Vol. 229 No. 16



Monday 2 September, 2013 11 Bhadra, 1935 (Saka)

PARLIAMENTARY DEBATES

RAJYA SABHA

OFFICIAL REPORT

CONTENTS

Messages from Lok Sabha-

Right to Fair Compensation and Transparency in Land Acquisition, Rehabilitation and Resettlement Bill, 2013 – *Laid on the Table* (page 1)

The National Highways Authority of India (Amendment) Bill, 2013 – Reported (page 141)

Re. Hike in Petrol and Diesel prices (pages 1-9 & 39-44)

Withdrawal of Members (pages 9-10)

Matters raised with permission-

Incidents of child marriage in Kerala (pages 11-13)

Attack on 35 Indian fishermen and their arrest by Sri Lankan Navy (pages 13-16)

Non-fulfilment of the assurances given by the Government after Kishtwar incident (pages 16-20)

[P.T.O.

 \odot

RAJYA SABHA SECRETARIAT NEW DELHI

PRICE : Rs. 50.00

Establishment of a separate bench of the Allahabad High Court in Western Uttar Pradesh (pages 21-22)

Hike in the prices of petrol and diesel for the sixth time in this year (pages 22-27)

Retrieval of Katchatheevu and the recent stand of UPA Government on it (pages 27-29)

Outbreak of Dengue in Guwahati and other parts of Assam (pages 29-31)

Shutting down of petrol pumps at night in view of falling rupee and rising international crude oil prices (pages 31-32)

Relaxation in age for appearing in Civil Services Examination (pages 32-33)

Need for PM's statement on coal scam in the light of Supreme Court's observation (pages 33-36)

Special Mentions - Laid on the Table

Demand to make a uniform policy for increase in toll rates on National Highways in the country (pages 36-37)

Demand to take steps to provide adequate facilities to tourists for development of tourism in Andaman and Nicobar (pages 37-38)

Demand to give compensation and waiving of crop loans to farmers of Karnataka (pages 38)

Demand to take effective measures for smooth disbursement of loans under Kissan Credit Cards scheme to farmers in Assam (pages 38-39)

Web-site Address : http://rajyasabha.nic.in

http://parliamentofindia.nic.in

E-mail Address : rsedit-e@sansad.nic.in

- Demand for proper implementation of the Integrated Action Plan for development of naxal affected districts in Bihar (page 362)
- Demand for mandatory attestation of documents by Gazetted officer or Notary Public for obtaining connections by mobile subscribers in the country (pages 362-363)
- Demand for moratorium on interest and payment of debt of the State of West Bengal (pages 363-364)
- Demand to take steps to ensure adequate utilization of allocated funds to provide relief to victims of rape in the country (pages 364)
- Demand to frame a national policy to ensure compliance of standards of quality and safety in construction of buildings in country (pages 364-365)
- Statutory Resolution disapproving the National Food Security Ordinance (No. 7 of 2013) *Negatived*

And

The National Food Security Bill, 2013 - Passed (pages 44-362)

Published under Rule 260 of Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business In the Council of States (Rajya Sabha) and Printed by Printograph, Karol Bagh, New Delhi-110005

RAJYA SABHA

Monday, 2nd September, 2013/11 Bhadra, 1935 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock, MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

MESSAGE FROM LOK SABHA

The Right to Fair Compensation and Transparency in Land Acquisition, Rehabilitation and Resettlement Bill, 2013

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Sir, I have to report to the House the following message received from the Lok Sabha, signed by the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha:-

"In accordance with the provisions of rule 96 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to enclose the Right to Fair Compensation and Transparency in Land Acquisition, Rehabilitation and Resettlement Bill, 2013, as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 29th August, 2013."

Sir, I lay a copy of the Bill on the Table.

Re. Hike in Petrol and Diesel Prices

MR. CHAIRMAN: We shall now take up matters...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka): I have a point of order. It is very important.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just a minute, please. We are now taking up Zero Hour.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Before going into that, 34000AE0 00 00 100 Au.

I would like to bring to your notice that the other day the Leader of the Opposition was speaking on the economy and the hon. Prime Minister was responding, subsequently we were told by the media that the Rajya Sabha Secretariat had informed the media that such and such portions of Shri Arun Jaitley's speech had been deleted, and that the media should not carry those portions in their news coverage.

This has never happened in the history of this House. I am surprised.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Who has told the media?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Hundreds of messages were sent...

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is a...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Just a minute, Sir. It is a question of the entire House. I am not naming anybody.

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Hundreds of messages have been sent saying that this particular portion has been deleted. Subsequently, after the lapse of so much time, another message about the Prime Minister was also sent saying that one word has been deleted.

I would like to know from the Chair how this has happened, who is responsible for this. And how can anybody inform the media directly without issuing the Bulletin?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Did the messages emanate from the House?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Not from the House; from the Secretariat of Rajya Sabha. The Secretariat of Rajya Sabha is a part of the House.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Well, if it is a matter of the Secretariat, we will have it looked into. That's all.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, this has to be taken seriously.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. We can't discuss the Secretariat here. We will have it looked into.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I agree with you. I don't want to discuss in the House the functioning of the Secretariat. But, at the same time, it is my bounden duty to bring to the notice of the Chair, and also to the notice of the entire House, what is happening in this House, in the name of this House, and how these things can happen. If it can happen in the case of the Leader of the Opposition, then, what about the ordinary Member?

MR. CHAIRMAN: We shall have it looked into. You have raised a point. Okay, now.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (Bihar): Sir ...(Interruptions)...

It is very important, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN (West Bengal): Sir...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. ...(Interruptions)... Please. ...(Interruptions)... Does everybody have to ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, there is a sanctity of the proceedings of the House going live all over the country. What the hon. Prime Minister said went live; what the hon. LoP said went live. It was strictly a political issue. Thereafter, at that point in time, the hon. Chair did not do anything. There were no protests from that side or this side on the issue. And, suddenly, it is deleted! ...(Interruptions)... It is a wrong tradition, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please ...(Interruptions)... Look, why are we ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: It is a wrong tradition. And we know it for sure that the Secretariat had rung up television channels saying, "Don't show it."

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: We have been told, Sir. We are saying this before the House that it is grossly inappropriate. That is what we are saying.

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, the procedure for deletion of any Member's speech is that the speech is brought to the Chair and the Chair deletes it and puts its signature. Has that process been adhered to?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Look, there is a standard process, Najmaji. You know it very well that any...

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: I am sorry, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: All the media had shown that it was deleted. How was it deleted? That is what I am asking. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One, two, three! Can three speak simultaneously? ...(Interruptions)... Please.

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, the procedure which you just talked about, is that anything that has to be deleted, the Chair has to delete it and put its signature.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, I am aware of that. We will check the records and satisfy ourselves on that. That's all.

We take up matters...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, the diesel price...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I know you have given a Notice. We will take it up...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, the diesel and petrol price hike...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Look, if you don't want Zero Hour to be taken up, we will go to the rest of the business.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, this issue is now affecting everybody.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. O'Brien, please. You have given a Notice for Zero Hour.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, the diesel and petrol price hike which is happening now, is going to happen again. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, this should be taken up first, before any other business. ...(Interruptions)... This has to be taken up before any other business is taken up, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: If the House does not wish to take up Zero Hour, so be it. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE (West Bengal): Sir...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Will you allow your colleagues to take up Zero Hour?

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, this has to be taken up first. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have given a Notice for Zero Hour.

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE: I gave a Notice, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay, fine. Your turn will come. ...(Interruptions)... Let the Zero Hour start. ...(Interruptions)... one person at a time. ...(Interruptions)...

Let the Zero Hour start. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, petroleum price hike is a burning issue. ...(Interruptions)... When the House is in session, ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One person at a time.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY (West Bengal): Sir, the petroleum price hike issue should be taken up first. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I have a solution. The Zero Hour can start with petroleum price hike issue. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no; there is a procedure for Zero Hour. The names are listed as they are received. ...(Interruptions)... No, no; please. Venkaiahji, this argument can work 365 days of the year. Let us stick to the procedure we have... ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE: Sir, my notice is there for the Zero Hour. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, we have given a notice for Zero Hour to discuss the hike in petroleum prices. Let it be taken up first. That is our appeal to you. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. Look, we take up Zero Hour issues as per the list.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: That is our appeal to you because that is the burning issue. It is affecting the entire nation. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Look, everybody will have the same argument.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: The Government has declared a war against the people. That should be taken up first. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just a minute; just a minute, please. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, this is our appeal to you. This issue should be taken up first. We have given the notice for that. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Every hon. Member has the wish to have his or her item prioritized. ...(Interruptions)... We are simply going by a list before the Chair. ...(Interruptions)... If you don't want Zero Hour, there will be no Zero Hour. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: It is people's issue. It affects the entire nation.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Naturally....(Interruptions)...Why can't we... ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE: Sir, when Parliament is in session... ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, please take up diesel price hike. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: It cannot be done in this manner. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, that is why I made an appeal, Sir. ...(Interruptions)... This is not an issue of this party or that party... ...(Interruptions)... It is a national issue. When the Parliament is in session, the hike has been announced outside!

MR. CHAIRMAN: Venkaiahji, do we follow a procedure or we don't follow a procedure?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: And now there is a wonderful proposal that the petrol pumps should be closed in the night. ...(Interruptions)... I don't know who gave this idea. So, we have to discuss it. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Look, you can express your views on all subjects. But please do it in an orderly manner. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, when the House is in session, the announcements are made outside. ...(Interruptions)... What is this, Sir?

ÁÖB ÁÖPÖDÖNÖ 30040 †ÖÖÜLÜE •ÖBŞÜE †ÖDÖŞÜ "ÖÖNEÜK, [©]ÖLEĞ "ÖÖNEÜK?

ÁÖB - ÖLÖÖÖÖ "Ö"VE ÖE "ÖÖAEÜK...

ÁÖB ÝÖ, ĢÖ †ÝÜÐÖ>Ö (^¢Ö, ü ^{*}Ö¤ÐÖ) : "ÖÖÆÜk...

ÁOB ĀŪTŪŪŪVŪ ŸŪŒ ×±ú¸ü ÆŪ¯ĀÖ ŪŪŒ "Ů»ÕŒ ¤**6⊷**Ö<......(¾ΦΦΦΦŪ••)...•Ūs¸ŪŒ †OΦ¸ü "ѾÆŪk μѾ •ŪÆŪ "ѾÆŪk?

ÁÖS TÖ, ŘÍO TÝTŘÁDAÖ "TÖVÁTÍK.... TÖÖ TÖPT**Ö**BÖÖ TÖ, Ü > 8°Ö, ÖÖ ÜÉ ×ÖÖÖ ZÖDETÇÜ ZÖRÖ ×ÖÖE ÆT**I...(340%-ÖFT)...**

MR. CHAIRMAN: If there is bedlam, there can't be Zero Hour. ... (Interruptions)...

<Ûú YÖÐÖB¸ü ĀÖKÖĞ»Ö ÆÜ. ÖÖ †ÖÖ ĀĞE ‡ŸÖ₹Ö ÆB ÛúÆBÉÖÖ ×Ûú †ÖÖ •ÖB¸ÜE †ÖKÖ¸Ü »ÜE ¸ÆE ÆŢ, †ÖÖ ^ÃÜE ™ÐÚĿ†~Ö Ûú,E. ÆÜÖ »ÖÖÄÖ ^₹ŎÚÁ ÃÖÜEÖ ÆÜ.

AB AGO CHO: μΌτι ΜΕ ΑΦΟΤΙ 2010 × μῦ Μμῦ Νού what are the subjects which will be taken up in Zero Hour. Everybody knows about it. ...(Interruptions)...

ÁĞB ÇÖŞÖ †YÜZÖÖÖ : •ÜBŞÜE †ÖXÖŞÜ TÖDÖÜŞÜ'B TÜE »ÜE »ÜS•Ö<......(34ÖĞ-ÖÖĞ)...

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE: Sir, I have also given a notice. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, this issue must not be diluted with other issues.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: We are with you.(Interruptions).....

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am sorry; I can't do anything about it. We have an established practice. ...(Interruptions)... No banners in the House, please. ...(Interruptions)... No banners in the House. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, when the House is in session, these announcements were made outside the House on Saturday night. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shall we take up the Zero Hour or not? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, we want Zero Hour. ...(Interruptions)... But the Zero Hour should be in a particular order. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, we want Zero Hour. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned for 15 minutes.

The House then adjourned at nine minutes past eleven of the clock.

The House reassembled at twenty-three minutes past eleven of the clock,

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, admitted Zero Hour submissions. ... (Interruptions)...

ÁÖB **ÚÁ ÁÖB. ŸhÖÖYÖB** (¾ÖÆÖ¸)) : ÁÖ¸Ü "ÖÖ¸Ü ¾ÖÖ¸Ü ÁÖE ÆŬŐÖ¸Ö ¾ÄÄQHÖ...**(¾ÖXÄ-ÖFÖ)...**

SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY (Andhra Pradesh): We have been raising the issue of Andhra Pradesh.(Interruptions)....

AGB ~ TAPTION : † 00 20 Sik ~ NB-0...(402-07)... NOTION ... Don't display posters. ...(Interruptions)... Venkaiahji, the House is supreme. If the House is of that view, I have no problem. But the House should agree to it. It is only a change of order. ...(Interruptions)... But let me see if it is allowed. ...(Interruptions)... Let me see if it is allowed at all. ...(Interruptions)... What is the difference in going by the order? ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: All the ten Zero Hour submissions should be completed then. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You understood the problem.(Interruptions).... Let me go by this. ...(Interruptions)... Let me go by the order in which they have been admitted by the Chairman. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: We appeal and we leave it to the wisdom of the Chair and the Ruling Party. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is my request to you. I am coming to your point. The point is, Venkaiahji has made a suggestion. I have understood the point. We are allowing all the 10 Zero Hour mentions. If the House is patient enough, we can allow all the 10 Zero Hour mentions, and especially, on this particular subject, I can allow those who want to associate to associate also. Now, Shri M.P. Achuthan.(Interruptions)....

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, what about the diesel hike? Will it be taken up first or not?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Roy, let me finish Zero Hour.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, our appeal is that let all the Zero Hour mentions be taken up.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, we are taking up all the Zero Hour mentions.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: But the hike in diesel price should be taken up first.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. I have given the ruling.(Interruptions)....

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: If our request is turned down, then we are making a silent protest.(Interruptions)....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please. I said that with regard to hike in petrol price, I would allow those who want to associate to associate.(Interruptions).... I have said that.(Interruptions)....

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, we are not disturbing the House.(Interruptions)....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You know that this kind of papers should not be exhibited.(Interruptions).... Banners should not be exhibited. Please, you are a senior Member. Don't do that.(Interruptions).... Please don't display this kind of posters.(Interruptions).... This is against the rule.(Interruptions).... Shri M.P. Achuthan, you can speak.(Interruptions).... You speak loudly.(Interruptions).... We have to put up with this.(Interruptions)....

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN (Kerala): Sir, my Zero Hour mention is about....(Interruptions)....

WITHDRAWAL OF MEMBERS

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: See, Zero Hour is Members' right. Why do you obstruct that? It is Members' right. ...(Interruptions)... I am asking you.(Interruptions).... Mr. Ramesh, you should apply your mind.(Interruptions).... I am telling you that Zero Hour is Members' right(Interruptions)..... You are not creating any problem to the Government by obstructing Zero Hour.(Interruptions).... I am telling you. You are only obstructing the right of the Members whose support you want.(Interruptions).... See, you want the support of the MPs. Why do you object to theirs?(Interruptions).... Please, allow the Zero Hour.(Interruptions).... After that, we will decide.(Interruptions).... Do you think that the Government is unhappy if Zero Hour is not mentioned?(Interruptions).... The Government is not unhappy.

.....(Interruptions).... The Government is not going to lose anything.(Interruptions).... You understand. ...(Interruptions)... That is what I am saying.(Interruptions).... Then, why do you obstruct Zero Hour which is a right of the Members?(Interruptions).... You meet me and discuss during the lunch break. ...(Interruptions). We will do.(Interruptions).... I will suggest something.(Interruptions).... You come.(Interruptions).... Why do you object to Zero Hour. ...(Interruptions)... I will give you time.(Interruptions).... After these 10 Zero Hour mentions are over, I will give you three minutes time. Go to your seats.(Interruptions).... Why Mr. Ramesh?(Interruptions).... What benefit are you getting out of this?(Interruptions).... You are simply wasting your time and also time of everybody.(Interruptions).... Please go to your seats.(Interruptions).... Go to your seats.(Interruptions).... Why do you want me to take action against you every day? ...(Interruptions)... Why do you want me to take action? ... (Interruptions)... I am requesting Shri Ramesh and Shri Chowdary to please go to their seats. ... (Interruptions)... Please. Please go to your seats. ...(Interruptions)... Please. Please go to your seats. ...(Interruptions)... I will invoke Rule 255. ...(Interruptions)... Please. Please. ...(Interruptions)... Please. It is my request. ...(Interruptions)... Please. ...(Interruptions)... Please. ...(Interruptions)... This is no solution. ...(Interruptions)... What you are doing is no solution. ...(Interruptions)... What you are doing is no solution. ... (Interruptions)...

Hon. Members, I am going to read Rule 255. It says, "The Chairman may direct any Member whose conduct is in his opinion grossly disorderly to withdraw immediately from the Council and any Member so ordered to withdraw shall do so forthwith and shall absent himself during the remainder of the day's meeting." ...(Interruptions)... I am invoking Rule 255. ...(Interruptions)... Under the authority conferred on me by this Rule 255, I am directing Shri Ramesh and Shri Chowdary to withdraw from the House immediately. ...(Interruptions)... Please vacate the House immediately. The House is adjourned for 15 minutes.

The House then adjourned at thirty-three minutes past eleven of the clock.

The House re-assembled at forty-seven minutes past eleven of the clock,

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Zero Hour. Shri M.P. Achuthan.

Incidents of child marriage in Kerala

[2 September, 2013]

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN (Kerala): Sir, child marriage is illegal in our country, but in reality, the practice of child marriages still continues in many parts of India. Even in a State like Kerala, with a high literacy rate and social awareness, child marriages take place. According to the State Social Welfare Department, in 2009-10, nearly 4,000 child marriages took place in just one district of Kerala. The latest incident of child marriage in Kerala involves a UAE citizen. Some decades ago, many men from the Gulf countries used to come to Kerala and marry the girls there. It was known as Arabi Kalyanam in Kerala, which meant Arabic marriages. The experience in most of the cases has been tragic. Usually, the bridegroom, after some months, goes back and terminates the relationship. Still, there is a general awareness about this and during the last few years there has been a significant decrease in such marriages. Though this has been the general situation, isolated cases do occur and on 13th June this year, a UAE national by the name Jasem Mohammed Abdul Karim Abdulahmed married a seventeen-year old girl in Kozhikode from an orphanage. The girl was very poor and resided in an orphanage. After 17 days of travelling all over the State, staying in hotels and resorts, the guy went back and after he left India, he divorced the girl through triple talaq over phone.

The State Government has registered a case and arrested some people and is taking action. But the problem is that the prime accused in this case is a UAE national. So, you have to get him back to Kerala to face the legal proceedings. I think the UAE and India have extradition treaty. By using the provisions of this treaty, the Union Government must take action to bring him back to Kerala to face the trial.

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, I want to associate with it because the other day when I was speaking on the Divorce Bill, I had mentioned that the Government should bring a legislation for the protection of Muslim women also. It is these kinds of things that are happening which we have to take care of and I had requested the Law Minister to bring a legislation. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

SHRI D. RAJA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

DR. M.S. GILL (Punjab): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

SHRI D. BANDYOPADHYAY (West Bengal): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

SHRI P. KANNAN (Puduchery): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

ÁÖS ¸Õ'Ö Ūσ'ÖÖ>Ö μÖÖ¤ðÖ (¾ÖEÖ¸) : "ÖÆÖ®ÿÖ, "Ö †"Ö®Ö †Ö'ÖÜÜE ‡ÃÖ ¾ÕÄеÖ ÃÜE ÃÖ'²Ö' ü Ūú¸ÜÖÖ ÆÓE.

ÁCÍS ^{QO}, gÖ †ÝŒÃĎ>Ö (^¢Ö¸ü ¯Œ**qĕ)**) : ΌŒΦŒPÜÖ, 'Ö †Ö®E †ÖÖÛuÜE ‡ÃÖ ¾ÃÂÇÃÖ ÃÜE ÃÖ²Ö 'Ü Ûú¸ÜÜÖ ÆÓE.

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

ÁÔB † ¡ʁชื่⊅™น Đố CÔ , u ĐÃ ÔE U (^¢Ô , u ¯Ô™**ệ ()** : ÔE Ô® piÔ, ´Ô † Ô® † Ô ÔÔ LÔE ‡ÃÔ ¾Ã QÃÔ ÃŨE ÃÔ ~Ô `` u Đú , viÔ AE NE.

DR. T.N. SEEMA (Kerala): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

SHRIMATI T. RATNA BAI (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

ÁÔS †Ö-ÖÖÐÚ «ΫΫΧΟ) 6 (^¢Ö¸ü ¯Ö+@Ď) : ΌΑΕΘΕ•μΌ, 'Ö †¯ÖΦΕ †ÖÖÖLÜE ‡ÃÖ «ΧΟΦΦΟ ÃΘΕ ÃÖ°2Ö ¨ü ŪÚ¸ÜÖÖ ÆDE.

ÁÔB 'ŒŒŭ'Ö¤ü;ÜĿūB (°ִܜ †Ö¸ü Ūú;ÖB¸)) : "ΘŒŪœÿÖ, "Ö †Ö®E †ÖÖÛûÊ ‡ÃÖ ¾ÕÜÜÖ ÃÜE ÃÖ²Ö`ü Ūú,åÖÖ ÆÐE.

† سمبدّھ کرتا ہوں۔ جناب محمد شفیع (جموں اور کشمیر) : مہودے، میں اپنے آپ کو اس وشے سے

[†]Transliteration in Urdu Script..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The whole House associates. ...(Interruptions)...

Attack on 35 Indian fishermen and their arrest by Sri Lankan Navy

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I wish to bring to the attention of the Government a problem which we have brought again and again before the Government, and I cannot remember how many times this issue has been raised in Parliament and in this House also. The issue related to the arrest and detention of 194 Indian fishermen by the Sri Lankan Navy in the past few weeks. We are left with no other option but to come back to this House to raise this issue. On 31st July, 65 fishermen were arrested by Sri Lankan Navy for crossing the maritime boundary. The very next day, on 1st August, 74 fishermen from Nagapattinam were arrested by the Sri Lankan Navy and they had been remanded in Trincomalee. Further on 3rd August, another 20 fishermen from Rameshwaram were arrested by Sri Lankan Navy. Again, on 26th August, 35 fishermen were taken into custody by Sri Lankan Navy. In those few days, a total of 194 fishermen have been taken into custody by the Sri Lankan Navy and there are already 25 fishermen languishing in Anuradhapuram jail in Sri Lanka on false charges. I wish to remind the Minister of the plight of five fishermen from Thangachimadam who have been kept in Sri Lankan jail since November, 2011, over twenty months, without trial and after the hearings were adjourned twenty-five times. The waters between India and Sri Lanka around Katchatheevu have been traditional fishing areas for our fishermen from time immemorial, and crossing the international maritime boundary cannot be a statutory offence.

Sir, with this background in mind, I remind the Government that in the past, hundreds of fishermen have been shot at and hurt and even killed. And their families haven't got an answer or any justice till today. I would like to remind this and also express our feelings to the Central Government which has filed an affidavit in the Supreme Court which would adversely affect the lives of our fishermen forever. The Tamil Nadu Government has filed a petition seeking to declare the Agreements between 1974 and 1976 as unconstitutional between New Delhi and Colombo regarding Katchatheevu. Our leader, Dr. Kalaignar Karunanidhi, has also described this affidavit as highly condemnable ...(Interruptions)... *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your time is over. ...(Interruptions)... It is not going on record. ...(Interruptions)... After three minutes, it won't go on record. ...(Interruptions)...

^{*}Not recorded.

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

SHRI D. RAJA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (Bihar): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

ÁΟΒ 20-Q2Ö -ÖÜSÂDÚ (↑¢Ő¸ü -ÖÞQEÖ) : "ÖÆÜB÷μÖ, "Ö †-ÖΦE †ÖÖDÜE ‡ÃÖ ¾ÃÑΦÖ ÃÜE ÃÖ 2Ö''ü DÚ¸ÑÖÖ ÆÉE.

ÁÔB £ÔĐÂ, ũ "ΘΦὰ ΫΟΤΕΙΝΟΘΌ ("Θτρό τοθ=φί) : Ο ΦΕΟΘ=μό, το †το ΦΕ †ο Ο Ο Ο Ο ΦΕ ‡ÃΟ ×ΑΘΑμό ÃΘΕ ÃΟ 20 το Ο Δο ΔΕ. Æ ΘΕ.

SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

SHRIMATI T. RATNA BAI (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, I also associate with the submission made by hon. Member.

ÁÓB 20ÃÜĐÃO, Θ-O TÜR™N-Ö (ΟὐΡΟΟΨΟὐν) : ΌΕΙΦΕΨΙΟ, 'ČI † "ŌΦΕ †Ö ΟΟἰΦΕ ‡ÃΟ «ΑΠΟμΟ ΑΘΕ ΑΟ 20'' Ü Οὐ, ΔΌΟ ÆLE.

ÁÔB • QÃO ˙ΟŪΛΦ, Ö ΦΟ ΦΡΟ ΦΑΘΕΨΙ (-ΟΟ ΦΟ Φ) : ΄ΘΕΦΕΨΙΟ, ΄Ο † ˙ΘΦΕ †Ο ΟΟΛΦΕ ‡ÃΟ ¾ΦΑΦΟ ĀΘΕ ĀΘ 2Θ ˙ Ψ Ο Μ. ἀΘΟ ΑΕΦΕ.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: After three minutes, it will not go on record. \dots (Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar to associate.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (Nominated): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by Shrimati Kanimozhi.

^{*}Not recorded.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Raja can say one sentence. First, I have called Mr. Raja, then Dr. Maitreyan.

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, it is not going on record. Shrimati Kanimozhi, it is not going on record. ...(Interruptions)... Please,...(Interruptions)... Yes, Shri Rangarajan to associate. Shrimati Vasanthi Stanley to associate. Mr. Kannan to associate.

SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by Shrimati Kanimozhi.

SHRIMATI VASANTHI STANLEY (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by Shrimati Kanimozhi.

SHRI P. KANNAN (Puduchery): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by Shrimati Kanimozhi but partially...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, it is not going on record, sister. ...(Interruptions)... What is the use? It is not going on record. Please, be seated. ...(Interruptions).... It is not going on record. After three minutes.(Interruptions).....

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, Shrimati Kanimozhi, please co-operate. What is the point in saying when it is not going on record? Now, Mr. Raja, you are permitted to say only one sentence.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, the Government of India has got a political and moral responsibility to protect the fishermen. The Government of India should not look at them as Tamil fishermen; they are Indian fishermen. The Government of India has a responsibility to save our fishermen. This is what I would like to emphasise.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, in spite of repeated reminders from our Chief Minister and in spite of the Calling Attention Motion moved by me in this House, the Government of India has only parroted that they will do all the needful, but

^{*}Not recorded.

they are not doing anything. They should understand that when persuasive diplomacy did not work; coercive diplomacy will have to be adopted. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Shri Avinash Rai Khanna...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, while associating myself with the matter raised by Shrimati Kanimozhi, I would like to say that it is high time that the Government of India engage Sri Lanka and then review the accession of Katchatheevu to Sri Lanka because that is becoming a flash point. Let us all focus our attention on that. As Mr. Raja rightly said, it is a matter of Indian fishermen. The Government of India should take it seriously.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Sir, one sentence from the Congress. I wish to associate myself with the remarks made by Madam Kanimozhi and to stress that the Government of India has arrangements, signed arrangements, with the Government of Sri Lanka in terms of which these issues have to be resolved. They must invoke those clauses.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): Sir, one sentence...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, this is not a discussion.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I just want to say one sentence of association. What has just been said about the Government of India having agreements with Sri Lanka, those must be strictly enforced. My association is on the basis of what Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar has said.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is a valid suggestion. Now, Shri Avinash Rai Khanna.

Non-fulfilment of the assurances given by the Government after Kishtwar incident

12.00 Noon

µÔÆÜ ÛÆB ÝÖ‡Ô ÊÖB ¾ÆĞÖ ÛĞ •ŒE ¤ŒĞÖB †ÜB±ŰÄÖÄÜÖ ÆÜ †Ü¸Ü ×ÖÆÖÄ™ÜÜ ÆÜ, ^®ÛÛĞ ¸B•ÖVÖÇEĞTÖ ÆĞÜÖ †Ü¸Ü ŸŒ©¤ÞÖ ÆĞÜĞÜ... ÆĞEÖ ×ÖÆÖÄ™ÜÜ ©E ŸŒE ׸Ü*ÖÖ‡® ÛÚ¸Ü ∞¤ÜÖ, »ÖBÛÚ® ¾ÆĞÖ ÛĞ •ŒE ¤ŒĞÖB †ÜB±ŰÄÖÄÜÖ ÆÜ, >B†Ö‡ÐÖB, <ÃÖ×ÃÖĞB †Ö∞Ü ÆÜ, †Ö∘Ö ³ÜB ¾Æ ^® »ŒÛŒE ÛÜÊ >ÜÜ ¸WÆĞ ÆÜ, -ÖÖÛÛÖ .ÆĞ ÆÜ.

30.400 TÔ, Ü • CÚC × Ô• Ô• Ô• Ô• Ô• PÚC • CÚC •

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay.(Interruptions).... It is over.

SHRI V. P. SINGH BADNORE (Rajasthan): Sir, I would like to associate myself with this issue raised by the hon. Member.

ÆÉ.

DR. CHANDAN MITRA (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, I would also like to associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA (Odisha): Sir, I would also like to associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All the associations to be added.(Interruptions)....

Next is Mr. K.C. Tyagi.(Interruptions).... Hon. Minister wants to react. Yes, please.(Interruptions).... Tyagi ji, hon. Minister wants to react.(Interruptions).... Please listen.(Interruptions)....

ÁÖB 🕏 🗗 Ü ŰĞÖÖ Ü ÛÇJÖÖ : ^ ÕÄÜĞÜÖÜÜ • ÖB...(34ÖZÖÖĞ)...

ൌഗ്രെറ്റ് † Ö, ü ൌഗ്രൈറ്റ് ഗ്രൈറ്റ് ഗ്രെറ്റ് (> ü ±ưở þÜ Ö † ²¤あ̄ » Ö) : † Ö Ö ÖÆÜ, ಔഗൈ Ûú, Ñ ễ ĀŪĒ♥<......**...(¾ഗ്രെറ്റ്)....**<0ú × ऍഐ ÃŪĒ♥<......**...(¾ഗ്രെറ്റ്)...**.

ÁΒ ^-**ΘΡΟΟΌΝΟ:** Ûψ,μΟΟ •Β, †ΟΟ ²Ū,Κ.....**(3/10/Α-ΟΘ)...**ΑΘΡΟΚ.....**(3/10/Α-ΟΘ)...**

DR. FAROOQ ABDULLAH: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I want to inform this House that the Government has already got the ex-Justice of the High Court enquiring into it, and, I can assure you that his findings will be there and everything will be done to maintain the communal harmony in that entire region.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Now, Shri K.C. Tyagi.....(Interruptions)....
Mr. K.C. Tyagi, please.(Interruptions)....

> **Ü** ±**uÖ' þÜÖ** †²¤**ö**»Ö : ŠØÛú Æü.

ÁÖB T-¾ÃPÜÇÖ ,ÜÄÖ ÜÖ®PÜÖ : ÃÖ,Ü "ÜÇÖ ÛÚ"ÖÑÂÜÇÖPÖ ÛÚÖ ÃÖRÖÖ»Ö ÆÜ.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. K.C. Tyagi.(Interruptions)....

ÁÖB "Q, @P, ü Ûœ´ÖÖ, ü Û¢; µÖÖÖ : ÃÖ, ü Ü&Ö Ö&Ö Ü; Ÿ pÖÆü Æü ×Ûú...(¾ÖÖÖÖÖ)...

ÁÜB ÚÁ ÃÖB YÞÖÐÖB (¾ÖÆÐ Þ : ^-ÖÁÐFÖÐÖÐÖ ÖÆÐ ÞÖÐ(¾ÐÐÐÖÐÐ)...

ÁÖB QÓ P? Ü ĐƯỚ Ở Ü Đứ; ƯỚÖ : ĐƯỢ; YBÁÖ> ÌI ĐƯB 'Ở MƯỚO 'Œ ĐƯỚO ại...(34Ở ĐƯỚO)...

ÁÖB ÚĞ ÃÖB ŸĻÖÖYÖB : Û¢; JÖÖ •ÖB, ~»ÖB•Ö.....**(¾ÖÖ2-ÖÜFÖ)...**

ÁÖB TÖ, EP; Ü ÛŒ ÖÖ, Ü ÛÚ; ÞÖÖ :*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What Mr. Kashyap says will not go on record.(Interruptions).... What you are saying is not going on record. Please sit down.(Interruptions)....

^{*}Not recorded.

ÁÖB ®ÇEP¦Ü ÛŒÖÖÇÜ ÛÚ;µÖÖ: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not going on record.(Interruptions)....

ÁÖB ®ÇEP¦Ü ÛŒÖÖÜÜ ÛÚ;JJÖÖ: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have called Mr. Tyagi.(Interruptions)....Please.(Interruptions).... What is your problem? If you want to associate, you can do so. All the associations are already recorded.(Interruptions).... No, no.

ÁÖB 🕏 🗗 Ü ÛŒÖÜ Ü ÛÇ;µÖÖ : *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. It is not going on record.(Interruptions)..... This cannot be allowed.(Interruptions)..... This cannot be allowed. You take your seat. You take your seat.(Interruptions)..... It is not going on record.

ÁÖB ®ÇEP¦Ü ÛŒÖÖÜÜ ÛÚ;JJÖÖ: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You give notice.(Interruptions).... If you want to say something, give notice.(Interruptions).... Without notice, you cannot...(Interruptions).... This is not a market place to stand up to say anything. This is Parliament.(Interruptions)....

It is not going on record.(Interruptions).... Mr. Tyagi, you please start speaking.(Interruptions).... Mr. Tyagi.(Interruptions)....

ÁÖB ÝÖ, ÞP; Ü ÛĐĆÖÖ, Ü ÛÚ; ŅÖÖ : *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then, you sit down. I will call the next Member.(Interruptions)....

ÁÖB ÔÁ ÃÖB YÞÖXÖB: ÃÖ¸Ų ÞÖEÜ †ÖÖDÚB ∞Ö´Ö®Ö¸B ÆÜ ×ÔÚ ÆÖ^ÃÖ †ÖbŌÜ ÖE †Ö<...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you want to speak, start speaking, otherwise, I will call the next Member.(Interruptions)....

SHRI K.C. TYAGI: I want to speak.(Interruptions)....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then, why don't you speak?(Interruptions)....

^{*}Not recorded.

Establishment of a separate bench of the Allahabad High Court in Western Uttar Pradesh

ÁÔB ỦÃ ÃÔB YLOXÔB (XÔ**ĐÔ,)** : ÃÔ, ụ xãÔ ÔưB 10 Ôú, ÔB Ì TỘ ĐÔ×B ÔưB YÔÔ(1) ÔбÚ ÔưB YÔ, ÉLÚ ´Ci †ÖrÖQúÖ ¬µÖÖPÖ †ÖQÛÛÖÖÖ ÜÚ,£PÖÖ "ÖÖÆÜÖÖ ÆÐÁR ÖÖ_Z"ÖÖB ^¢Ö,ü Ö⊏ÐÇÖ ÖE ×Ö″ÐsÖE 30 ÃÖD»ÖÆ ÃŒ »Ô/ÔÔ/ÔÒ, Ü µÔEŬ ÔÔÔÔ "Ô>Ô , NEB ÆŬ ×ÛÚ ¾ÃEĞÔ Ô, Ü ÆĞ‡Ô ÛÆPÔ ÛVB <ÛÚ ¾Ĉ Ô ÛVB ĀĒĞŌ PŶŌ ÛVB •Ō<... •ÖÄÖXÄÖÖ DÄÖÆÜ †ÖµÖÖĞÖ 2Ö9Ö, ^ÄÖ9ÖE ׸DÚ′ÖÞ> jeÖ9Ö ¤G ×DÚ ÆÖD 2Ö9Ö9B "ÖDÆÜK... 3A/00009O 'CE •OCE "OS±ú • ČÙÃŎ ÆŲ ^9EŎĐĒ ÛVÆÖ ×ÛV 2099B "ÖVÆÜK… •ÖE ÃÖBĀ-Ö9 ÛE ×9°ÖÖÖ EČE >Ö. † 20b ÛV ü †Ö, ü ^9ÛÓ ÃŬEjĬŎŬĠS 3ĠS EĞ; ^9Ô ÃĬŸÖŸĖ ≫ÖÜÖ √Ũú ÃĬŸÖŨĠE 9PÖĢÖ ×ÖÞÖŸÖ "ÖÞÆİK, ÃĬÄŸÖ 9PÖĢÖ ×ÖÞÖŸÖ "ÖVÆÜK †Ö,Ü ÃÖPÖÖÐ «Ö,Ü Ö,Ü •ÖÖPÖÖ "ÖVÆÜK... ÖQÐ ÖŞ,"ÖÖB ^ÇÖ,Ü ÖÞÞÐÖ ÃÜE ‡»ÖÖÆÐÖÖ¤Ü »ÖÓPÖÖÖ 700 ×Ûú×ÖEÖ™ijü ÖNÃÖ. ÆÜ. <Ûú ÝÖ,0°Ö ×ÛúÃÖÖÐ ÛúÔ¢ Ö•Ö¤äpü ÛúÔ¢ †ÖÖÖ ×ÖÖÖÖ ÜÚÆÐÐÐ Ûú ×ÖK, ¾ÃÆÖ •ÖÖÐÐ ÚLE ×XÔK ×ÔLAÍO TÔ CHÔ TOÔ CÚ, LETÔ ALDHO ALDHOO, XÔLAÍO TÔB CÔLÓFOIGE ALDHOB ALDHÓB, †ÖÖ ^ÃOÔLB ÚLS>ÔTÔ ÚLJ Ü ÃODÁNGE ATU. TÃOSOC TO TO ÃOSIPO DE ÃOSTOPE XPRABERO DÚLETO "CORNO AGÉ XÚL YOSOTOPO DE ÃOCEOS 2010>00 jiết tộ; piốtu "Ôtti Viting" Các 2000 °0 † ở đãi: Úvatro "Cót biổo até: Đú ‡9t được Tôt biể: Atôt Ó Úviđyô ÔưB TỔ TỔ TỔ ĐẦN ĐẦN, TỔ TỔ ĐỀ TỔ ĐẠN ĐƠ VỊ TẬN MẠI MỘ MỘU ĐƯỚ ĐƯỢC ÔU ĐƯỚC ĐẦN TỔ TỔ TẬN. TỘ LỦI MÀ TRỊ VỤ TÔ Ôté »ÔTÉÖ ÁFTI ^9FLÖRÐE "ÖÐFLÖ ÞÚÚ ÝÖDS>FRÖ METÖSÖ <ŒÃÖTÖĞÖ "ÖSÖ •ÖÖ< †Ö,Ü ÄĞRMÛÚYÖ ÞÃÖMB ÛUB YÖ,EFLÜ ÃŨĖ ;Õ, GPÖ ÔÚB ×ĐÔUÔTĖE TÕ ÆGĖE. TÖÖTĖE ×ĖÖ ÔÉ TÖHÖTÕ TÖĞÜB ÔÚB •ÖÖTÖ ×Ė ×G, »ÖBÔÚTÖ TÖÖTÜE -XPONO ÖNGE †ÖÖGE ÖDÜNÄYÖĞ ¤ĕ ∞ijiÖ »ĞDÜĞÖ ¤ĞE XPÖNO ¤ÆĞE ÜÉ »ÖK †ÖÖ YÖDÖ,ü ĞÆĞ ÆĞK... YOOE µOÆÜ •OOE †0°OUúO ~OO‡8•iAO™Ü ÆÜ µOÆÜ 20ÆNO UOYO,68°OUÚ ÆÜ. ~O` †0°OAOE UúÆn8O "OOÆNOO ÆÐE ×Uú -Ög_"Ö'ÖB ^¢Ö¸Ü -Ö¤ĕĕÖ Û6 ′ÖÖ'Ö»ÖE ′ÖE ÝŒÖB¸ÜÖÖ ÃÜE 2ÖNÖ ÛúB •ÖO< †Ö¸Ü µÖÆÖÖ ÃÜE »ÖÐú¸Ü ¾ÄÆÖÖ ŸÖÓÚ ÃIPOB TODYVIJOB ÛNE 1900 TOE ÛNB LÎND +OOPB +OOK, YOOÛN TÖZ"O'OB ^COLU OFIDO ÛNE WONDE ÛNDE TOVID WOYDE xĐú ‡ÃCĐ¢ 2°C, ề Từ ÃPÔ ĐưB CHƯC LÔU LÔU AĐU. HỮ -Ō, ĐÃC TỔ Ư •ÔC ĐỚC ĐỦAĐÝC XĐÚ ĐƯỜ TƯỚC TỔ CĐÁ ÃƯC AĐU. ×±ú,ü ×ão,0 −0,690 Æ0000, ^A00é 308 A00£0 Æū. Y08A0,0 Æ00€00, ÚvÆŭ 308 Æ0Ê. †Y0,ü 70½,"O'08 ^¢0,ü -Ö¤ặÖ ČE 20'Ö 904ĕ 2090'OB ÆÜ YÖÜE Ö "ÖDENÖÖ ÆÉE ÂÚ •ČE'ISÖB •ČB Ûé ŢĞ•µÖ ČE פIS>ĞB Ûé †¢Ü Ü ‡® 15 ×6×00€ 0'06€ •00≽1i 0'ú_00€ Aŭû€ 0'00€0 0'06 0'06 0'06 0'08 ‡•00•0'0'0 ¤ê ¤6 •00<... 30_690 70 ‡AO AO¤690 (0ë "004004998 ¤Ðbú,ü Uú4£690 "004£1400 ÆÐbe.√Uú <Uú פ690 <AOO †0<Y00 √Uú ⁻0⁄¿,"0′08 ^¢0,ü 70≠jiO (0€ Y02±0040 ^5jirOo, †0*00100 700408 200±i0 Æ60400, †0*0010 ¤ibO 200±i0 Æ60400, †0*0010 _60;040 200±i0 Æ60400 †Ö, ü Öçenk ××ısı>×ÖB ÖvüĞ AEvőÖ, ĕ Öç, "Ö'ÖB ^¢Ö, ü Öİ×ığÖ Öb ×ÖDĞÖ 'ÖçMÖÇ YİPÖ †ÖÖ Öç, "Ö'ÖB ^¢Ö, ü Öİ×ığ, Ö ¤được »CHÔUTO 20'Ô TÔPA à ¤được ‡ÃÔ SÔK Ở TỔ TỔ TỔ CÂU ÔVALOTO "COPLICO ARDE ÔÚ μỘT GOÓ ÁIPÚS ¤isi CÚE ÔÚ THƠ Đ 205ai Afii ×0400 •08 205ai Afii ×0400 •08 ACE 308 049e 2000 0x08 £08... •00e ^04000 Afii 34e ×90•08 2000′0800 'O'E YOOE 20⊳B †""B 200YO ÜÜLÜĞECE ÆĞECO •OOB'LI ÜÜLÜĞÜĞ, »QEÜLÜPO •OPO 'OOD'LO †0×YOO YOOE ^AO %ACEYO ÆĞÜOLÜĞ -ODO (ČE ¶VÆ)A 2008-ODGE YOUE (Ö. "ODYENYOO ÆGE ×OU ‡¶OOLB "OETOS YOU-MOOTE OLID TILIOOTAO ÆGENO "OOVÆLIK... ¤GE »OĐÁCĐE ÔƯS "CĒTŪS 2℃ B CƯỚY O ĐƯỚƯ ĐƯƯ. <ÔÚ YỮCE ≫ T™B <»C,†CĒTŪS. ÔƯS †Ö, Ŭ <ÔÚ × CĂÕÕ •ÜS ÔƯS... 'Oi "OVEN'OO ÆBE×JUú ‡AO'Oë ‡®Uu'O ‡O''Ü BAGEO®O 308 †Oi Dië Uu'B YO NEÜ AOE •OO\$-NO •OO®O "OOÆEk... -Ö9ıÖ%Ö¤ü.

AOB عَنْ اللهِ مَنْ اللهِ مَنْ اللهِ مَنْ اللهِ عَنْ اللهِ مَنْ اللهِ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ اللهِ عَنْ اللهِ عَنْ اللهِ عَنْ اللهِ عَنْ اللهِ عَنْ اللهِ عَنْ اللهِ عَنْ اللهُ عَا عَلَا اللهُ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ اللهُ عَنْ عَالِمُ عَلَّا عَا عَا عَلَا عَا عَلَا عَالْمُعِلَّا عَا عَلَا عَلْمُ عَا

Hike in the prices of petrol and diesel for the sixth time in this year

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE (West Bengal): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, when the Parliament is in session, when we are discussing very seriously the issue of rise in prices, its effect on the people, particularly on the farmers, and the Short Duration Discussion on this issue is pending, at that particular time price hike of diesel and petrol has been announced by the UPA-II Government. Sir, this is not the first time that it is happening. Since the UPA-II Government has come into existence, we have seen many such examples. I remember, on one occasion, just 12 hours before the Parliament session began, the prices of petrol were increased. Here, the increase in the price of petrol is of Rs. 2.35 per litre. This is the sixth increase in the price of petrol in the last three months. The price of diesel has been increased on the monthly basis of 50 paise per litre and a steeper increase is expected after the Parliament session is over. The prices of kerosene and gas will be increased and it will seriously affect all sections of people. Unable to check the falling value of the Rupee, the UPA Government is resorting to successive increases in the fuel prices. This will only add to the burden of the people by growing inflation and rising prices of all commodities. Sir, it is a matter of deep concern. This Government is responsible for the increasing miseries of the people. Prices are increasing and according to the Government, the number of BPL people is coming down. After the UPA-II Government came into existence, decontrolling of petrol started. On diesel, they have taken an in-principle decision. Partial decontrol has been announced since January.

When it comes to public transport, it has been mentioned here in Parliament, diesel price has been raised by 50 paise per litre per month. We hereby demand to scrap that Ordinance or that Government Order; it will be helpful to the people. What will happen if you include the local sales tax and VAT to it? It will definitely differ from city to city. It will further burden ..

[†]Transliteration in Urdu Script.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your time is over. Thank you. Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu and Shri Derek O'Brien. ...(*Interruptions*)... The names of Shri Sitaram Yechury, Shri P. Rajeeve, Shri K.N. Balagopal, Shri T.K. Rangarajan and Shri D. Raja will be added. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): Sir, I associate myself with the mention made by the hon. Member. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI P. RAJEEVE (Kerala): Sir, I associate myself with the mention made by the hon. Member. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL (Kerala): Sir, I associate myself with the mention made by the hon. Member. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I associate myself with the mention made by the hon. Member. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI D. RAJA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I associate myself with the mention made by the hon. Member. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA (Odisha): Sir, I associate myself with the mention made by the hon. Member. ...(Interruptions)....

ÁÓB £CŪΧΔ, ἀ "Ü™ὰ ÝŪÆÞÞÖLÐÖ ("Ö¬μÖ ¯Ū™ġEŌ) : "Θ Ã¾ΦμΟΟ ΟἰΘΕ "ΟŪΨΘΌΔμΟ ÃΟ™ÃμΟ Ο ΘΕ ÃΘΘΕΟ ÃΘ"2Θ" ἰ Ο ἀ, ἀΘΟ ÆΘΕ.

ÁÔB ÂŨŸŪŞŮ "Ů™, ü ×ŨÁÜÜ (^¢Ů¸ü ˙Ū™•̀̀̀ę̀Ů) : Ãܸÿ ′Ü ³ÜB †¯Ů™E ÛĸŰE ′ŒŸŮ*Ū¥Ů ĀĎ™Ā́́¥ŅŮ Ū•Ē ĀŒĒŪ ÃŨ°ŽŮ˙¨Ü Ûώ, ΫŰŨ Æ**Ē**Ē.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Venkaiahji, you can say it in one sentence. ...(Interruptions)... After that, Misraji and then Shri Derek O'Brien. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN (West Bengal): Sir, I ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you sit, then only I can call you. ...(Interruptions)... Shri Naresh Agrawal also.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka): Sir, what I suggest is ...(Interruptions)... Sir, I have no problem even if you call Mr. Derek also. He can be given an opportunity to speak. Mine is only one line. If you concede him, I will sit.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I called you. I will call him if he sits.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the decision of the Government, when Parliament is in Session, without taking Parliament into confidence and making such a huge hike in petrol prices and giving a dose of 50 paise every month per litre of diesel, is totally anti-people. It is breaking the backbone of the common man. The farmers will be the worst hit because it will have a cascading effect.

Sir, my point is this. Now the Minister is coming up with a wonderful idea of closing petrol pumps at night. Tomorrow, he may say life should come to a halt at night. What is happening to this Government? I am unable to understand it. I want the Government to take Parliament into confidence before taking any such decision.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That's all. ...(*Interruptions*)... Shri Derek O'Brien. Say that you associate in just one sentence.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, three sentences. We have been standing here for thirty minutes. At least allow me to speak three sentences. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That was indiscipline. ...(Interruptions)... Standing and displaying posters ...(Interruptions)... is indiscipline.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, we are not disturbing anybody. The problem is that this Government has declared a war on the common man. This is one. Two, import lobbies may be encouraged for all this. Three, after making diesel hike and burdening the common man and worse still they make ill thought of ...

ÁÖB ^ (ÄÖFÖÖÖYÖ : ¤ÃÖ Ö GÖRMÃÖ ¤ĕ ¤ÖE. ...(¾ĎÖGÖĞ)...

ÁÖB TÔ ỆO TÝTHÀNÔ: •070 ÃÔ¤160 "Ô»Ô **¸NEÔ** ÆÑ YÔPÔ TÔPÔB •03 ÃÔ¤160 Ûn †16¶ü '0000ÞOO Ûn file Dá 20•00,0 ÃO¤160 Ûn 2004Eŭŭ '0000ÞOO Ûn ja pôteŭ ...**(3404-6070**)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, in protest we are walking out.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY (West Bengal): In protest, we are walking out.

[2 September, 2013]

(At this stage, some hon. Members left the Chamber)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. V. Maitreyan. ...(Interruptions)... 🐧 i 🐧 • 🖏 • 🖏 • 🖏

ÁCÍS TỔ, ỆC TÝ TÚ XÃO T: "CỐT TỚ PƯ TẬU ^ CĂ CHO CHÝO TO XÝO - CÍS, ÃO, ĐƯƠ, LI ĐƯƠ , ĐỘ, CÓ XÝO, ĐƯỚ, MÁ CHÝO XÝO, ĐƯỚ, MÁ CHÝO XÝO, ĐƯỚ, MÁ CHÝO XÝO, ĐƯỚ XÝO, ĐƯỚ XÝO, ĐƯỚ XÝO, ĐƯỚ XÝO, ĐƯỚ XÝO, ĐƯỚ XÝO, ĐƯỚ XÝO, ĐƯỚ XÝO, ĐƯỚ XÝO, ĐƯỚ XÝO, ĐƯỚ XÝO, ĐƯỚ, THE TREE.

(‡ÃÖ ÃÖ'ÖµÖ Ûø''û 'ÖÖ'ÖÖÖQÖ ÃÖ¤ÑAµÖ ÃÖ¤ÐÖ ÃÖE 2ÖÖÆÜÜ "Ö»ÖE ÝÖ<)

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, first set the clock again.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): Sir, the discussion on price rise is there. So, there is no need of another notice. We will bring up all these issues. You please take up the discussion and continue that.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We can do that after ...(Interruptions)... I will convey your suggestion to the Chairman. ...(Interruptions)... Today, BAC meeting is there. ...(Interruptions)... We can discuss it there. Today, BAC meeting is there. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: It is there in today's business.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can raise this issue in the BAC meeting today. ...(Interruptions)... We have already decided it.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (Bihar): Sir, I have a point of order. ... (Interruptions)... Sir, my point of order is $\hat{\mathcal{A}}$ U $\hat{\mathcal{C}}$ PO $\hat{\mathcal{C}}$ O $\hat{\mathcal{A}}$ O $\hat{\mathcal{C}}$ E $\hat{\mathcal{C}}$ O $\hat{\mathcal{A}}$ O $\hat{\mathcal{C}}$ E $\hat{\mathcal{C}}$ O $\hat{\mathcal{A}}$ O $\hat{\mathcal{C}}$ E $\hat{\mathcal{C}}$ O $\hat{\mathcal{C}$

ÁÜB ^~ŰÄÜFÜÖÖÖÖÖ : ‡ÃÜS≫Ö< ŰFÜE ÚÚÆÖ ×Ûú †ÖÖ ‡ÃÜÚÉ »»Ö< TÜE™ÃÖ ¤©⊷Ö<......(¾₽₽₽₽ОТФ)...

ÁÔB ૄiĕB ;ÔDú,ũ ŌAÔDºũ: ÃÔĮŲ pIÔEÜ ≫ÔÙĠĐŨ ÆŲ pIÔEŬ ²ÔŒŬÔ ŶŨŶÔB¸Ũ ¾ÃÑQÃÔ ÆŨ...**.(¾ÃĎÃ-ÔŨŶ**)...

ÁĞB ÃĞŸÖÖ, ÖÖ ÞÖEĞAĞ : ÃÖ Ü •ÖPÖ "Ö'ÖÖÖ "Ö»Ö T**EG** ÆÜ †Ö, Ü...(**¾ĎXª-ÖÖP)...**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Today, we have BAC. ...(Interruptions)... I am not denying the fact that it is a very important subject. The Chair has understood the seriousness. Because BAC is to meet today at 4.00 p.m., my request to the agitated hon. Members is that you raise it in BAC. We can decide there. That is the forum to decide. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, my appeal to you is that we are already in the middle of a discussion.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have understood the point. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I am only requesting that immediately after the Zero Hour is over, you take up that discussion.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, the Chair cannot do that.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: It is there in the List of Business. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't enforce it on the Chair. ...(Interruptions)...

Now, Dr. Maitreyan. ...(Interruptions)... I have noted it. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, you take the opinion of the House and ask the Government to keep the decision pending. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, that way, we cannot function. ...(Interruptions)... We cannot function that way. ...(Interruptions)... There is a set order. ...(Interruptions)... We have to go by that. ...(Interruptions)...

ÁCB , jɨβὰ ; ἄθος ü - ἄΛοθ→ ü : ÃΟς ῷ ÆÜΟ + ઉΤΟΟ ΔΕ 2007Ο ' ΌΦΑΥΘΕ ÆŪ. ÆÜO 2³CB. <.ÃCB. ' ĈΕ "Ô'000 ÛΟς ἄΘΕ »ΘΕΟ ΨΘ + ઉΤΟ < ἐΘ » ઍ ™ Β "ΘΡΟς ἄΘΑΘΟ ÆÜΟ ÆÜΟ ¾ ΘΑΘΟ ΑΘΑ ÆÜ + ΘΟ ΑΘΑΘΟ ' ČΕ ΡΘΕŪ 20ÆÃΟ "Ó»Ο , jæb ÆÜ 20ÆÃΟ Ö¸ Ü ÃΟς ΘΟΟς Ü ~ 3600 † Ö * ΘΟΘΟς Ö ~ 3600 † Ö * ΘΟΘΟς Ö ~ 3600 † Ö * ΘΟΘΟς Ö ~ 3600 † Ö * ΘΟΘΟς Ö ~ 3600 † Ö * ΘΟΘΟς Ö ~ 3600 † Ö * ΘΟΘΟς Ö ~ 3600 † Ö * ΘΟΘΟς Ö ~ 3600 † Ö * ΘΟΘΟς Ö ~ 3600 † Ö * ΘΟΘΟς Ö

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am only saying that you raise it in the proper format. ...(Interruptions)... It is Zero Hour. At this time, I cannot decide. ...(Interruptions)... You can give a notice. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, it is already there in the proper format. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We have a published List of Business for today. We are working on that. If you want a change in that, that is a different matter. But, the Chair cannot suo motu take a decision. ...(Interruptions)... I cannot change like that. ...(Interruptions)... That is not the way. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: There is no change. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We can't do like that. ...(Interruptions)... I am not saying that what you have said is not important. I am not saying that. The issue that you have raised is important. But, the Chair has to stick to some procedure. There is a List of Business with us. Let me go by that. ...(Interruptions)... You can raise it. ...(Interruptions)... Today, there is a List of Business. ...(Interruptions)... No, no, please cooperate. ...(Interruptions)... You have made your point. ...(Interruptions)... Vechuryji, you have made your point. ...(Interruptions)... Rajaji, please cooperate. You have made your point. ...(Interruptions)...

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖ,Ü †»ÜB (ZÖEÖ,)) : ÃÖ,Ü XÃÜŁÔ <ÛÚ XÖŸYÜ..**(¾ĎB¿ÖÖ**Ö,...ÃÖ,Ü XÃÜŁÔ <ÛÚ XÖŸYÜ..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please cooperate. ...(Interruptions)...ĀŪŽŪ, İ † » B • B, ŽŪŠIK.... Ü. (Interruptions)... Maitreyanji, I will be forced to adjourn the House. ...(Interruptions)... ĀÜŽŪ, İ † » B • B, ŽŪŠIK...... (3408-Ü).... Dr. Maitreyan, you speak. ...(Interruptions)... It will go on record. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, since you are not allowing this discussion after the Zero Hour and even when a discussion is going on, a decision has been taken by the Government, objecting to that, we are going to stage a walk-out.

(At this stage, some hon. Members left the Chamber.)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Dr. Maitreyan.

Retrieval of Katchatheevu and the recent stand of UPA Government on it

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, 1974 Agreement signed between India and Sri Lanka, between Shrimati Indira Gandhi and Shrimati Sirimavo Bandaranaike, on 26th June, 1974, had determined Katchatheevu as part of Sri Lanka and the islet was ceded by the Government of India unilaterally to Sri Lanka without the approval of both the Houses of Parliament for a Constitutional amendment in this regard. The stand of the Government of Tamil Nadu, led by Dr. Puratchi Thalaivi, is that Katchatheevu has always been a part of India geographically, culturally and historically, and needs to be retrieved back, keeping in view the livelihood interests and security of thousands of Indian fishermen.

The Tamil Nadu Assembly had passed a unanimous resolution in May, 2013 regarding the retrieval of Katchatheevu . My party General Secretary and the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu had filed a writ petition before the Supreme Court in 2008 to consider 1974 and 1976 Agreements which have been the root cause for the untold misery of Tamil Nadu fishermen, as null and void, in the absence of the mandatory Constitutional amendment required and to retrieve Katchatheevu back to India.

Against this background, the entire Tamil Nadu is shocked that the UPA Government has responded last Friday in the Supreme Court that retrieval of Katchatheevu from Sri Lanka does not arise as no territory belonging to India was ceded to Sri Lanka. This is the greatest Indian betrayal of Tamil Nadu.

I would like to draw the attention of the House to the debate on 23rd July, 1974 in Parliament when the statement regarding the 1974 Agreement was made by the then External Affairs Minister, Sardar Swaran Singh. In that debate the great Madhu Limaye said, he spoke in Hindi, I would like to quote that here:

When people have said like this, 40 years later the UPA Government is considering this country as the zamindari of the Congress Party.

The UPA Government's statement in the Supreme Court last Friday has once again proved that whether it is genocide of Tamils in Eelam, attack of Tamil Nadu fishermen by the Sri Lankan Navy or the retrieval of the Katchatheevu, the Congress Party is anti-Tamil Nadu. The people of Tamil Nadu will give the Congress Party and whoever aligns with it, a befitting reply in the coming Lok Sabha elections. Once our new Government is formed next year, Dr. Puratchi Thalaivi will take all necessary steps to retrieve Katchatheevu back to India.

SHRI D. RAJA (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I will associate myself with the issue raised by Dr. Maitreyan in three sentences. Number one, I strongly deplore the affidavit filed by the Government of India in the Supreme Court on Katchatheevu. Number two, Sri Lanka treats the Katchatheevu as a closed chapter. The Government of India should demand the reopening of the Katchatheevu Agreement, renegotiation of the Agreement. Number three, if the Government fails to do that the Government has the option to go to the International Court of Justice. This is a very important issue, as far as Tamil Nadu and India are concerned.

[2 September, 2013]

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, the Government of India in its affidavit has said that the Katchatheevu has never been a part of the Indian territory.

I would like to point out that when India got Independence, the Katcha Theevu Island had a survey number of 1250 at Ramanathapuram in Tamil Nadu. It belonged to the Ramanathapuram Zamin.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, it proved beyond doubt that this Katchatheevu was part of the Ramanathapuram Zamin. I request the Government to please understand the sentiments; and call an all party meeting about the renegotiation of Katchatheevu and revise your stand in the Supreme Court wherein you have filed a wrong affidavit. There is a reaction across the country.

SHRIMATI VASANTHI STANLEY (Tamil Nadu): Sir, let the Government react. It is a very important issue.

ÁÖB •QÃÖ TÖDAĞ,Ö 9ÖÖ, QÃÞÖ ÖÁÖEÜ (-ÖÖ, ÜDÖÐ)) : TÖEĞEYÜÖ, TÖ ‡ÃÖÄÖE †TÖ9ÖE †ÖTÖDAĞE ÃÖZÖTÜ DÚ, ÜTÖD ÆÆ.

ÁÖB 20ÃODXOQ Ö-Ö ⁻ÖÖX™GÖ (ÚúÞÖÖÖ'ÚÚú) : ÖÆÖE×ŢĬÖ, Ö ‡ÃOÃÕE †Ö®E †ÖÖÜÚÖE ÃÖ°2Ö∵Ü Úú¸ÜÖÖ ÆÓE. **ÁÖB 3Ö NOÃÖEÜ "ÜYÖNDÃÖEÜ "Ö ŰÖÖ Ü** (YÖRÖ ÖVÖ) : ÖÆÐEÜÖ, Ö ‡ÃÕÄÜE † ÖPÜE †ÖÖÜÜE ÃÖ 20' Ü Ûú NÖÖ Æ**ĺ**e.

Outbreak of dengue in Guwahati and other parts of Assam

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA (Assam): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I thank you very much for allowing me to mention about the outbreak of dengue in Assam.

I rise to stand here to draw the attention of the Government of India to save Assam from the recent outbreak of dengue. Recent outbreak of dengue turned Guwahati city and many parts of Assam as dangerous. Already five people have died in Assam; and more than 100 people have been admitted into several hospitals in Assam. Out of these five people who have died, four people have died in Guwahati and one person died in Chabua near Dibrugarh due to dengue.

The State Government and the Guwahati Municipal Corporation have totally failed to prevent dengue; and control its outbreak in Guwahati and other parts of Assam. The Guwahati Municipal Corporation has already identified 22 places as vulnerable for dengue in Guwhati.

There is a shortage of technicians, there is a shortage of laboratories and testing labs and there is a shortage of medical equipments. I remember, Sir, when there was a dengue outbreak in Delhi, the Central Government initiated several programmes to prevent dengue outbreak in Delhi. I demand the Government of India to pay the similar attention towards preventing dengue outbreak in Assam. They should make the similar arrangement in Assam also.

Sir, there is no All India Institute of Medical Sciences-type institute in Assam. There is no AIIMS-type hospital in Assam. Guwahati is the hub of the North-Eastern Region. Thousands of people from several parts of the North-Eastern Region and other parts of the country visit Guwahati daily. Sir, to prevent dengue in the North Eastern Region and other parts of the country, it is the duty of the Government of India to take adequate measures and send a special team of doctors with adequate medicines to Guwahati. I would like to make a request to the Government of India to please consider setting up a regional research centre in Guwahati. Otherwise, the situation will take a more serious turn and more and more people will lose their life. I would like to request the Government of India not to discriminate against Assam. Whatever attention you have paid to Delhi, I demand that the same attention be paid to Guwahati to prevent dengue outbreak because Guwahati is the hub of the North Eastern Region. I hope the whole House will support me and associate itself with this issue.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Yes, yes.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (Bihar): Sir, I associate myself with this issue.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka): Sir, I also associate myself with this issue.

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, I associate myself with this issue.

SHRI SATISH CHANDRA MISRA (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, I also associate myself with this issue.

DR. CHANDAN MITRA (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, I associate myself with this issue.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, yes, all the Members associate themselves with this issue.

Shutting down of petrol pumps at night in view of falling rupee and rising international crude oil prices

SHRI SANJAY RAUT (Maharashtra): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, the Petroleum Ministry is planning to do away with 24-hour petrol pumps in cities as part of its austerity measures in view of the falling rupee and rising international crude oil prices. This will cause a lot of inconvenience to the consumers across the country. The Ministry is planning to shut petrol pumps from 8.00 p.m. to 8.00 a.m. This will cause a lot of inconvenience to the consumers across the country, particularly in cities like, Mumbai, Delhi, Kolkata and Bangalore. The city never sleeps. Even in the night, you can see people working.

The Prime Minister wants the Petroleum Ministry to save 25 billion dollars in the current financial year from oil imports. The Petroleum Minister suggested some measures, including regulating the time for sale of petroleum products. But this measure will not be implemented on highways. This will encourage black marketing of petroleum products during the closure periods; otherwise, vehicles would be stranded. It would create traffic chaos. Ultimately it would affect the economic development of the country.

The Ministry is planning conservation campaign of saving fuel in major cities. This drive will cost Rs. 17.5 crores. The Government should have done it long back. The Government should focus on generating power from wind and solar. For example, in China, 60 per cent of the vehicles are run on solar batteries. The Government should improve the condition of roads across the country. After every

monsoon, roads are badly affected and become unfit for driving vehicles, which consume a lot of fuel. The Government should also encourage blending of ethanol with petrol to save fuel. The Government should encourage production of green vehicles, and should announce some concession in duties, if not already done.

The US sanctions against Iran should not come in the way of India importing additional crude from that country. There will be a reduction in the foreign exchange outflow on this account on the basis of the fact that India pays in rupees for oil imports from Iran. This should be pursued vigorously.

Conservation of fuel should start from the Government side. For example, many Ministries in Delhi and Government Departments across the country are using Government vehicles recklessly even for domestic chores and leaving children of VIPs and bureaucrats at schools in Government vehicles. Therefore, the charity should start from home instead of shutting petrol pumps in the night.

Therefore, I urge upon the Government to defer the decision to shut petrol pumps in the night, and take the steps suggested by me.

Thank you.

SHRI ANIL DESAI (Maharashtra): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by Shri Sanjay Raut.

Relaxation in age for appearing in civil services examination

•0ÃΟ «Đứ †Ö CÔU CÉ TO SCÁ ĐỆU ĐỆU ÃO THỂ TỔ THE PROBLE PROBRATION CHẾ THỐ B TỔ U ĐƯỢCH, ‡40 xuốc 30000 tế ĐƯỢCH TO NHÀ THỆ ĐƯỚC TO NHÀ THỆ ĐƯỚC TO NHÀ THỆ ĐƯỚC TO NHÀ THỆ ĐƯỚCH TO THE THE TO

(ψ. 1989 (1980) Δεί ν. Δι Δίο χαθο Αξί ν. Δι Δίο χαθο Το Είνο Αδικό Το Είνο (ψ. 1988) (1989 (1980) Το Είνο Το

TÖ√ş BAĞYÖMƏ Dele 200=cü †20 ^90 ″ÖnjüCle Oldle <ĀLOB OldlefO şõvebiO ¶Övebi ∞66 YÖLEO AEU. ^ĀCle ĀCYÖTYÖ Olúşü ×="pico" YÖLDÖ AEU.

Ã000 » 309 ú Ã0500 † \$\text{\$\

ÁĞB Ú¢ ÃĞB YµXDÝB (*ÖÆÖ¸) : ^-ÖÄĞBÖĞÖĞÖ ÖĞÖ •ĞB, 'Ğ ‡®ÜÇ ‡ÃÖ ^»»ĞEĞ Û¢ ÄĞĞEÖ ÂĞ<mark>Q</mark>ÖÖ Û¢ĞE ÄĞ'ZÖ''Ü Û¢, WÖ Æ**Ç**E.

DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (Nominated): Sir, I associate myself with it.

ÁĞB T-¾ÖFÜÇÖ ¯ÖĞÐ Ü ("ÖÆ**Ö¸ÖÄ™)** : ÃÖ¸Ü Ő ‡®ÖÓÉ ‡ÃÖ ^»»ÖÜÖ ÓÉ ÃÖÖEÖ Ã¾ÖµÖÖ ÓúÖE ÃÖ°2Ö∵Ü Óú, ÜÖÖ ÆÉE.

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, I associate myself with it.

>**n** ***a} quò no ra Acc-co** ("0-µ0" "0-re)) : ^ OACC-CO OATO •CR, 'O ‡ ®CO n Acce o Asquo Ouce Acce o Asquo Ouce

Need for PM's statement on coal scam in the light of Supreme Court's observation

ΑὐΒ "ΟὐἀξΟ •ἀγΔ•Θύζὰ ('ὑξοξοῖΑ™) : ^ "ΟΑΘΡΟΤΟΫΟ 'ΟξοῦφῆΟ, ΑΟξοῦμοξὰ Ûά * »ΟΎΟΒ Æῷ וΟΑΟΘΘ Οὐῶ, ΦΟ × ΦΕΦΙΟΟ 30, ὰ 'ΘΕ ÆὰΘΟ, Β΄ ±ἀ•ΟΚΕΝΌ ÆΦΕΟ Æὰ. × ΦΕΟ "ΟΥΕΙΝΟΕ •ΟΡΟ ΤΟΙΕΟΟÚ × ΑΕΟΥΌ "Ο, ὰ "Θ'ΌΟΟ

^{*}Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

ÆtērÔ EČB, ŸŶŶŎ ×ĴviÃĎS °ŶĿ ŨďĐĐŠĈĿ Ũviß ±vÖ‡×Ö ŨvÖ 'ŐĠĠŌ ^ŠÕĻŸÖ... ^ÃŎ ÃŎ ŨvÕ ¾ÆTÕŎ TÖHÖŸŶŐĠÓB •ČB °ŶĿ ŸŎĸŮĠĸ ĆĿ ŨúŦŎ ĸŨú ĆŌ ±ďĴ‡ĸŎ ŨďŌ ÛúÙŌĠĸijŎŦŌ ŦŎŦŦŎĸ ÆÐÉ ČŌ ±ŰχĸŎ ŨďŌ ŢŨĴŎĸŎŎĸŎŌ ŦŌŦĔŎĸ ÆÐÉ ĸŌĿŨŰŦŌ ÆŭÖ ÛúÆÐÖÖ "ÖÖÆNÖE Æŭ ×Ûú †ÖÖ Æü. †ÖÖ ±ÖÖ‡»ÖE Ûé ³ÖS ŢÜÜÖXÖÖ>ÖE Æü †Ö¸Ü ¤ġÖ Ûé ³ÖS ŢÜÖXÖÖ>ÖE ÆŲ »ÔĐŮƯ® ¤ÔĐƯỀ ŨƯỜ †ÖÖ ŠÃÔÚ ŸÕ, ĐÔÉ ÃÕE ®VÆN ÔÚ, Ũ ŲÆÐ ÆŲ μŮÆß ¤ÞÖ ÛƯÖ ÇÔĐÔ ÆŬ. ÃŨKŮS Ö ÛúÖE^MÔ ^qữe •ôữe ÛúÆĐÔ £ÖÖ, †Ö•Ö ÛúÖ ´ÖĘĐÔ ´Ũ**G**ĐÔ µÔÆĐ**ô ÆŒ...(¾ĎÖÆ-ÖÖFÒ)** ÃÖÆÖ »ÖßוÖ<, ÃÖÆÖ »Öx-Ö<...(3/03/07) ^#"ÖÖÖ PÜQÜÖXÜÖ TE ÄÜBÖÖ DÜÜYÜ TE ÜVEÖ EÖ..(3/03/07) <Ûú ×ÖTMü.(3/03/07) ^ ""ÖVÖTÖ PRÖLDÖDSÖLÖ PÜÇ ÄĞBÜBTÖ ÜLÜBYÖ PÜE ÜLAFLÖ EÖÖ XÜL XÖDÄÖVÖ ±LÜÇ+SÖ ÜLE ÄÖBÖGÖ TÜE <±LİŢÖÇÇÜ Ö ¤ÔĐƯÔNÔ ĐƯỊĐE. Ở Từ ĐƯỢC "ỐƯƯỜ VÀU CLUÔ <±ú†ÖLỘT Qũ ¤HÔ ĐƯỢC ^TỐ ĐƯỢC VÀO Ố ĐƯỢC ĐƯỢC ĐƯỢC ĐƯỢC ĐƯỢC ĐƯỢC ĐƯỢC 'CÔÁIS °ÉE CLÚAEÐÍ ×Ôú ±ưỗ‡»ČE ce**ðerl**ifðe Óli ×>Ö< <Ôú ÓL'ÖE'NS ²ÖFÖÖ‡Ô ÝÖ‡Ô ÆÜ. ^ÃÖ ÓL'ÖE'NS 'ÖE ^ÃÖS •340±f0'ŭ ÃCOĴĒ™Ü 6 Û ÚĈE _6ÚCO ÝQUCO ÆŬ ×0ÃO •3405±f0'ŭ ÃCOĴĒ™Ü 6 °ČE ÃCO7OS†Ö‡Ô Û6 ¤&YÖ ü ĆE •COOÚ Ü †ÖÖ ±úÔ‡»Ö ce**ded**főe ÚúÖ ÚúÖÖ ¤ĕ jiÆté ÆT? †ÖÖ YÖÖE ÚúÖE ÆTB ÜÖ•ÖÖFÖE ÚúB "ÖÖFÖS ¤ĕ jiÆté Ætü. Ö -Ökêrêkî "ÖVELÎYÎO AEKÊ XÛ CEHÎÖ ±ÛÛ‡»ÇE ÂXÎHÎDÎ "ÖNDÎ ÛÛ, Ü "ÖNEÇE ÇE "ÖNÊB •ÖÜYÜB AER? CEHÎÖ XÛÂÛB °ÊE ¤ÎLÛÖ ÆŬ ×ÛÚ ±ŮŮ\$-VỀ ÜÜRTÜ ÆB >Õ\$30 ÛÚ, ÔÚ ÛÚĒĎ ŮÚÆĎ "ÖSÔS •ÖÖ , ŒB ÆÖR ±ŮŮ\$-VỀ ÜÜRTÜ "ÖYEĞ "ÖSÖS •ÖÖVÖS µÔFEU ÔƯỚCÔ ×ÔÚµCÔ ÆU. TÔS.<ÃÔS. ÃÔĞÔ¤U ÔƯB ÔƯCÔEYB ÆU. ^ÃÔ ĈE ŒµCÔ ÆUTÔ, µÔFEU ÆŬÔ ÔUPÔS ¾ÔŒUU ®ŸEB 2006/070; »0600/90 Ã0≈690 10: 2006/0900 š**6**00¢ Ætil. 108.<.Ã08. Ôt Ã00 090: Ã00.208.†0‡ô 90: •00: Ôu⁄Ætil, •00: 'CÔQÔÖ»ÔµÔ ®ÔÊ ÛúÆBÔ, ^ÃOÃÔÊ ÃÖÖ±ú ÆBÛ ×Ûú ²ÖÆBÎÖ ÃÖÖ,BO 'ÖÆBξÖ ÖBEÖÖ ±úÖ‡»ÖE YÖÄÖ ÆBÔE YÖ‡Ô ÆĪI....**.(348%A-00FQ**)...ÃÖ,Ü µÖÆÜ ÖÜERĞÜE'ISÖ ÂÛÜ'Ö ÆÜ †Ö,Ü ÖÜERĞÜE'ISÖ ÂÛŬÖ ÜE ÖHÖPYÖĞÖB ÜĞEÜ ÛLĞEÜ ÛLĞEĞSÖÖ ÖĞÖB Cũiµ∞ sốu Đãi Của Từ Lĩa Cổ Của kiệ Đố Đãi Của Của Của Của Của Của Của Của Của Đãi Đối• số Chuẩn Cổ Cầua Áia †Ô, ii ×ĐưÃIÔ ƯỚC CHOỐC CHỐC GƯỚC XXIÂO XXIÃO ÁTŲ TÃÔ×Ô< ÆŬÔ TOMÔ ĐƯ, NGÊ ÆŪ ×ĐƯ HỮC ±ƯỚ¢ VỀ YỐT, Ở ĐƯỚC ÆÐIÐ ÛdÔ •ODE TÔPÔNÔ ÆŬ, µÔPĒU ²ŒĐĨÔNÔPÔ ÛdÔ ÆŬ. ^ÃÔ Œ <ÃÔE NOĐÔĐE ÛdÔE TÔTÔ ¸ÛJÔE ★ÔPÆÐĒPÔE TÔÆĎDĈE ÆBÎ ÃÖS.2ÖS.†Ö‡Ô ÛxB ׸üÖÖLPÔ 2Ö≈isö®ÜE ÛxÖ ÛxÖÖ ×ÛúµÖÖ ÆÜ †Ö¸ü ÆüÖ µÖÆÜ ÖÖÖÖÖ Ûú¸iïÖE ÆÜ ×Ûú פik Æik. %8''0°0 Ûn †®08.00 ji '08.<'Ö. Ûnûê †0°0 Â0¤60 '0ë †00ú ji ™8''û'e''i ¤600 ''004Eik †0, ii ^Â0Ûn 200 ê '0ë ALŬOŬ (B CERÂBE, HEÔ »ÔERÎS "ÖDAEÎK… RÂE , ÎDÛRÂÔNÊE ±LÔ‡NÔ ÛE 3ÔS AEŪ †Ö, Ü ¤PĻÖ ÛE 3ÔS AEŪ NÔEÛL®Ô ¤ÂERÔE ÔuÔ Ô Š**ô**Ôú **"**Ÿeði Ôú,ü **jæði Æ**ü. þôæü ÆŭŐÖ,**ô** þôæðô ÔúÆď®Ô Æü...**.(340%-Ö0°9**)...

ÁÔY ÔYÔB TÔQAÔ ĐÃÔTEÚ ("Ô+µÔ TÔ×**p.Ô**): "ÔTEÔÞ×µÔ, "Ô Ã¾QµÔ ĐƯỀ ‡ÃÔ ¾QÂÔµÔ ÃŨE ÃÔ 2Ô" Ú ĐÚ, ƯỚB Æ**Đ**E **ACIS CYCIS Ã TCÁYO • CROPO ‡ QũPOS** (YOR O gũYO): TO ĐƯỢC PỊO, TO Ã Ă ĐẬU CÓ CƯỚC ‡ÃO × Xà QUÔ Ã CEÃO 70 TU ÔU LÝ COS Æ ĐE. **ÁÖB ੴĐÙ ĐƯƠCÔ U ÃCÔ,Ô ("ƯC**ỚBÃÔÝ Che**)**): "ÔFÊ® JIÔ, "Ở à ĐẬU CÔ ĐƯỚC ‡ÃÔ ઐÂHQUÔ ÃŨE ÃÔ 2Ô "U ĐƯ, ƯỚC Æ**Đ**E **ÁÖB ®VÁGIĞB AĞÖXÖD-ÖB SĞÜLÜÇEÜ** (YÜRÖ,ÖVÖ): ÖFĞÜRYÖ, ÖL ÂXÂDÖÖ ÜLÜR ‡ÃÖ XÂADOÖ ÁÜR ÃÖ'2Ö''Ü ÜLÇÜYÖÖ

ÁÖB †ÖEÖ "ÖDAĞ;Ö "ÖĞEĞşiü"(,Ö-ÖÄECÖFÖ): "ÖFĞ®şiÖ, "Ö Ä¾ĞAÖÖ ÖAÖE ‡ÄÖ ¾ÄÄĞAÖ ÄĞE ÄÖ?Ö'''Ü Dú,N'ÖÖ ÆĞE

Æ**É**.

