing seemed to have worked on the ground. There is no mention about this in the Budget. What evolved out of this package? Still the demand is sluggish; though banks and financial institutions are flushed with money, there is no credit off take. Unemployment is rampant due to non-availability of jobs. Under the situation, the Government should put money in the hands of the people to create demand and thus revive the economy. The falling Rupee and ever-rising fuel prices have broken the backbone of the common man. The Government needs to take immediate corrective steps in this direction.

Sir, in the entire Budget, hardly anything substantial is being budgeted for my State of Maharashtra. It is with great regret that I would state that Mumbai, the financial capital of India, contributes maximum to the exchequer by way of taxes and, in return, Mumbai hardly gets anything. Moreover, the rightful dues of GST, amounting to around Rs.25,000 crores have also remained in arrears. It was expected that Maharashtra will be provided substantially but nothing has come our way. But, the States which are going for elections have been provided liberally with an eye on elections. Sir, spirit of cooperative federalism should be reflected in the Budget, in a better way in times to come. Thank you.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL(Punjab): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I rise to oppose the Budget. But, at the same time, as a chartered accountant, I commend the Finance Minister for being very transparent. I have been in this House for 14 years and, for the first time at least, the figures are honest. However, Sir, the problem is with the fiscal deficit. The pandemic played havoc with our economy. We have a huge fiscal deficit this year and next year. My worry is that with this huge fiscal deficit, the prices will go out of hand. There will be a huge inflation. We saw once before, after the Lehman crisis that when the Government relaxed the fiscal policies how prices went up, especially food prices. This is going to be a double whammy for the poor person of the country who has also lost his job.

Sir, I would like to say that this Government talks always of cooperative federalism. But, at the same time, if you see, in all the States which are going to the polls, lakhs of crores of rupees are planned to be spent except the State of Punjab, perhaps because, I feel, they will not get any seat there. But, I think, it is extremely unfair.

Sir, the Finance Minister gave the figures of how much procurement has been done, how the figures have gone up two times and three times. I commend this Government for that and it is a fact that the MSP was raised, direct benefits to kisans have been given, soil cards were given and insurance has been improved. But, then the question arises as to why our farmers are on the street. Why are our farmers committing suicide? Why are our farmers in debt? I think, this Government needs to look at that issue because the main reason is that this Government is not thinking out of the box. Sir, this is the Council of States. I talk of my State, the State of Punjab. My farmer is on the street because he feels that the market is going to be snatched away from him.

For that, one will have to go into the history, a little bit. The State of Punjab included Haryana at that time. It came to the country's rescue when we were begging for food from America under PL-480, etc. As a result, when the window opens, both for wheat and paddy, FCI would procure everything that the farmer had to offer. So, the farmer had a market at his doorstep. Sir, the Prime Minister himself said that 80 per cent of our farmers have less than one hectare of land. These farmers have a market at the doorstep today. That is why they are stuck in this wheat and rice cycle. They can take the production risk but they can't take the marketing risk. Now they fear that with the opening up of these three black laws, private sector will come in. They will have to go to the private *mandis* with their surplus stock and they will not get MSP. The Prime Minister said yesterday, both in the Lok Sabha and before that in this House, "MSP was there, MSP will be there, MSP is there." But who is procuring

