

Vol. 229

No. 17



Tuesday

3 September, 2013

12 Bhadra, 1935 (Saka)

PARLIAMENTARY DEBATES

# RAJYA SABHA

OFFICIAL REPORT

CONTENTS

Re: Clarifications on statement on missing coal files (pages 1-4)

Papers Laid on the Table (pages 4-6)

Report of the Committee on Petitions (page 6)

Recommendations of the Business Advisory Committee (page 7)

Reports of the Committee on Subordinate Legislation (page 8)

Matters Raised with Permission—

Pathetic condition of roads and Highways, particularly the Delhi-Jaipur Highway (pages 8-10)

Modernization of Balamau Railway Station in Hardoi District of Uttar Pradesh (page 10)

Demand for Central Government's intervention to render speedy justice in matters of atrocities on dalits (page 11)

Gang-rape of a woman by police in Ghaziabad (pages 11-15)

[P.T.O.]

©

RAJYA SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI

PRICE : Rs. 50.00

Need to take urgent steps to improve state of human organ donations across the country (pages 15-17)

Cyber security in the wake of lack of security experts and continuing cyber attacks (pages 17-19)

Arrest of most notorious international terrorist responsible for several attacks (pages 19-21)

Unnatural death of 12 tribals due to negligence of Coal India Subsidiary MCL in Odisha (page 22)

Continuing practice of manual scavenging in the country (pages 22-23)

Problems arising due to non-functioning of Airport Authority at Kolkata Airport (pages 23-27)

Review of Supreme Court order on reservation policy in promotions (pages 27-32)

#### Clarifications on the Statement by Minister–

Regarding investigation of coal block allocations by Central Bureau of Investigation (pages 32-47)

Web-site Address : <http://rajyasabha.nic.in>  
<http://parliamentofindia.nic.in>  
E-mail Address : [rsedit-e@sansad.nic.in](mailto:rsedit-e@sansad.nic.in)

---

PUBLISHED UNDER RULE 260 OF RULES OF PROCEDURE AND CONDUCT OF BUSINESS  
IN THE COUNCIL OF STATES (RAJYA SABHA) AND PRINTED BY PRINTOGRAPH  
KAROL BAGH, NEW DELHI-110005

## RAJYA SABHA

*Tuesday, 3rd September/12 Bhadra, 1935 (Saka)*

The House met at eleven of the clock,

MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

### **RE: CLARIFICATIONS ON STATEMENT ON MISSING COAL FILES**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Papers to be laid on the Table; Shri Namo Narain Meena. ...*(Interruptions)*... Just let the papers be laid. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAI AH NAIDU (Karnataka): Sir, the entire country is agitated about the missing coal files. The matter was raised in the House and an assurance was given by the Government that the Prime Minister will come and inform the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... But, unfortunately, that could not happen. The Prime Minister, while speaking in the House the other day, said that he is not the custodian of the files. Then, who is the custodian of the files? What has happened to him? People are saying that he is going to G-20 tomorrow. Before going to G-20, he must come before I-120, India-120 crore people, and explain the people as to what has happened. Who is responsible? What is the accountability? What action is taken? The Supreme Court said, 'Register an FIR.' I want to know whether they have registered the FIR or not. This is an important issue. Nothing else is more important than this. So, I request the Chairman to direct the Government to first respond to this and then request the Prime Minister to come to the House. Then only can we proceed to other Business. The entire country is agitated. It is a matter of Rs. 1,84,000 crores. It is not my figure. It is the figure of the CAG. The matter is being monitored by the Supreme Court. One wicket has already gone. One Minister was made to resign. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAI AH NAIDU: The Government has tried to tamper the affidavit filed before the Supreme Court. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please.

SHRI M. VENKAI AH NAIDU: That being the case, it is a very serious issue. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you Venkaiahji. Please. Please.

2     *Re: Clarifications on*     [RAJYA SABHA]     *statement on missing coal files*

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: It is a very serious issue. The House must debate this issue first. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. Please. ...*(Interruptions)*... One minute. One minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... One minute. Let the hon. Minister speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...  
...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, the Government seems to be more accountable to the court rather than the Parliament. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, Dr. Maitreyan. Let the hon. Minister speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PLANNING (SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA): Sir, as you are aware, as per their request, the Prime Minister had come here to reply all the queries which they wanted to raise, all the clarifications which they wanted to seek. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: He is duty-bound to come to this House. He is not doing any *meharbani*. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, Dr. Maitreyan. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: Now, again, hon. Venkaiah Naiduji has raised this issue. I will find out the convenience of the Prime Minister to come to this House. ...*(Interruptions)*... You can't insist. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, during the days of Jawaharlal Nehruji, even during the days of Atal Bihari Vajpayeeji, the Prime Minister used to come to the House regularly. Then, why is the Prime Minister avoiding this House? He is a Member of this House. ...*(Interruptions)*... He is a Member of this House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: He is not avoiding this House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Venkaiahji, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... All right. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: They had given a specific assurance. When is the Prime Minister coming here? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Venkaiahji, please sit down. *...(Interruptions)...* Please. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (Bihar): Again, Mr. Rajeev Shukla is saying that he will see the convenience of the Prime Minister. This is equally important. Accountability is equally important. You must announce when he will be here. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right. Thank you very much. *...(Interruptions)...*

DR. V. MAITREYAN: The Prime Minister should come to this House. He is duty-bound to come to this House. *...(Interruptions)...* He is not accountable only to court. He is accountable to Parliament also. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. Let this House behave with decorum. Please. Don't make slogans which are inadmissible, contrary to our practice. *...(Interruptions)...* Please. Please. *...(Interruptions)...* No, this is not correct. *...(Interruptions)...* No, no. *...(Interruptions)...* The House is adjourned for ten minutes.

The House then adjourned at four minutes past eleven of the clock.

The House re-assembled at fourteen minutes past eleven of the clock,

[MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.]

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, last week, when the Prime Minister was here...*...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, the Prime Minister must come to the House and tell us whether an FIR has been filed on the missing coal files. *...(Interruptions)...* Sir, there is no response from the Government. *...(Interruptions)...*

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, last week...*...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us hear the Leader of the Opposition.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, the discussion on the missing coal files in this House is incomplete. This House was assured that the Prime Minister himself would give an explanation and answer the queries raised by Members.

I must concede that on one day the hon. Prime Minister was, in fact, here to answer them. But because of some disturbance by two of our colleagues, you adjourned

the House and, therefore, the entire business passed over to the next day. Since then we have been almost requesting daily, but this item is not coming on the agenda. I am given to understand that tomorrow morning the Prime Minister leaves for the G-20 and will, therefore, not be available. Are we to understand by this process this whole issue gets abandoned and, therefore, will not be responded to? Or will the Government just tell us what time the Prime Minister is coming? We can have that agenda and then we can proceed with the rest of the business of the House.

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: Sir, earlier also the hon. Leader of the Opposition has mentioned this issue. Earlier also, the Prime Minister had come. Since the debate was going on, it is inconclusive. The Coal Minister has already made a Statement and clarifications have been sought. The Prime Minister was to intervene. I have requested the Prime Minister. Immediately after Zero Hour, he will be here to intervene.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is an assurance. Now, we can proceed.

---

#### **PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE**

##### **Statement on Quarterly Review of the trends in receipts and expenditure in relation to the Budget at the end of the financial year 2012-13**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (SHRI NAMO NARAIN MEENA): Sir, I lay on the Table, under sub-section (1) of Section 7 of the Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management Act, 2003, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Statement on Quarterly Review of the trends in receipts and expenditure in relation to the Budget at the end of the financial year 2012-13. [Placed in Library. *See* No. L.T. 9703/15/13]

##### **Notifications of Ministry of Law and Justice**

THE MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY AND THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI KAPIL SIBAL): Sir, I lay on the Table, under sub-section (3) of Section 169 of the Representation of the People Act, 1951, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Law and Justice (Legislative Department) Notification No. S.O. 2470 (E), dated the 14th August, 2013, publishing the Conduct of Elections (Amendment) Rules, 2013 [Placed in Library. *See* No. L.T. 9650/15/13]

**Annual accounts (2011-12) of the Airports Economic Regulatory  
Authority of India, New Delhi**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION ( SHRI K. C. VENUGOPAL): Sir, I lay on the Table, under sub-section (4) of Section 35 of the Airports Economic Regulatory Authority Act, 2008, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Annual Accounts of the Airports Economic Regulatory Authority of India (AERA), New Delhi, for the year 2011-12, and the Audit Report thereon. [Placed in Library. *See* No. L.T. 9165/15/13]

**Notifications of the Ministry of Finance**

SHRI NAMO NARAIN MEENA: Sir, I lay on the Table —

- i. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Revenue), under Section 74 of the Prevention of Money Laundering Act, 2002, along with Explanatory Memoranda:—
  - (1) G.S.R. 557 (E), dated the 19th August, 2013, publishing the Prevention of Money-laundering (Issuance of Provisional Attachment Order) Rules, 2013.
  - (2) G.S.R. 558 (E), dated the 19th August, 2013, publishing the Prevention of Money-laundering (Taking Possession of Attached or Frozen Properties Confirmed by the Adjudicating Authority) Rules, 2013.
  - (3) G.S.R. 559 (E), dated the 19th August, 2013, publishing the Prevention of Money-laundering (Forms, Search and Seizure or Freezing and the Manner of Forwarding the Reasons and Material to the Adjudicating Authority, Impounding and Custody of Records and the Period of Retention) (Amendment) Rules, 2013. [Placed in Library for (1) to (3) *See* No. L.T. 9698/15/13]
- ii. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Revenue), under Section 159 of the Customs Act, 1962, along with Explanatory Memoranda:—
  - (1) S.O. 2327 (E), dated the 31st July, 2013, amending Notification No. S.O. 748 (E), dated the 3rd August, 2001, to substitute certain entries in the original Notification.