^{*}Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

ÁÖB ²QÃQĎXÃÒ, QP-Ö ⁻ÖÖX™5-Ö (ÚúÞÖÖÖ'NDÚ): ŐŒØĕNŢÔ, Ő Ã¾ÃŊDŐ ÚúČE ‡ÃÖ ¾ÃÑQNÖ ÃČE ÃÖ°2Ö∵Ü Úú, ÑÖÖ ÆÔE.

ÁÖB ÖFÐÁGÐÓ <»Ö ÖÐÐÁÐÁÐÓ (ÝÐÐÖ,ÖÐÖ). ÖÆÐÐÞÞÓ, Ö ÁÐÐÞÞÓ ÚÐÐE ‡ÃÖ ¾ÁÐÓÐ ÁÐÐ ÁÐÐ ÓÐÓ ÚÚÐ ÍÐÓ ÆÉ.

ÁÔS Į IŽÁ Ž**ÔÚŲ II TŪAŪD=II (**×ÔÆĐÕ): ÁŌŲ †ÔÔOUÔE TÕS ÆÐ ÆÐ ÆÐ XŨÚ ‡ÃÔ TŌŲ II 2ÔÆÃÔ ÆÐE "ŒÐÚS ÆÐI. The Government must give a statement. <Ûú × 60 TB. <Ü TÜK EÜ; ŢÃÜ ÆÜÖ Ã¾ BÛÜÜÜÜ Ã-Ô™GĐÚ, ÞÖ -ÔÐ> NÝÔ ÆLL. ¤ÞJÖ <∞Ô™Ð"Ð-U ÆLŲ ÞÔÆU <ÛÚ -ÔŒĐÃŒ'ЫÖ ÃŨŬÔ ÆLL. ÃŒĞĞÖ ÛVŒ'Û °ÐE 3ÔB ÛúÆÎÔ ÆÜ ×Ûú ×ÔÔÃÔYÔ ±úÖ‡»ÃÔ Ũĕ ²ÔÔ¸ē ŐE <±ú.†Ö‡Ô†Ö¸Ü Ûúß×Ö<.....**(¾ĎÆÖÖŤ)..**.ÃÖ¸Ü ‡ÃÖ Ō¸Ü ÃÖ Û ÚÖ Ü Û Û Û Û • Ö XÖ Ö ÞÖÖ Ö ÖÖ XEÜK.......(¾ÖÖ ÖÖ ÖÖ)...

ÁÔS ^ TOLO CO CÁTO »ÔĐƯỢ® , 🖼 Ô ; CÔU (ii TOLO CHI • ÔS, TÔS. < Ô. ‡-Ô, ii †Ô< £ÔE...**(3408-007)..**..< Ûú ×∞60 ¯ÔB.<´Ö †Ö< £Ü**;...(¾ÖĞÖÜF)...**^ÃÖ ×¤ÆÖ...**(¾ÖĞÖÜF)...**

ÁÔB Ţ**ijŖŮ**;ÔÓÚŢŨŢ**ŎĀÔP:** ÃŐŢŨ (¾ÔŘÔ-ÔŨŶ)...^ÃŐ ×¤ŒŮ ÆÔ^ÃŐ ŸŒŇ "Ö»Ю....**.(¾ÔŘÔ-ÔŨŶ)...**

ÁÜS ^ ÖÄÜÖÖÖÄÖ ÖB. <Ö. ÛÚS ÝÖ»ÖŸÖS ®ÖEĕ ÆŰ....**(¾ÖÄÖÖÖ**)...

ÁÖB ÃÖÇÖ,Ü †»ÖB (×ÖEÖ,Ù: ÃÖ,Ü ...(¾ÖÖÖÖÖ)...

> **Ö - Ö-Ö - ŠÃÚ Á**, Ü (Ö • ÖÃ É Ö • Ö): ÃÖ , Ü...**(¾ÖÄ-Ö • Ö**)...

ÁÖB Ţ**iřů ;Ö**ÓÚŢÜ TĂÖÖ¤Ü : ÃÖŢŲ ^ÃÖ ×¤ÐÖ ÆÖ^ÃÖ ŸŨEù "Ö»ÖÖ....**.(¾ÖÖÖÖÖ**Ö)...

AB - ACOUNT It is not the fault of the Prime Minister.

ÁÖB . iĕB ; ÖÓÚ, Ü "ŌÁÖD¤Ü ÃÖ, Ü ...**(340X8-009)...**» ÖĞÜÜĞ, ÃÖ, ÛÜĞ Ü ÜÜĞ ²ÖVÖ9Ö "ÖVÆEK...**(340X8-009)...** ÃÔ,Ų TÔÔ ¤Ē,Õ ÛWB TÔRÔ;µÔÛWÔÔ ÃÔÔ-ÔË. ÆŬÔ "ÔŒÆÔÔE XÛW ŢÃÔ Ō,Ū ŌB. <´Ô. •ÔRÔÔPÔ ¤Ē. ...(34034-009)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, the Government should say something on this. ...(Interruptions)....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right. Okay. ...(Interruptions).... Now we will take up Special Mentions. ...(Interruptions).... You can discuss it in the BAC. ...(Interruptions)...‡Ale 2018 < All (1) with with which is a special with the control of the co Mentions. Shri Ram Kripal Yadav to lay on the Table.

ÁÖB Ţ**ÖÖ ÛŒĞÖXÖ µÖܤÆÜ (**XÖEÖŢ) : ÃŎŢŲ TĞŢÖ ¾ÜXÄĀEÖO ÜÜÖ TÜŢ® ÆÜ....**(¾DXA-OP)...**

AB ~ TAPED TO PUTE TO SOME OU 'I am laying on the Table." Are you laying on the Table?

ÁÖB Ç**Ö Ö Ú É ÖÖNÖ µÖÖ¤ AĞ** : ÃÖ ÇÜ ÖÇ Ö ¾ÖRÄÄ EÖÖ Û LÖ ÖÇ Ö ÆÜ**(¾ÖRÄ-ÖÖÖ)...**

SPECIAL MENTIONS*

Demand to make a uniform policy for increase in toll rates on National Highways in the country

ÂCB † CEO TO LOÇO TO LOÇO TO LOÇO): "O LOCO) : "O LOCO) † † CEO LOS † CEO LOS TO LOS TOLOS O ÃO LOS TOLOS O ÃO LOS TOLOS O ÃO LOS TOLOS O ÃO LOS TOLOS DE CONTRO ÃO LOS TOLOS DE CONTRO LOS TOLOS TOLOS DE CONTRO LOS TOLOS TOLOS DE CONTRO LOS TOLOS DE CONTRO LOS TOLOS DE CONTRO LOS TOLOS DE CONTRO LOS TOLOS DE CONTRO LOS TOLOS DE CONTRO LOS LOCATION LOS LOCATION LOS LOCATION LOS LOCATION LOS LOCATION LOS LOCATION LOS LOCATION LOS LOCATION LOS LOCATION LOS LOCATION LOC

^{*}Laid on the Table.

Đườc CLUCO ×ÔPTO 30x80 †×OYTOCHPO XÚx< ÆB TO ĐÔ ĐÚ Lị ××INO YQUO CÔ? ^ÃCÔUB ĐƯỜC ÃÔ CỤÕÃO XÔO YOC ÆÐE ×Úú ÚÆÖ ŸŐÚÚ •Ö'ÖS®Ö ×Ő»Ö •ÖÖ<ŸŐS †Ö¸ü ÚÆÖ µÖÆü µÖÆÖ ÞÖÖ ÖÆÐ ÆÐEÖS?

"ÔÆÔ®¤NDÔ, "ÔKŶÔ "ÔÔÆÛ ≯R•Ô»Ô ÛN ¤Ô°ÔÔË "ĈE ¾Ô®"Û †2Ô ×®ÔµÔ×ÔŸÔ °Þ"Ô ÃĈE ÆÔË "NÆR ÆŨ, TÔ, ÞOÙ Đà XP ÞÔ •QUÔ CH ÞÆIÐ ÞA ÞÔ PÔ •Ô PÔÐ •Ô PÔÐ TÔÆÐS ÉR ÁCE †×ÔÚÚ TÔÆÐSÓ ÆLGE YQUÔ ÆLL. ÇЕÔ ÖXOÐ ÚUS ÆLEÐYÐ µÔÆü Æŭ ×Ûú ÖÆBÖČE ×±ú,ü ³ÖB 5 'ÖÖ'B ÃČE ÛÚ'Ö ÃÖ'QUÖ 'ÖE •QUÖ'QGÜ ÃČE פB>×ÖB †Ö°ÖÖ ÆĞÜĞÖ EÖÖ... YÖNÖ ¤Ôê XÔNÔO ÁÔE YÔÔE µÔYEU ÁÔ ÔµÔ 20œÛDÚ,U 6 ÁÔE 7 'ÔD'U ÆLÔE YÔµÔO ÆU XÔÆU 3ÔS YÔPÔ •ÔPÔ , ÔÁYÔE ÔE †ÔK ××48° ÆÐEE ¾ÖNÖ •ÖÖÖ •Ö ×ÖNÜ. CHÖ <ÃÜE ÜE ±ÚÖ «Õ,Ö ™ÖNÖ ¤Ü ĕ ŸŒÐEÖÖ PICHÖÄÖÖÖ ÆÐ? ÖÆÐEŸJÖ, 'Ô TÔ ÔĐĐ TÔ HỘ Ở ÂÔE ÔĐÔS ÔT ĐƯỢC Á ÂC ÔE ĐƯƠC ĐƯỚC Ở ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC ÂÔ ÔT ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC ≫Ů< ÛúĎŧÔ <Ûú 9ÔNŸÔ 2Ö9ÔS ÆŧŧÔ Æŭ μÖÖ 9ÔÆŭ μÖÖ †®BÖÐÐÖÖ ±ú°Ő †ÖPÐE ÆLÍÁÖÐÖ ÁÖE ÖXÝÐXÁHÖ ‡ÁÖĞE ‡•00±10 Oú, NOS _NENOS AEU †0, W ^9EB "ODO90e OB 200¤W 30S †0°0 •0°000 Oude ^AO _0•0°0000 Oute ^AO ÃÖBÂÐÖXÓ ^ ÖSÖÐ-Ö ÆÐI ÞÖÐ ÞÐEÐ, ‡ÃÜE ¤ÐJÖÐE ÚÐS ≫Ö ÖÐÐÐ,Ð SÚÁÃÖÐÐS ÆÐ? †Ö,U ™ÖÐSÖ ¤ÜJÖE ÚÐE ÞÖÐÐÐE Ûtê ²00× tit YÔ, ti , **0•**0 00700 70, ti Âŭekê-to<0 70; ti Âŭekê to<0 ×0, de †û, ti Âŭekê-to, °ÝVENI ÆÜL. ÔÇÔ ÔGÔB ÔÆÔPŸDÔ ÂĞE †ÖYÖFÜ ÆÜ ÆÜ ×ÛÚ <ÛÚ ²ÔÜ Ü ××Ï>×ÔS ÂĞE •QUÔĞI Ü ÂD>DÚÚ ÔÖYÖD ÂĞE •000ú ji ¤nĐiề x0ú xãÔXÔ CLƯƠ ÆA? ‡ÃÔ YÔ NEU †®NOĐĐÔÔ ±ứ Cũ Cước ™ÔSÔ ¤ijê 20chỗ® Cước ″êVi ®VEã ÆÐEÐS "ÖÐÆIK, ‡ÃÖDÁ »Ö< DúÖÞÓ <ÛÚ ÃÖÖÐÐ ÞÐSŸÖ ÆÐEÐS "ÖÐÆIK...

Demand to take steps to provide adequate facilities to tourists for development of tourism in Andaman and Nicobar

ÁÖKÖTÖK ×PÖÖNÖD ÚÚ; JUÖÖ ÁĞeeii («ÆüÖÖ"Ö»Ö TÖ¤**ĕ**Ö) : TÖÆÖE•IIÖ, TÖ †ÖTÖÜÉ TÖÖJÜÖ ÁÖE ÁÖ, ÍÚÚÖ, II ÚÚÖ -µ0090 ¤ặÔ Đế "Quốt khô Đưới Vỹ jihú ∞ bi đượi "đượi khác kiếc Aciđo à ¤ặÔ để 20 chố Ádo à "Quốt bú £Ó»Ô ÆŲ ×0°90úß †Čeŭ 0ú0±0° +µ00°9° 90±0 ××µ00° •00700... ‡ÄÖ ÄGÞÐ00° ČE Ö †6° ŭ00°9×°90ú6±00, ü 0ú0° ^×**0**0±0¢**b**0 ×xero "coveedas... 'Ci †-0°re cox, ero i Oé Accelo soveno Voto Eos, »obloiro cete por i ×doci vidici i ×eloco i cete co xÔú Đềwi lới °Đề Yới Atiố: 20thờ Đề Việu Xi xwini Đãy có Đế Việu Đối Đế XI XI XI XI XI XI XI XI XI XI XI XI XI AĒŪ. TÖDEYÔ 2≫ĢĒQŪ Û É ÃÖ ÖĻB ŸÖ™Ü TÖ,Ü ÃÛŒĞÖ >ÕĻDRÕYÖ †Ö.¤Ü ŽÖEBÖ ÃÖÖ,B YÖEÄÖ £ÖA, TÖ,®ÖE ¾AVEAO UÆ"Û 3°C ¾ÖÖÄÆEÖYÖ ¶ÖÆN EÖÜ.. ¾ÖÆÖÖ ¿ÖÖYÖSÄÜÖ †Ö¸Ü ÖÆNSÖ†ÜE ÛÜÜE ÛÜĞ ÛN ÖS Þ 2Ö¤NSÖ¶ÜE ÛÆ ≫Ö< 3°CS •ÖÜE ÆEÖÖ¶Ö 2090e £Ce, 30e TO¢CO,000 »OYOOO ú,ü 2090c YOk £Ce. 30e AOPO ™Mere±e2me †O,ü YOG+ë £Ce. ×±ú,ü ÆüÖ ÄÖ,OboO,& ±é, B Ôé «Đ, Ö TÖCEYÔ 2» QBÔ, ũ ÃCE ÆBÔ» QĐÔU ÝÖ<, •CÔE <>, QHÔO ÔUÔ ÃÔ PÔÃCE ÃÔ BÇU †Ô, ũ ¤ÂBÔ, È ®Ô 2Ô, ũ ÔUÔ 208″O AEŭ. ×OÃO ±éjos (ĉe AEŭO ¾ÖAEĞO YÖ<, ^ÃÖ'DE ″ú <µÖ¸ÛÛÓ> ¡ÇŌŸÕÃÖ »ÖYÜE EÇE °Ö¸ÜÜGE ÃĞPÖ ÜÖ¸ÖPÖ EÇE. ^®YÔE ĂŨE <ŨÚ 3ÔB <.ĂŬB. ŬŀĎŮ ®ŶÆŭ ŨÚĹŮ ĮVEĎ £ŨÔ †ÔĻŮ XÔÆĎÔ 2ÔÆŬÔ ÆBB 2ÔŢB ÆĎĠŠŨÔ £ŬB... XÔÆĎÔ ÃÔĿĽŮŦÔ 9ÔÔÔ ÛKB ÛKŮŢÔ "ÔS•Ô 9ŬEKÔ EŮB.. ¾PEKÔ 3ÔB ÃÔ, ŴKÔ, Ŭ ÚKB ŸÔ, ŒK ÃŨE ÛKŮŢÔ ŬCÔÃÔ ¾KŮXÃECÔ 9ĎEK EČB †ČJU ^ÃÖ ÃEČÍPÐ ÔÚČE TJJÓÐYÐÐ ÔÚB ¥HÀMU ÁČE ÁÐBÁÐÖÐÐÐÐÚ ®ÐEÐ 20°ÐDJÓÐ YQJÓÐ EÖD.. TÖLEÐÐE TOJU TOVOÐ "Ö»ÖÖ ×Ûú ÃÖ,ÛUÖ,Ü ¾ÖFEÖÖ ±Ó⊳Ü ¾ÖEÖÖÖ ÆÜL. ÖÏ ÃÖ,ÛUÖ,Ü ÃÜE ÖZEÆÖÖ "ÖÖFEÜĞB ÆÐÆ ×Ûú ¾ÖFEÜ ÖÄÖÖ ÛVÆÖÖ •00/00 ÆP ‡90 ÃÔ CH B YÔ MÔE Ô CÚE £00‡8Ô> Ü †Ô, Ü †900 ¤#, QUE Ô CB YÔ, ŒÜ Œ HOË 90ÆB 2090,000 •00/00, †Ô′Ô¤Œ® ³Œ •μÔÔ¤**Ô ÆÕ**ˌ...

†ŸĊ: †Ö*ÖŌē ´ÖÖ+pÖ'Ő ĀČĒ ĀÖ¸ĐƯŌ¸Ü ĀČĒ ĆĒţŮ †®ŌţÕĒŌ ÆŪ ×Ūú ¯ÖŒ*Õ ²»ĢĒŌ¸Ū ĀÖ'ÕĒſM ŸŌ™Ü ¯Ō¸Ü †"″M ĀÕĒĀŌŌ<Ó ^¯Ö»PÖ-Ö Ūú¸Ů‡Ô •ÖO< ŸÖDŪú †×ÖŪú ĀČĒ †×ÖŪú ĀÖ»ÖÖ®B ¾ÄÆÕÖ ŪúB ĀÕĒŪ¸ÜÖÖ ŪúĎ †Ö®ÐĒŪ ^ŠÜ ĀÕĎĀ...

Demand to give compensation and waiving of crop loans to farmers of Karnataka

SHRI AAYANUR MANJUNATHA (Karnataka): I would like to draw the kind attention of the hon. Minister of Agriculture towards damages caused by heavy rainfall in Karnataka.

Districts of Shimoga, Chickmangalur, Mangalore, Udipi and North Kanada have been severely affected by heavy rainfall in recent times. Crops like paddy, arecanut, maize, ginger, vegetable, flowers, etc. are lost due to this heavy rainfall. As per estimation given by the Agricultural Department of Karnataka, the loss is estimated about Rs. 2,000 crores to Rs. 3,000 crores. Crops are also affected by Phytophthora diseases.

Hence, I urge upon the Union Government that: (i) compensation should be given to the farmers; (ii) current year crop loan should be waived; (iii) agricultural loan should be restructured; and (iv) research has to be carried out on Phytophthora disease so that the poor farmers can be saved from loan and financial burden and committing suicides due to excess burden.

Demand to take effective measures for smooth disbursement of loans under Kissan Credit Cards scheme to farmers in Assam

SHRI PANKAJ BORA (Assam): Loan disbursement to farmers in Assam is very poor. Around 27.5 lacs farm families, of which 85 per cent being small and marginal farmers, are in the need of bank credit. The State Government has taken initiatives to enhance credit flow by simplifying the procedure for Kisan Credit Cards (KCC) and has waived stamp duty on loans up to Rs. 50,000.00; it is also giving interest subvention up to Rs. 2.0 lacs on all crop loans. The scheme is reviewed regularly at all levels of State Government. But the Nationalised Banks, on one pretext or the other, delay the KCC proposals and harass the farmers. The general Credit Deposit Ratio in Assam is below 46.60 per cent as against the national norms of 60 per cent and the apathy shown by the banks in disbursing KCC loans have compounded the farmers' miseries. The outreach of banking facilities is poor, as population per branch is above 18,000 as against the national

average of less than 14,000, and the operating area is 50 sq. km. per branch, making it virtually impossible for a farmer to visit a bank in times of need. Moreover, many branches are under-staffed causing further misery to the farmers. The banks also do not issue cards and the loan sanctioned is only for a season and not for the whole year and the amount sanctioned is not adequate.

It is, therefore, urged that the Government should immediately look into these matters and initiate immediate effective steps for smooth credit disbursement and should also open more bank branches, especially in remote areas with adequate staff, so that the farmers in Assam can avail themselves of the bank credit facilities.

RE. HIKE IN PETROL AND DIESEL PRICES - Contd.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, now we will take up Statutory Resolution and The National Food Security Bill. Please(Interruptions)....²ÚŠÍK., ²ÚŠÍK.......(4ĎÍÚÚ)... All of you please sit down. †ÚÚ »ÚÚÚ ŽÍŠÍK......(4ĎÍÚÚ)... Now we have to take up(Interruptions).... Please sit down.(Interruptions).... All of you please sit down. Hon. Members, now we have to take up Statutory Resolution and National Food Security Bill. The House knows that both will be discussed together, but I will call the first person who has given the Notice to move the Resolution. If he is not there, then the next person, i.e. Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad will move the Resolution. We are going to take up the Statutory Resolution and The National Food Security Bill.

Shri Ram Jethmalani to move the Statutory Resolution. Is he present? ...(Interruptions)... He is not present. Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad to move the Resolution.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I am making a request to you. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: I am making a request to you. In my place, the hon. Leader of the Opposition will speak, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think the House agrees on that. The hon. Leader of the Opposition to move the Statutory Resolution.

ÁÖB ÃÖĞÖ,Ü †»ÖB («ÖFÖ,) : ÃÖ,Ü Ö †ÖTÄÜE •ÖÖÖÖÖ "ÖDEÜÖ Æ**E.(¾ÖĞÖÖ)...**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please. †ÜÜ ÜŠÜK.....(4000)...

ÁÖB ÃÖD-ÖÇÜ †»ÖB: ÃÖ¸Ü ÖÖ †ÖÖÄÖE <ÛÚ ×ÖPPMÜ ÛÛÖ ÃÖÖÞÖ ÖÖÖÖYÖÖ ¸**ÆÜ...(¾DD-ÖÖF)...**

ÁÜB ^ ÖÄÖFÖÖÖVÖ : ÛŒ ÖÞÖ, †ÖÖ ²ÖKK......(¾ÖÖFÖ)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. ...(Interruptions)...

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖ,Ü †»ÖB: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is not going on record. ...(Interruptions)...

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖ († »ÖB : *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. \dots (Interruptions)... It is not going on record. Take your seat.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖÜ †»ÖB: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please. It is not going on record. You sit down.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖ,Ü †»ÖB: *

ÁŪS ^ ŪĀŪPŪŪČVÖ : ¾ĀÆÜ ׸ŪŪŪS Ô ÜĒ ŪĀÆÐ •ÖÖ ¸ŪÆÐ ÆŰ, ŸÜÜĒ ×±ú¸Ü †ÖÖ ŒμÖÜĒ ²ÖÖSÖ ¸ŪÆÐ ÆŬ?...(¾ΦÜÄ-ŪŪPO)...‡ÃÖ ŸÖ¸ŪÆÜ ĀÜĒ ²ÖÖSÖPÜĒ ĀÜĒ ŒμÖÖ ±ŪŮμ֤РÆŰ.....(¾ΦÜÄ-ŪŪPO)...•ŪÆÐ, ¤ŪÆÐ, †ÖÖ ²Ü·ŠÜk......(¾ΔÜÄ-ŪŪPO)...

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖ Ü †»ÖB : *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are wasting time. ...(Interruptions)... Don't waste the time of the House.

^{*}Not recorded.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖ²Ö ü †»ÖB : *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, please.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖ₹Ö,ü†»ÖB∶*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I request his Party leaders to ask him to sit down.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖ₹Ö,ü†»ÖB∶*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, please.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖÜ T»ÖB: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. I have given the floor to the hon. LoP. ...(Interruptions)... Please sit down.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖÜ †»ÖB: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is this?

ÁÖB ÃÖÖ²Ö¸ü †»ÜB∶*

ÁÖB ÃÖÖ₹Ö ü †»ÖB : *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But, what is this? Sit down.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖ²Ö,ü †»ÖB∶*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not going on record. You sit down.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖ ü †»ÖB : *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. What is this?

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖ Ü †»ÖB : *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is very bad. Very unfortunate! One Member...

ÁÖB ÃÖÖ²Ö,ü†»ÖB∶*

ÁB ^ ÖÄĞÖÖÖÖÖ : †ÖÖ ²ÖĞÜK.....(¾ÖĞÖÖÖ)...

ÁÖB ÃÖÖ²Ö,ü †»ÖB∶*

^{*}Not recorded.

ÁŮS ^ ŪÄÜÜÖÄÜÖ : †ÜÜ ÄÜŠÜK.....**(¾ÜÄÄÜÄÖ)...**†ÜÜ ±Ü¿Ü ®ÜÜ™ÄÜ ¤ê ¤**ß⊷**Ük......**(¾ÜÄÄÜÄÖ)...**

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖ Ü †»ÖB: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. That is not going on record.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖ2Ö Ü †»ÖB: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. It is indiscipline.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖ²Ö¸ü†»ÖB∶*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is the height of indiscipline.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖ²Ö¸ü†»ÖB∶*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. Height of indiscipline! ...(Interruptions)... Don't behave like that.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖ₹Ö ü †»ÖB : *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. ...(Interruptions)... You sit down there.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖ Ü T»ÖB: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am asking you to sit down.

ÁÖB ÁÖÖ2Ö ü †»ÖB : *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am saying, you sit down there.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖ Ü †»ÖB : *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You sit down there.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖ Ü †»ÖB: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will have to expel you if you behave in this way. ...(Interruptions)... Sit down there.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖÜ T»ÖB: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Do you want me to expel you? ...(Interruptions)... What are you doing? ...(Interruptions)... Very bad! I would request his seniors to advise him. ...(Interruptions)... Is there anybody who can influence him?

ÁÖB ÃÖÖ₽Ö ü †»ÖB : *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think his Party leaders are sitting here. Why don't you advise him, N. K. Singh sahib?

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖ Ü †»ÖB : *

^{*}Not recorded.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is he saying? ...(Interruptions)... What can I do?

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖÜ T»ÖB: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What does he want? ...(Interruptions)... I don't know. ...(Interruptions)... If he wants to say something, he can give Notice.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖ Ü †»ÖB : *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What does he want? He has been speaking for the last ten minutes. ...(Interruptions)...

ÁÖB ÃÖÖ₹Ö,ü†»ÖB∶*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is his problem? ...(Interruptions)... What is your problem?

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖ ü †»ÖB: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Zero Hour is over. How can I bring back Zero Hour now? N.K Singhji, can I bring back Zero Hour now? It is over. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI N.K. SINGH (Bihar): Sir, he wants to speak for only one minute.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has been speaking for ten minutes. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SABIR ALI: I will take only 30 seconds, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have taken ten minutes. What are you saying?(*Interruptions*)....†"" Ö 2000k, what do you want to speak?

ΑΘΒ ΑΘΘ-ΘΟ, ΨΤ » ΘΕ: ΑΘ, Ψ΄ ΤΟ μΟΣΕΝ Ο ΜΕΘΕΡΟ "Ο ΜΕΘΕΡΟ ΕΦΕΡΟΝ ΤΟ ΕΦΕΡΟΝΑΙΚΑ, • ΘΕ ΤΕΡΟΘΕΡΟΝΑΙΚΑ, • ΘΕ ΤΕΡΟΘΕΡΟΝΑΙΚΑ ΑΘΡΟΝΑΙΘΕ 20 ΙΑ ΑΘΡΟΝΑΙ

-

^{*}Not recorded.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is all. Now, you sit down. ...(Interruptions)...†2Ö †ÖÖ 2ÖŠik...**...(¾ÖÖÖÖ)...**

ÁÖS ÃÖG-²Ő ü †»ÖS : ÃŐ Ü †ÖDÖSŐ TÖDS Œ™ÃŐ...(**¾ÖGÖÖ)...**-ÃŐ±Ô <ŒÃŐ ÖÖE'Ô TŐ Ü 15 ÆÜFŐŐ Ü ÚÚ ÖS Ù ÛtÔ ® ¾Õ±Ô » ŒÚ,ÃÖ ÆŬ ...(¾ÖÖÖÖÐ)...

ÁÜB ^-(ÃÜ'GÖÖÖÖÖ : †20 †ÖÖ 2ÖKŠÜK......(¾ÜÖÖÖÖ)...

ÁŮB ÃŰG-Ö, Ü †»ÜB : ÃÖ, Ü ÞŰÆÜ ¤ÐÖ ÚÐ ××Ö< ÆŰ....**(¾ÚÖÆ-ÖÖÐ)...**

ÁÜB ^-(ÃÜ'GÖÖÖÖÖ : †20 †ÖÖ 2ÖKŠÜK......(¾ÜÖÖÖÖ)...

ÁÖB ÃÖD²Ö,ü †»ÖB : ÃÖ,Ü ÆŬÖ 25 ÆÐÖÖ,Ü ÛÚ,ÖBÌ ÛUB ²ÖÖÖ ÛÚ,ĎÜE ÆÜ. ×ÃÖÐÔ †ÖR®ÖÞÖRÁÖB <ÛÚ <ÃÜB ÃŨĀĒÖÖ ÆÜ ×Ûú †ÝÖ¸Ü ¾ÕÆÜ ‡ÔÖÖ®Ö¤Ö¸B ÃÜ£.**(¾ĎÆÖÖÐ)...**

ÁÖB ^~ÖÄÜFÖÖÖÄÖ : ÜE**B ~ÖEÖÖÖ**Ö ÆÜ ×Ûú †²Ö †ÖÖ ²Ö*Sük.....**(¾ÖXƏ-ÖÖFÖ)...**

ÁÖB ÃÖÖZÖ,Ü †»ÜB : ÃÖ,Ü ÖÖ ÖÖÖÖ ÃÖÖ»Ö ÃÜE ^ÃÖ ÛÚ×Ö™**B** ÖE Æ**ÉE...(¾ĎZªÖÖĞ)...**

ÁÖB ^-ŒÜĞĞÖÖ ÖXÖ : ´ÜÇ**B** -Œ**ĞÜĞ**Ö ÆÜ xÛú †²Ö †ÖÖ ²Ö\$İK.....**.(¾ØĞĞÖĞĞ**)...

ÁÖB ÃÖB°Ö,ü †»ÖB : ÃÖ,Ü, ÖÖ µÖÆÜ **×**Ö Ö®Ö,B ÃÜE ÛWÆÜ ,ÆÐ ÆÐE ŶÚ 40 ÆÜÖÖ,Ü ÛÚ,ÖBÌI ×ÃÖ±Ô ȆBÛ 6° ĈĈ ĈĪ ĀĈĒ 20"Ö< •ÖÖ ĀČÛ ÚŸĈĒ ÆŪ....(34ĈĒĞ-ÖĞŸ)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't waste time. You have made your point. I have allowed you.

ÁÖB ÃÖÖ≥Ö,Ü †»ÖB : »ÖEÛÚ® ÃÖ,ÛÚÖ,Ü ^ÃÖ Ö,Ü ¬µÖÖ® ®VE**A ¤Ü**ÖB...**...(¾ÖÖAÖÖ®)...**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One Member taking the House to ransom. I will be forced to adjourn. ...(Interruptions)... Now, hon. Leader of the Opposition.

STATUTORY RESOLUTION DISAPPROVING THE NATIONAL FOOD SECURITY ORDINANCE (NO. 7 OF 2013)

AND

THE NATIONAL FOOD SECURITY BILL, 2013

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): Sir, I move:

"That this House disapproves the National Food Security Ordinance (No. 7 of 2013) promulgated by the President of India on 5th July, 2013."

-7009990NO ^-0A(POTOXO •03, •00e 0AY00X490 09e Ous Ati √Oú _0A™0NO U00≥099 ÃO 500 Oud9090 Oe ÃÖĞÖĞÖ ÜE •ÖĞE †-µÖ≥ığıÖ †ÖµÖÖ, µÖÆü †-µÖÖ≥ığıÖ Üe †×ÖÖ!Ö,ü ÜıÖ ¤ely"QuÖĞÖ £ÖÖ... ÜÖÖ≥Ö®Ö ÃÖçbÖÖ ÜıÖ †×ÖÜÜÜ Ü ×ÖÖÜE ÖEB ÖÖ™i ‡ÃÖÜÜÖ ÖBÖÖ °ÞÖ ÃÜE ÃÖÖEÖÖÖ ÛÚ ÜÖB ÆŬ »ÖEÜÜĞÖ ×°ÖÄÖ YÖ BÜÜ ÃÜE µÖÆÜ †-µO>¤iO »OQOO YQOO †O;u ‡ÃO QuÔ®OOO Qué †&iiu •Oè »OQOO Æii ^ÃO CE 20EiiO ÃGOO;u Quß YOGOC;i Æü.

μΟΕ¨ΙΙ †-μΟΟ=ĕ̞O 5 •O&OO‡O 2013 UúCe †OμOO... ΑΟΘΑΦ-ΟΟ®O UúB -OO¸O 123 Ué YOÆNO †-μΟΟ=¤̞O ÝCPO »COLOO •COVOO AEŭ •CPO ÃOÃO⊃¤ ÛNO ÃO;O 20\$COPĈE CE ÃO QUO ÆLDE †O,U ÛNÔŒFO <ÃCO ×ÃOÂQUO †O ÝQUO Æde • Ode ĀQjÕ Või †Ö9de YÖVú TOVOSSOO 9VEN Vújü ÄOVIVÕ... If there is a matter of utmost urgency which can't await the session of Parliament, the Ordinance-issuing power of the Government is used, which is like an executive legislation. 5 • 00 2013 UCE £00... 30 ×∞.690ê (0ê <**A**.00 Œμ00 Æ**de**90ê ¾**0**0>00 £00 ×Uú ΑΟΑΟ×ΰ Ué ∞**de**90ê ΑΟ∞690 "0'000 Uú, **i**blé ‡ΑΟ∪ίαθε -TOX-NO Uújü ×NOÇ ‡AO'CE ACBOQü »CE †OYCE ÆÜO ^ACUUß TOYCBOOO ®VÆBO UúYCE £CD? ŒμCO ‡AO ×CO»O ´CE Ûa"û <ÃOÔ £OÔ ×Ûú 30 פÆÔÊ ĈE ÆŬĈE ÛŒÆÔ>Ô µĈE Ûa"û ÛŒµÔÔ Ûú¸ÆĈE £Ô? ĈŒŶÊ •ĈPÔ ‡ÃÔ †ÔÐ ÆÑÃÔ Uille Octo, YOLE \$4006 [E>000] YOLE \$000 OE >0000 Ati "Every person belonging to priority households, identified under sub-section (1) of Section 10, shall be entitled to receive a certain amount of foodgrains." < ÎLE • ^QÔUẨC ×, DỮUNGS ¤Qũ "ÔU "Ở TOO ÂU NÃO ĐƠN CHỊ TRỊC TẠO TO THÀ THỊ THỊ THỊ THỊ THỊ THỊ THỊ TỤ TẬU TỤ TẬU TỤ THÝ µOÆÜ ×UúYO®E »OŒOË UúOE פïµOO •OO×YOO, µOÆÜ Uĕ¦Ü UúB AQ,ŪUQ,Ü YQµO Uú,¥GB... Œ»OŒO 10 µOÆÜ UúÆNOO .Æü ×Ûú ‡ÃÔ "ŒE©×°ÖUdYÖ "ĈE ÛdŒPO »ÖŒÖ †Ö×WĈE µĎÆü ¸Õ•µÔ YQLÔ Ûú,NĈE. Œ>Œ>Œ•Û 10(1) ÛdÔ "ŒÆŒ‡•ŒE Un Trovided that the State Government may, as soon as possible, but within a period not exceeding 365 days, after the commencement of this Act, identify the eligible households in accordance with the guidelines framed under this sub-section".

'ÖÆĞE''''', ™ÃO'Ğ, ÖFÊ 20, ÎPÔ'Ğ, Ü ÂÖ ÛĞPÊÐ ÛĞÊ ÖŒĞ ÆÜ. ÛĞ ÂĞ ÛĞ Ğ ÂĞ X. Ö'ĞEĞ, ÎÜĞ ÆÜ à ÖÖÄÄÇ'Ö>֙аÜ ÆÜ †ÖB>ÖKYÖÇÖÄÖ ÆÜ †>ÖÜĞ ÖĞÇÜ ÆÜ. Ö°IĞ ÖĞÇÜ ÖĞ ÖĞ ÖĞ ÆÜ. ÖĞÖ > **ÖD Û LÞÔÐ GÁ ÖKEU (_GÁT™ÁÐÖ _GÞÖ-ÖÐÝBB ÖĞĞÖ, פW×ÖD) :** ‡ÁĞB×VÖK _GÞ µÖ ÁÖ, Ú LÓÐ, ÓÆ Ú LÓÐE ¤B ÝÖ‡Ó ÆŪL.

AOB † 14PO • CENTAOB : 70 ^AODKO A380YOYO DÚ,Ů JÆFO ÆBE † QŮ †YQŮ DĚJŮ "COÆË YOUE «DKAOB JO•µO 'ŐE 'ŒAŒŬú,ũ ‡ÃÔ ŨĸÔ >ĠĸĎ,Œ™ũ ≫Ĥ™ŒYĎœŒŶŮ Ũú,ŒŶŎ "ŒŒŖ ŸŨE ¾ŒŒ ÃŒŒĂ ÃŒŒ ÃŬE ŶŒĂ ÆŒ. †²Ô ¸Õ•µŒĔ Uli ×Uli/1090e (Oblyo (Opus Ati •00e † 090e oli•you Uli † »0/0+»0/0 Adi-1000 ¤ë jiltë Atii. Different Chief Ministers are giving different suggestions. Several Chief Ministers are writing to the Centre about 'what are the peculiarities of the scheme which will suit my State, the extent of coverage, the kind of nutritious food to be given, the extent of food to be given, the wages of food to be given, etc.' All these are matters which the Chief Ministers of States are writing about, 'I have schemes in my State which are better and superior schemes and I would like to continue with them.' If they want to do that, so this whole concept that the Centre decides one size and that one size will fit everyone irrespective of the peculiar situation in the States. We \$\pm\$ \$\pm ¿CQDÖ¤Ü µÖÆÜ †ÖÖÜĞ ×>Ö< †ÖÄĞ;µÖÜÚ ÆĞĞÖÖ ×ÛÚ ÜÖÖÖÖ®Ö ÛÜÖ †×ÖÜÜÇÜ ÆĞÇ »ÖÜÜĞÖ ÆÜÜÜ ÇĞ•µÖ ÛĞ †¶DasoÖ ^ÄÖÜLÖ •ÖE »Ö'ÖS»ÖÖÖÖ µÖÖ °»ÖÆÄÖZÖ»ÖMG•Ö ÆÜ ÆÜÜ "Ö•µÖ Û£ †¶DasoÖ, †YÖ,Ü †ÖÖ ^¶E , Ô∙µÔCE Ú é %vĩ Ô, lì "Ôb• lì ¤hÔCẹ VỚCe •ÔCE ÔĐUNÔ CĐÔS Ú ÚĐE JEE ATU ×ÚÚ ĆĘ ĕ , Ô•µÔ Ú ưS µÔCE Ô9ÔO ‡ÃOÃĆE 20ENOĮU AEU µCO 10ĘB **_0•**µO 10uB •00E 100EO×10UdYOO †0ĮU †0NA;µOUdYOO AEU 30AEU ‡AO 10u099BBO ACE †»OYO ÆÜ ŸÖÖÊ ¿ÖÖµÖ¤Ü ²ÖÆEŸÖ¸Ü ÆÖRÖÖ...

^~MîỞΟΫΟ •CB, <Ôú ΫΟΟΟ ∞ΦΦΟ •CD ¸ΦΕΟ ÆÜ ×Ôú •CDE CD•CDEΟ μΟΘ•CPOXO ÆŪ, ^90 μΟΘ•CPOTŒ CE <¶™ΦΦ™™ΦΟČŒ™ ÆÜ, T×COUÔ,Ü ®ŒEÙ ÆÜ TÖ,Ü ‡ÃΟΟÛ ²Ö©¤Ü <Ôú T×COUÔ,Ü ×CЬ»ŒŒ...

Entitlement will now become a right. Sir, at times, the devil is in the details. I would like the hon. Minister to read with me the most important clause, clause 3(2). The argument is that 75 per cent of the rural population and 50 per cent of the urban population is going to ipso facto benefit from this. Look at the language now. It says, "The entitlements of persons belonging to eligible households referred to in sub-section (1) at subsidised prices shall extend up to....." I repeat and underline 'shall extend up to seventy-five per cent of the rural population and up to fifty per cent of the urban population.' The way it is drafted, ".. seventy-five per cent of rural house population and fifty per cent of urban population..." is not the base, it is the outer cap. This cap is not a fixed cap. Read clause 2 now in conjuction with clause 9. It says, "The percentage coverage under the Targetted Public Distribution System in rural and urban areas for each State shall, subject to sub-section (2) of section 3, be determined by the Central Government and the total number of persons to be covered in such rural and urban areas of the State shall be calculated on the basis of the population estimates..." With †O^™ÿü ×>O×O™ü 75 ±u8AO¤6 †O;ü 50 ±u8AO¤6 ÆQEO8.. µOÆü UïrO Æğ ²OAO ®OÆŭ Æÿ ‡AO×O< Œ>OG> 9 Ué YOÆNO 308 ‡AO 70€ »O″OS»OOO®O †Q.ü °»OÆAO≷O«>O™O UúO †×⊙UúO,ü Ué%O⊳O Ué¦QuO AO,QuúO,ü UúO .Æü. YÖCE ‡ÃÖ ××Ô×惘 ÛúCE 75 ±úÃÃÖ¤6 †Ö,Ü 50 ±úÃÃÖ¤6 YÖÜú ×ĈE •ÖÖ9Ö ÆŬ ×ÛúYÖ9Ö Ũú´Ö Ũú,ÆÖÖ Æij ¾ÆÜ †×ÖÜÜÖÜ †ÖÖÖE †ÖÖÖE †ÖÖÖÖ "ÜÜÖ »>ÖJÖÖ ÆÜ.

** TAO TO ONO *OS, *OSE ‡ÃO *OSO Û Û †-μμο ** Δύμο † Ö, ü TO Û ΔΕΝΟ, ü ΑΘΕΙΟ, ü ΑΘΕΙΟ * Δύ † Ö ΦΕΙΟ ** ΔΙΑΘΕΙΟ * Δύ † Ö ΦΕΙΟ ** ΔΙΑΘΕΙΟ ** ΔΙΑ

ΫΟΘΕ 12 ΑΕΉ-ΟΙ, □ Οὐ, ΦΕΝΙ 1/ΓΦΡΟΟ 100-ΦΕΝΟ μΟΘΕΘΡΌΤΤΟΕ ΤΟΕ ΑΕΘΌ ΤΟΙ, □ •ΟΘΕΝΙ ΣΑΙΘΕ μΟΥΕΘΙ ΤΟΡΟΒ •ΟΒ ΟΔΟ ΟΔΑΕΘΕΟ ΑΕΘ. 1.00 P.M.

The National Food

- COPTE 20-0™U Û6 •CÛE >CŒLUCACEMÃO ECE ^90 ÃOO_E ¤ÃYOOXÃE ÔE ÛCÊ ÛCÊÛ ×Û4 'CO-CœÛ ÃOO>O Û6 20-0™U 'ŰE ÜÜÖ[™]ÖŸÐ ÛMB ×ÖNÖYB µÜÜEÖŸÖXÓ ÆŢi ^ŸÛÚE %TÖÜÜ †ÖÖÖE ÂÜÜÖŸÖÖ †ÖÖ^ÜÜ <\$ÖÜĞE™Ü ÂÛµÜÜ.. Food Subsidy via Targeted Public Distribution Scheme, including Rs. 10,000 crores, • We «» μθθωθ Uútθ Rs. 91,034 crores. Mid Day Meal Scheme – Rs. 13,215 crores; Integrated Child Development Scheme - Rs. 17,700 crores; National Food Security Mission - Rs. 2,250 crores; National Nutrition Mission: Computerization of PDS -Rs. 200 crores; Warehousing – Rs.145 crores. (To the Total -00x0-0090 1 »0000 13 ÆU-00,ü Ûú,dê>Li ÛúÔ 90Æŭ E0Ô, •00ê †0°09ê ÛúÆdî... ´0°9ê ‡ÃÔÛúÔ Ûé»Ô µ00êÔ »0/00µ00 Y00ê ¾04°ü Ælü 1 »00U0 24 Ælör00,ü 844 Uú,ûnòli. The total amount provided in this year's Budget on all Food Schemes, even without this Act or Bill or Ordinance, is Rs.1,24,844 crores. You have re-packaged that and now say, 'it will become an Act.' You say, 'my Schemes were an entitlement but the Act is a right.' The Act says, "... will extend up to ..." So, the language is flexible. How much it can be reduced, how much it can be raised — you keep that power reserved to yourself in the Act. Not this alone. You can look at it in another way. 'How many people are covered under your existing schemes?" #04Eü 30B †07OUiO A0AO¤ü (ČE AB ^CO, ü Aü. 100+0æ0 µCCE-Ô9O†CE CE ×ÛdYÔ9E »COÁO ÛGÂS-Ô AEP †»ÔYÔ+»ÔYÔ <ÙŮCEMÃO AEU ×Ûú ŌÇBÂŌŢU CE 4.6 »COÁO ÆDÂCE Æii μ00 4.8 ÆdiÆde Æii. We can keep that academic argument apart. ∞0/078 ′00-0æ0 μ00-070k0 ÆŸ ^ÃÔ'ĈË ÃŎĂŶĬŎ †900•Ô ×ÛŊŶŎŶĈĖ »OŒĬŎĿ ŨĸĬĠĖ ×ÔĸÔ ĮŒĔŌ ÆÐ? 82.99 ŨĸĹĠĠĸĬĿŨĸĬĠĿ †ŸŌŢĿ †Ô'ŨŨŎ µŎÆŬ -Qand 'extend up to' "Ôach פiiÖ •Ö< †Ö. ü 75 -Ö. nÄÖd'ü °b. isö †Ö. ü 50 -Ö. nÄÖd'ü †2000 »Öe »»QuÖ •Ok, YOE 10•0 UG •OPAODIO UE 10-0 ü Toüithis 82.99 crores will become 81.37 crores. What a great achievement! So, you have extended it to poor people. You have, in fact, cut down the number of people. Now, what do you do with States? And, many States and here this is a Council of States and therefore I raise the issue of States - are represented through their Members elected in the Rajya Sabha here, and that is what the Chief Ministers are writing to you. There are States with †0ΑΟΥΟ90 ΑΟΟ‡•0 4.6 μΟΟ 4.8 30S »CE »>ΟμΟΟ •ΟΟ<, YΟCE 23 μΟΟ 24 «Ūώ>ΟCE †970•0 ÆDE YΟμΟΟ.. †20 ^ÃÖ , Õ+µÖ ÛúÖ ŒµÖÖ Ûú,ij •ÕÃÕE "ŒÖÃÕYÖœŅ •ÕE 35 ×ÛúxÖŒ †9Õ+Ö ¤ĕ ,ÆĞ ÆA? †ÖÖÛß µÖŒÖ9Ö ′ÖÖ9KE µÖÖ †-Ö9OB ÖÖ9KE †Ö,ü ^ÄÖDüĞE Üü'Ö Üü,QP †ÖÖ ÜüÆü "ÜÆÜ ÆÜ ÆÜ ×Üü ¤ĞE 1ÿÖk, YÖS9Ö 1ÿÖk ⊺Ö,ü ∞**ili**do, »Gelúr® 36/4ü Yoù: <lú 1ự0< lùi ×atinhopo Áo: Tượcko Juli»od: ¤ê jiếtô Atā. Yoù: Œuơ †0°00'é lùiAfrôt: -Ő,Ü ¾ÁFEÜ >BŐ>Ő µÖŐ ₹™ÒÓ>Ő ÚÚ,BŐÖ? †ÖŐ ÁÄŒŁŐ †®Ő•Ő ¤ĕ "WEÉ ÆÜ, ¾ÁFEÜ 308 -0000 √JÚ>00ê -O/40 340°CEYÖ, 340°Eü †9°0°° 0°° 3°CS ¤180°0 Æÿ "°Ö°9°0 3°CS ¤180°0 Æÿ †ÖµÖD\$°Ö‡•>ü 9°°°ÖÛú 3°CS ¤180°0 Æÿ "°ÖS°9′S 3°CS

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, the hon. Minister would now move the National Food Security Bill, 2013 for consideration.

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS, FOOD AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION (PROF. K.V. THOMAS): Sir, I beg to move...(Interruptions)...

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ (Odisha): Sir, he is not speaking into the mike. It is not audible. ...(Interruptions)... The hon. Minister lacks conviction in the Bill. That is why he is not...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka): Sir, there is no voice security! ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, please. ...(Interruptions)... Please speak into the mike, Mr. Minister. ...(Interruptions).... Speak louder. ...(Interruptions).... After the Minister moves the Bill, we would have a break.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): Sir, I think the Minister's food security is important and so, you should break for lunch. ...(Interruptions)... Let us break for lunch. Let him eat and come back, so that we could all hear him. ...(Interruptions)...

PROF. K.V. THOMAS: Sir, I move:

"That the Bill to provide for food and nutritional security in human life cycle approach, by ensuring access to adequate quantity of quality food at affordable prices to people to live a life with dignity and for matter connected therewith or incidental thereto, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration."

The questions were proposed.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Minister, would you like to say something?

PROF. K.V. THOMAS: Sir, I would do that later.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right; he will speak after discussion. Now, hon. Members, the Statutory Resolution has been moved; the Bill for consideration has also been moved. As per practice, we will take up the discussion together. Now, it is almost 1.10 p.m. Shall we decide that there will be no lunch-break?

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right. Let us have lunch-break up to 2.00 p.m.

The House is adjourned up to 2.00 P.M.

The House then adjourned for lunch at eight minutes past one of the clock.

The House re-assembled after lunch at two of the clock,

[MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.]

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, the BJP is for the food security of all the people of the country, and for that matter every political party. In the morning, my colleague and the Leader of the Opposition, Shri Arun Jaitley, was questioning the Food Security Ordinance. Why Ordinance route when the Parliament was about to meet? I don't want to go into details because he has very neatly and rightly explained it. The reply is, "This may be a life-saver, a life-changer for many people. So, delay even by a single minute or a day, God knows how many lives it could cost." That is the answer. My colleague has doubted this Ordinance route. The response from the ruling party is, "This may be a life-saver, life-changer for many people. So, delay even by a single minute, or a day, God knows how many lives it could cost." Sir, this Food Security was part of the

Congress Party's manifesto in 2009. It was part of the Presidential Address in the Parliament also. From 2009 to 2013, how many days, how many years, how many hours, how many minutes and how many lives have been lost? The Government should explain it. After all, you said that 'delay of even a single minute will cost lives of people.' That being the case, why did you delay it for four years? You have to answer the nation. Just on the eve of your going out of power, you bring this, and that too in the form of an Ordinance when the Parliament was about to meet. That means the Government is not sincere; the Government is trying to be populistic on the eve of elections. That is the charge for which the Government has no clear-cut answer. They have no credibility. I wonder sometimes that after 67 years of Independence, 67% of the people need to be given food security. What has happened to this country? Sixty-seven years passed, 67% of the people need to be given food security. What happened to all Five-Year Plans? What happened to the Government? And that too, Sir, out of 67 years, for 57 years you have been in power. You forgot the food security. You never bothered about the common people. Now, after four-and-a-half years of your second tenure, you remember about the food security of people. Please give a reasonable explanation. That means, for 67 years you have totally neglected the common people and poor people. You never felt that there is any need to provide them food security. Suddenly, on the eve of elections, you realized that there is a need for food security and you are covering 67 per cent people. On the one hand, the Planning Commission says that the poverty is reduced considerably. On the other hand, you feel that there is a need to cover two-thirds of the population for food security. Sir, the Planning Commission is Government's creation. It is also an important body. It is speaking one language and you are speaking altogether a different language. How do you explain this contradiction? If the poverty has come down to 22 per cent as is claimed by the Planning Commission, which is thumped down by the ruling party all over the country as its great achievement, then how do you justify giving food security to two-thirds population of the country? This is the second question for which you have not been able to give a satisfactory answer so far. If you want to take the credit for bringing this Bill, please take the blame also for not covering 67 per cent people in 57 years of your rule. That is another question.

 ÝÖ GPÖB 20cHÖLLÍÐ ŒHÖÐ ÁÖB ÖGEÐ HÖB 300LÍÐ ÞÆ ÝÖ GPÖB 20cHÖLLÍÐ ×ÐYÐLÓFÐE ¤ÐE ÁÖÐSÖ ÞÐ-Ö ÞÚHJÓÖ? TÖÐÐE Ûú,ü "ÖC<, ‡ÃÖb»Ö< YÖ,QPÖB ²ÖceÙ YÖ‡Ô**....(?#ØX&ÖDFO)** YÖ,QPÖB ²ÖceÙ YÖ‡Ô ÃÖ'Ö'ÖRÖ 'ÖE ‡ÃÖO£ »Ö<* Æ**Ö**ÐFÖB "Mak Even after being in power for 57 years, they have been neglecting the downtrodden and the poor people. Forty years after giving the slogan, 'YO, FOS ÆLIOTO, you could not do it. When we were in power, Sir, we provided 35 kilos of foodgrains without any propaganda. We gave 35 kilos of foodgrains and now, you are reducing it to 25 kilos, and you are asking as to what is it that we have done. ÁÖKÖÖPÖ †™iső ×ÖÆÖLŐB ¾ÖÖ+ÖĞBÖK •ÖK ÚÁ •ÖÖÖPÖE ŐE ÆKTŐPÖE †ÖNJÖENIJŐ ±Ĭ×ÖsÖK•Ő ÚÁ ∞sÖ< ŒLJÖÖ-ŒLJÖÖ ×ĐúpÔ, pÔEŭ ĀPÔS Đứề CÔSÂĐÔ Æũ. ¤ịệÔ CE C2×CĐÚ ±é>ü × bĂ™bpÔpÔÐ ×ÃÕÙũÔ Đé ×SÔK ÆŭÖÐÈ ŒpÔF ŒĻĪŨ ×ĐúpÕ, pŮÆŬ ÃPÔB ĐƯỀ ŰŎĸŒĐ ÆŬ. ĐƯỚCĐŨ ¾ÕXÕČ ĐĖ <ÃË ×°Öx×Õ°PĖ ÃË Ŭĕ''ù °PÆŇ ÆĎŘŨ. †ÖŌPĖ †308 YOUú •00ê °90,01 פji00 Ažij »00k01ê °0ê ^AOUû0ê 20Æji0 A0fi00 Aži. ‡AOA0ê Ua''û A£0fi0ê 340>00 °04ê Aži. ACPOB ¤ġCROOAOB †COACE ®OQ.O∙O Æü. †²O ¤ġO <AOB ×ACPOE;O®O ŌQÜ ŌŒBO YQUO ÆÜ ×Ūú, AQQÜ †²O ͺÕĬĬŎ ´ČË ¤ŘĮŎ ´ČË ŤŒľŌĠĸŎ Ũú°µĎĜĖ 3ĎS ÆĨŌĬĔŎŎ.. ´ŐĎĸĎĔŐ ®ŎŦĔĂ µĎĖ †ŌĮÜ ŒĻŨŎŒĻŨŎ Ũú°µĎĜĖ ‡ÃŎ ¤ŘĮŎ ´ČË »ŐŌ®ČĖ 360≫0ê Æü.

†308 ~0008 •08 ™BAOR ~0E 20700 _WEB £0E ~9VEB-9VEB, µOEU YOOE ÛBAO>O AQE-OBAO £00°... ŒµOO ~0008 -Ö2×XÖLÚxXB ÁĞEĞDXA ×HÖE ÆR? •Ö7Ö µÖÆRÖ GÖDXĞLÖÖĞLÜ "ÖXÖ _HEB ÆĞ ŒµÖÖ GÖDXĞLÖÖĞLÜ Ö,Ü ^¶ÖLÜE XXAXXOAÖ °ÔPEĂ AEA? CEµCO ^°POLICE ŬTX-ÔPEP'Ŭ TÔ, Ŭ ¾AA XIOA Ô °POEĂ AEŬ ×ÛÚ 2°O°OO, Ŭ ĈE •OOOÚ, Ŭ <ÂCÊ ÂCĂ-OOXÔ ¤ÑCE AEA? AQO "ON , III All when the situation is delicate, the economy is dwindling and the rupee is going down, the Minister makes such irresponsible statements and tries to justify them also. The ruling party also stands behind the Minister. Sir, what is it that the Congress Party has done to reduce poverty during all these years? One of these must be correct. Either 67 per cent must be a * figure that they are giving, or, their claim of reduction in poverty must be * . One of these two things has to be *. You cannot contradict yourself in such a big way. People of India are intelligent.

Sir, the Government is trying to get vote security in the name of food security. I can assure my friends that food security is not going to get them vote security because they have lost the confidence of the people and they have * every section of society.

Sir, there is just about three or four months before the election. It will take four to six months to put everything in order and then start its implementation. You may make a formal inauguration. You may make a foundation. But nothing is

^{*}Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

going to happen because everything has to be organised in such a way. And now, you are saying that it will be a 'game-changer'. Your spokesman said, "It is a game-changer." Do you consider this as a game, playing with the lives of common ÆÖBÖB "ÖDÆÜK… †ÖTÖDÚĞE ÆÖBÖB "ÖDÆÜK »ÛÚ ‡ŸÖPÖE ÃÖD»Ö ÛÉ 2ÖD¤Ü ‡ÃÖDÚĞE ÝĞEÖ "ĞEÖ¸Ü DÚÆÜÏĞE ÆÜ. I am not able to understand the audacity of the Congress about such an important and sensitive issue. Sir, this is nothing but an electoral gimmick. I can assure you that your Food Bill is not going to get you 'goodwill'; it is going to get you a big bill. The Government has to understand this and it has to respond to the criticism in such a manner as will satisfy the people. Sir, the Congress and the UPA have no credibility. It has got credit. I do agree to that. Credit is going up day by day and we have Rs.3,62,000 crore interest payment per year and almost 63 per cent of GDP is going for debt repayment. That is the fact of the situation. Only 37 per cent remains. Out of that, how are you going to adjust? Nobody is explaining that. Sir, the Government has * the people on every count - be it controlling prices, be it bringing back the black money from abroad, be it taking action against the corrupt, be it taking tough stand on terror, be it providing reservation for women in legislative bodies, be it creating two crore employment opportunities per year, or, be it creating 'Nirbhaya Fund' for women. All these are the promises that the Government has made in the Presidential Address, in the Budget Speeches and in the statements made by the Congress Party from time to time. On all these, you have * the people. Now, how can you believe this promise of providing food security to all the people? You have not only promised but you have failed and you have * the people.

Sir, even about Mahatma Gandhi NREGA, you have been tom-toming across the country saying that you have created 100 days of employment. The figure shows that 14.48 per cent of the total registered households got jobs in 2008-09. The figure dipped to 10.9 per cent in 2012-13. That is the reality. You tom-tommed it across the country saying, "NREGA, NREGA, NREGA, "IND THE XIND THE ADDITION OF THE A

will be to make a mention here. When late N.T. Rama Rao, the icon of the Telugu people formed a party, he made a promise that if he was voted to power, he would

^{*}Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

not going to get you votes for ruling the country once again.

provide rice at Rs. 2/- per kilo. The then Chief Minister, late Shri Vijay Bhaskar Reddy, said, you would be able to provide rice at Rs. 2/- per kilo only if you come to power. I am in power, I will give rice at Rs. 1.90 per kilo. He made an announcement and started the same but the people did not believe him. The reason is lack of credibility and the Congress Party lost miserably in that election in 1983. I would like to remind that your empty promises, your hollow promises are

Sir, with regard to this Bill, my point is that food security can be provided if there is satisfaction among the farmers of the country. If the farmers are happy, then, only we can have food security. You cannot have an imported food security. You need to have home-grown food security. That is what Mr. Swaminathan and everybody is saying but you are not taking any steps. What is missing in this Bill, and, even in the objectives, is how you are going to encourage the farmers to produce more. Unless you produce more, you cannot meet the requirement. That has to be understood. You cannot import and then distribute foodgrains like that. Already, your import bill is going up. You don't have enough funds to provide for import of foodgrains. That being the case, what are the steps you are taking? Sir, leaving apart politics, my concern is: how do you sustain agriculture. That is the basic issue, which is agitating my mind. Sir, the average per capita grain consumption in 1965 was 418 grams, and, that of pulses was 62 grams. It is according to the Economic Survey, this is not my figure. After five decades, the per capita foodgrain consumption of an India in 2010 was a meagre 407 grams and the per capita pulses consumption was 32 grams. From 418 grams, it has come down to 407 grams. The per capita foodgrain availability in India in 1971 was 394 grams. After thirty years, in 2001, it has come to 396 grams, which means, a mere simple rise of 2 grams. That being the case, how do you assure food security to the people? The population is growing, the aspirations are growing, the consumption levels are increasing but the production levels are not commensurate with the consumption levels. That has to be understood. The agriculture is in dire crisis. What happened to the recommendations of the Swaminathan Commission? Seven years have passed but you did not bother or take care to consider the important recommendation made by the Swaminathan Commission of providing the support price to be calculated as cost of production plus fifty percent to the farming community. That is one of the important recommendations made by the Commission but you totally ignored it, and, you are not talking about that.

That being the case, how do you sustain food security? That is another issue. Sir, the share of agriculture and the allied sectors in India's GDP has declined to 13.7 per cent in 2012-13 as per the Central Statistical Organization. During 1950-51, it used to be 51.9 per cent, which has come down to 13.7 per cent in 2012-13 at 2004-05 prices. From 51.9 per cent, it has come down to 13.7 per cent!

ÃÔ,Ų Ū6ÁÔ Ū6 ÃŒPBÔÔ ČE ÆŬÔ »ŒŒŒ ŪďE ∽ŌŸŌĐÔ →ŪŪĐÔ ¤ŒÕÔ "ŒÆË, ^ŸŌĐÔ →ŪŪĐÔ ŪÆË ¤Ë -TÖ MEBB ÆÜL. ^ÃÖÜLÉ 2ÖÖ,É TÜE BYÖYÖÖ 3ÖB "ÖVEEN ÆÜL. ‡ÃÖÖLÖ ÖLÖ,NÞÖ HÖVEÜ ÆÜ √ÖLÚ √ÖLÁTÖPÖ ‡AO ¤ÞÆÖ 'ÔE ĂŮÔO'ŠŇÔ ��EĂ ÆŪL. ^�ÛNS †0%0-Ô µÔÆÔO YŨN TÔÆÔO'ÐE 'ÔE 'ŨS 'ÔE;ÛNSÔ ÆÔŒNS ÆŬL. ÛNFÔS-ÛNFÔS 'ÔŪND ×Ö»ÔE YÖÜE ^ÃOÔLIÔ ÃÔÆB ÃÔ TÔ ĐỚ ĐỚ 3˚B ÃÔ ĐƯỜ, LÃ LÝ LÝ LÝ LÝ LÃŨE ĐƯỀM ÆĐIỆÔ ÆŪL

Sir, that is why, people are waiting for the Government to take action on the Swaminathan Commission recommendations with regard to fixing the minimum support price. Sir, the present President of India said, "People's right to food can become a reality only through sustainable increase in agriculture production and protecting farmers". These are the words of hon. President of India. It will become a reality only through sustainable increase in agriculture production and protecting farmers, but what have you done to protect the farmers. Now, please understand that this Food Security Bill can be implemented if you produce 350 million tonnes extra. Then only, you will have the comfort of distributing and then providing food security. So, the moral of the story is, one cannot distribute what one does not have.

Mr. Ramesh, you will be able to understand it better than anybody else. Sir, from my childhood, I have been seeing in this House, that some political parties — I do not want to name them, they will feel a little embarrassed - always used to say, panchali, panchali, panchali, which, in Telugu means distribute, distribute, distribute. But, Sir, in my childhood, what I learnt from Acharya Ranga and Rajagopalachari, the great C.R., in those days, was, 'before panchali, penchali, which means, you have to produce more, then only, you can distribute.

Without producing, without creating wealth, without getting the growth, you cannot have development. This is a simple common sense for any student of economics or, for that matter, for any common man of the country also. But, unfortunately, Government is not taking enough required steps. It has not outlined any of those steps in this Bill with regard to providing safety, security and

incentive to the farming community to engage themselves in agriculture. Sir, what is happening is, about 2,500 farmers are quitting farming everyday. » WW UWW " Living like in the living farming everyday. » WW UWW " Living farming everyday. » WW UWW " Living farming everyday. •OO ŢWEĞ ÆÜL. »OĞĞÖ ÜĞĞÖB "ÖĞŞ Ü DÚÇÜ ŒĻOĞE •OO ŢWEĞ ÆEP µÖÆÜ ÃÖ, ŌUĞŢÜ ÛWB ÃÖ Ö-Ö ´ĞE ¶ÖVEĞ †Ö , MEĐÔ ATÚ. ÔNE″Ú ≫ÔĐỀÔ ÔƯATŮ , MEĐE ATŨ ×ÔÚ •ÔÖPÔE ÃŨE †""Ô ATB ATÔNEOO, TÔYÔ, Ů ƯỚƯỚG ÔƯÔ ŒŅOÔ ATÔNEOO, ¤ại Ô Ûưβ ÜÖD ÂCH ĐƠ ĐƯƯ CHU ÆĐICO? ‡ÃΟ ĐÁ 20 jà Cũ Ý CHU ÂC ÃΟ ÂC ÃΟ CO TO TO THE Sir, the number of cultivators has declined during the last decade from 127.3 million to 118.7 million, fall about 8.6 million. This is the reply given to Parliament; this is not my figure. 8.6 million people left agriculture in the recent past of the last one decade. Sir, the Maharashtra Government have admitted it in the Assembly. I am not making any charge against the Maharashtra Government because they are not here to defend. They made a public statement saying that 116 farmers have committed suicide. That means, three persons per day. As per the National Crime Records Bureau, in 2012, 3,786 farmers committed suicide, that is, more than 10 people per day. What is happening? JÚAOO 10, if Ai JÚAOO 06 Iti Ai »OUTO 1040 ÃÖCÖÖ ŐE ²ÖSÉ »ÖÖEÖ ÃÖÖE 'ÆEE Æü. µÖFEB ×ÃÖ'Ök;¿ÖFÖ Æü ×Ûú »OOKO ¸GE ¸ÆEE Æü †0,ü AO¢OO°þœli »OOKO getting reasonable prices, so says the Govt. The Agriculture Minister, Sharad Pawarji, he is not here, and also the Finance Minister have been saying from time to time that they have increased the Minimum Support Price from this to that. Sir, you have increased. But, at the same time, please note, you have increased the prices of fertilizers 24 times so far. You are going to increase them again. You have increased the prices of pesticides. You are increasing the prices of diesel every month. Then, what will happen to the agriculture? The prices of seeds are going up. The cost of cultivation is going up. The tractor charges are going up. All the agriculture input costs are going up and what you are giving as Minimum Support Price is only the 'minimum'. Please try to understand this. Diesel is very much needed for the farming community in the rural areas. It is common sense for anybody. Somebody said some time back, I don't want to take the name, that diesel is consumed only by the rich people. Are farmers rich people according to you? You try to understand its effect that is going to happen on the common people. Sir, I have a figure. The cost of production per quintal of paddy is Rs. 1,355 whereas the Minimum Support Price fixed is Rs.1,080. If Minimum Support Price is Rs. 1,080 and the cost of production is Rs. 1,355, how do you expect the farmer to produce more? Then, there was a question and Mr. Chidambaram the other day said, if that is the case, why farmers are getting themselves engaged in agriculture; why they are continuing. It is because they have no other way. *

^{*}Hon. Member Spoke in Telugu.

They have no other alternative. They cannot do any business because they have no seed money. They are not getting any support. They have no other alternatives of getting revenue. That is why they are continuing in agriculture. Otherwise, many of the people would have said goodbye to agriculture long back. But, unfortunately, the Government of India is not able to understand the seriousness of the situation at the grass-root level. Thousands of farmers are committing suicide. It is a shame for all of us, not only for the ruling party. That being the case, I thought the Minister for Food and the Government will come out with some concrete suggestions. While giving incentives for the food security, they should have given some incentives for producing the food also. They should have taken some welfare measures for the farmers also, which they have not taken. Sir, with regard to the prices of wheat, the production cost is Rs. 1,530 and the Minimum Support Price is Rs. 1,280. That means, the farmer is losing Rs. 250 per quintal. That is the realty. Many people are there from wheat-growing areas in the north. \$1000 308 \UiA000 UiB \alpha A0 AB \AB \alpha UiB \ightarrow AB \alpha Bi. That is why, Sir, my point is, first of all assure the House, assure the country about providing sustainability for the agriculture. And now you are saying small and marginal farmers, who are the producers, they are also consumers. Okay, if that is the case, are you going to put them in that one-third category where they are forced to purchase from the open market? The open market prices go up like anything. 50 per cent of the urban population and 25 per cent of the rural population who hold the land will be deprived of the public distribution system.

Then they will be forced to purchase from market. Wherefrom do they get the money? The poor farmers after harvesting will sell their produce then and there itself because they have to repay their debts. They don't have enough money to invest in agriculture again. Again, they will go to a moneylender for borrowing money. They don't even have the storage capacity.

Sir, the prices of all other agricultural inputs have gone up. The fear, Mr. Minister, among the farming community is that tomorrow the State Governments, guided by the Central Government, may go for a rice levy. And if there is a levy then it will be a compulsory levy and the farmers will be forced to sell it to the Government agency first. That being the case, they will not get remunerative prices from market. The farmers will be the losers. That is why many of the farmers' organisations are agitating and some of them are openly opposing this measure also. Try to understand this problem and then come out with some response.

Sir, procurement is a major challenge. Where is the infrastructure? Where are the godowns? The other day, the Planning Commission estimated cold storage requirement of 61.13 million tonnes. Present capacity is only 29 million tonnes. It is not even the fifty per cent of the requirement. Vegetables, other foodgrains and also fruits are perishing. Last week, the Minister gave a reply, which I have with me. He said, "Annually, Rs.13,393 crore is being lost on vegetables alone because there is no storage capacity in India." We have failed in providing storage capacity. Food does not mean rice and wheat only. Food means pulses, cereals, oil, sugar and other requirements. All these things are required. But you are not bothered about any of those things. You are just talking about wheat and rice.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Venkaiahji, your Party has five more speakers.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, leave it to me. You don't worry about that. I will take care of my Party. I am thankful to you for your concern about my Party and its time.

Sir, in a reply given by the Minister, in 2013-14, against the target of 613 lakh ton under PEG Scheme, storage capacity added upto July is only 3.36 lakh ton. The target is 613 lakh ton. And achieved is 3.3 lakh ton. Mr. Minister, this is your reply to this House. At this rate, how many years will you take to provide the needed storage capacity, both public and private, closed, covered and uncovered? That being the case, Sir, my worry is, again coming back to that point, about the sustainability. My worry about the sustainability is on two issues. One is about the neglect of agriculture, not providing needed incentives. Second is about the finances. I am not an expert on finance or economy. The CSO data released on Friday shows that the annual growth has come down to 4.4 per cent. This is the real worry. Where is the money that you are talking about? How are you going to finance the scheme? Please explain and take this House into confidence. Last year, the Finance Minister, Mr. P. Chidambaram, brought an expenditure cut of nearly one lakh and twenty five thousand crore. I stand corrected, it is Rs.95,000 crore under Plan Expenditure. Every segment, including education and housing, has been affected. Are you again going to put another cut like that in this year also? You are not able to sustain it because you don't have money.

Sir, rupee is sinking fast. Fiscal deficit is on the rise. Trade deficit is widening. Current Account Deficit is increasing. Growth rate is going down. Your subsidy bill is increasing. Investments are flowing out. No fresh capital is coming in. Investors, both domestic and global, have lost confidence. The other day the icon of Indian industry, Shri Ratan Tata, opined, "India has lost the confidence of the world." This is not a statement. This is not a happy statement either. At the same time, it is a fact that nobody is coming here to invest in the country. Even Indian investors are running away from India. Many people are praying that this Government should go at the earliest so that there is some certainty.

Sir, with regard to fresh capital, it is not coming in. Country's sovereign rating is suffering. Inflation is breaking the backbone of the common man. Growth has come to a grinding halt. Large-scale unemployment is looming large. That being the case, Sir, the experts are warning that this Bill may play havoc with Government finances.

Sir, the other day the RBI rang a warning bell to the Government and said, "It will be difficult to contain food subsidies within the amount even in 2013-14 when this Act will begin to get implemented." This is not a doubt expressed by Venkaiah Naidu. This is a doubt which is expressed by the Reserve Bank of India.

"In the next few years, growing subsidies could restrict employment opportunities including agricultural sector", this is the opinion of the RBI. The outgoing Governor of RBI said that the only solution to our rupee problem is to reduce Current Account Deficit. That is the advice he has given and we have seen CAD to be well above the sustainable level for three years in a row. Continuously, for the last three years, CAD has increased. A former Governor of RBI, Dr. Bimal Jalan, raised a red flag at the programme and said, "if the Finance Minister is trying to contain the fiscal deficit and control expenditure, it is important to look at the cost of financing such a programme, especially when the economy is not in a good shape". Sir, let me quote our Prime Minister, Dr. Manmohan Singh.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please conclude.

ÁÔS < Ô ¾ĐÝƯÃO ੴÃĎ Ě: ÁÔ,Ů †ÔÔ ŒµŒ ŶŮĸÔ ŶŌ•ÔO ĮÆĒ ÆË ÆÜÖJĒ %ŰŐJŮ ″ÔĠŮ ¤G⊷Ök... The Prime Minister, Dr. Manmohan Singh, while presenting the Budget as the then F.M. in 1995-96, said, "If we try to fund every project and programme irrespective of the revenue available, we will only generate high inflation, high interest rates, which

will choke off investment. This approach will only jeopardise our basic objective of development with social justice since it is the poor who will suffer the most from the resultant inflation and slow growth of employment." I underline the words 'high inflation', 'high interest rates', 'choke off investment' and 'it is the poor who will suffer the most'. Sir, food is not the only thing for the survival of human being. You need water; you need sanitation; you need education for children; you need housing; you need clothing; and, you need other minimum requirements. That being the case, if the inflation goes up and the Government is not able to contain the prices and control inflation, then what will happen to the common people? Merely by eating rice and wheat, one cannot survive. It is everybody's knowledge. So, that being the case, I would request the Government to understand this. Economist Prachi Misraji said that the cost of the programme may be Rs.50,000 crore. Just now, our Leader of the Opposition said that as per the Minister, the cost of the project is going to be Rs.9,000 crore only. On the one side, you are tom-toming and saying that this much money is going to be spent; on the other, you are saying that the cost is going to be only Rs.9,000 crore. One of this must be untrue. The other must be a fact. So, please explain to the House what the fact is.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, what is your problem? I am not able to understand.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: My problem is that your Party has only 22 minutes left and it has five speakers. How will I accommodate them?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I have been told by my Party that there are only two speakers.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is given here. There are seven speakers.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Don't worry, Sir. Leave it to us.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But, I have to regulate.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the problem with the Deputy Chairman always is, you try to apply brake. Once we break, then it takes some time to again catch up.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. No break. You continue.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the Food Security Bill is going to negatively affect the States. Chhattisgarh is giving universal coverage, 90 per cent of the people. You are restricting it to 67 per cent. Tamil Nadu Government is going to forego Rs.1,000 crore per year, ten to twelve lakh tonnes of foodgrains per year, as per your allocation. The other day I heard the Minister with attention. In Lok Sabha, he said that it would be offset by providing additional foodgrains. At what cost? That question was not answered. I would like to ask the Minister: At what cost? Please explain to the House today. Would it be at an increased cost or at the same cost at which you are providing to other people? Second is about Gujarat. Gujarat is going to lose around 1.47 crore people who are in the BPL. From 5.11 crore, it will come down to 3.66 crore. That is the apprehension. Please try to understand the apprehension and then address that issue also. Sir, the Supreme Court said that the Chhattisgarh model is a good model and why you do not follow it. I am asking the Minister: What prevents you from following the Chhattisgarh model?

Sir, now, I come to reduction of entitlement. As per ICMR, it requires nearly 14 kilograms. Now, you are making a provision of five kilograms. You are going to cover only 20 crore families as per the reply given to us in Parliament. It means, 20 crore into 4 or 4.5 per family, around 80 crore people. That being the case, what will happen to the remaining people? At what cost do they have to purchase the foodgrains? Secondly, I want to open up and tell the House about the debate that is going on. Are you really targeting the food security? Are you really targeting the needy? Then, why don't you also target the subsidies to those needy people? That means, the poor people, the BPL families, the *Antyodaya* families, the helpless families, etc., have to be taken care of not only rice and wheat, but also of other important components of food so that they also get a nutritious meal for their children. Malnutrition is a major problem in this country. It is a known fact. I don't want to quote the figures of the World Health Organisation and then bother you all.

But the fact is that there is malnutrition, stunted growth and undernourishment in the country. That being the case, without covering those aspects of the nutrition, how are you going to take care of those children? How are you going to take care of the malnutrition? You have not been able to understand. $\tilde{A}\tilde{U},\tilde{\Psi}$ ×OVÔ900 †Ö"Ö ^YÔ908 jāe'a... †ÖÖDé TÖÖÄÖ ×OVÔ900 TÕÄÖÖ ÆÜ ^ÃÖB ×EMÃOPÖ ÃČE ÜÖ"ÖÖ ÛÚ EPÖÖ "ÖÖÆÜK... So, first you decide what your target is. If you are going to give to 67 per cent of the population, then, you may say, Venkaiah Naidu, you said 90 per cent in Chhattisgarh, then, I ask you to cover it by 100 per cent. What is the problem? If, 67 per cent of the population can be covered, why not 100 per cent population? Some States are already giving. My point to you is, please don't attack the federal system of the country. Please allow the States to have their own schemes. If you want to supplement them, supplement those States' programmes fully. Then, do not make them villains. The Leader of the Opposition has made a pertinent point, you decide the number; and they have to decide the beneficiaries. YOD>>> OµOOO † O\, U †ÖxÖCCÖPÖ<) ^TÔUCC ÃΘΘΘC ÖxÏCC †Ö,Ü ÁĞGÖ †ÖÖ xÖEÖ "ÖXAĞC. μÖEÜ ŒμÖ ŸÖ,ŒÛÖ ÆFP Is it in the real federal spirit of the country? The number and the criteria should have been done in consultation with the States. You can't put the States in such an embarrassing situation; and create difficulties for them with finances. The Centre has got enormous resources. You have the taxation power. States have limited finances. That being the case, don't put the States to such a situation where they have to bear the brunt and you will try to tom, tom from Delhi AliO 16 YOU THE XILLIAN WILLIAM TO THE MAN AND THE MAN AND THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY AND THE PROPERTY OF THE »ÔĐIÔ "ÝĐEN Xà ;NĒC ÆŅ MÔEN †""NG 20070 "ÝDEN ÆN. ‡ÃÔ 200, B ČE Ý ÔĐÔS, BÔO ÃĈE ÃOĈEÔ90 "ODÆK...

[RAJYA SABHA]

Sir, with regard to the quantum of food, we have already talked about. With regard to taking care of inflation, we have already talked about. With regard to the Food Bill, I will conclude by saying a few words. I can tell you that the Food Bill is not going to get your good will. It is going to be a very heavy Bill. How do (0; †00 "%0,0+0")" Afte •0kb0e. Y0A0.0, you are talking of so many things on the eve of the elections. You are saying that this direct cash transfer will result in vote transfer. Finally it will end in regime transfer. Please try to understand it because the message is very clear. People are angry. They are impatient. They want this Government to go at the earliest opportunity. The sooner it is the better it would be. That being the case, giving lollypops, making empty promises without proper allocation at the last moment is not going to serve the purpose. The concept of food security is nobody objecting. My States are implementing it in a better manner. Please join my States of Chhattisgarh, Gujarat, Madhya Pradesh and other States and then make it successful. Thank you very much, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Next, Shri Narendra Budania.