at MSP? It is only the State agencies. The private sector is not procuring at MSP, and that is what the farmer says. He wants MSP is to be enshrined in the law. You do that and the farmer will go back tomorrow morning, but you are reluctant to do that. Now, the question arises as to what you are going to do to create a market at the doorstep of the farmers. The Prime Minister said, 'Look at the milk farmer. He is doing so well.' Yesterday he said strawberry farmers are doing so well. Look at Gujarat. The milk farmer is doing well because he has a market at his doorstep. Whatever he produces, the next day Amul picks it up, Mother Dairy picks it up, some private cooperatives will pick it up. Our farmers lack that and that is why they are stuck, -- I would, at least, speak for Punjab and Haryana -- in the wheat-rice cycle. Now, this Government has now said, and, I commend them that Rs. 20,000 crores will be given to create a new institution which will fund long term infra. It is required because short term funds were being used for financing long term requirements or infrastructure projects. But why could they not think of something for the farm sector on similar lines? Why should a banking institution be created which will fund these cooperatives, the food processing plants and such things? This is to ensure that the farmer finds a market at his doorstep, and till such time you that provide a market at the doorstep, please do not take away what they already have. Sir, in an answer to my question in this House, the Minister had said, Rs. 90,000 crores of fruits and vegetables are wasted post-harvest. Why? It is because there is no market at their doorstep. You can tell a farmer, 'please grow strawberries', but if the strawberries are going to rot on his farm, what does he do with them? He needs to live and I have...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please conclude.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: Sir, give me five minutes at least. I have just spoken for three minutes.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): You are going to speak for another one or two minutes.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: Why can't they create a wheat board, why can't they create a rice board, why can't they create a vegetable board and why can't they create a fruit board. Sir, I want to say one more thing and I will end. Give me 2-3 minutes. One is, Defence expenditure has gone up, which is good. We are faced with serious threat, but buying most modern aircraft or guns is not enough. You have to ensure

that your soldiers are motivated, that their morale is high. And the way their spokespersons are abusing the farmers whose children are on the borders, demotivates them. I don't know what they are trying to do. Sometimes they are called anti-nationals, sometimes they are called *Khalistanis*, sometimes they are called terrorists. I hope it will percolate down and all their spokespersons will now stop this nonsense which has been going on for so long. Sir, one more thing I would like to say. Please do not use force with these farmers who are agitating. ... (Interruptions) ... I have just one minute. Please don't interrupt. ... (Interruptions) ... Sir, then you must give me extra time if they are going to interrupt.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please carry on. Your time is already over.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: Sir, I have one thing to say that *lathis*, water cannons, barbed fences are not going to do anything because those farmers are inspired by our Gurus. They are inspired by Shaheed Bhagat Singh and today every farmer is saying,

*"सरफ़रोशी की तमन्ना अब हमारे दिल में है,  
देखना है ज़ोर कितना बाज़ु-ए-कातिल में है।"*

And I can tell you, Sir, these farmers will only go home when they can go home and say, फ़तह, फ़तह, फ़तह। They will not go home otherwise and I am telling you, either you withdraw these black laws or you provide them MSP for everything that they produce. Thank you very much.

SHRI KANAKAMEDALA RAVINDRA KUMAR (Andhra Pradesh): Hon. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I am very delighted for the opportunity given to me to take part in the discussion.

Sir, this Budget has not provided any hope to 5 crore people of the State of Andhra Pradesh. No allocations in the Budget in order to implement the provisions of the Andhra Pradesh Reorganisation Act, 2014.

Till now territorial jurisdiction of Vizag South Coast Railway Zone has not been specified, no funds have been allocated and no revenue deficit relief given. The Centre needs to generously support Andhra Pradesh which has been suffering due to bifurcation of the State.

The proposal of the Central Government to privatize Visakhapatnam Steel Plant leads to an uproar in the State of Andhra Pradesh. The Visakhapatnam Steel Plant is

now worth about Rs. 2 lakh crores. The steel plant bagged the National Energy Leader Award and Excellent Energy Efficient Unit Award consecutively till 2020. It is going to generate employment opportunities to one lakh people. The interesting development is that POSCO has evinced interest to set up a steel plant in Visakhapatnam in RINL lands. A joint team of RINL and POSCO visited the RINL, Visakhapatnam, and participated in a meeting with their representative. Subsequently, the officials visited on 09-07-2019 and 20-02-2020 in connection with setting up the plant. In the same connection, they met the hon. Chief Minister of Andhra Pradesh. But, till now, this issue has been kept in dark. I don't know why the people of Andhra Pradesh were not informed about this for the reasons best known to them. It appears that the Government initiated the process much earlier. Now, the State Government is also shedding crocodile tears about the proposal. This has come to light vide reply given to an Unstarred Question No. 1109 raised by one of my colleagues belonging to the Ruling Party. It created further doubts. However, we request the hon. Minister to drop the proposal of disinvestment.