- (2) S.O. 2329 (E), dated the 1st August, 2013, regarding Exchange rate of conversion of Foreign currency into Indian currency or *vice-versa* for the purpose of assessment of imported and export goods.
- (3) S.O. 2467 (E), dated the 14th August, 2013, regarding Exchange rate for conversion of Foreign Currency into Indian currency or *vice-versa* for the purpose of assessment of imported and export goods.
- (4) S.O. 2468 (E), dated the 14th August, 2013, amending Notification No. S.O. 748 (E), dated the 3rd August, 2001, to substitute certain entries in the original Notification. [Placed in Library for (1) to (4) See No. L.T. 9694/15/13]

iii. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Revenue), under Section 296 of the Income Tax Act, 1961, along with Explanatory Memoranda:—

- (1) S.O. 1491 (E), dated the 10th June, 2013, publishing the Income-tax (Sixth Amendment) Rules, 2013.
- (2) S.O. 2493 (E), dated the 19th August, 2013, notifying the National Iranian Oil Company as the foreign company and the MoU entered into between the Government of India in the Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas and the Central Bank of Iran on 20th January, 2013. [Placed in Library for (1) to (2) See No. L.T. 9695/15/13]

**Report (2012:No.16 of 2013) of Comptroller and Auditor General of India**

SHRI NAMO NARAIN MEENA: Sir, I lay on the Table, under clause (1) of article 151 of the Constitution, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India for the year ended March, 2012: No.16 of 2013: Union Government (Civil), Autonomous Bodies – Performance Audit. [Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9708/15/13]

---

**REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON PETITIONS**

श्री नमो नारायण मेणा जी : मैं १५ अक्टूबर, २०१३ को मंत्रालय में उपस्थित होकर, १९९५ के आदेशों के तहत तैयार की गई अथॉरिटी के अंतर्गत वर्ष २०१२ के प्रतिवेदन की न. १६/२०१३: संघ सरकार (मौखिक), स्वायत्त निकायों - प्रदर्शन आडिट (पहले में प्रकट करने के लिए उपलब्ध है।)

---

**RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE BUSINESS ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have to inform Members that the Business Advisory Committee in its meeting held on the 2nd of September, 2013, has allotted time for Government Legislative Business, as follows:-

Business	Time Allowed
1. Consideration and passing of following Bills:-	
(a) The Constitution (One Hundred and Twentieth Amendment) Bill, 2013.	Three hours (To be discussed together)
(b) The Judicial Appointments Commission Bill, 2013.	(Instead of four hours as allotted earlier)
(c) The Representation of the People (Second Amendment and Validation) Bill, 2013.	One hour
2. Consideration and passing of the following Bills, after they are passed by Lok Sabha:-	One hour
(a) The Right to Information (Amendment) Bill, 2013.	(Instead of one hour and thirty minutes as allotted earlier)
(b) The Narcotic Drugs and Psychotropic Substances (Amendment) Bill, 2011.	One hour
(c) The Pension Fund Regulatory and Development Authority Bill, 2011.	Two hours
(d) The Rajiv Gandhi National Aviation University Bill, 2013.	One hours
(e) The Civil Aviation Authority Bill, 2013.	One hour
(f) The Prohibition of Employment as Manual Scavengers and their Rehabilitation Bill, 2012.	Two hour
(g) The Indira Gandhi National University for Women Bill, 2013.	Two hours

**REPORTS OF THE COMMITTEE ON SUBORDINATE LEGISLATION**

SHRIMATI MAYA SINGH (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, I beg to present the following reports (in English and Hindi) of the Committee on Subordinate Legislation:—

- \* Two Hundred and Eighth Report on Statutory Orders laid on the Table of the Rajya Sabha during the 228th Session;
- \* Two Hundred and Ninth Report on the Hallmarking Scheme and Certain Rules/Regulations framed under the Bureau of Indian Standard Act, 1986;
- \* Two Hundred and Tenth Report on (i) the Cigarettes and other Tobacco Products (Prohibition of Advertisement and Regulation of Trade and Commerce, Production, Supply and Distribution) Rules, 2004; and (ii) Kandla Port Trust (Authorization of Pilots) Regulations, 1964 – Implementation of 163rd Report of the Committee;
- \* Two Hundred and Eleventh Report on the Border Roads Engineering Services Group 'A' (Amendment) Rules, 1988; and
- \* Two Hundred and Twelfth Report on Delay in Framing of Subordinate Legislation under the Acts of Parliament and Delay in the Laying of Rules/Regulations/Orders on the Table of the House.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Zero Hour - Shrimati Jharna Das Baidya. †  
क्या, ठीक है ठीक है, okay. Now, Dr. Chandan Mitra.

---

**MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION****Pathetic condition of roads and Highways, particularly the Delhi-Jaipur Highway**

DR. CHANDAN MITRA (Madhya Pradesh): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, through you, I wish to draw the attention of the House to an issue that is featuring regularly in our media, which is the state of the National Highway No. 8 from Delhi to Jaipur. Sir, this is a National Highway. It is being upgraded under the supervision of the National Highways Authority of India. Sir, it is really strange that for months, absolutely chaotic conditions are prevailing on this Highway, and particularly, after the monsoon, there are huge potholes, diversions are incomplete, and it is taking eight to ten hours to cover a distance that used to be covered in three hours' time.

Sir, it is on the basis of this terrible state of affairs that I have a few issues to raise with the Government, through you, about the highways, their supervision, their construction and their maintenance and management. I am a regular road user. I drive myself and use these highways. I have not understood as to why it takes so long to construct or upgrade highways which are done within just months anywhere else in the world. Highway construction upgrades are started even before land acquisition is complete, and so, the contracted company keeps saying that sorry, land has not been acquired, utilities have not been shifted, and, therefore, they can't do anything. Why is it happening like this? Why can't construction start only after all these things are done?

Sir, most importantly, even in this terrible and pathetic state of the Highway, NH-8, toll is being charged. People are being subjected to misery and harassment. Their cars and lorries are being damaged beyond repair and yet, they have to pay for the use of this absolutely potholed and hellish highway. Sir, it is absolutely pathetic. The tolls are kept on increasing and the Government is mercilessly charging toll for subjecting people to this harassment. Sir, diversions are not constructed properly, and with those diversions, cars are damaged even further.

Sir, I want to know from the Government whether anybody actually supervises these highways. I have repeatedly suggested that the Ministers in charge should actually drive down some of these highways and see for themselves as to what they are subjecting people to. Sir, I know that NH-65, which connects Moradabad to a place called Bajpur, is absolutely unusable. There are potholes bigger than craters on the Moon. The other Highway, NH-87, from Rampur to Uttarakhand, is in the same State. Sir, how does one get to Uttarakhand if this is the state of affairs? It is a hill State. It is very badly damaged and, I think, this matter must be addressed.

DR. GYAN PRAKASH PILANIA (Rajasthan): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by Dr. Chandan Mitra.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, names of all those who associate may be added.