ÁÖB QĐị qi u Quad Quố (**, 0 • O**ÁECOPO) : ^ OÁCPOTO VÀO TOLOBRIO, TO ‡ÃO < RÝOLOBÁCOÚ , OÁPPOŅO UCOP Á ČÁ, TÓ ČÓ ¾Ã-CÁ, ČÚÚ, 2013 Ú Ú ÁÖ ČÉ ČÍÐÖ ÚÚ, EFÜE ÚÉ ¾Ö< ÜÖ TÖ ÆTETÖ ÆTÉL

"ÔVEÔĐEŅIÔ, AEŬIOD B ĀCOSOP-COPO ×PÔ CODICOȚCE PĈE ĀCOSOP-COPO ÛNE ȚÓRIȚUI POVIO, DUCE ÛNE ÛNE ÛNE CONSCÔUL Ț×CÛUD, CE Đườ ×XÃY VGÔ XÂY XI, ĐÔ × PHÔ TÔ, TÔ, TÔ, TÔ TẾ Ã ĐÔ Ã ĐE TỆ ĐIỀA ĐƯỚC + ×Ô ĐƯỜ, TĒ - ÔS ĐE ĐƯỜ + ×Ô ĐƯỜ, TĒ XÔ TỔ ĐỀ ĐƯỚC + XÔ ĐƯỜ, TĒ XÂ TỔ ĐỀ ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC + XÂ ĐƯỚC + †¾ÃÃO, ü Ûé †×ÖÛď, ŭ Ûď ^»»ŒÜÖ ×ÛúµÖÜ... †Ö+Ö ÆŬÖ •ÖG®E Ûé †×ÖÛď, ü ÛďG ²ÖÖYÖ Ûú, ë ŸÖÜE ÜÖD»ÖG ÆĐÃO TÔ, U TÔPBR ÁÔE ÆŬÔO, Ô ÔƯỚ Ô TÔPĐÃI "ÔSÔ ÁÔÔƯNO ÆŬI. ÔPĐÁPÔ ÔƯỚE •ÔRTE ĐÉ ĐÉ SỐ< 30, ƯỚC U 3ÔĐE ÔPÔ ÛŭB †GPA;µÖÛNÏÖÖ ÆĞÜKÜB ÆÜ †Ü¸Ü ^ÃÖÜÉ ≫Ö< ^ÃÜÊ †9ÖÖ•Ö ÛŬB •ÖPÞ¸ÜÖ ÆĞÜKÜB... •ÖPÖ ^ÃÜÊ †9Ö0•Ö ×Ö»QÃÖÖ YÖPÖB ^ÃÖÜÁ •ÖSPÖE ÛÚÖ †×ÖÜÜÖÜÜ ÖÇÇÖ ÆÖĞÖÖ...

'ÔVEÔP≅µÏÔ, †Ö∙Ö µÔŒÜ ⊀Ö»Ö »ÖÖÊJÚ ÃÖPÖÖ ÃÖE ÖÖÄÖ ÆÐÔÐÚ,Ü ÆŬÖÖ,Ē 2Ö8″Ö †ÖµÖÖ ÆÜ.

'Ô ÛvE ÃÖÛvYÖ ÆNEXÛ µÖÆÜ ×ÖxÖ †®ÊÛ Ûv`SEPÖTµÖE ÃÖE YÖNÖ, ÛVÇ † †ÖxÖ ÆLYÖÖ, ê 2ÖS"Ö †ÖµÖÖ Æŭ. Û¢ŶĠS μŮŒŬ ÃŒÃŎ≅ΦρŎ ÃĒĊŌpĠS ÃŌ×ĆŸŎ Ûŧ ŌŒÃO ÝQÞŎO, ∙ŒĒŎ ‡ÃŎ Ō¸Ŭ ¾ÃßŌĒŌ "Ö'ŒŎ ÆŒĒÔ. ²ŌÆŪŌ ÃĈE Û6ÅÔ ¾Ã-00.9°ÛúĈE ÃĈE "Ĉ'000 ÆŒĻÔ 20ÆŬO ÃĈE <90•08†ĈEŌ ÃĈE "Ô'000 ÆŒĻÔ ŶŨúÃÔO9°ĈE ÃĈE "Ô'000 ÆŒĻÔ †Ō,ŭ ‡90 ÃPOÃE "Ô"OÒ Û6 20¤ü ^9Ûuß ,ÔµÔ ÃE •OÈ ÃGOŒÔ9 †Ö<, ^9ÛUÊ ‡ÃO ×Ô»Ô ČE;OXŌ»Ô ÂÛÛÛ ÝٵÖÖ, ŸÖPÖ µÖÆÜ ×Ö»Ö †Ö•Ö ÆŬÖÖ¸Ë 2ÖS"Ö ÖË †ÖµÖÖ ÆÜ. ‡®O ÖÜDÖÄÖÖE ÛVÖ •ÖÖE µÖEÖŒEÖÖ °þ°Ö, •ÖÖE %00ĂYO¾0Oú °Þ°Ö †Ö•Ö ÆŭÖÖ¸ë ÃOÖÖ®E †ÖµÖ Æÿ ^°ÖÄÖPOÖÖŸÖ ÖŸÖ ÖEÜE°µÖ, ‡ÃOOé ≫Ö< ´Ö µÖæÖß.<. Oùß †Ö,ü YÖEÜB »ÖYÖÐ Æü xÛú ¤ÞÖ ÖE †Ö∙Ö ÛúÐEÔ YÖ,ŒÖ ¾ÖÆEYÖ 3ÖÐÖÖ Ð ÃÖÖk, <ÃÖÖ ^ÐÛúÖ •ÖE ¥æbi

ÁĞB 20×07-08 ü - 100 : > 00 000 000 000 000 000 000 000 0000 000

ÁÖB °Ö, 6P, ü °ÖEĞ °Ö, ÖÖ : †ÖÖ 0′'ÖYÖÖ ŒµÖË Ûú, İYÖE ÆÜ ÖĞÖ ÃÖVEÐÖ?...**.(¾ÖXÐ-ÖÖP)...**

ÁÖB ²ÖXPÖB Ü ÖÖÖ : Ő TÖEÛ JEÖ ÆÐE ÐÚ TÖLFŐ ×ÖXPÖÄ™IJÜ ÛŰÖ ÛŰĞEÖ JÖBÖ ®ÖEĞ ÆÜ ‡ÄÖ'ÖP The Prime Minister has no role!

ÁÖB TÖJEP¦U "ÜBEÖĞ"QÜÖ": ÖL ÆŬÖÖJÊ "ÖHÖÖTÖĞÖB >Ö. "ÖTÖTÖĞEĞTÖ DÃÖÆÜ •ÖB, µÖÆÖB.<. ÛVB ÃÖ,ÛVÖJÜ †Ô,ũ ^ÃOĐÉ ÃƯỚS ÃƯỚS ÁŬEÇICHÂYQICË CHIỀ 3GS -Ô9ĐÔNФU ¤ĐĐO "ÔDENIO AEDE xĐú ^®AĐĐƯĆ ACCO, E ¤ẹḍÔ ĐÉ YÔ, DPOCE Ûê »Ö< <Ûú <ĕÎÛÆĎÃÃŨÚ Û£¤ĭŐ ^SÔŅÜÜ.. ÆĭŰÖ¸Ë ¤₱Ů Ûê "ÔĒ"Ë †Ö¸Ü ÃÖÖÖPÖ ÛÐÂÖÚÜË Ûê »Ö< <Ûú ¿ÜÜPD=Ö¸Ü ÛÚ¤ÏÖ ^ŠÔµÖ †Ö¸Ü <ÛÚ ¿ÜÜPD=Ö¸Ü ÜÖÖP ĀĞĻĎÖ ×Ö»Ö ÆÏРפŸÖÜ.. ÖÆÖEŸÖ, ‡ÃÖÛÜ »ÕPÖ ¤ÕEÄVEÕ‡Ô •ÖPÖVÖ ÛdE ×Ö»ÖÖÖ... ‡ÃÕÄČE 78 Ûú,ÕEÌ »ÕÕÖ »ÕPÖÖ®ØVÖ ÆÕÕČE.

^~ÕÃŒŒŎŸŎ ÔÆŒŖĬŎ, µŎŒŬ ÛĸĠŧÔ †"ŒŶŮĹ »ŒŲŒ ÝŲŒ ¾ÔŇŌ ŶŎĸŌ ŶŒŧā ÆĬI. ÃŎŶŒ 2009 Ûŧ 'ŒĠĎÖŌ -Ö;Ö (ÖE ÛUÖDÖĞĞÖ TÖD"'NE "ĞE ¤İÇÖ ÛUB •ÖPÜYÖÖ ÛUĞE ‡ÃÖ 2ÖÖYÖ ÛUÖ †ÖAXÖĞÖÖ ×¤INÖÖ EÖÖ ×ÛÚ NÖפII ÆIĞÖ ÃÖ,QĐƯỜ,U TẾC TỐK, YỮỚE ÆUÏÔ YỐ,QPỮỚE ĐÁ ≫ỚK ƯỚÔ^{CA} ÃỮQĐỮO XÃONÔ WỮĐỦ,U TÖKNÓE. TỐ PÔ HỮŒU XÃNÔ ^ÃÔ 'CÔBÔÞÖÖ-Ö;Ö ČE ×Ûú< YÖ< ¾ÖQÞ֤РÛúÖ ÆM Ök,ÞÖÖÖ ÆÜ. ÖEÐÞÞJÖ, •ÖFÖ 4 •ÖÐÐ, 2009 ÛúÖE ®Ö‡Ô

ÃO, ÔUÔ, LI ÔUÔ TOEBOO †×ORAÇÕÕ AETO EO, YOU †TÖPLE ÃO COCOEÕ TE ÕA™ÔO XO •OB ®L µÕEL 2000 ¤ÕEEL ÕEL ÕETO TÜÜ £ČB... ÔFEÔ#ŸÖ, µÔÆÜ ÜÖÖ? ĀČĄŏÖÖ ×Ö»Ö 22 תÃÖ?Ö,Ü 2011 ÛďŒ ĀČĀŌ¤Ü ĈĒ ŌŖÖ ×ÛŴÖÖ YÖŅÖÖ †Ö,Ü ^ÃOO 6 200¤ii ^ÃOO ide ÃOÃO ¤OQIO ÃECQIOS ÃO ×ÖYO O ide 30eO פjiOO YQIOO... ÃOÃO ¤OQIO ÃECQIOS ÃO ×ÖYO ¶e ‡ÃOĐE ÃƯƠC THE TOTA Xà TO BE Xà TO BE Xà TO BE Xà TO BE TOTA Xà TO TOTA Xà TO TOTA Xà TO TOTA Xà TO TOTA Xà TO TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA Xà TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA TOTA Xà TOTA XÃ ÃÖĞÖ¤ü "ÖE "ÖÇÖ Ûvß.. "ÖLGÖEÿÜÖ, •ÖFÖ ×,üÖÖE"Ô †Ö YÖLÇÔ ^ÃÖÖ€ 2ÖÖ¤ü 2Ö•Ö™ü ÃÖ;Ö Ûei †6rüü ×±ú,ü ‡ÃÖ _**dã™qu**ð Udda Āðajado **×ã-G**iðuú Údda tilgið ×Úuµdo Yüµdo tið, at Ãdúlda tölðið Úú_árða Úd∂ Údda Údda, jó Úuß Ýð±û. †°®Đứ Cước, Cộ Cê Cướ YÔT, Ô ACHU YÔ, MEU Á CE CƯỚC, Cỷ C CƯớc, Cỷ C CƯớc, Cỷ C CƯỚC, Cỷ C CƯỚC, Cỷ CHÂU ACÂC ÃOOuO †Ö,ü ÃOÃO¤ü †×®ó¿."ÖYÖ OuO»Ö Oé »»Ö< ãÖXÖYÖ ÆÖE YÖ‡Ô.

^~OĂĞPĞDÖĞŸÖ ÖYEĞDEYÖ, 'Ö <>Ö.†ĞEĞB. ÃĞÖYEĞÖ ÛxB 2ÖYEĞÖ ‡••ÖYÖ ÛxLÜĞÖ ÆĞDE †Ö,ü ¾ĞE •ÖYÖ 2ÖDSÖYÜE AFŲ YÖPÖ ČÍ ^®ÔUĞ 3000ÞÖ 20FBÖ →µ00® ÃČE ÃÔĐÔYÖ ÆÐE †Ö,Ü ^®ŸÃČE Û&″Û ÃÔBÜÖ®E ÛGB ÛGĞ;Ö;Ö ÛÚ¸BÖÖ *A*EBE ÃÖ, Ų ^®PEDBEE µÔTEU 20010 ÚVEB ×Ôú µÔTEU +⊣DO×pẹÔ CEµCÜE ×CÔŅOO YQUOO? ‡ÃÔÔUĆE ×ÖD®E ÚUB †CPA;µÔÛNÔO εŒĒ TÔ B ÆAP YŒĒ ÔPĒ µĒĒ 20VĒĒ †Ů OŪŪĒĒ 20VŒĻÔ ÆDÍ ÂUÚ ÂUÎÔPÔ TĢAOĀÔ ÂUÝJŌ ÝQAŌ, ‡®Ō TĢAOĀŒĒ Œ µCE ÃŒ±úxÔ °VÆBB ÆBK YÖÜE ¤ŖÖ Ûưß •Ô°ŸÖYÖÖ ÛÐ ÃÖÖÖ°ŸË •ÖÜE ¾ÖQ֤Р×Ûú< ÆBK £ÖÇ ^9Ö ¾ÖQÖ¤ÐE ÛưĞE -Cœ**i**ð Úú, 680 ŸCÔê •C°Þ, 6 £CÔ, ‡ÃÖ≫Ö< ‡ÃÖ -CÔUÔ, Ü ÚúŌ Úú¤ĭÖ ^š**ô**µÖÖ ÝQŪÖ...

'Ô4EÔB≓ŅĪÇ, »CÔĐÚ ÃÔPOO 'ČE "Ö''COO ÛÓ ¤ÔĻÔPO ÆŬÖÇB "ÔŅŌĻŪÃOPO ÃOD\$PŪŅOO YOOÓOB •OB °ŌE <ÛÚ 'Ö4EÑO ¥ữch ÃÖĐú»-Ö Ûúß 2ÖÖÖ ÛúÆG...

^®AĐĐĐE ALIÔO, B ™PĻÔ ÛLB •ÔPŸÖO ÃŨE †ŌB»Ô ÛLB, ALIÔ ÃÕPÕ ÃŨE †ŌB»Ô ÛLB, •ÔPÕ-ÖKÖ×PX-QLÕE ÃŨE †"ÖS»Ö ÛxB, ÃÖPÖ TÖÖM"IJÖĞE ÃĞE †"ÖS»Ö ÛxB ×Ûx †Ö+Ö ÃÖKĞÖSÖ ¾ÖEP'II ÛxÖ ¶ÖKEN ÆÇI JÖFEII YÖ_BPÖ ÛxĞE TÖP'II 3Ö,ii Ûne †970-Ö ¤NPRE ÛnÛ, ^ÃÖÜnÜE †×ÖÜnÜ,ii ¤NPRE ÛnÜ, ^ÃÖÜnÜE ÛnÖYNBB †×ÖÜnÜ,ii ¤NPRE ÛnÜ ÃÖNNÖNÖ ÆTü. ¿ÖÆŸÖ Æü.

^-őÁÖPÖDÖÄÖ ÖÆÖBEJÖ, µÖÆÜ ×ÖSÖ ÁÖÐÖ¤Ü ÖE †ÖPÖE ÁĞE ÖÆBÖE 3ÖB 2ÖÆBÖ ÁÖB ÓVÆSÆÖTµÖE ÁĞE ÝÖBÖ,Ö AĒLI. ĀÖLĀČIPUI ČĒ ŢÖPĒLĒĀČE TÖKEIKČE 3ÖB ‡ĀÖ ×ČÖKÖ PĒLE ŽĀMĀKŌ ĀĞB פGEŪNĪYÖĒLĒ ŪKŪ ĀĞÜTÖPĒD ×ŪNŅAÖ AĞŲ »ČĒŪNPŌ ¥inchi ÃÔÓló⊳7Ö Ôn †ÖYÖE µÖE Ôló≤safÖÖ‡µÖÖÓ ₹™ÔÚÚ °ÖVETA 7ÖÖ‡Ö †Ö;ü ÃÖĞÖ¤ü Ôn †64iji µÖVEü ⊀ÖsÖ 7ÖzÖ ÆTA†Ö ŸČEČŐ »ČČÉÚ ĀČPŐŐ ĀČE ÖČÁŐ ÆĞEÚÚ Ü µČÆÜ ×ČSÖ †Ö•Ö ÆŬŐÖ, É 2ČE°Ő ČE ÆÜ.

^^őÁÖPÖÖÖŸÖ ÖÆÖÞÿÖ, •ÖPÖ ÆĭŐ †Ö•ÖÖ¤Ü Æïk, ŸÖÜ †Ö•ÖÖ¤B Ûé ²ÖÞ¤Ü ÆĭŰÖ¸Ë ÃÖÖÖ®E ÃÖPÖÄÜE ²Ö⊳B ÃÖ CĂŲCÔ ÜCÔ PÔ PÔ TO: TO TO CHỚC QUI TO CHỚC CỦA ĐƯƠC CỦA. TÃO TOUTO CỦA TÒ B ĐƯƠC ĐƠC ĐƠC ĐỦA XÔ PÔ TÃ CÔM ÆCÔ ∞iệÔ Đườ ¾NĐườAO "ÔVENI Đứ, lị Á CĐƯỚCE TÔ, Lị TÁ CĐÉ ≫Ô< T®ĐÚ ĐEÁO ¾NĐườAÔ ĐứB μÔNEÔ9Ô<Ô 2090a, ×ŪúÃOO°ĐČE Ūuß -ČBŠŭ £Ô°ĐČĐÔ¢Ô ÝÔ‡Ô. 'Ô' †Ô∙Ô Â¾ÃYÔΦμÔ ‡Θ¤ijÔ ÝŒĐŬß •Ôß ŪúČE μÕO¤ü Ūú¸ΘĐÔ "ŒŒÑŌ ÆÐÆ ÆŬŮ ÜÜDªÖPÐ ÓE †ÖYÖÞÐÖQÜ ÆÐ. ^ÖÁÐÖÖÖŸÖ ÖÆÐÞÐÖ, †Ö•Ö ÆŬŮ †ÖYÖÞÐÖQÜ ÆÐ ÐÆÐ ÆÐ ŤÞÖ-Ö ÆŬŐ ÝÖR**Ã**Ô ÃČE ÚMÆŬ ÃŐONÝČE ÆŬ XÚM XŮMÃÖOPÖČE ÚMB Ö**ÆEÐ**ÖVÖ Ú**É «Õ,Ö** XÚM< ÝÖK ŮMŮMÖŬ †Ö,Ü ÃÖ,ŴMÖ,Ü ŪLB †""B 9854Ö ÜLE ÜLÜŞEĞ ALIĞ †980-Ö ÜLÖ X94000Ö 3ÖB ÜLÇÜLE ALI. †Ö-Ö ALIĞ ÜĞĞ ÖSSÖ ÜLÖ X94000Ö

ÔÚ, ĐỀ ÔƯB XÃE CỚO TẾ TEŨ. • CHÔ TRƯỞ TỘU THẾ ĐỘU TRU Ý TÝ TỔ TỔ TỔ TỔ TỔ TẾ TỔ TỔ TẾ TỔ TỔ TẾ TỔ TỔ TẾ TỔ TỔ TẾ †ÖYÖÖ ÆÜ xÛú †Ö+Ö ¤₫Ö 'Œ ÛÛŒÊÔ ¾ØÆEYÖ 3ŒÐÖÖ ÃŒŒOÖ ÆÜ, YŒE µŒÆÜ 9ÞŒÇÖ ÛVÃŒ ÆÐ? •ŒÖ ¤₫Ö 'Œ ±ŸĬŎŶĬŎ †ŶĬŎĸŎ TÖĸĬŎ ÆĞÎKÎŎ ÆŬ ŤŎŢŬ ÆŬĬŎŢŎ ÛŬŮĠŶŶĬŢŎŖŎ ¾ĬŎŒŶŎ ĬŎĠŎĿŤŎĿŮ ÃĬŎĿĸ, ŸĬŎĿ µŎŒŬ ŶŎĔĬŎ ÆB †90000 Aŭ. ÃPOS »004000 Oude 30 jūdrij 00090 ×050, TOAMON U0090 ×050, ‡ÃODe »04 Oud9080 †×0000 ji ¤ePÖe Ûei ∞>Ö< μÖÆü ≥Ö>Ö ÃÖ,uÛuÖ,ü »ÖÐú,ü †Ö‡Ô Æü.

^~OÃO°OÖ ÖŸÖ ÖÆÖ⊫ÿÖ, ‡ÃÖ ×Ö»Ö Ûá †&ïjü Ûú‡Ô ~ÖÖXÖ-ÖÖYÖ Æïi ∞ÖYÛÛûÖ ´Ö ÄÖÖGEÖ ´ÖE ¾ÞOÐO Đứ219Y00... 75 - TÔXÔ, ĐƯƠ TỚ201×8 YÔO ĐĐĐÔ TÔĐỆÔ ĐứB TÔ, Ũ 50 - TÔXÔ, ĐƯƠ TỚ200×86 ¿ĐƯỢŨ ĐứB ‡ÃÔ ĐƯỚ[©] ×Ö»Ö ÃĈE ÛLPÔŢU ÆDĪPÕS... ‡ÃÖ ×ČÖ»Ö ÛLE ÖÖHLÖÖ ÃĈE ÖÜLDĞEL ÝÖŢDPÖ ¾DĞEYÖ ÛLĞE ÖÜLDĞEL ÖE ÖÖDÖ aDikiÚk ábúþýr úÚ> ú þ† aðakúk ábíþýr áða þókóðir áðakíðir ábíkóðir í ðiðiðiði⊶ kölökói× í aðir† áðikiÚk 'ŐŒPÔ †900-0 ^~0×09-0 Ûú,ĕĞQÖÖ •ÖÖ<YÖÖ.. µÖ.¤ü ×Ûú9Æà ÛúÖ,ÞÖŒ ÃŒ †900-0 ^~0×09-0 9VÆà ÆÐÆÖ ÆŨ ŸŰĠĿŶÃŎ ¾AŎŒŸŎ ÛĸŰĿŸŶŎ¤A ŰĿŸĊĊŎ ¤ĐŶĿŨĸŎ ŰŌĂĠŎŸŌ ‡ÃŎ ×ŌĸŎ ŰĿŢŪJŎ ŶŨĸŎ Æŭ.

^^OÃOPOCIČATO TÔNEOBENIO, µONEOBO TO, U †ONPODENIO µODEOPOO DE 200, E TE OMOTOO 340CETO DUB YOLO AEU. †**ů**,úlle: jiô µlle: 0°00 (le Y0Eij) Æiji Y0,0°0 (k, ekō) i Úlle: 35 ×lúx (le †°00•0 (040°0 (040°0) ^0x0°0-0 Æiji) , MEMÍCO, <ÃCO ‡ÃO ×CO×O CE CONO-COPO AEU. ‡ÃO ×CO×O ÃCE ¤pịO ÔN 78 ÔU, GO-N VÔ, GPO »CONCOE ÔUCE »COPO ÆDĪPO, → OÃO TO, U <OÚ »OŌUO 25 ÆDFOO, U ÔÚ, DE 11 TY QUÊ U Ô'OÒ ÆDĪPČE. Ở ÃÔ Ô-OVOO ÆDĒ ŶÚú ÃŌŪŌO, U ÔE xÔuÂÔB 3ÔB ¤ẹÔ 'ČE ‡ÃÔ "ĐÔuÔ, ũ ÔuB ¾ĐXĐÃEĐO "ĐEN Æũ •ĐE †Ô•Ô pÔNĐS< ÂŌ, ĐƯÔ, ũ ÆŭÕŌ, è ¤ẹÔ Ôé ÝÖ, APÖ »ÖDÁÖDE ÚÁ ××Ö< ÚÚ, Ü "HEB ÆLÜ. ‡ÃÖ ×Ö×Ö ÖE ÖVÆDÖÖÖ ÃÖ; ÖVEYÖÚÚ, ÞÞÖ ÚÚB 2ÖÖYÖ 3ÖB "ÚÜÖB ÝÖ‡Ô Æü. ‡ÃÖ ĈE ĈŒŒĠĸŌŢĈĒ ÛĸŎ ¾Ã¿ÔÃŌ ÜμÖÖ»Ö "ÑŨÖÖ ÝÕμÖÖ Æü.

‡ÃÔ CE < ÔÚ TORÁ-CÔFO ŢŪJOO YŌJOO ÆLE XÔÚ × OÃÔ TO ŞÃÔQ E TOE 18 30ÂOÔ ÔÚB TOÆEDSOO ÆLDÉOB, 30ÆED ^ÃÖ TÖÇBKÖÇÜ ÛKB TÜĞÜÜĞÜ AEĞĞĞB.. ‡ÃÖ ×ÖSÖ ÛG †ĞPÜÜ YÜPÜKKÖKÜS TÖAEĞKÖTTÜ ¤EĞÖ ×ÖSÖPÜ ¾ÖSÖB TÖXÖÖ†ÜE †Ö, Ü 20'''ÖLE ÛĞLE ;ÖLK ÖSÖ XÛYÜĞ YÜYÜĞ ALÜ. •ÖLE YÜR**ÖLÖ**NÜS ÖXELGÖCK Ó ALÜ ^®ÛÛĞLE ÖĞA^MYÛÚ †Ö, Ü YÜ'ÖÖ ÜĞEĞÖ ^~Öx/P+Ö ÜÚ,QMOO •00<Y00...•00ê ¤#dÖ ×Öx/OPE 340XB ′00/00<Ó ÆÜ, ^9OUGE 70AP#DÚ 300eÖ9Ö ×Öx/OFO, YÖ'ÖÖ ÜÜÖPÖ ×ÖXÖĞÖ †Ö,Ü ∙ÖE 4Ö′″ÜE ÆQ ^9ÖÜĞE 3ÖB ‡ÃÖ "ÖÜÜĞ,Ü ÛKB ÃĞEĞÖÖ ÖEĞÇÖD ÛÚ,ÖÇÖ •ÖÖ×ÝÖB.. ÝÖPÖĞÖYÖB "ÔAEBÞÖTTË ÛNË •0PÖ 20′′′Ö ÆDËÖ, YÖE ^®ÔNË 6 ÆBÖ,Ü 1YÖK ÛNÖ ÖMÜ K®™O XÖ°™U 3°CS ×ÖSÖĞÖ.. ‡ÃÖ ÜÖÖ^T ÃĞIJÖÖÖ XÖSÖ ÛE YÖLNÖ ZÖ'"ÖÜE ÜE XSÖK HÖLEÜ TÖRƏLÖÖÖ JÜÖÖ YÖLÖÖ AEÜ XÛÚ 6 TÖLEGEÜE ÂÜE 14 3AAO YOO4 Oe 20""00 O40 TOAMD4 3000 0 ^ TO>0-0 O4, 400 • O0<YOO...

rÔÆDB≑piÖ, †Ö∙Ö ¤qē,Ö Ûni †G÷iji ĀÖPÖĀÔE 2Ö⊳BA ĀÖYÖĀpIÖ ÛnFÖDBÖDÖÖ ÛnBAETI. Ögge ĀÖDĀÖJi Ûni †G÷iji µÔÆŭ ÃÔPÔÃĈE 2Ô>**18** ÃÔ ÔõÔÔ Æŭ †Ô,ŭ †Ô•Ô ÆŭÔÔ,ë ∞ẹÖ Ôé †¢Ŭŭ ÆŭÔ 3ĈB ‡ÃÔÃĈE †″**ë**ÔË ®ÔÆN ÆŨ. ÆŬŎŎĒ ¤ĒĎ ŐE 3ÔB †Ö•Ö 3 ¾ÃÃÔÔ ÛŴB ^Ő ŸÔŨÚ ÛÉ 55 ŌŸŶŨ;ŨŸŎ 20""Œ ÛĒŌŒŶŨŶŎŸŎ ÆŨ. µŮÆŨ 2ŨÆŇŎ ÝÖBÖR ji 200YÖ AEÚ. •ÔPÔ 20'''ÖE ÛNETÖÐÁÖYÖ AEÐÁTÖE YÖDE 3/ÐE DŰÁĞE †ÖYÖE 20cAÁĞE 3/ÐE DŰÁĞE ¤ÐÖ DÚE ≫Ö< DÚÖ'Ö Ôú, NGP | ‡ÃÔ×3Ô< 'ĈI ÃĈIĈ-CÎVOO ÆMBE ×Ôú ÆLÜĈE ‡ÃÔ ×ĈISÔ ÔNE TÖZ, NÔ ÆLÖPĈE ÔNE 2ÔD¤U ÛNE CÔMÎDÔ ÛNE ×ÛĈISÔŒ±Ú »Ô>ĐIỀC ỞC <ÔÚ ²ữ ĐƯƠ ²Ô> B Ô™ Œ Ŭ ×ÔS CHỚS... Ở ĐIỀC ȚŮ, Ở ™ĐƯƠ ȚIĐÔ ĐƠO XÔÚ ĐƯƠ CHỐ TỔ ĐƠ ÞÔ TÓ TỘ TỘ TỘ TỘ TỘ TỘ TỘ THE TO THE TOTAL PROPERTY OF THE P

20FeBiO 30,000ú,ũ 9b-0 Ãũe Ãũ0 ở90e +0 , NEB AEQ. ÔP0e ×NUÔ VÚ µÔFEU ×ÔFED,ũ CE 55 -OXÔ,EŬO, ^>RÃŨ - ĈE 55.2 - ŒŶŶŶŗŨŶŎ, - ĈŶŗŮ - Œ¤ġŮ - ĈE 56 - ŒŶŶţŨŶŎ, - ÔŒŨ,ŒŶŶŶŮ - ĈE 51 - ŒŶŶţŨŎ, ŶŨĸŮ,ŒŶŎ - ĈE 46 - ŒŶŶţŨŶŎ Æŭ. †Ö•Ö ÆŭÖ ²Ö>B-²Ò>B ²ÖÜÖE Ûú¸ÜÖE Æij ÆŭÖ ²Ö>B-²Ö>B μÖܕְÖ†Ö †ÜE Ûúß ²ÖÖÖ Ûú¸ÜÖE Æü †Ö¸ü •Ö°Ö ÆŭÖ †ÃÖ∞QHÖYÖ ÜE ¤ÐÜÖYÜE ÆÐ YÖDE ÛÐIÖÐÖÐÖ ÛÐ µÜE †ÖÖÚ⊳ÌE ÆŬÖQÐ ĀÖÖÖÐE †ÖYÜE ÆÐ †QÚ ÆŬÖQÐ QÓÐÓMÐ ÜÖ⊳È ÆÖÊ •ÖÖYÖÊ Æü.

^-ÖĂĞPÖDÖÄŸÖ ÖÆĞĞEÇÜÖ, ´Ö ÜĞI''Û †Ö,Ü 2ÖÖYĞE ÜVÆGPÖÖ "ÖÖFENÖÖ ÆĞĞE †Ö∙Ö ÆÜĞÖ,E ÜĞI'Û ÂĞÖÆÇÜĞE «Ö,Ö Ûtê" Û ¿ÔĐƯỚ<Ô ¾ĎŒŸŎ ÛƯB YỚ¢Ô ÆTI. ¿ÔĐƯỚ<Ô MỀ ¾ĎŒŸŎ ÛƯB ÝÔ¢Ô ÆTI ×ÛÚ †®Ô•Ô ÛÚÆTĂÔ ÃĈE †Ö<ÝÖ, MÔÆTI †900-0 Y0,040 Y0006 Y00ú ÛvîAdê Ö**xab**ûkio, xûxâoi90ê ûvdê 996vîAoi90 Atako, çêxudê û6 †90x0 êê ûxi^mai'as ÆDÁĞB, µÖÆÜ ÃÛXB´Ö ×®O,TÖQÜ ÖLYÖKÄÄĞÖ ÛXÃĞE "Ö»ÖĞĞB, »ÖBÛÁ•ĞEÖ ÛXÂĞE 1YÛXYÖB †Ö,Ü TÖ×»ÖÛÚ ×YÖKÖDĞĞEÖ ÛXÂĞE ∞**iệ**gũ **a-điểo**s... ‡Ãô Yô, **để**ũ Ôưβ †®Đứ ²đôyớe Acidô, ề Ãđô ở Đề †ô‡ỗ †ô, ũ 0'ô/dô<Ó ¾ớc Yô Ôưβ Yô‡ỗ. Ở Ôư⁄£6Đô "ÖDENIÖ AENE «Đứ μΙΦΕΙΙ ŪÚVERPÖ ÝÖNÖV AEN «Đứ †900-0 ŪÚVENIÓ ÁĞE †ÖNÝÖD... †Ö-Ö ÆNÖ †Ö9DE VÚÁNÖDPÖE ŪÚB -Ö9nÖKÖD≃ü ¤FPÖÖ "ÖÖFEЙÜE ÆÜ ×Ûú ÆŰÖÖ, ê ¤ệÖ Ûé †FYÜü †®Ö•Ö ÛúÖ ³Ö, üĞeçü ³ÖÖ ÖLÜ ÆÜL. ×Ö″b>ÖE ¾ÄÄÖÖ ÆŭÖQ è ¤ji Ö ČE 259 ×Ö»QÖTÖ MEÖ †EÖÖ•Ö Ö¤Ö ÆEHÖ.. ‡ÃÖ 3ÖÖÖ ŸÖE ÖÖTÖÄÖBÖ 2ÖÆÜÖ †""Ö Æü †Ö, ü Æü. ‡ÃÖ≫Ö< µŮÆÜ †®Ö∙Ö ÛúÆĎÔ ÃĈE †Ö<ÝÖÖ, ‡ÃÖ ÃŮÔÔÔÔ ŰE µŮÆÜ ×ãÖŸÖ ÆŬÖÖ,Ė ÃÖÖÖ®E ÆÜ ×Ûú ÆŬĬŎŢſĠ ŎŎŎŎ ĀĈĒ •µŎĊ¤Ŏ †ŸŎŌ•Ō ÆŬĬŎŢĒ ŌŎÃŌ ÆŬL ţÃŌ×Ŏ< ÆŬŎ ţÃŨĒ †""ſĠ ŸŎŢŒŬ ÃŨĒ »ŌŶŒĒ ŨÁŢĒ ÃÖÛúŸÖE ÆÜL.

'ŐÆÖÞŸŢĬŎ, <Ûú ²ÖÖŸÖ †Ö¸Ü ÃÖÖ'Ö®E †Ö‡Ô xÛú ‡ÃÖÄÖE xÛúÃÖÖ®Ö ÛúÖE ®ÖÐÚúÃÖÖ®Ö ÆÖÖÖÖ… 'ŐĘÆ ÃÖÖ-Ö TE TÖRBA TÖNÖ ABI XÚÚ TÄÖÄÖE XÚÁÖÖTÖ ÜÜE TÖDÁÄÖÖTÖ ŒµÖE ARBAÖÖ? TÃÖ XÖXÖ ÛE TERÜÜ TTÖDÚ <ÃCE TORA-TOPO ÆŢi ∙TOE ÚGÂO ÚLICE TORĂTOVÆRIO ÚLI, EPE XIOXE ÆŢI. ‡ÃO CE ×PRAÇO ÚLICE ªCLEOPE ÚLIO TORA-TOPO ×ĐượCÔ ÝQUÔO ÆLL. ‡ÃÔ CE ŒŨŲÔ °ÞŌ ÃŒ ĐÃO'CÔ‡Ô †₹ŒÃŒŒŌ\$O, ŪĠĂÔ ¾ÔŨŒÃÖ, ¾ÕßŐQLŨ ÌԌÔ†Œ †Ö∞Ü ÖLÜ - 340,000 - 1,0090 × 1,000 (10,000 AΔL. - 30,0400,000 0,000 × 1,000 × 1,000 0,000 × 1,000 × ÔưB ¾PRĂĂECÔ ÔưB •CÔKÝÔB †Ö, ũ ^GÔÉ «ĐÔK ČốC J. ĐÔ ÔÚB "ÆÃÖ ÔÚB ŠCÔKÝÔB...

+2Ö ͺÕ•μÖ ÃÖ,ŪưĎ,ÕĒ ŪưÕE ੴĐƯÃÖÕÕ ŪũÃĈE ÆÕĞÖÖ, μÖÆÜ 2ÖÖÖÖ ŐÇÆ ÃÖÖ-Ö ÃÕE 2ÖÖÆÜÜ ÆÜL

ÆDÁKOS, MÔÆÚ 2007Ö YŐSÖYÖ ÆÚ. ÖÐMÖ ÃÖ ÓMÖ DÉE ÚMÜE †ÖÐÖ ÞÖLE †900-Ö ÖÆÐMÖ ÆDE ÆÐE ÆÚ 30ÆÚ †900-Ö , Ô+HÔ ÁÔ, ĐƯỢ, ĐỀ ĐƯỚC ^ÁÔS TÔƯỢ, LÃ ÃC Ô**đị**gờo Ađđiđo , NĐIĐÔO... ^ÁÔ ĈE xĐƯÃOS TÔƯỢ, LÃ ĐƯỢ LÂ ĐƯỢ ĐIỀ ĐƯỢC ĐƯỢ ÛNB YÖTÊ ÆÜ 2Ö>>ÛN ^9ÖÛNÊE †Ö,Ü 3ÖB 2ÖLEĞÎ ÛN,Ü †9ÖD-Ö ×ÖD-ÖLÖÖ, TÂÖ ×ÖD-Ö ÛN †6FÜ KAĞB MADMÂFEĞÎ Ûúß ÝÖ‡Ô Æü.

'ÔVEÔB°ŅÔ, μÔŒŪ ÃŌXŌDSÔ ^ŠÔŅÔŌ •ÔŌ ĮŒËÔ ÆŬ ×Ûú μÔŒŪ ÆŬŐŌĮÔ •ÔŨĖ ÜÖÖª ÃŌĄĎÔŌ ×ŌSÔ ÆŲ μÔÆŪ -TÖKYÖ 3AMATÓ ŰTÁTŐE "Ö>Ö ÁTÖDAFŐTÖ? AETŰTE µÖVETI 2ÖTYÖ µÖD∞II "ÚJÖPÖB "ÖDAÆEK √ÚÚ TÖEÖTÖ 'ÆEK_HYÖ ŰTÖGYÖ' ÚTÖ 9Ö,Ö ‡6¤ÿÖ •ÖB 9ÜE ÆG ∞ÿÖÖ £ÖÖ †Ö,ü 'Æjk_YÖÖ ÛÛÔÂÖ' ÛG ^ÃÖ 9Ö,È ÛJÖ ÆJÖÖ,È ¤jĕÖ ÛE ÃÖÖÖPÜE

'Ö † 0.00 - 0.0

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please conclude.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please conclude.(Interruptions)... Your Party has seven speakers. What can I do? Please conclude. Don't give so many names.

^~OÃOPOCOVO OŒŒijŎ, ‡ÃOOé 200¸ê XOMÆÃO•O OUB 200VO OUB YOţO xOú XOMÆÃO•O OŪÃŒ ¤igü ƌь. OŒŒijŎ, ‡ÃOOé ××O< ~OBÆ~OOFO XOú< YO< Æŭ. ‡ÃO XO×O OÉ †6ĕÿ ÕÃO±Ú YOÜ Ü ~O; Ũ ÙÆYÜ YOKÆPOCE¶ÃO

ÛuĜE †ÖµÖÖHÖ 2Ö9Ö9ĞE Ûuß 2ÖÖYÖ ÛuÆBB YÖ‡Ô Æŭ †Ö¸Ü 3ÅPEBÖ Ö¸Ü 9ÖDE¥bÖ †Ö£±uÃÖ¸Ü »ÖYÖÖ9ĞE Ûuß 2ÖÖYÖ ÛuÆBB ÝŮŦÔ ÆŬ. ‡ÃŮB TŰĎUĎ,Ŭ ÆŬŰŎ,B TÖÖÖQHÖYÜE ÆŬ ÆŬŰŎ,Ů ŤŮŤŐ,Ŭ ŮÚĎ⊳Ô ÆŬ ÆŬŰŎ,B ŤŮĎÔŶ®XÔÒ⇒ÌHŰŐ ÆŪ <ÃŮB †®ÔĐÚ ÃOãCÔ<Ó ÆŸ •ÔĈE ÝÔÔÔÔĈE ÛÚ †ÔPŸÜ ‡ÃÔ ÛÚÔ Ô ÔÚĈE ÛÚ ÚÔÔS...

(OÆOBENIO, ‡AO ×20×0 Dúe †Beijü ⁻OO, Beilio, OYOO †Ojü •0800P0≥NEB ⁻Ojü 30B ×30g,0ND 7µ0090 פ1µ00 Y0µ00 Æŭ. ÃÖDXGGÖZTŐÚÚ ¾ÖYÖ_ÞÖ TÖÞÖD>ÖB ÚÁ × ÚDÚÖ>Ô ÚÚĞ ÃÖDXGGÖZTŐÚÚ ÚÚ_fTÉ †Ö¸ü ÃÖQ£Ö>Ö †Öb>11'ü ÚÚ_gTÖTE ÜúO †×00úO,ü ³0B פiµOO YQµOO Æü.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are the Party Deputy Chief Whip and you have given seven names. You yourself have said that you will take only 20 minutes. There are so many Members who wish to speak. I am requesting Members from every Party. ... (Interruptions)... Please.

aob ® je? ii ²0ea0 ® jao : ´0e0e jio, †308 ´0 3000 po a0e0 j**ee0** £00, ^ao 3000 po Ué †4eijii Uéz"û ²CÖVCË ÃCC C[®]CE †CITÔ. ÆUCO, Ē µÔÆ**C**Ô ˙Ō, Ü <Ûú ±ĩ⊳ Ų bòO ×ÃÕÙƯÔ ÆÜ, **....(¾DB&CÔFO)** × ÕÃCÔE †∲ÜÜ , **Õ•**µÔ ÃÖ, ĐƯƠ, ĐỀ CHỦO ²ÔĐƯƠ ²ÔĐƯO ²ÔĐ**O** ±Ú• ĐÔ *Đ*ŨL. †Ö•Ö CHɦT CÚB HỮBB< ÃÖ, ĐƯƠ, TẾ «CÚ «ĐƯỢ ĐÃÕCÚ «ĐƯỢ » VẬUỐ . Æij ÝÖ, 18°ÖE Ôưề ±á6> ũ ÔưÔ ÔưÔ9°®®B †×ÔOưÔ, ũ ××; piốO ÝQuÔO Æij <ÃČE ĆE ×; piố ÔưB , Ô• piố ÃÖ, lỗuồ, đe Ôuồ 30S µOÆÜ Uứ¢©QµÔ 20°90/00 ÆÜ √Uú ‡ÃÖ ×¤¡¿ÖÖ ´ÖE †ÖYÖE †Ö Ûú¸Ü ¾ĞE 3ÖS ÛúÖ'Ö Ûú¸Ë. ÜÖÖ[©] ÃÖ**çö**ÖÖ Û€ ≫ÔK ÝÔ,0PÔ TÔK,ĐƯƠ,QŨE ÔƯAS TÔFEXYÔÔPÔ ĐÚ,GƯỚŨ ,ÕI• HŮ ÃÔ,QÔƯÔ,QŨE ÔƯAS ∞0° ÔE Ô,GA ÆŨL. TÝÔ, Ŭ HŮÆŪ ÃÔFAS °ÞTÔ ÃČE »ÖÖYÖE °ÖYENI ÆNTÖ, <Ûú YÖ,0FÖ ÛdÊ †°ÖÖ•Ö ×Ö»Ö ĮNEÖ ÆNI †Ö,Ü ¤NEÖ,Ë YÖ,0FÖ ÛdÊ °ÖYENI ×Ö»Ö ĮNEÖ, ŸÖÖÊ ¾ÄVEÜ 3ÖB 2ÖVEÜÖ 2Ö⊳ BI Ø″ÖŸÖÖ ÛUÖ ¾ÄÄÄQJÖ ÆEÖÆÖÖ...

(Á PODOVO TEČENO TOSÁČÁ ÚSTO EK)

‡ÃČE _QÕĐƯỢČO 3'OS 2'ÖFĐƯÖ •Ô'P_8 ÆLL. •Ô'PÔ ¾ÃÔO QÞO "ÖÞÖD»ÖS ÛLÜE Ö•ÖFÖNÖ 2'ÖPÖDPE ÛLÖ ÛLÖÖ Â™ŒY'U ÝONOPODEPU ÚLÔ AEÚ. ^AOU Á ‡AOU Á »Ôk †OYÔE †ÖPO AEONOO... AOPÔB YÔ_OPOŒ YOU ÁOAYOO †®O•O FÔENDGE µÔÆŭ ×Ô ÔĕÔ, B , Õ∙µÔ ÃŎ, Ŵườ, đề Của ÆĐÁCA... »ÔBÔЕÔ TÖ, Ŭ CủaPÔĐe TÔPÔŎ , Õ•µÔ ÃÒ, Ŵườ, đề Của Cướ Ô ÆĐÁCO... 'ÔÆÔȤ¡µÔ, µÔÈ ĂÔPÔ 2001'ÔE ÆŭÔÔ¸Ë ‡ĂÔ ÛÔÔª ĂÔĄĬŎÔO ×Ô»Ô ŨÉ †¢Piţü 'ÔÔ+Ôbeü ÆÔO.

ÃŒŒŎŎŶŎ ŐŒŒĸĬŎ, †ĬŎŎ ŰĔŰ <ÛÚ 200YŎ ŨŴŒŒŎŌ "ŐŬŒŒĠŎO… Ű ŅŨĠĠS< ÃŌ,ŪŨŰŢŪ ŨŴĘ ^ÃŎŨŰS "ČPO ÜĞAĞBO ÂĞBEĞINÖ YÖBĞB •ĞB ÜLĞE †Ö, Ü "ĞHÖĞĞĞĞB •ĞB ÜLĞE -ÖRĞKBÖ¤Ü ¤ÆĞÖ "ĞVEHÖÖ ÆÆE XÚÚ µĞEĞK<-1 †Ö,ü μÖxBS<-II Û ê Û άÖμÖÖD iÖ»Ö Û ê † Φ i i † Φ i Û Û Û Û Û Û Û Û Û Û Û Û Û Û Î × Φ P Ö Ö × Θ VÖ<...

^® DKONYODUÔJB ×®ÞONOŒ DE †ÐEQŲ Ö DVÆBRÖ ®ĐEŇ "ÖDENO, "ČENS ×ÞEÖ DKB •Ô9DYO DE ÄØDÖÐE Æü....**(¾ÖÖ-ÖÖŦ)...**

ÁÖB ÃÖ'ÖÖÖÄÖ : £ÖDú µÖæ †Ö'ÖDúÖ ÃÖ'ÖµÖ ÜÖY'Ö ÆÖDE YÖµÖÖ ÆÜ.

ÁÖB ®Ö,QP¦ü ?ÖbeDÖ×Ö,DÖÖ : "ÖÖÆB ÄÖÆÜ ÃÖÆÜ ÃÖÆÖÖÖ ÜGÖ †×ÖÜĞ,ü ÆÖÇ ,ÖbÖÖÖ,ü ÜGÖ †×ÖÜĞ,ü ÆÖÇ ×;ÖbÖÖ ÔưÔ †×ÔÔưÔ,ũ ÆGÊ HỮÔ †Ö•Ö ÜÖÖ[®] ÃŨĄĎÖÖ ÔƯÔ †×ÔÔưÔ,ũ ÆGÊ.

ÁÜR ÁĞ ÖĞĞĞĞ : †ÖÖÜÜ ÁÖĞ ÖĞ ÜÖÜÖ ÆÜE YÜÜÖ ÆÜ. Please conclude.

ÁĞB ÇÜÇEÇ Ü ZÜLLÜ ÇÜÇÜ : †Ö-Ö ÆĞÜ ĀĞPÖ ÜĞLE ×Ö»Ö ÜÜÇ ‡ÃÖ ×Ö»Ö ÜĞLE ÖÖÄÖ ÜÜÇ EĞÖÖ "ÖÖÆĞK... YÜÇEPÖ •ÖTVÖ YÜÜÜ †TÖ-Ö TÖÆĞÇ TÖĞA™ĞÜÜ †TÖ-Ö TÖÆĞÇ ‡ÃÖÜĞ »»Ö< ÆĞÖ ĀĞPÖ ÜĞLE ×Ö»ÖÜÜÇÜ TÇÖÖÄÖ ÜÜÇEPÖ "ÖÖÆĞK... **XÜL**ÜĞE ÜĞB ÜTÖYÖÖ TÖYÖ ÜÜÇÜ.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

ÁÒB TỘ LỆ II "THEO PHỚO": MỘU ÔIB ĐƯỢC TO ĐÚ LÃ. • PHÔ MÁĐI LƯƠC • OB † O- O 2000ĐÔ J. VIET ĐỘC YƯỚC TO - ÂŬO NƯỚC J. V. L. (34054-0074)...

ÁĞB ÁĞPĞÖĞĞYÖ : †ÖÖÜLÖ ÁÖ'ĞUÖ ÁÖ'ÖÖ'YÖ ÆĞE ÝĞUÖD ÆÜL

ÁOB ^{QO}, e^o, ii ²ÔœĐ^Q, dũ : 36e ²ÔÆĐÔ †"" δι ²ÔœĐÔ Œ ÆŪ(**34036-ŪP)...**» ΘΕΟŪP † 0•0 ^ QO € 300ADO ĆE ÆŪ ĐÔ» ĎÆĐ°Ū • μΟΩ Φ Ε΄ΟΒ... ^ĀOĀĆE » ΟΥΟΥΟΌ ÆŪ «ĐÚ ‡ÃÔ «Ć»Ô ÃČE YŌ, G°CŒ ÛŪČE ±ŪŲĐΩ Φ ÆĎŒČE 340» ΟΌ ÆŪ...(ÃO QÃO ŪΔΒ 'ŒYO,...~ÃΟΟ Θ΄ 3ÛŪ ^ QŪŪČE ĀOΥΟΌ , ŒĒ ĀCŪ. ²ÔÆĎÔ -ŨPĐÔSĐΩ Œ Ū.

3.00 P.M.

•µÖ≥Ö ÜÖ'ÖÖ Ûú,€Ê •Ö ,ÆB Æÿ •ÖÖÛú ‡ÃÖ ÆÐÛXÔÖÏÖ ÃË •ÖŸÖÖ ÛÚË †®¾Ö-Ö ŸÆM "ĎÜÖ •ÖÖ ÃOÔLÁYDO ÆÜL. HÔÆÜ •ÔÔE 2007Ô ÔFÔE ÛLÁÆB ÆÜL YÔÔE Ô ÔOFÔFÔDHÔ ÔGÔB •ÔB ÃÔE ÃŒÔE-ÔYÔ ÔGÔB •ÔB ÃĈE "CÔAĐÁCB ×Ôú •CPÔ 3ÃE ‡ÃÔ 3ÃPÔpÔÚú TÔ,ũ †CPÔ •CRĂCPÔ ¤Ē ŸÔČE CĘB ‡ÃÔ 2007Ô ÛdÔ ÃTÔR™DÔÚ,ÞPÔ •CPÞ,ũ ¤ã. »ÖĐÛU9Ö ×±ú,ü 3ÖB ‡ÃÖ ¾ÄĞĞÖÜÚ ÜE •ÖÜE ÛĞ″Û 3ÖB 9Ö‡Ô ÃÜBÄĞÖÖKÓ ÝÖ,ØĞÖ »ÖÜĞÜE ÛĞE פK •ÖÖ9ÜE ÛUB 20010 ÛwÆB YÛ‡Ô ÆŅ ‡ÃŬŨĸĎ ÆŭÜŌ¸B TÖÖ™B ¤ÞÖ ÛwB YÔ¸BPÖ †ÖÖ •ÖFÖNÖÖ Û6 ÆÑÖ ÜE ÃÖ BÖNÖÛú YÖÖ¸Ü TÔ, Ú TÔĐĐÔ ÃÔ ÔĐÔĐÔ ĐÚ, NÔS ÆÚL. ŒHÔĐĐÚ ÆŬÔÔ, B TÔÔMH 3ÔS †ÔĐB ĐÔBY QUỐT ĐÉ YÔPHÔ HÔPH "ÔĐHÔ ÆŨL °Ô ÆB ÛÐIÖÐÐÖÐ ÃĞE YÖÄÖYÖ ¸ÆÐI. »ĞEÛYEÖ, ‡ÃÖÛÐ ÃŒEĞ ÆB µÖÆĞÖ µÖÆÜ ³ÖB ÃĞKĞÖ»Ö °Ö≍Ö ÆĞÜĞÖ ÆÜ ŶÚ †ÖÜÜÇÜLÜĞÜ ‡ÃÖ ×Ö×Ö ÜLÜE †4Ö ×ÖÖ'ÜE ÜLB •ÖPÇÜÖ ŒHÜE ÖSB? ÃÖÆB ÖÖHÜE ÖE ‡ÃÖ 4ÖÇE ÖE ÆLŰÖÇB -TÖT™á Úưð µÔÆU ÚvÆÐRÖ ÆU ×Úú ¤ặĕ Úúdê †Ö•ÖD¤U ÆŪk »ÖYÖPÖYÖ 66 3ARÓ ÆÐRÉ YÖ< †Ö,U ÃÓRAÐ-ÖÐÐ Úúdê 30S »ÖÖYÖLE ÆTÜK »ÖYÖPÖYÖ 63 ¾ÄÄÖÖ ÆTÜLE YÖ< †ÖLÜ ‡ÃÖ †¾ÖKÖ ÜE ÛE¦Ü ¾Ö Ü⇔µÖÜLE ÜE ¾ÖÄ3Ö®Ö ÖÖÜ™ÜÖÜLE ÔưB ÃÕ, ĐƯỜ, Ē , ઑEà AFŪ, ∞Ô9ÔÔưB •µÔÖ∞ĐỞÕ, Ü °ÔBŸÔµÔÔÔ †3ÔB ŸÔÔÚ AFŰŐË ÝÕ, ĐPÕ ×FEŸŐ ŐË ÔÚŐ †Ö, Ü -TÓBEÔS CHÝQUÔCE Ú 6 ׯUÏÖCE ČE •µCO×IÔ ÆÜRÂS ÆÜRÔS ÆÜRÊS ÆÜRÔ Ý•Ö, Ü †Ö‡Ő. ×ÖÄOÚUS ¾0•ÖÆÜ ÃCE † ÖFÖE ¤ji Ö ČE ÝÔ NPÔB ÚƯ Ô ÆĞEĞE ÚUB 20-ÖĞIÖ »ÖYÖÖYÖĞ Ü ÞÖFEÜ 2ÖCEÜ 'WERG ÆÜL ÞÖFEÜ ÝŐ NPÔB 3ÂÂĞE ŸÖĞE ÆÜĞE ÁĞPÖ ÁÖ'ÖD-ÖĞE 'ČE ×100°°ČE ÚďE ×Ö,>ÖVÖB ÆLL. ÝÖ,18°ÖB ÁČE ÁÖÐÖ ÁÖ'ÖÖ•Ö Ú16 »ÖÖLÖ TÖPÖD¾AVÖ ÆLÖE "HEÐ ÆLL ²ÖLJB YÖ,1ELL ÁČE -TÖPOD×XXVO ÆÐE "VÆÐ ÆÐI »ÖÐUÚ9O ÆŬGE †Ö∙Ö 30S ‡ÄOUúS ÄÖPOÄGE •µOD¤Ð VÖD¤Ð¤ µÖÆÐÖ ÄÖÆŅIÐE ÄGE "Ö»ÖS †Ö _iÆBB •ÖÖXÖKÄÖ¤B <%ÄÖ %ÄÞÖÖ ¾ÁÖKÄÄ£ÖÖ Û& †Ö-ÖÖ¸Ü Ö¸Ü 2Ö9ÖB ÆB£Ô ÝÖ,Ü2Ö¸ÖFÖ¸B %ÄÖxÖB ÃÖÖÖÖ•ÖÖÚ 34/0XAãCÔ ĐĐ ½,0Đườ, ũ »COPÔE ĈE †£0000 †®AĞUKOPO •COXO, †®AĞUKOPO •CPO•COXO ∢XO †910 ×Ö″D-Ò XÂVO Ué »ODFOCE (ČE ÆB ¤NDOPCE UúCE ×′O>OYOS ÆÜ וOPÆB Ø•O¤NFOS Ué ÆÜÜ TOÆBOCE (ČE †TOPCE TO_DE TO_Ü UO⊳D Ûú, GPĈE ÛG ××Ö< TÖ, LIĞ ÖREYLÖ 2ÖPĞÖ ÃÖVEBÖ > Ö. 3ÖSÖ, ÖRÖ †2ÖS DÚ, LI 9ĈE 3ÖÖ, WÖRYÜ ÃÖGRÖ-ÖÖFÖ ĞE †9ÖÐÚ ÛdÔ®BBS †×OUdĴii פik Æji »ÔĐUŶŌ ¤ĕŪÔ ÛdS 20070 µÔÆii Æji ×Ûú Ûĕ¦ii ¾Ô ¤ġĎ Ûé †×OUŶŌ¸ii ˌÕ•µÔŒ - TE + TO+O 3B + PO 3ANOO Û 16 - TOHO ÆGEO 30 • OHOKOKOD≃B 1098-AQUANOO , LUOPE 3AO-OB - TOOMIJUGE Û 16 ÆGEOE TE •µOD×ONO_ü AO¢OO ÆOGEE UúB 30•0Æü AOE ‡9Æë ‡90 AOXO+OX+9Uú UúD9&BB †×OUúQ OË UúD †308 YOUú šoUú cedió ÁGE ÁÐEG 30 TGEÓ »ÔGEÓ «ĐEŇ ×Ó»Ô TÖÖ "NEÖ ÆÜL. ‡ÁÖ 200YÖ ÜLÖ •ÖSYÖD•ÖÖYÖYÖÖ ^¤ÖGEÜ, ÞÞÖ þÐEÜ ÆŬ ×ÛÚ ÃŮŸĒ 1955 ÃÜE †ÖŸĒE ¤ġÖ ÜE ¾ÖÜ ÄÜBAÖ ÃŬBAÖÖŸÖ ÛĠ ŸŸĒŬÖ <ÃŨÃŬB, <ÃŬ™B ¾ÖYÖÜ ÛĠ ×>Ö< ÃĈE Ûĕ¦U ÃÔ,ĐƯỜ,U «Đ,Đ ‡ÃÔ TÔ TÔ ĐĐE ÛƯB ÃÔ EB TÔ,ĐƯB ® ĐŨ ÚÚ,ĐỮE ŨƯB ¾Đ ÔÆU ÃÕE ‡ÃÔ ĈE ŨŒ"Û <ÃÔB ;¿ÔTÔ »ÔTÔ ×à YÔTÞ ×ÔTÑÁC ‡9E8 Ô×ÔBTÔYÔ ĈE •ÔC †Ô,BÔĐÔ ×ÔSÔ ,ŒÔ £Ô, ¾ÃEŬ <ÛÚ ŌŨÚŌ, ŨÁC ∞901-09°007x88 Ædie Y0μ00... †£00000E •070 Ûeï″û »0040 ∞9°05x08 †¤öb>0700E Ûe ²00¤ü ‡Ã0 ′00′05x0e Ûu0e »009ú¸ü 2009P99QuO AGEODYO UdQeYO CE YO<, YOOE 1009P99QuO AGEODYO UdQeYO CE UE®¦ii AO_iDdo]ii «Q_O ‡AO 1001Os/CE UdB Ûá"û <ÂBB ¿ÑŨ »ÔYÔO ¤ã, ∞Ô9ÔAÔE <ÃÔAÔB, <ÃÔ™B ¾ÑÔŨ ŨÉ »ÔŒŒÊ ŨŒÊ Ô¤Œ₽ŌĂÔ Œ •ŒÊ †Ô¸ŏÔÞÔ ×Ö»Ö ĮNEÖ EÖÖ, NÄPEÜ <ÛÚ TÖDIĞ Ü ÄĞE NYÖLTÜRÜNKIN AEĞE YÖYÜĞ... TÖLYÖYÜNDÜ ÄĞBÜĞ Ö DÜĞEYÖ YE ‡YÜDIN TÖNDEYÖNYÖ ´ČE †Ö,ŏÖÞÖ ÛĸĈĖ ŤŌŒÖÔ °ÞŤÖ ÃČĖ µÖÖ ŤŌŒĖ ŸÖÖ;Ü ÃČĖ ÜÖYŤÖ °ÖVEĕ ×ÛúµÖÖ £ÖÖ, »ČEŬú°Ö Ûĕ″Û ¿ÖYÖ <ÃĞB

ÆĞBXÖĞÜLÜ ÖĞTİYTİNDÜ ÃĞPÖĞTÖYÜ •ĞB ÜLÜE ^ÃÖ ÃÖĞLÖ EĞĞBÖ 2ĞLÖ 3ĞB »ÖYÖD ÆĞĞĞÖ, »ĞBÜLÜYÜ ^ÃÖĞE 'ČĘĐÔ CƯỚCŦÔ †"Ô970 ‡10 QIẨN"U 904EN £CÔ, CEµCOĐCÚ TÔ •CÔE CHƯ 3ÔS CÚAEU MEB £CB µCÔ YONAÃO •COAEU,U Đú, ũ , **iếc** (CC), xô kếu "Ở ∞iệ Ô Đế Đú, điệ điệ †® đã đượ đờ • đồ Vộ † đi, ũ • đợ • đô Vô Đế » được Đế Về «AEVÔ "Če Được J**iếc** Cổs... Ælőb cũới ‡ãô Tổi Tổy Cế Tết Ælice ÃũBÔ∞ũ Đế †∲rịu †ô, ũ ²cũ/Eijũ ∞iđ€để •đy Ôfei Đườ±ưs •ÖŞÖĞ•ÖFEFFÜ ÛÚ,(PÖB ⁻Ö≻İB, ÃÖÖÖÄÖÖ ÛÚ,(PÖÖ ⁻Ö≻ĬÖ... ‡ÃÖÜÓ ≫Ö< Üĕ¦Ü ÛÚB ÃÖ,ÜÚÜ,Ü Ö¸Ü ÛÜܱÚB ¤BÖÖPÖ 20°90°90 °C>10 †0, ü ‡Ã00'd0 °CV'OS•00 µ0Eü Ætető ×0ú ‡Ã00é ××0< Ûĕ¦ü Ûd8 Ã0, Ôdd, ü Ûdê Ã006-00×°E0ú ÃQQQEÔTO ×ÔSO »QOTO TÔSI... 30FEU ×ÔSO ÇÕ•µO ÃOPOO TE YQE TOÃO ÆDE YQLO, »ÇEÛLTO µOEU TOTOSOO »QOÛL ÃÖPÖÖ ÖE †3ÖS YÖDÚ »Ö™ÐÚÖ Ö⊳Ð Æü. †Ö•ÖD≈B ÓÐ 2ÖD¤ ÃÃË »ÖÐÚ¸Ü †Ö•Ö YÖDÚ ‡®Ö ¾Ö/ÖÖ ÓÐ ÖÐ ÖXYÖ ÔĐ; Từ TÔ, Từ TÔ ĐƯỚC ÔUB ĐƯỚC TỔ PỔ ĐÃƯ CÔN ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC TỔ ĐƯỚC TỔ ĐƯỚC TỔ ĐƯỚC TỔ ĐƯỚC XÔ SƯỚC ĐƯƯ. <ÃỐ ĐƯ %AVOÔ Û.6 »CÔCÔCE Û.CÔE Τ®POXÎÔ ÎE •CÔE †Ô, BÔPÔ ×Ô>Ô , LEĐÔ EÔÔ, XÂPEU Û.CÔ\$Ô ÎÆBÂOS 20Ô, U ¶VEBA ÆBÎTÔ EÖÖ, NAFEÜ ÛLÂĞFÔ PÊTÔ ÂĞANAFÖÖ PÖFEM EÖB, 2Ö»DÚL NAFEÜ ÂÖPÜE 1955 ÂĞE ×ÖNÖ "MEĞ EÖÖ, »ĞEÛLYPÖ ‡ÂÖDLÂĞE 3°CB Ôĕ¦U ÔưB ÃÕ, ĐƯỢ, U 2Õ, ĐƯỢ, ĐỰ ®VEĂ , ĐƯỜ "CỐTÔ. Tà CÔÉ ÃCÔEÖ ÆB, ™ẠÕ TŒ <ÃCĂCB-<ÃC™B-†CECBÃCB %ÁYÖÖ Ûê »ÖDÊĞE ÛĞE ÃÖ,ÛNÜ,G ÃĞĀEĞFÜÊE ĞE ÖÆHYĞÖDEĞÖ ¾Ö ÃĞÆÐEĞÇÖS»Ö •ÖYÖEĞE Ö,Ü ×ÖSÖ _ÆĞ †Ö,ÖĞPÖ ²ŎFĞB×Ö ÛÚ, EPĞ Û6 'ÖÖ'Ö×ÖE 'ÖE '3ÖB ÛЦÜ ÛUB ÃÖ, ÛÛĞÜ Ü ÆĞĞÊ ÛUĞÇÎ •µÖÖ×Ö YÖEĞB_, Ü ÆĞĞĞB. ÆĞÇÎ °Ö•Ö, Ü "ÖYEĞ †Ö weß Æü.

‡ÃO DÉ † \$0000, \$\frac{1}{2}\text{0}\$ \$000 \$\frac{1}{2}\text{0}\$ \$

‡ÃÖÛé ÃÖŒÖ ÆB, ÆüÖÖ¸B ⁻ÖÖ™ã ÛúÖ µÖÆBÖ µÖÆÜ ³Öß ÛúÆBÖÖ ÆÜ ×Ûú †Ö∙ÖÖ¤B Ûé ²ÖÖ¤Ü ÃĞE »CĐứ ũ †20 ŸCƯÚ pừ ĐƯỚ Để¦ ũ đề 30 , Ô• piốc đề ×ô 90 308 cũ Thiệc Đức Ãộ được ở 90 8 Aci ^920 Aci ^920 Aci & %AVOO ÃČE •O& À YO_OPO »OOFOOE OE %AOE'NE OUCE »OE'OE OE «>OE >>O< ^9OO E *ÆNO ČE †3OS YOO µOOEO'9O<Ó YOOE 20EBÎO 20POÇTO AEU »GEULIPO ^90ULO ÛLÔŒTO •µIO¤O »OOPO ‡90 YO_BPO »OOPOŒ ÛLÔÊ 90EBA ×´O»O 700 _WELO AEU. •PPÔĐÚ ‡ÃÔ TỚ ÔS ĐE TE ÆŬÕ, B TỚT B ÔƯƠ PÔŒU ĐƯỢ ĐỀO ÆŬ ĐÚ †Ö•ÔŒB ĐĒ 2ÖŒU ÃĈE SÕĐÚ, Ŭ †3°B ŸÖÓú ÝÖ¸0PÖ »ÖÖFÖÖE Úé, ¾ÖÐÚú;ü ÃÖŒ¿¡ÖÄÖ Úé »ÖÖFÖÖE Úé ¾ŒHÖ ′ÖE ∞ÖYÖPÖB ³ÖB µÖÖEÖPÖÖ<Ó °ÖPÖB ÆÐJ "ÖÖFEÐ 3ãe çũ•µcũe CưB ÃO, Quốc đe giệ 20900±0 Acti µcũ Cức¦ ti CưB ÃO, Quốc ti giệc 20900±0 Acti µc∞ ti ^gò µcũeô900±0e Cưở 50 TQ,AQP'ü »QBO 308 ‡90 »QAQE ÜLÜE ‡0009¤0,0 †Q,ü ×90š0 ĀČE ¤ë פjiQ •00/Q, YQE ČI †0°00/QE µÔÆU 20/0090 "OŒNOS ÆBE XÚÚ ‡ÂOÂČE † 09ĈE ¤ŘO ČE ‡9Ô »ÔŒÔŒ ÚÚS »ÔYŒOYÔ 50 Ô,ÂÔŒ'U YÔ,Œ'B •Ô°Þ,Ü ¤ēpii Ædie •ONOS, »CEŪLIPO <ÃCO μΟŒDIO ÃCIĐORIO POŒ †Ci•O ÁČE »ÔYPOYO ÁĞRAD ¤ÁE ÁCO»Ô TÖLEĞE YÖLAPÖ »ÖCHCÜE ÜLB ‡ÁÖ ¤ÇÖPÖLÇÖ †ÖLEĞÜL ÄLEĞYÖ ÜLĞE 7LÖPÖ TÜE ͺĎÜÖÚĸŰ μÖÆÜ ŠAŨŃ ÆB ÛŃÆĎ EÖÖ ×ÛŃ <ÛŃ ŸŎŢĿĤ ÆŬŐŎŢĖ ¤ġŎ ČĖ ³ÖŎŢB ŸÖÞ֤ܤÜ ČĖ †®Ö∙Ö ÜÖSĞE †ÖÃÖÖÖPÖ ÚÁ ®ÖYÜE ¸ÜÜÖ ÆÄTÖ ÃÖÞÌI ¸ÆÄÖ ÆÄ, ŸÖE ¾ÄEĂ ¤ÃÃÖ,B ŸÖ¸ELÚ †®Ö•Ö ®Ö ×Ö>ÖPE ÚÚB ¾Ã•ÖÆÜ ÃĈE YÔ, OPÔ »ÔĐĐÔ ³ÔĐĐĈE Ô, U ¸NETĒ AETU. <ÃÔB ×ÃEÔŸÔ ĈE ÛE¦U ÛNB ÃÖ, OĐNÔ¸U ÛNĈE µÔVEU ÛN, ĐPÔ "ÔĐAEIK £ÔÔ ×Đú ‡ÃÖ TÔĐƯỜ, Lĩ ÃCE †®Ô•Ö ĐƯỚC ÝPÔĐỀU ĐÚ, GỐC ĐƯƠ ÝĐ-ÔU, ÕÃCE ∞ặ, Õ TC PÔĐƯC TỘ, Lĩ , ME NÔHÔC ĐƯỚC ±ŮB (ĈE µÖD 20ÆÜÖ ÛÚ'Ö ÛÚB'ÖVÖ "Ö,Ü ¤Ð ¤ÐÖÖ "ÖDÆÜK £ÖÖ...

×ãÖŸÖ ČE µŮÆÜ ¾Ð-ĞBÖÚú ²ÖÆBÖ TÖÆBÖE ÆB µÖÆÖÓ •ÖPþ_Ü TÖÄÖ ÆĞE •ÖÖYÖ... ‡ÃÖÚÉ †»ÖÖXÖÖ ‡ÃÖ ¾Ð-ĞBÖÚú 'ČE ÝÔ, GPÔ »COLOCE ÔUCE ÃOÃÝCE ¤Ô'COE CE Ô£ÂSO "CORÁSO, ÝOE£E 30 COEPÔ †®O-Ö ¤£PÊ ÛUS ÆB 2007Ô ÛUÆB ÝÔTÔ ÆŲ »ÔĐÔƯPÔ TÁNĂCE TÁÔ ¾Ô-CHÔCÓU ÔUÔ TÔOVÁÔ¤U TEĐÔ ®VEN ÆĐBO ÆU. ÝÔ PÔ »ÔĐÔCE ÔUÔE •ÔCE ÆUÔ UOOPª ÃOO OYOB ÃOÃYCE ¤O'OOE CE ¤£PCE OUB 200YO OU, II "HEE AFI, YOOE O£PADO AEUO "OOPADO, YOEEDE †O', II OOP'O †°90°0 ÆB ∞69°E ÛnB 2000 Ûnji jehê Ati. »GBÛn°9 YÛ,0°0 »QKÛE ÛnDE •ÖÂÛE Atiô ÛnÆNÛE Ati xÛn 36° ŒPi 3Ô,ĐÚ,ũ ÜCÔ9ÔO ÜCÔ<Ó YỐCE Ở ÃÔÔ-ĐÝOS ÆBE XÔÚ ‡ÃÔÃČE ^9ÔUÔ μÔEũ ÖÔÚÃϤũ ČĘĐÔ 9ÔEB ÆBE ÃÔÚďÂÖ... †£80000 ‡Ã0 70070>0ê 10ê ±ú,ü µ0Æü µ00ê 0°00 †0-08-†-0ep0 Æ00 20°00ú,ü ¸vŒü •00<f08.. ‡Ã0⇔0< ‡Ã0 - 34-0μ00ú (0€ Ý0,040 »00400€ 0úβ †9μ0 • 0°þ,000€ 0ú0€ 3′β - μ0090 (0€ ,0000ú,0 ‡Ã0′0€ 9°00ú, Ý0⊌0 3′0 ×0⊌0 †Övzü ÜdĞE 3ÖS •Ö'P\, ü ¿ÖÖ×ÖsÖ ×ÜQQÖÖ •ÖÖYÖÖ "ÖÖVEK £ÖÖ, ×ÖYEE ‡ÄÖ ¾Ö-QÖÖÜÚ ÖE ¿ÖÖ×ÖsÖ ¶ÖVEM ×ÜQQÖ ÝŮJUÖ AEÚ. ‡ÃÔ TÔ,U 3ÔB Đế¦U ĐƯA ÃÔ,ĐƯÔ,U ĐƯÔE •ÔPÞ,U HƯỚPÔ ¤ĐPÔ "ÖÖAEÜK... ‡ÃÔĐÁ ÃÖDEÔ AEA ‡ÃÔ -3**8-Ç**iQÛ (Ĉie piĈÆŭ 3Ĉis ÛúÆŭ 4ĈipÔ (Āŭ Aŭ , QΙ**Ô**pÔ ÜÖÖ[®] ÂĞipŌÖ piŒsÔŸÕ ÛúÖ »Õ°Ö 75 -ÖKŸÇiŸÖ **∞iE**QÖÖÇ 'ŐE 30 50 TÖRYO;ÖYÖ ;ÖPETÇŐE ÚE ÝÖ,QPÖ »ÖÖHÖÖE ÚLŐE פ;ÖÖ •ÖÖ<ÝÖÖ... »ÖEÚLÝÖ ‡ÃÖ †®GÖÖYÖ ŰE ¤ÆGÖYÖÜE ÚE ××Ö< ÜÖÖ™ ÃÖÖÖYÖB ÛuÖ ÛuÖE'Ö ³ÖB •Ö°Þ;ü ²ÖœHÖÖ "ÖÖÆEIK £ÖÖ… ‡ÃÖÛÉ †×ÖDÄÖ TÖHJÖÐÚ ÝÖ,DPÖ ¾DÆEYÖ Đước Acijii ÔPENPPC ĐƯƠN 5 √ĐứN CÔC ƯƯƠ™ ÃƯƯỚIO ¤PPCC ĐứN 20070 ‡ÃÔ HƯỚC ÔPPC Đứ YVENYÔ ‡ÃÔ ¾Ñ QUỚC 'ŰË ÛWEB YÖTÖ ÆÐ ×ÖÄÖ'ÜE ÛÐÆÐNÖ YÖÐÐÐE "ÖÖRÐNÖ ¾Ö "ÖÜL"Ö †®ÖNÖ ÆB ¿ÖNNÖNÖ NÛWÖÖ YÖDÖ ÆTI. TÄÖÛß 'TÖ';TÖ 'ĞE 3'ĞB Ûĕ¦Ü ÛdB ÃÖ,QÛdÖ,Ü ÛdĞE •Ö'P|ÇÜ 2'ÖCEĞĞÖ,B ÛdÇEĞB "ÖÖAEÜK 3Ö,GEĞÖ µÖÆÜ µÖĞEÖ9ÖÖ Ö'PÖ,ĞEĞÖ ÛdĞ ÆBB YÖ_NEÜ †-ÖÜÚ""ÖB ÃÖÖZÖYÖ ÆĞÖÐÚ¸Ü "NEÜ •ÖÖ<YÖB... µÖYEÜ 2ÖÖYÖ TÖYÜE µÖYEĞÖ ŒµÖĞE ÛÚYEBB ÆÜ ŒµÖĞEÜÚ ‡ÃÖ -×AP-CBÔOÚ Đề YÔLHÔ <ÛÚ ÔLLĐĐE ĈE <ÛÚ ¾AÔLLYÔ ĐƯỀ ĐĐÂNÔ 5 ×ĐÚN ĐỀ ÜỚ™ ÃŨ ÔNÔ ¤ĐỀ ĐƯઝ 2000 ÃÖ Ö-ÖVÖB ÆÐE «ĐÚ ÆÜĞE ‡ÃÖDÚB 'ÖÖ;ÖÖ 'YÖLEÖPÖB ÆÖÖĞB... ‡ÃÖDÛB YÖ,ELÚ ÃÖ,DÛĞ,Ü DÚĞE HÖÖPÖ ×ÆÖE DÚB •Ô°P), NÔ ĐƯỊ CHƯỚCĐƯ ÔĐƯ: ÔĐƯ: ÔÒ ĐƯỜ ĐƯỊ ĐƯỊ ĐƯỢ •ÔP), NÔ TỔ ĐƯỢC TẬ ĐƯỢ ĐƯỢ ĐƯỢ ĐƯỢ ĐƯỢC ĐƯỢC ĐƯỢC ĐƯỢC ĐƯ 3µÔÆTŸÖ ÛdÊ ¤ÆÎÊ ÛdB ²ÖÖYÖ ÛdÆB YÖ‡Ô ÆŸ ‡ÃÜB TÖÜDÜ Ü ÖPÐ NÖÐ ÞÖÐ ÖPÖ ÜE ÞÖÆÜ ÛdÆÐ YÖÞÖ £ÖÖ £ÖÖ ÞÛ ÆŬÔ ÃŨPÔ ÝÔ GPÔ »ÔŒÔŒ ÔƯỚE ÔƯỚE ÔƯỚE MEÔÝÔO Ů ™ƯỚE. »ÔĐÔƯÝÔ ÞÔŒŮ ÞŮÔEŮ ÞÔÐÔ 3'ÔB †-ÔÔÚ""ÔB ÃŨ₽ÔŸÔ ÆŨE JÆG ÆŨ, ŒŅŒĠĹŮ ÔŶŶŊĬĬŎŎ ÛŒ ŸŎŦĬĬŎ •ŒÊ ŶŎŊĨĨŶŎ »ŒĠŌ ÆŢŅ ^ŶŎŮĠĔ ŸŒĿ ŨŒĂĠŷŎ ÃŒĠŶŌ ³ŎŢŬ ŒĔÃŒŎ ∞ŒſŎ ŢŨĿŎŶŎŎŢŨ ××ipiO •00/00 Atii. Ā00x0 ³0;ii 'Če Ā00 ××e80 Y00e ®VEBi AtiBACe 365 ××e80 AtiBACe Atii. ÛerAbx0 Ā00 ××e80 Ûuû ^®OUdê ÛdÎ'Ö ×¤jidÖ •OOYÖ Æü †Ö,ü 265 פ£Ö %E ÜÖD>ÖB TÖ>TE JELYÊ Æü. ×±ú,ü YÖE ‡ÃÖB TÖDdÖ,ü ±°®Oúð 308 µÔEB ÆÐBÐ ÆÐBÖÐ. †ÖÖ <Ûú ¾DÆEYÖ ÚÚÊ 5 ×Ûú>ÔÊ †°®Ö•Ö <Ûú ÖÆÐPÐ Ú6 ׯÐÂÖÞÖ ÃŨE jeEbříče, říSe⊐ijůe říže •000újii říči46 20•00Vče jeEbříče ×0ú †20 0úvEbő Álče †Ök, ^900úče Obe≃ijůlo ¤e ¤e. Yöče ‡ÃÔ∞Ô< ‡ÃÔ †ÔẹŬ 3ÔB →µÔĐÔ ¤ĐỀ ÛưB •ÔPÞ, ÑÔ ÆŬ. ‡ŸÔĐÔ ÆB ĐŒĂ, ‡ÃÔ µÔĐÔĐÔ ÔĐ ŸÔÆÑÔ ¤B •009te 380x08 U009 A00701/08 308 Y0,040 x00400e 04de 0330x01m/8 04 x4A0070 A0e 3004 A40x010 0e x0x09t8 "ÖÖÆÜk...