It is reported that the hon. Chief Minister, Andhra Pradesh, has visited Delhi and requested the hon. Prime Minister and hon. Home Minister for funds and resolving bifurcation issues. It yielded no fruits. We do not know whether the Delhi trips of our hon. Chief Minister are for that purpose or any other known purposes since there is no reflection in the Budget.

SHRI AYODHYA RAMI REDDY(Andhra Pradesh): Please don't mention the hon. Chief Minister. It is not a fact. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI KANAKAMEDALA RAVINDRA KUMAR: But the fact remains. After June, 2019, in Andhra Pradesh, about 140 temples were attacked. \* still are going on. An hon. Member from YSRCP in his speech earlier referred to our TDP and made allegations against us. In fact, no action on Antarvedi burning of chariot has been taken. Recently, Lord Ram was attacked in Ramateertham Temple. Instead of taking action against culprits, the State Government registered false cases against the opposition TDP leaders and made a statement that BJP is also involved in it. There is no proper investigation. The State itself is encouraging these types of attacks. However, we demand a CBI probe into these attacks. There is a total lawlessness in the State. Political victimization is going on. The Government machinery and police is being misused and abused by the present State Government.

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Sir, the present party came to power in Andhra Pradesh by campaigning and made a request to the people of Andhra Pradesh to give 25 MPs so that he will get Special Category Status. Though they have given 22 seats, nothing has happened so far for the reasons known to the public. But, the State of Andhra Pradesh is not even turning a single stone for upliftment of the State. All the canons of democracy are flouted. Sir, even the print and electronic media is not spared! Media has also become victim in the State of Andhra Pradesh!

For construction of Amaravati, which is the Capital of new born State, no funds have been allocated. Sir, the hon. Prime Minister laid the foundation-stone and granted Rs. 1,500 crores. Already Rs. 10,000 crores have been invested. The construction was abruptly stopped by the present Government. Assembly, Secretariat, High Court and other respective institutions have also been functioning there for the last several years. The present Government of Andhra Pradesh has decided to create three capitals, contrary to the provisions of the Andhra Pradesh Reorganisation Act.

The present hon. Chief Minister made a statement in the Assembly earlier that he will support Amaravati and now contrary to that he has taken a decision. The farmers of Amaravati have been agitating for the last 422 days. The decision of the present Government is contrary to the provisions of the Andhra Pradesh Reorganisation Act.

Sir, Polavaram Project expenditure is estimated at Rs. 55,548 crores. But, no funds have been allocated. For getting funds, the present Government did not take any steps. The expenditure on Polavaram Project is estimated at Rs. 55,548 crores. But, no funds have been allocated. The present State Government did not take any steps to get the funds. It was no surprise to me, being aware of the manner in which the YSRCP and the Government of AP have been attacking the constitutional institutions, like, the Legislative Council, the State Election Commission, the High Court, etc. All canons of democracy are being brazenly flouted. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please conclude.

SHRI KANAKMEDALA RAVINDRA KUMAR: The State Government is filing false cases to suppress the dissent. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Central Government should immediately intervene in the present state of Andhra Pradesh where the situation is very alarming; lawlessness is rampant everywhere; false cases are being filed against the critics; political opponents are being suppressed. I request the hon. Minister and the Central Government to allocate funds in order to fulfill the demands of Andhra



Pradesh Reorganization Act. I request the Central Government to immediately take special steps in order to protect and save the people of Andhra Pradesh from the oppressive and suppressive acts of the State Government. Thank you, Sir.

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL (Rajasthan): Thank you, Mr. Vice-Chairman Sir, for having given me this opportunity to speak here. As we all know, we are discussing this year's Budget in an extraordinary situation. On one side, there has been COVID Pandemic and its impact; on the other, our *anna data* are in a historical fight against the anti-farmer laws passed by the Central Government. They are on the streets for the last seventy-five days even in extremely cold weather. Around seventy farmers have lost their lives during this agitation. I salute their uncompromising historic struggle to save the present and future. I extend my solidarity with their peaceful and non-violent struggle. I pay my homage to our *kisan* brothers who lost their lives during this agitation.