श्री. चण्डन मिश्रा (राजस्थान) : मैं आपसे जो बातें कह रहा हूँ, वे हैं कि, जो NH-8 पर टोल लगाया जा रहा है, वह बहुत ही बुरा है। लोगों को परेशान करने के लिए टोल लगाया जा रहा है।

श्री. ग्यान प्रकाश पिलानिया (राजस्थान) : मैं आपसे जो बातें कह रहा हूँ, वे हैं कि, जो NH-65 पर सड़क का काम हो रहा है, वह बहुत ही बुरा है।

श्री. चण्डन मिश्रा (राजस्थान) : मैं आपसे जो बातें कह रहा हूँ, वे हैं कि, जो NH-87 पर सड़क का काम हो रहा है, वह बहुत ही बुरा है।

श्री. ग्यान प्रकाश पिलानिया (राजस्थान) : मैं आपसे जो बातें कह रहा हूँ, वे हैं कि, जो NH-65 पर सड़क का काम हो रहा है, वह बहुत ही बुरा है।

श्री श्री सुधीर कुमार शर्मा (बिहार) : आर्य समाज के सदस्यों को भी आर्य समाज के सम्बन्ध में जानकारी देनी चाहिए।

श्री श्री सुधीर कुमार शर्मा (उत्तर प्रदेश) : आर्य समाज के सदस्यों को भी आर्य समाज के सम्बन्ध में जानकारी देनी चाहिए।

SHRI PREM CHAND GUPTA (Bihar): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by Dr. Chandan Mitra.

### Modernization of Balamau Railway Station in Hardoi District of Uttar Pradesh

श्री श्री सुधीर कुमार शर्मा (उत्तर प्रदेश) : आर्य समाज के सदस्यों को भी आर्य समाज के सम्बन्ध में जानकारी देनी चाहिए।

आर्य समाज के सदस्यों को भी आर्य समाज के सम्बन्ध में जानकारी देनी चाहिए।

आर्य समाज के सदस्यों को भी आर्य समाज के सम्बन्ध में जानकारी देनी चाहिए।

आर्य समाज के सदस्यों को भी आर्य समाज के सम्बन्ध में जानकारी देनी चाहिए।

**Demand for Central Government's intervention to render speedy justice in matters of atrocities on dalits**



300000 100000 200000 300000 400000 500000 600000 700000 800000 900000 1000000 1100000 1200000 1300000 1400000 1500000 1600000 1700000 1800000 1900000 2000000 2100000 2200000 2300000 2400000 2500000 2600000 2700000 2800000 2900000 3000000 3100000 3200000 3300000 3400000 3500000 3600000 3700000 3800000 3900000 4000000 4100000 4200000 4300000 4400000 4500000 4600000 4700000 4800000 4900000 5000000 5100000 5200000 5300000 5400000 5500000 5600000 5700000 5800000 5900000 6000000 6100000 6200000 6300000 6400000 6500000 6600000 6700000 6800000 6900000 7000000 7100000 7200000 7300000 7400000 7500000 7600000 7700000 7800000 7900000 8000000 8100000 8200000 8300000 8400000 8500000 8600000 8700000 8800000 8900000 9000000 9100000 9200000 9300000 9400000 9500000 9600000 9700000 9800000 9900000 10000000

... (3:10-10) ...

... (3:10-10) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is the gangrape of a woman. ..(Interruptions)..  
You please stick to the subject. ..(Interruptions)..

... (3:10-10) ...

... (3:10-10) ...

... (3:10-10) ...

... (3:10-10) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If all speak together, I can't hear. ..(Interruptions)..  
All are talking together. I can't hear. ... (3:10-10) ...

... (3:10-10) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You stick to the subject. ..(Interruptions).. Don't  
change the subject. ..(Interruptions)..

... (3:10-10) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is a question of gang-rape of a woman.  
..(Interruptions)..

... (3:10-10) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Stick to the subject. ..(Interruptions)..

**အုပ်စုဝန်ကြီး:** မိမိတို့ အဖွဲ့အစည်းများသည် မြန်မာနိုင်ငံတော်၏ နေရာထုတ်ပေးမှု၊ အသိပေးမှု၊ အသိပေးမှု၊ အသိပေးမှု... (အသံစဉ်)...

**အုပ်စု ဝန်ကြီး:** အိမ်ထောင်ရေး ပြဿနာ... (အသံစဉ်)...

**အုပ်စု ဝန်ကြီး:** အိမ်ထောင်ရေး ပြဿနာ... (အသံစဉ်)...

**အုပ်စု ဝန်ကြီး:** အိမ်ထောင်ရေး ပြဿနာ... (အသံစဉ်)...

**အုပ်စု ဝန်ကြီး:** အိမ်ထောင်ရေး ပြဿနာ... (အသံစဉ်)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The subject is permitted by the Chairman. ..(Interruptions).. The subject is permitted by the Chairman. ..(Interruptions).. The subject is permitted. ..(Interruptions)..

**အုပ်စု ဝန်ကြီး:** အိမ်ထောင်ရေး ပြဿနာ... (အသံစဉ်)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We always take up the issue of rape. ..(Interruptions)..

**အုပ်စု ဝန်ကြီး:** အိမ်ထောင်ရေး ပြဿနာ... (အသံစဉ်)...

**အုပ်စု ဝန်ကြီး:** အိမ်ထောင်ရေး ပြဿနာ... (အသံစဉ်)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nareshji, we have taken up the issue of rape when it happened in other States also. ..(Interruptions)..

**အုပ်စု ဝန်ကြီး:** အိမ်ထောင်ရေး ပြဿနာ... (အသံစဉ်)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is a very serious issue. So, we take it up. ..(Interruptions).. Everybody admits that it is a serious issue. ..(Interruptions)..

**အုပ်စု ဝန်ကြီး:** အိမ်ထောင်ရေး ပြဿနာ... (အသံစဉ်)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: When it happened in Maharashtra, we took it up. ..(Interruptions)..

**အုပ်စု ဝန်ကြီး:** အိမ်ထောင်ရေး ပြဿနာ... (အသံစဉ်)...

**အုပ်စု ဝန်ကြီး:** အိမ်ထောင်ရေး ပြဿနာ... (အသံစဉ်)...



ÁÖ ÁÖÖÖÖ "Öü×ÖÖÖ : <ÁÖÖ ÖÖÖ 2ÖÖÖÖ "ÖÖÖÖÖ....(3/12/09)...

ÁÖ ÖÖÖÖÖÖ : †ÖÖ »ÖÖÖ 2ÖÖÖÖ •ÖÖ† <... ×ÖÖÖÖ •ÖÖ, †ÖÖ 2ÖÖÖÖ •ÖÖ† <....(3/12/09)... †ÖÖ »ÖÖÖ 2ÖÖÖÖ •ÖÖ† <....(3/12/09)... ÖÖÖÖÖ •ÖÖ, †ÖÖ 2ÖÖÖÖ •ÖÖ† <....(3/12/09)... ÖÖÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ •ÖÖ, †ÖÖ 2ÖÖÖÖ •ÖÖ† <....(3/12/09)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Brajesh, your time is over. ..(Interruptions)..

ÁÖ ÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ (2ÖÖÖÖÖ) : ÁÖÖÖÖ 2ÖÖÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ <ÁÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ....(3/12/09)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nareshji, when it comes to the question of rape, it being such a heinous and horrendous crime, wherever it happens, we have taken it up. When it happened in Maharashtra, we discussed.

ÁÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ †ÖÖÖÖÖ : ÁÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ....(3/12/09)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You give notice.

ÁÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ †ÖÖÖÖÖ : ÁÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ....(3/12/09)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can give notice. ..(Interruptions)..

Nareshji, you can give notice. †ÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ....(3/12/09)...

Atrocities on women, atrocities on dalits, we always take up these issues. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka): Sir, they are friends with the Congress. ..(Interruptions).. Let Mr. Rajeev Shukla make a compromise with these people. ..(Interruptions)..

ÁÖ ÁÖÖÖÖÖ "Öü×ÖÖÖ : †ÖÖÖÖ »ÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ....(3/12/09)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Atrocities on women ..(Interruptions).. Venkaiahji ..(Interruptions).. Atrocities on women, atrocities on dalits, we always take up these issues wherever it happens. ..(Interruptions).. †ÖÖ 2ÖÖÖÖ •ÖÖ† <....(3/12/09)... †ÁÖÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖ. Now, I go to the next ..(Interruptions).. Shri Derek O'Brien. ..(Interruptions).. We always allow it. ..(Interruptions).. Yes, Mr. Derek O'Brien. ..(Interruptions).. Please ..(Interruptions).. Please speak Mr. Derek O'Brien. ..(Interruptions).. †ÖÖ 2ÖÖÖÖÖ <...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN (West Bengal): Sir, how can I start? ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You start. ..(Interruptions).. It is going on record. ..(Interruptions).. You start please. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, ..(Interruptions)..



Sir, 1.4 lakh people die in road accidents every year in India. Out of that, 90,000 people are brain dead. Besides Tamil Nadu, Sir, West Bengal also has a very good record. In fact, ten lakh people in West Bengal, including former Chief Ministers of West Bengal, have pledged their bodies. This way bodies can actually be used to save the lives of other people by giving them organs. Sir, in India, we need about 25,000 transplants every year. The last year's figure for cadaver transplants was a dismal 126. This is my appeal, through you, Sir, to all Members of Parliament. I know all of us want to be remembered in our life time and that is fair enough. But if we pledge our bodies for use after death, 34 organs and tissues can be put to use. There are many NGOs which are running this campaign. In fact, last month was Organ Donation Month. I would appeal to all Members of Parliament in the Rajya Sabha and the Lok Sabha to pledge their bodies to save lives. This will also help in reducing the illegal trade of organs and their blackmarket. So, here is an appeal, Sir, to all the Members of Parliament to do something about this. Thank you, Sir.