‡ÃΟΘά »»Ö< Θά¦ü Θưβ ÃΘ¸ΦμΘ¸Ü Θưβ ÜΘΘ ÜΘΘ ÃΘΘΌΥΟΒ Θά 309 ظΦΘ Θưβ 308 μθε ü ÃΥΟ¸ü Θ¸ü ¾Q¿ŌΔΘ ¾μΘΑÃΕΘΟ Θύ¸ΦΌΒ ΑΕΦΑΘΕ ŒμΘΘΕΘύ ‡ÃΟ ΘΟΘ»Üε ΘΈ ÜΘΕ™Ü Θά¦ü Θưβ ÃΘ¸ΦưΘ¸ü Φ'E †308 ΑΕΦ»Θ ΑΕΒ ΘΈ μΘΕÜ ΘΟΘΟ ΑΕŬ «Θύ †696 ×Φ'Θ ΘΈ ÜΘΘ 308 ظΦΘ ΟΛΒ ΟΛΙ΄Β ΟΛΙ΄Β ΟΛΙ΄Β ΑΘΕ «Θ΄"ΦΘΕÜ ΑΘΕ «Θ΄"ΦΘΕÜ «ΘΘΕ "ΘΟ¸Ü 360Θ ΘΈ »ΟΥΘΟΥΘ

21 ÆijÖÖ,Ü ™GÖ †®Ö•Ö ÜÖ,ĞPÖ ÆĞÊ "ĞÛÜÖ ÆÜ. <ÃĞB ×ÃEÖŸÖ ÖE †ÖÖÜĞÊ ³ÖŞÖ,ÞÖ ÛúB ¾ĞÆÄEÖÖ Û£ »×Ök 3°CB šÕÃÖ Û¢¤ïÖ ^šÕPĈE ÆÕÄČE. ‡ÃÔŨÉ ÃÖŒÖ ÆB ‡ÃÖ µÖŒÖPŐ Û¢ÜE ÃÖ°QÞÖ ÁŒ ¾Ö šÕŨ¢ ŒĐŐ ÃŒ »CÔÝ ČER Ú Ú, ÔT ČER Ú ÓR × ŠÔ< ×ÃÔ Xà PPÔ Á ÝÔ, LÍ TỔ, LÍ • CÔE × TẬU TỔ Xà Ú Ú CÔ THẾ ŽÃ TỔ ČÝ ÝÔ K. ÁTŲ ↑ PÔÚ CÔ TỚB Á TỔ ÚÝ ÚB. ÃĈE TÔSOPO ÚÚ,ÔPO ÆĐÃO †Ô,Ü ‡ÃÔ ĈE TÔŢÔ •ÔPE 3ÔSOS ÚK∕QUÕE ÚUS •ÔÔÔ TÔSĂÕSOÕ ÚÉ ×SÔ< ÚɦÜ 3Ô , Õ∙µÕ ÃÖ, ĐƯƠ, Đề ƯƯỚE † TÔ ĐẾ¢ TÔ ĐẾ¢ ÃYÔ, LÍ TÔ, LÍ <ÛÚ ×ÃÃ, ĐÃÔ ×ĐƯÔ, ĐĐB Xà ÃÔ ĐÃO Đà ĐÃO °C ĐỀỚ ĐỀ ỦưB †Ô, LĨ 3'08 -µ00'90 ×98'8 Ûu8 •0'Pb_N'0 Æü 30_68'0 ‡ÃO µ00'6'09'0 ÃO'6 YO_6P'O »00'6'08 Ûu0'6 •µ00×0 »00'9'0 9'0Æia ×0's'0 -TÖKÝTÖL. µÔYEU ÃĞB-TÖKKÖ ÖL ÜЦÜ ÛKB ÃÖ,ÛKÖ,Ü ÛKĞE ‡ÃÖ,≫ÖK ¤ĕ "WEB ÆBB ŒHÖĞÐÚÚ "ÖĞ™ÜHÖ ÜTÖ™ ÃĞQ,ÖÖÖ µIOE-090 20909€ ÃĈE "ÔEBĂĈE ™BO ÛLE YO_BPO ¾O ÛLEO-OŒEŬ YPPOÛLE ÛLE ¾EBÎOŒ ÛLE »XÖK †40 YÖÛLE †¶ÛLE ÛLEJADO μαθεό 900×0 2090 "αθνα Αείμ •αθε Αείαθε Αθχώνα), με ±α臻 αθε 'θε -θωθο "αθπήλιος 90•0, α †θ χώεις Αεία. ‡Αθ 20070 Ôú †®ĐÚ ^¤ÔHQUPÔ ÆUÔĞ ÃÔÔÔĞ ÆU. TŨ ÃÔÔÔ ÔÔ ÆU. TŨ ÂÔÔÔ ÔUÊ ÔŨ ÔU ÆU ĐÚ •ÔÔ ¤ÃÔ ÔU ĨŨÔÔ ÔÔÔ ÔŨ , NEB ÁOS ÖVÖB ‡Ô¤Ü, Ö ÝÖÜÐÖS •ÖB, ֤ؕÖ EÖB, ŸÖÜÊ ^9EÐÐÐE †ÖÐB ÆÐÐÆÖVÖ ÚÉ ¤Ð, ÖÐÐ ÝÖ, ÞÞÖ ×ÐBÐÖ, ÞÞÖ Ôé »Ô< 20 ÃÔ¢ÔŊÔ ÔưÔµÔÔÔÔÔÔÔ 29ÔÔµÔ, »ÔĐÔÝÐ ¾ÔFEI †2Ô ÔÚFEĂ "9°Ô,II "ÔFEĂ †Ô "ÆEÔ ÆEI. ‡ÃÔÔÉ 2ÔD¤II ÛuÔDÔÔÔÔ TÖD™NG ÛUG ÃÖ,ÛUÔ,Ü ÇÊE ÝÖ,QPÖS ^®ÖDDÖĞÜ ÛE ××Ö< †Ö,Ü ÛU‡Ô ÃÖÇEDYÖ ÛUÂUÔÛÛ Ö 2ÖĞÖ<, ×ÖEÛUFĞ ^®ÔUÔ ÔƯỚC Ô TYÔO-TOVÔ ®VENI ALI. TÃO ÃÔĐĐÔÔ ỚE ƯỚC ÔĐƯ ÔƯƠNG TÔ™NI ÔUÔ HỮE 3ÔS ÔƯÆGTỚ ALI ĐÚ ¤#Ö ÖE YÖ,0PÖ ¾Ö ÛúÖ•ÖÜEÜ ŸÖPÜÜÁ ÛuÜE ¾Ö¾Ö®Ö Ûĕ¦QuÖ μÜÜEÖ®Ö†ÜE ÛÆ YÖÆÜÖ ¾Ö¾Ö®Ö °ÞÖÜE ÖE •ÖÜE ÃÖ, ĐƯƠ, B »COPÔ × XII, OÒ • COVÔ ÆŅ † CÔÜ, Ü CÊ ÂÖ CÊ ÃČ ÂŬ CÊ ÃŨ 6 ^ GÔĐE - CÔÃÔ 100 1 Ý ÖK CÊ ÃŨ 15 1 Ý ÖK YOU Ú ÚIÐ Æ**ir** »00°0 "04**6**0 "00700 Æii. ‡ÃO "00°0»0e "0e "0 Ú00ÃO YOU i ÃO ÚI**00KO** "00°4å ¾ ~¶Oúis pládok< ÃÖ, được là ÂCE pláta 2007Ô •Ô°P, là "Các đểO" "COTCHÔO" ACÁC XÚ 1 ÇXÚÔ, được là ÂC ÂC Ô Ú de xyố< Dướt ×ô "Ô¢ĐÔ, ũ ÆCP " Ôĩ ÃÔ Ô-ĐÝÔS ÆLÉE ĐÚ ‡ÃÔ ĐÉ ×Ô< ÃÔÆC ČÔĐÔ ÔÇ ÔÔÇ ÔE Đɦ ũ ¾Ô , Ô• μỗ ÃÔ, ĐƯỜ, ĐE ĐÚS Ýľovoľo Ãďœlo, Ýľovoľo ®dr¥ľoµddo 30 Ýľovoľo Ôuôµdo Droovids Æbb ≐ďoædô °þ÷ö Ãde ×-oʻ′ Čæloj ii Ætii. ‡Ão ′ďo∵ovde ´ďe Ûĕ¦ü ¾Ô ŢŴ•µÖ ÃÖŢŴŀŮŢŒĿŨĸŰĿ×Ő»ÖŨĸŢÜ →pÖÖР׌ÑÖ ÆŒÑÖÖ, ŸÜPÜS ‡ÃÖ ŢŴĀ™ŒŅÖ ÜÖÖ⊃ ÃÜĘĕÖÖ µÖÜÈÖÐÖ ÔUÔ ÝÔ PRÔ »CÔƯCE YÔUÚ ÃÔTEB "CÔUÔTICE CE CERÔ »CÔPÔ TOTBÔ ÃCÔUÍTO ATÚ. ‡ÃO DE ÃCÔCO ATB ‡ÃO HOŨEÔTIC ÛuÔE »ÔĐÚ ÇII ÆTIÖÖ ÇA TÖÖ™TA ÛUÖ µÖÆTI ³ÖB ÛuÆTÆTÖ ÆTI ×ÛU Ûĕ¦II ÃÖ ÇÎDÛĞ I «ÖÇÖ TÖÇET ¤ȚEÖ ÛE ×»Ö< ÝÖ, 62°Ö ¾Ö •Ö9Ö-ÆHÏÖ Ûúß •ÖÖE ³Öß Ûĕ¦nauÖ µÖÜ•Ö9ÖO<Ó 2Ö9Ö†Ô •ÖÖYÖß ÆÜ ^9ÖÛúÖ -ÖæÖ ÜÖ'ÖÖ Ûĕ¦Ü Ûúß ÃÖ,QÛdÖ,ü ÛdÊ ÜÜErü ÆB ^šÖPÖ "ÖÖÆÜK ŒµÖÜÜÚ †"ÖPÊ ¤₱,Ö "ÜE †Ö•Ö ¾ÖB •µÖÖ¤ÖVÖ,ü ¸Ö•µÖ <ÃÜE ÆÜ ×°ÖŸÜÚß †ÜLEÖÜÚ ×ÃEÖŸÖ ŠÆÜÚ °ÖÆŇ Æü.

ÁÖB ÃÖ°ÖÖÖÄÖ: †ÖÖÖUB ⁻ÖÖ™ä ÛuÖ ÃÖ′ÖÞÖ ÜÖŸÖ ÆÖË ĮÆÖ ÆÜL.

ĀŬĀŬS (ŎĻŪĠĀŬS : 2ŌĀŎ 3-4 ×ŎŶĬMŭ †ŎŢŬ "ŰŎÆĬK... ţĀĎ»Ŏĸ <ÃŨS ×Ā£ŌŸŎ ŰE ţÃŎ ÜÜÖ^A ĀŨĘ**ō**ŨŎ µCCEÔTO ÔUÔ TÔĐÃO ƯỚ°ÔÔ ÁÔTÔB ÇÕµCCE ỚE ĐæU ÔUB ÁÔ ĐƯỚCU ÔUÔE ÆB ^šÃĐTÔ "CÔÆEK †®PÔCECÔ µÔŒU μΟΘΕ-0900 308 -090 Đế †30900 TVE μΦΕΦΟ ĐƯỚ ΦΡΟΟ ΑΕΦΕΘΕ 300>08 904E à ΛΕΕ ŒμΟΘΕΦΟ ‡ÃΟ μΟΘΕ-0900 ĐƯỚ •µÔD×ĐƯO, ũ ƯỚ °Ô) •ĐÃÔD ×ÔU Ở °ĐỀ ‡ÃÔ ×XĐ-QĐÔOU Ở E ÔCEÔD ÆŲ ĐĐ-µÔĐE ÔE ‰TÔ, ũ ÆB "ĐỆN ×XƯỚ X X Ç ĐỘ Ý QUỐ AEÚ. <ÃŮB ×ÃEÔŸÔ ŰE µŰEÚ µŰŒŰPŐŐ ¸Õ+µŰŒ ŰE ÛÚŰŸµŰPŐ ÆÖŒÜE ¾ŐD×ŮB ŸŨÆÑA ÆÚL. ‡ÃŐ ÚÚE †×ŰDÆŰ ‡ÃŐ µCCE Ô9TÔ ÔUCE »COYCE ÔÚ, TYCE ÃÔ QUÔ ÆTICE XÔUÃO 9TÔE ÔÚ ÆTHÔCE ÔUCÔ 3ÔS ÆTH A ÃYÔ, HÌ TÔ, HÌ TŒPÔF CEPÔ →µCÔ9TÔ , iÚ 0900 Æ OK 00...

‡ÃÔĐ¢ ÃÔŒĈÃÔŒÔ ¤ṇÔ Đ¢ YÔ,0PÔ »ÔŒÔŒ Đước ÔĐÔÔ ºþ°Ô ÃŒ ¾ÔĐứÃÔNÔ Đứ,đỡc Đớ ^Spịlô ÃÔE Ô µÔFEÔO µÔFEÙ 3ÔB ÛÚFEÐRO "ÔVEÑOS ÆÐÐE XÚÚ ‡90 »OŨÊÔE ÛÚÐE ÛÐFÐÐNÖ ÃÕßÜE ¤ÖYÖÐE ŰE YÔÐÐÐE "ÔVÐÐNÖ †ÖÞ¤Ü ¤ÐRÐE . ÃĈE ÛLÔ Ô 904Ei "ÔN ÔÃÔ 20-NÛL ‡90 ÛLB , ÔPEÔ Ô, ĐÔ ÛLB †900 •ÔP), ĐƯỢE ŨLÔE Ô, ĐÔ ÛL, ĐỀE ÛLE XVÔ< 30B Ûĕ¦ü ¾Ô ¸Õ•µÖË Ûưß ÃÖ¸ÔưÔ¸ÕË ÛưĜE ‡®Æë ãÖ܇Ô ¸ÕËŌYÖÖ¸ü †Öפü ¾Öß •Ö°þ¸ü ^7Ö»Ö°-Ö Ûú¸Õ®E ÆÕÄĞE +£0000 ‡ÃÔ "ÔÔ"Ô>ÔE 'Œ †Ûœ>ÔE '' Ô9Ô,ĐÔO' • ÔÃÔS †-ÔÔ'U''ÔS _ÔEÔNÔ,ŪÒ,ŪÒ ÞÔÐÔ Ô9Ô Ûúß 'YÔ,ŒEU ¿ÔBÞ Ûvß ÝCTÔ TÃO PCCEOTO 30 T9O PCCEOTOTCE ÁCE T9O »COLCOE CUÓ CUÓ CÚCO "CXOTE 300XO TOPEM AEU 20»OÚ TÃO Ûé »Ö< ÆŭÖË †Ö,ü ³ÖB •Ö°Þ,& Ûú¤ŭÖ ^š**ö**°ÖE Æ**Ö**ÄÖE.

ਮða •Ö°Þ_G ²ÖÖYÖĞE Û Á ÃÖĞEÖ †²Ö ′ÖÖ Ûĕ¦Ü ÛGB ÃÖ_QÛĞÜ Ü ÛGĞE µÖÆB ÛVÆÆPÖÖ "ÖÖÆÐÖG ÆÐÉ ×Ûú Ûĕ »Ö< Ûĕ¦Ü Ûúß ÃÖ,ÛúÖ,Ü ÛúĞE •ÖPþ,Ü ÃÖÖÖÖ,Ü Ûú,ŒÖÖ "ÖÖÆEik...

ÆĞIXÖĞÜLÜLE †Ö+Ö ÜLE ÄĞETÜKÜĞE ÜLE †XÖXĞÖ ÜLE"LE †Ö, Ü ZÜB +Ö'D, B. ÄĞETÖXĞ ÖZETKÜE ÆB. ÄÖ, DÜLÖ, Ü ÜLĞE ××ik •00 "ÔĐÁ ÆTŲ ×•0°Đ ČE ÃŨE ÛÃ" Û ÃŬEÔDAŬE ÛÚĈE ÃŌ ÛÚĎ, ĐỀE ‡ÃŌ ¾Ã-QHÔÚ ŨE ŰŨEVI ÆTA ÃQHÔŨEÛ°Ð »ÖÜÓÚ¸Ü ¿ÖÖ×Ö»Ö ÛÚ¸Ü ×»ÖÞÖÖ ÆÜ, ÞÖÆÜ †"″MB 2ÖÖNÖ ÆÜ, »ÖEÓÚFÖ ‡ŸÖFÖE ÆMB ÃČE ÝÖ¸MFÖ »ÖÖHÖÖE ÛúÖE ‡ÃÖ µCCE-Ô9O ÛUÔ TÔĐĐ ≫CCPÔ ×ÔXÔ9Ê XÔXXÔ 9ÔE AĞI. ‡ÃÔXXÔ< ‡ÃÔ XÃ-CHÔÚÚ TÔ, II ×4-6PCOÚÚ 26 †ÝÕĂŸÔ ÛUÔE •OKVÔCE µO ÆŬO, 6 °O™ê °CE •OE °OB °OP), 6 ÃÔŒONO פŬ ÆŬ ^°O Œ ÃĈE Ûĕ"Û ÜÖÄÖ ÃŒŒONOŒ ÛdÊ yÖzü ÃÖĞÖĞ ÆĞE ÃÖDÉ, YÖÜ Dɦü Dúß ÃÖ ÔDÖĞ Ü DúĞE ^®ÆE •Ö'b ü ÃXKDûĞ ü Dújü »ÖÇÖÖ "ÖÖÆEk, YÖÖDÛ ¤ạö Ûá ÝÔ 020 30 †ÃÔΕÔμÔ »ÔXÔ ‡ÃÔ μỮŒÔPÔ ÛúÔ CŒŨFŒŒÔ »ÔPÔ ^šÔ ÃÔŨĂ, 0ÛÚŮŒ ‡ÃÔŨÁ ÃŨŒÔ ÆB µÖÆBÖ ÜÖÖÄÖ −µÖÖÖ ∞ÆÖE ÛxB 2ÖÜÖ µÖÆï 3ÖB ÆÜ xÛú ‡ÃÖ ¸ÕÄ™ÔŊÖ ÜÖÖ? ÃÜÇŏÖ µÖŒĕÖÖÖ ÛxÛE »ÖÖÉŒ Ôú, Đỗ Ôể »Ô< ‡ÃÔ Ö, ũ Ôể, lũ pốÔ , **Ö**+ pÔ ÃÔ, Đườ, đề Ôưã...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

ÃČÁČB ĆŪĻČŮŠŽČB: ÃÖŢŲ ĆŮ ×ÔĖŸŮŠŠÕ ×ÕĖŸMŪ †ÖŢÜ »Õ**Š**ČB...

ÁÜB ÁÜPÖÖÖÄÖ : ŸŒĕ, ŸÆĕ, †²Ö †ÖÖ ÜÖŸÖ Ûúß⊷Ö<...

ÃOÁOS TOLOGRÁTOS : ÇÕ-HŐ ÃŐ ĐƯỚC ĐỀ ĐƯỚ ĐƯỚC • HỮO ĐƯ ĐƯỚC TOTO TOTO XÃO XÃO ĐỘI ĐỆN ĐƯỚC TÃŐ XÃO ĐỘI ĐƯỚC ĐƯ 'ČE ŅĪŒŪ 20070 ĪŒĒ YOŪ,Ū ĀČE ĀĪŌ™Ū 90ÆÐ ŪUS YOṬŌ ÆŪ ×ŪU ‡ÃO ŅŪŒŌ9O ŪŪĒ "O×OO9Ē ŪĖ ××O< ‡ÃOŪĒ †ÔLEÔÚÚ ÄÖÖĞ CEJŐÐ-CEJŐÖ ÆÐÁÖÐ? ‡ÃÔÚÐ ÃÖCEÐ-ÃÖGEÐ ÆGÍÐE ‡ÃÖ 2007Ö ÚÚR YÖ_ELÚ 3ÖS →JŰÐÐ ÆÐÁÐ ÆÐÁÐÐ ÞÚÚ Đế¦U ÃÔ ĐƯỢ, U Đườ •µÔX×ĐƯỚ, U 'ÔÔ Ô×ĐŨÉ 'ÔE ĐÂN TẠIÔ "VÀ THỚO ĐÂN TẬUÔ ÃYÔ, U "Ô, U TÔLEÔÚ VÀ TỘ "ÔB VỚS ĐỘ ĐÔ Ôú ÝÔ×ÔYÔ 20°06 AEÔBÔE ÔÚ ÔUÔ, ÞÞÔ ×Ô" B>ÔE ÔÚ" Û ÃÔ QUÔ ÃÔE ÞÔÆÔÔ 1ÝÔ< ÔUÔ ÔUÔ ÔYÔ †Ô< ׌ĐÔ ÔUÔ±ÛB •μÖΣ×Ö Ûú´Ö•ÖĞÇÜ ÆĞÜĞB •ÖÖ ¸ÜEĞ ÆĞÇ ×•ÖÄÖÛĞB ¾Ö•ÖÆÜ ÄĞE †ÖPĞE ¤ĞĞÖ ÛĞB †EĞĞĞĞĞĞĞEÖ ÖĞÜ ¾ÖB †2Ö »Ô/OÒ/OQ ii 20x0 - CPOOXO - CP-Ci , MEO AEU + ECOOCE + ECOXIOXAEOO 308 + 20 »Ô/OÒ/OQ ii ×Ô/OP-NOB • OO , MEO AEU + 0, ii ‡ÃÔÛdÔ 2ÔÃà TÔ PÔĐÃO †2Ö ¤ẹJÔ ÛdB ÝÔ, 18PÔ <¾ÔÔ ÔHÔÔ ¾ÔYÔÔ ÛÉ »ÔÔHÔŒ TÔ, U 3ÔB TÔ ÞEÐE ÚÉ ÃÔŒĐÔ ÃÔŒĐÔ ‡ÃÔ , ĐÙĐƯỜ ƯỚO? ÃỚà TỚO HƠĐỆ 0°90 TO, LÍ 3°CB TO MÝO... ‡ÃÔ «ĐĆ «ÃỚE ÆÐD»OŪYÜE ĆE..

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Please conclude.

ÁCÁICS (CQUCEAPCS : ÃÔ,Ų ∞ilie × Ô®O™U...∢ÃČE ÆBISOVOČE (ČE ŪCOTOČÃO TOŌ™BI ŪCB , Ū™OQUŌ †⊣µÖ5Ö ¾0 pláciás<. Cub "Čejo jiďádělo °Če »cállu álbid Če tál «Ab-Cejúču če tál «Ab-Cejúču čeju 2008-čile atek •cile půteu Cuatió »Cu tál µCOE-Ô°90 Úulie »COYObe Úú, ePê Úé ∞XÔ< ÆŭIO, ê "COÃO ÃOO-Ô°90 Æŭ µCO °90Æmia, x00úYOm ‡ÃOO é ∞XÔ< ÆŭIOE AOO-O°90 •ŒPÔPÊ ÆŒÊÊ; »ŒÛÛŶŶ ‡ÂŒÛ 20, ê ´Œ ÆŒŐ, B ˙ŒMã ÛÛ µŮŒÜ ÛÚÆŒŶŨ ÆŰ ×ŨÚ ¤ġŮ ÛÚB <ÃŒB ÜÔ, ŒPÔ †ÖLEÖDÚ ×ÃEÖŸÖ ÛÉ ÆÖNÜE ÆÖK ‡®ÖLŰS ÚVÆB ÆÜEÔ ÞÖÆÜ 2ÖÖÖ †2Ö ‡ÃÖ ÞÖÐÖ ÚÉ ≫Ö< ÚÆBÖSÖ <ÚÚ Ôư**đẹ B** Ôư**a độn**ở để B²⁰900 ú, ũ<u>i</u>te ũ • đó vớb, < Ádo được » NV TVO đều. < Áde Ôô, đợc † **địc** đó đão với để Ôé "Ö»ÖYÜE †²Ö µÜELÜ µÜEÖPÖÖ µÜEGÖ •µÜÖ¤Ö »ÜEÜE ÃÖ'QµÖ YÜÜÚ "Ö»ÖPÜE ¾ÖÖ»ÜS PÖYEN ÆLLI. ÃÖÖĞÖ ÜE †²Ö ÆLÜÖĞB -TÖT™BE ÛNÎ PÛPEB ÛNÆBPÎÔ ÆEU ×ÛN PÛ×WU ÛB¦U ÛNB ÂÛ,ÛNÛ,U ‡ÂÔ PÛDEÔPÎÔ ÛB •Û×,UK PÛPEBÎÔ ¤PÊ,Ô ÛB YÛ,BPÎ 30 •CDXOROD≥18 340RAãCO Ú16 ×2,CÚCO, µ †ÃOÆQHO 30 Ú1.CO•CQEU »CORCOE Ú10E ÃOÆB CÓQHO®E CE ‡ÃOÚCO °CQEO »ÔPÔ ¤ĐĐÔ "ÔĐĐƯƠS ÆŲ YÔĐE ×±ú,ũ Đẻ¦ũ ĐưS ÃÔ,ĐƯƠ,ũ ĐưĐ¢ ‡® ÃPÔS 2ÔVÔĐE ĐưS YÔ,ĒLÚ ÃÔ QUÔ ÃŨE ÔĐĐÔ -µ0090 ×eP00 "00×Eik... ‡9Æia •0°b,6 20000ë Që Ã00E0 †20 °0 -090. †0908 -00™ia Qu8 †0ë i Ã0E Që¦ii ÔưB ÃÖ,ĐƯƯ, ũ «Đị Đ »ÔÖ< ÝÖ< ‡ÃÖ †Ö-Cè†-Cepē , ĐÙĐƯ, Ö ÜÖÖ[™] ÃŒ, ĐÖÖ ×ÃÔ-CḤĐÔÚ ÔƯỜ ÃỜ ĐÃY ĐÔU ÝÔŌ, Ũ [−]ÖŢÜ ÃÖ'ÖEÖĞÖÖ ÛÚŢÜĞE ÆĞK †°ÖĞÖB 2ÖÖYÖ µÖÆĞA ÃÖ'ÖÖYÖ ÛÚŢÜĞB ÆĞE -Ö°PÖĞĞÖ¤Ü.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Sitaram Yechury, your party time is fifteen minutes and you have five minutes.

ÁÖB ÃONYOÒ Ở Ö LICEOTAB : ÃO°OTONO •OB, "OĐOÚ †3OB OVERPB ČE ÆB "O'OOO "O»O LIEB ÆÜ ‡ÃO»O< 'ČÍ 3'OS OPEBPOS ČĖ AEDS 2'ODROBŪO... ČĘDI "OPEBROO ĀORODRO ŅŪPEU AEU RŪ TŪOO ĀODRO TOPEBROĖ •ČPO ‡ÃO ÃO ĐŪDO U ÃÖ,ĐƯỜ, Lũ ÚC ĐÔ ÃƯỚ, ĐƯỜ Ở ÃƯỚ ÁƯỚ ÁƯỚ XHƯỚC ĐƯỢ ĐƯỚCS... ^9Ô ÃƯỚ ∞ ĐƯỚC Ở ĐƯỜ Ở ƯỚCÔ ỦƯỢ ĐẦC ĐƯỢ ĐƯỚC ĐƯỢ ĐƯ TÖLEÖ×ÖÖLÍYÖÖ ¤B YÖ‡Ô EÖB ×Ôú ¾ÊE †®Ð ÁÖLJÞÖÖ DÚÐÐÐÐ »ÖC×VÖE. ^ÃÖÐÐ 2ÖÞÜ ÖÐÆÐ 2ÖÐ,U KÁÖE ÁÖÖ ∞ÆÐÐ 20NO YO< †O, ii †20 •000ú, ii †0•0 µOEii ×0×0 »OQOO YQOO ÆIII. ÕEËE ÜQIB ÆII ×0ú <ÃCE ÃOOÃOO ∞EB -70) NETÜ 200, Ü 2009'Ö9ÜE ÛNE 200≃Ü †Ö•Ö µÜNEÜ ×Ö»Ö »ÖQNÖÖ •ÖÖ _NEDÖ ÆÜ, YÜÜE ×90-½,″ÖVÖ °þ⊤Ö ÄÜE µÖNEÜ ¿ÖÜÚ -Ô¤Ô ÆŌŘÔÔ ÆŬ ×Đú ‡ÃÔ ™Ô‡ØÔÝÔ ĐƯÔ ′ÕŸÔ×PÔ ŒµÔÔ ÆŬ †Ô,Ŭ µÔÆŌÔ Ō,Ŭ..**(340ŘÃďO°)...**

THE MINISTER OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY AND THE MINISTER OF EARTH SCIENCES (SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY): Better late, than never.

ÁÔB ĂÔNYCŲ Ở Ô ¼CĐČĄB: ŠBÔÚ ÆŲ •QUÔCO»Ô ĮĐOB ĂCOÆBÔ ÚÚB ²COYÔ ´Ô ´COªO »CHO ÆĐE — ¤Địũ †ÔĐÔ¤II ¤ĐIVÂYÔ TỘƯỘ¤II. ¤ĐIII ÂĞE TỘƯỚO, »ÔĐÔƯỚO ¤ĐIVÂYÔ TỘƯỚO, »ÔĐÔƯỚO ƯỚCEII ¤ĐIVÂYÔ 3ÔB GÔPEN ÆŞI ‡AO»O< 10 µOÆü UNÆ970 "OOÆNOO ÆÐE >Un ÆüO AO10£080 Un 970 "OOÆNOE ÆŪ, ÆüO "OOÆNOE ÆÜ >Un APOUNDE † Ô°GE ×ặi Ô Chi thếu ũ troới Álai biOO ×Ôs Ce »ÔĐO ứ°O ‡ÂÔ ¾Ô CặC CO Cức »Ô°GE Chi ×sók • GUE GŒÊK ÔC ƯỚO 'ČE ≫0.000 YQUO, ^AO ™ODEO×00.0100 Oude †Y0, ii †Ö0 ™ODBOÇE Y00E µCE •ODE †GB•ODE™B4°0 ≫0.00E Y0× AFII ‡¶ -10034-00900ë Uni "0»01/0ë 34dë »00/0de 904-ni Ændë A0Uni/0ë. What does the Bill say? It says, "To provide for food and nutritional security in human life cycle approach, by ensuring

access to adequate quantity of quality food at affordable prices to people to live a life with dignity." There are three aspects.

Three aspects are there. †00 TOAMINI †OEO, Ü ×10090 •09, ß ÆÜ ^V090 ×100 †QÜ ±••010 Ûtê ÂCCEO 0•0×0 _iEERê Ûtô †×CÛtô, ii ×MÊ. µÔEÔO Ö, ii •CÔE ŌDAO-COPÔ †Ö°9ÅE †ÖPÆ ÂCE;ÖPÆE Æ xÔú< Æŭ ^®'ĈE †Ö'Ö®E ĈŴÆØ xÔú 67 ~ÖXQ;ÖYÖ †Ö'ÖÖ¤B ÔŴE ÆB µÖÆÜ †×ÖÖÜĞ Ü xÖxÖEÖ, 33 ~ÖXQ;ÖYÖ †Ö'ÖÖ×B ÛdÊ ‡••ÖÏÖ ÛÉ ÃÖŒÖ •ÖSŸE ÛdÖ †×ÖÛdÖ¸Ü ŸŒĎ ÆÑ ŌŎ™ŴÚ †ÖÆÖ¸Ü ×Ö»ÖŸE ÛdÖ †×ÖÛdÖ¸Ü °ŘÆ à Æü. †ÝÖ, ü †ÖÖ µÖÆü ÖÖ?ÖÚú, ü "Ö»ÖÉÖE ×Ûú 33 TÖ, ÍÄÖĽÜ »ÖÖÉÖ †Ö•Ö TÖL'Ü 3Ö, ÍÚÚ, ü ÜÖÖ "ÆEÐ ÆŪ, ±••070 Ûé ÂCCEÔ •08 jiEê Æji YCCE †ÔÔ †*Ô90E ÆB †COÚ⊳ÎE ≪90ÚÔ>Ô Ûújü ¤ÎDÔ >CG>•0K, •CCE †COÚ⊳ÎE †ÖÖÜLÖ ™ÖÖPÖYÖ ÛLÖĞ;ÖPÖ ××ÜÜÖ "NEĞ AĞL. 20""ÖE ÛLE ÛLEĞÖĞĞPÖ ÛLĞE AĞLÖÖ, E ×ÇÖ ÛLE TÜĞÖPÖĞĞB ÛLÆĞIĞE ÆŲ "It is a national shame." †ÖÖ child nutrition ÛúÖ Ō¸ŪÃÖÜĞÖ ×ÕÖúÖ»Ö Ûú¸Ü ¤ÓÜÖ »B\$+-0k... †Ö'00'dde "00'00 "0\$-0de'00 \$0ú •00e ‡Ã0 Y0 jiEû 0'd8 0•0≥¥0'08 ‡••00'0 0'e Ã0'0e'0 •08 jiEê Æji "0e''û ³Ô,ũ Đứ,ũ ∙ÔS , việc Act, ^ÃÔ YÔ, đượ Đề Về »QUẾO 33 °Ô, MÔC"ũ ®Việu Act. ‡ÃÔ×Ô< †Ô•Ô phátu †×Ôdáð,ũ ÃÖPÖÖLÜĞE ×Ö≫ÖPÖÖ "ÖDAEik... µÖÆü <Ûú †ÖbrüÖE'ü µÖÖ ÃÖQÖDEÖPÖ ÆüÖ †ÖPÖB TÖÖ™NE ÛKB †Öçü ÃÖE Ûú,NÖE. AEŬÔ AÔ,ĐƯỚÇII ĂŨÊ TÔYÔVEU ƯỚLU ŅIEB AEŪ XŮÚ AÔ,ĐƯỚCU ‡ĂÔƯỚC 100°0 XŨE. TÝŨ,U ‡ÂÔƯĐ 200,B ỞE TÔHÂCE ĐưB Đứ ÔB ĐưB ²00Yờ **đi** đề j**iếu đi**ụ Yôbê ở ^ãô địu 3ÔB †ô%**đ**yôd... †Ö•Ô đườo ê ∞ặô Điệ †**9**qu đã đe ÔUB ÔUÔHÊÔ ÔƯ ÔB "ÔVEN" AEN. HỐ ĐƯỚC ÔNĂ ĈE ÔUÔ SAÔU ^ CỘU ÔVEN AENE NEW AEN. TỚ Ó TỚB CHE UNDE NAENO ×ē şilētē AEDIP ‡ĀOO UB O LIŪĘTO •O P) SIO 904 tā AELI. ^900 e 700 tō 7000 AEĻ ^ĀOĀOE ŒμΟΟ Ο Ú.£100 AEĻ ^ÃÖÜÉ 2Ö,ĕ ´ÖE ^®Æĕ ŌNÖÖ ®ÖÆÄ ÆÜ. ‡ÃÖS≫Ö< ¾Ë ÃÖĞĞÖ ÜÖ,ФÜ jÆÉ ÆÜ, ‡ÃÖS≫Ö< ¾Ë >ÖB>Ö,Ü UO,60ş jilēā Atū ∞0AOUdO ∞070 20œNdO •00 jilē0 Atū †0jū 30è ∞0j0 Udß †£00%0A£00 Udß °Qa™ü Uújü , NETĒ AETĪ μÖÖ ¾ŘE , OLμÖ»Ö <ÙĐ"Ū 'ČE ‡®AÕĒ™Ū ÛÚ¸Ū , NETĒ AETĪ. μČE YÖS®ÖE AEB •OYOYEÐ AETĪ •OYEBO TO¸Ū TOACE ‡ÃÔÛuÔE ¾ÃßÖÖ≿¸ÜÖ Ûú≤¸ük, µÖÆÜ ŌÆÜSÖB ²ÖÖŸÖ ÆÜ.

×ábū, β 2000 μūti ati xû †ö 99e û útið Ati xû Tökö Xaöteyö 7000 ×ö,xöe †90•ö 70kö 70kö ×áb,xöe †90•ö 70kö 70ke ×áb †ÝÔ, Ů ‡••ÔNÔ ĐỀ ĂCCEÔ •CG9Ô AĞŲ TČE'Ü 3Ô, Ů ĐÚ, Ů DÚ, Ů DO9Ô AĞŲ YCCE CEJÔD TONÔ ¾JÔCENÔ TOCOÒ XÚÚX CCE †9°D•Ô −ÖÄŸÖ ´ÖÜÆÜ ¤6PÖE ÃÜE µÜÆÜ ÃÓÓÓÞÖ ÆÐ? †ÖÖÜvÜE µÖÆÜ ³ÖB ²ÖEÖPÖÖ ÆÖÖÖÖ †Ö¸Ü ‡ÃÓÓé ≫Ö< ³ÖB ÆŬÖ ÃQĐQĐĐ90 ×NGE. †ÖÖ 70000 XÛúxÔE ÃÔE ÃOONO XÛúxÔE ÛÚÔ ÃÔE ÛÚÔ ÃÔE ÛÚÔ 70XO 34ÔXEYO ‡ÃÔÛÚE ÛÚX,IK... †ÖÖ ‡ÃÖŮúß ¿ÜBPPTÖVÖ ÛÚĸ,ÜK... TÖÖ ‡ÃÖÖÜÜÊ ÛÚŐ ÃÜÊ ÛÚŐ ÃÖÖVÖ »ÛÚ»ÖÜE ÖÜYÖ ¾ÄÜÆTYÖ ÛÚĸ,ÜK... TÖÖ ÆÜÜÜ ¯Ö×, ðďÖ, ü ÛúÖê 35 ×Ûú»ÖÖê †®Ö•Ö ¤**ß**⊷Ö<...

†¶00•0 ×100ê. Æŭ00jê pû400 Ûú‡0 jû•pô <ÂGE Æŭ •0Æ00 Öjü Y0j6F00E Ûvdê †¶00•0 '08Y0 200Y0 •00Y00 Æü. <ÃĈE ¸Ô•µÔ ÆŪ •ÔÆÔÔ Ō¸Ü YÔ,ÔPÔ ÛƯỚE <ÛÚ ¹ýĨQUĈE ×ÛÚ≫ÔČE ÛÚ ×ÆÃÃOPÔ ÃĈE †®Ô•Ô ×¤¼ÔÔ •ÔÔYÔ ÆŬ <ÃĈE ͺၨO•μÖ Æti •ÔÆDÔ Ōͺü ¤ÔE ¹γ̄QÃCE ×Ûú≫ÔE ĈE †®O•Ô ×¤ÿÖÖ •ÔOVÔ Æÿ †ÖÖ ^® ÄÖPÖ Ü6 ×≫Ö< ŸOS®Ö ¹γ̄QÃCE ×Đú» Cũê Chức 200-00. Chế¦ từ Chế Chưở Phái Álde » CHY CÔ ∞ Mốtệ Y Phốte Tổi-phốte Chế † 6 tiệ từ Cũc Chượp Cổ Ælde Thiệt Ælip ^90 tế ¹yÔưĐAP™U TÖXÝÜS... ‡ÃŨ×ÔX ‡ÃÔŨĸŰE ²Ö¤ÞÖŸÖ ÆÐÜEÖL.. TÖŸÖ TÖÐEU TŸÖÞÖ ÛÚB ÛÚBTÖÖÖ ¤ÜE ¹YŢŨyÜE ×ÛúxYÖE ÃĈĖ ∙µÖ¤Ö °ÖÆB ÆÔŒÔS "ÖÖÆEÏK… ‡ÃÔ ŸŎ¸ŒEÜ ÛúÔ <Ûú †Ö¸Ü ÃÕQԌ԰Ō †ÖÖÛdĈE »ÖÖ°Ō •Ö°Þ¸Ø ÆÜ.

"ÖCEÖS 20070 µÖYEÜ AEÜ ×Ûú 20ABTÖ ÃÖÖ, Ö ¸Ö•µÖ <ÃĞE AEÜ •ÖÄĞE — Û6, ÖöÖ ÆÜ ŸÖ×ÖöÖPÖ⊳ ö ÆÜ 20000öö ÆŲ "CÔSÃÕÏԜ٠ÆŲ †Ôs>Ų,ÖÖ ÆŲ צÖŌĄÖ ÆŲ •ÔÆÖÖ Ō¸Ü †×ÔOŮŌ¸Ü •ÔČE ×Ö>Ö ¸ŒĞÖ ÆŲ ¾ÕÆÜ ‡ÃÕÃČE •μοῦ×ο Αξίι. † 0•0 × 0900 καθ •μοῦ×ο †900•0 × 0»0 μετο Αξί ^900 καθ ‡Ãο Ο κάθθεο Ο ο 2099 θε Ο ο 200×ο Ο κίδο †°ÖD•Ö ×ÖSÖĞÖÖ.. ÆĞĞE µÖÆĞ ÂSÆĞÜĞ Ü °ÖÆĞ ÆĞ.. †Ö•Ö •ÖĞ †°ÖÖ•Ö ^ÖÖÜĞE ×ÖSÖ ¸ŒĞ ÆĞ SÄÆĞ ^ÖÖÜĞE ×Ö»Ö°ÖÖ "ÖÖAEik… ¾ÄEü ^°ÖÜüĞE ^ÄÖB ¤ÖÖÖ ÖÜÜ «ÖöÖÖÖ "ÖÖAEik •ÖÜE †Ö•Ö Ü6 ¤ÖÖÖ ÖÜÜ ¾ÄEÖÖ ×Ö»Ö , NEO AEU. †ÝÔ, U †Ů Ö <ÃÔO °ÔYEN. DÚ, ÔNGE ŸŨE ŨÚ‡Ô ŨÚ, ÔNS Ì »ÔÔEÔ ×ÔŸŨÚĒ †Ô∙Ô †°ŸÕ ÃŨĄ NÕÕ ×ÔNÔ , MEGB AEŲ ^900 0 −00Ã0 †0•0 •00e †×00 d) il AEŲ ^ÃO †×00 d) il ĀČE †0°0 ^900 dE ¾09°070 Dú, MACE. AEŬO "COARÁCE ×Oú •CE †ÖTÖCKB CURBJĖO AEŲ ¾OAEU 2CCCE. †ÖTÖ CUTÖ ÃCE CUTÖ ÃCPO »COÁCCE CUCE μÖAEU †×COCUCU ¤β⊷Ök •ÖDE †Ö'ÖÖ'dÖE ™ŒÃÖ •Ö'ÖÖ °ÖVEÐI ÔÚ, NÖÇ †Ö'Ö ^YÖ'ÐE »ÖÐYÖÖE Û'dÖE YÖÖE µÖVEÜ †×ÖÖ'dÖ, ü ¤β⊷Ök... ¤**mẫ**u (B. 2000), †öö ‡Ã00 (B. YÖD×Ö¤ü 20e00‡<, †öö ‡Ã00 (dê 70X)Ö (d0€ü 25 x0 (xxx0dê Â0e 35 x0 (xx0dê 0 (xx)... ŸŨŶÃŎŢ**ß** 2007Ŏ, †ÖÖ ‡ÃŎŨĠ ¤Ô°Ö ŨďĈe ŸŨŶŶŌ ¹ýŢŨţĈe ŌŸĬŎ ×ÛúxÔČe ÃĈe 'Ō™ÔŨÚŢÜ ¤Ũĉe ¹ýŢŨţĈe ŌŸĬŎ ×ÛúxÔČe Ûíx,ik... "CŒCB 20070, •CŒ ÇÕ•µCŒ ÛúÆ †Ö•Ö ×Ö»Ö ŢŒÖ ÆŬ ^ÃÖ YOD¤Ö¤ü ÛúŒ ÛúÖ ´ÖYÖ Ûíx,ik... ÇÕ•µÖ ו07090 †900•0 ^š0 jiEti Æÿ ^Ã00uß ′00;00 90Æið '0™90ß "00Æik...

'ČI †Ö-ÜÖ,B 3AÖLTÖ'Ü µÖFEÜ ÛúFEBÖÖ "ÖÖFBBÖÖ, ŒµÖDÐÚ ÆLÜÖ,B TÖÖ™İ ÛúB >Ö. ÃÖB'ÖÖ ‡ÃÖDÉ ²ÖÖ,Ē 'ČE . ×XÃÁ YIOQ ü ÃČE † ÔTB 200YČE , ĐƯỢYĆS, »ČEĆUYĞ ÆĞÜ ‡TĞ "ÖÖ, ü ÃQĄ ÖDEĞTÜE ÛVÊE ÓDAĞ ÛV, BÎĞE. ÆĞÜÖ, Ö ÃÖ, DÛVÎ, Ü ÃĈE †®tajÔEÔ ÆŬ ×ĐÚ XÔÆŬ ÆŬÔŌ Ō ÃCÔOÔEÔ®ÔE ĐƯỀ CÔ®Ô »ĈE YÖDĐÚ ‡••ÔNÔ ĐÁ ÃCÔEÔ Ø•Ô≃Ô ÆE®ĈE ĐÁ †×ÖÜLÖ, Ü ÜLÜE »ÖÖĞE XÜLÜÖ •ÖÖ ÃÖÖE... †ÖÖÜLÜE 60 ÃÖÖXÖ ÜLB †Ö•ÖÖ×B ÜLE 2ÖÖ×Ü 3ĞÜÖÖ, B ÜLÜE ×Ö™ÖFE ÔƯƠ TỔ ĐƯỚC BÝ CÔU TỔ CÔU Ở XÔNÔ THỆ Ở THỆ TẬ CHON CÁ TỘ CHẬC TẬ CÓ TỰ ĐỘC THỊ THÝ CHÝ THÝ THÝ THÝ THÝ THÝ THÝ ×Đú ÆŭÖÖ, ề µÔĐÃÔ CỔÃỚỀ ÚứB ÚƯỚỆ Ô ÚÝ ÔB °ÔVÆÐ ÆŬ. ÃÔ, Ų CĘĖ TOÕÃÔ 20•Ô™U ÚÉ >ÔŒ µÔŒÆÑÃÔ ÆŪ. ‡°ÑÚÉ † ĐếU, ũ ÃÔ, ĐƯƯÔ, ũ "TẾC ƯỚĐƯ CÓ TỚO ĐƯƯ LÃU LÃO ÃCÔ>Ô 5 × XÔŨÔ 74 ĐƯỢ ĐÔ, ũ ÔU, ĐÔ> LÃU ÔƯỚ ™NEÃÔ • CỐC Úú»ÖE™ü Úú,€ÖÖ EÖÖ, ¾ÖFEü ™ŒTÃÖ Úú»ÖE™ü ®ÖFEù ×ÛúµÖÖ... ‡ÃÖ ÃÖÖ»Ö ×±úÃÚú»Ö >ie±ú×ÃÖ™ü 5 »ÖÖÜÖ 21. ÆĿŸÖÖ¸Ü Ûú¸ÕB•ÌL ÆÜ. †ÖÖ®E 5,74,000 Ûú¸ÕB•ÌL ™ŒÃŎ Œ»ÕŒ™Ü ®ÕÆÑL «ÔψÜÖ, †ÝÖ¸Ü μÕÆÜ Œ»ÕŒ™Ü ÆÕÜÖ, ŸŰĠĿŒijŰŎ ţÃŐ ¤ġŎ ŰĠĿĿĸĨÃŨú»Ő >ĕĿſĸÃŰMŰĸŔĨĬĬĬŨĸŖŢĠĬĠŎŖŢŢŎŢŨĿĿĸĨĂŨſĸŎ >ĕĿſĸÃŰMŰ ÛĠĿŶŰŎŎ ŌŢŨŢŢŢŶŎ †Ô°Ô°Ê YÔSÔ Ú á ¤ď Ô 20cďo פik... †Ô Ô <Úú ÆďEÔ ÃÔ Ê†®Ô ÃÔ ĐÔ Õà ĐÔ ÞÍ ÆÐ ÆÐ ÆÐ ÆÐ ÞÁÐ ÞÁÐ ÁÐ ÁÐ ÁÐ ÁÐ ÁÐ ÁÐ ¤Ď'Ô ²ÔcĐÔÚú,ũ YÔ,0PÔČÊ ÚĐ †×ÔÚÔ,Ů "N°Ô" ,NEĐ AEũ. †ÖÖ ∙ÖÈ ŌÃÔE ±ú•ÖbÖ ÔE ¤Đ ,NEĐ AEŨ, †ÖÖ ‡®ÃÖR™BBÔ ÛÐ ®ÖÖÖ ÖÜÜ •ÖÖE ™ŒÃÖ ÛÓÃÜÇÖĞÖ ¤Ð ÆÐ ÆÐ ÆÐ ÍÃÖÛÖE ŸÖÐÜ ÛÚ ÖÇ ŒµÖŒÛÚ †ÖB,Ü ÛÐ ÖÖÃÖ 2ÖFEŘÍÖ TÖÃÖÖ ÆÜL. †ÜTÖ ™ŒEÃÖ DÓÃÖQ;Ö₹Ö TÖYÖ ¤ĎÉ. ÆŬÖ µÖÆÜ ¶ÖÆÜ DÚÆŘÍÖE ×ÛÚ ^¶ÖÓÉ %ŰTŐ,Ü ™ÆEÃÖ 20ceDi†Oe. †ÖÖ Oávú 308 ´ÖYÖ 20ceDi†Oe †Ö;ü ∙ÖE ^®OOde OAAQ;Ö® ∞i jiEi Ædi; XAEü 20eü Oújü; ^AÖOde 3ÃÃÔœÔ Ôú, ÔE †Ô, ũ ¤ặ.Ô Ôưß YÔ, ŒÔưß †Ô, ũ †ÔÖ »ÔÔÔÔE ÔÉ ±ưQuÔ¤ê ÔÉ ×>Ô< ‡ÃYŒÔÔ>Ô Ôú, ÔE. ÔĘÂ †Ö'ÖÄĞE YÖLEN ×90'MERE'Ö LEÜ †Ö'LÜ Ö'Ü "ÖÖLEMEÖ XÛÚ •ÖÜE Ö'PÜE ÄÖÇÖÜEÖ'Ö ×¤ik LEŞ ÄÖ'LÜÜĞ ü ‡°Ö "ÖÖ'LÜE ÃŒŒŒŒŒŒ ÛĸŮE ߯ŮĸŮŢŪ ÛĸŢŴŧ <Ûú ²ŒŒŇŎŢŬ ¾Ä+ĞŒŬÚ »ÖÖ<, ŸÖÖ×Ûú ÆŬŒŢĒ ¤ĘĒÖ Ûtê †DĕŸŢŬ »ŒŒŌ ‡••OYO Ué ACCEC...ÆŭOJē ¤ēO 'ČE CuốteC 3000'OJB 'ȤO '® ÆĞE YCECO »COÉC 3000 ÃČE 0'ÖXOVO ® ÆĞE ‡ÃÓ»O< ‡ÃÖCIĞE <ÛÚ ZÖEBÖÇÜ ¾ÄPĞBÖCÚ ZÖPÖC<Ó †ÖZÜ ĞEĞE ^´´ĞB¤Ü ÆÜ ×ÛÚ †ÖÖ ‡®Ö ÃĞBÖĞPÖE ÜLĞE ÃXBOĞÜĞÜ Đứ, tổiề. "ÔK Đề=tại", "Ở ‡ÃÔS ^''ÔS≃ũ Đế à CÔCEÖ †Ô TÖÔĐÉ TÖÖ HỘÖ ÃŨE ÃÔ, ĐƯỜ, ũ ÃŨE † ÔS≫Ö Đứ, ũ , tế Đồ ÆBÊ ×Uú ¾AFü ‡® ĀÖģÖGEÖŸÖE ÛdÖE þBÛdÖ¸ü Ûú¸b'Öß... -ÖŸDÖXÖ⊃ü.

Security Bill, 2013

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Now, Shri Derek O'Brien.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN (West Bengal): Sir, what is an idea and what is a gimmick? Very simply put, an idea endures over time and changes people's experiences. A gimmick certainly attracts a lot of attention but does not meet two issues. One, its commitment, and, two, most people who come up with gimmicks do so because they are under pressure. Sir, I can well understand that the UPA is the 'Under Pressure Alliance', and, therefore, we can understand why they are so much in search of gimmicks and not ideas. Sir, having said that, in principle, we agree with the concept of 'Food for All' and we also agree that when 12 per cent of a Budget is allotted for Defence, about 5 per cent is allotted for HRD and Midday Meal Scheme together, and, 2 per cent is allotted for Health, then, whatever the figure, 6 to 8 per cent is the figure they have now, will be part of this food security. In principle, we are in agreement with this figure.

Over the next few minutes, I want to stress on the two broad points which I want to make today. First is the mockery of federalism, and, the second is the execution of the plan. So, let me make three quick points on the mockery of federalism.

Clause 38 of this Bill basically says that for all issues of finance, the Centre will give the States the directions and the States will have to comply with whatever directions the Centre gives. This makes the mockery of federalism and let me give you three examples. The Congress-led UPA Government is making a lot of noise about VAT, VAT, VAT; how a VAT is implemented or one per cent of GDP will be improved. The story is that there is a CST, that is, the Central Sales Tax, which the States would collect and which is 4 per cent. In their enthusiasm to introduce VAT, the States were told to bring it down from 4 per cent to 2 per cent. The Centre dictated the same. Then, they said that they would reimburse the States but, Sir, in reality, this did not happen. I am using this example to show you how my State West Bengal has not got Rs. 650 crore. A promise was made for CST and it was not done. The point here, Sir, is that this is the danger of clause 38, and, that is why, we have moved an amendment to clause 38, and, I would appeal to all the Parties, who have more than 90 per cent of their seats from one States, to look at this clause very, very carefully. Let me give you second example. When a Central Scheme starts, for example, Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan, NRHM, they start with a particular percentage. Let me give you two examples; I can give you eight-

ten examples but I am giving only two because of paucity of time. Sir, ten years ago, the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan started with a sharing arrangement of 85:15, that is, 85 per cent share of the Centre and 15 per cent share of the State. Now, in the same programme, the share of the Centre has come down to 65 per cent from 85 per cent, and, the State's share has gone up from 15 per cent to 35 per cent.

If you take the NRHM, again, it started off as 85-15 and now it is already down to 75-25. Sir, this kind of law will have an impact on how the States manage their funds, especially debt-stressed States like the State I come from and a few others like Kerala and Punjab where we will not be able to prioritise our own programmes. Sir, the second point on this mockery of federalism is, if you look at section 23 - and here we were very tempted to move an amendment also, but in the nature of consensus, we thought, 'no we won't' - the suggestion made is that when the Centre cannot supply the grains to the State from the Central pool, the State has to buy the grains on their own. Now, here is the problem. And regarding reimbursement, let us say if the State buys at 'x' price, the reimbursement may be below 'x'. So, the State, in fact, will be losing money. Why? Because the Central pool could not supply them the grains. Third, Sir, quickly on setting up of infrastructure, whether you take the redressal mechanism, whether you take the State Food Commission, whether you take storage, transport, distribution, on all these points, it is not very clear as to how much of the burden the State has to bear. So, over all, my friends in the UPA - actually I should say my old friends in the UPA - have either not read the Sarkaria Commission or Punchhi Commission Reports, or, they have read it and they have selected amnesia. Those are the few points, Sir, we made on federalism.

Sir, now quickly some points on the execution. Mayawatiji actually shared the point which I again want to re-emphasise. You look at the PDS, you look at AAY, BPL and APL, then you study these numbers. It is an extremely relevant question because what is really happening is 60 per cent of those BPL houses covered under PDS will get less. So, if you look at AAY, BPL and APL, if you put them together on the existing PDS, 40 per cent, I agree, will be beneficiaries, 14 per cent will be equal and the rest of it, which is about another 40-45 per cent, will actually be getting less than what they are getting now.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have taken half of your party's time. Do you wish to take all of it?

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: No, Sir, I will take another two minutes and I will finish.

Sir, I want to come to the other issue. Is this going to solve our problem, which is a shameful problem for our country, of malnutrition and stunted children? Almost one out of two children born in the world is from India. In the case of malnutrition and stunted children, we are number one. Sir, here again, there is so much emphasis on cereal and cereal is not the solution for two problems. Cereal, without going into the details as everybody would know, will not be the perfect balanced diet, and the second thing is you are encouraging farmers to do more cereal production, and be it oil or be it pulses, will continue to do our imports for them. Sir, that is a very serious issue because nutrients should not be mixed up with the world 'calorie'. So, Sir, we have these two choices - one, we go for the mockery of federalism and two is on the execution. On the execution, we do believe that with proper guidance, with systems in place, there is some hope. I would appeal to the Congress-led UPA to please delete section 38. If you could take that out of this Bill, we will forgive you for the over-enthusiasm and the gimmickry of trying to push this through. Take out section 38 and we will support your Bill. Thank you, Sir.

ΑΘΒ Φ΄ με ΤΥΦΑΘΟΝΟ΄ (^CO LI TO με O) : -Ο ΡΟΚΟΟ ΣΙ ΑΓΡΟΠΟΧΟ • OB... ΑΘΟ Φ-ΟΚΟΟ ΔΙΟ ΤΟ Μ΄ ΔΕ ΕΝΕΝΙ ΑΘΟ ΕΙΝΟΒΕΝΤΟ ΚΑΘΟ Ο Ο ΟΝΟ ΤΑΘΟΝΟ Ο (^CO LI TO με O) : -Ο ΡΟΚΟΟ ΣΙ ΑΓΡΟΠΟΧΟ • OB... ΑΘΟ Φ-ΟΚΟΟ ΔΙΟ ΕΙΝΟΒΕΝΤΟ ΕΙΝΟΒ

*ΦΦΦΟ 3'08 ××0
£0. ^\$£0£0£0 2000£ 0'00 ¸0ÙΦρΟ0'ú¸ÞO ×0ψΦΟ £00, ×0668 -0'00'0 0'00'0 √0ψΦΟ £00, 2'0\$ΛΟ ΑΘΕΦΕ ΑΘΕΦΕ ΑΘΕΦΕ ΑΘΕΦΕ ΕΘ

†Ô•Ô †ÔÔ •ÔÔ ♥ÔÔ Ô ¤ĐĨề ÔƯB 200Ô ÔÚ, Ủ JELÊ ÆŲ ^ÃÔ ♥Ô, Ề ÔƯB †ÂÔ»ÔƯÔÔ Ō, Ů 3ÔS •ÔÔ‡<... †Ô•ÔÔÚ»Ô <ÔÚ ¾Ô-ÔÔÔ9Ô †ÔVÔÔ ÆŬL. 300,ÑÔ ÃÔ,ÔÚÔ,Ü †Ô9Ô <ÔÚ ¾Ô-ÔÔÔ9Ô ¤ë ,ÆB ÆÜ ×ÔÃÔ ĈE ¾ÆŪ . Ô•0830 •08 Dư0 < Dú 3000⊅0 ∞000008 Æŭ ×Dú Dã¦ũ ÁCe YÔ 6700ê Dư0ê •00ê ÔÆŬÔ Dư0 ŌÁOO •0000 Æŭ ^ÄÖÜLÖ 85 -Ö,JÄĞEY'Ü 208"Ö ÜLE ×Ö'ĞÖ×Ö< ÜĞÖ •GÖYĞE AFTI. ÜTÇÇÖ ™ĞĞĞELLŰ Ü ¾ÖÖ×ÖS µĞŒEĞ9ÖÖ -Ö,Ü ‡9ÖÜLÖ µĞÆÜ <> ĐƠ™ĐỚ¢ • Ở TŒP'U "ÔSÔ ȚIELÔ ALU. ALUÔ 3ÔS ™GRÂB "Ô, U ¤ĐƯÔ »QƯỚE ALU. • ŒÔ ȚÔ• ÔGRÃO • ÔS ¶ŨE HÔLEU RÂBÛJÔ, U (Ógyðī (Óu) (Ógyðī úð40k giðtim (6®† siði• (Oð† ú))k siðiljú) úð40k újóú)040kk á siðuþið (Oð† újú±k siðil, (Oð ÛĭĨĂĈĖ ×ÖSÖ •ÖÖ<ÝÖÖ? ÆĬĬŐ »ÖÖÁÖĞË ®Ë ‡ÃÖB 2ÖÖYÖ Ö¸Ü Ø″ÖYÖÖ ¾ÄÖEYÖ ÛWB †Ö¸Ü ‡ÃÖ 2ÖÖYÖ ÛWÊ ÛWÆÜ... ÁÖZŐPŰE †Ö•Ö 3ÖS ÆÜÖÖLG OYONO ÆÜ XÛÚ <ÁÖÖ 9Ö ÆÜÉ XÛÚ †ÖÖÜÉ ‡ÄÖ ±ÉÐ Ü XÁÜEHÖÖELIYG XÖXÖ ÜÉ 200=ü Ü00≥1099 2»004:000k≥490 04: 00+070 AC: 200+00,ü 0E: ‡Y090 AEC: •OK ×O4 ×O4A0090 •OE: ^70•0 70×0 Ûú, jệ ^ÂCÊ ^ÂOÙGS 'COÙGMU ÆGS ®Ô ×ÔSŒ. 'Ô †ÔOÙGÊ †ÔOÙÉ ¾ØPOÙÔ ÛGÔ ^¤ÔÆQ ÞÔ ¤ë wŒG ÆGE <±iÂOS†Ö‡Ö ®E ÆĬĞE •OXOPÖ ×¤ÿÖÖ ×Üú ^¢Ö¸Ü TÖÞÿÖ ÖE TÖYÖ ¾ÃOÖ 355 »ÖÜÜÖ ÖB™ÖDÚ ™®Ö YÖÆÆÐE ÖÞÖ</p> ÆDĪĪÖO ÆLĪ ŢÜ, Ü ^ÃÜPĒE ŢÃÖ ¾ÄÄÖ ¾ÄܱÔ 55 »ÖÖÜÖ ÖBX™ÕDÚ ™PĒÖ ÜÖ,OP¤ÖL. ×ÛVÃÖÖPÜE °ÜE 300 »ÖÖÜÖ 'ŐB≯™**Ô**ÐÚ ™6PÔ YÖ**LEÓE** 2ÖÖ+ÖÖ,Ü 'ÖE †ÖPÖE †ÖÖ 2ÖEÖÜ... <ÃÜE ÆBB ^ÃÖPÖE ÛÚÆÐÖ ×ÛÚ ^¢Ö,Ü Ö¤ġÖ 'ÖE 122. »ÖÜÜÖ ÖB⊁M**Ö**M ™EPÖ -ÖĞĞ TÖRÖ ÆĞEÖÖ ÆÇ XÇÖĞÖ ÖE ÄĞE ^ÄĞĞE 22 »ÖÖÜÖ ÖB⊁M**Ö**M ™EPÖ ÜÖÇ**G**¤Ö †Öçü √ĐuÃOĐĐOE QË 100 ×0000 TOR™ĐƯU ™ĐĐ 200•00, 11 TE 2020 ∞4μ00... †308 YOUE √ĐuÃOĐĐÔ ĐướE ×10×ĐĐO TO ĀDTOCHĐ -700‡ÃÔ -ĨQŬ -70AOO ×Ô≫Ô •00YOO ÆŨ ≫ÔŒÛÚ®Ô †YÔQŬ †Ô°ÔÛÚÔ ¤ÔŒ ¹YĨÔk ÛÚÔ YÔŒŒŒÂÔQŬ≫OÃÔ 200•00QŬ ´ÔŒ ÛdÎPÎBPÎQÎÊ ÛB TÛHDÎ ÂÛE 2×ÎÛHTÛÛDÎPÎ ERÎBÛYÛ "ÛSDÎ TÛDÛ TÛÛ ÂÛ Û ÂÛ ÛSDÎA ERÎE YÛDÛ, YÛÊ <ÂÛD ® ÆÎBÊ xÚú xÚúÁ0090 ÚúČe ^ÁOÚé ^ÃÔ YÔÆÉE ÚúÓ ¤ÔTÔ 5-7 1ýÖk TÖXÔ xÚúxÔE xÔxÔ; x∙OÃÔ YÔÆÉE Úúß ^TÔ•Ô 3APEÜ ÄOS-ČE 200•00,Ü ČE 2020100 ÆÜL. ÖÖPÖPÖSYÖ ÖĞÖB •ÖB, 'Ö "ÖÖEDÜLÖ ×ÜÚ †ÖÖ ‡ÄÖÖLÖ •ÖRÄPÖ ¤Ü. 'Ö "CÔAEŬOO AEDE×OLÚ †ÖÖ ‡ÃÜE ÖQQE ¤PÇÖ DE ÃOOÔ®E 20100<O. ‡ÃÖ≫Ö< ÖPĞE OLÚAED ×OLÚ †ÖÖ ‡ÃOOE ×≫Ö< ÛdÔ\$FÔ Â**080F**OX®Ûú Â020Ô£Ô90 »ÔO<Ô XUú µÔEÜ ÂÔ,ÔUÔ,Ü ÛÛ,Ü ÛB <ÛÚ Â**080F**OX®ÛÛÚ ∞Ô´Ô£Ô,B ÆÜ XUú ¤ặ,Ô ÛdÔ xÔuÃOĐĐ •OČE 30S "OS•O, ∞OVĐĐS "OGO TE TŒO ĐƯ, Ệ ^ÃŨE ƯỚ, ĐŒPĒE ŨưS ∞Ô TŒŌ, B ÃŌ, ĐƯỜ, Ủ ŪưS ÆŨ, ŶŶŶŎ Ű ÂŬŶŎ-ŎŶŎŎ ×Ũú †ŶŶŎ µĎÆŭ ±ŔÐ Ŭ ×ÃŎŒµĎŒ¸ĬľYB ×ŶŎ×Ŏ ×ŨĸÃŎŨŸŨĔ ŨŔ ××Ôk ×Ôk Æŭ. †ŶŶŎ <±ú>B†Ô‡Ŏ Ûê TÔHƯỚ ÂCE ¾Đ™ỆÚS »ÔƯƯCE ŨƯCE ĐƯƯỆ MERMÂY ĐƠPÔ TĆE »ÔƯPÔ "CÔNHỮCE ÆTŲ †ÔTÔPČE × MYĐO ŨƯCE 3ÔS ¾Đ™ỀY QUỐCE Ûlê ××Ô< ÛÛDXÔ ×¤jiÔ... <Â.ÔO "ÔFETA AETI XÚI †Ô Ô XÚIÂÛS ÂOO×Ô;Ô ÛLÊ YÔFETÔ ^®FET ×ÔOPÔ "ODETÔC ÆÎDE xĐú ‡ÃO xÔsÔ Đề 200¤ũ •040 ¤iệÔ Đườ xĐưAOPÔ 20700Đũ ÆĐE •00xÝOO, YOU ¾0¤iệŪS »004Ô †0Dú;ũ ^ÃOĐÆ •0'089° 0'08° 19' 30AGE 3'0' 30AGE 10'0 »0'06'E. ‡ÃO ¤ġO 0'é ×0'0AO'90 0'08 1'¼'O 30AGE 3'08 0'00'08 'ČE † »00900'uō, B •000'0 •00k ×10ú ×10úA0090 100erii (0•0¤iejii 2090 •00k †0,ii †0°00é ‡A0 ×10x0 10é ¤iejh100°08 °0k,‡b00°0 †""ê 90

ÂÓB (THE \$\text{\$\tex

¤mão, 6 ²0070, <±uÃo;†Ö‡ô ³Ōā™ôr'Öo, ü Ûuô Ão;rõão; ²Ō> bò †øð Æü. †Ýō, ü ÛuÆna Ão;rõão; †∞Ö0ú 30A™Ô''Ō,ũ ∞ĐÔÔŌÔ ÆÔÊ YÔÔÊ †ÔÔ "Ô>ÔE "Ô>Ô<... <±ÚÃÔS†Ô‡Ô ŬÔ,Ô∞ũ 'ĈË ¾ÃŒŨ ÛÚÔÔ ÛÚ,ũ ,ŒÔ ÆŨ.

′009999ayıÖ ′0908 •08, °0EwiCe †Ö'Ö †ÄÖ×QüÖÖ •0090 ×08•°Ö<... •00e †ÄÖ×QüÖÖ •0090 ×0000 Æü †Ö,ü †ÃÖ∞QJÖYÖ ČE ÛYÖÖ ÛYÜĞÖ ÆÇ ¾ÖÆBB ×ÖPÖÖYÖ ÛYÖ ÃÖÆB ŒĞYÖB ÆĞÜĞÖ ÆÇ. ÜÖÖ≫ÖB ÆĞÖÖ ČE †Ö,Ü †ÖÖÚ⊳ĞE 'ŐE ĮNEGFŐE 3KO>OO 'ŐGÓB 2ÖGEŘÍÖ "ÖÜ'ÖÏÖ 'ŐGÖB ®ÖGEN AEĞKÖÖ ÆÜL. †ÖÖ ¤ĞÜÖ< YÖÜE ÃÖÆB ×Ûú †ÖÖÜGB <±uÃÖB†Ö‡Ô ŒµÖÖ Ûú,ü ˌwŒB Æŭ. ³ÖؙϰÖÖ,ü ÛúÖ †øĎ <±uÃÖB†Ö‡Ô ÆŨ, µÖÖŸÖB ³ÖؙϰÖÖ,ü ÛÓFÖŸB <±úÃOS†Ö‡Ô ÆÜ. ŒµÖ ÂÖS <±úÃOS†Ö‡Ô ÛÓ ÖÖŋÖ'Ö ÃÜÊ ‡ŸÖ®Ö ²Ö Ñ ¾ÖNÖ »ÖÖÓú¸Ü †ÖÖ µÖÆÜ "ÖÖÆÏÖE</p> AEū ×Ôú AEŭÖ ‡ÃÖ ¤piÖ Ûn »ÖÜKÖÜE ÛnB ³ÖHÖÖ ÜÖÏÖ Ûú,ü ¤pKÖE †Ö,ü ±mb ü ×ÃÖEHÖÖB;NMB ×ÖsöÖ Ûn ÖÖHÖÖÖ ĀČĒ ‡ÃÖ ¤PĢÖ Ûuß ÝÖ,OPÖß ¤Qeü Ûú,ü ¤MÖ?

(^~ÖÄÖÖÖÖÄÖ ÖEÖEÿÖ ÖBŠÖÄÖSŐ ÆK)

<Ůú ŸŎ¸ŒÚ ŸŎĠĒ ŤŮŎ ŨúÆĬĬĠĒ ÆŒ ĬŨú ÆŬĬŎŢ**Ŏ** ¤₱Ġ ŶŎŒĬĬŎ >**BĠ**>ŎŎ ŨúŢŨ ŶŎĮĬŎ ÆŨ ÆŬĬ >**BĠ**>ŎŎŎŎŎ »0000 <ÃCE ATŪ •00E YO_0FO ATŪ †O¸Ü •00E 3000 ÃCE *05≫NO ATŪ ∞0*0*000E ¤0E ™04 O O∪O 300E090 30S ®VATĀ ×Ö»ÖŸÖ ÆÜ. †ÖÖ ¤ÖE ÛÓ™ÖЬ Œ™Üß ²ÖÖŸÖE ÛűÃÖE ÛÚ'Ü 'ÆÐ ÆÐ?

†ÖÖ ÃÖS-ÐEÃOS-ÐE ÃXXXXXÖÜ ÜÚK, IK ×ÔÚ ÆÜÖ ÝÖ, OFÖ ÆÜ. 67 XXXX ÛÚ Û ÛÛXXXX †Ö, Ü 300-ÖÖÖ ÛÁ ; OÃÔ9Ô ÛÚÔ>Ô ´Œ µÔŒÜ ¤ỆŮ...**(¾ØĞÖÖPÔ)...Æ**ÔÔ ¾OÔ-ÔÖÔ ÛÚÔ ¾OB ; OÃÔ9ÔÚÔ>Ô £OÒ...

ÁÖB _ iĕB ;ÖDú, ü ŌĂÖD=ü (~ÖFÐ,)) : ÛúÐVÐAÖ ÚÚÐE ŸÖÐE †ÖÖÐE ŸÖBÐ ÃÖD»Ö...**(34ÖÐAÖÐ)...**

<Ûú ´ÖŸŸŸŊÖ Ã֤õÖ: †ÖÖ ŸŒ ŌŎŎŌ ÃŒ ÃŒ **...(¾ØX₽ÖÖŸ)...**

ÁÖB ® jēÖ † YÜKÖ>Ö : ÆüÖğ ē †Ö ü ‡®O ē 20-è Ö-Üğü × ji YÖE Æü...**(¾ÖX-ÖP).**..-ÁÖÖ ®Ö•ÖDú × ji YÖ Æü....**(¾ÖÖ-ÖÖT)...**

ÁÖB ®ÒạiÔ TYỮBÃDÒ: ÃÔ, Ų ÆÜÔ ŸŨĈĖ TÖÖÔUĈĖ ¤ĐƯÔ ÔÚ, Ŭ ¾ÃÃČE ÆBB •Ô>¤B ÜÔYŐ ÔÚ, ÆĈE »ÕŸÖŸĈE ÆīL....(3/10/24-00/9)...+ÖTÖ +ÖTÖE ÆĪL YÖÜE Ő •ÖDEVÖÖ ÆÆE-Úú ÃÖĞJÖ Ûúß 'ÖD'ß 20-ÖEÜE »ÖTÖLÖS... Ő YÖÜE ÜÖEFÜ ÆB ÖÆBÖĞ ÜÖYÖ ÛÚ, ÆÖÖ "ÖÖÆBÖÖ ÆBE.

ÁB ^-OÁBODOVO: ŠBÛú ÆÜ 2008»Ö<...

ÁÖB ®ÇipiÖ †YÜKÖD>Ö : ÁÖB'Ö®Ö, µÜE ÜÇEÖ ∞piÖ ÜÖYÖ ÛÚ;Ü **viE**E ÆTI ÜE-ÜE †Ö®Ö ³ÖÖHÖÞÖ ÆEB ÃÖ'ÖÖYÖ

. ÃÔ, Ų 'ČI µÔTEŪ LŪVEŪ , VĒCÔ EČÔ XŮV †Ö'Ö <ŮV ŸŎ, ŒYÚ LŮVEĐŮČE ÆŬ XŮV ÆŬÔ > ĐĠXÔŌTÔYÖ LÔOTÔYÔ ÆŲ ÆĸĬŐ >ÐÁлÖTŐ ÚÚ,Ü ĮÆEÐ ÆÐJ ¾ÁÁÁNŐ ÚÚB †EÖÐÞÚÐÁÁÁEŐÓ ŐE DÆÐÞÁÁYŐÖÐÓ ÚÚŐ <ÚÚ ÁEŐÖÐÓ ÆÐÓÐÖÖ †Ö,Ü

ØÆĕ#ANYOOPO ¾AANÃO ÜUB <ÜÚ ŌONAĞÇÜ 20°9YĞÖÖ, »ÖĞÜÜFÖ ¤ÃĞÖĞB ŸÖŞËŁÚ †ÖÖ †ÖPÖB ‡ÖEÖ ŒµÖÖ ¤ĕ ÆÆ ÆÐ? †ÝÔ¸U ×XÃASÃO ÚÁ ÃOÔÔPÔE ÆŬÔ µÔÆU ‡ÔEÔ ¸ÚŨÔ ¸ÆE ÆŪ ×ÚÚ ÆŬÔÔ¸E ¤ÞOÔ ÔE 3ÔS ÝÔÔXÃOE ÔE 75 Ō¸ÁÔŒYU »OĐÔ ¤ÔE ™ÔT Ö 3ÔEÔPÔ ®ÔEĂ ÖÔÔE ÆÑ TÔ,Ú ÆÑÔ,Ě ¿ÔEŲŮ ĈE ÆÊBÔE ¾ÔSÊ 50 Ō,ÃŒŸŮ »OŨÔ ¤ÔE ™ÔT Ö 300èÔ9Ô ¶ŸETA ÜÖÖYÜE AFÜ YÖÜE AEÜÖÖ,18 ‡ÜEÖ ŒµÖÖ 2Ö9ÜĞÖ? µÖEÜ YÖÜE †±ÜRÛÚ¶Ô ÛÓ™Ô∙Ö ¾ÖD>ÖB ‡ÜEÖ ÆÜE ÝŮŦĎ •ÔĚ †Ö•Ô †±ĬÃŮÚPÔ ŨďPÔ•Ô ÛưB ‡ÔĒÔ ÆŲ •ÔÆĬÔ »ÔĬÔÕ ¾ÔËÔ ÃŨĒ ŐŢÜ ĮÆĒ ÆŪ. Ő PÔÖÖ »ÔPŐ °ŶÆij "ÖŒŬÖÖ ÆĠĿ ŐŸŶĿĂŐĿÔ †±ĬŒŨŰŶŶ ÛÓ™Ô∙Ô ÛŴÆij ∞ŸijÖÖ Æij. ²ŸÆŬÖ ÃÖB †±ĬŒŨŰŶŶ ÛÓ™Ô∙Ô Æij. ∞Ö°ÖÜGB TÖĞ•Ü;Ö°Ö †Ö•Ö ÜĞTÖĞĞÖDÖ ÜGB ÇEEB ÆÜ †Ö;Ü •ÖÆĞÖ TÖ,Ü 2Ö′′′ÖÖE ÜGE ¤ĞE ™Ğ‡Ö ÇĞE'B °ÖÆĞ ×ÖNÖYÖB... µÖÆÜ 200YÖ •ODE ÖFÐE †ÖNNÖÐFÜ ÖE ÚVÆÐ ÆÜ XÚÚ †ÖTÖ ÚVÆÐYG ÆÜ XÚÚ XÃŒÐÎ ÖDEFÖ †900+Ö, ÝŮEĐÁ †Ů,ũ "ŰŸÁÞÔ ¤Đ ¤ĐÝC, »ČƯƯỚ ±Ú,ũ ¤ÔĐÔ ÚÁTÁÔ ÃČ ¤ĐỚ? †ÖÖ ^¶ŮÚCÊ ⊀ŮŸŐ ¤ÔĐÔ Úà 3ÖEŐŸŐ ∞ďď? ¾ÃÃČE ³ČB °ČI ∞ďJÖ ŢŒĞO ÆĞE ŶŨú °ÖÆŰÖÖÇTÔ ÛŒ ÛŰÔŢÞŐ ŢÞÖÆĞE ÛÚB EÖÖ≫ÖB °ČE ÃČE ∞Ö≫Ö ÝÖÜJÖ?Ö .Æŭ....**(¾Ø¾ÅÖÐ)..**...;µÖ0∙Ö ³Ö8 ÝÖQÞÖ Æŭ.. ŸÖE †ÖÖ ^ÃÖDúČE µÖÆÜ ¤ÆËE Ûvß ²ÖÖYÖ ŒµÖE ®ŸÆŭ Ûv́, ŸÖE †YÖ, ü †ÖÖ ^®ÖÜÜĞE †®Ö•Ö ¤ĕ ¸WEB ÆQ »ÖÜÜĞÖ †YÖ,ü †ÖÖ ÖÜEYĞĞ ®ÖÆB ¤WÜE «ÃܱÔ Üü»ÖÜÇĞ ¤ĕ ¤WÜÇ YÖÜE †Ô¤ửÔS CHĨAĞE 0ºÔ¤Ô , VETHÔÔ? †ÝÔ, CH 2Ô×ÔÁ> CH ±éb CH 9ÔHĂ ×Ô×ÔHÔO, YÔÔE †ÔÔ †°Ô9Ê ¤ặÔ Ché 9ÔYÔ×, Được ÃĈE ŒµÏO ^´´ÎB¤II ÛÚ, ŬĈE ÆP? •ÔĈE ÆŬŐO,& ÃÔŒŐ »Ô ĐỂC •ÔŐ ,Œ& ÆŬL**.(ÃÔ QÃO ÛÆ 'ÖDY)...**ÃŎ, Ų †³ÔS ŸŐĈE 12 ×Ö₹ÖMü Æ**ö**k Æü.