Coming to the Budget, many of my colleagues have already made their points. Unemployment is today a burning issue. We are remembering the words of our hon. Prime Minister. He had promised creation of two crore jobs every year. But, today, he is totally silent on the rising unemployment in our country. According to the Centre for Monitoring Indian Economy (CMIE), about 21 million salaried people lost their jobs from April to August, 2020. There were 86 million salaried jobs in Indian during the year 2019-20. But, in August 2020, this figure drastically went down to 65 million. Rural unemployment too remains at a worrying level of 9.15 per cent, in December 2020, as per the CMIE.

As per the information provided by the Ministry of Tourism to the Standing Committee, the pandemic led to revenue loss of around rupees one lakh crore in the tourism industry alone. There was also a loss of 225 crore jobs in the tourism sector. What is the way forward to address this concern? How are we going to compensate in this issue of unemployment? The banks are also now very reluctant to give loans to the tourism sector. This was informed by the Secretary (Tourism) in the Standing Committee. Even in the measures, which the Government has announced in the Budget to meet these extraordinary challenges, there is nothing to revive the sector or to generate more revenue. The youth is asking where the jobs are. In the Budget Speech, or, in the Budget documents, there is no roadmap to generate more employment opportunities. The Budget is totally silent on creating employment opportunities.

Coming to *per capita* income, now, we are behind even to Bangladesh in terms of *per capita* income. The SBI Ecowrap, June 23, 2020, has projected that *per*

*capita* income in India will fall in a severe manner post Covid. It is estimated that the *per capita* income will decline by 5.4 per cent in Financial Year, 2020-21, to Rs.1.43 lakh. The Economic Survey itself has pointed out that the GDP registered a shocking 23.9 percentage collapse between April-June, 2020, the first contraction in 50 years. The daily wage earners, street vendors, migrant labourers and unorganized workers are still in an unexplainable crisis. What roadmap is this Government providing to them? As you all know, this type of extraordinary situation needs extraordinary measures. The people in this country had a great hope and expectation from the first Budget after the Covid-19 pandemic outbreak. They were eagerly waiting to get relief to revive their livelihood, business, and their economic activities. It is very sad to state that the Budget unfortunately failed to give confidence to the people of this country. It is not the effect of pandemic alone! Before the Covid, the GDP projection for 2020-21 was already bad. The pandemic has only deepened the pre-existing economic crisis. The GDP growth has already hit a 11 year low in 2019-20. Even, now, the Government is arguing that the economy is on V-shape recovery. But how that recovery is possible is not answered in the Budget. Curiously, one mantra is behind you, which we are all seeing, and that *mantra* is privatisation. The Budget has included every measure to sell out our public enterprises. Disinvestment is the only source of income as far as this Government is concerned. Earlier, it was the airports, now it is the shipping sector, and again, it is the insurance sector. Every sector is being sold out for the benefit of a handful crony, capitalist friends. The Government has already sold airports. Now, the Airports Authority of India has become the Airports Authority of Adani. Now, the Shipping Corporation of India is also going in the same way. Yes! everything is going in the same way. And the buyers are two, three persons only! That is, India is now under him.

Sir, MSME is the major sector for reviving our economy. It is the backbone of our economy. The number of MSME employees is about 12 crore. It is responsible for about 48 percentage exports. What is happening in the MSME sector, already, Chidambaramji has pointed out. That has totally collapsed. About 35 percentage of the MSME sector have shut down. It has totally collapsed. What is the roadmap for reviving the MSME, which is a major area for providing jobs? You did not have any vision and you did not have any programme. Then, how can you revive the MSME sector? The Government offered credit access, ignoring the MSME sector's demand for a stimulus to address working capital requirements. Everybody pointed out MNREGA. The only hope for crores of Indian households was the Rural Employment Scheme. Even though the hon. Prime Minister in the other House has called it as a monumental corruption of the UPA Government, everybody is now