SHRIMATI VASANTHI STANLEY (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I associate myself with the mention raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI P. RAJEEVE (Kerala): Sir, I associate myself with the mention raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI D. RAJA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I associate myself with the mention raised by the hon. Member.

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I associate myself with the mention raised by the hon. Member.

SHRIMATI AMBIKA SONI (Punjab): Sir, I associate myself with the mention raised by the hon. Member.

DR. K. P. RAMALINGAM (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I associate myself with the mention raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I associate myself with the mention raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI ANIL DESAI (Maharashtra): Sir, I associate myself with the mention raised by the hon. Member.

DR. GYAN PRAKASH PILANIA (Rajasthan): Sir, I associate myself with the mention raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI C. M. RAMESH (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, I associate myself with the mention raised by the hon. Member.

ఆంధ్ర ప్రదేశ్ రాష్ట్రం (ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్) : ఏడాది, పరిశ్రమ అభివృద్ధి కేంద్రాన్ని సహజంగా ఉపయోగించి ఉద్యోగాలను సృష్టించే అంశంపై చర్చ జరుగుతుంది.

ఆంధ్ర ప్రదేశ్ రాష్ట్రం (ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్) : ఏడాది, పరిశ్రమ అభివృద్ధి కేంద్రాన్ని సహజంగా ఉపయోగించి ఉద్యోగాలను సృష్టించే అంశంపై చర్చ జరుగుతుంది.

ఆంధ్ర ప్రదేశ్ రాష్ట్రం (ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్) : ఏడాది, పరిశ్రమ అభివృద్ధి కేంద్రాన్ని సహజంగా ఉపయోగించి ఉద్యోగాలను సృష్టించే అంశంపై చర్చ జరుగుతుంది.

ఆంధ్ర ప్రదేశ్ రాష్ట్రం (ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్) : ఏడాది, పరిశ్రమ అభివృద్ధి కేంద్రాన్ని సహజంగా ఉపయోగించి ఉద్యోగాలను సృష్టించే అంశంపై చర్చ జరుగుతుంది.

ఆంధ్ర ప్రదేశ్ రాష్ట్రం (ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్) : ఏడాది, పరిశ్రమ అభివృద్ధి కేంద్రాన్ని సహజంగా ఉపయోగించి ఉద్యోగాలను సృష్టించే అంశంపై చర్చ జరుగుతుంది.

ఆంధ్ర ప్రదేశ్ రాష్ట్రం (ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్) : ఏడాది, పరిశ్రమ అభివృద్ధి కేంద్రాన్ని సహజంగా ఉపయోగించి ఉద్యోగాలను సృష్టించే అంశంపై చర్చ జరుగుతుంది.

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, I associate myself with the mention raised by the hon. Member.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All the Members are associating themselves with the mention. I also associate myself with the mention. I have already committed to donate my organs.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): Sir, all the leaders of our Party have pledged their bodies. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (Bihar): It is a very good development. We fully associate ourselves with this mention.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I also associate myself with the mention made by Shri Derek O'Brien. We should consider it. I have already committed to donate my organs. Shri Shyamal Chakraborty; not present. Shri Tarun Vijay.

**Cyber security in the wake of lack of security experts and continuing cyber attacks**

SHRI TARUN VIJAY (Uttarakhand): Sir, with full authority and information available to me, I can say that your location and your purchase profile are being

watched by the NSA in the USA. I am quoting today's *The Hindu*. It says that the NSA picked content from Brazilian President's phones, email and texts. India is among the list of countries watched and classified as "Friends, Enemies, or Problems?"

†Y0, u 2000-08-08 16:00:00, www.rajyasabha.com. <mailto:rajyasabha@rajyasabha.com>.  
†Y0, u 2000-08-08 16:00:00, www.rajyasabha.com. <mailto:rajyasabha@rajyasabha.com>.  
†Y0, u 2000-08-08 16:00:00, www.rajyasabha.com. <mailto:rajyasabha@rajyasabha.com>.

<mailto:rajyasabha@rajyasabha.com>.  
†Y0, u 2000-08-08 16:00:00, www.rajyasabha.com. <mailto:rajyasabha@rajyasabha.com>.  
†Y0, u 2000-08-08 16:00:00, www.rajyasabha.com. <mailto:rajyasabha@rajyasabha.com>.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Your time is over.

**†Y0, u 2000-08-08 16:00:00, www.rajyasabha.com. <mailto:rajyasabha@rajyasabha.com>.\***

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Rajiv Pratap Rudy. Mr. Tarun Vijay, your time is over. It is not going on record. †Y0, u 2000-08-08 16:00:00, www.rajyasabha.com. <mailto:rajyasabha@rajyasabha.com>.

---

\*Not recorded.

آب ٻڌڻي ٿي ٿي (ٻي ٿي) : اٺ ٻڌڻي ٿي ، اٺ ٻڌڻي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي

آب ٽي ٿي ٿي (ٻي ٿي) : اٺ ٻڌڻي ٿي ، اٺ ٻڌڻي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي

آب ٿي ٿي ٿي (ٻي ٿي) : اٺ ٻڌڻي ٿي ، اٺ ٻڌڻي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي

آب ٿي ٿي ٿي (ٻي ٿي) : اٺ ٻڌڻي ٿي ، اٺ ٻڌڻي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي

†[چودھری منور سلیم (اترپردیش) : آپ سبھاپتی جی، میں خود کو اس سے سمبذ کرتا ہوں]

آب ٽي ٿي ٿي (ٻي ٿي) : اٺ ٻڌڻي ٿي ، اٺ ٻڌڻي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي

آب ٽي ٿي ٿي (ٻي ٿي) : اٺ ٻڌڻي ٿي ، اٺ ٻڌڻي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي

SOME HON. MEMBERS: We also associate.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think the entire House associates.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (Bihar): Sir, you need to note one thing that on the matter raised by Tarun Vijayji, there is a great consensus in the House and it is a great tradition for our Parliament that on the issues of national concern, we speak in one voice.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is very correct. I fully agree and we have always shown that kind of unity. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. RAJEEVE (Kerala): Sir, they have installed one server near New Delhi. It is a very important issue. It should be discussed. The Minister is here. We want a response from the Government.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now, Shri Rajiv Pratap Rudy. ...*(Interruptions)*...  
ٻي ٿي ٿي...

**Arrest of most notorious international terrorist responsible for several attacks**

آب ٿي ٿي ٿي (ٻي ٿي) : اٺ ٻڌڻي ٿي ، اٺ ٻڌڻي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي  
< ٿي ٿي ٿي اٺ ٻڌڻي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي ٿي  
ٿي  
> ٿي  
> ٿي  
> ٿي  
ٿي ٿي

†Transliteration in Urdu script.



**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Yes, Mr. Rajiv Pratap Rudy, time over. ..(Interruptions)... Please. Now, Shri Dharmendra Pradhan.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** \*

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** It is not going on record. Shri Dharmendra Pradhan.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** \*

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** It is not going on record. Why do you speak? After three minutes, nothing is going on record. Then, what is the use of speaking? Rudyji, you know the rule.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** \*

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** \*

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** \*

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** \*

**DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA (Madhya Pradesh):** Sir, there are many issues which can't be confined within a particular time frame. This is a major issue concerning the security of the country. Not one state, but many States are concerned with it. Most of the Members are agreeing to it because they belong to different States. I humbly request you that on some issues please don't bind us to conclude within a particular time frame. We are not asking you to bypass the rules. But, at least, on some issues you can use your discretion to decide which issue has got major national concern.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** But it is a decision already taken with the consent of the House. With regard to Zero Hour submissions, after three minutes the mike will be off. It will not be recorded. So, I am bound by that. But, I think, you may give your suggestion to the Chairman. He may consider it. I agree that you have made a valid suggestion.

**DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA:** Chair is not bound by any rule. The Chairman can suspend any rule. This is only a minor issue.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You are a more learned Member than me. You know the rules. Now, Shri Dharmendra Pradhan.

---

\*Not recorded.





country; people manually clean dry toilets everyday while braving dangerous infections, sometimes for a paltry sum of Rs. 10/- per household.

In a recent incident, in New Delhi, three men died while cleaning a sewer inside the Indira Gandhi National Centre for the Arts. They have collapsed after inhaling toxic gases from the sewer.