ÁÔB ^~OÃPODÔXÔ: †ÖÖDÉ 12 ×Ô™™ ÖQÉ ÆĞE ÝÖ<... †ÖÖDÜÖ ÖQÊ ™Ö‡Ö ÜÖÖÖ ÆĞE ÝÖYÖ...

ÁÖB ®Ö,₫Ö †ÝÜKÖÖ>Ö : ÃÖ,Ü †³ÖB ŸÖÖE 12 ×Ö®™Ü ÆB ÆB ÆB ÆÜ.

ÁÜB ^-ÖÄÜPÖÖÖÄÖ : †ÖÖÖÜÖ ™Ö‡Ö 12 ×Ö9Ö™ü Æß Æü.

ÁÔB TỔ ỆŮ TÝTRÃO Ô: ÁÔB Ở ȚE ...**(¾Ďà ČÔT)..**. Ở TỔ TỔ ĐỀU ĐƯỢC LỤČE LỤĆ THỂ ÂĐE ĐƯỢ TỚ TỔ TỔ ÂỚ Ô "CB•CCE Ö,Ü ¾AP'OÖ,Ü ÛdB×Ö<, †ÖÖ ‡®Ö ÃÖPÖ "CB•CCE Ö,Ü •CRACPÖ ¤ĕ •CCE ÆŬÖ,ĕ †´CEÜCE'NÄÖ ÆŪ. ÁÖSÖ¶Ü †308 YÖÜú <Üú TÖÇBBÖÇÜ ÜLÜE 35 XÜÚXÖE †900+Ö XÖXÖYÖ EÖÜ... ‡90048 9040 µCDEÖ90 ÄÜE †40 ^ÄÜE µDFÜ 25 ×Uúx00ê ×°Ox0400... °O408 •08, †Y0,ü 25 ×Uúx00ê Y0**£6ê** Uú0 ×**0**6°0 •00ê li x08×0×, Y00ê µ0Æü 50 ¹ç°Qu6ê UúO Ædde YQµOO, †YO¸ii †0°0°9'ê 2 ¹ÿ°0k °O×O ×Uú»Odê פµOO †Q¸ii 10 ×Uú»Odê •Odê '0°MO, ^AOUúdê †YO¸ii 15 ¹ỹÖk Üle ׯMÖDÖ ÄĞE •ÖDe'Li »ÖSx•Ök YÖCE µÖELI 150 ¹ỹÖk ÜLÖ ÆMFÖ.. YÖCE †²Ö ^ÄĞE 200 ¹ỹÖk ¤efte "Ö≻li'Üç •Ö'Ö-Ü-Ü "ÖEBÖ-Ö ÄĞE 175 1γ'Ö< "ÖE ×Ö>Ö'ÖÖ EÖÖ... μÖÖ+ÖB †Ö'ÖÜ ÜB μÖÜ+Ö'ŸÖ ÄĞE †2Ö ^ÄÖ †Ö¤ĭŐB ÖÜÜ •µÖ¤Ö †ÖLEÖDÚ ²ÖLEÖ Ö⊳Ìi •ÖKYÖÖ... •ÖLE YÖ_BFÖ TÖEBÞÜE ‡ÄÜE ÄÖÄYÖÖ TÖXÖÖ EÖÖ, †ÖÖDÚB ®İ‡Ö µIOB-Ô900 ÃĈE 3APEŬ ‡ÃĈE "ÖPENFOO" TÖCKYOO, ŒµIOBEÛÚ ^ÃĈE TŒ"Ŭ 3Ö,£90E ÛE ≫ÖK ‡ÃĈE 200+OÖ,Ũ ÃĈE ÜÖ,G¤Æ90 -"Ô>NGO... 304Eŭ •00ê 5-10 ×0úxx00ê 104NGO †970•0 200•00, ŭ AQE UO, QaxNGO, ^AQOXO ¤0i 0 •00ê AEQNGO, ^AQOX 25 ×Ûú»ÖE ÃÜE •µÖ¤Ö ÆĞÜĞÜ... YÜE µÖÆÜ µÖÆÜ ÞÖÖÐÖ ÛúÆĞ <ÃÖÖ 🕏 ÆÜE ×Ûú ×ÃܱÔ ²Ö°Ö Ûúß µÖŒÖÐÖ ¸ÆÜ •OK, ‡ÃÖ µÔŒÔ9Ö ÔUÔ »ÔPÔ ÝŨ PRÔŒ ŸŨÓU 9Ö TÔÆĐÔŒ. Ở TÖTÖÄŒ µÔŒÛ ÔÚÆÐÖÖ "ÖVÆÑÖ ÆÐÆ XÔÚ TÖÐÐÖÐJÖ '06/08 •08, •070 †070 •08/070 ∞16/0; Y00: •00: 070×16 ′070: ^\$0k Ætt ‡9°0 070×16†0: 0√0 †Y0;ü •08/070 ∞16/0; YOOÈ TO AOTO-100000 ×Uú ‡AO ¤ṇO UúB •090YOO ×30A3XOOAO Uú,ĕYOB ×Uú †070 •090YOO Ué ×7EXYO TOE ×70×0 »OO jaEtā AEĪŅ ®VĒEĀ YOCĒ •OCĒ ĀOĒPĒJŌ "OSOO YOĻOO ×Ūú µOĒEŪ ×OSSŌ YO_APOCĒ Ūā ׯBĪŌ 'ČĒ ®VĒBĀ AEŲ µOĒEŪ ×OSSŌ 3002°ių die Ole ×aEnio Čie AEij ‡Älo ¤iĝo Čie OniACe Oudobao Älo, Oudo, ii 2090ok "Oveie ¤iĝo Oub †£004004ã£cio O'O'i o

ÆĞÊ •ÖÖ<, XÂÆÜ ÃŐĞ∳ĞÖ †ÖÖÖĞ ÖĞÖ ÖĞ TÖRĞ İÆĞÖÖ... ‡YÆĞ ;Ö°¤ĞE ÛĞ ÃÖÖEÖ ÖÖ "ÖÖÆĞĞÖÖ ×Ûú ÖÇĞ † ÖB űÖE™Ü ¯Ö, Ü µÖÆÜ ÃÖ, ÛÛÛ, Ü µÖÆÜ ²ÖÖYÖ •ÖÖB Ü ¤ĕ. ²ÖÆBÖ-²ÖÆBÖ -ÖPÞÖRÖÖ¤Ü.

ÁÖB ²⁰2 CŘŠW 900 QÁĎPÔ CŘÔTEW (×ÔFEĎ,)) : ÔFEĎE*ŢIÔ, Ô ÚÔĎ² ÃÔĄ ĐÔÔ ×ÃÔ-QHÔÚ ÚÉ ÁÔ ÔEÔĐÔ ÔE ‡ÃÔ××Ô× ÜÔ×**lò A**Eátô AEác xÔú 'Ô xÃÔ' đđô Ôá tô+Độ ũ "Ô, ũ t¾Đ-Độ phố Ôá tô+Độ ũ "Ô, ũ tô, ũ ¤ị, Đđô

»ÔĐÛứ^qĐ, ‡ÃÖ ¾Ã-CĢIÔÚ ÃÜÈ Ũā"ù 0''ÖYÖÖ<Ó ³ÖB "Ö¤**Ö** ÆĒĒĒÔ ÆŪ. ‡ÃÖ ¾Ã-CĢIÔÚ ÛưB ÃÓÓ**ŌÞEŌH**ÔÖ ÛưĞE ¤ĐƯƠ®C ÔƯB ‡""Đ 30B ĐƯƯCB ĐƯ. ÃÔ¤ĐÔ CE •CPÔ ‡ÃÔ CĐỐ ÔƯƠ <ĐƯỢĐÃÕOÚ ⊀Ô>Ô †QƯỚ ĐƯ. ŤŨ TÔ U ÃÖ ĐƯỢ U THE ‡ÃÖ CHƯỞ ĐƯỚ ± VÃÖ NÖ XĐƯỢ Ô ĐỰ • CÔE † TÔO ĐƯM TOU Ở TỔỜ ĐƯỚ ĐƯỚ NƯỚ XVÂÔ ĐƯỚ ÆÜ.

ÆÐÖQÜ ÚÐ ×ÜÖÞÖбÚ ×ÆÞÐÐÖ ÖÐ ÃÖÖÖÖÖÖ ÚÆB ′ÖÐAÖÞÖÖ ÚÆB ÝÖÞÐ ÆÐ ÞÖQÜÞÖÖÇÜ ÞÃÖÖÜ ÞÁÖÓÜÐÐ ×ÆÞÐÐÐÜ 3ÔB ×ÛúµCÔ •OÔ , VEĐÔ ÆLL. 3ÔÔ, VỀÔ ÃÔ, ĐƯỚ, VỊ "CÔPEÐ × CÃÔ TÔK, HÁLEПÔ TÔE ÆLÐE × CÃÔ ÃÔ TẬU Œ ÆÐE × CÃÔ ÃÔ TÂ Đườ thời ÁCE pừ Đũ ×Ô>Ô »CÔ‡Ô Đũ, Tổ ‡ÃÔ VỚ ÃỮ CĐỚO ‡ÃÔ >Ô< Đứ ĐÝ VÔ, CHÔĐÔ Ú "CÔ Để ¤ệu điệ "CÔ Để ÃÔXÂÇII ÆĞIÇ •ÔPÔ 3ÔS ÛXÔĞEÔ †""Ö ÛK¤ITÔ ^SĞIÇIÖ •ÖCK, ^ÃÖ ÃÔ°QLÖ ^ÃÔÛÉ ÃÖ°ÖEĞĞÖ ÜE ÜÖ⊳**I**E ÆĞE •ÖÖPÖ "CÔAFEIK… μŮFEB ÛLÔ, ÞÖ EÖÖ xÛú •ĈPÖ ‡ÃÖ xÃPĞpÖÙú ÛLB "Ĉ'ÖÖÔ AFŒPÔ YÖÜE XÕEÐ, EI ÛLÐ CÖÐJLÖ CÁÐB, ÁÖB ¶ÖNYÖB;Ö ÛnirÖÖ,ü ®de at the earliest stage ‡ÃÖ ×Ösö ÛuÖ ÃÖ'ÖEÖÖÖ Ûu´dede Ûuß 'ÖÖNÖÞÖÖ Ûu´ß £ÖS...

'ÔVEÔB÷NIÔ, ‡ÃÔ ⊀ÔNÔ ÔN ÃƯỚCÔ "CẬN ™ƯƯỚƯ ỞE ÔN" Û ÃÔNÔNÔ 308 ^SHÔC ÆN, ‡ÃÔNÔN Ở † TÔTÔN OƯƠNG TỚE ĐƯỚE 3'ÔS 34ÔCEYÔ ĐƯỢNNOÔ TỔ, Là ĐƯỚN Á ÔĐ-CÔNÔ 3'ÔS ¤MĐƯÔ... ‡ÃÔ ×¤B>>ÔS 'ỚE ¤ƯỚE ¤BYĐẠCÔ ÆŪL. 2'ÔÆBÔ 38NO CÁ 200-XI 200,6 200-XI 200,0 CH XI, LÁ ">OÃO TE JÆÐE XOXOCE ÚUS †ÖJU XAÞOO TÖJU XÁDOÁÖÐÜÐ ÚÚJÐE XOXOCE ÚUS YŒÖ ×ÃOQB ׯÐJÖ ÆU ÞÖÐÖ

[^~0ÃܰÜ)+µÖÖ **(ÁÜB ³ÜÄÜÄÄÄÄ**Ü Ü**ÜÖ»ÖŸÜÖ** ~ÜBŠÕÃÜB® ÆË.]

ylű (1990) Ú de xÔu (1900), è 20Ã0 (1902) việte 3400 x cức Ú de Ãi (1909) Ú de Dú (1900) viị "x (19Ã0) Ú čiệ 20Ã0 (1902) việte 3400 x cức Ú de Ãi (1909) ؕԤÝÔB ÔƯỚE 2ÔŒNÔ, 11 œĐÔ ÃŨE •ÔSTÊ ÔƯÔ ÃĐƯỚG Ô ÆŨL. •ÔPÔ 2ÔŒNÔ, 11 œĐÔ ÃŨE ؕԤÝÔB ÔƯỚE •ÔSTŨE ÔƯÔ ÃÖXÏÖSÖ ÆĞ ŒµÖ †3'ÖS YÖÜÚ 3'ÖÖ,NÖ ÛúS µÖÖEÖPÖÖ†ÜE ÃÜE ^®ÖÜÜÜE ±ÜQJÖ≥Ö ÆĞTÖ, »ÜEÛú°PÖ •ÖÜE µÖ ÖRÖÖ Û£ ×Ûú90, ê 20Â09ê 360×0ê Æÿ, ^90 ×0040ê ÛúB Â000µ00 20eNîB YÛ‡Ô Æü. ÛÆÛe'µÔ, ÆÛs>Ô Æß ´Œ †×OÛúD, ü şibiB Ûtê ÃÖ ŒÔĐÔ ĈE ÆŬÔ »ÔŒÔĐÊ ÛdÊ ∞¤is>B Ûtê "ÖŞ EFBRÖŞB ÛdB †ĈĘŬ •ÖÖĞE ÛdÖ ÖDÛD ×ÖSÖ...•ÖÆĞÖ ÆŭÔPËE ÝÔPËE ××XPOÑÃÔ ÔƯỚE ™ĐƯỚ, -ŒĐĐ× ÞIỚCE ÔƯỚE ™ĐƯỚO †Ô, Ü <ÔÚ Ô�PÔ×Ô ČE ŸÔPPÔ-YÔPPÔ °Ô'''ඊCE ÔƯỚE ׌ĐÚ, Ü ÃOĐĐE ¾OĐÔB TOO ÔUCE 308 ×NĐOO... TÔ-Ô TỚO COÔ3 ÃOĐĐO ¾ĐĐĐOÚ »ÔO NE ATI. TỚO COÔ3 ÃOĐĐOÔ - 34-CBOÙÚ ÛÉ YÖEHÖ †900-Ö YOŒ ¤ê ¤HÛÇ »ŒÛÛ90 •0°Ö YOŒ ê OÖ90K ŰE ÜÖ090Ö 20°90ÉÖ, YÖŒ ^ÃÖ »Ö⊳ÌÛE Đườ ÃXĐÃĐ, CE LICO AĐĐĐƠ? PIÇ™I ≫Ô ĐÔUÔ †°ÔTÔS 'COÔ ÃĈE ™THÔ 'CÔNDÔTÔ, YCCE 'COÔ ĐƯỀ †°ÔTÔE ÃYÔTÔ ĐƯỜ ∞eid ∞efit Toxii vio tūju pio∞u jūlice Atāk Yoso 20'''ce Atālice Yoce ĀYooo Āce ∞eid Ole 20∞is/ce ĀYooo Old Uoso ^90uiê ×0x000.. ‡Ã0 ×0x0 °E Y0E ‡9 ÃPO ×000E Uið TPONA ÆÐEÐ "OVÆK... ŒµO †ÖO 90x0 ×0×indeP ŒŲIÔ TỔÔ ¤ÃO ĐỂ TÔLEÔĐÚ ĐƯỚNG ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC ĐẾ ĐẾ ≫ÔK YÔNÔ, ỦATA ÔFLÔC VẬO THỂ TẠC ĐỂ TỘC ĐẾ TỐ ĐỀ ĐỘC Đ

4.00 P.M.

88

ذÖVÖÐ ÚN †Ö-ÖĞÜ ÚNĞE 20×160'ÐE ÚNB •ÖPÞ¸NÖ ÆÐE YÖÞÓ ÆÐI ŒÞÜÐÐÚ ÞÄÖ ×180 ÖE »ÖÐÖS®MÖYÖE ÚNB ÄÖÖDÞÖ Ûĕ"Û ÆËFÖQ ŐE †Ö,Ü »ÖÜÜÖE »ÖÜĞÜE ŰE ÆÜ ÃÖ,ÛUÖ,Ü ÛKB †ÖXÖÖ-Ö †Ö-Ö ŸÖÛÚ ^®Ö »ÖÜĞÜE ÛÉ 2ÖS"Ő ®ÖÆĞ -ÖAEÁPŐS AEÿ ×0°°ÖÜLŐE 75 †Ö,ü 50 ÚÁ †ÖDÚ⊳ÌE ÚÁ ŸÖAEÁYÖ »ÖE°ÖE ÚLŐ TÜJÖÖÄÖ ×ÚÚJÖÖ ÝÖJÖÖ AEü. µÖפü μίθε 0900<0 † 0, ü 300, bi 0 Ú úβ † Ομε 00 ú 90s xi 0 ÃO 100s ág úβ × 30 ú 03ã 0 Ú ú † 90ã 00, ü 2090 úβ μίθ90β ÃO 100s ág úβ 3¢OùCÃÖ ÛLÔ TXÔSŒÔ ÆLL ÂÚL 9KÔUÔ ÛLE ÃTÔLÊ XÔUÔÃÖ ÛLB TŒ,ÛLÔSŌŨO, YÔCE †Ö•Ö ‡ÃÖ ¤ġÖ TE ‡YÖ¶E Ûú,ôb≥li »ÖDKÖCE ÛdĈE 3ÖDÜÖÖ,& ÛdÖ ×;ÖÜdÖ,ü ÆDÖRÖE ÃČE 2Ö'ÖÖPÖE Û6 ××Ö< †Ö,ü 3ÖDÜÖÖ,& ÃÖ'ÖÖYÖ Ûú,6PÖE Û6 ≫ÖK •ÖBE HÖÆTÜ HÜĞEÖPÖÖ †Ö•Ö 2ÖPÖTTŐ YÖTŐ ÆĞŲ ^ÄÖDGĞE ÖYĞPÜE ÛKB •ÖPÞ, ÜÖ ®ÖÆĞ ÆĞÜĞB... ŒHÖÖ †ÖTÖ ¤mãō, ổi Ùđới »Chức? Chức trò ÔéAÔ , điệi crò 20°C/Vớc Chức trừ 3ÃVô, thờ Ôé ∞ỏ< , điệi crò 20°90×100? µ04×11 ×34070,1×10 U.6 ×>0< U.00‡0 jūb÷ii (0°0 °90Eia 20°90700 AEU, Y00E Œµ00 ‡Y0°908 20⊳18 µ00E°0°90 ÃÖ±ú»Ö ÆĞĞE ÖÖ<YÖD? †YÖ,ü Û6ÁĞÖ Û6 «»Ö< ÛúĞEĞ ÖBĞÜ ÖĞĞ "ÖVEĞ 2ÖYÖÖ ÆÜ, YÖĞE ŒµÖÖ µÖÆÜ µÖĞEÖ PÖ ÃÖ±ú»Ö ÆĞE ÃÖÛdÏĞS ÆĞ? "ÖÆĞEÿÜÖ, 0"ÖÏÖÖ ÛE ÃÖRÖÖ»Ö †®ĞÐÚ ÆTI. ŒµÖÖ ³ÖÖ_ÜÖÖ ÃÖ_ÜÜÖ¸Ü ‡ÃÖ ºÖÖÖÖ Ö¸Ü ÃÖXĞÐBÖĞQQÖ TÖNO™YÖ ÛÚ, ÛDE ¤Ö'Ö YQJÖ ÛÚ, EĞE ÛGB ÛGĞEÔ Ã TÖR™Ü †Ö, Ü ÜÖÖÄÖ ®ĞBŸÖ ‡ÃÖ ¤ġĞÖ TE TÖĞÄÖÖÖ ÔÚ, ĐÔS? TÝÔ, Ŭ <ÃCÔ XÔÚ CÔ •ÔXÝCÔ, YÔC TÃÔ Ã CÔÁ CÔ ÔƯ XỞ Ô Ô ĐÔ ÆĐE Ã CÔƯ CÓ ÆŨ.

rÔÆÔBPŸÖ, ‡ÃÖ ¾Â-CĠÔOÚ CË ÆŬÖ »ÔÔĞÔE ÛVB ÛĞ″Û Ø"ÖŸÖÖ†ÖE Ö,Ü ⊣pÖÖ® ∞¤ŸÖÖ YÖYÖÖ ÆÜ. ‡ÃÔÔĞ »ÖK Ő ÃÖ ŰÜĞÜ ÜÜĞE -ÖPÜKKÖZÜ ¤ÜÖÖ AĞE ÖĞĞE ÖĞÖPÖKÖÖ AĞÜ ÂÜ ŞAĞ ÃÖĞÖZÜ ÖE ÖĞKÖĞÜ ÂÜÜĞ YÜĞÖ Æŭi. j**ôi™d**uö ÜÖÖ[™] ÃŒjōÖÖ ¾Ä-ĞgÖÜ Û£ ÃĞGÖÖEÖÖÖ ÖÖ°P°Ö Œ ×ÕÆÖjü ÃÖ,QÛJÖ,Ü ÛJB Û£″Û Ö'ÖÖÖ Ø'ÖŸÖ†ÜE Ûê %erÖ,ü ⊣pÖÖ®Ö x¤pÖÖ YÖpÖÖ Æü.

×ÖÆÐÇII ÃÖÇÔUÖÇII Û6 ‡ÃÖ ÃÖÆÖRÖ ÛUÖE ÃXBROÚÖZII ÛÚÇII ≫ÖLIÖ YÖLIÖ ÆEI √OÚ TÖYDÖÐÚ XAÖÆEYÖ ÛUÖE '700Ã00ú †0-40,ü ⁻0,ü ⁻0000 ×0ús>00400′0 U00≥°0≥0 0ub Ã0′00€0 Æ£0ú∞**0,b** 0ù Ã00£0 0æb\$50 <0ú Ã0′008æbb ÁÐÞÖB "ÞÜÖB •ÖÖ<... ×ÕÆÖJÜ ÁÖJÚÁÖJÜ ®É ÞÖÆÜ ³ÖB ÖÖÐÖÖ ÚÁB EÖB ×ÚÚ †ÖÞÖÐÞÞÖ †ÖJÜ †®ÞÖ ÞÖÐÐÞÖÐÐÐÓ Û6 †807000 †Û9ê 300xê Ök,800,0ê Û18 30700090 ÆÛ1û×Ô,8 308 20,Û1ú,Ô,ü ,ÛÛB •00k, •00ê ÖHÛ Ök,800,ü 35 ×Ûú»ÖÖÉÖÖÖ ÖÖÖÖÖÖEÜ Æü.

¿CO×O×O «OúpiCO YOpiCO Æti «Oú ÃCPCB ¸O•piCB CE piCDeCPCO Oú º20Ætji ¸iDCE •COPCE ¾CO×CE »COÉCCE OúO †®EXCOVO <Ôú ÃO 0090 , ĐƯỢC ÔứB 20 040 ‡ÃƯ ĐỊ ĐƯỢC THẾ ĐƯỢC TO THE ÃΟΘΙμΟΌ ΤΟς U TÖ-ÖX, NÖ ÆLÜLE. ×ÃO-ÜLEOÓN TÜE 75 TÖRÖ; ÖNÖ YÖD ÖSÞÖ TÖLÜ 50 ±LAĞÖXAG ; ÖMELÜLG TÖRÖXAG ÚNS ͺaã™ôμö Ûuβō,ĕö Ãös′öö Ûuĉe ²Ö♥Ök ¸ùÜÖYČe Æik ¸ö•µö Ûe ××Ök ¯ŒEÖÛú ÃÖ′ÖÖXÖçÖ♥Ö ÛuÖ ^¯Ö°ÖÖÖ ×ÛúµÖÖ ÝQUIO AEU ‡ÃOOè »»Ö< AEUÖ -ÖPDÖKÖRU RÜGE AEU. ¾Ö-QBOOÚ ÛÉ TO BYUÇEG ÝÖ, DOÉ ÃČE »ÖDFÖDEĞUĞE ÛUS TÖREYÖPÖ Ûê ÃÔĐĐÔ TĒ 3B ÆŬŌ,B 0'TVÔ ÛLÊ •ÖYÔÆŬ ¤B YÔŦÔ. ÃQĐŌĐĐÔÔ ¾B-GÔÚ TĒ Ō•µŌĒ ÛLÊ †×ÖLÔ Ŭ ¤ŸJÕ ÝQUÔ ÆŬ XÚÚ XÃE ÇÕ•µCÔE «ÕÇÕ XÃ-CÖSTÔÚÚ ŸŎ, QOĐE ÃÕE 2ÖTÖK ÝÖK 1ÖTÖÜLÖE ÚÉ †Ö-TÖ,Ü Ö,Ü XÃKÇÖNYÜ ÃOSCÖ Ôé †¢riji »ÖDPÖÖLEĞIÖĞE ÖVB TÖLEKÖÖPÖ ÖVÇI ÃÖÖE... ¾Ö-ĞBÖÖV Ôé TÖÇÉPÖÖV ^TÖPÖÖÖE ÖÉ †¶ÖÖKÖÇI ÜÖÖPÖÖPÖE

30s Ažii. AžiiÖ ‡ÃÔÔÁ ÃÔ ŒÔÔÔÔ ĆË ‡ÃÔ⇔Ô< 2ÔÔÔÔ , iÆB Ažii xÔú ‡ÃÔ ÃÔ ÔµÔ ¤ặÔ °ÔÉ † ÔŶÔS Ôú Ô-ÔÔS, ipôŒ ÛdB YÖ,ELÚ →DÖPРפIIIÖ ÆLL. •ÖE ÆLÏÖDdE ÖÆBÞË ÛLLÆÖ "ÖVÆLK EÖ ¾ÆEL †Ö•Ö YÖDÚ ÆLÏÖ ÛL,L ÖVEB TÜK ATŲ YÖPÖ ZÖLAÃO DUO ÖĞO µÖLLU ALDE ÄÖDÜNYÖ ALU XDU ALUÖ †ÖPÖB PÖBYÖ ÖL ÖK TÜK ƏKÖNÖÖD DUÄÄLE DUÇP 20/ΕΝΑΟ ŪΚΟ 10**8/0** YOUE †20 μ0/ΕΚΊ ÆΝΘΕ ΑΟŪΚΝΟΟ ÆΝΊ «ŪΚΙ ÆΝΘΟ, ᡛ ΟΥΟΝΘΡΟ 10Έ ŒLHOO ¤**OR**O £00? 20/ΕΝΑΟ ŪΚΟ 108**/0** ŸŰĊĖ µŮVEŬ ÆŪĈĖ ÃŰŮŮŸŰŎ ÆŬ ×ŪÚ ÆŬŰŌ †ŌŶŮS ÃŐ, ĎŮŮĎ,Ŭ ŪĆE ×ÄŘŶŐŶŶŐ ×ÄŘŶŐŬŶŰĊĖ ŰĖ ŮŮŮEŤŮĎ ÆŶŖĎŶĎ ŨŨĂŰĿŪÚ, Ē. Ûú»Ö ¤Ös»Ö Ûúß Ûú´Öß ÆÖE •ÖÖ×YÖß... †ÖÖ ÛésÁÖ ²ÖÖs**Ö** ÖBsü ÖÖÖ °Ö®Ö »ÖHÖE ÆŪ †Ö¸Ü µÖ∞ü**...(34Ö3ÆÖÖ®)**

^~CĂĞĞĞ (AĞB 3ĞBĞĞĞB3Ğ, ü ÛĞĞ»ÖĞĞ : ÃÖĞĞĞ ÖÖ ÖÖ ÛĞ**%**Ök...

ÁCB 20_{7.} Olsü 90. QLO-Ö AĞÜEÜ: 20ÂÖ, <Üú ×Ö99''ü. µÖ¤ü ÂÖ'ÜXQEĞB XQUÖĞĞ ÜVB µÖDEÖ9Ö †Ö'Ö 209Ö »ÔUCE ÆŢI ÃÖ CÔCĂÇÜS ¾ÃÔ CÔÃO ÔUĞ ÖVÖNĞEÖ <ÔÚ ÝÖ_BEÖ •ÔÜE †ÖPÖS <ÔÚ ×ŒPÔ ÛÚS Ö•Ö׌P ÜÜÖÛÚ Üİ †ÖPÖS (0+Ö≥ÚÚB "Ö»ÖÖYÖ ÆÜ YÖE ÂÖÛúB ÛÛµÖ;ÖÆEYÖ ²ÖœÖFÜE ÛE ≫Ö< 3°OB µÖÜ÷ÖFÖ 2°ÖFÜE †Ö, ü •ÖCE ¤ÃÕÇ E YÖFÖÜE ÆŢŲ ^900xB 30B UNŲQ;ÕÆYÖ 20xHPE UxB µ00xÖ90 2090; 30e †0900×ii µÆTE. »0e0x90 •00e 20≥1e 70°0090e 70;ii Y0,080 ÆÜ ^®ODÚB DĬĻIŲ;ÕÆYŎ ²ŌœŇÔB ĮÆĘ ĮIÕÆB ³ŌŌĮŇŌ ÄŌĮŪÚŌĮÜ Ūé ≫Ök, ‡ÄŌ ¤ĒĮŌ Ūé ≫Ök "ŌŒŒŎŌB ÆÜ †Ô,ũ μÔÆB ÛúÆü Ûú,∎Đé Ở †°Ô°ÔS 200YÔ ÂÔ'ÔTYÔ Ûú,⊌ÔÔ ÆÐE -Ô°₽ĴÔXĐÔ¤ü.

SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN (Maharashtra): Sir, I consider myself extremely fortunate to have got this opportunity to put forth my views and to support this historic landmark legislation on behalf of my party. Sir, looking back at the 66 years of our country's history on the one side, we take pride in the progress and development that we have made in the fields of Science and Technology, Information Technology, Infrastructure, Industry, Agriculture and Social Welfare. Thanks to the positive initiative in the last decade, that we came to be labelled as the fastest growing economy in the world. We see the emergence of a rapidly increasing middle class with higher standards of living and increasing purchasing power. We are proud of the fact that we are termed as a country on the march and are considered an important player on the global platform. However, on the other side, Sir, there are glaring and startling realities which need to be addressed. Ours is a country of disparities and it is this gap that we need to bridge. It is unfortunate that a major chunk of our population still has to struggle for basic survival needs. Sir, India is home to a third of the world's poor. India is home to nearly a fourth of the hungry in the world making it the world's hunger capital. One out of four children is malnourished. The figures and captions can go on. More eloquent for me, Sir, are the words I read in an article of a grandmother, Jharna, carrying her sick, undernourished, limp, emaciated one-year grandchild to a clinic, who anxiously expressed to the author of this article and I quote, "You see her arms? They are almost the width of my thumb. She is too weak. She can't even sit by herself." I was shocked to hear this and when I saw my own thumb and compared it to probably the arm of a one-year old, I could not imagine that this could be true, and, therefore, I googled, I searched for images and I was shocked to see that it was not only just Jharna's grandchild but many more children cuddled in their mother's arms, who perfectly fit that description. Therefore, Sir, in passing of this Bill there is a special feeling, a deep sentiment of contentment and fulfilment, I think, which our Mahatma told us that we have to think of the last person and this is the dream that he envisaged and that is exactly what we are trying to do today. Sir, as we aim for a high economic growth which is absolutely essential, what is utmost important is, the growth, has to be inclusive. It is our duty to ensure that the benefits reach the poor and weaker sections of our society and I feel in passing of this Bill we are precisely doing that.

Once this Bill becomes law, food security is not a welfare measure but a right of almost 2/3rd citizens of India. Sir, to be able to provide entitlements, as mentioned in the Bill, it is absolutely essential that there has to be stability and self-sufficiency of food production. Worldwide, especially in the Asian region, challenges such as increasing population, climate change impacts, over exploitation of natural resources bring pressure on food production and sufficiency.

Lester Brown, a renowned environmentalist, in his Book "Full Planet, Empty Plates", has observed, "Globally the world grain reserves have fallen by 1/3rd and the world is in a transition from an era of abundance to that of scarcity." In this background, I think, we are fortunate and blessed that what was unthinkable a few years back in India, today, boasts to be self-sufficient in foodgrain production.

Sir, we are the largest exporter of rice and the second largest exporter of wheat. There has been a record production of pulses. India is the second largest producer of vegetables. India is the second largest producer of fruits. India is the largest producer of milk. India has the largest livestock. Agriculture credit which was Rs. 86,000-odd crores in 2003-04 has now reached Rs. 600,000 crores. From a net importer to a huge exporter of agricultural produce, India has, in 2012-13, exported agricultural produce worth Rs. 2.32 lakh crores. And, to our credit, this tripled in just four years. India's godowns are overflowing with wheat and rice waiting to be reached to the poor. In spite of many natural calamities, we have achieved a record foodgrain production of 259.29 million tonnes in 2011-12.

Initiatives such as Green Revolution in the Eastern India, 60,000 pulses and oilseed villages, successful Minimum Support Price policies and many others have played a major role in achieving this success.

Sir, we have to realize that the introduction, deliberation and passing of this Bill would not have been possible had there not been toil and hard work, grit and determination of the sons of our soil — our Kisan. We would not have been talking on this Bill had the great impetus not been given by the Government in recent years to the agricultural sector. We would not have been talking on this Bill had it not been for the leadership and direction of an astute and truly visionary leader who understands the nerve of agriculture and farmer, hon. Minister of Agriculture, Sharad Pawarji, and the support of the hon. Prime Minister, Dr. Manmohan Singhji, whose valuable contributions have made India not only self-sufficient in foodgrains, but has set all-time production record on the global scenario. The challenge now, Sir, is to maintain the pace and ensure sustainability. For this, we need to ensure that every farmer is remunerated well, kept motivated and we have to keep in mind, that he — the farmer — is the pivot, he is the champion, in the real sense, he is the Anna Data for this programme's success. And, topmost priority should be given to his concerns.

Sir, it is heartening to see the provisions in this direction in the Bill too. Schedule III of the Food Security Bill is extremely welcome and crucial as it makes sure all levels of Government — Central, State, Local ...(Time-bell rings)... Sir, I am going to be the only speaker from my party.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): You have got only two more minutes now.

SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN: ...Governments would strive to revitalize agriculture to make interventions for procurement, storage and movement of grains and to provide access to safe and adequate drinking water and sanitation.

Sir, we all know that health burden of poor quality of water is enormous. It is estimated that every year around 37.7 million Indians are affected by waterborne diseases and 1.5 million children are estimated to die because of diarrhea. Sanitation forms an important component of health. More than half of all people who defecate in the open live in India. Studies in India have shown that there is a link between open defection and stunted growth. Therefore, ill-health will not allow proper absorption of food and nutrients. Therefore, these issues also need to be addressed.

Sir, it is extremely important to realise – and this is the last but one point – that, through this legislation, no doubt, we are taking care of only a part of the food basket, quantity-wise and nutrients-wise, which itself undoubtedly is a major step.

The ICMR norms recommend that an adult requires 14 kilos and a child 7 kilos and, therefore, this is only the beginning of a stupendous task that we have in future.

To combat malnutrition, one needs basic food necessities, which means a combination of cereals, pulses and edible oils. Let us hope that the Government is taking care of the responsibility of a part of the food basket and the rest is earned by the person who fends for himself. And, therefore, we need to make sure that the poor get work and income. The MNREGA is a step in that direction. However, we will have to strive for more aggressive implementation of skill development and other such programmes.

A massive education programme needs to take place as people need to know what nutrition really means. It should not be that, just because they have been given the grain, they feel that everything has been sorted out. They have to understand that it has to be supplemented by pulses and edible oils. (*Time-bell rings*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please conclude.

SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN: Yes, Sir.

Some of the other challenges that we face today are climate change impacts, water shortages and, of course, not a very efficient PDS system.

Through this Bill, Sir, ours will be the biggest programme in the world to eradicate hunger. I am sure, if all of us, the law and policy makers, the elected representatives and administrators at all levels of the Government, resolve that we want to see a better world, a hunger-free world, a safe, secure and healthy world for our children, our future generations, then, I can only say, this is our best chance.

SHRI H.K. DUA (Nominated): Thank you, Mr. Vice-Chairman, for giving me the opportunity to speak on this very, very important Bill.

Sir, there is an unwritten consensus among all the political parties, despite the current mood of cynicism that has spread across the country, that we can be a major economic, political and nuclear power of the 21st century. We have the world's largest skilled manpower, a major source of our strength. We have one of the world's largest Armies, Air Forces and Navies. We are one of the world's larger missile powers. In a few years' time, an Indian will be landing on the Moon. Possibly, we will be able to send a Mission to the Mars, "On the near future.

But, Sir, the reality on the ground is not as happy and hopeful as it seems. A chunk of our population doesn't get nutritious food every day. A chunk of the population does not get one nutritious meal per day. If a majority of the children who are malnourished in the world are Indians, then, there is something wrong with our priorities.

Sixty-five years after freedom, now we are in a position to fill that gap between promise and achievement. It was not possible soon after Independence when we were going round the world with a begging bowl asking for PL-480 foodgrains, and we had to pay heavy price for it in our policies and programmes. There is no free lunch anywhere, as you know.

Now, we produce enough foodgrains of our own. We are exporting it also. But it is not reaching all the people. Why? That is because the people do not have the purchasing power to buy all what we grow, or they need. That is why there is malnutrition. There are not many famines in the country, but there have been, still, people in Vidarbha who died of hunger, who committed suicides. It happened in Andhra Pradesh also. It happened in a prosperous State like the Punjab where, some years ago, there were hunger suicides, not in large scale but there were six people who had died.

Now, what is worrying is, even if famine has been eradicated from India, and we have enough bufferstock to take care of a drought or two, malnutrition is very, very widespread. It is so widespread that it cannot be the base for building a major power of the 21st century. You can be a power; but on hungry stomach, you cannot be a major power of the 21st century. This Bill tries to fill that gap between promise and performance. We have the grains. There are 70 million tonnes of grains in our warehouses, or, lying in the open on the plinth. A chunk of it is eaten by rats. Rats don't commit suicides in Vidarbha; they are fairly well-fed, or,

elsewhere where the pockets of food shortages are there. It is men who do. No where rats are suffering from malnutrition. It is people who do; it is the children who suffer from malnutrition. Now, a chunk of these 70 million foodgrains is eaten away by rats or the vagaries of weather. Can't we distribute it to the people who need it? Those people who cannot afford to buy these. This Bill provides them cheap grain at a vast scale. That is why it is of historic importance. I am sure the House will support it unanimously. There have been reservations from different parties about some problems with the Bill. I am sure, these can be addressed. If not, as we go along, if some glitches appear, these can be rectified later. This programme is of a massive scale. I think we should all support it. Criticism is coming from the middle class outside. Criticism is coming from the 'Shining India', which has been a gainer of growth. The 'Shining India' wants subsidies for petrol, it wants cheap fares for air travel, it would like to go to posh restaurants and order lobsters and discuss obesity. The people who belong to the 'Shining India' don't want to share a handful of grain with the poor and who are under-nourished children. They just don't want to share it. I read in the newspapers, and most of you people would have read that kitty parties are being held by chartering an aircraft for rich ladies to go to Hong Kong or Bangkok or Paris. The kitty parties are being held there at tremendous costs, and when they come back, they discuss why this Bill is being brought, why cheap grain is being distributed to the other India; and when the country doesn't have enough resources. But, 'Shining India', frankly speaking, is a bit selfish India. When the voting time comes, the Shining India people don't turn up for voting. The voting percentages are the least in prosperous areas, as it has been experienced in posh areas of Mumbai or Delhi. They have the least percentages. Who have really the stake in democracy? Ultimately, the poor of the country have the stake in democracy. And, if the State does not take care of the poorest, "the loneliest and the last," then, I am afraid, it will be an undemocratic State.

Sir, there are other plus points in this Bill, which are very, very important. Women, particularly the women who are on the family way, and the children are the first charge in its scheme of things. An important aspect of the Bill — there is one Clause which has not been explained — is that the head of the family in every beneficiary family will be a woman, not man. Now, that is indeed of societal importance in this Bill that the head of the family will be the eldest woman of the family. Now, that kind of proposition is unimaginable in Indian social set up, where

a woman is not regarded although your passport and my passport will mention the mother's name also as head of the family in an entitlement card. Now entitlement is to be determined by the head of the family - a woman.

If the democratic promise has to be fulfilled — although 65 years have been lost. Let's not lose more. You have to feed the under-nourished families. If they cannot afford, then the State has got to help. There used to be times when you ask your help or someone, 'well, your son has got the job, congratulations, ..." AULL YOŸU¾AOÆü YOÒE ŠÃÜJÚ ×O»O •OO<YOB, ¤Ob»O-OEºNS YOÒE ÆOÈ •OO<YOB... These days *dal* is getting outside the menu of the poor. For most people in India, the only source of protein is dal which the poor cannot afford at eighty rupees or ninety rupees a kilo. What a housewife does? She puts more water in dal to save on dal, reduces the quantity of dal which is being cooked for the entire family. In the process, protein is being denied to the children who are already malnourished. So, they suffer more from malnutrition. How do you build a democratic, strong India of the 21st century on the basis of hungry or malnourished stomachs? This Bill goes some way, possibly, I think we may have to come and increase the grain later on at some stage till the purchasing power of the common man improves. Let us not go by the glitter of the malls or the lifestyles of those of the shining India. Our big aim should be that entire India shines. This Sir, is only a beginning. Thank you very much, Sir.

>**Ö 300, ÜÜÜ a 00, Ü, ÜDAÜÜ**Ö ("ÖEÖ, ÖÄ™)) : ^ ÖÄ ÖP ÖD-µÖBÖ "ÖE**Ö**EYÜÖ, "Ö †Ö-Ö †ÖÖ-ÖB Ûuß •ÖYÖEÜ ØYEEYB 'ČĖ † TÕPB 200YO ŪvÆBPO "COVENCO ÆĐE ŒµCOĐŪ TĢŌ †Ö•Ö ŪUO BĀCEYBAO ™ALSAR. TŌŢU †DOĒĞB CĖ 20ÆÃO Ôú, Đềc XXIX CE TEÔ, QÔÃ, QUỐC Đề ×XÔK. "Được AEÚ. TÃÔ ×PỆO ÔUÔ •ÔC TÔÔ TÔ×ƯỚS AEÚ •ÔC XÔUÃ ĐỚ ĐỆU ÔÚ, ŇÖÖ ÆÜ, ¾ÄÆÜ ÃÖбÚ ×,Ã-ÖŒ™Ü ÔÐ ÃÖŒÖ, †ÖYÖÄÖ′ÖÖÐ ÔÐ ÃÖŒÖ ,ÆŒÐÖ "ÖÖÆÑÖÖ ÆÜ. ^ÃÖÔÜÖÐ ÞÖÆ †""Ô ŸŒB »ÔTÔTÔ ×ŨÚ ^ÂĈE ÝÔ,ĐÃÔ ŨŴŒÔ •ÔK µÔÔ ¤ĔţĬŢĬ ŨŴŒÔ •ÔK... ^ÂÔŨÂĈE »ÔTÔTÔ ÆÑ xŨÚ Ô ÝÔ, ĐPÔ •ÔP Þ, W ÆÐÆ »ÔĐÔƯPÔ † ÔPÔS ÔƯ ÔĐỆÔ ÃŨ † ÔPÔO ÔC VU 3Ô, VIÔO ÆÐÆ ‡ÃÔ ¤ặÔ ÔUÔ •ÔE †ÔÔ †Ö¤ƯĜS Æŭ †Ô.ŭ •ÔĈE µÔŒŬ 20070 ÛÚÆÑOO ÆŬ Ô †Ô•Ô ^ÂÔŨ€ ≫Ô×, ^ÂÔŨúB 20070 ‡ÃÔ ÂŒÔÔYÔŒŬ ĈE ^**SÔ**®Ô "ÖÖÆÜÖÖ Æ**é**e.

OvEdderijo, ‡AO ¤jio ´Ce 120 Uú_dde li •090voo Æii. Æiio ‡90´Ce ACe 70 Uú_dde li »OdeOce Uúde vo_dpo, ∞iệ; lị ủ Ưưx4690 "CP46VCE ATụ <ACB CEµCO 200YCE ATP <Uú YO, iEú YOCE ATŨ UÚAEVCE ATŨ ×Uú 2020 YOUú ATŨO ‡ÃÖ ¾ÃÃÃà ÛÚB ÃŒŐÜ ü ÖÖRŐÜ ü 2ÖPŐPŐE ¾ÃÖ≫ÜE ÆÜ †Ö ü ¤ÃÃŐ B ŸŐ ŒÚ ÚÚÆŬÜE ÆÜ √ÚÚ †Ö•Ö ¾ÖB 2013 ´Œ ÆŬĬŎ, È ¤PÔ ÛĴB 67 ÖÏŶÜ; ÔÑÔ •ÔŸŶĬŎ ÝŌ, PPÔS , ĐƯỚ ÛÉ ÝÔS ŰÉ ÆŬ ÆŬŰE ^ŸÔ »ÔŒŒÊ ÛÉ ××Ô< ÜÖÜŸÜE ÛĴB 3408AA£OO UU_RRB "OOÆEk... ‡®70'E AQE UUQPO AQB 200/O AQ'O ÆÜ ŒµOO ÆÜO AQEOQ E 'OPAQ'E 2009@E AEO μΟΌ ΑΞŪΟ ¤ἰκ¸ιὰ ii ¸interdo "COMENICE AEP μΟΘΕŪ ĀO¸ÔUCO¸ii ‡ÃO • OFONOO CUCE ŒμΟΟ ÃO O-ONOS AEP ^ĀCE μΟΘΕŪ 2000 - OFEIGE ÃCE AEB • COVAEÇU CU¸u ¤ROS "COVAEIK » CÚ ŒμΟΟ ΑΞŪΟ ÝO¸OPO ΑΕŪ μΟΟ ÃŒO¸U - CONO¸U 2070PCE • CO ¸inte AED

^**-0ACP-00-µ050 (AOB 302970}30 ii 0-00>>010) :** ÃO 00 YO 0 028→0<, †0 00 00 ÃO 040 ÃO 00 YO Æ**0**0 "00 00 Æ11.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please conclude.

>**0. 300 jil00 á 00 ju jokalno :** pôteu Oúxô 900ú † 690e - 6000 - 0 ju Oôx**ô** ji**le**ioo... pôteu ×ôdo×u Aeu xôú †Ö+Ö μÖÆĞÖ Ö,ü <ÃÖÖ ÛLÖĞĞ 3'ÖB "ÖDXĞ+ÖD"Ö "ÖVEĞ AĞü. YÖĞÖ †Ö+Ö YÖ,GA"Ö AĞĞÇ ÛLIXÖ 3'ÖB YÖ,GA"Ö "ŒĞĞÇ ÛLIXÖ †Ö'ÖÖLÖÖ 2ÖE'Ö YÖ,GPÖ ,ÆE¢ ×±ú,ü ^ÄÖÖLÖÖ TÖÖÖÖ YÖ,GPÖ ,ÆE¢ †YÖ,ü µÖVEA 34ÖXAÄEÖÖ Ûú,GPÖS ÆÇ YÖÖE ÆĞĞE ‡ÃÔ ×Ô»Ô ÃĈE ŒµÔÔ ÛúÔÔ Ûú, ĐỀÔ ÆP? Ở TÔE ĐẾ ĐỀÔ TẾE ĐỦI ÆÊ ĐÚ ÆÜÔ ¤ÞÔ ÛÉ ××Ô× ŒµÔÔ Ûú, ĐỀÔ "CÔÆBÎČE ÆÐ? ‡ŸÔŸÔÔ CÚÆÐŘE CÚE ²ÔD¤Ü ČEÆE <CÚÚ †Ô,Ü ²ÔOVÔ TÔÆÐŘOS ÆŬ ×CÚÚ †ÝÔ,Ü µÔÆÜ ×ÔSÔ »ÔÔŸÔ ÆÜ ŒŲĨŎ TÖÖ ŦÃŎŨĠ ××Ů< T-ŲĨŎ¤ŖŎ ×ŐK £ÔP ŒŲĨŎ TÖŌPĒ T-ŲĨŎ¤ŖŎ ×ŐÔPĒ ÃŒ ŌÆĸĬŒ ŨŒĸ ͺΰ•μΰὰ Đὰ »Φάθαὰ Αθε Τάκιο Εσό? Œμιο †6°09ê ^90 ͺΰ•μιοῦ Αθε Τάκιο Εσό, •σὸ †6°οθε Τόπου Τάλομο Đά ͺΰ•μο Æï?

^~OÃOPOCHUĞĞ •OB, 'Ö 'ÖLEĞ QÖRM'D ÃCE †ÖVÖ ÆGE 'Ö 'ÖLEĞ QÖRM'D ÛLE 2'ÖĞ E 'ZÖĞ ÄĞE 2'ÖĞÖ ÃĞÛLÜYÖ ÆGE XÛL ŐŁŐ, ŐÄ™Ò ´ŰE •ŰÉ ²ŰS. ŐS.<»Ö. , ÚŰŐ Æű....(¾ØÖÖÖÖ)...

^**~CACPOD-µOSO (AGB 302270≥30 ii Ûlû≫OKO) :** ÃÔ CO YÔ ÛLØ≫ÔK, †Ô CŨLÔ ÃÔ CẬÔ ÃÔ CO YÔ ÆLÔE "OĐLÔ ÆLŨ.

Į**veo aede.** Toedijah™o te ×0,×cie tobat™a ×cii+® †ecidote yoʻlakos julcio āce ®b*te jveate 360,×cie ûub •cie ≫ÖÙU ÆÜU ¾ÖÆÜ 1997 ÛÚB ≫ÖÙU ÆÜL. ¾ÖÆÖÖ ÖÜÜ †Ö•Ö 3ÖB 1997 ÛÚB 2Ö9ÖB ÆŒÇÔ ≫ÖÙU ÃÜE ÛÚÖÖ "Ö»Ö ÞEÖ ÆÜ. •ÖÖ: 1991 ÛvÔ ÃÖĞÖÄÖ ÆÜ ¾ÖEÜ 1997 ÛvB ×»ÖÄ™Ü ^ÃÖÛ£ †Ö-ÖÖ Ü ÖÖ Ü 2Ö9B ÆEÊÔ ÆÜ. ^ÃÖÜÁ ²ÖÖ× ĨÃÜE 2001 †Üşü 2011 ÜÚB •ÖŸŸŰÞÖŸÖ ÆÖE "ÖÐÚß ÆÜ »ÜEŬŰŸŐ ´ÖÆÐ¸ÖÄ™Ó ÄÖ¸ÐÚÖ¸Ü **90.(34000000)**

^**~ďÁďOϦŮĎŮ (ÁŬB 3ŮŽďďe3ŽŲ ii ÛUĎ≫ŨVĎ) :** ÃÖŰÖŸŐ ÛUß⊷ÖK, Ű 9ŰEÙÚ ÛUŰE 4ŮÞŐÖ **"VEÖ ÆÐ**Æ

>**Ö. ³ÖÇÜNÜĞĞÖÇÜ ÇÖXANÖ:** pÖÆÜ ÛNÖÖ ÖĞEĞ ®ÖÆĞ ×ÛNDÖ ÆÜ. †YÖZÜ ‡ÃÖ YÖZŒÜ ÛNÖ <×Ý•ŒEÇÜÇEĞ® Æij ŸĬŎĿŧÃŎ ¤ġŎ ÛĸŎ ŶŎŢŒŎ ŶŨĸÃŎĠŧ ŌŎĂŎ •ĬŎĸŶĬŎ? ŒŅĬŎ ÆijŎ ÂŎŨĸĠĿ1997 Ûĸß ≫ŎÙij ĨĿ¤ĠŪĠŔŒ ¾ÄFEÜ ¾ÖÆFYÖ ×ÖÄÖ®E 1997 ÜE •Ö®Ö ×>ÖDÖ ÆÜ •ÖÖE †Ö•Ö 16 ÄÖÖ>Ö ÛúÖ ÆÜE YÖDÖ ÆÜ..**(¾ĎÄ∂ÖÖ)...**

^~OAO°OO-µOSO (AOB 3O2000g:30g ii ŪuO>>OVO) : −Ö9\0%00¤ii.

>**Ö 300, WODÉTOL Ü, ÇIYANÖ : C**EPÖÖ †ÖÖ ‡ÃÖDÉ †Ö-ÖÖ, Ü Ö, Ü ÛÚÖÖ ÛÚ, Ü "E**E**E ÆEP ÃÖ, Ü "ĞHÜE »ÖYÖYÖÖ AEŭ ×Ûú ‡ÃO ŸŎ,ŒEŭ ÛďO ×ÃO×Ô, µÔÆŭ †-µÔD×@PÔ †ÔPÔE ¾ÔD×ÔE ‡×ÔŒE;ĈPÔ ÛďB PÔ•Ö,Ŭ ĈE ŢŪŬÔÚú,Ŭ ×ÔQHÔO ÝQHÔO AEÚ. Ở TÃÔ T-µÔ™ĐÔ ÔƯA ≪Ô™Ô ÔÚ, NÔ AĐE Ở ÃÔ, ÔUÔ, Ŭ ÃĈE ÛVAEÐÔ "ÔŬEÑÔ AĐE XÔÚ TՐÔŨŒ XÔŒ™Û ÔưB •OÔE 3ÔB Ç**ũ•**ÔTBAYÔ Ôư,ĐBB AEU ^ÃÔÔưÔE 2ÔPEU,Ü ÔưB•Ô<, »ÔĐÔưTÔ YÔ,BPÔŒ Ô£ ÃÔŒÔ XŨÔNDAÑD ÌI ÔYÔ Ûúß⊷Ö<... -Ö¶Ö%Ö¤ü.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Next is. Mr. Sanjiv Kumar; not present. Then, Shri Birendra Prasad Baishya.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA (Assam): Thank you, Sir, for having given me this opportunity.

Before beginning my speech on this Bill, I would like to quote Mahatma Gandhiji what he had written in the *Harijan* before Independence. Before Independence of our country, Mahatma Gandhi wrote this in the *Harijan* in which he said, "In a democracy, a Government which cannot provide basic amenities to the poor people of the country is not a Government but a conjunction of the anarchist."

With this quotation of Mahatma Gandhi, I would like to start my speech on this Bill. India is a welfare State and it is the duty of any welfare country to fulfil basic needs of the people of the country. In our country, what are the basic needs of the people? They are: Food, clothing and house. But successive Governments have totally failed to provide 'Roti, Kapada and Makaan.' It is nothing but a slogan in our country. All the Governments have failed to implement this.

Coming to the Bill, in this Bill, the Government has said that it will provide five kilogram of rice or five kilogram of wheat per person in a month—rice at Rs. 3 and wheat at Rs. 2. But, Sir, no individual can survive with only five kilogram of rice. So, I want a modification in this paragraph of the Bill. I request that it should be increased up to 15 kilogram a month for an individual. Only then, he can survive. By five kilogram rice, nobody can survive.

Then, Sir, take salt. The price of salt is very low in this part of the country, but if somebody has visited our border area, Indo-China border area in Arunachal Pradesh, he would be knowing its price there. Can you imagine that it is sold at Rs. 100 to Rs. 120 per kg there? So, I request the Government that it should also include *daal*, oil and salt along with rice in this Scheme. Only then, people can survive. But, for successful implementation of this Bill, strengthening of the Public

Distribution System is also very important. However, in our country, the Public Distribution System has totally collapsed. Without improving the Public Distribution System, you cannot implement this Scheme. ...(*Time bell rings*)... If you will not properly implement this Scheme through the strong Public Distribution System, this Scheme will be like the slogan 'Roti, Kapada and Makaan'. In the fair price shops under the Public Distribution shops, sugar is already missing. People are not getting sugar from the fair price shops for the last several months. So, try to improve the Public Distribution System first.

Then, storage is also a very important part of this. I come from the North-Eastern Region of our country. During flood times, North-Eastern Region always gets cut-off from the rest of the country. But there is no sufficient storage capacity. Without sufficient storage capacity, you cannot implement this Scheme. You should also look into this. This also needs to be given importance in this Scheme. ...(Time bell rings)... Then, there is one very interesting thing.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Mr. Baishya, please conclude.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA: Sir, give me just two minutes. ...(Interruptions)...

Sir, I would like to make another point here. The role of the Food Corporation of India is very important, but there is a nexus between the Food Corporation of India and some illegal businessmen due to which the Food Corporation of India has totally collapsed in our country. I would call it, not the Food Corporation of India, but 'the Food Corruption of India'. I would urge the Minister, before implementing this Bill, try and look into these issues. Otherwise, this Bill would remain only in name and people would not get any benefit out of it.

Sir, there is another important point to which I wish to draw the attention of the Government. There are certain basic problems being faced by the people of the North-Eastern Region. Most of the fair price shops are smuggling goods into Bangladesh. It is not reaching the poor people. Although the Government has introduced the scheme, people are not getting any benefit out of it. Most of the low-priced goods are being smuggled into Bangladesh and illegal and dishonest businessmen are earning money. The Government must look into this and make some clarification.

With these modifications, I would like to support the Bill. First, improve the public distribution system; second, improve the FCI; third, take steps to stop smuggling; fourth, increase the quantum of food per person from 5 kg to 15 kg, and fifth, provide sufficient amounts of salt, oil and *daal* to the people. If all these are implemented, the Bill would be successful, otherwise, this Bill would just be another version of the MNERGA in this country.

With this, I conclude, Sir.

ÁÖB TŰLÜÇÖ •ÖBB-ÐÚÇÜ (TÖEÖÇÖR™)) : TÖPÐEÖBPÖ ^TÖÃPÖÖ+PÜGÖ •ÖB, †Ö+Ö ÆÜÖ ÜÖÖ^A AQQIBOO UÐ ×0»0 ¯0,ü "0"000 Uújü j**il**ti Atü. †0•00¤16 Ubi 66 A00»0 Atūlė "Obbi Atū we are into the 67th year of our Independence. †0.00×10 Ué 66 Ã00×0 Ué 200×11 †Y0 ii Æitle ×ị0 Ué 80 Uí li volta Uứce U00º A Chiốn 0 ∞ĐRê Uức 2000 Uú,ĐRS TO NGS AFÝ †YO, Ů YO, DPGS ‡90 66 ACO>COE CE Uứ O 90-Eá AE\$EO ÆŲ ŢŶŎŢŮ ^9ÔVIĜE ÜÖÜ9ĨÖ ×ÜÖXÖÜ9ĨE ÛE XXÎK ×ÖXÖ XÖÜ9ĨE ŸĨÔÚ ÛŒ 9ÔFÎÖÖ ŢÖÏÖK ÆŲ ŸĨŨĖ ŢÃÖÛE XXÎK Đườ9 ×Ô ÔXÔ,ũ AEP µÔEŬ (ĜĘÔ TÔEBXÔ TŲ;90 AEŬ. (ĜĘĎ TŲ;90 Đườ ↑¢Ô,Ŭ 3ÔS ÃÔŒÚ AEŬ ↑ÃÔĐƯÔ ↑¢Ô,Ŭ ×ĴuÃĈB ĴuĈE 207009ĈE ĴuB •Ô'Pḥ, ŶĬÔ 9Ô4EĂ Æŭ. ‡9Ô 66 ÃŨS>ŨE ĈE 56 ÃŨS>ŨE ŸŐĴú ĴuĎOÕÃÔ 9ĈE ÃŐ, ĎuĎ, ŭ #\$\text{\$\textit{\$\te are discussing the basic issue of food security for 80 crore people of the country now. †0'00x8 ¾0'90;0'00,8 †£00 90x40 90; ¤iĝ0 0x8 Æ0x00 Œµ00 20'90 ¤0, µ0Æii ×0x0 ^A08 0x0 ^0'00Þ0 AEÚ. ÃÔCÔ "ÔSÔOTE ĈE †ÔTE "ÔĐÚ ÛNS AEÚ. †ÔTÊ ÝÔ ACÔ ÚNS ÛNS ÔNDE THE TRANS ÛNS. 1971 ĈE †ÔÔĐÊ YÔ, GPÔS ÆÐYІÔE ŨƯŨ ĐÔ, Đ YỮŨÊ ×¤ JŨŐ, »ÔE XŨƯĐ YÔ, GPÔS †ÔŌÃÔE ÆÐYB ĐŨĒĂ... †Ô∙Ô TŒJŪ ¤ặ.Ô †ÔÔÂŒ •ÔÃĐÔ ỞƯỚŌ ¼ĐÔ ÆÜL †ÝŌÜ 66 ÂŨ≫ŨË ŰE ÝŨ, GPŮB ®VĐĐ ÆĐYB †ŨÜ ÝŨ, GPŮ ÂŶĐÔ-PŮ ÂŒ † 1.0900 | dê 0700 jii 1000 újii † 1090ê 10 dê 10 ji AO 0£00 °þið AGE ÚG>10 °97£11. Æde 100,40, ‡ AOÚ£8 ∞ 0 ′0€40,6 UúDOCAO ÆGI ÆGI. †YO_ ¢‡AO ⊀O»O UúD AQBO »O®OE UúB ÆGGÞÍI †OTO'OE 'O''OB ÆGI YOOE ‡AO °OO'O Uú. UúD ¢ÞO 308 †070 Æ**18** Æ1ji Æ1ji0ë µ0Æ1ji 308 A070-0 »0£70 "00Æ1jik...

¿ΰ¸ μετί ΤΟΧΟς μι • CB + ܸ μι ²000 μβ ΑΘΟς εἰ Ομάθοθο Ο εί » «Φίθο Ομάθοθο ΑΕ΄ π. «Ο μι ΑΕ΄ ΘΕΘΕ < Θ < ΑΘΟ ΦΕ΄ ΘΕΘΕ «Ο ΑΘΟ ΘΕ΄ Ε΄ ΘΕΘΕΘΕ ΑΕ΄ ΑΘΟ ΑΘΟ Ε΄ Ε΄ ΘΕΘΕΘΕ ΑΕ΄ ΑΘΟ ΑΘΟ ΑΘΟ Ε΄ Ε΄ Ε΄ ΘΕΘΕΘΕ ΑΕ΄ ΑΘΟ ΑΘΟ Ε΄ Α

ÃŌ¸Ÿ 'Ö ‡ÃŌ ¾Ō»Ō Ō¸Ÿ Ûð"Ŷ ²OOYŒ ÛVÆÐ®Ō "OOÆÑOO ÆÐÆ

^**-(Ā/PΦ-μῶο (ÁCB ³ΦΔΡΦ-Δὰ Ü ŪŪ»Ở) :** †ÖΟΩΒ ¯Ö™ā Ūé ĀŒ**Ô** 11 ×Ö¶™ü ²Ö"Œ Æū †Ö¸ü "Ö¸ü Ā-ŪΟŪÃЮ ²ΌΟΩΒ Æū....(**¾ΦΑΟΘ)...**

ÁÚS "ỚૅṇĒĐ ÝƯỢĐÔ>Ö: ÃиŲ <≫Ü,†ÜĒÚS. ĐƯÔ •ÜÊ ™ÔḤŤÖ ĐƯÔ, ¾ÕḤŪ ^ÃĐŪĖ ≫ Ü•Œ™Ü ੴAÐ ÆÐÆÐ "ŰÐÆÜK... He was just moving the Resolution.

^-**căipio-pico (aos ³obero 30 ii Olo**»oroo : 30ei ≫ i **c**e™i ¶vei Aoloo Ai.

Á**ÖB TÖLDÖÐ YÖÐÐÖÐ :** †ÖÖ ^TÖDÜÐE 2006Ö ¤GA-ÖK, ^TÆÐEÐE ^TÖDÜÐE ‡TE»ÖBEÜ ×ÐÚHÖÖ ÆÜ**....(34074-007)...**

^⁻ÖÄÜÖÖÇÖĞ (ÄÖB ³ÖZÜÄB³ÄÇÜÜÛÜ»ÖÖÖ) : ¾ÄEÜ ≫ BÆÜE [®]ÖEĞ ÆÜÜÖ ÆÜ**....(¾ÖÄĞÖÖ)...**<Ȇ,†ÖEÖB. ÛÜÖ ™Ö‡Ö ≫ürŒ™ü ®ÖÆã ÆÖÆÖÖ Æü.

ÁÖB TÖLÜÇÖ •ÖDAĞ DÜÇÜ: ÃÖ,Ü, ÖL YÖS9Ö-"ÖÖ,Ü ×Ö9ÖMÜ TÜE † Ö9ÖB 20ÖYÖ ÃÖ TÖÖYÖ ÛÚ,Ü **JETÖ AFÓ**E **^~OACPOD;IOSO (ÁOB 3020204330 ii ÛUO>>OVO) :** †00 2008>0<...

ÁÖB ⁻ŰDŰÇÖ ∙ŰÐÆ≻ÐÚÚ∷ ÃÖ¸Ü ′Ő "ÖÖ¸Ü ×Ö°Ö™Ü ŐE †Ö°ÖB °ÖÖYÖ ÃÖ′ÖÖYÖ ÛÚ¸Ü **'ÆÖ** Æ**Ó**E

>**0 °0>0'00 <. ÆÐÚNG:>0** : ĀÔŢŲ <>ÔŢŮĒĠŖ. °ŨĒ ×•OÃÔ TÔŢŬ 200600 £ÔÔ, ¾ÆÜ Ā™ŒŒŸŲ 8 ŢĒ ÛŌ\$ŲŪÆŨŦŨ ŸŒ**à** Æ**Ö**ĒÖ "ÖÖÆÜK......**(¾ÖÖÖÖÖ)...**

^~**CĂĞ CÖ-JUĞĞ (ÁĞB 3Ğ22FQB3Q ü ÛJĞ>>ÖVĞ) :** 3ÅEÜ ‡¶E>ÖRÜ ÇÖEĞ ÆĞĞÖ...

ÁÖB ⁻ÜÜdÇÖ ∙ÖDXÒ≻Ðú́цü: ŠBÛú ÆÜ ÃÖ¸ü. †ÖÖÛdÖ −Ö°PÞÖXÖ¤ü.

^**~~ÖÄĞYĞP_İLÖĞÖ (ÁĞB 3ĞBİYĞPŞZ**Ç**Ü ÛLĞ>>ÖYÖ) :** †20 †ÖÖ ÄÖYÖYÖ ÛLB>+ÖK, ŒLIĞBÛÚ †ÖÖÜĞ 20ÖLB Ã~ÖDÛÁĞÔ Û LÛÊ ÂÛ ÇILÛ "ÊVEN × Û» Û LÛÛ.....(340°A CÛFÛ)...

ÁÖB TÔUÔÇÔ •ÔĐÃĐ-ĐÚŲÜ: Ö ÃÖ ÖÖYÖ ÛÚŲÜ **LEÖ ALÉ...(3/07/2-ÖFT)...**Ö †Ö,Ü TÖÖÖ ×ÖYÖMÜ 2ÖDSÖYÉ ¾ÖDSÖÖ ÆLÉ: »ÜŞÛLIĞÖ, ÃÖ,Ü ÜÖÖ^A ÃÜ**,Ö**ÖÖ ÛLB...**(¾ÖĞ-ÖÖĞ)**...

^**-ďAČPÖÐJÖĞ (ÁÖB 3ÖZÐÐASQ ü ÛdÖ×ÖÖÖ) :** YÖYÖ ×±ú, ü †Ö'ÖÖGB "ÖÖM" ÖLÖÖ ×ÖÐÖM"ü 2Ö'ÖKÖ, ŒJÖŒÛú †ÖÖÜÉ "ÖÖ¸Ü Ã-ÖSÛúÃÖÖ ÆŪ....**(¾Ď&ÖÖŤ)...**

ÁÖB ⁻ŰŪŪÇÖ ∙ÖXÐ>ÐÚÚÜ: †ÖÖÜÐ ÛÆÐ,ÞÖ ¤ÞÖÖ ÛÐ ×ÐÚÃÖÖÐ ÛÆ, ÜÖÐÖÆÜÜ Ö-Ö¤ÆÜ ÛÆ, ÝÖ,ÞÖ ÛÆ ·†ŇyūDejiÖ †®Ö yūDeÖ9ÖC ÛxB TÖLENÖ ÛxB †Ö,Ü ‡ÃÖ yÜDeÖ9Ö Ûé «Ö,Ö œÖLÖ Ûú,Öe ù TÖ,ĕKÖ,ÖE ÛxDe ¤Ğe †Ö,ü ŸÖK®Ö ¹ýÖk - ŐE 35 ×Ûú»ÖÜE †®Ö•Ö ¤ÞÐE ÛúÖ ÛúÖÖ ¿ÖÞþ ×ÛúµÖÖ... ŸÖÜE ÜÖÖ? - ÃÖçöÖÖ Ûúß μÖÆÜ ÃOŒCÔOÚ ;ŒŊŶŦŎŸŎ ŦŶŎŢŬ ×ÔVÃŌB ŶĠĿÔVB, ŸŎŒŧ†™ĠĸŎ ×ÔŒÔŢB ¾ŎŌ+ÖŤĠĸŌB •ŌB ŶĠĿÔVB... †2Ö ŢŎŶŒ:•ŌŎÓÚŢŬ "¢08Ã0Y0œù ®e ^Ã0'0E <Ã00 †-µ0Qu0 •00€10, •0E ¤Û0®E †Ö,ü Ã0'0-0®E »0Qu00ú ²00Y0 Æü. †ÖÖ Û€Â\$>0 ÜÖÖ? ĀĞĻĪÖÖ ÛLÖ ×ÖSÖ »ÖÖ LÆFE ÆŢI »ĞÐÚTŶÖ "ŒÖĞĀÖYÖLLİ ÝÖE ±LÖYĞĞÖÖ ÛLB ×ÃĞELJÜĞL TYB ÛLB, ±LÖYÖÖ ÛLB ×ÃŒĿĮŒĿŖĬŶĠ ÛĸĠ, "ŒĿŒ;ÖŸŌ ÛĸĠ ×ÃŒĿĮŒĠĿŖĬŶĠ ÛĸĠ †Ö,Ü ×ÃĨŸŶŖŲĠĿĠŸŌ ÛĸĠ ×ÃŒĿĮŒĠĿŖĬŶĠ ÛĸĠ, ‡ÃÖ×Ö< ¾ÆŒĨĬ ±és ii xÃOŒHOOB, PMG ÃOŒOOÚ AGÉ ÝO‡Ô †Ö, ii •OOE ÃO°Ö OUĞE ×Ösö , MEG AGI. OERASÖ 10 <Oús ii xeÖÄÖOGS dÃÔ×'ÔĬÔ 3Ô¢Ô ÆŨ †Ô,Ŭ ‡®Ô ‡®ÔÚÔ ™ŒÃÔ ÆŨ XÃŒŨ "ÔÔ\$À ÔÚ,Ũ ÃßÔÚÔE XÃÆÔÔ HÔŒŬ ×ÔSÔ ,ÑEÔ ÆŨ †Ô,Ŭ ŒŅĪŒ ×ÔSŐ ĮĪĒŌ ÆŲ ŒŅĪŒŪÚ •ÔŦŌŎ ÛŒÃSŐ ÖÖÖÖ »ÖÜÜÖ ™ŒÐ ±ÚÃŌSŐ ÛŒ ŪŒĻĪŒÇŒŒŬŒ ÆŌŒR ĒŪS, ¾ÆĒŎ †Ö∙Ö 50 »ÖÖÜÖ ™6°Ö Ûuß ÆĞE ÆĞE ÆĞ ŒµÖĞÊÛu Ûĕ¦ü Ûuß <Ö.<ÃÖ.Ö. ÃÖE •µÖ⊃¤Ö ÖÄÖÖ ″¢ÖßÃÖYÖceÙ † Î9TE ×ÛvÃOOPOE ÛvGE ¤E jEEO ÆÜL YOOE µÔÆÜ ÛvÛ 9TE ÛvÛ YO OÛvÛ ÆDEO ÆÜL ^ÃO9TE ≫™MPµGEO9D 9TE MÔÛÛ ĐƯỢC \$YŮPŮÔ ÃĞGÔ, Ô, \$YŮPŮÔ TÔĐÔ Ô\$PÔ ĐỘ ĐƯỢC ĐƯ TỘI TỘU \$YŮPŮÔ ×, ĐÔSÔ ™Ô\$TÔ ÔĐÔ Ở ÔĐÔ Ở ÔĐÔ ĐƯƠ ĐƯ ĐỦ ĐỦA ĐI 3'B »ÖDÓé•Ö °ÖÆNA ÆĞE JÆB ÆĞ. ^ÃÖ'ÖE JÖ;Ö'Ö ÛGB ÃÖÖ,B ¤ÐUÖ'ÖÖE ÛGB ÃEÖÖ'Ö'ÖÖ °Ö< ×ÃÖ E ÃË ÖD ÛGB AEŭ. PÔÆŬ <ÛÚ †""N ZÊNÝTÖYÖ ÛÚB AEŬ. XÛÁÄÖÖÖ ÛÚÊ ×ÔE 1ÝÖ< TÖYÖ XÛÓSÖE ÛÚB ×ŬE 2ÖDEÄÄÖ ×Ð , ME ČĒ ĀĒŪ µÖÖPÖB TÖKYÖ ØŒ¾Ö™ÖSÖ ¤ÖE ÃÖÖ 1√°Ö< ¤ĕ MEĞ ÆÜL.

^ OĀŪOJOĞ (ÁÜB 30200A3Q ii OŪŠ×ÖVĞ) : ÛĒŪJOĞ †ÖÖ ĀĞÜÖYÖ ÛŒS•Ök...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Now, Dr. Karan Singh – not there. Dr. Bhalchandra Mungekar.

DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (Nominated): Sir, I thank you for allowing me to participate in this important debate. At the outset, and with utmost gratitude, I congratulate the Congress President, Shrimati Sonia Gandhi, who is the architect of this historic legislation. Some experts criticised her personally for originating it, but she remained steadfast in her commitment to the poor people because she represents the voice of the poor in the country. I also congratulate Hon. Prime Minister, Dr. Manmohan Singh, and the UPA partners for bringing in this historic legislation.

Sir, the Bill has two dimensions. One is philosophical and the second is that of logistics.

Sir, millions of people in this country joined the freedom movement under the leadership of the Indian National Congress, but it was not only for political freedom, i.e., right to vote in every five years. It was also for the enhancement of the material welfare, that is, sustained improvement in their living conditions. They fought for freedom from colonial exploitation to end poverty, unemployment and destitution. The Constitution of India, therefore, committed to create a 'welfare State'. Within the vision of Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru, the country accepted economic

planning as the strategy for economic growth with equal distribution of the benefits of economic development.

Sir, even the worst critic of India's development strategy will have to admit that whatever economic growth has taken place in the country has benefited all sections of the society. But, regretfully, due to the unequal social structure – caste, gender, etc. – and all kinds of rigidities, all sections of the society could not equitably share the benefits of economic growth. It is in this background that the country witnessed the disaster that the slogan of 'Shining India' could lead to.

Therefore, the Congress-led UPA Government adopted 'Rights-based' approach to the economic development in the Eleventh Five Year Plan, implying that the improvement in the living conditions of the people is not at the mercy of the Government of the day, but it is the right of the people. It is in this context that the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme, the Tribal Forest Land Rights Act, the Right to Free and Compulsory Education and the Right to Information are the shining examples of the Rights-based approach to development. I am aware of some of the shortcomings of these schemes very closely, but nobody can deny the fact that these schemes have improved the lives of millions of people, needy and poor people, in the country, particularly in the rural areas.

Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, Right to Food Security is the most important addition to this agenda of Rights-based approach to development. I call it 'most important' because all other Constitutional rights could be enjoyed by a person only if he or she exists. Right to Food Security gives a person the right to existence. Since the details of the Bill are well known, I would straightway deal with some of the apprehensions and criticisms of the Bill.

I will begin with the Statutory Motion moved by the hon. Leader of the Opposition. Sir, he was talking about the political exigency while moving this Bill and bringing the Ordinance at the cost of the Constitutional propriety. Sir, it is accused that the Bill is politically motivated. The point is that after coming to power in May, 2009, in the election manifesto, this promise was given that the Bill relating to food security will be introduced.

Exactly after two-and-a-half years, in December, 2011, this Bill was introduced. Since then, the Parliament was not allowed to function. Only on 5th July, the

Ordinance was issued because there was no other option. The hon. Leader of the Opposition just now mentioned that this was the political exigency. Sir, I spent my career as a teacher, and, that is why, I am not fully trained in settling political scores. But even assuming that it as a political exigency, I think, that political exigency is still better than the demolition of the Babri Masjid in 1992 for coming to political power in this country. ...(Interruptions)... Madam, please.

Sir, on the one hand, there is implicit consensus on the Bill, all political parties, with some differences, have approved the Bill in Lok Sabha, then, why should there be criticism? I understand that there are some valid points of criticism, but the major reason for the criticism is the political fear in the minds of the Opposition parties that this Bill will give political mileage to the Congress. This is the main fear, which they are not able to overcome. If at all, suppose the Congress takes the benefit of this, the Congress is not a party of *sadhus and sanyasis*, preaching *Vasudeva Kutumbakam*, and, actually going for violence.

Sir, in a country like India, the food security is of fundamental importance. I am reminded of Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru's words, when he said in 1928, and, I quote, "India was a classic land of famines, where famines are not caused for want of food, but for want, amongst the masses of money to buy food". Panditji said this 52 years before Professor Amartya Sen developed his celebrated theory of economic entitlements only in 1980. It is due to this that the Bill guarantees prescribed quota of foodgrains at affordable prices. These prices will remain in vogue only for three years, and, then, they will be revised but, in any case, they will not be above the Minimum Support Prices.

Thirdly, the Bill is heavily criticized because it covers 810 million, or, 81 crore people when the poverty is declining. I think, Sir, people are missing the point that this is statutory and justiciable Fundamental Right. It is not dealing with poverty. The poverty has nothing to do with it. Secondly, the most important point is that if we take into account the World Bank's norm of \$2 a day poverty, which is called the median poverty, and, which is not taken into account in this debate at all, then, automatically, 81 crore people are covered under median poverty. Sir, I do not understand as to how people forget that only a few days ago, we were discussing Rs. 27 a day for rural areas, and, Rs. 30 a day for urban areas as the lowest cut-off points.

5.00 P.M.

(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.)

Now, when we are taking \$2 a day poverty benchmark, which, at the current exchange rate comes to Rs. 124, what is the objection? It is just contradiction. Another point is that my Leftist friends, whom I value very much, have been demanding universalisation of the food security. I absolutely share their concern. But I will only say that at present, the Bill covers 61 per cent of the population and is near universal. I wish, in course of time, the Government will actually make this scheme universal.

My fourth point is about the cost of implementation of this Bill. Some critics are frightening by arguing that the additional cost of the Bill will be Rs.1.25 lakh crore . A prominent economist, who is writing in a daily, has estimated the cost of Rs.3.14 lakh crore, just another discovery after Einstein, and, that is 3.0 per cent of the GDP. Surprisingly, one prominent former Union Finance Minister quoted this figure of Rs.3.14 lakh crore, unmindfully, without questioning the statistical or methodological blunder that the prominent economist made while estimating the cost of its implementation.

Sir, if the Bill is fully implemented, the maximum cost, according to my own estimate, may go up to Rs. 1.35 lakh crore rather than Rs. 1.25 lakh crore, which will be approximately 1.2 per cent of the GDP, and, if this PDS is properly restructured and improved, then, I think, the cost can be brought down to one per cent of the GDP.

And, even I go further. Suppose the cost is 1.3 per cent. So what? Congress President is on the record - and I fully support her - that if there are no resources, resources are to be made available for the poor people because ultimately for whom is this growth?

Sir, as Mr. Dua has just now mentioned, it is most distressing. Who are the critics? I can understand the political parties in the game of parliamentary politics will be criticizing on political fronts. But who are the serious critics? The serious critics are the people who have reaped the benefits of post-1991 economic reforms and who used practically every imported consumer item, including perhaps the toilet paper, and contributed towards the deterioration of the current account deficit.

They are the ones who are opposing the Food Security Bill. They are condemning it as 'wastage' of the resources. The same clan has been vociferously condemning the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme as 'fundmuzzling'. Many people here referred to Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme - forgetting the fact that nearly five to six crore poor unskilled rural households are annually getting around 250 to 300 person days of employment. I, therefore, strongly denounce such people's anti-poor stance and treat it unethical.