saying that it is the only one scheme which is providing jobs in the rural sector. But what is happening now? As per the records, nearly 120 million people have asked for jobs under the Scheme during this financial year. The total work demanded under MNREGA in 2020-21 is 53 percentage higher than that of the last year. Nearly 35 million people have requested MNREGA work in the months of December and January, 2020. This is a clear sign that there is a high demand for jobs in the rural sector. In spite of the demand from the people and suggestion from experts, MNREGA allocation for 2021-22 did not cross Rs.1,00,000 crore mark and stands at Rs.73,000 crores only. This is a 34.5 percentage reduction from 2020-21. From this reduced amount, it is clear how the Government is going to revive unemployment in the rural sector. We have discussed migrant labourers' issues many times. We saw their plight. Poor migrant workers died while walking to their homes. It is also a concern that there is no immediate relief to the migrant labourers and unorganized sector in the Budget. The enrolment of 25 crore workers in the proposed portal will take, at least, five years which is announced in the Budget. What are the immediate measures that the Government has taken? Nothing is there.

Now, I come to the petroleum prices. That is also discussed here. Yesterday, the hon. Minister has given a reply to my supplementary question. Actually, with utmost respect, I am trying to say that this is totally a misleading statement. With all my respect, I would like to say that the hon. Minister was misleading this House. Let me give some details in this regard. In May, 2014, at the end of the UPA-2 Government term, the petrol price in Delhi was about Rs. 71 per litre and the global crude oil price average was US dollar 101.10. Today, the crude oil price is at 58 US dollar and petrol price in Delhi is at Rs. 87.30. How is it happening like this? On April 21, 2020, the crude oil price fell to its lowest level since 1999. It was the lowest price in 21 years. The price was at 16.38 US dollars. Then what did the Government do? Was the benefit of the lowest price passed to the common people of the country? No. What the Government did is, within a week, on May 5, 2020, the Government increased the excise duty on petrol and diesel. The excise duty was increased by Rs. 10 per litre on petrol and Rs. 13 per litre on diesel, a record hike. It has to be remembered that the hike was happening during the Covid period; and since June 7, 2020, the petrol and diesel prices were increased for 22 consecutive days. It didn't stop there. Since November 19, 2020, the Government has increased the petrol and diesel prices 15 to 16 times.

Excise duty on petrol. In May, 2014, the excise duty on petrol was Rs. 9.20 when the UPA was in power and on diesel, it was Rs. 3.46 per litre. In the last six years, you have increased the excise duty on petrol by additional Rs. 23.78 per litre,

and on diesel by an addition of Rs. 28.37 per litre. You have hiked the excise duty 13 times and have earned Rs. 19 lakh crore in last six-and-a-half years by increasing excise duty on petrol and diesel alone. What have you done with that Rs. 19 lakh crores? The people are suffering again and again. They are in much pain. But nothing has happened.

In addition to this, now you have decided to impose an agricultural infrastructure development cess also. Therefore, this is the situation in petrol and diesel. Therefore, I think, the Minister has totally misled the House while saying that this is only because of the crude oil price in the international market. That is a totally irresponsible statement. I would like to tell that.

Then, Sir, regarding defence. Today we discussed about that also. Chidambaramji pointed out that even there is no mention of the word 'defence' in the Budget itself. You are very much nationalized. We saw the nationalism; the leakage of a WhatsApp message. We saw the nationalism. The Balakot incident was leaked to one of your media friends. The country witnessed the nationalism of the BJP. You are talking about nationalism every time. What is your defence preparedness? Nothing is there. There is no additional thing. I will tell you. In 2018, Indian Army Vice-Chief, Lieutenant General Sarath Chand, had informed the Standing Committee on Defence that 68 per cent of the army equipment was in the vintage category, 24 per cent in the current and 8 per cent in the start-of-art category. What the Government is doing? What is your action for modernization of defence forces? Is there any mention of that in the Budget? We didn't see any mention of that in this Budget. Now hon. Raj Nath Singhji today has given a statement about the border issues. We are all with you on this issue. On fighting our enemy countries, we are all with you. But you are not giving enough information to the political parties of the country. You are not taking all political parties into confidence. That is what the country is lagging in. You are doing things at your level to show that you are the master in all such things. This is not going to help us.