The Safai Karmachari Andolan had organized a protest where manual scavengers, mostly women, demanded a complete ban on the practice.

Our Party called for strict implementation of the Employment of Manual Scavengers and Construction of Dry Latrines (Prohibition) Act, 1993 and sought a time-bound programme to end manual scavenging. We demand serious efforts on the part of the Government to prevent death of labourers due to asphyxiation while cleaning sewerage network.

The Government should consider passing the new Prohibition of Employment as Manual Scavengers and their Rehabilitation Bill, 2012 with amendments on priority. In the new Bill, the definition of 'manual scavenger' is according to our demand. Thank You.

SHRI D. RAJA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I associate myself with this issue.

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I also associate myself with it.

SHRI P. RAJEEVE (Kerala): Sir, I also associate myself with this issue.

SHRI N.K. SINGH (Bihar): Sir, I also associate myself with this issue.

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE (West Bengal): Sir, I associate myself with this issue.

SHRI AVTAR SINGH KARIMPURI (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, I also associate myself with it.

#### **Problems arising due to non-functioning of Airport Authority at Kolkata Airport**

SHRI SHYAMAL CHAKRABORTY (West Bengal): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, there was a consensus between the Airport Authority and the Aviation Ministry on the one side and the Employees Union and former Left Front Government of West Bengal on the other side. A consensus was arrived that the Netaji Subhas Airport at Kolkata

would be modernised by the Airport Authority itself and the employees would neither be retrenched nor transferred or be declared as surplus. Now renovation work has been more or less completed, but the Airport Authority has embarked upon a scheme to replace the permanent employees by hired contract workers through outsourcing on the plea of the so called inefficiency of the employees.

Recently, a tender has been floated in this regard. Sir, if new employees are needed for the expansion of the airport and for its efficient functioning, then, the Airports Authority itself can recruit such people. Sir, I appeal to the hon. Minister of Civil Aviation to direct the management to withdraw the order and instruct the Authority to immediately repair the defects existing in the new structure and ensure smooth working environment thereby ensuring a decent passenger service.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Bhattacharya to associate...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN (West Bengal): Sir, only the maintenance work should be outsourced.

SHRI VIVEK GUPTA (West Bengal): Sir, I associate myself with it.

SHRI P. BHATTACHARYA (West Bengal) : Sir, thank you for giving me this opportunity to speak on this issue.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just associate yourself with it in one or two sentences.

SHRI P. BHATTACHARYA : Sir, I do not know whether you had any opportunity to visit the Kolkata Airport. If you happen to go there, you may find it to be a very beautiful airport. But once you enter the Airport, suddenly, you will see a glass pane breaking and hitting your head. And, if you enter the Airport in a rainy season, you have to carry an umbrella with you. Otherwise, it is very difficult to go inside. I have, repeatedly, complained about it to the Airports Authority. But, unfortunately, I do not know what these people are doing except transferring the workers this way and that way.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay, you conclude.

SHRI P. BHATTACHARYA: They are doing nothing. Sir, it requires a serious investigation. Malpractices are going on there. The matter cannot be thrown away. It requires a serious investigation as to why these things are happening.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Minister of Civil Aviation is here. Mr. Minister, you kindly get it examined.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): Sir, I would like to add something here. The hon. Prime Minister is here. He chairs the Committee on Infrastructure. That Committee had taken a decision that as far as the Airports of Kolkata and Chennai were concerned, they would be renovated by the Airports Authority and whatever they wanted to outsource, they would decide. But now we hear that they are being privatized...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no...(Interruptions)

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: That is also an issue that needs to be answered by the Minister.

আইসি এয়ারলাইন্স (সিএইচডি) : উত্তরপ্রদেশ সরকার, ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is the subject?

আইসি এয়ারলাইন্স : সবেই তিনটি বিমানের ক্ষতি, যেসব ক্ষতি পূরণে সরকারে প্রস্তাব দেওয়া হয়েছে।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If it is about clarifications, then, I will give you time...(Interruptions)...

আইসি এয়ারলাইন্স : উত্তরপ্রদেশ সরকার, তিনটি বিমানের ক্ষতি পূরণে সরকারে প্রস্তাব দেওয়া হয়েছে। ...

আইসি এয়ারলাইন্স : ... How can I allow? ..(Interruptions)...

আইসি এয়ারলাইন্স : পূর্বেই উল্লেখ করা হয়েছে যে ...

আইসি এয়ারলাইন্স : ...

আইসি এয়ারলাইন্স : ...

আইসি এয়ারলাইন্স : ...

আইসি এয়ারলাইন্স : ...

আইসি এয়ারলাইন্স : ...

আইসি এয়ারলাইন্স : ...





**ஆர். பி. சி. அரவிந்த் :** தலைவர் அவர்களே, சர்க்கார் கொள்கையைப்பற்றி... (பேசவில்லை)...

**ஆர்திபதி :** உறுப்பினர் அவர்கள், சர்க்கார் கொள்கையைப்பற்றி, அதற்கான விவரம்... (பேசவில்லை)...

**ஆர். பி. சி. அரவிந்த் :** உறுப்பினர் அவர்களே, சர்க்கார் கொள்கையைப்பற்றி... Nothing will go on record.

**ஆர்திபதி :** \*

**ஆர். பி. சி. அரவிந்த் :** தலைவர் அவர்களே, சர்க்கார் கொள்கையைப்பற்றி... Minister wants to say something. All of you please sit down. That is all. Nothing more will go on record.

**ஆர்திபதி :** \*

**ஆர். பி. சி. அரவிந்த் :** தலைவர் அவர்களே, சர்க்கார் கொள்கையைப்பற்றி... Okay, you associate.

**SHRI PREM CHAND GUPTA (Bihar):** Sir, I associate myself with the concern expressed by Km. Mayawati.

**SHRI D. RAJA (Tamil Nadu):** Sir, I associate myself with the point expressed by Km. Mayawati.

**SHRI DEVENDER GOUD T. (Andhra Pradesh):** Sir, I also associate myself with the point expressed by Km. Mayawati.

**ஆர். பி. சி. அரவிந்த் :** தலைவர் அவர்களே, சர்க்கார் கொள்கையைப்பற்றி... (பேசவில்லை)...

**SHRI KAPIL SIBAL:** Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I just want to clarify... (பேசவில்லை)...

**ஆர்திபதி :** உறுப்பினர் அவர்கள், சர்க்கார் கொள்கையைப்பற்றி... (பேசவில்லை)...

\*Not recorded.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we will take up clarifications on the Statement by the Prime Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ተሰቦ *የቤት ጉዳይ*... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... Hon. Leader of the Opposition will speak now.

*አባል ጥያቄ*: ተሰቦ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ግንኙነት አለመኖሩን ለማረጋገጥ ለምሳሌ የሚገኘውን ጉዳይ ለማረጋገጥ ለምሳሌ የሚገኘውን ጉዳይ ለማረጋገጥ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*...

*አባል ጥያቄ*: ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*...

*አባል ጥያቄ*: ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ተሰቦ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*...

*አባል ጥያቄ*: ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ተሰቦ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*...

*አባል ጥያቄ*: ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*...

*አባል ጥያቄ*: ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ተሰቦ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*...

*አባል ጥያቄ*: ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*...

*አባል ጥያቄ*: ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... You raised the issue and you got assurance. Misraji, Minister has given assurance. What else do you want?...*(Interruptions)*... No, no. Let us proceed with the business. ተሰቦ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ተሰቦ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... I can not direct. *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... That is not necessary...*(Interruptions)*... ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*...

*አባል ጥያቄ*: ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*... ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ ስለሚገኝ ጉዳይ... *የቤት ጉዳይ*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

*አባል ጥያቄ*: \*

*አባል ጥያቄ*: \*የቤት ጉዳይ \*

\*Not recorded.



SHRI C.M. RAMESH (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, people in Andhra Pradesh are on the roads. ...*(Interruptions)*...Sir, Andhra Pradesh is boiling. ...*(Interruptions)*...

శ్రీ ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్ మంత్రి: టైం ఉన్నప్పుడు ఆ సభలో చర్చ జరగడం కాదు...*(Interruptions)*...It is not going on record. It is not going on record...*(Interruptions)*...

శ్రీ ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్ మంత్రి: \*

శ్రీ ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్ మంత్రి: \*

శ్రీ ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్ మంత్రి: టైం సరికొస్తే...*(Interruptions)*... I will be forced to adjourn the House. Misraji, please sit down...*(Interruptions)*...I cannot hear anything...*(Interruptions)*...I will have to adjourn the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

శ్రీ ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్ మంత్రి: \*

శ్రీ ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్ మంత్రి: \*

శ్రీ ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్ మంత్రి: సభలో చర్చ జరగడం కాదు, టైం సరికొస్తే...*(Interruptions)*...