Sir, some argue that the Bill is anti-farmers. We have heard it here. It is a travesty of truth. Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, today, Minimum Support Prices, just now my colleague, Mr. Javadekar, was speaking, are protecting the interests of the farmers more than the consumers. (Time-bell rings) If the Government withdraws from the market, we must have... (Time-bell rings). Sir, I am having time. Basically, the point is... (Time-bell rings)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR: Sir, I think I am given fifteen minutes.

Sir, the basic question is the Minimum Support Prices are protecting the farmers, because if the Minimum Support Price mechanism is withdrawn, the farmers will be the losers because of the imperfections of the market and the role of the middlemen.

Sir, the Food Security Bill will not distort the market prices, because it is only additional five-six million tons of foodgrains required to be procured for the PDS. That will not distort the market, because it will also withdraw that much demand from the market.

Sir, I compliment the Government for three or four other reasons. I am completing within two-three minutes, Sir. First, the Government did not introduce...(Time-bell rings)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please conclude.

DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR: No, no, I will conclude after two or three minutes, please.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no time.

109

- DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR: Sir, the Government did not introduce the voucher system for the food security as some of the so-called experts were consistently demanding.
 - MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Everybody has to adhere to the time-limit.
- DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR: It was first recommended by Milton Friedman...
- MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have taken ten minutes. Ten minutes would do.
- DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR: Sir, let me complete silently. It was first recommended by Milton Friedman for American society. India is not America. Sir, today only a leading national daily, those who talk of voucher system, has quoted that India's largest private insurance company, ICICI Lombard, has cheated the Government for crores of rupees through false insurance premium claims by creating ghost beneficiaries. The company was given contract for implementing welfare schemes. (Time-bell rings) Sir, the next point is, I understand the Government has agreed to ensure the number of present beneficiaries in different States and it will take further measures to protect the interests of the States. Sir, the Bill prescribes, as Mr. Dua said, the eldest woman as the household head and it will reduce the anti-gender and anti-children bias in the families.

Lastly, food security will now be a justiciable right. The Bill provides for grievance redressal cell mechanism at the district and State level and the States will have flexibility.

- Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, this is the last point. Now, having totally supported the Bill, I am constrained to draw ...
 - MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please conclude.
 - DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR: Only last sentence, Sir.
- MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, your party has so many speakers. Your whip has said to reduce everybody's time.
- DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR: One minute, Sir. By this time, I will complete.

I am constrained to draw the attention of the Government to the challenge of the implementation of this historical legislation, particularly because of the very serious shortcomings of the PDS. I would summarise all the shortcomings as the dominance of "vested interests". The Government will have to totally restructure the working of the PDS to reach the food security to the needy. Sir, I have mentioned that the Lok Sabha has passed this Bill. I congratulate the hon. Members of the Lok Sabha.(Interruptions).... Let this House also pass the Bill unanimously. (Time-bell rings) Sir, one last sentence. The Fifteenth Parliament will go in the history of India's Parliamentary democracy as the one that has given the country's citizens the right to food, right to existence. Thank you very much.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, hon. Members, unless ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL (Punjab): Sir, I want to raise one point. You gave so much time ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Is it a point or point of order?

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: One minute, Sir. Then, there are six speakers from the principal Opposition Party. Small parties are then given three minutes each. This is not fair. You have been promising us all along that consideration would be given to us also. But if this goes on, we will all be in the Well and this debate will not go on.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have made your point. Gujralji raised an important point. I agree with him. But from 'Others' category, there are 14 speakers, and the total time for them is 47 minutes. How much time will one hon. Member get? I think it will be less than four minutes. That is my problem. Take five minutes and cooperate. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: What is this? This has been going on for so long. I have been protesting it for six years.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You should know that we are governed by Rules.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: This is not fair. You have to change the Rules. Just because we are a small Party...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Gujralji, please sit down.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: I come from a food State.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Gujralji, we are governed by Rules. I am telling you that I am ready to curtail the time of major Parties. Even that is not possible because not much time is left allocated to the BJP. It is only the Congress Party ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: So, Sir, let the BJP and the Congress Party run the House and we all will go out. Then what are we doing here?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am ready to reduce it. It is for those Parties to do that.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, we can extend the time. Voting can take place tomorrow morning. What is the great difficulty in this? I am not able to understand it.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is for the House to decide.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: All other Parties should get a fair opportunity.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then I will be very happy. Venkaiahji, I will be most happy if you agree to extend the time allocated for discussion and give time to everybody. I really want to give time to everybody.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: We agree to it. We have no problem.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I really want to give time to everybody. Nareshji, my sympathies are with you.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: We can sit up to 6.30 p.m. ...(Interruptions)... We can have voting tomorrow. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have made your point. Dr. V. Maitreyan. My humble request to everybody is, please keep to the time. Your Party's time is ten minutes.

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, on behalf of All India Anna DMK, I rise to oppose the National Food Security Bill, 2013. My Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu Dr Puratchi Thalaivi has taken a consistent and principled stand against the Food Security Bill since it is against the interest of Tamil Nadu. When the draft Bill

was approved by the UPA Government in 2011, my Chief Minister wrote to the Prime Minister as early as on 20th December 2011 opposing the Bill vehemently. She reiterated her opposition in the meetings of the National Development Council (NDC) held on 27th December 2012 and 10th June 2013. When the UPA Government issued the Food Security Ordinance in July 2013 prior to the Monsoon Session of Parliament, our Chief Minister again wrote to the Prime Minister on 2nd August 2013 wherein she had suggested several amendments to the Bill. Again, prior to the Lok Sabha taking up the Bill on 26th August, my Chief Minister wrote to the Prime Minister on 24th August 2013. Hence, our stand is consistent and principled. To protect the interest of Tamil Nadu, we oppose the National Food Security Bill, 2013. We will definitely vote against the Bill. I have moved nine amendments. We will insist on them and demand division on each of them at the time of voting.

Now, I shall come to why we oppose the National Food Security Bill. One, while you have agreed to protect the existing level of allocation under the PDS, Mr. Thomas, you have left the fixation of issue price to the discretion of the Central Government. When this matter was raised by the AIADMK in the Lok Sabha, we demanded that difference in the quantity between what has been assured through clause 3(1) and what is eligible under clause 3(1) read with clause 3(2) should be supplied to the State at the price of Rs. 3 per kg or at least at the current price applicable for the APL families, that is Rs.8.30 per kg. Mr. Thomas, in your reply in the Lok Sabha, you had assured that it indeed would be the APL price of Rs.8.30 per kg. But you did not bring any amendment to this effect. That is why we oppose this Bill.

Two, Clause 3(2) of the Bill says that 75 per cent of the rural population and 50 per cent of the urban population will be covered. This is totally arbitrary without any rational basis. It should not be forgotten that PDS was originally put in place to ensure affordable supply of foodgrains primarily in urban areas. Hence, my Chief Minister had demanded to increase the urban coverage to 100 per cent or at least 75 per cent on a par with rural areas. This has not been accepted. And that is why we oppose this Bill.

Three, Schedule 1 of the Bill assures even limited allocation of foodgrains only for a period of three years. My Chief Minister had demanded an amendment to Schedule-I and guarantee subsidy for a period of at least ten years. You have

ignored her request and that is why, we oppose this Bill. Fourthly, the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu had suggested that clause 23 should be amended to make it compulsory for the Central Government to implement all necessary measures including import of foodgrains, when warranted, to ensure continued supply and not leave the States to fend for themselves. You have not acted upon that and that is why, we oppose this Bill. Fifthly, according to clause 10(1), identification of eligible households should be completed in 365 days. Since this is contingent on the completion of the National Population Register and the Socio Economic and Caste Census, SECC, whether one year is enough, is not sure. You have not made any amendment to this and that is why, we oppose this Bill. Sixthly, as per clause 12(2)(h), there is a provision for the Central Government to introduce cash transfer programmes and food coupon schemes under this Bill. The AIADMK is firmly opposed to the direct cash transfer programme and hence, we oppose this Bill. Seventhly, clause 37 gives the Central Government unfettered freedom to amend Schedule-I, Schedule-II, Schedule-III and Schedule-IV as and when it wishes. Clause 38 gives power to the Central Government to give directions to the State Governments for implementation of the provisions of the Bill and that the State Governments shall comply with such directions. Both clauses 37 and 38 strike at the very root of federalism. In a federal structure like ours, the Union Government should not encroach into the domain of the State Governments. Hence, we oppose this Bill. But, there are parties which opposed the Bill in the States, which opposed the Bill while speaking in Lok Sabha, but voted for the Bill and the UPA during voting. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...(Interruptions)... It is not about you. ...(Interruptions)... Vasanthiji, it is not about you. Why do you worry? ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: In fact, a voice from Chennai screamed on 11th August that their party will support the Bill only when various important amendments are accepted by the Government. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has not mentioned the name of the party. ...(Interruptions)... He has not mentioned the name of the party. Then, why do you worry? ...(Interruptions)... He didn't mention your party's name. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Except for a single addition in clause 3 of the Bill, protecting the existing level of allocation and offtake of foodgrains under the PDS, none of the amendments moved by various political parties has been accepted by the UPA Government. Yet, my opponents from Tamil Nadu voted for the National Food Security Bill in the Lok Sabha and I am sure, they will repeat the same today also. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: 'Opponents' is all right. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: If I have to borrow the words of Mr. Venkaiah Naidu, operation in Chennai and cooperation in Delhi is rank opportunism and great * on the people of Tamil Nadu. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: 'Opponents' is only practical. Why do you worry? You can reply. When your chance comes, you can reply.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Now, I will focus on the Congress Ministers from Tamil Nadu. I don't see Mr. Chidambaram here. Najmaji, will you help me see whether Jayanthiji is here? I wanted to ask Mr. Rajeev Shukla whether Mr. G.K. Wasan is here. But, Mr. Rajeev Shukla himself is not here.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why do you worry about them?

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Because these three Congress Cabinet Ministers from Tamil Nadu were present when the Union Cabinet approved the Food Security Bill. By approving the Food Security Bill in the Cabinet, these three Congress Cabinet Ministers from Tamil Nadu have * the people of Tamil Nadu. We have two more Ministers from Tamil Nadu and adjoining Puducherry –Narayanasamyji and Dr. Sudarsana Natchiappan. All of them have * the interest of Tamil Nadu. ...(Interruptions)...

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): Sir, he has called my name. ...(Interruptions)... I have to reply. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you take names, they have a right to reply. ...(Interruptions)...

^{*}Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

- DR. V. MAITREYAN: They can reply, Sir. I have no problem. ... (Interruptions)... I am concluding in two minutes. ... (Interruptions)...
- MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: So, don't take names. ...(Interruptions)... Then, he has a right to intervene. ...(Interruptions)... Don't take names.
- SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Since he has taken my name, I will respond. ...(Interruptions)... Since he called my name, I have to respond to him. ...(Interruptions)...
- MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, * is an allegation. So, I expunge it. It is an allegation. So, I will expunge the names.(Interruptions).....
- DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, very soon all will be expelled from Tamil Nadu. Sir, the people of Tamil Nadu will reject the DMK Party and the Congress Party(Interruptions)..... I challenge you to make the Food Security Bill as a referendum among the Tamil Nadu people; and go to the next Lok Sabha elections. Tamil Nadu people will throw you lock, stock and barrel into the Bay of Bengal. Thank you.
- MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will go through the record.(Interruptions).....* is unparliamentary. It is expunged.
- SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Before you give your ruling, if any Member, while making a speech or a submission in the House and takes the name of the other Member, the Member can be given an opportunity to explain. But the Chair expunging the name, it never happened.
- MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am saying the word * has been expunged. ...(Interruptions)... I agree. Now, you please take your seat. If any Member takes the name of the other Member, who is a Member here and who can come here, he can defend himself. So, names are not expunged. What I expunged is *(Interruptions)..... Mr. Narayanasamy has a right to explain.
- SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, since the hon. Member has taken my name, I have a right to explain. Whether you count it or not, let me make my point clear.

^{*}Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Sir, under the Food Security Bill, the Government of India is giving a subsidy to the tune of Rs. 24 per kg of rice. As far as rice is concerned, the State Government's contribution is only Rs. 3.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: The Government of India doesn't get money from the heaven.(Interruptions).....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, you can't intervene.(Interruptions)..... Dr. Maitreyan can't intervene.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: It is my money also. Let me make it very clear.(Interruptions).....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is replying because you took his name.(*Interruptions*)..... It is the Minister's right to explain because you took his name. ...(*Interruptions*)... Dr. Maitreyan should not intervene. You please take your seat.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: It is my money. It is your money. Let me make it very clear. In the case of Tamil Nadu, free rice is given to the people. The publicity is being given that the State Government is giving free rice to the people. But the Central Government is giving a subsidy of Rs. 24 per kg on rice. Most of the people know about this. ...(Interruptions)....

DR. V. MAITREYAN: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not going on record. Dr. Maitreyan's speech is over. What Dr. Maitreyan says will not go on record.(*Interruptions*)..... Mr. Narayanasamy, please. It is only a friendly exchange between Mr. Narayanasamy and Dr. Maitreyan. They are good friends. That's all. Shrimati Kanimozhi. Let us listen to the lady Member, please. Hon. lady Member is going to speak, let us listen to her.

^{*}Not recorded.

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I do not need concession as a lady Member when somebody is saying ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I said, hon'ble lady Member. Not a special consideration. Hon. lady Member. You are always hon. lady Member.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: If she is refusing, why should you object to it?

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: Yes, I have an equal right. That's all. I don't need special consideration.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes. I didn't say special consideration. You have an equal right.

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: Thank you, Sir. In 2012, the Minister of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions and Minister of Statistics and Programme Implementation released a report titled, "Children in India". This report estimates that close to 40 per cent of children, that is, 63 million children, are suffering from malnutrition.

It is also reported that 50.7 per cent rural children and 39 per cent urban children are stunted, that is, less height for the age. This indicates that the rural children are at a greater disadvantage. When we talk about the Global Hunger Index, we are nearly on a par with Ethiopia, Sudan and Angola. It is a collective responsibility. All of us are to be blamed for this. Keeping this in mind, when a Bill comes to protect these children, when a Bill comes to make sure that people don't go hungry, I support it because our leader, Dr. Kalaignar and our Party definitely believe in making sure that there is a more equal society, there is a chance and choice for everybody and people are protected and the right to food is a basic right of every Indian. Saying this, I support this Bill and welcome it.

Sir, I would like to proudly share this with the House. People have been talking about many States who have done very well in food security. I think one of the model States is Tamil Nadu. In Tamil Nadu, PDS was started in 1964 and now the Universal PDS has been started, that is, there is no discrimination between APL and BPL families. This Universal PDS was brought by the DMK Government. Sir, the Universal PDS in Tamil Nadu is actually run by the cooperative societies, Women SHGs and Tamil Nadu Civil Supplies Corporation. All these agencies come

together to make sure that the PDS is successful and it ensures transparency, safety and accessibility. Here people were talking in different voices; voices coming from here and contradicting themselves. I would just like to give an example about what a master contradiction this is. In 1996, the Central Government tried to bring Targeted PDS and it wanted even Tamil Nadu and many other States to have Targeted PDS. The then DMK Government in 1997 refused to give into it and we continued with the Universal PDS, but in 2003, the then AIADMK Government wanted to go back in time and they wanted to distort this Universal PDS. We all know that colourful cards were brought in; red cards, yellow cards, rainbow colour cards with 'H' stamp. In Tamil Nadu, it is called H Muthirai and I don't think the people of Tamil Nadu have forgotten it, and will ever forgive that Government...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: That is why they voted for us in 2011 with a thumping majority. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, please ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: Sir, just winning an election is not everything.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: People had voted for us. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, no running commentary, please.

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: When political parties only know about winning and losing elections and they don't have any concern for the State and its people, this is what the response will be.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, that is why...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, please do not interrupt. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: Sir, one Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu said ...(Interruptions)... people dying in a war ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't bring in Tamil Nadu politics here. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: It is a very, very normal thing and they are very proud of the Chief Minister who has been voted to power. ...(Interruptions)... This was actually talking in different tongues. They wanted to bring back Targeted PDS, but actually the Government had to go back on its decision because there was a stiff opposition from all parties and the people in the State. It is very funny that these people today are talking about protecting the people. On 9th August, our President, Dr. Kalaignar, in a statement had written to the Central Government to make sure that the concerns being raised by us have to be respected and the Bill has appropriate provisions to protect the off-take of food grains, only then will we support this Bill.

And, on 26th August, the DMK President again urged upon the Government to ensure the supply of APL foodgrains at Rs.8.30 per kg, as is the case now. The Minister, who spoke that evening in the Lok Sabha, after the discussion, stated, and I quote: Eighteen States, including Tamil Nadu and Kerala, are not getting what they are supposed to get under the TPDS. I discussed it with Shri Baalu, — the Leader of the DMK Parliamentary Party — and told him that whatever is the off-take in the last three years in respect of all the States will be completely protected. For example, in the case of Tamil Nadu, their average off-take is 37 lakh tonnes. There are OMS and special BPL schemes which will continue. Even now we are getting OMS's supply of foodgrains. But the TPDS' off-take in the case of Tamil Nadu is around 37 lakhs in relation to the Food Security Bill. It has come down to 27 lakhs. I assure him that the remaining 14 lakhs will be protected, and it will be at the price which they are getting now under the APL, that is, rice at the rate of Rs. 8.30 per kg. so that it is fully protected."(Interruptions)....

DR. V. MAITREYAN: This is not seen in this Bill which has been circulated.

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: There were amendments made which have been brought into the Bill.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please conclude.

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: A few minutes more, Sir. I further quote: "Out of 27 lakh tonnes, 7 lakh tonnes will be provided at Rs. 3 per kg and the rest 22 lakh tonnes are to be given at Rs. 5.65. Now the Central Government will be giving the entire rice for BPL families at Rs. 3 per kg. This means that the State's burden to

provide food will be greatly reduced." Sir, I would like to mention here that the DMK will never accept anything which goes against the people of Tamil Nadu, and I don't think that the Central Government will also want to bring in anything to offend or hurt anybody, especially, Tamil Nadu, in this case because we have, repeatedly, been asking for assurances from the Central Government to make sure that the interests of Tamil Nadu and other States, which are performing well, are protected.

Sir, there are a few concerns on the National Food Security Bill, which I would like to mention here. (i) Nutrition comes from a well-balanced and all-rounded meal. The Government is only providing rice, wheat and coarse grains. Can the Government consider including pulses either now or in the future? (ii) Fair Price Shops are essential for the distribution of rice and wheat and the implementation of the Food Security law. But the Bill is silent on improving infrastructure of existing Fair Price Shops. The Government may consider providing assistance for modernizing Fair Price Shops. (iii) In clause 3 (1), the Bill specifies that priority households shall get 5 kilos per person per month. In the case of poor widows and homeless people, I don't think that this will be enough. Also, will the hon. Minister think of making sure that even homeless people are taken into consideration and are brought under this Bill? (iv) In clause 4 (b), the Bill provides maternity benefits, that is, one meal for pregnant and lactating mothers. Can the hon. Minister explain as to what mechanism will be put in place to provide cooked meal to such a large number of pregnant and lactating mothers? (v) In Clause 5 (1) (b), the Bill provides entitlements for school-going children up to class VIII, that is, fourteen years of age, by way of mid-day meals. Will the Government consider extending it up to class XII? Even in Tamil Nadu we have the Mid-Day Meal Scheme and it is given till Class XII because we cannot leave the rest of the children without considering nutrition requirements for them.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please conclude. You have made all the points.

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: (vi) In Clause 23, the Bill provides the option that the Centre may provide funds when there is a short supply of foodgrains. Does this mean that the States would have to make their own arrangements? When the Centre is unable to arrange foodgrains, then, how will the States be able to do so? (vii) In Clause 38, it is stated that the Central Government can give directions

to the State Governments. Can the Central Government consider a better way of putting it? The food security is not enough. Even in the recent speech of the Prime Minister, he has pointed out that sanitation and drinking water are very important and are an important health ...(*Time-bell rings*)... factor. Concerns in this have to be taken into account.

SHRI SHASHI BHUSAN BEHERA (Odisha): Sir, on behalf of Biju Janata Dal, I rise to participate in the so-called historic Bill, The National Food Security Bill, 2013 drawn by UPA-II which will keep the nation free from hunger and people will live with dignity. Sir, it gives an assurance to nation that 67 per cent of the population will be covered by this, 80 crores of people will be benefited by this and the per capita allocation will be five kgs per person. Sir, it sounds very healthy but with this scheme the Government wants to cover up shame that we are victims of hunger even after 66 years of Independence. Anyway, the attitude of the ruling party is still unchanged and they have no concern for poverty, they have no concern for the hungry. Sir, it is, I would say, all for 2014 elections. Sir, I am saying this because I was watching television when the Bill was discussed on 26th of last month in Lok Sabha. I saw in the television that a crowd burst clapping was there was patting of tables when an amendment was negatived by a division. Sir, what is that amendment? That amendment was moved by a Biju Janata Dal Member, i.e. to keep the subsidised price of grain at Re. 1 per kg in a uniform manner throughout the nation. Sir, it only speaks about the attitude of the ruling party, which is now being proved here. It creates anomalies and Ministers from the Centre are visiting the States and telling people, like what Mr. Narayanasamy spoke here, that the Centre is giving at Rs. 18 and the State is giving at Rs. 2. Everything will be mitigated when you will agree for Re. 1 as a uniform subsidised price throughout the nation. But they were intolerant. You are intolerant towards the national economic crisis. When the country is in economic crisis, everyday the rupee value is depreciating, gold is at a higher price and you, the Treasury Benches are enjoying. When the Prime Minister is making statements, you are also clapping and patting the tables. Your concern is exposed. So, this is nothing but a political gimmick. You have no political attitude for this Food Security Bill. You just make it a game-changer. What is the present PDS system? It was well discussed by Venkaiahji, Behenji, and other Members also have given details of how much of grains you are giving to the nation.

How much excess money are you spending by making Budgetary provision? This may be a game-changer for you. But, it is completely an election gimmick. Without proper infrastructure and without any preparation for improvement of infrastructure you are bringing this Bill in the election year i.e., just a few months before elections. Sir, it was there in your 2009 Election Manifesto; we are now in 2013. You are bringing this Bill just before elections. Who is responsible for this delay? You have come with this Bill, but there are so many flaws. It is just eyewash.

Sir, food security requires huge preparation. You have not prepared for this. You are not prepared for de-centralized procurement or de-centralized storage which is very much required. Unless you prepare for de-centralized storage system, we will see the same way in which lakes of tons of wheat is rotten. It is all happening because of lack of storage facility.

You have taken up some projects under the ICDS and other programmes. We all know that there is a lot of corruption in the ICDS and other programmes. And, Sir, you are not able to give MSP to farmers. You are not looking at the welfare of the farmers. So, these are lacking in you.

Sir, you are going in for distribution system which is not scientific and is not computerized. And, you have reduced the Ration Cards to 16 crores from 22 crores. There are bogus Ration Cards even within the 16 crore.

I would like to know how you are planning for universalized distribution system. Sir, this is all impossible. For that, doubts come to my mind. You are planning to cover 50 per cent population in urban areas and 75 per cent in rural areas by giving them grains at Rs. 5 per kg.

Sir, currently, the BPL household is entitled to 35 kg per month as per the Central Government norms. It is not being followed by many States, because there are some States like Tamil Nadu and Andhra Pradesh which are catching up...(*Time-bell rings*)...Sir, I will take only 2-3 minutes. You have never given more time to me. Every time I concluded my speech within the given time. I request you to give me one or two minutes.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: For me everybody is equal.

SHRI SHASHI BHUSAN BEHERA: Sir, some States are capping the household allocation to 20-25 kgs like Andhra Pradesh and Tamil Nadu. For a wider coverage, we have to make it more households. This type of flexibility must be given to States.

In my State, my Chief Minister has given such a wider coverage and if you go by this norm, it is beneficial. We are still following the 1997 BPL statistics. Sir, sixteen years have already been passed. What does the NSS 2009-10 speak? It says that a family either of 7 members or more than 7 members constitutes only 10 per cent of the population. And, less than 7 members constitute 90 per cent of the population. So, naturally, they will be the losers. And, only 10 per cent, having 7 members, with 5 kgs foodgrains, will get 35 kgs of foodgrains.

So, ninety per cent of the families or the households would be losers. Therefore, allocation should be made according to the population of the State. That would be better. This is my suggestion. You must make allocation according to the population of the State. As for the approach or the way it should be done, it must be decided by the State Governments. That would help maintain better Centre-State relations. So, a clear and uniform system must be adopted. Otherwise, this would create confusion; I am going only by this part. Let us take a look at the tribal areas in our State such as Malkangiri, Mayurbhanj, Bharipada and the interior areas; if you give 15 kg of food grains to families with two or three members and some other families get 18-20 kg of food grains, this would lead to discrimination and the PDS dealers would be benefited out of this. They will confuse the whole system. There is another thing. If a family has added to its numbers another member, because of marriage or birth, then, they will also have to face difficulties. It will be very difficult to address this. These are some of the things that I wanted to point out.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude now.

SHRI SHASHI BHUSAN BEHERA: Then, the State Governments must be given the choice in the matter of BPL households. Now, what is the criterion in respect of BPL households? It is the *pucca* houses. Now, *pucca* houses were provided by the Government under the Indira Awas Yojana. Will they be deprived of this benefit? You would be denying this benefit to those people. Then, decisions regarding identification, eligibility, etc., must be kept with the State

Governments. SC/ST people, hostels, women and children must be given due importance. As for free rice given under the Annapurna Yojana, there is no mention here. (*Time-bell rings*)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, yes.

SHRI SHASHI BHUSAN BEHERA: Without giving due importance to ...(Time-bell rings)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right. I gave you more time than what you had demanded.

SHRI SHASHI BHUSAN BEHERA: If you do not give due importance to the people belonging to the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes, it would not serve the nation. Thank you.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now Shri D. Raja. Rajaji, I have to say something. What Shri Naresh Gujral said was correct. There are 14 names in the 'Others' category, and the total time allotted is 47 minutes. If you divide it, you get only three-and-a-half minutes. Don't take more than five minutes. This is my humble request.

SHRI D. RAJA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, we too have a humble request to make to you. You must also be considerate.

Sir, it is time we took brave steps forward to eradicate hunger and malnutrition. Article 21 of our Constitution guarantees the fundamental right to life and personal liberty. It includes the right to food also. Then, article 47 also speaks about the fundamental right to nutrition and public health.

Having said this, my Party has been fighting for a strong legislation on food security and the right to food. My Party, along with the other Left Parties, has conducted a countrywide campaign for a strong and effective legislation for food security and the right to food.

Sir, the Government's Bill falls short of many of our expectations and the Government's Bill falls short in its vision also. As many Members have pointed out, it appears as though it is just an extension of all the existing programmes, whereas we need the Government to re-imagine the entire food economy. That is what we expect.

Sir, here, I must list out certain concerns which my Party has got. I have proposed a number of amendments. When we take up the amendments, we would be able to look into those amendments. But, due to the paucity of time, I would only make certain points for the consideration of the House and for the consideration of the Government.

Sir, in this Bill, agriculture and farmers have been neglected. Our hon. Member, Shri Venkaiah Naidu, spoke, in detail, on this issue. Sir, 60 per cent of country's population depends on agriculture. Sir, 52 per cent of food is produced by small and marginal farmers. They are the ones who will be the backbone of this Food Bill. They have to be supported by adequate minimum support prices. Sir, the Bill must put in place a mechanism for procurement from all States in the country and directly from small and marginal farmers, ensuring they get remunerative prices.

Sir, then, I move to the other point. The Public Distribution System coverage, as it is, in the Bill, is not enough. We have been demanding universal coverage. The existing Public Distribution System must be strengthened, streamlined and it should be made universal. Here, I quote the Saxena Committee Report of the Ministry of Rural Development. The Report states, "We respect the view that all basic entitlements should be universal. We believe that the Directive Principles of the State Policy in the Constitution should never be compromised or undermined. Instead, they need to be realized, strengthened and further taken forward. Food for all; Health for all; Education for all; Work for all; these should be taken as the bottom line. The BPL identification exercise should, under no circumstances, be used to dilute these principles. In no way should it be used to exclude people from their basic rights and needs." It is your own Committee, namely, the Saxena Committee of the Rural Development Ministry. This is what that Committee states. That is why we keep demanding that PDS must be made universal.

Sir, here, I would like to emphasize one point. There are States which have relatively better Public Distribution Systems. These existing systems should be protected. In fact, States like Kerala, West Bengal, Tripura, Tamil Nadu, Karnataka, Odisha, and Chhattisgarh have better system. As of now, Tamil Nadu is providing 20 kilograms of foodgrains free of cost to all households under the Universal Public Distribution System. Other States, such as, Chhattisgarh, Karnataka, Andhra Pradesh, Odisha and Madhya Pradesh have, in fact, reduced the price to one rupee per kilogram. These are all existing schemes. ...(*Time-bell rings*)... Whatever the Bill tries to do, it should not affect the existing schemes.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please conclude.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, there are many points, but I will just mention the points. The Public Distribution System which we talk about should be expanded to cover pulses and oil in order to strengthen the nutrition component of the Food Security.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please conclude.

SHRI D. RAJA: Then, the children should be given a central place in the Bill on nutrition. You must take steps to contain the private contractors who are entering into the Mid-Day Meal Scheme or ICD Scheme. Sir, the women empowerment is an issue where you will have to address the concerns of the people from the SCs and STs...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please conclude.

SHRI D. RAJA: I am coming to the end.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But that 'coming' is a 'long coming'. That is the problem.

SHRI D. RAJA: No, Sir, I am going to conclude. Sir, our great poet Thiruvalluvar once said, "If you have no food for your ears, you must throw some food for your stomach". I am giving food for your ears; food for the Government to think and do something better for this country.

Sir, finally, I make one point that this Bill should not adversely impact the federal governance of our country. In many parts of the Bill, the Central Government has retained all powers of decision-making. This goes against the federal nature of our polity. The State Governments must be consulted at every stage. ...(Time-bell rings)... At the same time, given the present state of States' finances, this Bill should not place additional burden on the budgets of the State Governments. The Central Government should take the responsibility of contributing to all or the majority share of all cost related to the entitlement under the scheme including PDS, ...(Time-bell rings)... maternity entitlement, ICDS, ...(Time-bell rings)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Do not take so much of advantage. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, this is a serious issue. ...(Time-bell rings)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If everybody takes this much time, what will I do? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI D. RAJA: Let me quote our great poet, Subramaniya Bharathi...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can quote it later sometime. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI D. RAJA: If there is no food for one individual, we should destroy the world. That is what Subramaniya Bharathi, our great poet said: *

Let us understand the anguish and anger of the people. After 63 years of Independence, our people are undergoing starvation, semi-starvation. It is time we addressed this issue with all seriousness to ensure right to food and food security to all citizens of our country. Thank you.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If everybody takes this much of freedom, then we cannot pass it till 10.00 p.m.

SHRI D. RAJA: We will sit up to 10 o' clock. ...(Interruptions)... Lok Sabha sat till 11.30 p.m., Rajya Sabha can also sit. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am very happy. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI D. RAJA: We can sit tomorrow.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We have to pass it today. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI D. RAJA: We cannot pass such a legislation in a hurry, in a haste. There should be some comprehensive debate on the Bill.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: When time was allotted, you were also there. You could have given this opinion at the time of allotment of time.

SHRI D. RAJA: We said it. I share with Mr. Naresh Gujral. We raised this issue. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now Shri Rangasayee Ramakrishna. Please take only six minutes.

^{*}Hon. Member spoke in Tamil.

SHRI RANGASAYEE RAMAKRISHNA (KARNATAKA): You have already given me a good comment for brevity the other day. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know that. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RANGASAYEE RAMAKRISHNA: Sir, due to time constraint, I will certainly flag only a few issues and leave them to be pondered over by the hon. Members. The first thing I would like to say is that this morning Mr. Budania from Congress mentioned that the number of beneficiaries, as he calculated, will be 78 crores. Let me put it even at 80 crores. The market price of rice and wheat for the type of quality which we get in PDS will not be more than Rs.30 per kilogram. So, for five kilos per head for one year, you need Rs.1800 per head. If you calculate that way, you will be spending only Rs.1.44 lakh crores. Is it not a much better system of putting this Rs.1800 in the accounts of the 80 crores people and ask them to fend for themselves? Instead of that we continue with the existing system with all its infirmities like centralized procurement, the PDS, unavailability of wagons, lack of storage space and we continue to have twin spectacle of grains rotting in one place and people starving on the other side. This is number one. Number two, this morning we also pointed out how despite the Bill citing as many as 20 or 25 items in which they need State Government's implementation this is a classic case where you have not consulted the Chief Ministers even once. Now, I would like to recall that when we started our post-Independence era, there was a very good tradition of consulting the Chief Ministers even on issues which were, essentially, the Central subjects. I will reminisce on my own experience. I was a Deputy Secretary in the Ministry of Finance in 1966. At that time, we had administered devaluation. In 1966, we devalued one dollar from 4.7 rupees to 7.5 rupees. That day, we, all the officers, were called and asked to wait in the office. Then, there was a letter, from the Prime Minister to each Chief Minister, given to us. We were sent as messengers to go to individual Chief Ministers, discuss with them and get their concurrence. This was on devaluation, which has nothing to do with the States. Today, on an issue, where for everything you have to depend on the State Governments, you did not feel it necessary to consult the State Governments at all. This is number two.

Number three, I want to flag a very broad issue. We have two different models of attacking poverty. One is the growth model with a trickle-down effect

Security Bill, 2013

6.00 P.M.

and the other one is a direct attack on poverty. The first one is a little difficult to achieve because, administratively, it takes a longer time, but it is well-sustainable. What we are tempted to always is to prefer a direct attack on poverty like the one here. In this particular case, I am really aghast that we have included even ablebodied, employed and employable people for public doles. This will completely demoralise the society. You take the case of Western countries like the United States or the UK where unbridled social security has completely changed the social fabric of their countries. Today, a country like the USA is surviving only on immigrants. Now, do we want to drive our country to that type of situation? Soon after Independence, we rightly dismantled feudal structures, jaagirdari, jamindari and the privy purses. But feudalism has been rearing its head from time to time and masses have been longing for a bygone mai-baap culture. In the classic debates on the relative merits of growth and the trickle- down effects and direct attack on poverty, one traces a natural preference for the easier option of the latter. The Food Security Bill is a classic case of this mindset. In fact, not only the Central Government, but the State Governments also have been vying with each other to provide a cradle to grave provisioning of freebies. Now, this is a very wrong system of converting a robust nation into an army of parasites. So, my suggestion would be that we should confine food security only to destitutes, senior citizens, infants and expecting mothers. Now, how do we do it? The first suggestion which I have made is that you make a direct subvention of Rs.30/- per kilo for five kilos in bank accounts, which will be a much easier method and much neater method. You can dismantle the entire leviathan of the Food Corporation of India, the defective system of warehousing, the insufficient wagon space and all. But if you do not want to do it, then, the better way will be to empower panchayats.

We have been dealing with Panchayat Raj only in the Constitution document. But we have really not empowered them.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes. Now conclude, please.

SHRI RANGASAYEE RAMAKRISHNA: Sir, I am concluding. So, make food security the responsibility of the local Panchayat and the Panchayat can also coordinate with religious institutions like gurdwaras, temples, mosques and churches. They can provide for feeding destitutes, senior citizens, infants and expectant mothers.

Even for the buffer-stocking of grains, instead of having a centralized system, we can leave that to the *Panchayat* because, I think, ever since the PL-480 days, we really have not had a situation where we need a huge buffer-stocking.

Now, this morning also, there were many interventions on the impact of this Bill on agriculture. Today, the reality of the situation is that agricultural production is largely in the hands of small holdings where people are growing crops only for their own consumption. Now, if these people are also promised doles from the Government, where is the need for them to grow crops for themselves? ...(*Time-bell rings*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Ramakrishnaji, please conclude.

SHRI RANGASAYEE RAMAKRISHNA: Sir, I will conclude.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am forced to request you. I know you are making very good points. I know that.

SHRI RANGASAYEE RAMAKRISHNA: Just two minutes, Sir.

The last thing I wanted to mention was about the absolutely wrong-timing of this Bill. Next day or two, we are also going to consider the Land Acquisition Bill. Now, we all know that the country is passing through a very grave economic crisis. And, what are we doing? We are adding to fiscal deficit by this Bill and the small holding people will now find getting doles more attractive than their growing crops. They will sell away their lands under the promised higher earnings in the Land Acquisition Act. What is going to happen? What will be the future of this country? So, I think, it is a very, very highly ill-timed introduction of populist legislation which we should have avoided.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now Prof. Alka Balram Kshatriya. Please take only ten minutes.

- THE T > COLOR TO THE PLANT TO THE PART OF THE PART

ÃÖ, ĐƯỜ, Ľ ĐƯỜE »TOƯỚE ĐƯỜ • ĐƯỚĐ - ÃYÔ, Ľ ‰ీƯỚ ^ SỐPĐE ĐÉ ≫ÔK • ĐŨE Đứ≃TỔ ^ SỐPĐE "COMEIK, ^ÃÖ ÃƯỚĐ ĐỞ 'ČE ÆŬÖ »ÖĞĞÖ ÜÖÖ[™] ÄÜQÖÖÖ ×ÖsÖ Ûê °Þ"Ö 'ČE <ÛÚ †ÆŬÖ ÛÚ¤ŬÖ ^šÖPE •ÖÖ ¸ÆE ÆŪ. 'ÖÆÖE°ÖÖ, ¤ÞÖ ÔưB TÔ-CÔ×B ÔÉ XÂNÔ ÁCE »ÔĐƯ, C TÔ-Ô YÔÔU ¤ẹÔ 90E 20ANO ÔƯB ACC. ACC ¤LŨ ŅĒC ACC ĀC ¤ạō Ôé »COÉCE ÔƯƠ •CBÂPO ÃYÔ; ũ ÔƯƠ±US %Đ'ƠO ^SỐ Æũ †Ö, ũ »COÉCE ÔƯƠ ÙG E Ô † ĈŒÚ »ODBÃPO ÖYEGGE ÃČE ÔƯбƯA 2**ĐE**ĐÔÇIU ÆDË ÝQUỐO ÆŲ »ČEÔƯ® ±Ú,U 3˚B PÔÆU ÔƯ™E ÃÕ/PÔ ÆU ×ÔÚ ¤ẹÔ ČE †Ö∙Ö 3˚B Ôe''Û »OĐÃO ÝÔ, OPÔB †Ô, Ŭ 30ĐÔ Ô, B Ô ĐÉ ½, ÔÔ ĐÔ, Ŭ ĀŢĪ †Ô, Ŭ ^9Ô ĐÉ 20Ô, Ě ÔE 3ÔB ÆŬÔ »OĐÃO Ĉ Ô ĐỀ Ã ĐƯỢC ĐƯỚC Ã ĐƯỢC ĐƯỚC Â ĐƯỢC ĐƯỚC Â.C. •OČE »OČEÓ ÝÖ, GPÖB, ³OĞÜÖ Ö, B †Ö, Ü ÛÐ ÖÖÐÖÞÖ ÜE ×ÖÖNÖ, Ü ÆÐŲ ^®OÚÉ ²ÖÖ, È ÜE ÆÜÜE Ø'ÖŸÖPÖ ÚÚ, GPÖÖ "ÖÖÆÜK †Ů, U ŤĠ+ĈĿ ÆÂŎŎ ÆŬ ×Ûú ÆŬŐ, B ŤÖ™Ġ ÛvB †+uÔoŐŎ ÁÔSŤŰŸÔS ÃŐŒŶŶŨŎŎ ÝŐŬĤOS ŶĔĿ ¤ġŮ Û¢Ŀ »ÔŒŐŒ Û¢Ŀ‡ÃŨ †×30;00°0 Ûé 200,ĕ ÔE ® AÖ±Ô 0°0'0'0 •00AEiji Ûúß AEï 20×0Ú ^®Ôúê ××0< Ûé″û Ûúji Ý0è0,€®ê Ûé 3AÖQIÔ¤ĕ ÛúÔÊ †Ö∙Ö ÖQÐÐ 3ÖB xÛúQIÖ Æü.

†Ojü ^AO ¾OQ10¤ë Üú0è "Cepið ÜújePõe Üé ∞O< µOÆü UOOª AOJiŏOO ¾A-OpOUú »OQ10O YOµOO Æü. "ÔVEÔBEŅIÖ, ÛNE"Û »ÖDÊÖ ‡ÃÖ ÜÖÖP ÃŌQNÖÖ ¾ÃÐ-QNÖÚÚ ÛNE 2ÖĞNE 'ÖE ÛNE"Û ÃÖXPÖD»Ö ^SÖÜ NETE ÆTÜ. ÛNE"Û »ÖDÊÖ ^ÂOUê »0090ê Ûê ÂŬŶŪŎ Ûê 200,ê 'ÔE μΟΟ ^ÂOUê "ΦΙΧΑ-ΦΟΡΟΘ Ûê 200,ê 'ÛE ÛÚ‡Ô ÂŌΧΑΟΝÔ ^SÔO ,ÆE ÆŪL. 'Ô TÔ ĐƯỢC TO THỘ Ở THE NGƯỢC THE ĐƯỢC THE ĐƯỢC THE ĐƯỢC ĐƯỢC THỊ THỆ THỊ THỊ THE TREE THE TREE THE TREE THE T • CÔE 20010 - CÚ4EG - EÔS, ^ ÃŨE CE3KÔCE'Ŭ - CÚ4, GEÔO "CÔYENGUS... ^ "PACÔPER - CÚ4EJÔ - EÔO - CÚ4 "- CÚ4" Û » CÓÉ O HÔFEŬ - ÃÔFGÔS Ô ^šŎĬĬĊĿÆĪĪ×ÛÚ ŒĻĬŎ ÆĬĬŎŢĖŗŌŎĀŌ ‡ÃĬŎĠĿ‰Ö< ÃĬŎĿŌŸŌ ÆÐ? Ő ^ŸŎĀĠĿÛÚÆÐŸŌ "ÖŬÆĬĬĠ ÆÐÉ×ŶÚ ÃÖÄÖSÖ ÃOÔÔŸŌĒ ÛNÔ ŸŒĖ, ‡ÃOŨÉ ≫Ô< ÆŬĈĒ ÃOÔÔŸÔ •ÔBYÔŸŌE ÆÐÂĬĈĒ. ŨÉZÛ ÖŒKYŌE ÆŪ «ŨÚ ŒŅOÕ ŅŌÆŬ «ŨÚŅOÕ •ÖÖ ÃÔĐƯỢCÔ ÆT? Ở ^ĐÃĐE ĐứÆTRÔ "ÔPERÔS ÆTÁE ĐÚ pÔTET ÃÔXÔS Ô ĐƯƯM ĐÚ Œ ĐÔ ÆTÍÔ PÔTET ĐÚ Tà ĐÔƯỢCE ÆTI μÖÖ TÖVEĞ, ÆÜĞE μÖEÜ ÛÚ, (PÖÖ ÆM ÆŬ. ÛĞ"Ù ÃÖKÖDSÖ ^ŠÖNÖE ÆŪ XÛÚ ŒμÖÖ μÖÆÜ XÖSÖ ÂÛÁÄÖĞTÜE ÛĞ ÆÜÖ TÚE AER? TÚ ^®VÁCE ÚMEARD "ÖVENÜB AER ÐÚ ÚGÁÐ †Ú,U ÐÚÁDÐ, ÞÆRÐE AB AUÐJA ®BRÝÚNÚE ÚÐ TÖÐÚÐ † \$60 \$\text{A\$10}\$. \$\text{A\$10}\$\text{P\$6}\$ \tag{\text{\$\$\exittit{\$\texititt{\$\text{\$\texitt{\$\exititt{\$\text{\$\text{\$\text{\$\text{\$\text{\$\text{\$\text{\$\text{\$

růtelderijið, rði †öröOlá röð-jiðrð Árðe rðlæði ∞iþjó Úldðe «Úlú Áðderiþjó ∞defðo "öðvetilðis Ælde †öljú jiðvetú ²ðÆlilð Ã-Ô™ũ ÃÔĐĐĐÔ ÆŨ ×Ôú µÔÆŨ <Ôú ¿ÔĐÝTÔŸÔ ÆŨ. TÝÔ¸Ũ •ÔYݸŮÔ ÆĐĐÔ ŸÔÔE TÔŸÔE ÆŨŐ ^ÃÔ ÔE ²Ô≈ďSÔĐÔ »ÖÖ ÃÖDÁÍYÖE ÆTÜ. ¤ġÖ ÜĞ ÝÖ_GPÖ "Ö+ÖÖÖ XÖYÖÖ ÜĞ »ÖÖĞÜE ÜĞ ×»Ök •ÖÜE ÜÚ¤ŬÖ µÖÆÜ ÃÖ_ÜÜĞÜ ^SÖ _ŒÆB .Æÿ ^ÄÖ'ÜE †ÖÖ ÄÖPÖ "ÖÖM'NE ÄÜE %vĩÖ_ü ^\$NDÚ_ü †"Ö9ÖÖ ÄÖ'ÜEOÖÖ ¤B⊷Ök... ‡ÄÖDE ^ŞĕµÖ †Ö_ü 3ÖÖXÂ9ÖÖ†ÜE ÛuÛê ÂÔÔ-Ô<, TÔ XÛú TÔÔ ‡ÂÔ TÔ,Ü ÎΕÔTÎBXÔ Ûuß•Ô<...

'ÔVEÔP×ŢĪÔ, 'ÔI µÔVEÜ ÛÚVEOPÔO "ÔOVEŇOS ÆÐÐE ×ŨÚ †ÔTÔ µÔVEÜ ÔVÔ 3ÔD⊕>Ô< ×ŨÚ <ÛÚ ÃÔ'ÔµÔ £ÔO, •ÔPÔ 20000≫Ô TĒ TŪRĐĪĐĪO, 8 ±ĭm>ŪS EŪS, 3ŒJŪTĪ, 8 ±ĭm>ŪS EŪS †Ū, U †ŪvŪmÖ EŪŪ.. ÆTŪTŪ, Ē ¤pēŪ TĒ ŪvÆtā TŪRĐĪTŪ, 8, 3000°0,6 †û,û †û,û †ûdôxô †ö'ö®ê ∞idûo? 'Ô †ö®ê ∞ijê û ê xûdênêdê ûdê 20-dûtê ∞iêê "övelids Æbe xûd <ÃCB -ÃEÖXÖ TE 30B ^9ÆDEEE ^9Ö ÃCPOB †ÖÖ×Ö†TE ÛÜE TÖÇÜ ÜÜLXÜÜ... ÆÜÖ9E ×ÖÜÜ ÂÛÚ ÆÜÖĞ Ã ÃÃÖÖĞ -CH-CÔPPÔ CÔPÔB ‡6×4ÇIÔ •CÔB ÚN ÁÔ CÔHÔ -CÔE AEUÔPÔE AEU£NÔ Ô Ô CÔPÔ Ô CÔB... <ÚÚ ÁÔ CÔHÔ £CÔ, •CPÔ AEUÔ † CÔE,DÛAÔ ÃĈĖ »CÔ»Ô YŮÆĐĒ †ÔµOOYÔ ÛÚ, BYĈE EĈĘ »ĈŒÛÚ®O †Ö•Ô ÆŬOÔ, Ē ŌOÃÔ YŮÆĐĒ ÛÚB ²Ö´Ö, Ü Ō¤ÐRĐÔ, Ü ÆŨ ÆŬÔŌ, Ē -ÖÖÄÖ 2ÖÆÜÖ 2Ö>DÖ Ã™ÖÖDÚ ÆÜL †Ö∙Ö ÆÜÖ ®ÖÖĞÖİÄÑ™Ü †Ö¸Ü "Öç″Ö'Ö ÛÆ ÛÆ"Û ¸Ö•µÖÖE Ûúß ´Ö¤Erü ÃÖE ¤BBO_G AEÿ,NO ONO9YO OUB †ČĘŮ †YOAÖ,Ů AEÖE "WEB AEŬ †Ö,Ů AEŬOO,Ë µÖAEŎO "ÖDAĞ»Ö OUB "Ö¤ÖAÖÖ,Ü ²ÖAENÖ ²Ôceü ş**iEB A**Eÿ µÔÆÜ ³ÖB ÆÜÖÖŞÜ ≫Ö< ÜĞĞĞB ÛWB ²ÖÖYÖ ÆÜL. ‡ÃÖÜÜ ≫Ö< ´Ö ÖçGÜ ÃÖ¤ÐÖ ÛWB YÖŞÜŁÚ ÃÖE †Ö,Ü †Ö'ÖÜÁB ŸÖ,ËLÚ ÃÜE ×ÛÁÄÖÖ®ÜE ÛÁÜE 2Ö-ÖÖ‡Ô ¤£RÖÖ "ÖÖÆLÏÖB ÆLÆ

ÖVENÖENIÖ, Ö µÖVENÖÖ ÜTE''N 2ÖÖYÜE •ÖPÞ, Ü ÛVÆETÖÖ "ÖÖENÉÖS… †3ÖS ÖÖPÜE ÄÜTÖÖÖ ×ÛÚ ®ÖÜKÖÖ, ÖÜKÜÖÖÖÖ ″itônãô/Celi Úur 20070 Úúju jæti Ede. ^®tápēde Úu⁄tá Edo xÚú ″itônãô/Celi de ‡ãoãde †"″r µdie 0°90 atu. †ÝÖ, ü ¾ÄÆÜ µÖĞEÖPÖÖ †"″**6** ÆÑ, ŸÖĞE ÆÜÖ ÄÖPÖ •Ö°Þ, ü ^ÄÖÖL® ÄÖ, ÖÆGPÖÖ ÛÚ, NÖĞ; »ĞEÖLEPÖ †ÖÖ ″0CÖXÄÖ/ÖceÌI ÔUB ÆB 2007Ô 107Ô ÛUB×ÔK... †ÖTÖ •ÖÆBÖ ÃÜE "ÔBPÔÚLÜ Ü ‡ÃÖ ÃÖ¤BPÖ ÜE †ÖK ÆÜ ¾BÆÜ 'Ö•µÖ YÜBFÖ'ÖNÖ ÆÜ, •ÖÆÖÖ ÃÜE Ö 3ÖB †ÖİÖB ÆÐE †ÖÖ ^ÃÖÖÚB 2ÖÖYÖ 3ÖB ŸÖÜE ÛÚB≻Ö<... ÆÜÖ®ÜE ¤ÓÜÖÖ ×ÛÚ ×Ö″òsÜE ‡»ÔŒ;ÔPÔ ÃĈE ÔÆBBÔE ÝÔBÔ,ĐƯỜ ĐÁ 200, ĐÍ ÔE TỚO »ÔĐĐÔE PÔE ÝÔ,ĐPÔ ĐÚBVHÔĐÔ ÔBÔÔ TÔ, Ũ <ÃĈE ĐƯỜ±ÚS ÃÕ, PRO THE THE PROPOSITION NO THE CONTRACT OF THE PROPOSITION OF THE PROPOSITION OF THE PROPOSITION OF THE P ŸŎŢŒŨĸß ÆŧŧÔ Æij »ŒŨĸŶŌ †ÖÖÖxß Æß ÃŎŢŴĸĎŢÜ Ûŧ, ÝŌĸŎŢŎĬĬŎ ÃŎŢŴĸĎŢŬ Ûŧ †ÖŎĸŹŧ Ő †ÖÖÖxĞŧ ²ÖŸÖŌŶŎ "CÔÆBÎOB ÆÐE. †ÖTÖLOB ³CÔ•ŌTÖÖ ¿CÔÃÃÕTÖ ÝŒFŐ,ŌTÖ ÃŐ,ÔLÔĞ,Ü ÛE ÝCÔTÔÞÐ ×ÃÔLÔÃŐ ÚÚ×Ú;ÔŦÐ °Œ µÔÆB ÚÚÆÐ ÆÜ ×ÛÚ ¾ÂÂÔÔ 2000 ĈE ÝŨŧŎ,ŌĬĬŎ ĈE 23.29 >ÖÖÜÖ ±Ĭĸ´Ö>Öß•Ö ²ÖĞÖS<>Ö ČE EÖA, •ÖÜE ¾ÂÄÖÖ 2012 ČE ²CceÌDú,ü 30.49 »CCÜÖ ÆĞE YÖ‡Ô ÆŢ µCÖ°BS ×Ûú ²CS'GS<»Ö ±ĭx'Ö>CS•Ö ÛúS ÃCÖµCÖ ²CceÌ YÖ‡Ô Æĭi. YCCê Öï ÃÔ×ĐPÔ Đề "CÔ+ĐỞÔ ÃCE ^®ĐÃCE CHEĐPÔO "CÔÆBIÔS ÆĐE ĐÚ †ÝÔ; ũ ÝCEÔ, ĐƯÔ ×ÃÔ CHÔÃÔ ĐÚ, ũ ŢIEDÔ ÆŬ, ŸÔCE ×±ú, ũ YO_GPOCE LIGB ĀCODIPCO ‡ŸOPOB ŒPCCE ZCELI ÎNEB ÆGP ‡ĀCB>>O< CO OMÆGPO "COZENCO ÆGE YOU ÆGIO ĀCPCOLICE ͺΦ•Ô90xXÖ ÃĈE %xĩŌ,ü ^šxĐú, 11Ö,04'ÖE Ûé ∞xÖk, ¤ẹ,Ö Ûé Ö+,Ö'Ö ¾ÃYÖÖ Ûé ∞xÖk, ×Ö''Þà ¾ÃYÖÖ Ûé ∞xÖk •CÔE HÔTEU ×ÔNÔ TỘHÔO ÆÑ ^ÃÔÔHÔ ÃÔ ŒCÔĐÔ ĐÚ ĐỀÔ "CÔMEIK TỔ ỦI HÔTEU ÃỚ ÔN TOƯỚCE ĐÉ XNÔK •ÔP H.B. ÆÑ. Uú, 698 "ODÆik, »OBUť90 pOÆi •OE Uú¤ió Æij pOÆi Ōœi ¤ijo Ué »Ok »Opoo Yopoo Uú¤ió Æij †Q i pOÆij ÛdÔ¢Ô µÔŒÔŸĨÔ ŸŨÆŇ ÆÑ, »ÔŒÛďŸÔ µÔŒŬ ÛdÔŸÑÐÔ ÆÑ, ∞ÕÃÔŨÆ ŸĨŒÑÔ ^ŸĨŨdĈE ÜÖÖŸĨE ÛdÔ †×ĨŨdÔ, Ŭ ÆŬÔ »ÔŨÊÔ †Ô•Ô ¤ề jiếtê ATU. ‡ÃÔ CÊ ATƯÔ ÃỚPÔ »ÔĐỀÔ 3ÔÔÔS ĐÔI U ATÔE JIẾTÊ ATŲ ‡ÃÔ »Ô< ÔTHĈE »ÔÔÔNÔO ATŪ √ĐÚ ATƯÔ ÃÕPÖŮÚÕE † ÖPÖE †ÖTÖ TÖ,Ü YÖKÖÖ ÆÖEÖÖ "ÖÖVÆÜK...

ŐVEĞEYÜÖ, Ö ÛúVEGYÖÖ "ÖVENÜCS ÆĞEÊ×Ûú ÆĞÖ •ĞYÖ †ÖYÖE «×, JÖÖ ÖE •ÖÖVÜE ÆĞI YÖCE Û61″û »ÖÖKÖ ÛúVENÜCE ÆÜ ×Ûú ÆŬÖÖ,Ê µÖÆÖÖ ²ÖTÖS<»Ö Ûúß •ÖÖE µÖÖ∞ß ²Ö°ÖB ÆÜ ¾ÄÆÜ ŠØÛú °ÖÆÐ ÆÜ.

Ûĕ"û »ÔDKÔ ÛÚÆKÎĈE ÆLÏ ×ÛÚ ÆLÏŐÖ¸Ë 9ÔOÔ 9ÔÆB ÆLÏ. ÛĔ"Û »ÔDKÔ ÛÚÆKÎĈE ÆLÏ ×ÛÚ 2ÔSÔS<»Ô ÛúB »»Ö™ü 'ČE ×°Ö9 »ÖÜÁÜE Ûé °ÖÖ'Ö °ÖÆBİ †Ö9ÖE "ÖÖÆBİK, ^®Ö »ÖÜÁÖE Ûé 3ÖB °ÖÖ'Ö †Ö "ÖĞDE ÆEL. Ûú_BFÖ-Ûú, GPÔ ĂĞPĞB <×, JIĞO•Ö ´ĞE ÆTIĞPĞE <ÂĞB ×ÂEĞYÖ ¤AĞB ÆTÜ. ‡ÄÖ 2001Ö ÜĞE ÆTIĞÖ, E TÜPEĞ ÜĞE ×ÖDEĞ ÆTB ÝVEÐ ÁÐRÍS TÆÐIÐE ÚÐ »ÔÐIÐ •OÐÝVÐE ÆÐI. Ó ÞÖÆÐI ÚVÆÐRÐ "ÖÐENÐS ÆÐE ÞÚÚ ÞÍÐÆÐ ¾ÐÆÐIÐÚÚ ÞÓBÓS<»Ô ÁÐE %ťÔŢÜ ^ŠĐÚŢÜ ²0010 ŪÚŢŇO ÆÜ. µÔÆÜ ÂOĐÁ*ÖTÔ ′009ÔÃOĐÁTÔ ¾0000 ¾0-QHÔÚ °0ÆŬ ÆÜ. ‡ÂŬĈE ²ŪŸŮS<»Ô †Ô, Ü < ÔS<»Ô ¤ÔĐÔĐE ÛNÔ ÃÔ ÔĐÂÇÔ ÆĐE •ÔÔÔÔ ÆË. ÝÔÔÔĐÔ ÔĐỆÔ ÛÐ 75 ŌĤÔ;ÔÔ †Ô, Ŭ ¿ĐÆŬ, B ÕĜÇÔ Ú 6 50 TOXÚ; DYO »ODROČE Ú ÚČE ‡ÁO ¾A-GROÚ Ú ÚÚO »OPO ×Ó»OPE ¾O»O ÆŬ ‡ÁO»O< ÆŬ »ODROČE Ú ÚČE ‡ÁO -×XÃ-CBOOÚ ĐứB ÃÔ ĐƯAĐƯO ĐÚ ĐƯB "COXEIK... ÆŬÔ ÃÔPÔB »COÃÔ •COPÔVÔE ÆŪ ×ĐÚ TÔS>B<ÃÔ ĐứB •CÔE ÃÕßÔB ¤Đườc đị ^90ư Gụ0 đỏo00 đơ đứ0 ¤ĐƯC đị vũ diệc đị x0ú °Co 6×ão μ098 ÃΩΛYC †90•0 Cư ¤Đườc ×UúAO AO'QuO UOB×OYOS ÆÑ, ™OYOO ®OÆÑ, "O×OYOO ÆÑ †Q,Ü UÚPOS YOOE ¾GE UOB×OYOS Æß ®OÆÑ, ÆÑ. ¾OÆÑOO ™O,Ü Æü. ÆüŐ »ÖÖKÖÜE ŰĸŰE ‡ÃÖ ⁻Ö¸ü ³ÜB YÖÆü'Ö OYÖKÖ®Ö Űú'É®Ö "ÖÖÆEÜK… ‡ÃÖ ¾ÃÐ-QÞÖÚú ⁻Ö¸ü ŰúܱuB OYÖKÖ®Ö xÔúµCÔ ÝQµÔ AEŭ †Ö, ŭ Ôœî'û ÔŒÎP®ÔœÔÔ ÔÔRÂ-ÔÔ®Ô ÔS> &<ÃÔ Ôœê 2ÔÔ, ê ÔE 3ÔS xÔú< ÝÔ< AEŭ. × ÔÃÕÃĈE xOŰĞÖE Ôước ^9ÔU đã Từ ĐÃO TX XÔU ĐÃI X XÔN ĐƯỚC ... ^TOÃ PROTO XVÔ TO ĐƯỚC ĐƯỚC TÔ HỘC TO THẨU THE TRANSTORM TO THAT THE TRANSTORM THE TRANSTORM TO THE TRANSTORM THE TRANSTORM TO THE TRANSTORM TO THE TRANSTORM TO THE TRANSTORM THE TRANSTORM TO THE TRANSTORM TO THE TRANSTORM TO THE TRANSTORM TO THE TRANSTORM TO THE TRANSTORM THE TRANSTORM TO THE TRANSTORM TO THE TRANSTORM TO THE TRANSTORM TO THE TRANSTORM TO THE TRANS -×ÃĐ-CBÔŪÚ TỔ, Ü >׌ĐÚ ÃÔ900 'ĆE "Ů"000 ÆĒFÔ †Ô, Ü μÕÆÜ TÕ×, NÕ ÆĒFÔ, ^ÃŌ ×ŒĐÔ ™0.3ÆB. TỔ, Ü ŪĒ"Û "Ů"0°000 ÆGE ÆG £GS, ; CQμΟ=ü ´COUλi™ü Uā''ú ×YO,ü ÆG £CO YCPO Uā''ú ×COĕO μΟÆÜ UúÆÜ ÆG £GE •COE ×COËO † °CPC †O°OOLOGE 20si ib OBABS TOPPVCE AEji TOPEE ^9POUBS "O"OOD ×BUOB, 3AE »OOBO µOEii UuAEii jeEii ECE ×Uú AO¸ibuo¸ii ‡AO ×80-CặCUÚ LƯỚC »OC‡O ÆŲ ‡AOACE ¤ặO LƯỚ ?OOÆO®O ×20YO⊳NOO, ¤ặO LƯỚ †OLECLÚ ×A£O×YO LƯC, OFO ÆOCE •Oc×YOB... ´O` μÖÆÜ ÛÚÆÆÖÖ "ÖÖÆÜÖB ÆÐE ×ÛÚ •Ö?Ö ÃÖ¸ÛÛÖ¸Ü ^ªÖÉÖÜE ÛÉ ≫Ö< ÃÖÄŸÖB •Ö'ÖB®Ö ¤ÖÖB ÆÜ AOAYOB ×20∙0>OB ¤#OB ÆÜ AOAYOO ™OO®B ¤#OB ÆÜ ^QU'OE †@ebú YO_iÆÜ U'OB AO&90+00<0 ¤#OB ÆÜ ^AO ÁÔ QUÔ YCCE TỔ Ô »COỚO Đấ″ Ú °ÔNĐÃ 2005ĐỚCE ATÚ. TỔ COƯỚCE •CCE ÁÔ ZÁÔ B ∞B •CÔ VÔS ATÚ TỔ CÔ ƯỚC •CCE 20DÚ ÃĈE »CŒPÔ ×¤IICÔ •COVCO ÆŬ, ^ÃCÔUĈE †ÔÔ ÃÔÔUÔ ÃĈE ¾ÔOÕÃÔ ®VÆŬ ÛÚ,ŬĈE ‡ÃŬ×Ô< 2ÔÛUĈE ÛÚÔ <®PÔS< 20celi •00700 Æŭ Y070 Y00ê ^€00ê 200 ê Cê Ûwû\$ê "0'000 €0Æê Ûw lido Æŭ. •070 Y0 @Pûtê Ûwûê ¤ûê %ûEY0 Ûwû úďoľók ďkôžaŘ úďoďoľ áli úďo vák sába solikaviú ďó† tör tiða kili úďoľók ďkóžař úľoľók ďkóž kili seker úľoľók •OC×ÝČB... ČEÁČE »OŤOVOČ AEÚ ×ÚÚ ×°ČPÖ »OĎĚČČE ÚĽB <ÃČB ÃČČEŐ ÆÚ, ^°ÇŮÚB ÃČČEŐ ČE ÆB ÚE‴Ú ÝÖÞOÝČB ÆŰ †Ojü ^90 »OOLOGE OLIGE ¤ġO Oé *ÆNO 'ČE ÃŬŒ'Ô9Ö "ÖÖÆEK, ^9ÔUĞE †"Ö9E ÃXŒEÖ Ûé *ÆNÖ 'ČE 9ÖÆB ÂŒĠŶŌ "ŒÆĒĸ... μĹŒŨ 2000 Ở †ŮŒĠ ŒŀĴŮŎ ĂŒ ÂϤÐŎ ŨĠ ŒŀĴŮŎ ĂŒ ^ŶŌ so called 2Œ; œŒ���Œ Ôước ĐƠP Lũ Được ĐĐO "CÔN ĐƯỚC VÀU ^ TÔ ĐƯỚC MặC ĐƯỚC MặC ĐƯỚC TẾ Ã CÔC ĐƯỚC "CÔN ĐƯX... TÝÔ, ũ mặC đưị Viớc ÂÖP Ô Ûtā"û AEŭ. †ÝÖ,Ü ¤¢Ö TÖFEN AEÑEÖ, ŸÖE 3ÃE 3ÔS TÖFEN AEÑEÖE TÖ ^TÖÖE ^¤ÖÖ AEÑEÖE. ∙ÖE ÖÆFRÖÖ Ûú,£TE %XOò>ČE »OXÍO ÆÐ, †YÔ¸Ü XÃE ÆÐ °ÖVÆÐ, ÆÐÍÖÇ ŸÖÜE ×±Ú¸Ü ^®ÖÛÐ ^ªÖĞÖ ÛVÆÐÖ ÃÜE ¾XOÛÖÄÖ ÛÚ¸Ü ÖÖ<NÖ? ^®ÔUÔC ÔEERVÔ ÔU ERÊ ¾ÔXÊ ÝÔ GYÔ »ÔŬÊÔE ÔUÊ ÛÔPÊ ÔUÔ †×ÔÛÔ U ¤ERÊ ¾ÔXÊ ¾Ô-GIÔÚ ÔE 2Ô E ĈE †-098 ÃOCO 20×1098 ÆB -0×168, 20×1098 ÆB -0×168, 20×1098 ÆB -0×168....**(Ac qã ûu ûub '099...**

^~CAG9OTO×YO ~OÆDB¢ijO, ~O ×±ú,ü AGê <Uú ~20,ü ¤i<u>ặ</u>O Ué Uú,**D\$-D**ē YO,DPO »OD¥ODE UúDE UOO®DE UúD †×00 ú0 ji ¤ēte 360>0e †0 ji ^A00 é «ô jõ ¤ẹ, Ö Oé ¾00 ú0ÃÖ ′Öe ^900 úde 300Ý08≈ô, ii ²Ö90°te 360>0e ‡ÃÖ -×AÐ-GBÔUÚ ÚĽIĞÊ ÂŬ CÊCŒPÔ ≃HĨĞE ÆTİK µĞBBK< ÚĽIB "ĞBÖ, TÖÄGÖPÖ CÖTÖTÖRDIÖ ÂÖDEPQHÖÖ YÖDƏÜB •ÖB ÚLĞE †Ö, TI ÆTIĞO, H -ÜHÖÖÐÖÖÐÖB >ÖL ÖÐÖÖÐEÐÖ DÁÖÐEU •ÖB -ÖÐÖÐÖ¤U ¤ÐOB ÆÐE

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

−OLE †»OŪJOĎ ŏÕ≼QÃO : ^−ŌÃØPOTŌÃÔ ÔŒŌŒijŎ, †ŮTÔŸÔE ÔŒPÔE †−ÔŸÔS 2007Ô ÛJÆEÐÆE ÛJÓ ′ŎŨŨJÓ ×¤ijÖÖ, ‡ÃÔ»Ô< 'Ô' †Ö'ÖÛúÔ 3ÔB -ÔPDŒXÔŒÜ ÛÚ,ÑÔB ÆÊE. -ÔPDŒXÔŒÜ.

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI (Rajasthan): Sir, I was first in the list. I did not know that there was no Question Hour today. Otherwise, I was number one on the list. ...(Interruptions)... Kindly give me a few minutes and I won't take a minute longer than you give me.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: After Dr. T.N. Seema, I will call you. Dr. T.N. Seema, your party time is 7 minutes now.

DR. T.N. SEEMA (Kerala) :Sir, give me some more minutes. I am also an hon. lady Member of this House.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Every lady Member is honourable; every Member is honourable.

DR. T.N. SEEMA: Thank you, very much, Sir, for giving me this opportunity. Sir, my Party CPI(M) is a committed supporter of legally mandated right to food. Nobody in this House would oppose the concept of food security for all people in this country. However, a lot of reservation about this Bill remains. Why? Sir, look at the situation in the country. After almost seven decades of Independence, 42 per cent children are mal-nourished.

Vandanaji had described about the pathetic condition of a small malnourished child. Fifty-seven per cent do not have safe drinking water. Thirtynine per cent persons do not have proper kitchens. Fifty-three per cent do not latrine facility. Above all, our country, India, contributes one-third of the hungry people to the global hungry population. But unfortunately, these facts have little impact on our policy-makers and the Government. If we look at this Bill, this Bill is not meant for food security for all. That is my Party's main objection. This Bill can't address the larger issue of malnutrition and hunger in our country. This Bill legalises the injustices of a Targeted Public Distribution System and the Government does introduce the Targeted PDS in a new form with a lesser scope and more limited coverage. Sir, irrational exclusion of population will lead to food insecurity and not food security, and it will worsen the condition of the malnourished in our country. Sir, we demand a universal Public Distribution System. It should be made universal excluding only the income-tax payers. But, this Bill envisages a targeted system by imposing a cap on the inclusion of the beneficiaries. The Government's propaganda is that the Bill will cover 75 per cent of the rural population in all the States and 50 per cent of the urban population, coming to an average of 67 per cent in all the States. But, it is not the case. Sir, it is 67 per cent average for the total national population divided differently in the States on the basis of the criteria decided by the Planning Commission. In fact, 13 States will end up serving less than 67 per cent of their population. Sir, there are many States which are already running good PDS, for example, our State Kerala, Tamil Nadu, Chhattisgarh, West Bengal, Tripura and Odisha. Sir, I want to draw the attention of this House to the situation in Kerala. I am very happy that Shri A.K. Antony and Shri Vayalar Ravi are here. Prof. K.V. Thomas, hon. Minister, is also from Kerala. Kerala had implemented a statutory rationing system to provide rice and other essential items to the people in 1964.

THE MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT (SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH): Hon. Deputy Chairman is also from Kerala.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Chair is neutral.

DR. T.N. SEEMA: This system has been running for the past 50 years and it is a very successful experience. Everybody knows that the State of Kerala has a comparatively better quality of life. Our statutory rationing system has played a historical role in achieving this. Sir, we have about 81 lakh households with ration cards. It is almost universal and an absolutely successful concept of ration cards itself, but in the Food Security Bill, only 46.36 per cent of our population will be included. Hon. Ministers are here. This is a very big challenge that we have to take as to how we will maintain Public Distribution System in Kerala. Sir, look at Tamil Nadu. They have a unique Public Distribution System, which is universal and they are providing 20 kg foodgrains free of cost. They have made a dramatic change in the social indicators and quality of life in Tamil Nadu. What will happen to that? I would like to request the hon. Minister to please ensure that Tamil Nadu people are not deprived of the existing benefit as a result of this legislation.

Sir, with this Bill, there will be a loss on three counts to States like Kerala - cut in allocation, high prices as well as exclusion of APL cardholders. The Government should not see PDS just as an outlet to distribute subsidised food to the poor. It is an alternative mode of intervention by the Government. Through the PDS, the Government can intervene in the market and control the market price. But unfortunately, this Government is not interested in intervening in the market. They are not ready to control the market price. Sir, the claim of the Central Government is that they are giving the right to the State Governments to identify the beneficiaries. But it is only a half truth because the Central Government will draw the *Lakshman Rekha* first and then the States will have to limit themselves within that cap imposed by the Centre.

But they are generously putting the extra financial burden on the State Governments if they want to continue the higher coverage. Look at clause 32(2). Sir, this is totally against the federal structure in the country. The Bill should necessarily allow the States to determine their food delivery system whether in terms of coverage, scope or efficiency.

Sir, in clause 39, as part of the power of the Central Government to make rules, the Bill empowers introduction of cash transfer as 39(d). It must be deleted. Sir, this clause gives the power to the Centre to impose their neo-liberal reforms on PDS including cash transfers even if the State Governments object.

Sir, my next submission is regarding the quantity of entitlements. Our amendment is for giving 7 kilograms of foodgrains per person or 35 kilograms per household, whichever is higher, and, for providing rice at Rs. 2/- per kg. Adequate quantity of other items like sugar, pulses and cooking oil should also be included in the foodgrains because everybody knows that for giving nutritional security, distributing only rice and wheat is not enough.

Sir, I was also a part of the Standing Committee which dealt with this Bill. (Time-bell rings) Personally speaking, it was a very good learning process for me. We got more than one lakh recommendations, suggestions, apprehensions in front of us. Many eminent persons, professors, research scholars, activists, political leaders appeared in front of the Standing Committee and shared their views. Not only in the Standing Committee but in the media and on other platforms also, they have pointed out that even seven kilogram allocation is very less than what is needed for a healthy life. How can the Government reduce the allocation from seven kilograms to five kilograms? What is the justification for that? Even as per the Indian Medical Council for Research estimates, a 5-member household would require about 49 kilograms of foodgrains per month while the Bill provides just 25 kilograms, and, the Government says that they do not have that much foodgrain for making it universal. That is not correct. As per the Food Security Bill, the Government plans to give only five kilograms per head per month, which comes to 60 kilograms per year.

Sir, last Friday, I asked a question regarding per capita allocation of foodgrains and per capita consumption of foodgrains. Let me tell you the answer. As per the figures provided by the Government in this House, per capita

availability of foodgrains in this country for 2012 is provisionally 450 grams per day, that is, total net availability per head will be 164.25 kg per annum. That means, only 36 per cent of the available foodgrain is being given through this Food Security Bill.

Sir, for the last several years, India has a bufferstock of foodgrains, which is more than double its requirement. The expenditure on maintaining this stock is very high.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

DR. T.N. SEEMA: I am concluding, Sir. This shows that there are enough foodgrains available in this country to feed the needy, but the Government needs the political will to do that.

Sir, through you, I urge upon the hon. Minister to delete the Schedule I. It is regarding fixing the price of foodgrains after three years. Actually, this Bill wrongly links the issue price with MSP. I do not know why the Government wants to create confrontation between farmers and consumers in the future. Sir, there is a huge campaign unleashed by the corporate class and the Right Wing Economists that subsidy to the poor is the main villain responsible for the economic crisis and this Food Security Bill deteriorates the financial condition further. (*Time-bell rings*) One minute, Sir. It is not correct that the entire cost of food security law implementation will be less than 01 per cent of our GDP, and, according to the estimate given by the Ministry of Food, the implementation of food security law will not require any substantial increase even the foodgrain requirement.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please.

DR. T.N. SEEMA: One second, Sir. Finally, I wonder what magic the UPA Government is going to play to solve the whole problem of hunger and malnutrition without substantially increasing the subsidy and without increasing the foodgrain. I wonder what magic we are going to watch. (*Time-bell rings*) My last point...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Finally, then, last point, then, very last...

ÁÖB ^ TÄÖPÖÖÖÄÖ : ŠØÛú ÆÜ. †ÖÖ 2ÖKŠÜK...

>**0 ™6 < 0 ÃOSO :** ®Æi, ŸŎĿ»ŌĬŌ †ÖÖÛŒ ²Ō¤iŏŌ ¤ĬŒ.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you. Now, Shri Ram Jethmalani. I hope you will conclude in five minutes, maximum six minutes.

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI : Sir, I assure you that you won't have to ask me to stop.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know you will always keep your word.

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: Sir, I will make points without even converting them into full sentences. Point number one is that this ordinance was a * on the Constitution. The Supreme Court, time and again, has held that the ordinance making power is intended to clothe the executive with a power to deal with sudden emergencies which are neither foreseen nor foreseeable. Poverty has been discussed in this country prior to independence, in the shape of gareebi hatao after the independence and even in July, 2013, something happened that we were compelled to discuss again one of the drastic and the tragic consequences of poverty. Sir, the second point; I am not a saint. I admire even sinners. But I admire those sinners whose heart really does bleed for the poor people of this country. But, Sir, I do hate those whose heart starts bleeding for the first time on the 13th of July, 2013. It is obvious that this is a piece of deception. It is an election stunt. Let us now see the Bill. The description of the Bill is a total misnomer and a falsehood. You are supposed to be dealing with food, the supply of food. The food is not a word which is equivalent to foodgrains. 'Food' has been defined by the United Nations. The United Nations has said that it is permanent access for all to food, nutritionally adapted to quantity and quality and culturally acceptable for a healthy and active life. And, Sir, I want to remind the House of the immortal words of Dr. Swaminathan, one of our great experts, who told us in no unmistakable terms that ultimately food means nutrition, security, goes further, and involves physical, economic and social access to a balanced diet, clean

^{*}Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

drinking water, sanitation and primary health care for every child, woman and man. Sir, you are not providing the food as known to the United Nations, as known to Dr. Swaminathan, one of our greatest experts and as known to every man of common sense. Foodgrains means nutrients, foodgrains means oil, it means *ghee*, it means some condiments, it means some kind of macro nutrients and, Sir, all kinds of things which make food something which ultimately repairs the damage to the human body which our existence causes from moment to moment. Are you are providing security? Security means that which guarantees health; security means that which guarantees the repair of the body continuously against the damage which the working of system inevitably causes to it. Sir, this is not security really. You are providing not food but a means to postpone death and disease for a while. This Bill should not be called the Food Security Bill. I think, Sir, the best description of this Bill will be that it is a Bill for the temporary prevention of death and disease as a result of lack of nutrition.

That is the appropriate and honest description of this Bill. Please do not perpetrate this * on the poor, trusting people of India, who think that today you are giving them some kind of remedy for their long-suffering misery.

Sir, let me tell you that I don't wish to vote for this Bill because I don't wish to be a party to this grave deception on the poor people of this country who expect much more from us. We are giving them nothing but a small lollipop as an exchange for their vote, which we are expecting from them. Thank you, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much for adhering to time limit. D. Bandyopadhyayji, your Party's time is only four minutes. Do not take more than five minutes.

SHRI D. BANDYOPADHYAY (West Bengal): Sir, I always abide by your order.

Sir, long ago, Mahatmaji had said that 'God manifests himself in a morsel of food before a hungry man.' Food is life. Some years ago, in an FAO meeting in Rome, Dr. M.S. Swaminathan was speaking on eradication of hunger. Among the listeners was the former President of Brazil Lula da Silva. He was keenly taking notes. It's heartening to note from the print media that Brazil could successfully implement the programme of 'No Hunger in Brazil by 2015' even before the target date. My point in bringing the Brazilian example is that given sufficient political

^{*}Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

will, it is possible to achieve the 'No Hunger Goal' within a reasonable timeframe in spite of all odds against it.

Sir, I read somewhere and I shall be grateful if someone corrects me that every night 11 per cent of the Indian population goes to bed with hunger. With 1.2 billion population, nearly 11 crore Indians go hungry every night. In spite of glittering average growth of over seven per cent for the last few years, the persistent hunger is not acceptable. It is an ugly blemish on any civilised society and so it is on us.

The usual criticism of PDS is that it does not function properly. No Bill could be perfect and so is this Bill. That does not mean in search of perfection we totally reject this Bill. Let's go by the principle that something is better than nothing.

The main criticism in the malfunctioning of the PDS is the present condition of the PDS in different States. States will have to bear additional load. It is heartening to note that a few recent studies conducted in Koraput, a very backward district in Odisha, found PDS to be functioning fairly well and so did the IIT Sample Survey of nine States which found that 84 per cent of the PDS entitlement was being received by the beneficiaries. Another defect is large exclusion errors. In the new framework, people's entitlement would be much clearer and therefore there would be pressure on the system to function and function properly. The danger is the haste in pushing through the measure without adequate preparation. Identification of eligible households is the basis for programme. There was a BPL Census in 2002. Then it was followed by a Socioeconomic and Caste Census in 2011.