Sir, many announcements were made. My friend, Shri Muraleedharan, is here. When was the announcement for the Kerala National Highway made? We all know that hon. Nitin Gadkari had announced five months earlier that the National Highway in Kerala was going to be widened into six lanes. Now, they have said in this Budget that Rs. 65,000 crores have been announced for road development in Kerala. That is a package of the NHAI. Everybody knows about that. Many announcements were made even earlier. In 2015, the hon. Prime Minister announced a Rs. 1.25 lakh crore package for Bihar. It was a big package. That was a poll promise. But schemes worth only Rs. 1,559 crore out of the total package were executed in Bihar

till 2020. Out of Rs. 1,25,000 crore, projects worth just Rs. 1,559 crore were executed. These are promises that you made. In the last Bihar elections, you announced free vaccination for the poor. We didn't find any mention of vaccination in this Budget.

**श्री सुशील कुमार मोदी (बिहार):** सर, माननीय सदस्य बिहार के बारे में गलत बोल रहे हैं कि केवल 1,000 करोड़ मिले हैं। इन्हें जानकारी नहीं है।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please don't interrupt. Let him speak.

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: Sir, farmers are protesting. Our *annadatas* are in a historical struggle and they have been protesting on the streets for so many days now. Our Prime Minister used the term '*aandolanjeevis*'. I don't understand this term '*aandolanjeevis*'. We saw some *aandolan* in 2014 also. Were they also *aandolanjeevis* who promoted agitation? Before the Government came to power in Delhi, our National Capital witnessed so many *aandolans*. My humble question to the hon. Prime Minister is, were they too prompted or instigated by *aandolanjeevis*?

**एक माननीय सांसद :** आंदोलनकारी और आंदोलनजीवी में फ़र्क होता है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: Yes, brother, there would be *aandolans*. The political system in the country itself is based on *aandolans*. ...**(Interruptions)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Mr. Venugopal, you don't have to reply to them. Please, address the Chair. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: Sir, the political system in the country is like that. What do you mean by '*aandolan*'? India got freedom through *aandolan*. \* because he did *aandolan* to get us freedom from British *Raaj*. Even the Indian National Congress did that. Mahatma Gandhi was Leader of the Indian National Congress.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN): Sir, please don't denigrate the...

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I will check the record and if it is denigrating, then I would expunge it from the records. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: Every time such *aandolans* have taken place. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, my question is, when the poor farmers are fighting for their livelihood, when they are fighting for their present and future, how can they abuse them like this? ...*(Interruptions)*... How can they abuse them like this? ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री शिव प्रताप शुक्ल (उत्तर प्रदेश):** सर, ...*(व्यवधान)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I will check the records. If it is.. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: Sir, they are branded as *Khalistanis*. They are branded as terrorists. They are branded as Pakistani agents. Every day somebody appears in some evening debate on TV channels and abuses our farmers badly.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): You may conclude now.

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: Sir, I am about to conclude.

Sir, this is the fate that our *annadatas* are facing due to the attitude of this Government. Therefore, the farmers need an answer from the Government.

I would like to end my speech quoting the same *Thirukkural* that the hon. Finance Minister quoted in her Speech -- "*Uzhuvaar Ulagattharkku Aaniaathattradu ezhavarai ellam porutthu.*" This quote from *Thirukkural* means that farmers are the linchpin of the world. They support others who cannot plough the land. So, listen to the farmers. Show some concern. Withdraw this *kaala kanoon*. Withdraw this *kaala kanoon*. Thank you very much, Sir.

**वित्त मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री; तथा कारपोरेट कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर):** उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, आपने मुझे बजट पर intervene करने का अवसर दिया, इसके लिए आपका धन्यवाद। मैं कल से लगातार विपक्षी दलों के सांसदों के तर्क भी सुन रहा हूँ, लेकिन मुझे एक बात की सबसे ज्यादा पीड़ा हुई। देखिए, बजट पर कोई आलोचना करे, यह उनका हक है।

कोई सुझाव दे, तो बहुत अच्छी बात है, लेकिन मैंने कभी यह उम्मीद नहीं की थी कि \* इससे बड़ा दुर्भाग्य और क्या है? ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: No. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री सैयद नासिर हुसैन : ये झूठ बोल रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: No, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री दीपेन्द्र सिंह हुड्डा (हरियाणा): सर, ये झूठ बोल रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please carry on. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : सर, ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): If something is wrong, I will look into the record. ...(Interruptions)... I will look into the record. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : सर, माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने बड़े स्पष्ट तौर पर यह कहा कि आंदोलनकारी और आंदोलनजीवियों में क्या अंतर है। ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I will check the record. ...(Interruptions).. If something is unparliamentary, it will be corrected. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: It should be expunged. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please go to your seats. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : अगर उनसे जोड़ दिया जाए, जो इतना बड़ा ...(व्यवधान)...