శ్రీ ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్ మంత్రి: \*

శ్రీ ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్ మంత్రి: సభలో చర్చ జరగడం కాదు, టైం సరికొస్తే...*(Interruptions)*...సభలో చర్చ జరగడం కాదు.

శ్రీ ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్ మంత్రి: (సభలో చర్చ జరగడం కాదు) : టైం సరికొస్తే ఆ సభలో చర్చ జరగడం కాదు, టైం సరికొస్తే ఆ సభలో చర్చ జరగడం కాదు...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is what I am saying. ...*(Interruptions)*...

శ్రీ ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్ మంత్రి: \*

శ్రీ ఆంధ్రప్రదేశ్ మంత్రి: \*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is what I want to take up. ...*(Interruptions)*...I am requesting the hon. Members, including the most respected Kumari Mayawatiji, please allow the clarifications on the statement of Coal Minister ...*(Interruptions)*...Parliamentary Affairs Minister, would you like to say something?...*(Interruptions)*... The House is adjourned for ten minutes.

The House then adjourned at nine minutes past twelve of the clock.

The House re-assembled at nineteen minutes past twelve of the clock.

[MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.]

**အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်:** အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်... ..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, please. I am not allowing. You made your point, and now I am not allowing.

**အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်:** အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်... ..  
အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်... ..  
အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်... ..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You kindly listen to the Parliamentary Affairs Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mayawatiji, the Parliamentary Affairs Minister is on his legs. Please listen to him.

THE MINISTER OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT AND THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI KAMAL NATH): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I want to clarify... ..  
... ..  
... ..  
... ..

**အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်:** အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်... ..

**အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်:** အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်... ..

**အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်:** အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်... ..

**အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်:** အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်... ..

**အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်:** အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်... ..

**အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်:** အိမ်ခြံမြေရေးရာ ဝန်ကြီးချုပ်... ..  
... ..  
... ..  
... ..

... (Interruptions) ...

... (Interruptions) ...

... (Interruptions) ... \*

... \*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have called the hon. LoP. ... (Interruptions)... Nothing else will go on record. ... (Interruptions).. Nothing else will go on record. ... (Interruptions) ...

**CLARIFICATIONS ON THE STATEMENT BY MINISTER**

**Regarding investigation of coal block allocations by Central Bureau of Investigation**

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, the hon. Minister for Coal has made two statements before this House. He made the first statement on the 20th of August, 2013 and the second statement on 23rd August, 2013. In the first statement, he was a little vague. He said ‘some files may not be available. In case they are asked for we will try and supply them.’ In para three, he said and I think this is extremely important because this was a methodology of concealing fair information and I quote from his statement, “The CBI has asked *interalia* for 157 applications/documents which were prior to 28.6.2004 but have not been allocated coal apart from a few other files and documents.” So, the statement was paraphrased as though all these are pre-2004 files. On the same day, when clarifications were sought, he made a statement in the House, ... These are all prior to 2004. This was categorically stated. When Members were not satisfied because reports were appearing that these are all documents between 2006 and 2009 and not the documents prior to 2004, he has now made a very interesting statement which is an example of how the arithmetic of this Government works. In para 4 he says and he refers to the documents and files ‘not supplied’, these documents may be broadly classified as 43 files, 19 applications for coal block allotment, 157 applications of private applicant companies who had applied

\*Not recorded.

for coal prior to 28.6.2004 but have not been allotted, 17 other documents. The position is as under. And, I will just briefly reaffirm this. In the first case, he says that seven files are not available and efforts are being made to locate them; sixteen applications, along with 157 applications, are being searched; out of seventeen documents, nine are being searched. So, he sub-qualifies them into files, documents and applications, as they were all loose sheets of papers. If you total, it is not the impression of seven files that has been given, it is seven plus sixteen plus nine plus one hundred fifty-seven. This is the net total of whatever nomenclature you give them. You can call them files; you can call them papers; you can call them documents; you can call them applications, which are missing. And, the categorical impression, which has been given, is that these are those that were prior to 2004. Some may be prior to 2004, but most of them pertain to the period 2006 to 2009. What is the substance of the charge against the Government? You allocated coal blocks in an arbitrary manner, without charging any consideration; there was an act of nepotism; these were allocated to favourites; important political leaders became name-lenders and rentiers; they became sweat equity holders in the companies that were the beneficiaries. Therefore, those were the companies to whom these coal blocks had been allocated. This is the substance of the charge. And, under the monitoring of the Supreme Court, this is being investigated. Therefore, it is an important matter. That's why we were all constrained to request you, Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, to kindly request the hon. Prime Minister to be present here in this House, when this issue is taken up, so that he may give these clarifications. Now, the magnitude is, there is a fraud on revenue. A large amount of revenue of the Government has been compromised. The court is monitoring this investigation. And, right under the nose of the monitoring court, the subject matter of investigation, that is, the files and the notings disappear. And, this is on the premise that if there is no evidence, there will be no proof of crime. The third attempt is made to mislead the House by saying that everything was prior to 2004. Hon. Prime Minister, if you take the different parameters of what can constitute bad governance – fraud on revenue, contempt of court, breach of privilege and destruction of evidence – every conceivable element of bad governance is present there. On the last occasion, I had pointed out that there is a possibility of contending that there is conflict of interest, And, it is a case that has shaken the conscience of the whole society and we are, now, faced with a situation that the files will not see the light of the day. From the Media reports, which have been appearing, it is evident that those files relate to those very specific cases where names of important functionaries, close to the Government, are involved. Destruction of evidence is a crime. My specific questions, which we had raised the other day and which the courts are also arguing, are: Have you registered

a case? Have you started investigating the case? Have you started booking the guilty people, those who are responsible for this destruction of evidence? Or, you have not started this exercise at all? What steps is the Government taking to make sure that these documents reappear and that this investigation could be carried on to its logical conclusion? The courts will fix the penal responsibility. But who, in the Government, Mr. Prime Minister, is going to take the moral responsibility of this? And, that is precisely why we were constrained to request you, Sir, to request the hon. Prime Minister to be present in the House to answer these questions.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Since we have to take up the The Constitution (One Hundred and Twentieth Amendment) Bill, 2013, clarifications should be brief.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal) : I am sorry, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I only said that it should be brief. That is all.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY : Sir, on the basis of two Statements of the Minister of Coal, we have had one session and round of clarifications, but we are not satisfied with the answers that have come. The Minister of Coal has said that there are in total 199 missing documents. If you add up various categories that he has mentioned, there are 199 missing documents. Of these, there are many files; of these, there are many other documents that he has claimed, but whatever it is, these are missing. At that stage itself, I had raised one point saying that why you have not registered a case. Why is there no FIR? Why are you not moving to have this matter investigated? The answer we got, Sir, was that a Committee has been formed, which will probe as to how these have vanished. Once the Committee report comes, on that basis, we will go and file an FIR. Now, it has been over a week, Sir. Whichever Committee has been formed, whoever is there in that Committee, what has happened to that? Has anything been found from that? If it has not been found, why are you not proceeding with a proper recorded investigation? Why are you not registering a case, in case it is a theft or missing case? The fact that this is not being done increases the bar of suspicion. It increases the bar of suspicion that there is something that has to be hidden. That is very unfortunate in this particular case.

My second point is, last time itself I had raised this issue that these are cases on the basis of which the CAG has given its Reports. The Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General has, actually, revealed a lot of acts of commission and omission in this entire case. There has been a presumptive loss estimated to the tune of Rs.1,86,000 crores. This cannot just go unanswered. Yes, the CBI is investigating

and the court is monitoring, but we, as a Parliament, would have to know how this has happened in the Government. How is it that these documents are missing? Since the CAG has investigated on the basis of these documents itself, last time, I asked directly why you are not procuring it from the CAG. Request the CAG to give you that information. Since it is a Constitutional authority, a request can be made by the Government, so that they can give you that information which is not there in your records today, but they have examined and investigated.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Why is that not being done? Sir, if these are not being done, as I said earlier, Sir, the bar of suspicion keeps rising. Or, what is the degree of complicity? That is not good for the country and the guilty should be identified and punished.