We would like the Government to follow the second census. Thirdly, a good measure should not be used by any party as a political football to be tossed around for a political game. Lastly, Sir, the ICMR's norm for cereal is 14 kilograms per person per month. By assuring five kilograms of cereals per person per month, the Bill assures semi-starvation diet. Semi-starvation diet prolongs the longevity of an individual for some time, but it also ensures a painful existence for the semi-starving persons. In the end, I strongly object to clause 38 of the Bill where the Centre will use the draconian power to do what it wants here and will send the Bill to the States. Hence, Sir, I would say that the Centre should take the entire

responsibility for this. I would only quote that in the year 2011-12, the tax foregone was Rs. 5.33 lakh crore. ...(*Interruptions*)... In 2012-13, the tax foregone is Rs.5.73 lakh crore. Why don't you recover this tax and pay for the Food Security Bill? Thank you, Sir.

MESSAGE FROM THE LOK SABHA - (Contd.)

The National Highways Authority of India (Amendment) Bill, 2012

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Sir, in accordance with the provisions of rule 101 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to inform you that the following amendments made by Rajya Sabha in the National Highways Authority of India (Amendment) Bill, 2012 at its sitting held on 13th August, 2013, were taken into consideration and agreed to by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 2nd September, 2013: —

Enacting Formula

1. That at page 1, line 1, for the word "Sixty-third", the word "Sixty-fourth" be *substituted*.

Clause 1

2. That at page 1, line 3, for the figure "2012", the figure "2013" be *substituted*.

STATUTORY RESOLUTION DISAPPROVING THE NATIONAL FOOD SECURITY ORDINANCE (NO. 7 OF 2013)

AND

THE NATIONAL FOOD SECURITY BILL, 2013 - (Contd)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Amar Singh. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I want to make a submission and also an appeal to the ruling party. A good number of Members want to speak on this Bill. So, let the discussion be over today. Minister's reply and voting can take place tomorrow morning. ...(Interruptions)... That will be ideal. Otherwise you won't get Members. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN (BIHAR): Sir, I oppose. •00 †00 \$UiAB "B•0 UiB ×PopO (PO`ii Oú, ii/Ce Afij. YOCE ÃO'O »OO(O †*O'PCe »>O< ÃO (OpO ×PopO(O) Oú, ii/Ce Afij. (Ge/Ce †0∙0 †0™0PO •00°PO £CÖ, »ĈŒĴŰŶÐ ‡ÃĈĴÓ ĴUĈŢÞÔ ĈŶĈŒ ¾ÃÆĞÔ •ĈŒŶŨ ĴŨĸÃŮĸÔ ×ĴÚĶŨĞ.. µÔÆŒ ×ĸÕÙB-Œ ÆŒ. »ĈŒĴÚ ÃŒŶŨ ŶĈŒ ŢŌĬŎ ÔN 11 - 20-ÔE YÔÔU - 2050 ÔU, U HÔTEU - 20-80 - COÃO - ÂUHHÔO - EÔO... ‡ÃÔ ÔE AEUÔ - ÂUHÔ PÔE - NOHÔ - 2006 PÔE 380-80. AEU?

You conclude today.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now, Shri Amar Singh. Your time is five minutes only.

'Ôb; Ûú»Ö ÃĈE "Ê-ÃOŨYÖ »ÖÛÊÖ †Ö, Ü 2'ÔD»Ö°ÊE ¾ÖD»ĈE ÆÜ. †3'ÖS <Ûú-¤ÔE 'ÖÛ'B 'ČE µÔÆÜ ÜÖY'Ö ÆÜE •ÖÖ≺YÖ...

ÁÖB † Ö,ü QÁÖRÜ (^¢Ö,ü TÖ¤ÁÐ) : TÖPÐPÐAÐ ^TÖÁÐPÖTÖYÖ TÖRÐÞÞJÖ, TÖ ‡ÁÖ TÖRÐYÐTÐRÓ <ÐYÖRÐÁÖDÚ ÜÜÖ^a ÃÜĄMÖÖ ×Ö»Ö ÛÜÖ ÃÖÖEÖÖÖ ÛÚ, (PÖE Ûé ×»Ö< ÜÖ>**Ö** Æ**É**E.

†Ö∙Ö ™ÖNÖ: ÛdÖ»Ö ÃĞE »ÖYÖNÖÇÜ Ö ÃĞPÖB ÖÖPÖPÖDYÖ ÃÖ≥ÃYÜĞE ÛE ¾ÖCEYÖNYÖ ÛdĞE ‡ÃÖ ÃÖ≥EÖ ÖE ÃĞBÖ ,**víľů Ab**é Ã0°00við †°0°00+°0°00 ×±vi00pci Afij Ã0°00 é †°0°0e†°0°0e פŭ000°0 0vi8 ±víÃ0°00 Afij ^°°0•°0 Afii †°0,ii ÃÖ'ÖB ÖBOÚ ĐỂ ÖŒÚ×ĐÃÖE ĐỂ ×ĐO< ×±ưĐƯ ĐỆU ÆŪ.

> ÜÖDÖB TÜTÄ ×XÜÖÖÖ XÜÄÖB ÜÜÖ ×XÜÖRÜ ÄÜE ‡ÃCOPÔ Ö Ç CÓO ÆĞNÖ ÆÜ † ÖPÊ ÛŒÂCœÜ ÂCÊ. ±ưÃO>Đề Đườ Được Được NGC Từ >ĐƯỢC ĐƯƠC Từ >ĐƯỚC ¯ÖÄÛÚ, Ü »ÖÆËEÛIĞE ¯µÖÄÖ °ÖÄÖÖFÖE »ÖYÖE ÆÜ »ÖÖÄÖ... (Œxú»(ÃO ÛdĈe ¤ĎlOÚú ii •OČE Ö Ö ÖÖÖ °ÖÆði ÆÖÖÖÖ, μΌτα ÃO'O ΑΤΆ <ÃCÊ ¿CUÃO ÛLO ‡ÔCOTO TOTA A CÁRCO...

ÃÔ,Ų TÔ ĐƯÆGPÔO "CÔPENTOO ÆGE XĐÚ HÔPEU ÃORADNO ^SÔPPO XĐÚ "CÔPPORÃO CONACPOTO;Ô TĈE HÔPEU 20PENO -ÔveisiQe £00 †û, û †20 Ceµqûe Aeitô Aeii †û, û †Yô, û †20 °Ôveia xÛqµq0 Aeûtû, Yûqê Ûqaeû •00700 Aeii xÛq xÔxĐayÔ xÔúµÔ AEB ®VEia.. ¤iệii TÔx ¤iđyÃYÔ TÔx... µÔEI ÔUAEBÔ xÔú TÔÔ •ÔŒ ¤iệÔ TĈE ÔÚ,BÔE•100 ŢĪĒĒ ĀĒŲ ĀĒŬÖ ×ÛVÃÖB ŢÕ∙µÖ TÖE ²ÖÆBÖ TÖÆBÞÖĒ ²ÖÆBÖÖ †""Ö ÛVŢÜ "ÖĞDÉ ÆÜ,

(^~OÃO°O) HOÃO (ÁO°O'O , ÞŒHŌ "ŒĐŌ, O ~OŠÕÃOS® Æ#Ð

‡ÃÖ∞Ö< 2Ö∙**Ö** Ö9Ö ∞MÖÖÖ9Ö "ÖÖÆÜK… 3ÖÖ‡Ö †19ÞÖ •Œ'BÖB •ÖB ÛUB ‡ÃÖ 2ÖÖÖ ÃÜE Ö ÖBÖÖ 9þ°Ö ÃĈE ÃŬŒŬŎŸŎ ÆGE ×ÛÚ 20> 10 700 ××1000000 "ÖDÆÜK...

†ÝÖ, Ü "ÖĞÖ ÜĞÖ ÜĞĞ Ö %ÖĞEYÖ "ÖĞ ÖÖ ÖÖĞ "ÖYEРפĞÖÖ , **EEĞ A**EÇ YÖĞ "Ö YÖĞ †ÖĞĞĞ †"ÖS»Ö ÜǶİYÖÖ ÖÜHÜK 3Ö ÖL¶Ü, 169ÖÖÖÖÖÖÖ 0 ÖÜÜ 3ÖÖ 9ÖÖÖÖ† 10Û XÖ×XÖVÜ ÖÖBBÜÖÄ ÜÜÜ ÖÜÜK ÖÖÖ ÖÖÖ ÖÖÖ 10 ÖÖ AEŲ ¾ÕAEU ŪUÖÖ µÕAEU ÃÖ,ŪUÖ,U †Ö,U µÖAĞB< ŪUÖ ¶ÜKÖRÄÖ ÖREC ¤piÖ ŐE ŪÚ,PŘE •ÖÖ "NECÖ AEU. ŪÚŌEÕ ŸÖÜE 20⊳10 '0'90 ××10'00k... †Ý0, ü ‡-0, ü 00•00608 ÆÜ Ÿ00ê ^-0, ü 01ê »0060 ××10'00k0 †ü. ^-0, ü 00•00608 ÆÜ ŸÖĞE ‡-Ö,Ü ÛNE »ÖĞĞÖ ×¤NÜĞÖ≺Ö ŒµÖĞÐÚÚ YÖ,DPÖĞE ÛNĞE ÖNĞE ÜNĞE İĞEYB ¤PÖĞE †Ö,Ü ÖCPÜ ÛNB 3ÖHÖ ÛNE ÖÖTÖSĞE ÖE ÄÖĞÖÖ

ÔưA ÁCQIĐO Đế TỚ Ô ĐỀ CỆ ¤ĐƯ ĐƯA TOÔN ĐỦA ĐỘ ĐƯA ÁCQIĐO Đế TỚ Ô ĐỀ CỆ ½ CÔ CÔ TỔ Là ÂXĐà CHỐ Đế TỚ Ô ĐỀ - CÊE CÊ, B. ÃÔ Ô-Ô - CÊE ÛVÔÇTÔ XÃQUÔÃÔYÔ ®ÔFA AFLÔBÔB "CÔMFEK †Ô, EI XÃQUÔÃÔYÔ AFLÔE 3'OB ®ÔFEĂ ȚIEB AFLI. 3'ÔFBÌO Đứ Ô »ÔĐƯÔ ÆŲ •ÔĐE ‡ÃÔ ×ÔSÔ ĐƯÔ ĐÔĐÔ XÔ ĐĐỀ ĐỦI, VỊ ĐƯỜ ÆŬ. ÆŲ VẬĐÆYÔ "ÔĐĒƯÔ ÆŨ ×ĐÚ pÔÆU ×Ô»Ô [−]COÃO ÆĐĐE •CÔ< †Ô,U −COÃÔ ÛÚ,ĐÃE ÛÉ ×>Ô< ×ÔHÔ ²ÔSĒ ³ÔB ÆŲ ×ÔĐÚ PÔ ÔĐĒ ¤ĐƯÔ ‡ÃÔ ²CÔÔÔ Ôuổ ATũ Đũ ÃPÔ †Ô9Ô†Ô9Ô caveat ¤ã jÆB ATũ. ÃPÔOUÔ ‡ÃÔ 2ÔŨÔ Ôuß ×±uÔú ATũ XÚ ‡ÃÔOUÔ ÁQÔ ^-Ö,ü ²ÖSĕ ÆÜK »ÖÖKÖ °Ö »ÖE »ÖE †Ö,ü ‡ÃÖ«>Ö< ²ÖÖ,ü²ÖÖ,ü †°ÖÖAĞ;µÖÛú °Þ°Ö ÃÜE ₹™ü"ÖÞÞQJÖÖ ÆÜE ¸ÆBB AEII. ŐI ×ÛúÃŰB ŰúŐ °ŐÖŐ °ŐÞEði »ĎEŐÖ "ŐĎEĎŰÖ, °ŐÖŐ »ĎÐú¸II †°ŐÖÐÁ;¡µÖÚú ×ÃÐÁÖ⊃II °ŐÞEÐI ÖÞÞÖ Úú¸EÐŐ "COPENICO, <Úú 215-18 †CROO-O †CI‡Ô xÚú ÁCIS CIVOS ÁCOSPONOO ÝCCHOS PĈE ÚVARIO ARII xÚú ÁCO-CIPÓ ARIOE NICO PO ARIOE ÆŬĈE µÔÆŬ ÛÚ,£90 ÆŬ. ÛVÃĈE ÛÚ,\$ÔP ‡ÃÔÛÔ ÃĐÃÔSÔ ^ŠŮ.. ^ÃÔŨÔ •PXÔPÔ ÃÔXÔÔ,Ô°Ô µĈEĆĄB °ĈE ¤ĕ פµÔ xÔú 20-0°°° (Đề 700XĐ-10°90) Ati xÔú 6 x00000 Ôú, đề lì 1 yĩ Ok † Quố Ôuố k CÔú k Ôú; đồ Ôú, để Đi Ati xÔú 6 x00000 °CO Atik... ¾ÃFÜ ŸŎŦĂ ÆŨĖ ĮÆŪ ÆŬ. ¤ŘŮ ÛÉ †ŰŖŮ »ŨĚÔ ÃŨĐĐÔ ÜŮ, Q¤ЙŪĖ ÆŪ μŰÖ ĮQUŮ»Ö <ÙŒ™Ů ÜĖ ≪ÕĻŪŪĖÖPŌ Ôú, NG Pai piố ×±ú, ũ > Ôb Ô; ũ ƯỚ, Ôp NG Phốc Pai. †Ô•Ô Paữớ, ề ¤ại Ô ÔuÔ 1/Î Quố Đứ, Ô ÔuÔ Vật Ô Vật Ô Pai v Ûn ÂPOÂCÊ 20-În †ÔPÔRYOÙú 'Ô,ÔPÔE ÛIŒ 17Ô< ÛIB ‡ÂÔ ŒHB ÂCÊ 20HÎND ±ŒŅÔ≃Ô ÆĞÊ YĞHÖ... <ÂCÊ YÖ'ÖÖ'Ô »OÚPOČE TÖ, LI ™OEÃÖ »ÖÜPÖÖ "ÖÖÆLIK... <ÃČE YÖTÖTÖ »OÜPOČE ÃČE •ÖÜE -ÖPÖCEG¶ ÆLII וÖPÖTČE TÖ 3ÖB ÆLJE ™OEÃÖ »Ôs~Ô<... Ở TÔTEN ÔÚTENÔ ĐÚ Ở ÔEÚ×ÔÃÔ TỔ, N TỘ, N PÔ, ĐỀ Ở 3ÔS ÔÚ, ÔS ĐỀ ČE ™ŒÃÔ ¤HÔO ÆĐE <ÃĈE ŸŮŸÜŸŰ »ÔĐĚÔ, ∞ÖŸŮÛÉ ÖŨÃÖ ÆŲ •ÔÜE ÆÐNÉÖ ÃÖÖÖ™ŮÜÖ ÃÜE ÃÖÖÖÐÖ ÜÜÖŸÜE ÆŲ ¾ÖE ÝÖQÐÖÖÖ ÛÉ ÖÖÇÉ ÝÖÇÐFÖ »ÖÜYÖĞE ÛUĞE †YÖ,Ü †ÖYÖR •ÖĞÖ ÄĞE ÛĞ"Û ×ŸÜÜĞSÖ ÛÚÜ ¤Ë †ÖÜÜ †YÖ,Ü ¾ĞE ¤ĞYE ÛĞ ×>Ö< YÜYÖÜÜ ŸÜEĞ ÆΦ, ΥΟΘΕ ^900'8 • ΘΕΘ ΄ΘΕ ÆΘΕΘ > ΦΙΝΟΌ μ΄ ΕΙΝΟΘΟΝΟΝΟ Ο Ο ΕΙΝΟΘΕΘΕ Ο ΙΟΙΟ ΤΙΧΟΟΝΟΘΕ ΤΟ ΤΟ ΘΟΟΙΘΕ ÆΨ, ΙΑΘΗΝΟΚ μΟ ΕΙΝΟΘΕΘΕ Overero XVI AGAGO-079 Poeta Atip ^x'010 Poeta Atil. O YGE pôteŭ Overero "Goetabo XVI »GORGE Ovde •GS 67G, ÁGRÁCÍAÓ †Ó,II ‡Á HÁ™ÍÐÓSÓ ÝÖÐEÓ ÚGS 2Ó-18 ±LÚÚL ÆÐ, SÓÐÚSÐ Ó ÖRÐEÐÓ "ÖÐEÐÓ ÆÐE ÐÚ ÝÓ,GRÓ ÚGÁÐÓÐÓ †ÖŢŶĸÃĞB ÛĸŎ ÆĎŒŸĸŎ ŸŶÆĸ 2ŮŸŎ ŌŎĸŶŎŎ, »ŌĿŨĸŸŌ ŢÖŢŶĸŔĞB ŨĸŎ ÆĎŒŸĸŎ "ŌĸŎŨŶĿ XĨŎĸŌĿ »ŌŒŌ, ŌŎŎŎ ×ÃOVO, Ů ÆŬE'IĎÖ "Ö>ÖÖ'ÉE ¾Ö>ÖÖ †Ü†Ö'IÃÖS †Ü, Ü ÖVÖ, EÝÖ>Ö ÛE »ÖÜYÖ ÝÖ, IĞ'Ö ×ÛVÃÖÖ'Ö ÛVB •Ö'ÖS'Ö ÛVÜE »ÔĐứ, ũ TƠ™Ô 20°90°Đề Đườ Đườ Đứ, ũ ÃÔĐƯỀ ÆŨ. ‡ÃÔ×Ô<, ‡9 ĐÙĐÔ×Ô YÔĐEÔ ĐƯB 0'ÔYÔ ỚYÔ ĐƯઝ•Ô<... µÔĐƯƠ TÔ, Ú , **Ô** TÔ . • ÔS ƯỚN B . • ÔB . 2003-ĐE † Ô, Ú . 2005-Ô . ÔÚ, ĐƯỚ . "Ô » ÔE ÝÔ<, ^\$**TĐƯ**ĐE Ú ƯỚN ĐE ÔUB, 3006-ÔN . ÔÚB ^~Ö×900×06 ČE ×>0000 AEü ×0ú ÜÖÖ° •ÖSÖPÖ ÛúS ÖbePÖÖÖ †ÖKÖ;jöÜüÖÖ Æij ĀĞ™ü ČE ^ŸÖ¢Ö ÜúÖ ÖbeÖ †®Ô ΑΤΙ - ĈĒSĂB - Ö, Ü •ČBSĎ ÛNB μĈĒCŪĒCŪĬŎŌ ÛNĎ ÛNĎ, ÞÖ †®Ô ΑΤΙ - ĈĒSĂB - Ö, Ü •ČBSĎPÔ ÛNĎ - Ö'ÖĎ 3ĎB †®Ô .AEŭ <380 ^0E\$8B ^0; û •0B\$800 †~096 †100 ^0; û ×86A00•070 <380 A0'00×ENO †0; û Â0'00'070 30B †®90 Ûn †nêq û ÆB ÆÐÆÐ ÆÜL. †®Ð ÚVÆÐÓ ÁÐE †ÖKÝÖ? 30.NÖÐAÐ ÞÚVÁÐÐÐ 200^9Ð "ÖLFÁÐ, 200ÁÚÖÐB "OÐÐAÐ, ÞÚ "ÖLFÁÐ, ²»ÔĐÚ ¸ÕHÃÖ TÖ,Ü ÝÔĐÔÔ ÛxB ŸÔ™ÔpÔ ×Ô¼B TÖ,Ü 18 ±xB™Ü »ÔĐÔE −ÔĐĐ Û¢ TÔĐĐE TÖ, ŴưÙI»Ô ¾Ô™ÜÜ ÔNG -TOTAO saline resistant rice Ôuữe 2090090 ÔUS 60 OVOO "LÚOVOO AELL. 300, NO ÔUO «ÔUÃOO90 ‡YO900 ÝÓDAOS Æij ×AQ±**0 ¾**Æij ŒºŒ'Ŭ Ūú¸Ø®O ®Œĕ •OO®OO Æij. ^ÃŎŨŧß ÝŒĠŌĠĊŎ ŪťĠ "ŒŒŪOß ŌĬŌ ¤G⊷Ök… Ö ŪúÆŒ®O "ÖDEŇÖÖ ÆÐÉ ×ŰÚ •ÖÐÖR"ÐÚÚ ‡ÐÖRÝÐÚÖQ ÝÖ MONSANTO ŰÚÖ <ŰÚ ŰŰÐÖÐŰÍÖ ÆÐ, ‡ÄÖ×Ö< þÖÆÐ ±ÆÞ Ü > ĕŒŒŔĂŮŔ 3ŮŔ 2ŮÆĬŮ •ÛPŊŮ ÆĬĽ. ±Œ₽Ů >> Œ™ĦPŮŲ ĬĶŮŎ, •ŒÊ 2ŮÆĬĮĎÄ™ĠŲŎ ŮĠĊŘŖĠŲŒŎ "Ů>ŨŎ ĮÆÐR ÆŸ •ÜB> &ÜB ÝÔĐEÔ †Ô, ũ ÃOÃÔĐEÃÔ ĐÚ 9ÔÔÔ Ô, ũ Seattle ČE •ÔČE 4Ô>D≥4Ô>D ÔSOP™ÝČE ÆDE ,ÆD ÆŪ, ^9Ô ÔSOP™ÝÖE ČE

•Ô9VIÖÖ ÜÖBSÖÖ ¾Ö,ÖBEÖ ÜÚ, ¸MEG ÆÜ †Ö,Ü Seattle ÖE •Ô9VIÖÖ ÜÖ>D ÆÖDÚ,Ü ÜÚÆÜÖS, ÆÜ No new around, turn around, ‡ÃÖ»Ö< •ÖB>6°ÖB †Ö,ü ÃÖÄÖEÃÖ Ûé ÝÖDEÖ ÛúB 0°ÖYÖÖ ÖVÖ ÛúB•Ö<...

•ODE †ÖÖ PÜREÜ ÜVAENÜE AEÜ ×ÜÚ PÜREÜ ±66> Ü ×ÖSÖ "ÖVETÜ AEÜ, XÖDE"Ü ×ÖSÖ AEÜ, YÖÜE †YÖ,Ü PÜAEÜ XÖDE"Ü ∡Ö»Ö 3'ÖB ÆĞI YÖLE CEPÖD ÆĞI'ÖD ÆĞP CEPÖD XÖCE'Ü, BÖLBÖD "ÖVÆĞI ÆĞP CEPÖD XÖCE'ÜLÜ YÖ_GPÖ "ÖVEĞI ÆĞP XÖFEÜ •ÖLE ÝÖ, GPÖ 3KÖEPÜÜ KEĞI 3KHEBB ‡-Ö, Ü Û6 »KÖĞEĞE ÜLĞE 3ÖB ^-Ö, Ü Û6 »KÖĞEĞE ÜLĞE 3ÖB, KEĞÖ ÂĞPÖÖLĞE 3KÖEPÜ ¤ÜÖÖ Æü.

†ÝÖ,Ü ¾ÖÐPÁÑÖ Û 6 TÜPÜ Û 66 ³ÖÐÖ Û 6ÜE ×Ö™ÖPÐE Û 6 ××Ö< ³ÖB ÞÖÆÜ ¾Ö,XÖ ×ÖÞÖÖ •ÖÖ 'ÆÐÖ ÆÐ, YÖĞE ‡ÃÖ ⊀Ö»Ö ÛúÖ †ÖÖ »ÖÖÉÖÖE ÛúÖE ÃÖ ÖEÖÖÖ Ûú,€PÖÖ "ÖÖÆEik...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Amar Singhji, please conclude.

ÁÖB † ÖÜ Ü GÁÖRÜ : ÖÜ †Ö ÖÖLÜB 2000 ÖÖLÜVÜE ÆİK ‡YÖLÖ ÆB ÖVE**HÜ**Ö 🔎 Ú ^ª ÖĞÖ •ÖYÖVÖ ÖLÉ »OÖKÜE Đườe ×0" nó đe ×ngườe 104e <0ú "1040×0" đe ×nh da.. 300±0 10+0 ¿00ú, ũ †µµ0, ũ •0s •0e †"" n •0x000 ×nµ0... Đứ¢ Ô 2007CE, YOUE •µÔD≃ÔD ×ÔĐÔS °ÔĐENE ĐƯỢENS •ÔO ÃÔĐƯỚOS ÆQI, XHE "ÔB"B ĐƯƠNG ĐƯ TỐ HỘ TÔ HỘ ÃẾ ĐƯỢENS •ÔO ÃÖÛdŸÖB ÆÜ. ĮÕ™ÕĎú¾Ö ĮÕ′Ö+ÖQB QÃÖÆÜ ×¤ÐÖÛúĮÜ ®ÖÊ ÛúÆÖ £ÖÖ :

À30070E ÛLÛE × ÖVÖYÖ ¤XXX 30YQ 30XXE 20"'ÜE † ÛXVÖYÜE AFII ŰŐÓ Ûĸß ÝŒÞ**ß** ŰEך**išą**ü ×ÖÖŰú •Œ⊳Ìi Ûĸß Ţ**Ö**NÖ ×ÖNÖNÜEÆü.

AEŬÔ ÛACCŒÊ ÛŬÊE ¤ÆBĴ30010 ¤Æ ÃÔÛĤÛE AEŲ »ŒÛÚF9 7000 ÛNS YŒHS 7E ׊AŠĄPAYŌÖÛÆ 20″ŒE ÛŴE ÜÜÖF90 ¤Đổc Đế ÃƯƯỚG>Ô TÔ, Wà ÃƯỚGEÃÖ, •ÔS>ĐƯỚG TÔ, WÝƯỚGEÔ ĐƯỚG ĐƯỚG ĐƯỚG ĐƯỚG ĐƯỚG ĐƯỚG ĐƯỚG ĀĞPÔ ‡°Ô "ÖB∙ÖÜE ÖLÜE ³ÖbeÜE †Ö,ü ‡ÃÖ "ÖEEÖú,ü ÖE ®Ö , ÞEE >Óú ÁÖÞÖ ÖLÜPÖ »ÖDEÐÓÚ,ü »ÖE ∙ÖÖ<YÖÖ? ÆUÖ ÁÖÞÖ ÖLÜÖ "ČŒŪú,ũ "**dis l**à †Ö,ũ ‡ÃÖ <eŶÖÆ**Ö**ÃÃŎŨú ×Ö»Ö ÛúĈĖ ×Ö»Ö •ÖBÖÖÚ,ũ ÖÖÄÖ Ûú,ë ¤‡Ö Ûé ÝÖ,A?ÖÝÖ£jåÖÖE Ûúß ²Ö¤#**Eď**>Öß Ûé >>Ö<, ^©ÖÚúß ³ÖÜÖÖ ÛúÖê ×Ö™Ö°ÖE Ûé >>Ö<...

ÁÖB ³Ö NÖCÁÖTEÜ T**ÖRÖNÖ AÄÖTEÜ TÖ LÖÖ**Ü Ü (ÝÖRÖ ÇÖNÖ) : ^TÖÄÖRÖD-NÖGÖ TÖE**ÖR** ÜĞÜ, †Ö ÖRÜE TÖRÜE TÄÖ ×ÖNÖ Ôé ‰rőjü ²Öböÿte Ôdő Ãö'tjuö פjüÖ, ‡ÃÖÔé ≫Ök -öÿöööb¤ü. ÖÆÖeyiÖÖ, 'Ö ‡ÃÖ ×ööÖ Ôé ‰rőjü ²Öböööte ÃÖ QUÖ °PÖRMQ;Ö9Ö ×Ö;Ö9Ö †Ö£ú ‡6> µÖÖ Û6 °Ö,ÖÖR™ÃÖÖ Û0Ö †Ö-ÖÖ,ü »ÖÐÚ;ü Û6″û °ÖÖYÖE µÖÆÖÖ ,úÜÖ9Ö "CÔAENICO AENE ‡ÃÖ ×CÔ>Ö ČE <Úú 2015'CB<>>Ö ±ĭ×CÔ>ÜB ÚUĈE 25 ×Ûú>ÖCE †®Ö∙Ö ÖLEÇNÖÖ ÚÚ, ÖPÜE ÚUÖ TÖDNÖ-ÖÜPÜ √UúµOO YQµOO Æii. µOO9B <Uú ¾µOÆYO Uú0è <Uú פÆO 165 YOO′O †9O≠O ×′OxOŒO... 9pO£Q;O9O ×′Q;O9O †O±ú ‡\$\$ µÖÖ Ûê "Ö, Ô'ÔB" MÃÖÔ Ûê †Ö-FÖÇ Ü "Ö, Ü <ÛÚ ¾QJÖÄÛÚ ¾QJÖEYÖ, •ÖE ÖEEFÖÖÖ ÛÚ, NÖÖ ÆÇ •ÖE ÝÖ, OFÖ †Ö¤ ÜĞS ÆŸ ^ÃÔŪứCE ÆŸŸ ×׌PÔ 2500 Ũŭ>ÔCEG•Ô "ÔOÆŸK... ‡ÃÔ 165 YÔŨÔ ĈE •ÔCE ŨĬŏÔĈĘG ×ÔŏÔŒÔS, ¾ÃÆŸ ×ÂŒĎ 500 ÆDĪBČS... ×±ú, ü ^ÃOŪLĪB 200 ŪĭJ>ŪĒBĒ•Ū ŪLVEDĪO ĀŪB >ÖŪĒB ÆDĪBŪB †ŪĘ Ü ^ÃOŪLIB •ŪKĀŪĒB ŪLIŪ ŒĻŪŪ ÆÖKÖ?

- ŐÆÐÐEÞJÖÖ, - ŐT μŐÆÐÖÖ ‡ÓÞÐSÞÐ_Ü ÚÚß <ŰÚ - ŐΘŒŸŐ Œ3ÐŒŸÜ ÚڿПŐ "ŐÖÆÐÐÖÖ :

´ÖÆMÖÖÇŐ ²ÖœÜPÜE ¾ÖÖ>ÖÜE ÄÖE µÜE ¾ÖMÖE ±ú×, ü,ŸÜE ¯ÖÆNÖE ÆÜ †Ö, ü †®Ö•Ö ¤8ÖÖ®E ¾ÖöÖE ÄÖE µÖE ³ÖBGE ±ú<, ji, YÖE ¯ÖEENÖE ÆÜ †ÝÕ, Ŭ µÕEŬ ÆÕSÕ ŢĒŌ ŸÕÈ ¤ĔŶŶſŌ ČĖ ³Õ, ŇÕ Ûſß ÛſÆÕŶB ŒſŌ ÆÕËŌ, ×0ÃÖ ¤ÃÖ ÛLÖ 2Ö'ÖÖÖ 3ÖNÖ ÆÜ ^ÃÖ ¤ÃÖ ÛLß •0%ÖÖß ŒLÖ ÆÜÖ?

AEŬĈE ‡ÃÔÛÚ %ŪŌ¸Ü ¾Ã°ÖÖ¸Ü ÛÚ,£PÖÖ AEĎĚÖÜ… 66 ÃÖÖ>ÖÜE ÜE ‡ÃÖ ¤ÞŐ ÜE ÝÖ,£PÖB ²ÖŒĤÖB "Ö>ÖB •ÖÖ , NEB AEŲ †®10+10 ÛNB ÃONORENDOČĘB 3'OB 2'ČCENTOB +0'O , NEB AEŬ YOEOO YO, OP'O †O', Ŭ YO, OP'O 2'O®OVOO •0'O , NEBO Æü. ÆüÖE »ÖYÖYÖÖ Æü ×Ûú ‡ÃÖ ×Ö»Ö Ûê %ü´Ö¸ü ÖÆÖBÖYÖÖ¸ü Ûú,£ÖÖ ÆÖÖÖÖ...

ŐVEÓÐENJÖ, Ő EŐÐAÐEÁŐB †Ö.JÚ 20ÖVÖE ŐÖPÖPÖÐJÖ ŐGYÖB ∙ÖB ÓLÓE 2ÖVÖÖPÖÖ "ŐDVEÐVÖÖ ÆÐÓE ÁÖ.JÚ ‡ÁÖ ×ÖSÖÖ Đườ TORA-ĐIPÔ Đứ, Nữc ÁÔ QUÔ Từch ×pộ Đế , Ô- piốc Đườ , ÔHO °ÔHA »ÔS YÔ ĐÔ ATU. ATƯỚC TOVÔ ATU xĐứ ‡Á ĐÔ US ÆŬĈE ÃŎĊEŎŸĠE ÛĸB •Ô°Þ¸ÜÖ ÆŨ. ÃŎŢŲ ‡ÃŎĊE <Ûú ¤ÃÃŎŢĎ ŌŒĂŌŎŶŌ ³ÖB ÛúŢĠŶĠE ÛĸB •Ô°Þ¸ÜÖ ÆŨ. ¤ŘŎ 'ČĖ •ČPÖ ŪBE¤ŲNIČB †Ö'Ö¤Ö †ÖNÖB ÆŲ •ČIĀČE 2ÖDENI †ÖNÖB ÆŲ 3ÖDNÚ´Ö †ÖNÖÖ ÆŲ †®ÖDRDAPII µÖÖ †×IÖRDBAPII i ÆDĪĒŪS ÆŲ YOČE ‡ÃO ×OSO ČE <ÃOS ÛLĪŪĒÔ YOO, ÞYO ÐVÆÐA ÆŬ xÛÚ ^ÃO ÃO ÕÇĻO 3'OS ^9ÆÐ †9°O∙O ÖÐĒŅŪO Đứ, ĐĐO ĐÃO ĐÃO ĐÃU. TÃÔ×OC TÃÔ CĒ «Đứ Đứ Đứ Cò Đị ĐĐO PÔĐE » XÔĐO "CÔ TĒK XĐÚ «ÃÔE ÃÔ TỤÔ CĒ 3ÔS ĐƯÔ ^ ®ÛúĈE † ®Ö•Ö ÖÆÜÖÖ Ûú¸Ö<ÑĈE.

'ÔÆÔP₽ijÖÖ, ±éÐ Ü ×ÃÔŒμŰŌ&ĔľNG ÛÉ ÃÔŒPÊÖÔ ÜË "ÔCÔÃÕÍԜ٠<Ûú 'ŐÔD×ĠSŌ Ã™ĒľÜ 2ÖPÔ 2ÖμÖÖ ÆŬL. ‡ÃÖ ×ôsô (če •CCE °COXXI-COPÔ AEŭ 3ĜE ÂOPÔ YCCE "CEOXĂOYOLEŬ ¤ŬOO AEO AEŬ ‡ÃOOÉ ÃCCEC-ÃCCEÔ 3ĜAEŬ ¤Ôsô, "CSPB, "Ö90, 90°00ú †0פü Ã0°0 ¤000 Æij ו0Ã0Ã0E »00°00E0ã Oude 700°090 ×0°0000 Æü †0;ü ^Ã00ưβ 9000d/0 308 ²CœNYOB ÆLÜ. ‡ÃÖ ⁻CÔCUÖ,Ü ÛUÖ ¯COSAÐ-CÖPÖ ‡ÃÖ ×CÖ>Ö ´CŒ ³CB ÛÚ,£PÖÖ "CÖׯLÏK...

¤ÃÃÖ, Ö, ‡ÃÖ ×ÖsÖ ČE Ûĕ¦ü ÃÖ, Ôưỡ, ü °ČE , Õ•µÖ ÃÖ, Ôưỡ, ÕE Ûưỡ • ỐCE YỐC‡> sốCỆÃÖ ¤6 ÆŪ, ^°CÔÓ †°MÃIQ ŭ ÝMÔ'ÔÞÔ OĞÇÔĞ ĈE 75 ~ÖKŶĠŢŎŸŌ †ÖŢÜ ¿ÖPEĞB ÖĞÇÔĞ ĈE 50 ~ÖKŸĠŢÖŸŌ •ÖĞ ÛĞSÖ ~ÖDĞSĞÇÖ°Ö ÆĞ ^ÃÖD¢ ⁻ÖJÖ'ÖS™ÃÖÖ Û¢ †Ö-ÖÖJÜ ⁻ÖJÜ ^®ÖUß √Ö®ÖB ÆÖĞÖS... ÆÜĞE »ÖÖÖÖÖ ÆÜ √ÛÚ ‡ÃÖÛ¢ †∲üÜ ³ÖS ÃÖBÖÖ,Ü ÛVB †ÖRĞ;µÖÜNÜÖ ÆÜ, ŒµÖDÐÚÚ ÛV‡Ô <ÃÖE Ö•µÖ ÆÜ •ÖFÐÓ ÝÖ,AFÖE ÛVB ªÖÆÖÖ ²Ö>ÌB ÃÖÖDµÖÖ ÆÜ. 'ĈI YON-O_ONO ONO 308 ^»»ĈEJO ON_EPTO "COLANCO ABBE ‡ÃO 20>0 ON †Ö-CO_U Ō,U YON-O_ONO ĈE •ĈE ĈE;ON>O †ÖPÖE 36Ö>ÖB ÆÜ, ^ÃÖOÚÖ 3ÖB 'Ö ^>>ÖÜÖ ÛÚ,ÆÖÖ "ÖÖÆÜÖÖ ÆÐÆ

^-ŎĂĞPÖÖ+µÖSÖ 'ÖÆĞ®¥µÖÖ, YÖ&Ö¸ĞNÖ 'ÖE †3'ÖB ±ÁÐ U ×ÃÖŒµÖĞ®¸EM'G ÛúÖ »ÖĞPÖ »ÖE ¸ÆEG •ÖÖE YÖ¸GPÖ 208.708.<>0. ±0₹Ó>08 Æÿ ‡ÃÔ ≥Ô>Ô Để †Ô°08 ÁŨ Đứ, 0PÔ <ĐÚ Đứ, 0PÔ <ĐÚ Đứ, 0Bể 1 ¹ỹÔ< 70°00ÂÔ >>00ÛÔ >Ô0ĐÔ ‡ÃÔ »03°0 ÃCE ¾04°010 Æ0E •00°0E ¾00>0E Æ0. ÃO, Ü ¤0.0°0 †0•0 Ý0E°0, 000 °CE 35 √0ú»0E †°00•0 Ý0, 02°0 208.708.<>0. ±û×03×08 Ûvîdê O**E**Çijad Ûvî**d**ijad •00 ji**l**êd Æû. ‡ÃÔ ×Ô3×0 Ûn †0°0ê Âûê ×Â0±û 25 ×Ûúx)dê †900-0 ×030400.. ‡Â0ÂÛ YÔ, 0PÔ ±ûkÔ3ÔB TÔ, W •µÔÞÔ 1 ŶŨk Ô4Ô 20ÊÔ TÔ HPÊ 3603Ô ÆW. 30ÆW †Ô•Ô 35 ×Ûú»ÔČE †®ÔO•Ô 176 ¹ýÔ< ĈE ÜŐ, ÔB¤Ü "VENG ÆÜL †Ô®Ê ¾ÔÔ»ĈE ÃÔ ÔUÔ ĈE •ÔPÔ ‡ÃÔ ×ĈO»Ô ÛúÔ ‡~»ÔS ÔP 18 1990 A ĐƯỢC YỐC ^Ã CÔ LỚC 25 ×ÔLÓ SỐC † 900 Ô CÓ ÔĐẠC ÔĐẠC ÔÉ 261 1 V Ô C "CÔLỞ 90 Č TÔ TÝC. † Ö ĐƠ ‡ŸŰŶŶŔ ŰĸĸĬŎŎŢŎ ŰĖ ŶŨĸŨĸĸĸŎ. ±ũĸŐĸŨĸĸŨĸĨŎ ŸŎŗŒĸŨ †ĬŶŶŎ •ŨŖŶŶŶ ¾ŎŨŎŶŎ ŨúŗŨ ĸŒĸĸĸŒĸĸŶŒ ŶŖĔ ¤ŨĖ

3ÁCEYÖ Û0B ¸ÔE'B 3´ÜB °ÖÄÜRÖ °ÖÆÐ ÆÐÆÖS... ŸÖÖE ÆÜĞE »ÖYÖVÖÖ ÆÜ »Û0 ‡ÃÖ ĞE µÖÆÜ 'ÖDÆÖ'Ö°Ð ÃĞBÖĞ∫EĞE Û0B •Ö°Þ¸ÜYÖ ÆÜ. EÖEµĞE

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (Nominated): Madam, given the very short time available, I would, while rising to support this Bill in its entirety, like to bring to the attention of the hon. Minister that despite my meeting him, despite my pleading with him, despite my giving it to him in writing, Chapter X of the Bill, as it stands today, is word-to-word exactly what it was in Chapter XII in the previous version of this Bill. In other words, we have not at all taken into account what the Constitution says about the role of the Panchayats in the Public Distribution System. If the hon. Minister would kindly look at the Constitution, it says, in the Eleventh Schedule, that the Public Distribution System should be brought under the Panchayati Raj System. And, in article 243G as well as in article 243W, the Panchayats and the Municipalities are described "as institutions of local selfgovernment". Now, our Minister has used a completely colonial term 'local authority'. So, it is not at all clear from this Bill that when this Bill talks of local authority, as it does at several different points, whether it means some kind of bureaucratic system or whether it means the people of India. Further, there is a provision, and that is what I would plead with the Minister to take advantage of now, that State Governments shall, by a notification, explain what the role of the local authority is. But as this is a Centrally Sponsored Scheme, it is not only State Governments which will be issuing notifications, but the Centrally Sponsored Scheme will also have Guidelines, and as per the Circular, which has been received by his Secretary and other Secretaries, the Prime Minister's direction is that each one of the Centrally-sponsored Schemes must have an Activity Map detailing the jurisdiction of Panchayats and Municipalities in terms of the devolution of Functions, Finances and Functionaries. Mr. Minister, if you do not do this in your own Bill, then, I am afraid, we will go the way of all flesh and will end up with some kind of an enabling provision for the Panchayats, but we won't get the Panchayats involved in the system. All over this country, wherever the PDS has functioned successfully, be it Tamil Nadu or Chhattisgarh, it is because the Panchayats have been given a role which means that the people who are the beneficiaries, as also the people, who must know whether a particular ration shop is or is not providing the civil supplies that it is supposed to, are involved. Also, Mr. Minister, you must know that the Civil Supplies Departments, all over this country, have become dens of corruption. And unless we are able to make the Panchayats responsible, the people responsible, I don't see how this continued dependence on the bureaucracy is going to give you this answer. I say this as a former bureaucrat myself and I say this on behalf of several distinguished civil servants, who are in this House, who have all have realized that this is not the way to go forward.

But you have done nothing about it in all that we have pleaded with you. Now, you have a golden opportunity. As soon as this Bill becomes an Act, you will have to produce the Guidelines and in the course of producing the Guidelines, I would plead with you, as I have done already by letter, that you must recognise that however gargantuan the task and the expense of producing food supplies, of procuring food supplies, of storing food supplies, of transporting food supplies, of delivering food supplies even unto the doorstep is, if at the last mile there is a babu standing there and not an elected representative of the people, there is no hope whatsoever that all your trouble and all your money will actually give results. And who was the one who saw it? None other, Sir, — I would understand if this Bill came from some other party — but it was Rajiv Gandhi who wrote with his own hand and in my presence that the Public Distribution System should be under the Panchayati Raj system and if 25 years ago, the leader, that both you and I acknowledge, is going to be ignored in a historic Bill produced by our own Party, then, whom are we kicking in the mouth? We are kicking ourselves. I plead with you that despite all my efforts and your giving me such a sympathetic hearing, receiving all my papers, saying that you will do it, even though not one comma has been changed between 2011 and today, there is still an opportunity because you have to produce the Guidelines; you have to produce the Activity Map. I have got a whole team. There is an Expert Committee which I have chaired, which has produced a 1500 page Report. It is in five volumes. I will take out four or five paragraphs that relate to you. You can follow them. We can still get this done but I think, I would like to demand not only on my behalf but on behalf of this entire House, whose representatives have asked for a discussion on the Expert Committee Report, that you must please answer us as to whether, when you bring this Act into operation, you will ensure through the Guidelines and the Activity Map attached to the guidelines that the Panchayats will have a really significant role in Tamil Nadu, whether it is the DMK or the AIADMK Government. If they have had such a huge success, it is because even though the DMK or the AIADMK fight each other all the way down to the villages precisely because

7.00 P.M.

political forces are fighting each other in the villages, delivery at the village level is simply outstanding. Dr. Kalaignar said that he would give rice at Rs. 2 a kilo. He ended by giving rice at Re. 1 a kilo and nobody complained that they didn't get the rice. The complaint is perhaps about the quality. But that is just as well because those who want basmati rice can go and pay for it in the market. So please understand, Sir, that everything that you have done is going to come to naught unless the Panchayats and the Municipalities are given that last mile delivery and that they are made responsible to the Gram Sabha because it is only in the Gram Sabha or the Ward Sabha that the beneficiaries of this scheme can sit. It was Rajiv Gandhi who said, "We need a responsive administration." Then he went on to say, "You cannot get a responsive administration unless it is a responsible administration, responsible to the beneficiaries." And he added that, "You cannot have a responsible administration which is not a representative administration." IAS officers may be brilliant at passing exams. I too have passed the exam and I hold the example in complete contempt because it has nothing to do with ordinary people and ordinary people cannot get into the IAS and everybody else in the bureaucracy simply imitates the IAS. For God's sake, understand that the people of this country have been given Constitutional Right by Rajiv Gandhi and today we cannot pass this historic Bill without recognising those Constitutional Rights. Please give us the opportunity of doing so. Thank you.

SHRI V. P. SINGH BADNORE (Rajasthan): They never heed to your advice. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA (Odisha): Madam, I will not go into the views of Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar.

Thank you, Madam, for the opportunity. First, I don't agree with Amar Singhji who is sitting here that it is good that at last this thing has been brought.

In 2004, you promised and came to power on the plank of providing employment. The UPA was voted to power. You could not live up to your promise. What did you do? Then, you promised this in your Manifesto and you did a waiver of farm loans. Again, people believed you and gave you a mandate. And, you have formed the UPA-II. Now, after the Election Manifesto of 2009, we

expected that in the first Monsoon Session — this is the fifth one — you would bring this Bill. But, you are bringing this Bill four years later and, before we discuss this Bill, you are giving Government advertisements on television and on every other part of media by saying that 'you are getting 5 kgs for Rs. 3, Rs. 2 and Re.1.' The advertisement showing some lady going to Ration Shop and all that; propaganda has started. Is it just an election gimmick or what? Therefore, had you really thought of this Bill, you would have taken my friend, Mani Shankar's suggestion very seriously.

Madam, I had floated a party five months ago. The first and foremost programme of that party is to ensure that the village becomes the source of all power. In that, we have written down and now we have gone on propagating everywhere that village will be a Panchayat and in that Panchayat procurement, distribution, storage and processing of foodgrains will be the responsibility of Panchayat. Panchayat will be the source of power; residuary power would come to Government. This is the concept. This has to be the concept if India is to become strong.

Having made this point, I would say that a strong India means, a real federal India where we trust in the State Government and a powerful village Panchayat. You must trust powerful States; not arrogate all the powers to the Centre. Not to have arrogance of saying that we will give directives and you have to obey directives. Who are you, anyway? If you leave out the States, where is your existence? You always say that you are giving money from the Centre. It is propaganda. State leaders are also saying, 'we are giving this free to you.' This is all people's money. Nobody should claim, neither the Centre not the State, that they are giving money. If we are giving it free or if we are giving it at Rs. 3, Rs. 2, Re. 1, it is with their money. We are taking it through the representatives of the people in both the Houses of Parliament. People have given them mandate to give it and to make laws. So, let us trust each other. Let us also see and acknowledge that this is people's money and, since people have voted us through the State Assemblies, we have a responsibility to see that their money is utilized in the best way possible. And, you have found the best way in 2004. You did not implement. The best way is not to distribute anything free or anything subsidized. The best way is to give employment, employment and employment, so that if I am a poor man, I earn and I have enough earning ability and I feed my family.

How can you play with statistics? The present figure of 67 per cent is more than double the number of, what you call, people living Below Poverty Line. How can you say that when, on the other hand, the Saxena Committee goes to Odisha and says, 84 per cent of the people are poor? Then, the Odisha Chief Minister has given statistics showing that they have brought down the number of people living Below Poverty Line from 57 per cent to 37 per cent, and now, to 32 per cent. So, there are the Saxena Committee figures and these. Why do you play with statistics? We must look at the facts on the ground. There is extreme poverty.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Mohapatra, I must request you to conclude. Please, conclude.

SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA: I would conclude. Madam.

There are extreme kinds of poverty. We must have conscience, we must have sensitivity and we must have compassion for our brethren who are poor. And only on that score, I support the Bill. I support the Bill only on one condition, the one which Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar has mentioned, which we support fully. We must endorse it and besides, take more people out of the 67 per cent.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Shri Jai Prakash Narayan Singh. He is not there. Shri M. Rama Jois.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS (Karnataka): Thank you, Madam, for giving me this opportunity. I give my qualified support to this Bill.

The preamble to the National Food Security Bill, 2013 states that this is a Bill 'to provide for food and nutritional security in human life cycle approach, by ensuring access to adequate quantity of quality food at affordable prices to people to live a life with dignity and for matters connected therewith or incidental thereto.' Thus, the objective of the Bill appears to be to provide relief against starvation and to wipe out the tears of those who are in distress. From time immemorial, that has been a part of our rajdharma and the rules which are prescribed for the state. In the Mahabharata, Raja Rantideva says:—

9 Y3Æ6 Ouð que ¸o-µm 9 A3200 9 -089020 €. Ouð que ≈euo Y0Y0900 -00+090 € †0000,090 €...

It means, I do not want kingship or political power, neither *swarga* nor *moksha*, but my desire is to wipe out tears from the eyes of those who are in

distress. This indicates that the desire to render such selfless service is the most important function of the state. The preamble to the Bill indicates this.

But, unfortunately, when you see the provisions of the Bill, the motive appears to be questionable. In fact, as early as on 15th December, 2012, the Times of India (*Delhi Edition*), had a news item wherein there is a statement of * the number two in the Congress hierarchy, saying, "Get Cash Transfer Scheme right and we can win the next two polls." So, the entire noble object of the Bill has been totally destroyed by this. And I read only one para. It states, "Congress heirapparent, *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Well, actually, Mr. Jois, you can't take the name of a.....(Interruptions)...

Just a moment. Let me tell him. Mr. Jois, you are senior enough to understand that he is a Member of the other House. Kindly avoid taking names of Members of the other House. Anyway, we will examine it. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: I am quoting from the Times of India newspaper.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): But the tradition is that we do not take names of Members of the other House, who are not here to defend themselves. We will examine the records and do the needful. Yes, Mr. Jois, please continue. Do not take names.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: In this statement, it is clearly stated that the Aadhar number as well as the cash transfer is meant only to influence voters in the 2014 general elections and also 2019 elections and satisfy the hunger for votes by the ruling party. This has been stated not by any Tom, Dick and Harry. This has been stated by number two in command in the ruling party. This is violative of Section 123 of Representation of peoples Act, 1951. Therefore, you cannot slightly brush it aside. ...(Time-bell rings)...

Á**ŮB AEÁŮFÖ ¤WÜRŮEÔ (**ŰVEÐ ÖÄM) : půe Œpůů ²ÖÜVÜE ²ÖÜÐÖ ¸ÆEÐ ÆEP...**(¾ĎRÆÖÜFÓ)...**

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Jois, you have to speak within your time limit.

^{*}Not recorded.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Jois, you are losing your time to say what you want to say on the Bill.

ÁÖB AFÁÍOFÖ ¤IJÖÖZÉFŐ: ŐPEÐÍYŐÖ YÖDÐOB ÚUÓ ‡ÁVÁÖE ŒµÖÖ ÁÖÐOÐÓ ÆTP...**(340026-00F9**)...

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: Am I producing a fake document? ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): You can stick to the Bill. Your time is up, Mr. Jois. Please conclude.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: That is why I have given amendment to Clause 8 which provides for cash transfer and also Clause 12 regarding Aadhar. Shri Jawaharlal Nehru said, 'industrialize or perish'(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Jois, while pressing for your amendment, at that time you can speak. Now, please conclude.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: Now, the agricultural lands are excessively utilized for industries, and now it is, 'industrialize and perish'. That is the situation we are facing. That is why we are short of agricultural commodities. And, then,...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Thank you Mr. Jois. Please conclude.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: Then, coming to Aadhar, it is a more serious matter. The National Identification Authority Bill was introduced before the Rajya Sabha on 3.12.2010...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Jois, you are taking up the time of your colleagues. If they agree, then, you speak. If your other colleague is willing not to speak, then, you speak.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: On 3.12.2010, it was introduced before Rajya Sabha, and, then, referred to the Standing Committee. The Standing Committee rejected it on 11th December, 2011. Then, giving of Aadhar numbers was stopped only for some time.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): I am afraid, your colleagues' time will be cut. Please conclude, Mr. Jois.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: Subsequently, it is continued in utter disregard to the Parliament. The Aadhar numbers are being issued not merely to the citizens but also to the non-citizens. When you are giving Aadhar numbers to non-citizens, they are also entitled to same amount of foodgrains. Are you maintaining noncitizens or non-patriots or even infiltrators to...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Thank you very much. I am calling the next speaker. Shri Vijay Jawaharlal Darda.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: When the Standing Committee has rejected the Bill, if the ruling party has any iota of respect for Parliamentary democracy, they should have brought back the Bill before Rajya Sabha, and got its support. Why are they... ...(Interruptions)...

ÁÖB ¾Ã-QÃO •ÜXÖTEQIIIÖÖNÖ ¤IIIÖÖ(ÖYEÖ,ÖÄTM)) : ÖDIÖ, Ö ÇÄÄTMÖLÖ ÜÖÖ^{MA} ÁĞQIDÖÖ ¾Ä-QÖÜÚ, 2013 Û LÔ ÃÔ CE CÔO ÚL ĐÃE Ú ĐÁ × Ô< ÚÔ> ÎD Æ Đ Ô Æ ĐE....(34002-0070)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Jois, I am afraid, nothing will go on record, if you continue as I have called the next speaker. You can speak at the time of your amendment.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: *

ÁÍB - ¾ QUÔ - CHÁOTEIQIÚ CÔ NÔ ¤IÀ IÔ: (ÉAB TÔT MÁ TẾC (ÉAÊ 2006) ÔTÊ ÚÉ - »ÔK 15 × ÔT THÍ Ú LÔ ÁÔ QUÔ × XI DÔ ÆŸ ‡ÃÔŨÉ ××Ô< ĆŨ †¯ŮŸB ¯ÖÖ™Ë ÛŰÖ †Ö°ÖÖ¸B ÆÉ£.**(¾ØÆÖÜŸ)...**

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Nothing is going on record. Please sit down.

ÁÖB ×ÃP-QÃO •CRÁDTEI; WiGO×Ö ¤W-ÃO: ÃÖPŐÃČE TÖLEWĞE TÖ †TÖPÖB ^ÃÖ 3ÖDRÁPPÖ ÚLĞE ¾AĞEYÖ ÚL; II <u>, VE</u>Ö AEĞE

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: *

ÁÖB ¾Ã-QÃO •GXĀTEŲ II•GŪNŌ ¤II•IÕD: ÖÜ ^ÃO ¤ÞĒŌ ŪƯŌ ÖÜYÖ.4ÖNÐ ŪÚŲ II **JETO ÆÐE •**ÖLEGO †40 ŪŪŪEŌ 30000 °VE a Ã00k Ý00.....(34080-009)...

^{*}Not recorded.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: *

ΑΘΧ ΘΎΘΣ "ΘΎΘΣ ΘΆΘΕΨ" ("Θ-μΘ "ΘΨ"&Θ) : †Θ"ΘΘΕ "ΘΘΘΘΟΒμΘ ΑΘΣΨΑμΘ Ο ΔΘΕ "ΘΘΟ Ο Δ΄ μ καν ψιΟΟ ÆΨ....**(¾ΦΧ-ΘΤΟ)...**

^ (ACC O μ (ACC O CAC

ÁÖB **₹Ö-ÖÖ • ÖÄÖRÜJÜNÖÖNÖ ¤B ÖÖ:** "ÖÄ-ÜE ¤ÁÜÖ ÛÁ ÃÖŒÖ ÛNÆEPÖÖ ÖN ÜI JEEÖ ÆÜ..**(¾ÖÖÖÖĞ)...**

^**-ŒĀĠŸŎŗĀĠŎ (ÁŎĠŸŎĠ, ÞŒĤĎ "ŎĠŎ,):** ¤₺ŎÔ •Œ, ŒŗŎŎ †ÖÖ yield Ûú,ü ˌŒē Æ£?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Jois, I had said, if you colleague agrees that he will give up his time for you, you could continue. We had requested you. The matter is over now. I am sorry, Mr. Punj, I have already called the next speaker, and he is speaking. ...(Interruptions)...

You cannot show papers like that.(Interruptions)....

ÁÖB ×36-QHÖ -ÖRÖTEÜJ ÞÖÖÖ ÞIÐ **ÞÖÐ**: 'Ö ÞÐEÐÓ [™]Ö, Ü ‡ÃÖ ²00YÓ ÛÚÔ ^»»ÔÐÖ ÛÚ¸ÆÖÖ "ÖÖEÐÖÖ ÆÐE ×DÚ...**(340X8-00F)**... 'ÖFÐE ÞÐÖ ÖÐ ÃOŒÖ ÞÖEÜ ÚÚÆÐÖÖ Ö⊳ÌI **JÆÐ**Ö ÆÐ ×DÚ...**(340X8-00FQ**)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... The Member is not yielding. ...(Interruptions)... Then your colleagues would not get the time. ...(Interruptions)...

^{*}Not recorded.

ÁÖB -¾À-QÃO - CHÁDEQ III GÓN Ö = II HÔO: ÚÁ" Ú »XÔHÔCE TÉ = IFPQHÖ ÚÁ ÃÔO ÔTÉ 300, HÔ ÚHB "IÉÀ ÚHÉ †3°B ŸŐÚú ¾ÔĐÔ †Ô,Ũ ÝÔ,ŒPÔB Ũé ÃŐŒÔ ÔĘŐ Ũú,ŒÔE ÛúÔ ÔŪÔY®Ô ×ŨÚµŐÔ ÆŨ**....(¾ÆÆÖÖÐ)...**¾Ê "ŐÆĒ †EQÕÕĂ_jÖB **ĀŪĿ.(¾ÜÄÜĞ)...**ŠAŪÚ ĀŪ ^ŸŪŪĒ ²ÜĎŪŸĒ ¤**6**~Ü<.....**(¾ÜÄÜĞ)..**.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... The Member is not yielding. ...(Interruptions)... Then your colleagues would not get the time.(Interruptions).... † 00 2000‡<? † 000 ± 000 3°B ÆÐ, µÖ.¤Ü †ÖÖ ^9ÖÛdÖ ¾ÖEYÖ ‡9ÖÜdÊ ¤Ð "ÆÐ ÆÐ, YÖE †ÖÖ 2ÖYÖ ÛÚ Ü »ÖS⊷Ö<...**.(¾ÖÐ2-ÖÖ9**)...

ÁÖB 3ØB - ÖB ØÄÖTEÜ 2Ö±GKÖQ Ü : µÖEÜ > 8Ö»Ö ×ÄÖE µÖÖ& E^MB ÆÜ....**(3øDKO-ÖDF)...**

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ: The Chair has given extra time. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): I have not given extra time.(Interruptions).... I am sorry. ...(Interruptions)... I am sorry, Mr. Punj. ...(Interruptions)... I don't think that is right.(Interruptions).... You must not speak in this way. ...(Interruptions)... I am very sorry. ...(Interruptions)... No extra time has been given, which can be examined from the records.(Interruptions)....

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Let him finish. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: Mr. Murli Manohar told this.(Interruptions).... We agree with the food security. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Punj, please sit down.(Interruptions)....

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: Just as Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar said, I fully support him, the Constitution was amended to bring in existence the Panchayati Raj. That was done by Shri Rajiv Gandhi. Why don't you entrust this responsibility to Panchayats? All the allegations against the Central Government will go. ...(Interruptions)... Entrust it to the Panchayats. Persons belonging to various political parties will be there. Let it be entrusted to them. A Constitutional status has been given to Panchayats by amending the Constitution. Therefore, my submission is that while I fully support the objective of the Bill, I am strongly opposing the ulterior motive. That is why I have given amendments to clause 8 and clause 12. Thank you.

ÁÖB ¾Ã° QÃÖ • ÖXÖTEÜ JI ÖÖÖÖ ™IS ÖÖ: ÖÖ> IÖ, ÖÖ TÖEBÖĞE ÃĞE ¿ÖĞPÞ ÛN°PÞ JAÖÖ ÛĞ™**K°**PÞÖŒ ÛN°PÞ?

^~OĂBOĐ-NĀSŌ (ÁŬKOŬOK ĮĐOĐNŌ "OĐ-Đ,NO : †ÖÖÜNÖ ™Õ‡Ö †²Ö ¿ÕRÞ Æ**ÖN**ÖÖ ÆÑ.

ÁÖB ¾Ã-QÃO •CRODELŲ NICO>O ¤18 CÔ: †Ö¤Ų ÞCÔŅÔ ^*CĂČPCO+JČOÔ ŐEČĐ÷ŅČO, ČŮ †ÖÖDÉ ÃŮČĠŮ ÜÖÖ[™] ÃČĄ ŏCÔ †×Ö×QUÔ Ö ÔUÔ ÃÔ ŒÔÔO ÔU ĐỚE ÔE ≫Ô< ƯỚЫ AETÔ ÆETÔ ÆEE Ô ÃPÔÃŒ ÔEBÊ †ÖPB ÂRE 3ÔPÂPÔ ÂRE 3ÔPÂPÔ ÂRE 3 ÛdÔ TÔKÔK-90K-0134Ô ÛÚ;Ü j**êlô Aldê •**ÔleôO TÔ,Ü ÛdÔleÔ 300900 90'leñ Âlôk YÔ... (Îb-Ôle 200'de Ûde 34ê jêl'¤ü µô0¤ü †Ô hungry that God cannot appear to them except in the form of bread." 10.0 Auto 1 , Ô™ÔLUÔ †-µÔSCÔ, ÁÔSCÔYÔS ÃCÔE®OLOÔ ÝCCĐÔS •ÔS ĐÉ ³CÔSÁ®CÔY ÔĐÚ »ÔÝCÔSà †Ô, ũ †£CÔÚ ¯Ô, MÁÔ CÔE ĐÉ °CÔ¤Ũ -CHOOPTOARS •OS TOPTOBERRO RAVEII •OS 90E XAEU ACTOPO -CRAD ×UMMO AEU ×OAOOMS 20RPMO©II TOPMIA DAE 1000APOD--Ö;Ö ´ÜE <Ûú ¾ÖQDÖ¤B Û6 °ÞrÖ ´ÜE ^®ÖÛxB †-µÖsÖYÖÖ ´ÜE ¸NÜĞB ÝÖ‡Ô £ÖB... ´ÜçB ¾ÖrÖsÖ Û6 ÄÖÜ£ÜB ‡ÃÖ -×XP-CBÖOÚ ÔƯỚC ×XCĐÚ, TÔ CƯỚ±ƯB †ÖÔƯỚYÔ AETI. Ở ^9EB †×2ƠMÔ †ÖḤÁ™BYÔ ÔE XÃC ;Õ¤T pÖÖ¤TI פTXXÕYÖ #00F1100 Afte "An empty stomach is not a good political adviser." AFi0 10F60 [0,1] »00F111G10 ÃÔĐƯƯỜS AETI. Ở μÔÆĐÃO ĐỊU ‡ÃÔ 2007Ô ĐƯƠ ¾ĐỆ,ĐÃO °PTÔ ÃŨE ^>>>QĐỚ ĐƯỢ,ĐÃO "CÔÆĐĐÃO XĐÚ CH-ÔE ∞ĐƯỜ ĐƯỢ ÃÖÜLÖ ÚVÆLPÖÖ Ö>ÌI jillið ALII «ÚÚ †3ÖS YÖÚÚ 3ÖÖJIÖ ÚÚS "1188Ö ÚÚĞ ¤RPÖLJÖÖ ÚÉ ÃÖÖÖPÖE 3ÖLÐÖ †ÖJÜ YO_0POB UÉ ®00'O ACE "QEO ×UúµCO •OOYOO _iNEO AEü. 3GE "COAEE †EQEODA;OB _iNEE AEGE µCO ×090 »OOHOCE ®CE ×±ú» ÔČE ÚÚ ÔÔ-µÔ Ô ÂĈE ¤ËPÔµÔÔ Û LÔË µÔETI פĐÔÔµÔÔ ÆLÊÇ ÔYÔ, Ŭ Ô †Ô•Ô ^PÔÂCE µÔETI •Ô°Þ, Ŭ ÛúÆLÐÔÔ "CÔAĐĐÃO xÚú ‡ÃCÚÉ 200¤ii ÁČE ‡ÃO ¤ặO CHÔ CHỐTÔ 3ÔS 34ÁXEÝO 3ÔĐOO 9ŘETE ÃOŌRÝOO... ^9ÚHÔE CHÔ9ĐĐÔ ÚÉ ŸŎĔŇŎ †×ĐĴƯŮŢŮ ×ĨŎĸŎĔŎ, •ĬŨĖ ^®ŨƯŮ †ĬŌŸŎ †×ĐĴƯŮŢŮ ÆĐĚĬĎ †ÖŢŮ ¾Ė ^ÃŎ †×ĐĴƯŮŢŮ ŨÆ ÃĬŒĎ ŢŪĒŮS-Į**dē™B** ŪúB ²00Y0 Ūú,ü A0ŪĕYO£.

ÆŭŰÖ¸ιβ μŰxeB< ÃŪ¸ωŪưϸiù Φ'è ÃŪxeOŒOTO ½,ÖÖÖÖ ĐƯỞ †×ÖĐƯϸiù ∞αμÜÖ, ∞±ú¸iù ÃŒŒŪŪÖ ĐƯĎ †×ÖĐƯϸiù ∞αμÜÖ, ,ωèΘΥΌĎ¸iù 0ƯĎ †×ΘĐƯϸiù ∞αμÜÖ †Ü¸iù †²Ö ³ŒΘΘΘΘ ĐƯĎ †×ΘĐƯϸiù ∞αμÜÖ •ŒO ¸nEĐ ÆÑ.

‡ÃÔB Đế ÃỮCCÔ-ÃƯCCÔ, TỔ PỐPEU ĐƯỢCGŨ "CÔPEGRO XĐÚ ĐÚ‡Ô Để PƯỚC Đế TỘU," "CÔPE XÂPEU YỮ Ô, ĐƯỚC ÆĞÊ "ÖVEB XÂFEÜ "CÖRÂÖYÖceÜ ÆĞÊ "ÖVEB XÂFEÜ "Ö+DÖ "Ö≠BÖ ÆĞÊ •ÖE 3ÖS ÂÖLGS'ÂÖ †Ö‡Ö ÆÜ "ÖVEB YÖÖ ¤ÆĞE ÔưB 20070 ĐƯỢC "CÔPEN †900-0 ¤ĐƯC ÔưB 20070 ĐƯỢC "90 CE 300, NO ÃO, NÔUÔ, N ÔƯB 20ENO 20-10 , NSO ĐƯỢC ĐƯỢC TÂN. Ở "CÔPENNEO ×ÔÚ 300,NO ÃO,NOÔ,C Œ ×OÃO TO,NÃOPINO ÔN ÃOCEO ^9ÔÚNS TO×BENE ÔÚ,EE NEEM AEM XÃE ^ÃOE 20100×Ó. ÙPMÃÖ ÛGŶĞS 3ĞS HÖELÜ ®ÖÆLĞ 2ÖVÖÖĞS ÆLE XÛÚ HÖELÜ 3ÖD NÖ ÃÖ HÜHÖLÜ ÛGS Ö¤ELÜ ÂĞE XÛHÜÖ •ÖÖ , HEÖ ÆLÜ. ‡ÃÖ××Ö< 10 "00AMBO x0ú 300,110 ÃÖ,ûluð,ii ûluß ∞000408 308 µ00e0400x0 Æqi, ^40 ÃÖ,0 µ00e0400+Öe 0'ë ûluð4080 Ûê YÖLENÖ µÖLEÜ ÖDXA-ÖPÖ ÆLÜEĞÖ "ÖDÆLİK »Ûú ^GÖLÜE XALEĞÖ Ö¸Ü 20100GÖ "ÖDÆLİK… ‡ÄODE »»O< UúD9GED ~00×, NO AEO\$00 "00×4Eik ×Ūú 300, NO A0, Divô, ii Ùvß •00è•00è µ00è090×0 AEji , O•µ0 ^90Uv0è 20Y00×0 †0, ii †Y0, ii 3Aê <AOO 9DETA UÚ, NOE AEU YOOE HOPET UN THEUU TOXYOO TO, TO THEUU AOUNO TOBACEHQROPO AEDBOO "OD×FEIK, <AOB 70€0 7000 ÆII. AOCEO ÆD AOCEO, 10 µOYEII 308 20/0090 "OO×FDEOD XUú ‡AO ¾A-QBOUÚ 70€ ÆIIO UOO³ ACQ 1000 UúB 20070 Uú, ü jille Acq »QeUú®0 ‡AOUe ACCEO-ACQ 14AO CE «JúACO®CCE UúO 3CB <Uú 20Æ110 20⊳10 70A0>x00 Æ11. •090 Y00ú ×0úA0090 †900•0 70≆0 90€10 ÚL1100, Y090 Y00ú Æ110 ÚúÆ100 Á0€ ×00H00€ Đườc †°°C0•Ô ¤ã TÔXĐÔ? ‡ÃÖ∞ÔX ÔI "ÔŬEĐĐÔ XŨÚ XŨÁÕÔ°ÔE Ö,Ü 3Ở8 ¾Ã¿ŨÃÔ °ÞÖ ÃČE ⊣µÔÔ°Ō ¤ÆÖÔ "ÖVÆÜK… ×ÕÄÖ ¯ÖÜÜÜ Ü ÃÜE ^®ÜÁ %uTÖ Ü Ûú∙ÖÖ £ÖÖ, ^ÄÖ Ûú•ÖÖ Û€ †ÉKÜ Ü Ûú MPÖ-Ûú MPÖ 60 »ÖÖÜÖ Đú, Đầs là 1ỹ Ô< Đườ ‡±ớc™ù Atỳi Ởi "ĐƠ ĐƯỜO Athè XĐú ‡Ã ĐĐới "ÔF Độ ÂĐÔ XĐÚ pÔ Đũ "ÔS•Ô † Ô, ũ † ĐƯỜE 20ch ‡ÂODIĞE 308 -µÖPP ĞE ¸DÜPPO "ÖVÆİK... XÜIÂOPPO •OĞE TÖDEQMÂĞ ÜİÇNÖÖ ÆÇ ^ÂÖ †®O•Ö ÜIĞ 308 †""Ö . PP'ü ×Ö>Ö9Ö "ÖDAEik… •Ö9Ö ^ÄÖÜÜĞE †""ÖÖ . PP'ü ×Ö>ÖGÖÖ, YÖĞE ×9D>;"ÖVÖ °D-Ö ÄĞE ¾AAEü AEüÖ »ÖDAĞE Ü6 ÄÖCEÖ ÄÖEÜÖCEÖ ÜÚ,Ü TÖC≺YÖL. †Ö∙Ö ÜúB ‡ÄÖ ‡ÜúCEÖCÖĞB Üé †EFÜÜ ^ÄÖÜúÖ 2ÖEÜÖ 2Ö>**D** µÖCEÖ∞ÖFÐ ÆÜL †ÖÖTE ¤ÔUÖ ÆÑÜÖ XÛÚ 2003 TE ^TÛÛE WEĞÜ 87 ÛÚ ÔBÈ ÛÛÛ XÔUË ÊÛÛ, •ÖÜE †Ö•Ö XÃÜLÂ 7 ÛÚ ÔBÈ AEÚ. ‡ÃÔŮŮÔ TÔNÔ»ÔPÔ AEÚ ×ŨÚ ^9EďBPE 3ÔS ‡ÃÔ ‡ÛďBPÔBÔS ŨÉ †GEŸÜ †ÖPÔÔ AEŰEÔ »ÔYÔŨĴŐ AEďFÔ AEÚ.

SHRIMATI GUNDU SUDHARANI (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, I am grateful to you for having given me an opportunity to speak on this very important piece of legislation which, this Government says, changes the face of poor in the country and is a game changer. We have seen to what extent the game has changed since the Congress came out with a slogan 'garibi hatao' in 1971 to remove garibi by Indira Gandhi. Now the Congress is giving the slogan, 'hunger hatao'. After 40

^{*}Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

years of 'garibi hatao' slogan, garibi in the country has gone up. Who is responsible for this, Madam? And the present 'hunger hatao' slogan would also meet the same fate as the earlier slogan, unless the Government is sincere in its implementation.

I have heard the other day in a debate on a TV Channel, one of the Congress Spokespersons saying that it is a "Vote Catcher." I agree with him that it is not a "Game Changer"; it is a "Vote Catcher" and an election gimmick. If it is not the intention to gain political mileage and hoodwink the poor people of this country, the Government would not have waited for more than four years to bring this legislation. It is precisely with this objective in mind, Congress has brought this Bill.

Madam, our party never opposed food security to poor; rather it is the TDP founder, *Swargiya* Shri NT Rama Rao, who had implemented Rs. 2 kg rice for the poor in Andhra Pradesh, perhaps, for the first time in the history of this country. So, it is not new to us. When the TDP implemented this in 1983, this very Congress Party opposed the decision saying, 'it is not good economics and is a cheap trick.' But, exactly after three decades, Congress opened the eyes, doing what we had done in 1983. It is not only with regard to food security, but the same is the case even with regard to Cash Transfer Scheme also. Cash Transfer was first proposed by Shri Nara Chandrababu Naidu in 2009 in the TDP Election Manifesto. Now, the UPA Government has copied it and it is being implemented in some districts of the country. So, this is not a new scheme. It is old wine in a new bottle. So, all that we want is its universal coverage, because food is the fundamental right of every citizen.

Madam, in a country where you do not have a fixed definition for 'Poverty', where you have no accurate data either at the Centre or at the States as to how many poor are there in the country and without giving any thought to important aspects like production of foodgrains, procurement, storage, transportation and with rupees free fall, Congress is blindly and adamantly trying to push this Bill. Government is pushing this without any guidelines to States or making any regulations and without taking views of Chief Ministers into consideration. Madam, there is also a need to revamp, modernize and strengthen the PDS in the country.

Madam, the Bill provides 5 kilogram rice to poor. I tried to find out whether it is sufficient. I had gone through the recommendation made by the ICMR and

NSSO. The ICMR recommends that 7 kilogram of foodgrains for children and 14 kilograms for adults are required. Even if you look at the NSSO Survey, it says that 9.5 kilogram foodgrains are required. But, you are providing just 5 kilograms. From where will the poor get the remaining foodgrains? He cannot afford to buy them from the market. (*Time-bell rings*)

Madam, I would need two minutes more. I am a lady Member. So, you have to be considerate.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): The Chair has got nothing to do with this. The Chair has no gender.

SHRIMATI GUNDU SUDHARANI: You are giving me the chance to speak at last. So, Madam, I request the hon. Minister to increase the foodgrains to, at least, 10 kgs if you really want to help the poor.

Farmers are the backbone of the Bill, Madam. I tried to find out whether the Bill has anything for the protection and welfare of farmers. But, alas, there is nothing. Sir, food security can only be given if the farmers produce foodgrains. They can produce only if they see some profit in agriculture. We can give him profit only by protecting the MSP. And, there is nothing in this Bill to protect the MSP. Here, I agree with the hon. Minister. Recently, in an interview, he said and I quote:

"My worry is not today or tomorrow, but when the Food Security Bill will be in full swing — by next year — the subsidy bill will go up to Rs.1.25 lakh crores. My worry is that any Finance Minister will not be happy with this burden and their advice to the Council of Ministers will be not to hike the MSP."

He further said, "Because this will only increase the burden and that will directly affect the farmers and the farmers will get hurt. He will shift from crop A to crop B. Then, how are we going to implement the Food Security Bill?"

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Sudharaniji, please conclude.

SHRIMATI GUNDU SUDHARANI: Madam, other people also got some extra time. Madam, the Bill under clause 3 (2) covers 75 per cent of rural and 50 per cent of urban poor but the Ordinance reduced it and says that it covers 67 per

cent. I will give you the example of my own State of Andhra Pradesh. In Andhra Pradesh, out of total population of 8.46 crores, 8 crores are covered under Re. 1 per kg rice scheme. If Food Security Bill is implemented, only 4.61 crores would get the benefit. And, it puts an additional burden of Rs. 2500-3000 crores on Andhra Pradesh and the State requires 1.7 lakh additional foodgrains every month.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Thank you Sudharaniji. Please conclude.

SHRIMATI GUNDU SUDHARANI: So, Madam, I would like to know from the hon. Minister how he is going to do this.

Lastly, I wish to say this to the Government. I suggest to the Government not to just see populism, but provide the poor with nutritious food, because it is the need of the hour. Many of the women and children in our country, about 51-74 per cent, are malnourished.

Madam, there is no doubt that foodgrains are required at normal times. But, in this Bill, it is said that the Government would not take care of the same during natural calamities. I would suggest that this Bill be sent to the Standing Committee as many amendments have been suggested to this Bill.

With these observations, and hoping that the hon. Minister would address the concerns expressed by me in the true sense, I conclude my speech.

, \$\text{Oúi} \text{Oim} \text{O

Đườc ²040k ⁴Veà jù 0 Ã00 ước. 'CH vớc tội UCO²¹ ÃC và 100 có 140 ú 140 ú 170 có 240 0 100 thời 170 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 có 240 0 100 thời 200 0 100 0

ÃΟς ΦΙΟΙΟς ΙΙ ‡ÃΟ "†ΟΥΟΙΟΙΒ "ΦΡΟΙΟΙ *ΟΝΟΙΝΑΙ" μΟΘΕΘΡΟ "ΦΙΟΒ *ΟΝΟΙ ΟΘΕ «ΦΙΟΙ ΟΙ-ΦΡΕΕΤΟ, ΙΙ 1.25 »ΟΟΟΟ ΟΙΑΘΕΙΙΙ ΤΟ ΤΟΝΟΙΑΙΑ ΤΟ ΟΙΑΘΕΙΙΟ ΑΘΕΙΙΟ ΑΘΕΙΙΟ ΟΙΑΘΕΙΙ

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (Aandhra Pradesh): Madam, Vice-Chairman, this is a historic occasion. Ours is the rights era. AM •00 A0000 3000. This is our universal Vedic message, to strive for the wellness of all. The centrality of Swami Vivekananda's teachings is, feed first, only then preach. Our beloved bapu, Mahatma Gandhi, taught us to care for daridra narayana first. The need for food security comes from the prevalent food insecurity. Due to the scarcity of adequate quantity of quality food at affordable prices, there are price fluctuations and financial crisis, which lead to food insecurity, resulting in suffering from hunger and growing malnutrition.

Ensuring food security is a wider and broader challenge. How much wider and bigger challenge is this? As per 2012 Global Food Security Index of 105 nations, India ranks at 66 whereas China ranks at 39. Even at nutrition front, our India is behind our neighbouring country Pakistan. This has the essence of

concern of my leader, hon. Congress President, UPA Chairperson, Sonia Gandhiji. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): What is this? Across the floor shouting. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU: All along our Indian National Congress and our UPA partners established the standard of performance on growth path. My friends are enjoying in making phrases. They are at liberty. But UPA, the United Progressive Alliance, with its established track record, is the upper-path achiever. The UPA initiated the process of development equalization.

(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair)

Growth, development, prosperity and mitigation of livelihood complication became rights under our UPA Government. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: After he finishes, I will call you. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU: Shall I take a few minutes or not, Ravi Shankar Prasadji? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I have to make a request. Many more speakers are left. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA (Assam): Sir, I have a serious objection. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU: Sir, right to adequate food paves way to advance food and nutritional security to maintain intake standards and to raise the level of nutrition and standard of living. With this grand focus on vulnerable populace, we will achieve improvement in public health. With this Bill, we will not only achieve public health, but this will also reduce the burden on the Public Distribution System and the Food Corporation of India and its food storage requirements. To be in the statute that the price will not exceed Minimum Support Price for wheat and coarse grains, derived Minimum Support Price for rice, we can ensure livelihood security to farmers and this will also expand the agricultural

production and the agricultural infrastructure, geographical diversification of procurements and enhance the qualitative scientific decentralized food storage mechanism. This enactment will bring reform and much more transparency. The Union Government, with this Bill, with this enactment, is under obligation to ensure regular supply of foodgrains to the depots of State Governments all across the nation. On formation of State Food Commissions, these State Food Commissions will protect hunger-stricken, provide food security allowance and punish those who err in discharging their responsibility in delivery of right to food. This demands the involvement of rural and urban local bodies for which ready mechanism is available in the form of District/Block/Mandal/Village Committees besides ration-shop Committees. This has to be pruned and scope shall be evolved as enshrined by late Rajiv Gandhiji through his Constitutional Amendment.