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please go to your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... If anything is unparliamentary, I will look into it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** सर, दो बातें बड़ी स्पष्ट हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, यह जो बजट है, यह एक आशा है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI DEEPENDER SINGH HOODA: Sir, I have a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** इस बजट में आशा की किरण दिखती है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please, go to your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** इसमें आशा है - नए भारत के निर्माण की, इसमें आशा है 'आत्मनिर्भर भारत' की। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please go to your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** मैं माननीय वित्त मंत्री, निर्मला सीतारमण जी को धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I have said, if anything is unparliamentary, it will be looked into. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** 'आत्मनिर्भर भारत' बनाने के लिए उनके द्वारा जो बजट लाया गया है, उसकी पूरे देश ने भूरि-भूरि प्रशंसा की है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, समाज के सभी वर्गों ने इस बजट की प्रशंसा की है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I will check the records. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** सर, मैं यह भी कहना चाहता हूँ कि इस बजट के बाद किस तरह से मार्केट ने भी रिएक्ट किया है। एक दिन नहीं, दो दिन नहीं, बल्कि मार्केट में लगातार positive response आया और सेंसेक्स में 51,000 प्वाइंट्स से ज्यादा का उछाल आया। ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह भी अपने आप में दिखाता है कि पूरे देश और दुनिया में इस बजट की किस तरह से प्रशंसा की



गई है। यह मोदी जी की वह सोच है कि भारत को 'सशक्त भारत' भी बनाना है और 'आत्मनिर्भर भारत' बनाने का काम भी इस बजट के माध्यम से करना है। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, खुशी की बात इसलिए भी है कि विपक्ष के नेता भी कहते हैं कि 70 वर्षों में पहली बार इतना पारदर्शी बजट आया है। इसके लिए भी उनका मैं बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद करता हूँ। ...(व्यवधान)...

सर, अगर extra budgetary resources की बात की जाए, तो वह ज़ीरो है। इतनी पारदर्शिता इसमें लाई गई! ...(व्यवधान)... इस बार डिजिटल बजट रखा गया और 'मेक इन इंडिया' टैबलेट पर इसको पेश किया गया। ...(व्यवधान)... वही भारत, जहाँ पहले केवल दो mobile manufacturing units थे, आज मोदी जी की नीतियों के कारण दुनिया के सबसे बड़े दो mobile manufacturing निर्माता हमारे हिन्दुस्तान में आए हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... यह हिन्दुस्तान की एक बहुत बड़ी उपलब्धि है, यह भारत की उपलब्धि है, यह नरेन्द्र मोदी जी के नेतृत्व की उपलब्धि है। ...(व्यवधान)...

सर, यहाँ पर विपक्ष के कुछ सांसदों ने कहा कि यह आम बजट नहीं, यह खास बजट है।...(व्यवधान)...सर, मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि ये जो नारा लगाते थे, ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please go to your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** सर, ये नारा लगाते थे, ये कहते थे कि गरीबी मिटाएँगे। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, इनके समय में गरीबी नहीं मिटी, गरीब मिटने पर मजबूर हो गया था। ...(व्यवधान)... लेकिन, पिछले छः वर्षों में मोदी सरकार की नीतियों के कारण हिन्दुस्तान के इतिहास में यह पहली बार हुआ कि हिन्दुस्तान में सबसे ज्यादा गरीबों को 'गरीबी रेखा' से बाहर निकलने का अवसर अगर किसी ने दिया, तो वह नरेन्द्र मोदी जी की सरकार ने दिया है। ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I had allowed Mr. K.C. Venugopal. He has already spoken. So, you can go to your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** महोदय, सबसे ज्यादा गरीबों को गरीबी रेखा से बाहर निकलने का अवसर नरेन्द्र मोदी जी की सरकार ने दिया है।...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): When your turn comes, you can speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** महोदय, यहां पर हमारी महिला एवं बाल विकास मंत्री, श्रीमती स्मृति ज़ूबिन इरानी जी यहां पर मौजूद हैं।...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): When his turn comes, he will speak. ...(*Interruptions*)... You have given name. ...(*Interruptions*)... Go to your seat. ...(*Interruptions*)...