மேலும், அவை (கொள்கலை) : அதற்குள் அப்போது அந்த மூலக் கோரிய படி, அந்த அமைச்சர் அவர்களுக்கு "கொள்கலை" என்று அமைச்சர் அவர்களுக்கு அனுப்பி வைக்கப்பட்டிருந்திருந்தால், அந்த அமைச்சர் அவர்கள் அது பற்றி ஏதாவது ஒரு தர்ப்புகாரம் அளிப்பது மட்டுமே தான் சர்க்காரின் பொறுப்பு. ஆனால், அந்த அமைச்சர் அவர்கள் அது பற்றி ஒரு தர்ப்புகாரம் அளிப்பது மட்டுமே தான் சர்க்காரின் பொறுப்பு. ஆனால், அந்த அமைச்சர் அவர்கள் அது பற்றி ஒரு தர்ப்புகாரம் அளிப்பது மட்டுமே தான் சர்க்காரின் பொறுப்பு. ஆனால், அந்த அமைச்சர் அவர்கள் அது பற்றி ஒரு தர்ப்புகாரம் அளிப்பது மட்டுமே தான் சர்க்காரின் பொறுப்பு.

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, the mystery of missing files in the coal scam is getting murkier day by day. In fact, the Minister of Coal Statement on the first day gave some number. The revised Statement gave another number. When the Government filed an affidavit in the Supreme Court, it gave a different number. According to the information available with me, a total of 257 files are missing. They say that most of the files are from the NDA. According to the information available with me, from 1993 to 2004, 153 files are missing. That means, 104 files are from 2004 to 2009. Precisely, during this period, 103 files are missing. It was the hon. Prime Minister who was the Minister holding charge of coal.

Now, last week, the Prime Minister was unusually aggressive here. He said that he is not the custodian of the missing files. But, at least, he should accept that he is the custodian of the Prime Minister's Office. Now, the CBI has gone to the Supreme Court and said that a Joint Secretary from the Prime Minister's Office,\*

---

\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. *(Interruptions)*... The name is expunged. *(Interruptions)*... Don't mention name.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Okay, I don't take the name. A Joint Secretary had gone to the CBI Office. He sat in his DIG's room; and he has prepared the report. This has been given as an affidavit by the CBI in the Supreme Court. Who was the Joint Secretary who authorized him to go there? Was any investigation done as to how he went there? What action has the Prime Minister taken against the official in his own Office? He is answerable to that. See, as far as 2G is concerned, I can understand his saying that ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, don't bring 2G here.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: ... because of the coalition compulsion, he couldn't act. But here, as far as coal scam is concerned, Mr. Prime Minister, you and you alone are answerable to the country.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Sir, ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. That is all. Yes, Mr. Derek O'Brien. Put the question....*(Interruptions)*... That is all. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN (West Bengal): Just one question, Sir. On the floor of the House last week, the Prime Minister made a statement to say that he is not the custodian of the coal files. My question is: (a) Then, who is the custodian of those coal files? And, (b) To his knowledge when the files went missing, when and where did the files go missing?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: *(Interruptions)*... (3:02:40)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: *(Interruptions)*... (3:02:40)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: *(Interruptions)*... (3:02:40)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sir, ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: *(Interruptions)*... (3:02:40)...

उत्तर प्रदेश के मुख्यमंत्री श्री योगेश्वर प्रसाद यादव ने कहा कि सरकार द्वारा जमा की गई सभी दस्तावेजों का निरीक्षण कर लिया गया है और कुछ दस्तावेजों का खोज जारी है।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay; hon. PM will intervene. The reply will be later.

THE PRIME MINISTER (DR. MANMOHAN SINGH): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, with regard to the so-called missing files or papers pertaining to the on-going investigation into allocation of coal blocks, the House has already seen the detailed clarification offered by the Coal Minister in his Statement of 23rd August. I would like to reemphasize that the Government is making all efforts to locate the papers requisitioned by the CBI, and, at this stage, it would be premature to say that some papers are indeed missing. A vast majority of the papers sought by the CBI have already been handed over to them. However, disregarding the factual position, some Members have gone ahead and drawn their own conclusion that there is something fishy and the Government is hiding something. Hon. Deputy Chairman, Sir, let me assure this august House that the Government has nothing to hide. The fact that more than 1,50,000 pages of documentation have already been handed over to the CBI clearly shows that our intention to facilitate the process of investigation cannot be called into question.

Right from the days the Comptroller and Auditor General began its exercise of performance audit, the Government has always provided its fullest cooperation to the CAG and later, to the CBI. We will continue to do so. If the records in question are indeed found missing, the Government will carry out a thorough investigation and ensure that the guilty are brought to book.

Hon. Deputy Chairman, Sir, the matter of allocation of coal blocks is *sub judice*. The Apex Court of the country is looking into all aspects of these allocations. Moreover, the ongoing investigation by the CBI is being closely monitored by the Apex Court. In its Order dated 29th August, 2013, the Supreme Court has directed that within five days, the CBI shall provide a comprehensive list of documents and records which remain outstanding, and thereafter, within two weeks the Government will hand over the available papers to the CBI. The Government shall follow these directions in letter and spirit and shall do its best to locate and hand over the requisite papers to the CBI within the time-frame stipulated by the Apex Court. If the Government is unable to locate some of those papers within the stipulated time, then, as directed by the hon. Supreme Court, a report will be filed with the CBI for appropriate inquiry and investigation.

In such a situation, Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I urge the hon. Members of this august body not to draw hasty conclusions and let the House continue with its normal business.



MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think, that is over; that's all. Now, we will take up...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (Bihar): Sir, are files between 2006-09 missing or not? ...*(Interruptions)*... That was the period when you were the Coal Minister, hon. Prime Minister. That is the simple question that we are asking. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:.....*(Interruptions)*...please sit down,. ...*(Interruptions)*...  
...no.... no ....*(interruptions)* ...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka): Sir, not even one question has been answered. ...*(Interruptions)*... Not even one query has been answered. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... That is all. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, Legislative Business. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: \*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Legislative Business. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, not even one query has been answered. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us take up Legislative Business. ...*(Interruptions)*... Don't you want to...*(Interruptions)*... Please, take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: \*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no...*(Interruptions)*... That is expunged. What Dr. Maitreyan says is expunged. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no. That is expunged. ...*(Interruptions)*... ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*...

---

\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, not even one question has been answered. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The hon. Prime Minister came; he replied and now you must cooperate. ...*(Interruptions)*... That was your demand. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, Mr. Maitreyan. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, he did not reply. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, Mr. Maitreyan. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is for the Prime Minister to reply to what he wants. He cannot reply to satisfy you. ...*(Interruptions)*... He can only reply what he can...*(Interruptions)*... I will have to adjourn the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... Listen to the Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, listen to the Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, the Minister here has said that the reply would come from the Coal Minister. So, let the Coal Minister reply. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You wanted the Prime Minister to come and reply. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the Minister here has said that the reply would come from the Coal Minister. So, let the Coal Minister reply. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has come and replied. What more do you want? ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, please cooperate. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: He has gone to the Lok Sabha for the same statement. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, he has not answered even one question. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please cooperate. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is not fair. ...*(Interruptions)*... You cannot expect the Prime Minister to say what you want? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: Your queries will be answered by the Coal Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: He should...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has replied according to his information. He said what he had to say. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: They wanted the Prime Minister to be here. He has given it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, he has said that the Coal Minister would answer. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Allow the Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*... Why don't you listen to the Minister? ...*(Interruptions)*... What do you want?...*(Interruptions)*... One of you may speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... What do you want? ...*(Interruptions)*... One of you speaks. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAI AH NAIDU: We don't want to hear anything from the Parliamentary Affairs Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*... Questions were raised by the Leader of the Opposition and questions were raised by other Members; not even one question is answered. ...*(Interruptions)*... He is totally escaping. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is your observation. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will be forced to adjourn the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... This demand is a not justifiable demand. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Prime Minister came and replied. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will be forced to adjourn. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: He did not reply to our questions. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't you want the Bill to be taken up? ...*(Interruptions)*... What can I do? ...*(Interruptions)*... I will allow you. ...*(Interruptions)*...  
†00 »000 05k.....(30000) ... Ravi Shankarji, what is your point?

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, my point is very simple. What the hon. Leader of the Opposition and other Members stated is that this massive scam is agitating the people of the country and also the image of India. The Supreme Court is monitoring. We had requested the Prime Minister to come with replies to our specific queries. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He replied. ...*(Interruptions)*... What do you want?  
...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Not even a single question is replied.  
...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: He did not reply to our questions. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Now, we are being told that our concerns about Prime Minister's statement shall be addressed by the Coal Minister. Is it the new procedure? That is what Mr. Shukla is saying. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now you listen to Parliamentary Affairs Minister.  
...*(Interruptions)*... I allow him. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: He did not reply to our questions. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sir, the Prime Minister can only reply according to his version. ...*(Interruptions)*... He cannot reply according to your version.  
...*(Interruptions)*... Don't expect that. ...*(Interruptions)*... Your demand is not justifiable.  
...*(Interruptions)*... It is not a reasonable demand. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: The Prime Minister intervened in the matter.  
...*(Interruptions)*... Now all the queries will be replied by the Coal Minister.  
...*(Interruptions)*... What more they want? ...*(Interruptions)*... The Prime Minister has to come to this House. ...*(Interruptions)*... He has gone to Lok Sabha to make the statement. ...*(Interruptions)*... They are demanding Statement there. ...*(Interruptions)*... He has gone to Lok Sabha. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned to meet at 2.00 P.M.