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि महिलाओं और बाल विकास के लिए भी हमारी सरकार ने 16 प्रतिशत बजट की वृद्धि की है। यह भी महिलाओं और बच्चों के उत्थान और विकास के लिए है। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): You can't interrupt like this. Please go back to your seat. ...(*Interruptions*)...

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** सर, समाज के अनुसूचित जाति वर्ग के कल्याण के लिए अलग-अलग मंत्रालयों में कुल मिलाकर 51.65 प्रतिशत की वृद्धि की गई है। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Mr. Minister, just one minute. ...(*Interruptions*)... Mr. Nasir Hussain, I did not want to take your name, but you cannot challenge the Chair. You are a new Member. Learn something...(*Interruptions*)...learn something and then you say. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please go back to your seat now. ...(*Interruptions*)... You go to your seat now. ...(*Interruptions*)... You cannot challenge the Chair, Mr. Nasir Hussain. Go and learn something from your senior Members. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please go to your seat. ...(*Interruptions*)...

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं एक बार फिर से आग्रह करना चाहता हूँ, बड़ी गम्भीरता के साथ कहना चाहता हूँ कि जो आम बजट और खास बजट की बात करते थे, मैं उन्हें बताना चाहता हूँ कि आम बजट यही होता है कि महिला और बाल विकास के लिए 16 प्रतिशत ज्यादा दिया। ...(**व्यवधान**)... हमने अनुसूचित जाति के लिए 51.65 प्रतिशत की बजट की वृद्धि की है। इसी तरह सामाजिक न्याय और अधिकारिता मंत्रालय में 28 परसेंट की वृद्धि की है, जो नरेन्द्र मोदी जी की सरकार ने की है।

महोदय, मैं आपके सामने कुछ और बातें रखना चाहता हूँ। आप जिन गरीबों के लिए कहते थे कि 'गरीबी हटाओ', आप उनको न पक्का मकान दे पाए और न गाँव-गाँव तक बिजली पहुंचा पाए। देश के हर गाँव और हर परिवार को बिजली देने का काम अगर किसी ने किया है तो वह नरेन्द्र मोदी जी की सरकार ने किया है।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Mr. Thakur, please conclude now because it is going to be 3 o'clock now.

**श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर :** महोदय, पांच मिनट में तो नहीं हो पाएगा, जब तक मेरी बात पूरी न हो, तब तक आप सदन को extend कर दीजिए।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I will have to take the sense of the House in that case. Please try to conclude before 3 o'clock.

SHRI ANURAG SINGH THAKUR: Sir, I am trying to conclude. I am not going into details of the scheme. ...(Interruptions)... हिन्दुस्तान के गरीब से गरीब परिवार के लिए शौचालय बनाने का काम, गाँव-गाँव में हर घर को बिजली देने का काम, चार-चार एलईडी बल्ब देने का काम, पक्का मकान देने का काम, बैंक खाते खोलने और उन खातों में पैसे जमा करने का काम और यही नहीं, अब हर घर को नल .....(व्यवधान).....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please sit down now. Now, we will take up the Special Mentions. Shri Anil Desai, not present. ...(Interruptions)... Dr. Santanu Sen, not present. ...(Interruptions)...

Now, the House is adjourned till 9 a.m. on Friday, the 12<sup>th</sup> February, 2021.

*The House then adjourned at fifty-nine minutes past two of the clock till nine of the clock on Friday, the 12<sup>th</sup> February, 2021.*