The House then adjourned at forty-eight minutes past twelve of the clock.

The House reassembled at two of the clock,

[MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair].

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Constitution (One Hundred and Twentieth Amendment) Bill...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, unless the PM comes here to explain all the questions raised by the Opposition, there is no meaning in running this House. We want the Prime Minister to come back.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, the Prime Minister has explained.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: No, he has not explained. Why do you take the blame? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: Sir, the Prime Minister only intervened. ...*(Interruptions)*... Did Vajpayeeji come several times like this? ...*(Interruptions)*... Every now and then, you ask for...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: He has totally...*(Interruptions)*... He was totally evasive. He has run away from the debate. There is no explanation at all. We want the Prime Minister to come back and answer all the queries to the satisfaction of the House.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: See, it is on your request that the Prime Minister came and he made a Statement and replied. What version he should give is not my job. He gave his version. He may not have satisfied you. What can the Chair do for that? If it is not satisfactory for you, what can the Chair do for that? I cannot do anything.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, we have got the highest regard for you in the Chair. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But, what can the Chair do in this?

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Just a minute. We had sought accountability from the Prime Minister, not *pro forma* answers. Therefore, the hon. LoP had asked question. The Prime Minister was duty-bound to answer about the biggest scam of independent India. Instead of saying that, he said, "It is hypothetical." The Supreme Court had said that FIR ought to be lodged. Sorry, it was evasive.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He can tell only his version. He cannot tell your version. What can I do? ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: But, he should tell the true version. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, what can I do?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: (Interruptions): Sir, what can I do for you? ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: (Interruptions): Sir, what can I do for you? ... (Interruptions) ... Sir, what can I do for you? ... (Interruptions) ... Sir, what can I do for you? ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Ravi Shankar Prasadji, it is on your request that the Prime Minister came here. How can you expect the Prime Minister to say what you want to hear? You cannot expect that.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: I am sorry, Sir, as the Deputy Chairman, you should not say that. ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Can I ask the Prime Minister to reply in a particular way? ... (Interruptions) ...

THE MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY AND THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI KAPIL SIBAL): You sit down. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: You cannot speak like this. ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; please sit down. ... (Interruptions) ... The House is adjourned for 15 minutes.

The House then adjourned at three minutes past two of the clock.

The House reassembled at eighteen minutes past two of the clock

[MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair].

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Legislative Business. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, without the Prime Minister coming here, nothing will... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us take up The Constitution (One Hundred and Twentieth Amendment) Bill, 2013. *..(Interruptions)..* The Judicial Appointments Commission Bill, 2013. *..(Interruptions)..*

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the entire country is agitated. *..(Interruptions)..* An amount of Rs. 1,84,000 crore is not an ordinary amount. If the Parliament.. *..(Interruptions)..*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is over. *..(Interruptions)..* It has been discussed. *..(Interruptions)..* Clarifications are over.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the files are over. *..(Interruptions)..* The scam is over. *..(Interruptions)..* The scandal is over. *..(Interruptions)..*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Prime Minister has replied on your own demand.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, the Prime Minister has not... *..(Interruptions)..*

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, the clarifications sought... *..(Interruptions)..*

~~SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the clarifications sought... ..(Interruptions)..~~

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I request the Deputy Chairman not to come to the rescue of the Government. *..(Interruptions)..*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not rescuing anybody. *..(Interruptions)..* How can I rescue anybody?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Please leave it between us and the Government. *..(Interruptions)..*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What can I do? You tell me. *..(Interruptions)..* What can I do? *..(Interruptions)..*

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Please direct the Government to bring the Prime Minister. *..(Interruptions)..*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is why the Prime Minister came and replied. *..(Interruptions)..* That is how the Prime Minister came and replied on your own demand. *..(Interruptions)..*

DR. V. MAITREYAN: But he did not clarify... ..(Interruptions)..

ശ്രീ വി. മൈത്രേയൻ: ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, our questions have not been.. ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not my job to ask the Prime Minister to reply in a particular way. ..(Interruptions)..

ശ്രീ രവി ശങ്കർ പ്രസാദ്: ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: See, Venkaiahji, please. ..(Interruptions).. Venkaiahji, please. Venkaiahji, as Deputy Chairman, I cannot ask the hon. Prime Minister or the Leader of the Opposition or, for that matter, any Member of this House to say or speak in a particular way. It is up to them. You wanted the hon. Prime Minister to come and give reply to the clarifications. Hon. Prime Minister came and replied. What more can I do? ..(Interruptions).. What more can I do? ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I will only urge upon the Chair please allow us to have our say. Let the Government respond simply because the Prime Minister came and said something without answering any of the queries raised by the Leader of the Opposition and Members of the other parties. ..(Interruptions).. Please bear with me. The Supreme Court is monitoring the case. One Minister has to resign and then files are missing.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We have discussed this umpteen times.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: What did we discuss? What is the meaning of discussing? Where is the reply? ..(Interruptions).. There is no reply. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: Sir, I will respond. ..(Interruptions).. I will respond to the Chairman. ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, listen to the Minister. ..(Interruptions).. Why don't you listen to the Minister? ..(Interruptions).. Let us hear the Minister. ..(Interruptions).. Please cooperate. ..(Interruptions).. Let us hear the Minister. ..(Interruptions).. Please. ..(Interruptions)..



SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: Sir, the Prime Minister came thrice. *..(Interruptions)..* He was supposed to intervene, and he intervened. *..(Interruptions)..* Now, the clarifications which they want to seek, the Coal Minister is there to respond to those clarifications. *..(Interruptions)..* So, we are not shying away or trying to hide or conceal anything. *..(Interruptions)..* They are trying to take undue political advantage. *..(Interruptions)..* The Prime Minister responded thrice. Now, their clarifications will be responded by the Coal Minister. *..(Interruptions)..* The Coal Minister will respond to the clarifications. *..(Interruptions)..*†²º ²ºV00†<?...*(शुद्धी)*...•0A0e µ0V0ü 0V00V0,ü 00»00ü0 A0e.*(शुद्धी)*...µ0V0ü 00»00ü0eµü Aü...*(शुद्धी)*...†0ü0ü ¾µ0V00ü ü »0ü0<...*(शुद्धी)*...µ0V0ü 00»00ü0eµü Aü µ00 0V00V0,ü 00»00ü0 A0P...*(शुद्धी)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What do I do? *..(Interruptions)..*

A0B, 0-0B0, 0E>0: Y000 Ü0B 000ü0V0?00-00,ü ²º000, ü00 Aü...*(शुद्धी)*...Eµ00 A0A0=ü <A0e 0»0V0B A0P...*(शुद्धी)*...A0A0=ü Üü0\* ¾0-000 Üü,ü,ü 0EB Aü...*(शुद्धी)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned up to 3.00 p.m.

The House then adjourned at twenty two minutes past two of the clock.

The House re-assembled at three of the clock.

[MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.]

A0B 0ü0, 0-0B0, 0E>0 (0V00, 0A0M): A0,ü A0A0B 0 Üü0eµü 0e ±ü0†»0 e0e0e Ü0 »0< A0,ü0ü,ü Üü0e •00e ¾0EY0 »µ00 Aü ¾0Eü †0-0 0ü00 ²º-0e Y00ü Üü0 Aü...*(शुद्धी)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, there is no meaning in running the House like this. *...(Interruptions)...* Will the Government come back to the House and respond in a satisfactory manner? *...(Interruptions)...* Let the Government come back and explain it to the House. *...(Interruptions)...*

A0B, 0-0B0, 0E>0: A0,ü †A00ü0e ¾0»0ü0»0 0V00 00000 "00-A0k... µ0e »0000 <A0e A0B 0000 Üü,ü,ü 0EB Aü...*(शुद्धी)*...0-000 00B •0B ²0ü0000 »0 "00ü0 Aü...*(शुद्धी)*...0-000 00B •0B 0e-0,ü0e ²0ü0000 0V00 »00e...*(शुद्धी)*...µ0V0ü †000ü •0000e Üü0 ¾0M0'00,ü Aü...*(शुद्धी)*...†000e •0000e Ü0 ¾0M0'00,ü Üü0e.*(शुद्धी)*...

\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't you want the Constitution Amendment Bill to be taken up? ...(*Interruptions*)... The House is adjourned to meet at 11.00 A.M. on Wednesday, the 4th September 2013.

The House then adjourned at two minutes past three of the clock till eleven of the clock on Wednesday, the 4th September, 2013.