A word of caution for the judicious functionality of these State Food Commissions is highly required. There is right to employment and the National Rural Employment Guarantee programme, but to check and to ensure the right to employment...(*Time bell rings*)... Shall I take two minutes, Sir?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, only two minutes more; not more than that.

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU: With this, the right to employment is yet to evolve through a proper mechanism at the State level, and with this precaution, there is every necessity to have the perfect State Food Commissions. The State Food Commissions will ensure the provision of Right to Food to the needy. Here, I want to make a small point. For the success of the Food Security Bill, we shall ensure proper functioning of markets and the trade system in the country. Developed nations' distortions are hampering the developed nations like India in food production. So, I request the hon. Minister at this occasion to have the proper mechanism to provide a ration card through AADHAR and other technological advancements as smoothly as getting enrolled as a voter. Here, I would remind that there are certain dreams from those benches...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, now, you conclude.

 on, and within a few hours from now, the food security is going to become the right of the needy Indians to have food. Thank you very much, Sir.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, my request is that still, a good number of speakers is left.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Seven more speakers are there.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Therefore, I am only requesting that let all the speakers be completed today and the voting may take place at 11 o'clock tomorrow after the Minister's reply.

ΑΘΒ ¸Ο ΘΑΘΑΘΙΑΘ ΤΟ ΚΑΘΑΘΑΘΟ : ΑΘ ¸Ū ¾ΘΕΤΦΙΟ ΦΟΦΙΟ & • ΟΒ ΦΕ ×ΟΕ *ΟΘ ΘΕ ΦΕ ΦΕ ΛΟΥΘΕ ΑΘΑΘΟ ΑΘΑΘΟ ^ \$ΦΦΙΟ ΕΩ. ^ΑΘΑΘΟ - ΤΟ ΚΑΘΑΘΟ - ΤΟ ΚΑΘΑΘΟ - ΤΟ ΚΑΘΑΘΟ - ΤΟ ΚΑΘΑΘΟ - ΤΟ ΚΑΘΑΘΟ - ΤΟ ΚΑΘΑΘΟ - ΤΟ ΑΘΑΘΟ - ΚΑΘΑΘΟ

ÁÒB ĀÒƯƠςὖ "Ởº ϊὐ×ỞΛΟΟ (↑¢Οςὰ ΤŒ-QĒO) : ĀŌςὰ •ΟŒ ΟἰΟΝΟΛΑΟ ΟΔΕ 'ΔΦ'Œ ÆĒK ĀΤΟΧΟΛΑΟΟ ÆṬ ¾Æ † ΤΦΘΟ ÃΟ ΦΙΟ ±ΙΦςΝΊΟΘΕ Ο Δ΄ςὰ ∞Ē † Οςὰ † Φ΄Ο ‡ÃΟ ΤΟςὰ ¾ΦΕΡΎΝΟ Ο Δ΄ςΟ »Œ. ŒΡΦΟΘΟΛΟ ↑ ΘΌΟΛΟ ΑΘΟΦΟ † 3'ΟΒ 3Ο ×ΌΨΟΥΝὰ † Οςὰ 20'0Ο ÆŢ; † ΥΌςὰ ↑ ΘΟΘΕ 1Ο ĀΤΟΧΟΛΑΟΟ † Οςὰ 2008-0ΡΟς ΥΌΘΕ ΤΟΒΕΝΟΤΟ ÆΘΕ •ΟΟΚΥΌΒ......(?ΑΦΕΛΕΤΟΡΟ)....

ÁOB ^~OAOPODÓXIO: Úd**olo**ão Úé •µCO×**O**PO¸ü Ã~OBÚáOO 20080 "ODÉ Æü....(3**4084-00F)**...

ÁĠB ÃĠĠĠţÖ "ÖP¦ü×ĠÁĠO: †ŸŐ¸ü ¾ÃE ²ŒĠŐ "ŒŨā ÆĀ ŸŒĒ ×±ú¸ü ‡ÃŐ Ő¸ü †Ö•Ő ÆÆ ¾ŒŒYĬŐ Úú¸Ö ¤Æ•Ö<......**(¾ÄÄĠĠŎŸ)...**

ÁÚB ^**-ŒĀPŪO ŠŸÖ** : ÛúĎŪÕÃÕ ĀČĒ †³ŰB ŸŐŨú Ā-ŪBŪÚ¸Ų > Õ. ÛúÞØ ĐÃÕÆÜ ÆÜ †Ü¸Ü †∞ÃÖ Ũú™ŸÕ¸**ß** ĀČĒ †³ÜB ÃÜÜVÕ Ā-ÜBŪÚÃÖ ²ÜÜUß ÆÜ. What is your reaction to this?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is for the House to decide.

ÁÖB 3ÖB ÆGPÖRÖÖÖ ÜRÖĞ (†ÖÖÖD ÖÖ¤<u>Þ</u>Ö) : ÃÖ¸Ü †Ö∙Ö ÆG 3ÖÖF™ÝÖ Úú¸Ö‡<...**...(34ÖXĞ-ÖÖFÖ)...**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no consensus.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, we can have voting tomorrow.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House should agree. ... (Interruptions)... What is your view?

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: Today.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Today. They are not agreeing. Shri Ram Kripal Yadav. Take only five minutes, strictly five minutes.

ÁÖB ÖÖ ÜGÖSÖ HÖPÐAZ (XÖLÖ) Þ : ÖLEÐÞJÖ, Ö †ÖPÖ 3ÖÖÖÞÖ <ÜÚ ÚÐAÐÖ ÖGEYÖ ÁÖE JÖRÞ ÚÚ GÐÖ "ÖÖÆÜÖÖ ÆÉE.

~^•070 YOÚÚ 3**0HO** ‡**Ã**0070 **jeh**00, YO'O YOÚ -Ö,NOB -Ö,Ü YOHOÖ'Ö **jeh**00.?"

´Ő †ÖPÖÖ,Ü ¾ÖŒYÖ ÛÚ,69Ö "ÖÖFEЙÖ ÆÉE ÖÖTÖTÖNÖ TÖHÖTÖÖÖÖ •ÖB ÛÜÖ, ≫ÖPÆÉEE ±é⊳Ü ¾ÄÖŒµÖÖE,∄MB ×8×0, 2013 ×000ú ji •00e −0 ji/08 −0 ii Y0eed0+0 AEij ^Ã00u0e ×0™00+0e Ouß Ou0e;0;0 Ouß AEii. 10 ‡Ã00u0 Ä3X00/01/0 Oúşilioo Æqie Ão CEC090 Oúşilioo Æqie. "OÆqieqio", ¾ö> ü²0900 Æqi ×Oú 65-66 ¾000 Oúß †ö•oö×iß Oqi 200×ü 308 »00k0 30k00€ 10,ü jetê Atû. Atú0 †0•00×ü 300,b0 0k 900/0×,b0ú Atú. Atú0,ê 10,b00€ 90€ ‡Ã0∞0k †Ô•Ô¤G ®ĐEŇ »ÔS ĐÔS ×Ôú 65-66 ¾ÃÔÔ ĐÁ 2Ô¤Ü 3ÔS ÆŬŐ, Ë »ÔŨÔ 3ÔĐÔE Ô, Ë. Ở ÃÔÔ-ÔVÔ ÆĐE ÞÔÆŬ 308 + 6070 ×36 17090 Ati x0ú ‡Ã0 ¤ã0 cê ¤ãe Vô Nei Ouß 0+0¤ár0.000 +089e 340xê x000 Ate. Ouôtô Ucôvê . UÖÜYÜE "Ö, ü. jiEĞ AEÜ †Ö, ü. Ûd܇Ô 3ÖÜÐÖÖ "Ö, ü. jiEĞ AEÜ. <Ûú ŸÖ, ïEú ÛdÖ‡Ô ×¤ÐÖ 3Ö, ü. Ûú ÖÖPÜE Û6 2ÖÖ¤ü ∞ÔE ¾ČEYÖ ÛÆB , ÔE'B °ÊVEĞ ÜÖÖ ÖÖVÖÖ, †ÖPÊ ÖÇĞĞÖĞ ÜĞÜĞ ÛĞ"Û °ÊVEĞ ¤Ğ ÖÖVÖ, ^ÃÖÛĞ 2Ö''ÜE 3ÖĞĞE ÆĞ •OXÔE AEU †Ô,U ¤ÂBÔ, 6 YÔ, HÚ ‡ÃÔ ¤ÃÔ ĈE <ÛÚ <ÃÔÔ ³ÔS YÔPÔÙÔ ÆŬ ∞ÔPÔÐE ÛÆÇÊ †Ô,U ×Ô»»ÔS ³ÔS ×ão TÔNGE ATIL. µÔÆU ÂLÊXYÔ ×ã ĐÔƯ †Ô, U 3QAORAÆU ATU. †YÔ, U ‡ÃÔ †ÃÔ ÔÔNO Ú ÚČE ×ã; U ĐEŇ XÚ, ÚÔ ÝQUIO ŸOČE ×®D; "OVO ŸOŌ, Ü TŌ, Ü ¤ġŌ ČE †ĀĒŌ, ŬOŌ TŌPŌ ÆŪĠŌS... ÃŨ OVOŌ ŌŒŌÚ ÃÕ COPŌ ÛNS ãOD Ō®Ō ÛNS ÃŒCÔ ÆŬŒĴĒ TĒĻŪŪŒĒ ÛĸB ĒĞB, »ĞĐŨĸPŌ XĬÆŪ ¿ŒĢÔ¤Ü PÔÆĒ ÆĞÊ ÃŒÛĸD... ÖÆĞEŸÜÖ, <Ûú YÖ¸ĒŁÚ ÆĞEYISÖŒ Œ -0000-0000, ¤não-¤não Afiroo, ii 170k ûns -»đe'ii ‡ão ¤pệo ûn jatão »đườ üdovide Afii tôjii ¤não, s yōjehi ÝÔ, ĐPÔ »ÔĐĐÔ 3ÔĐĐÔE NĒLĪ •ÔDYČE ALĪL. Ở ÂÔ Ô-ĐYÔD ALĐE XŨÚ PÔLET XÔNÔ 2ÔN ALĐE ^ QUÔĐÔB ÂCDXÔYÔ ALĐE Ô ÆÜ, ‡ÄÖÄĞE »ÖDEÖ ²ÖÆEÖ "ÖFÖ ÜÜB °ÖB¤ü ÄÖÖKNÖE. ´Ö ÄÖ'Ö-ÖYÖÖ ÆÐE √ÜÚ ‡ÄÖ ∻ÖsÖ ÜÉ ÖÖHJÖ'Ö ÄĞE .75 - Ô, Ñ.CP'ũ Ý ƯƯ CƠ ÞÔ »CƯỚC + Ô, ũ 50 - Ô, Ñ.CP'ũ ; ÔE Q B + CPÔD×0 + ± CẬU Ô×Ô - ŠÔ - CÔX Ý ÔB... ÔE ÔĐ PÔ, Û CÔ PÔS PÔ †0. ii <0ú 170< ×0ú×00e 100*00 †400•0 AEŭO 67 1040;000 »00e00e 0ú0e ¤40e 0ú0 0ú0'0 0ú;40e. 10 A0'0-OVO ABBE×Đứ pắtri 3°08 < Đứ 0°0VO Đườ ¾ĐIQUÔ ARI ×Đứ ARIÖ pắtri †®Ô•Ô ĐứARIÔ ÁČE »ÔX ĐÔ? ∞ÕÃÔ YÕ; IEU ÃĈE ŬŌKÔS ÛN OKÎO ÖKÎO XÛLÂÛÛ 1½-Û99 'Ô"Ô ÆĻ ×OÃO YÔ,NEL ÂĈE †Ö•Ô XÛLÂÛÛ9 XÛLÂÛ98 ÂĈE 30YÔ ,NED

ÆŸ ‡ÃÖ "Ö¸Ü 3ÖS ≪Ö½;"ÖYÖ YÖÖ¸Ü "Ö¸Ü ÃÖ¸ÛUиÜ ÛdÖ: →µÖÖĞÖ ¤ÆÖE ÛdG †ÖÄĞ;µÖÜdŸÖÖ ÆÜ. ^GÖ ÜÖÜÖÖE ÜÖ×»ÔFÐFÖÐE ČE ÛUŮÖ Ó ÚÚ,ÐÐE ¾ÐÖ×ÖE »ÖÐEÖ, •ÖÐE †ÖÐÖÖ ÜÖÐÐ †Ö,ü ÖÄÐGÐÖÖ 2ÖFÐÖÚÚ,ü †9Ö0•Ö ÚUÖ ^YÖDÞÆÐ Ûú,ďČe Æij ×°Ö9ÔÓ 2Ö»Ö -Ö,ü ÆïÖ 67 -Ö,ÃÖP'ü »ÖÖFÖÖ ÛvÖE ÜÖÖ°Ö9Ö ÃÖFÖ ÃÖFÖ;"ÖVÖ Ûú,ÆÖE •ÖÖ ,ÆEÐ ÆÜ, ÆŬŐŶĿ ^ŶŎŨĸŖŶŎŢĿĹ ŨĸŶĠŖ —ÖŎŎĸŶĿŌĿĬŎ ŨĸĬŎ ŶŶŦĸĸŶŨţŨŎ ÆŨ. †Ö•Ö ŶŨĸÃſŎŶŨĿŨĸĬŌ ¹Ý—ĬŎŶŌ ŒŖĬŨĿŶŌŸŨ , MEO AEŲ μÖEU 308 ĀCCECPEE ŪLIO ¾AAQO AEU. †Ö+Ö 2CECO, ė ×ŪLACOPO •CCE ×COVOVO 7CECOS ×COVOVO 1ECE AEŲ ¾AAEU 3ÔB XÂDTÖÄÖ 9Ö4Eni †Ö jeEB ÆEL. ×Ö″n>ÖB µÜREÜS.<. YÖRÖPÖÖÜPÜI 9ÖE <ÜÚ ×9ÖPÖÖÖ »>ÜJÖÖ £ÖÖ †Ö, Ü xÜLÄÖÖPÜE -Ö,ü 2ÖDIĞE ÜĞ ÜÚ•ÖÖ ÖÖ±Ú ÜÚ;DĞ ÜĞ″Û ŞÖFEBÖ ¤B EÖS... †Ö•Ö ×ÃEĞŸÖ ¾ĞFĞ TÖFĞÖ ÝÖ‡Ö ÆÜ. µÖFEÜ ¾ÖB ĐƯỢC ĐƯỞ ¾ÃÔĐ,Ô ÆÑ. CƯỚ™ ỞEĐỚC ÆÑE ÝÔTÔ ÆÑ ×Ô°ÔSÔS ỞEĐỚC ÆÑE ÝÔTÔ ÆÑ >6°ÔSÔ ĐƯỚ ¤ÕÕ ÕÃÔ 20celi jaEŭ AEŭ. Ĉi ÃOĈ-CIVO AGÉ Ĉiú •00ê ĈŒEGROŬŲ,Ŭ ĴŪÃOĈÐ AEJ ^90Ûdê ±dŷÖ¤Ö 90Æi ×ÖŏÖ jaEŭ AEŭ. ŸŰĊĿ•ŰFŰ ŰŰŎŶŰŶŶŮŰŎ ^ŸĊŰŎ¤ŒŶŮ ŶŸŒĂĿÆŨĠŰŎ, •ŰFŰ ÆŬŰ "ŰŨKÁĎŎ, ÝŨŒŒĿŤŮŢŮ ŰŨĽĿĖ ŤŶŰŌ•Ű ÛÚŮ ^ŸĊŰŎ₽ŒŶŮ ®Varia Oú, bíde Yode ×Ovão †ö+Oo, ü i ō, ü ariið ‡ãö ×O×Ö Oia i oð-þöið áde »odalode Oude Uiob≥o®90 i obrijoð Oú, öf9te Đườ Đườ°O Đứ, NGCP "ÔVEÔN° NỘ, MÔTEI ĐƯỚYCO ĐƯƠ ×XÔNCHO ĐEŲ ÃÔ, ĐƯỜ, Ŭ ĐƯỚC ‡ÃÔ "Ố, Ŭ →MÔTO ×NFTO" "COXTEIK... 7009090µ0 70700900µ03 •03 µ0400 Æÿ 10 Ã010-0100 Æ£e √Ûú ≪0×2,11010 Y00,ü 70,ü ¾0e ‡Ã0 70,ü ¾0100,ü Ûú,£10e. †Ö∙Ö ‡ÃÖ ×Ö»Ö Ûé ÖÖ+pÖÖ ÃÜE ‡ÃÖ ¤pịÖ Ûé •ÖÜE ÝÖ,pPÖ ŸÖPÖÜÉ Ûé »ÖÜÖ ÆQ ¤eÖEÜérÖ»ÜE »ÖÜÖ ÆQ ×Ö″ùè ŐÖǶÜBÇN'NG ÛÉ »ÖÖĞÖ ÆĞI ×ÖPÖÜÉ ×>ÖK ‡ÃÖ ×ÖSÖ ÛÉ ŐÖHÖÖ ÃÜE ÜÖÖ⊐Ö™Ö ÃÜGBÖÖÖÖ Űúj¶ÜE ÛuB †ÖMÇ;µÖDdŸÖÖ ÆÜ, ^®ÖDÉ ÖÜŸÖ ÃÖ¸ÛUÖ¸Ü ®E °Ö>**ID** ÆB <®ŸÖÆĎÃÄÖDÚ Ûú¤üÖ ^šÕµÖÖ ÆÜ †Ö¸Ü ‡ÃÖ Úú¤üŐ ÚúÖ ÆÜŐ ÃÖPŐ »ÖDÍÓ ÃÖ°GEÖÐŐ Úú¸GÐŐ "ÖDÆÐÍÖE ÆÜ. "Ő ÃÖ°Ö-ÖVÖÖ ÆÐÐ ×Úú "Ö⊕Ð ÃÖ¤ÆÖ ‡ÃÖ "ÖÖÖ ´ÖË ÆÜ.

"ÔVEÔB° JIÔ, ×ÔVEÔQ U •OÃOÔ "Ō¤ JEÔ †Ô Ô ŶOÔ, U "Ō, U ²OÔCeÙ †Ô, U ÃOĎ ÔDCeÙ ÃÔE ÝOÃÔNÔ JÆĽŮÔÔ ÆÚ. †3ÔS ×ÔĐĐỘ LI Đề »ÔYPÔYÔ 28 ×Ô>CE ÃCƯOO> LI ÃCE TROO-XÃYÔ ÆU †Ô, U 10 ×Ô>CE 7ÔCEL ÃCE TROO-XÃYÔ ÆU. <ÃCE -Öl≃á,ÖÖE -Ö,Ü ×ÃG;ÖBÖ -µÖÖ9Ö ×ÆPÖE Úúß †ÖRÖ;µÖÜdYÖÖ ÆLL. µÖE ‡ŸÖ9ÖE 2Ö>ÌB •ÖÖE ÖPÖÖ×ÃGYÖ ‡»ÖÖÜá ÆLŅ Öİ ÃO O-OVO ABE Đứ ¤ặO Đế Đứ¢Ô <ÃO TỘU ĐỘO ĐƯỢC TO ĐƯỢC ĐƯỢC TO ĐƯỢC ĐƯỢC TO ĐƯỢC TO ĐƯỢC TO ĐƯỢC TO ĐƯỢC TO ĐƯỢC ͺĸŒŬĈĖ ÆŲ ^®ÕŨĖ ≫Ô< ૐŨţŨĠÔ ^~ÕĢŮ ŨúͺĔĈĖ Ũúß †ÖÆÜ;μÖŨúŸÖÖ ÆÜ.

ťOŁOĎENIÖ, ‡ÃÖ 'ÜE ÛÚ‡Ô ÜÜÖX'QLÖÖÓ ÆÜL. †ÜÖ •Ö°Ð×XÖYÖ,ÞÞÖ "ÖÞÖÖXÖB ÛÓ 'ÖÖ-µÖ'Ö ÃÖE ‡ÃÖ µÖÜEÖ°ÖÖ ÔÉ ŸŎŒŇŎ †®Ŏ•Ŏ ¾ĀŶŎĸŇŎ Ôú,ŒŎŌ "ÖŬŒŇŒ ÆŲ »ČŒŨĞŌ <Ôú ×,ŭďŒŶÔ ÔÉ †Ö-ÖŎ,ŭ TŌ,Ŭ µŌŒŬ TŌŅŌŌ ÝŌŅŌŌ ÆÜ ×ÛÚ •ÖPÐ-XÖYÖ ÞÖ ÖÞÖD»ÖR...**(34ÖXÐ-ÖÖPÐ)..**..ÚúB 34ÖXÖÃEÖÖ ÛÚĞE ÃÖ¥ÜEÜ ÚÚ ÆÖÖ ÆÖÆÖÖ...

ÁÖB ^~ÖÄÖPÖÖÖÄÖ : †~ÖÜúÖ ™Ö‡′Ö ÜÖŸ′Ö ÆÖE ÝÖµÖÖ... †ÖÖÜÉ 5 ×ÖPÖ™Ü ÆÖE ÝÖ< ÆŪ.

ÁÖB ,ÖTÖ Û¢ÖÖ>Ö µÖÖ≖ÀÀ: ÃÖ,Ü ÖÖ ¤ÖE ×Ö®™Ü ÖE †Ö®B 2ÖVÖ ÜÖYÖ Ûú,Ü ¤**®**ÖÖ...

ÁÖB ^~ÖÄÖÖÖÖÄÖ: †"″Ö, †ÖÖ <Ûú ×ÖŸÖ™ü ÖE ÜÖYÖ ÛúB⊶Ö<...

ÁÖB ¸Ö'Ö Û∉ÖÖ>Ö µÖD≔ÖÖ : Ö'EÖE;µÖ, ´Ö ×®YÖE;ÐÖ Ûú¸ü ¸ÆEÖ £ÖÖ ×Ûú <ÃËŒ ´Ü≔¿EŒ Ûuß †Œ;ü ¾Q;OÐO -µÖÖ® ×®ÕE ÛúB †ÖXÖ;µÖÜúŸÖ Æü. ÖÆÖÞ¤µÖ, ÝÖ,ØPÖB †Ö,ü ²ÖׯÖÐ×ÖB ′ÖE ÝÖÐÖ,ü ¸ÆÖ ×ÖÆÖ,ü ÃÖPÖ ÃÖÞ ÝÔ,QPÔ TÖ⊋QÖ, •ÔÆQÔ 2ÔÆQÔ ÆB 2Ô≈ÆÔ≫ÔB ÆŬ †Ô,Ŭ ÝÔ,QPÔB ¸ĐƯỚÒ ÁÔE 9ÔB″ŨE ÝÔFÔ,Ŭ2ÔÁÔ,Ŭ ÛÚ,GPÊ ¾ÔD≫ÔŒ ÛúB

ÃÖÜYÖÖ †×ÖÜú Æÿ ^ÃÖÜúß †Öçü ¾ÖçÖBÖ →YÖÖÐ ¤ÐÖÈ Úuß †ÖAÇ;YÖÜÖÖÖ Æü. ÖÆÐÖEYÖ, <Úú 0°ÖYÖÖ ÚuÖ . ×ÃÃQ,Õ †Ö, ü. Æŭ. ×Ûú. Ûé¦ü. ÃÖ, ÔưÔ, ũ. ÛúS. ÃŒŒB. ĈE. ×ÔÆŌ, ü. ĈE. ÝÕ, ŒBS. , ĎÜÖ Ûé. ŸŒ°ĈE. ÝŒĸŌ, ïºZÕÃŌ, ü. Ûú, ÆĞE ¾ÃO»ÖŒ Ûưβ ÃOÔPOÖ ÛÚ'Ö ÆÜ †Ö¸Ü ¸Õ•pÖ ÃÖ¸ÔUÖ¸Ü Ûưß ×¸ÖÖŒ°Ô Ûé †®ÃÃO¸Ü ¾ÃÆŬ †×ÖÛÚ ÆŨ. ‡ÃÖ †ÃÖ ÖÖ₹ÖÖÖ ÛdÊ 3ÖB ¤Œçü Ûú, ĐĐÊ ÛdB †ÖÞÖ; μÖÛdŸÖÖ Æü.

ÁÖB ^-ÖÄĞÖÖÖÖÖ : †2Ö †ÖÖ ²ÖKŠÜK...

ÁÖB ÖÖÖ ŰGÖĞĞ LÜĞ™ĞĞ : Ö**EĞ**ÇÜĞ, ÖL <ÛÚ 2ÖÖYÖ †ÜLÜ ÛÚEÜ ÛÚ,Ü †ÖPÖB 2ÖÖYÖ ÃÖ'ÖÖYÖ ÛÚ°ÐYÖÜ... †Ö∙Ö µÖÆü ÃÖ,ÔUÖ,ü ≪Ö×;"ÖYÖ YÖÖ,ü ⁻Ö,ü <Ûú ^⁻ÖÆÖ,ü ¤ĕ 'Æß Æü. ÃÖ,ÔUÖ,ü ®ÖE ∞ÖÄÖ YÖ,ÆÜ ÃÖE , ÔBĐÔYÔÔ, Ũ YỐ, ÔYB PƯỚC ĐỚÔ ≫ÔÔYÔB ÔÚ, Ũ ™ẬĐÔ ÔƯỚC <BYÔ ĐĐÔ-ÂÔÔÚ ^ÔĐĐÔ, Ũ ™ẬƯÔ ĐÔÒ, ^ÃÔB YÔ, ŒŨ †Ö+Ô ±ÁĐ Ũ ÝÖ, ĐƠC PỐ PỔ »ÕÔU, Ũ ZỮEĐÔ ÆB <ĐÃÕ Đà ÕÚ ÛŨ Ö »ÔÚ Đà ŒŪ.

ÁÖB ^ ÖÄÜPÖÖÖÄYÖ : _ÖÖÖ ÛŒÖÖ»Ö •ÖB, †ÖÖ ÛŒÖÖ Ûú_ÛŒ ²ÖKŠIK...

ÁÔB , Ở Ô ĐƯỢCO Ô , LỚC ĐẦĐ : Ở ‡ÃÔ ×ÔSÔ ĐƯƠ ÃÔ CEÔĐO ĐÚ, ĐỮC ĐƯỢ ĐÃT † ÔĐB 2000 ÃÔ CÔYÔ ĐÚ, ĐƯƠ ĐƯƠ -Ö91Ö%Ö¤ü.ü

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, I want to raise only one point. Two MPs from the TDP party were suspended today morning. I appeal at least at the time of voting they should be allowed to come and vote.(Interruptions).... It will be a healthy precedent, Sir.(Interruptions).... They will be used only for voting.(Interruptions)....

ÁÚB ^~ŰĀŬŶŰŎĊŶĬŎ : ÁŰB ŢŰŎŶĠĸŎŨÃŨ ~ŨŎĂŨĸŎŨŶŨ... ×ÃŒĿŨ 5 ×ŎŶŶĬĬĬŰĒ ÃŨŸŰŸŨ ŨĹĘĒ.

ÁOS ŢŮG-XB>OTÃO TOTAG-XDFO: ÃÔ, Ŭ TÔ ±ớs ữ ÁOELµOS, Đ'OS XÔSÔ ÔUÔ TO, Ŭ OĈ, Ŭ OĈ, Ŭ ÂÔ ĈE OĐÔ ÔU, Ŭ OÔ ÆĐE µÔE Ữ ×8×0 20EBO 70EBO 70EBO + 0 •0090 4004EB £00... 0EBO 04EBO QABO 70EBO 70EBO 70EBO •0B 90E 4 •0B0, Đườ, IPB PÔ PÔTEU ×Ô>Ô ×Ô™ĐườÔ ÇIEÂU.. XÃHÔO 2011 ČE •ÔPÔ ×ÔÔĐÚ ÃÔPÔO ČE PÔTEU ×Ô>Ô ĆĐĐ ÆHTÔ, ĈI ÁÖ Ö-ÖYÖÖ EÖÖ ×ŨÚ µÖÆÜ ×Ö×Ö ^ÁÖB ÁÖ ÖµÖ "ÖÖÄÖ ÆÖË •ÖÖ×YÖÖ, »ÖEÜÚ®Ö ‡ÁÖE Á™MD-NÖ Úú ÖE'NI ÜúÖE ¾Ö±Ö ÖÖ† üjÖ† 8Ď3 8ÖÖÖ Ö«Ö" äÆÖ BAROKODÓÖÜ 8üÜ ü'ÐÖÖÖÇ«ÖÖ" ÖÞIÇÖÜÜ 8ÖAÜC-ذAÖAÜC üj± …OOQY ÖÖü× 'ČE »ÖÖ'ÖÖ,Ü ÆLÖĞÜÜ,Ü ÃÖ,ÜÜÜĞ,Ü ÜÜĞE †ÖD⊳ÆÖÄÖ •ÖÖ,G ÜÜÇEÖÖ Ö⊳ÖL.. †2Ö µÖÆÜ ×Ö»Ö Üé °þ°Ö ´ÖE »ÖÖĞÜ ACPOO AQUCE TOOAO ÆDDÚÚ, II ÆTIOO, E AO¤CPO TCE †QUOO ÆTIL. TO ‡AO ×O≫O ÚTIO ACTCEOGRO ÚTI, NOO ÆDE. •CPO ‡ÃO YO'OO "O=16EOO CUGE -OB 6-OB 6 200Eüü ×90Cu>O9Ce Cud ~ 00Cud ×0>OVOO Æü YOOE •340>00 ObUB 90EbO ±68°140O .Æij »ĞΘÛĞPÖ μÖ∞Ü ^ÃÖ "Ö∞ÜEÖÖ ÜÜĞE ∞80000Ú;Ü "ÜÜĞPĞE ÜĞB ÜÜĞB;Ğ;Ö ÜĞB YÖ‡Ö YÖCE •360>ÖÖ'ĞÜÖB ±62°NÖÖ ÆÜ fall'. •ÔDE ÃÔPÔ ÃŨE "ÔD" ŨE ÆÜ, ^ÃŨE ¾Ů, GĐE Û ƯÔ "QUÔ "ÔĐE M ÆÐKÖÖ ÆÜ, »ÔEÛ ÝÐ •ÔDE ÃÔPÔ ÃŨE ‰ữ Ô, Ü ÆÜ. %APEU †-Ö9B ÜÜK, jiÖlÖ Ö9Ök... ÆŭÖ YÖE >ÆE Æŭ ÄÖ9ÖÖ, YÖKÖÜĞE 3B »Æ >ÆÜEĞ. 9ÖEÄĞ»ÖLJ™MÖ ÜE 7ÖÖĞÆ 'ČË 3'OS µÔFAS ÆĞË ĮÆĞÎ ÆĞ. ÖFEĞEÿÖ, ®OCĞĞÖ×Ö+Ö ÜGÖ ÖĞܵÖ ÜGÖ,ÞÖ ÆĞ ×Ûú ^®O ×ÖCĞÖE ÜGÖ ÜÖÖPÊ ÜGÖ

»ÔĐƯƯỢ ÃÔ, ĐƯỜ, ũ ƯƯỜ †""Ở ƯƯỜ ° °ÔTƯỚ CÁ 208"Ô CÉ ĐƯỢC +ÖNÖÖ †Ö, ũ •ÔŒ •ÔTƯỚ ÚÉ 208"Ô 'ČE 90/Eni •00/90 "CO-AEIK, ^ÃCO KO TÔ'O ŞE OÃOO ŞU ÆDECO ÆNI. ÃO DÛKO ŞU ČE 20'SE ÆNK »COKO XÛKÂO YO DÛE ÃĈE TŒĐĂCOSIÔ ÚU, NĈE ÆŬI µÔÆŬ 2000 ÆŬĈE ÃÔ Ô-Ô ĈE ®VÆN †ÖVOS ÆŬ. ‡ÃĎ»ÔK ÆŬÔ †Ô CÃĈE ÚVÆÐRÔ "CÔZĒNĈE AEũ xÔú 'GPÔ, ÔPÔE ÔưB ÔưÔ¢Ô 2007Ô "ÔVENA AEũ. 20x0®≈N Ôé ÃCÔEÔ †ÖÖ •CÔ‡<, 2014 ´GE †ÖÖ ×±ú,ü »Ô™ĐÚ, ji †Ö×ĐÔ; †ÖÖÖJB ÃÖ, ĐÚÐ, ji 2014 ČE †Ö×ÝÖB... ‡9≠ijÖ YÖÖÐB •ÖB °ÖE °ÖÖ,Ö ∞ijÖÖ £ÖÖ — ÝÖ, BFÖB ÆÐUÐÍTÖR TÖLÜ ^ÃÖ YÖLÐFÖB ÆÐUÐÍTÖR ÚÐ ÞÚÖNÖбÚ ÃOÖLÐ NÖÐÐÖR ÐR ÖDEÖÐÐÐAÐ ÚÚLÜ NÖB EOB... ‡65-ÐÐÐUÐ dÃÔ> Ŵď™ũ 20°0 ÝQUÔO £CÔ †Ô,ũ †Ûé>Ĉe ^ÃÔ ÝÖ,QPďB ÆTMÖ†Ĉe Ûé ®ÔÖ,ĕ Ûé 20°>Ö Ö,ü ‡∮¤ũ,Õ ÝÖDÓB ¤ÔTÐÖ,Ö TÖRKÖJÜ (ČE †Ö YÖ‡Ô EÖL.. µÖÆÜ ''ÖЇ™Ü ™EE ±ÉÐ ÉF ÛLÖЇÔ 'ÖÖÖKKÖB ''ÖB•Ö 'ÖVÆÐA ÆŬ, µÖÆÜ ''JÖ‡™Ü ™EE ±ÉÐ ÉF 2ÔFBÍO 2Ô⊳ÌB "ŰS•Ö ÆIL. †Ö•Ö >ÛvÃÖ ŸÖ¸BÛĞ ÃÜE ŸÖLÛРפJÜÖ •ÖÖ ¸UEĞ ÆLI ×Ûv TÖÄÖÖ ÛvÆĞÖ ÂÜE †Ö.YÖÖ? -TÜHÖPPÖGYÖB •ÖB, TÖÄÖD ≪PÜÜÜX×ÖK 40-BEYÖ-BE TÖBEÖBÖYÜYÜĞE ÄĞÇ •ÖE 5 ×ÖÖÜÖ ÜÚ,ÖBE'LE ÄĞE •µÖP¤ÖD ÖXÖ 40ÖXÜYÜÖ ™MEÃÖ Û¢ °ÞTÖ ÖE jÜÜE ÆRK ÆTI. TÖÄÖ ×®ÖÜÖ×Ö× ^®ÖÄE •ÖE 5 »ÖÖÜÖ ÛújÖsÌI ÃE •µÖÖ×Ö ÛúDE »ÖDEÖ 25 AEÜFÖÖ,Ü ÛÚ, ÜBB ÌL ÛÚÖ AEÜ †Ö,Ü "ÖYEÜBÜE 3ÖB ÛÆ"Û HÖBÊÖFÖÖ<Ó "ÖBÖ "WEBB EÖA, ‡ÃÖ-BÖ< "ÖÄÖE ÛúB ÛÚ'ÖB °Űvetá AEÚ. Ôváeði ∙ÖÖVÖÖ AEÚ xÔú ¸ö∙þö ÃÖ,ÐúÖ,Ü ÃÖE ÖÖMÖÖE. ÔvőPÐ ¸ö∙þö ÃÖ,ÐúÖ,Ü xã,ÖeÖ Ôú,ÑÖB AEA? •ÔE ÃÔ₽ÃÔ>B ¤B •Ô<ÝÔS, ¾ÔFE 3ÔÔ,ƯÔ ÃÔ,ÔUÔ, Œ ÞÔS ÞÔÔ ŒVEÐ ÞÓÔ ŒVEÐ ÞÓÔ? ,Õ•ÞÔ ÃÔ,ÔUÔ,Ü ÛUÔ; ÆŬŐÔ,Ð µÔÆÔÔ ×ÔÆÔ¸Ü ĈE ŸŨĒ ±UŶĴŌ×Ô ÆB ÆÔÆÔĒ ¾ÔSÔÔ ÆŬ. ×ÔÆÔ¸Ü ÛưB ÃÕ¸ÛUÔ¸Ü ÝÖŸÔ ĈE ∙ÖŌ ¸ŒB ÆÜ »ĈŒŮÚ°Ō ‡ÃÕÃĈÊ ^ÃÕŨŒÊ ±ứΦO¤Ō ÆŨÊ ∙ÕCYŐŎ.. μÔÆŬÔ ÃÕŌ¸Ē ŨÉ ÃÕŌ¸Ē ÃŎŒĈS μÔÆŬ •ÕŌŦŌYĈÊ ÆŬ, ‡ÃŌ»Ö< Ő μÔÆŬ ÛvÆBÎÊ Û6 ×>Ô< ÛÔ>ÎD ÆBTÔ ÆBE Ûv ‡ÂÔÔE ÛvÔĐÔ ‡-Ô,B^-Ô,B ŶŒBE ÆÊBÔ "ÔŒÆEK… ÛvÆD •ÔÔÔ ÆBE ×Đú μÖÆU "ÖBRÖKAB "ÖĞÖ ÆÜ. ‡ÃÖ ¤₫Ö TE "ÖBRÖKA ®Ö ÆĞE YÖE ŒµÖÖ ÛLÖŒÊ ŶŶŎ,@PÖE ÛÉ ≫Ö< ÛLÖĞÖ Ûú,≸ÖÖ? ÃCOVÔ •Ô®'ŒE Œ 3ÔB YÔ, OPŒE Û6 ≫Ô< Û£Ô'Ô ÆÐEE ¾ÔO>ÔÔ ®ÔEA ÆLL. ¾ÔEU ¾ÔOU'U Û£B , Õ•Ô®ONŸÔ ÆLL. ¾ÔŒU'U Ole AENIO OUB 20070 AEDROB AEU †Ö,Ü ÄSKÖPÜSKÖÖL AEU SÕL •ÖFÖ "ÜKKÖKÖ †ÖYÖ AEU.†ÖÖÖLB 3ÖB ÄÖ,ÜNÜĞ,Ü †Ö‡Ô £ÜS, ŸÖÜE †ÖÖÖÜE ‡ÃÖÛLÜE †ÖÖÜE <•ÜBEE ÖE ŒHÜÜE ÖVEE ĻÜÖÖ £ÖÖ? ŒHÜÜE ÖVEE <ÖVEE KAĞ ÇÜLÜ ÃÖ,ÛLÜĞ,Ü ÖÜE

ÃÖ,Ų Ö <ÛÚ 20070 ÛÚÆBPÖÖ "ÖÖFBÜÖÖ ÆBÉR <ÛÚ ÆBÜÖÖ ÆÜ <EE™Ų <ÛÚ ÆBÜÖÖ ÆÜ ±ŒE™Ü †Ö,Ü <ÛÚ ALÖĞÖÖ ALÜ MAEMÜ. YÖĞE «ELMÜ TÖÖ 2ÖYÖÖ İELE ALÜ DÜĞYÖĞÖ 2ÖYÖÖ İELE ALÜ »ÖBÜLYÖ ±ALEMÜ T»ÖYÖ ALÜ. ^ÃÖÜ¢ ××Ök †Ö'ÖÜÜE ™Œ™E¢×ÖS ÜÜÖ'Ö ÜÚ_99Ö "Ö≻ĬĬÖÖ... †Ö'ÖÜÜE ^ÃÖÜ¢ ××Ök "ÖÜ_jerük;ÖYÖ »ÖÖ9ÖS "Ö≻ĬĬÖS... †ÖÖTÜE ÛMÆĞI ÆĞI •ÖĞE YÖFÖĞĞÜĞ ÖMÆĞIĞÖKÖ ÆĞI •ÖĞE ZÖ"ÜE ÆĞI ÃÖFÖÜÉ ≫ÖK †ÖÖTÜE µÜÆĞI ÛMÜTÜĞÖ ZÖTÖÖTÜE ÛMÜ Ôườ ở ĐượCổ đấi, »CĐÔư9 ‡ÃÔÔƯCE • C'ÔN9 Tổ ũ ^ YÔO ĐỀ ÔÉ «MÔK † C'ÔÔUCE ÃŨ, Œ YÔ ĐƯỮC... 3'ÔO, NÔ ÃO, ĐƯƠ, LÍ CƯỚC TẬO CE ÃO LÝO ÁICE ÃO LÝO ×ĐIỆN ĐƯỚC ÞƯỚC L. TẬO CE TỔ CE ÚM ÃO CÂUCO TỘU ÁM. TỐ LỚC TỐ CÓ TỐ †ÖKÝÖÖ †ÖLÜ ^ÃÖÖĞ †»ÖÖÖÖ ÆÜÖ "ÖÖÆÜĞ ÆÜ XÛÚ •ÖĞ 3ÖB ÖĞ;Ö9Ö ;ÖÖÄÖ ÆÖÇ •ÖYÖÆÜ•ÖYÖÆÜ ÖÇÜ •ÖĞ , ÖÇ ÖTÖ ÜLB ≖ÐUÖTÖL ÆÐ, > CN>ÖÄÖÖ ÆÐ, XÐEÐÓ -ÖÖÐÖNÖS ÆÐL JÆG ÆÐ, ^ÃÖÛĞL ÜLÃĞL JÖÐÐÝÖ? ÜLÃĞL ÝÖ, GPÖ ÔĐ TOÃO T[©]OĐO T**rácic** #00/ENDO £00 ×0ú ×3/APYO, ü ÂČE †ÖÖÜLĞE 2070/3/46... "Ö 20AÖ ÜÖY"Ö ÆBB ÜÚ, ü "NEBÖ ÆBE...‡ÄÖ×»Ö< "Ö †ÖÖÜLĞE -ÔĐÔCĐO XI XĐÔO "CÔLƯƠ ĐÁC THỚ ĐỚCĐO •CB, TỔ ĐỚC **(ÃO QÃO ĐƯB 'CÔTQ...** TỔ II DƯỚCĐO ĐƯB †-µGCÔO ÁCŨEQÃO YÖCGÖB •ČB °ČE µÖÆÜ •ÕE ÚÚÖÖ ×ÚÚµÖÖ ÆÜ µÖÆÜ ÚÚÖÖ ²ÖÆÜÖ °ÖÆBÖE ÆĞÇĞÖ "ÖXÆÜK £ÖÖ… †Ö•Ö †ÖÖ µÖÆÜ ×Ö»Ö »ÖÖ< ÆŸ †Ö¸Ü †Ö•Ö µÖÆÜ ÖÖÄÖ ÆÖÄÖÖÖ... ÖÇEĞ ¤ĞÖ ÖE »ÖÖKÖÖE ÛĞ ÖPÖ ÖE <Ûú ¾ÄA¾ÖÖÄÖ ÛuÖ "COEŬOS ATĪ, ^90000 ATŪÃOSOO -OÃYO ATŪĞOO... ‡9Emi ;ܤdē Ûmi ÃOCEO †ÖÖ9E CEĞE 200509E Ûnd 'OO00 ∞ijiO, ‡ÄÖÜ**é »»Ö< ²ÖÆÜÖ-²ÖÆÜÖ -Ö°PÖ%Ö**¤ü.

ÁÜS ^~ÖÄÜPÜDÖÄÖ : -ÖPJÜRÖÖ¤Ü. ÁÜS †Ö,Ü <ÃÖ. ~Ö+ÖÖÖÄÖ •ÖS, ²ÖÜ\$»Ö<...

^ôÃĠŶĠŎŶĬŎ ŐŒŨĖĸŢĬŎ, Ő ÆĿĸŢĬĬŎŶŎŌ ÃĜĿŢŎĬŎŌ ÆĐĿÆĿĸĸŢĬĬŎŶŎŌ ÃŎŢŨĸŎŢĬ °ŶĿŶŎŎŎŎ ŰĿŢŒŖŶĿ¾ŎŎĸĠĿ ∙μΰ⊃ΦVŐ, ü »OĐYŌĐĒ ÛNĒ TÔS>ČĒ ŨƯĠ>Ô ŪƯĠ™Ü פIK. AEŪ. 3ĀĒ »OĐYŌ ‡ÃÖ ÜÖÖP ÃŌĄÕŌ ×ÕSÖ ŪƯĠ »OPPŌ ŪỮÃŪE »OΦCP †ÝÔ, ũ ÃÔ, ĐƯƯ, ũ μΟΨΕũ 100°ΘΥΟΒ ΑΕῦ «Đú †Ö•Ö 308 ΥΟΟΚΦ ĐÉ 75 "Ö, ÃČŒ"ũ »OΦCŒ Được ‡ÃÔ «Ö»Ö Đế 'CÔ+JÔ'Ô ÃŨE †®Ô•Ô ¤ĐRE ŨưB •Ô'P, NÔ ÆŲ ŸŨE ‡ÃÔ ¤P,Ô ÛưB <ÃŨB ÆÑSŌYÔ Û¢ ≫Ô< ∞Ô'Ô₽Ô,U ŨưỚPÔ ÆD? ÆÜÖÖÇÊ ¤ÞJÖ ÛUÔÊ TÖ•ÖÖ¤Ü ÆBK 67 ÃÖÖ»Ö ÆDÊÝÖ< ÆÜL T²Ö YÖÛÚ TÝÖÇÜ 75 TÖJÁĞEYÜ TÖPÖÖ¤B Ûu'B ÆĞB>ÖVÖ <ÃĞB ÆÜ ×Ûu´ †Ö∙Ö ³ÖB ^®ÖDu'ĞE ‡ÃÖ YÖ_iÆÜ ÃĞE †®Ö•Ö ¤ÆĞE Ûu'B •Ö°Þ_iNÖ ÆÜ YÖĞE ×±ú,ü ‡Ã00¢ →0°0€¢, ii •00€ »0°00000, ii ‡Ã0 ¤¢,0 0¢ %i0, ii ,0•0 0ú, li0€ , liEt AEi →0°0 »00€0€ 0.18 •µ00×10°0, ii ÃÖ,ÔƯỚ,ũ ĮNEB ÆŲ ÛƯỚXĐÃÔ ÔN »ÔĐƯỚE ÔUB ÃÖ,ÔƯỞ,ũ ĮNEB ÆŲ ¾ĐE ÆB ‡ÃÔON ≫Ö< ∞Ö´Ô™Ô,ũ ÆŪ. †Ö∙Ö ÆŭÖ •Ö°ÖVÖ ÛvÛE ŒµÖÖ ∞EPĈE •ÖÖ ¸WEB ÆÐ? •ÖÄÜE ÆÿÖ ²ÖDEÌI ŰE ±ÐÃÜE ÆÜK »ÖDKÖÜE Ûvß ÃÖÆÐÞÖVÖÖ Ûví¸bÜE ÆÐ, ^ÃŮB YÖ,NEU ÃŮE ÆŬŐ ‡9Ô YÖ,NPÖ »ÖÖLÖĞE ÛÚÜE †9Ö•Ö ∞6PÜE ÛÚÖ ÛÚÖÖ ÛÚ,NPÜE. µÖÆÜ YÖÜE <ÃÜB ÆMB 20010 ÆDE Y܇Ô — •OĀĈE ÃÖ,QÛďO,ŭ ^®OÚDE Ö″DSB TÔÚD ÈTÖÚD È ÛÚ,Ŭ ¤ERO "OŬÆDŪB ÆŬ, ^9ÆË Ö″DSB -"ÔÚ⊳ DÚ ú ii ¤Đểc Cư3 • PP þ. Vớ ° PV Đã ATŲ 20→ Cú ^ PTE Ö'' DÞ. CB - "ÔÓÚ> ĐĐÔ - AÕÜÖÖ PÖ "ÖÐ Fük, YÖFÜB ^ PÖCÚÖ Ûĕ"Û 3Ö>Ö ÆÛÊ ÃÖÛÎÎÖ ÆÜ. •ÔŸÎVÖ ÛLÛÊ ÇÎBÊÎYÖÇÜ WERÊ ÛLB •Ô'ÞÇNÖ ÆŬ. •ÔŸÎVÖ ÛLÛÊ ÂÛÇDÖ "ÖDÆÜK, »ODPOE Úďe ÁČEjōÖO "ÖDÆIK… •OPO »ODPOE ÚTE TOÃO ÇÔEOYOQU ÆDPOQ YOU ±ÉE UÚS ÁČŒLJŒE, 11°18 †ÖPE †ÖÖ ÔưB †""B ੴBŸQĐÕĒ ĈIĒ ÔưÔ, ÞPÔ ĐÔƯỘ ĐÃE. ÃÖ, Ŭ †®PÔ ÔƯÔ × ĐÔƯÔ Ô ^Ÿ ÖÌ∞BPÔ ÃÖ, ĐƯỚÒ, Ŭ ÔưB †""B ŶĠĸŸĊŗĬĊĠ ÛĠ ÛĸŮŗÞŐ ŶŎŦġ ÆijŦŐ Æij ²Ö≫Ûú ÆŭŐŎŢĠ ĸŨúÃŰŎŶĠĠ ŶĠċ †ŸŶĠ ŰŒŒŶĬŎ ÃĠċ †®Ŷ ÛĸŐ ×ţŴĸĨĿŶÔ 'ÖÆÐÍÖÖ >6∙Ö»Ö »ŒÐÖ Ö⊳NÖÖ ÆÐ ÖÆÐÍÖÖ ÞÖÐÐÖÖ ÞÖÐÐÖ "Ö⊳NÖÖ ÆÐ ^9ÆÐ ²»ŒÚÚ ÖE >6<ÖB »ŒÐB Ö⊳NÖB ÆŬ »ĈĐƯỢ ¾090 ÃO ĐƯỢ ÔE 308 XÛÁO90 °CE ,ÕIV ∞60 °CE69VO ÛÚ,ÔE, −Ö,NOS ÛÚ ÃOS9O "B,ÔÚ,Ŭ †®O ÔÁ × ĐƯỢ> Ô ^Ÿ TÔI×ĐĐÔ CÚ (ĐĐỀ CƯỚ) CƯỚCÔ × ĐƯỢCÔ PETE. ÃÔ (ĐƯỚC TE CÚB ÝÒ×ÔVÔ °ĐSX QUỚC CÁ CƯỚC ĐƯỚC ÞÔ × ĐƯỢ> Ô †®Ô ^ŸÖ¤ĐÔ Ûú,ĐĈ Û£ 2000-00eü 308 XÛAÖÔÔ ÛÛE 30ÛÛE 70EÛ ÂÖÛÊÛ ÖEÛ ÂÛÛ ÆŬ. †Ö-Ö XÛAÖÔÔ ×Õ,ÑÖ,Ü Ôú•0Ô ÔN 90°CE ×80000 °C>00 •00 , NEO ATI. XÔFEI ÃŌ, ÔƯƠ, Ŭ ÔƯB ÝO>000 90XÝQUỐC ÔN ÔƯƠ, ÞÔ ÔƯƠ, ÞÔ ÔÚ•0Ô ÔN 90°CE ∞80700 "Ö»00 •00 ,ieE0 Æii....**(ÃÖ'QÃO ÛÆ 'ÖЎY)..**.ÃÖ,ÿ 'Ö ×ÛúÃ00900€ ÛÆ '2070 Ûú,ü ,ieE0 Æ**6**£

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude now.

ÁÖB , ÞÖXÐS, Ú RÃÖEÚ TÖ-ÖÖÖÄÖ : ÃÖ, Ú ÞÚÆÚ "Ö"ÖÖÖ ±ÆÞ Ú ×ÃÖŒÞŰÐS, ₹™B ×?Ö»Ö TÖ, Ú ÆÚL. TÖ ÆÐS, ÞÍÖÞÖÖ ÃĈE †ÖYÖÖ ÆĞE. ÆÜK,ÜPÖÖÞÖÖ †Ö,Ü TÖĞÖÖPÖ ÃÖPÖÃĈE •µÖÖ¤Ö †®®Ö TÖ¤Ö Ûú,ÜĈE ÆÜ.

ÁÖB ^~ÖÄĞÖÖÖŸÖ : ÆÖE YÖLÖÖ... †ÖÖ ²Ösü •ÖÖ‡<...

ÁÖB ÞÖXB Ú RÁÖEÚ TÖ-ÖDÖYÖ : ÞÚÁÃÖÐÐ •ÖÖE †®Ð TÖÞÐ ÚÚ ŰÖD ÆÚ ^ÃÖÚÐ ××Ö< 3ÖSÐ ÞÖ ÚÚB 34ÔVĂĂECÔ HÔPEU ÃÔ, ÔHÔ, U GÔPEĂ ÛÚ, U TÔHÔ AEU. ÃÔ, U TÔ "ÔĐENÔO AEÐE ĐÚ ÝÔ, ĐPÔ »ÔÔHÔE ÔHÔE ÃOÃYÔO †GÔĐ-Ô ×´Ö»Öê.

ÁÜB ^ ÖÄÜPÖÖÖYÖ : "Ö+ÖÖÖYÖ +ÖB, †²Ö †ÖÖ ²ÖSü •ÖÖ‡<...

ΑΘΒ , ΦΟΧΘΒ, ΙΙ ΘΑΘΡΕΙΙ - Ο-ΟΟ Ο-ΧΟ : ΑΟ ΙΟΙΟΟ, ΙΙ ΥΟ ΙΑΖΟ »ΟΟΧΟΟΕ Ο ΘΙ »»Ο < ΑΟΑΥΟΟ † 900 • Ο ^ - Ο»ΟΖ-Ο Ο Ο ΙΑΘΕΝ ΑΙ ΙΑΘΕΝΙΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑΙ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑΙ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑ Ο ΕΝΑΘΕΝΙΚΑΙ Ο Ε

ÁÖB ^ ÖÄÖÖÖÖÖÖÖ : ŠØÛú Æü. -ÖPIÖÖÖ¤ü.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now, Shri Mohammad Shafi; not here. Now, Shri Naresh Gujral.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL (Punjab): Thank you, Sir. A detailed analysis of this Bill clearly shows that this is nothing but a political gimmick, an attempt to hoodwink the poor people of this country, on whom a * is being perpetuated. As the LOP stated this morning, it is nothing but re-branding and re-packaging of the existing PDS system.

Sir, the Bill says that it will cost the country Rs.1,25,000 crore. If you look at the budgetary figures, Rs.1,24,840 crores were provided for the PDS and other schemes relating to the women and children.

The hon. Minister in reply to my question last week stated in this House that if the PDS was updated to 2013, it will cost the exchequer another Rs.4,000 crores. This means the total cost of the schemes which exist today plus PDS, if updated would have been Rs.1,29,000 crores. Now, the Bill says it will cost Rs.1,25,000 crores. You tell me what is being given to the poor. Sir, my contention is supported by the Bill which states that 54.9 million tonnes would be required for this proposal. Sir, I have a PIB release of 20th August which states that 56.3 million tonnes would be required for the foodgrains under the PDS which means you are reducing it by 1.4 million tonnes and then you are saying that you are giving a lot to the poor in this country.

^{*}Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Sir, very, very poor of this country will be hit very hard because till now they were getting 35 Kg of foodgrains per family. But now an average family of five would only get 25 Kg foodgrains. According to the NSSO survey of 2009-10 the per capita cereal requirement of a human being is 10.7 Kg. Now, where will the balance 6 Kg will come from? The poor man can't afford to buy from the market given the way that this Government has messed up the economy; and the way food prices have gone up.

Sir, already in States like Andhra Pradesh, Chhattisgarh, Madhya Pradesh and Punjab, we have our own schemes wherein we not only give cereals but also *daal*, *chana*, sugar, etc. Now, I wish the Government should have taken care of these things; and borrowed a leaf from our book.

Sir, there are two more points that I would like to dwell upon. A nation that cannot secure its existing foodgrains stocks can't promise food security. Today, we have 20 million tonnes of foodgrains rotting in the open. In Punjab alone 12 1/2 million tonnes of foodgrains are lying in the open; and in Haryana another 6 million tonnes of foodgrains are lying in the open and in Uttar Pradesh more than one lakh tonnes of foodgrains are lying in the open.

The other day the hon. Minister has said that CAP is a scientific storage. This is the most amazing thing I have ever heard that you keep foodgrains outside on the plinth. Monsoons are in full swing; and you say that this is a scientific storage. Please name one developed country wherein foodgrains are kept outside, then, they call it scientific storage. What does the Government do? It says that they have planned to add six million tonnes of foodgrains storage capacity in this year. It is totally illogical. You have 20 million tonnes of foodgrains lying outside. You plan for six million tonnes of foodgrains. Then, what do you build in the first three months? It is merely three lakh tonnes. It is a shame the way that they are storing our foodgrains.

Sir, today, we are lucky that we have some food available. But if monsoons fail two or three years in a row, where will these foodgrains come from? We have to look at the supply side economics also to ensure that our poor people would continue to get foodgrains because this nation can't afford to import foodgrains, given our precarious foreign exchange position. You have to ensure that the farmer gets a good price for his produce. This Government claims that it has doubled the

MSP since it came to power. Sir, I would like to challenge them that compounded every year the rise has been 9 per cent for wheat and 10 per cent for rice. So, don't fool the poor farmers of India because the input cost has more than quadrupled in this period.

Sir, I have given a notice to amend clause 2 of the Bill requesting for the Swaminathan formula to be adopted which means input cost plus 50 per cent would be the MSP that would be given to the farmer.

Sir, 65 per cent of our population is dependent on agriculture and we have to ensure that they get a fair deal. Unless we make agriculture a viable business, this country will not be able to guarantee food to its poor. Thank you.

DR. KARAN SINGH: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, we have come to the end of a rather long and very interesting debate and the Minister will surely reply to the various questions raised. I would simply like to put, first of all, this whole historic legislation in the broader perspective. What the UPA has attempted to do in the last nine years is to put in place for the first time the elements of a social security net for one billion people — it has never even been attempted in human history before — more than the population of the whole of Europe and North America combined. We started with the Right to Information Act which opened out the doors of the Government to every person, which gave every person an empowerment. We went on to the Right to Education Act, which was a constitutional imperative and now has become a right. We went then on to the Nation Rural Employment Guarantee Act. Despite all the criticism, millions of people have benefited from MNREGA, and now we have come to the Food Security Act, which is another element in this network that we are trying to build for the security of the people of this country.

Sir, thanks to the green revolution and the patriotic farmers particularly of the last two speakers' States of Haryana and Punjab, and elsewhere, we have enough foodgrains today. I remember the days, the Prime Minister will remember, when we lived from ship-to-mouth, in a ship PL-480 food came. We used to go around the world literally with a begging bowl asking for food. Today we are growing enough food for our nation. What we are now trying to do is to ensure that this food really gets to every deserving person in the country at a reasonable price. Its important difference is that now this is becoming a legal right. It is not only a

give-away, it is a Right to Food, like the Right to Education. So there is a qualitative difference between the earlier programme and this programme. That is the first point I would like to mention.

Sir, it is a shame and a disgrace that millions of children still go to bed in India without a full meal. Once we are able to get this grain to them, hopefully, it will considerably improve their nutritional value. Certainly, grain by itself is not enough nutrition. That is an obvious thing. As a former Health Minister and my colleague sitting here, we all know that nutrition needs a lot of other inputs. But grain is essential. Without grain you cannot have any basic health. Therefore, the †®ÖÜ †ÆŭÜ †®ÖÜ †ÆŭÜ †®ÖÜ 1 am anna; I am anna; I am anna because they realized that that was the basis of civilization. Therefore, it is very important to realize what it is that we are trying to do. We are not talking about the problems of the farmers, that is a separate matter. There is one point I must mention which seems to have disappeared from our public discourse, Sir, and that is population stabilization. Nobody ever mentioned it anywhere. I am not going into that now. We will have a separate debate one day on that. I am just pointing out that if the population continues to grow exponentially, then the pressure upon our foodgrains will naturally increase.

I know there are concerns about financial implications. But as the Leader of the Opposition pointed out, and as other Members have pointed out, this figure that is being bandied around that we are driving the country into bankruptcy by all the columnists, and some of the TV channels are saying that you are driving the country to bankruptcy, is simply not true because this Bill is encompassing a large number of existing organizations and strengthening them. Sir, three very quick points and I will be over. Although my Party has 24 minutes, we are giving up 20 minutes for you.

I would like to make three points. The first is storage. I agree that it is a crime that children go to bed hungry and our food rots. So, you will never see a thin rat in India, but you will see a lot of thin children. Rats are always fat because they are eating our grains. Therefore, the provision of storage facilities, building of storage facilities all over the country, has to be the first priority both in the public sector and in the private sector. We should not leave it to the Food Corporation of India which is not able to do it and has an unsavory reputation.

The second is transportation. We are often told that nobody is prepared to lift the grains. How do we take them from one place to another? We have to work out a proper system, a scientific system of transportation by truck and by train so that the grains can move as and when required, and they don't have to be stored. It has to be computerized and modernized, and again, both the public sector and the private sector have to co-operate. The final point, Sir, is distribution. That is the essence of the whole thing. The Central Government and State Governments must ensure that the highly subsidized foodgrains reach the people they are meant for and that they do not get sold in black markets. This is a very important thing. Panchayati Raj Institutions have also got to show this. There is the cancer of corruption that is eating into our economy, society and our politics and it must not be allowed to destroy this very great and historic programme that we have brought.

Finally, Sir, let us not be misguided by the prophets of doom and necromancers of negativity because there are some people who are, constantly, bewailing what is happening thereby disempowering people's minds and hearts. We have got to renew the national purpose. We are celebrating the 150th Birth Anniversary of Swami Vivekananda. His favourite verse from the Kathopanishad was that we should awake, arise and move forward boldly across the razor-edge path. It is the razor-edge path which is before us. It is a difficult path, but there are no short-cuts, and we all have to do this together. The Opposition, the Government, all of us as a nation, have to ensure that we get enough food for our children. I will end, Sir, with the verse from the Kathopanishad which is an inspirational verse.

MR. CHAIRMAN: This concludes the discussion. Now, the Mover of the Resolution.

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I had moved the Resolution opposing the use of the Ordinance path under article 123. And the reason for the opposition was that between the 5th of July when the Ordinance was promulgated and the 6th of August, there were 30 days, and there was no urgency. In any case to operationalise the Ordinance or the Bill, as and when it is passed, it is going to take a reasonably long time. The Bill itself says that it will take 365 days

for States to prepare the list of priority and eligible houses. In the entire discussion which has taken place and to which many hon. Members have contributed, I am still struggling for a response as to what the need was to have an Ordinance to cover up for this period. We could have easily waited for a Session of Parliament, and during the Session of Parliament, we could have discussed, amended and altered the Bill rather than confront Parliament with a *fait accompli*. Also, during the period, from 5th July till date, there are no effective steps which have been taken, no guidelines which have been framed and which have been sent to States in order to take further steps in the matter. All that has taken place is that a certain number of political programmes have been held in some selective States in order to demonstrate that we are putting in this Bill into motion and operationalising the Bill itself.

But, that is only a showcasing. That is not an effective implementation of the Bill and such political signals, as I said in the morning, can never be a lawful, valid ground for promulgation of an Ordinance. Sir, I had said that my party is in favour of the Right to Food. The Right to Food itself makes life more meaningful, it makes it more effective. It is essential for anyone to survive, to have an effective life which can't be the anti-thesis of an animal existence. It is life which is more meaningful and, therefore, empty stomachs will have to be fed. My party, therefore, supports the concept of the Right to Food. But are we substantially expanding the right over what existed prior to this Bill being brought in. Are we substantially increasing the outlay? The answer is 'no'. Are we increasing the number of persons who are going to benefit from it as were benefiting from preexisting schemes? The answer is 'no'. Are we increasing the quantum quite to the contrary for BPL? We are reducing the quantum. Compared to several States, we are reducing the quantum. Are we making the food which is being promised, more nutritious? The answer is, we are not doing it. It is only foodgrains and nothing else. In the face of all this, is this an effective Right to Food or is it merely a repackaging of all existing schemes? I regret to say that it is a re-packaging of all existing schemes and not an effective Right which is being given as far as this Government is concerned. I would, therefore, urge the hon. Minister, when he replies to this debate on merits, to take all these factors into consideration and try to improve upon the Bill. There are certain amendments which Members of the Opposition benches have moved, which will go a step further in strengthening this Bill. I am sure he will be magnanimous enough to consider some of them.

PROF. K. V. THOMAS: Sir, today this Bill was discussed in this House threadbare and the discussion started from the hon. Leader of the Opposition, Shri Arun Jaitley, and 37 Members participated in the discussion, ended by Dr. Karan Singh. Sir, a large number of suggestions have been made. I have noted down those suggestions. At the outset, I wish to bring to the notice of the House that all the constructive and positive suggestions will be carefully followed when we have the rules, guidelines and when we start implementing this important legislation. I also wish to assure the House that the federal system of this country will be totally protected because we know, especially in the case of the food security of the nation, both the Central Government and the State Governments have to go hand-in-hand. Unless we work together, not only in The Food Security Bill, but even in the targeted Public Distribution System which started in 1997, it cannot be implemented effectively. Sir, in this context, I wish to bring it to the attention of the hon. Members, many Members suggested that there are better food security measures and projects undertaken by many State Governments.

There are model projects like what is now being implemented in Chhattisgarh or in Tamil Nadu or, my CPI(M) friends from Kerala said that Kerala has got a model project. I agree with that. But, the model projects which all of us like to be implemented are not the projects which can be implemented throughout the country, because the character differs from State-to-State. When hon. Members suggest that States are doing better, I think, one important factor is forgotten. The commitment, both financial and availability of foodgrains to be given to the States, by the Centre is much more than what the States are spending now.

The present TPDS — let us forget about the proposed Bill — supply 1 kg. of rice to the BPL at Rs. 5. For example, Kerala is getting it at Rs. 5.30 — 30 paise is the addition of the State, because State does not want to bear the transportation charge. So, we are giving it at Rs. 5. What is our economic cost after paying the MSP, after paying Bonus and the State taxes? Sir, per kilogram of rice alone comes to Rs. 27. So, we have to bear Rs. 27 and States are getting it at Rs. 5. For example, to my State, Kerala, when I give it at Rs. 5, now, the State Government is giving at Re. 1. And, what is the subsidy given by the State? It is only Rs. 4. I am not pointing out the fact that it is small. But the burden of the Government of India is much more than the States that are bearing.

Similarly, I come to the quantum of foodgrains. Some hon. Members pointed out that the present Chhattisgarh model is good. I know it is good. I myself have gone two or three times. But, look at the present situation. Sir, the existing subsidy, as per the TPDS, to Chhattisgarh, is Rs. 2,027 crores from the Government of India and the subsidy now we have to incur — once we implement the National Food Security Order in Chhattisgarh — is Rs. 2,910 crores. It is more than Rs. 883 crores we are bearing.

Similarly, I come to foodgrains. Now, we are giving foodgrains to Chhattisgarh, through the TPDS *i.e.*, BPL, AAY and APL, to the tune of 11.33 lakh tones. In the Food Security Bill, it comes to 12.91 lakh tones. So, roughly, it is more than 1.5 lakh tones.

Sir, you look at other considerations. For example, hon. Members from Tamil Nadu said that they have got a better system. Okay; I agree with that, because I am just its neighbour. They also put a question whether the Government of India is supplying foodgrains to 18 States, including Tamil Nadu, Kerala, etc., which becomes lower than the present supply. What are we going to do?

Sir, in the case of Tamil Nadu, the average off-take in the last three years has been to the tune of 36.78 lakh tonnes, for BPL, AAY and APL. So, here, we must understand that from 1997 onwards, both the BJP and the Congress have been in power. In Tamil Nadu, the DMK and the AIADMK have been in power. But, during these periods, in the case of Tamil Nadu and Kerala, only AAY and BPL were mandatory; APL was not mandatory. For example, in 2009, when I became the MoS with Sharad Pawarji at the helm, CPI-M was in power in Kerala; Mr. Divakaran was the hon. Food Minister. In the beginning, for APL, we gave only 8.5 kg per family. After that, we had enhanced it to 10 kg. ... (Interruptions)... My point is about 1997 onwards. That is what I am talking about. Before that, so many things have happened. At the end of the last LDF Government in Kerala, from 8.5 kg it came up to 10 kg. We never looked into the politics of this. Now, we are giving 15 kg. My point is that, for APL, it is not mandatory; the price is linked to the MSP. When I give AAY under two rupees for rice and five rupees for BPL, my APL price is linked to the MSP. Now, we have taken a decision because some of our friends from these 18 States, including Tamil Nadu and Kerala, were getting less. If you take Tamil Nadu, their total AAY, BPL and APL was Rs. 36.78 lakhs. AAY and BPL together was round about Rs. 20 lakhs. Now, it

has been enhanced to Rs. 24 lakhs under 'priority'. The priority is much more liberal. So, now we are giving 24 lakhs. A State like Tamil Nadu, which is getting only Rs. 20 lakhs under the present PDS system, under AAY and BPL, is going to get Rs. 24 lakhs. Then, there is a balance of twelve lakhs. That is the APL. Under the APL, it is always so, that the quantity is not fixed. It depends on the off-take of the State for the last three years and the availability of foodgrains, and it is linked to the MSP. So, what is the decision that we have taken now. Because of the representation from 18 States which are getting less than what they are getting now, the hon. Prime Minister has taken a very bold decision to protect the quantity and the price for the next three years. And what is the additional burden? The additional burden is of Rs. 5,000 crores. Dr. Maitreyan had asked me one thing. I would reply to him. He had asked me if it was included in the Bill. Dr. Maitreyan, it is the quantity that is included in the Bill.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: What about the price?

PROF. K. V. THOMAS: I am coming to that point. I had told you that even the last time, APL was linked to the MSP, but because of the recommendations of many Chief Ministers, including the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu – as also Mr. Karunanidhi, Mr. Baalu and all our friends from Kerala — we decided in the Cabinet that when the Bill is taken up in the Lok Sabha, the price of Rs. 8.30 per kilo for rice and Rs. 6.10 for wheat would be protected. This is the present APL price. That has been approved by the Cabinet. I can give you the document. What else do you need?

It is a Cabinet decision. Do you want much more than that? I have got the document with me. We have not included it because APL is always linked to MSP. So, the Cabinet has taken a decision that till these three years are over, because this is a review. Somebody said that after three years, we are going to drop it. Sir, we are not going to drop it. It will be reviewed. Review does not mean we are going to cancel it. So, we have protected all the 18 States with more foodgrains and additional financial burden.

Then, somebody asked me, in a State like Kerala, where there is almost universal rationing, Tamil Nadu has universal rationing, what you are going to do. I have discussed it with my friends from Tamil Nadu, with the Chief Minister of Kerala. Somebody alleged that we have not made due consultation. Sir, what we

have done is this. Remember, it was in 2009, exactly on 4th of June, the Rashtrapatiji made this decision. The next day, we sent the Draft Paper to every State. Sir, EGoM was constituted under the then Finance Minister, Pranabda. It met eight times. There was an NAC under the Chairmanship of Madam Gandhi. There was Dr. Rangarajan in the Economic Advisory Committee of the hon. Prime Minister, and I called the Food Ministers of the country four times. What else is needed? Wherever I went, except a few Chief Ministers, I met all of them personally and explained the position. Sir, in Bihar, I met Shri Nitish Kumar. About three months back, I met the Odisha Chief Minister, Shri Naveen Patnaik. In Punjab, I had discussions with both the Chief Minister and the Food Minister about one month back. I went to Chhattisgarh more than three times. I have good relations with Mr. Raman. So, we have discussed all these matters. I myself have written to the Chief Ministers.

DR. K.P. RAMALINGAM (Tamil Nadu): Have you met the Tamil Nadu Chief Minister, Sir?

PROF. K.V. THOMAS: I don't want to answer it. You know better than me. ...(Interruptions)... I sent the message. The Food Minister of Tamil Nadu, the Food Secretary, we used to meet. I go to Cochin via Chennai only. So, I used to meet all these people.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: None of the Union Ministers... ... (Interruptions)...

THE MINISTER OF SHIPPING (SHRI G. K. VASAN): It is because of the Union Ministers... ... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, please. ...(Interruptions)... Hon. Members, allow the Minister to continue.

PROF. K.V. THOMAS: I have all the respect for Jayalalithaa. But I was conveyed. Yes, except a few Chief Ministers, I met everybody personally and explained it. In this House also, I met almost all the Members of Parliament, explained the position. So, Sir, there has been adequate consultation.

Then, somebody may ask, why you have taken the Ordinance route. Sir, this Draft Bill was presented to the Lok Sabha in the end of December, 2011. It was sent to the Standing Committee. The Standing Committee took one year's time. The Standing Committee went to almost all the States, consultations were made. And,

finally, the Standing Committee unanimously gave the recommendation, except, as I said in the other House, that Seema, from my State, made only one amendment, *i.e.*, universal PDS. I am with her because that was the stand taken by the CPM and the CPI for quite a long time. Except that, the recommendations of the Standing Committee were unanimous.

Sir, let us take the first Draft Bill. In the first Draft Bill, 75 percentage was the coverage; out of that, 46 will be priority in the rural areas; and 50 percentage in the urban areas, out of that, 28 percentage will be priority. So, in the original Bill, we had three categories at that time, *i.e.*, priority, general and excluded.

The Standing Committee in its wisdom after having lengthy discussions has suggested that there can be only two categories, that is, 75 percentage of priority in the rural area and 50 percentage of priority in the urban areas. It is a drastic change because in the existing PDS what the Government of India is obliged is only 6.52 crores of BPL families, not more than that, that is, 32 crores of the people. There is AAY sector within this which is about two crores of families who are entitled to 35 kilos. It is family-wise. In the existing PDS it is 35 kilograms. But what is the position in the country? I am giving 35 kilograms to my State Kerala in the present system of PDS. But Kerala Government is not giving 35, they are giving only 20. Many States cutting across the country are not giving 35. I am not blaming them because they have enhanced the number. The BPL, APL and AAY is decided by the Planning Commission. So, on that basis it is only 6.52 crores of BPL families which is now 32 crores. Because of the unanimous recommendation of the Standing Committee which was headed by our good friend, Dr. Vilas Muttamwar and the Members representing the political parties both in Lok Sabha and Rajya Sabha are Members of it. So, because of that we have enhanced it to 75 percentage in the rural areas and 50 percentage in the urban areas, that is, coverage is 82 crores of the people. From 32 crores it becomes 82 crores. We have not rejected any major recommendation. We have expanded it. For example, their suggestion was that in the case of AAY families, just like the other priorities, we give only five kilograms. But after I discussed this matter with hon. Prime Minister and Madam Gandhi, they suggested that AAY is the poorest among the poor. There may be only one member in that family or two members. But as they are getting now 35 kilograms at the rate of Rs.3 for rice and Rs.2 for wheat per kilogram, that has to be protected. And, Sir, we have protected that. That is our

Sir, another question that was raised was that whether our Public Distribution System is ready enough to handle this situation. Sir, we have got the PDS. The responsibility of the Central Government is to procure foodgrains, store it, transport it and make it available to the State Governments at designated places. This is what our responsibility is. Sir, when the new UPA-II Government was formed, our storage capacity in 2010, covered and CAP, was total 583.86 million tonnes, which, within last five years, we have built up to 751 million tonnes. So, it is a commendable achievement, Sir. We will build up another five million capacity before the end of next year. Somebody asked the question whether 'covered' is only scientific, whether CAP, is not scientific. Sir, CAP is the scientific CAP not the katcha which India has been using for a quite long, long time. When I visited many of the wheat producing countries, I found that many of them are using the CAP, but it should be scientific. There are some scientific norms fixed for that. It is not the katcha one. Sir, I would also add that we have got a huge damage. It is true there was a damage. Though the FCI is handling and procuring till the arrival of the foodgrains, there is no control by the FCI. During the season, when the

foodgrains come, we are bound to procure and protect the MSP price. Last year, our procurement was to the tune of 82 million tonnes whereas we needed only 60 or 62 million tonnes. This year, it has gone up to 73. So, Sir, huge procurement is taking place, because we have to protect the interest of the farmers. So, whatever said and done, I know the FCI is a white elephant. It has got its negative points. But the FCI is the only organisation under the public sector - it is not with private—which guarantees procurement of the foodgrains which come to mandis and nobody else. And it is the only Organisation which protects MSP for the farmers. Suppose they are left to the private traders, what would happen? We had a bad experience last season, because we were procuring everything under the MSP, giving the bonus and giving the State taxes. What happened? As we had a higher procurement, we found out that private traders did not come to the market. So, we had to supply the huge stock we had through the OMSS, but a heavy subsidy was there. So, this year, we took a conscious decision. The OMSS wheat is taken by the biscuit manufacturing companies. So, they will pay the MSP plus the bonus and plus the State taxes. So, as a result, this season, because in the last season we purchased about 39 millions of wheat in Punjab and Haryana, it has come down to 24 and 25. They knew that they would not get subsidised wheat from Government. So, this is the huge responsibility we are holding. So, Sir, we are fulfilling all these responsibilities.

Sir, another question was raised whether we will protect the farmers. Sir, if you look at the Bill, you will find that the Schedule III clearly gives an indication that revitalisation of agriculture will be given foremost importance.

There will be agrarian reforms through measures for securing interests of small and marginal farmers. There will be increase in investments in agriculture. Sir, there are about six or seven measures like these which we have added in this Schedule so that the farmers' interests are being protected.

Sir, similarly, take the MSP price. The MSP price will not be frozen. The MSP price is decided by the CACP. The CACP's recommendation is usually accepted by the Cabinet. So, this Bill, Sir, is a new step. I am not claiming that it is hundred per cent perfect. We have got a long dream. I appreciate the views of my friends of the Left from Kerala. They had said, if it is a universal measure, well and good. But can we have more than 62 million tonnes? Our procurement is 30 per cent of what we produce in the country. When we calculated in 2010-11, it

was 339-340 million tonnes, and we found that we could scientifically procure 30 per cent, which would be enough for the requirement under the proposed Food Security Bill. If you go beyond that, then there will be scarcity in the market. The prices will go up. So, we have taken all these things into consideration and then this Bill has been brought. I do not want to go into many more details. This Bill has been discussed in the other House also.

So, with these words, I request the hon. Members to pass this Bill unanimously.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall ...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, the hon. Minister has made several statements. I have just two specific questions to him. There are States which have a superior food scheme. Will this Act prevail or those Schemes prevail? That is to say, after the coming into force of this Bill when it becomes an Act, will those superior schemes lapse and a Bill for which they have to pay more and get less prevail over those non-statutory schemes? That is my first specific question.

My second question is, in Clause 3, you say, the coverage will extend up to 75 per cent of rural and 50 per cent of urban population. One of the concerns we raised was that these percentages are the upper cap. Will you make a change in your Bill so that they are the base and not the cap so that the numbers don't come down below that figure? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, we are not re-opening the discussion. It will be unending. Yes, Prof. Thomas, please go ahead.

PROF. K.V. THOMAS: Sir, article 32 of the Bill protects all the existing schemes that are there in the States. ... (Interruptions)... Then, Sir, the question was raised as to why we confined to 75 and 50. It was because it was decided by the NSSO. When this question of 75 and 50 came as the priority, many States like Uttar Pradesh and Bihar asked us, are you going to give the same to Kerala which has a much better lifestyle? Are you going to give the same to Tamil Nadu? So, we took a decision that that will be done on the basis of NSSO and when we get all the figures, this would be considered. So, it is on that basis, we took the second decision. ...(Interruptions)...

- SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I also have to seek one clarification.
- MR. CHAIRMAN: No, I am afraid, not. ...(Interruptions)... The discussion is over. We shall now put the (Interruptions)...
- SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: What is this? When we initiate a debate, don't we have the right to ask clarifications? ...(Interruptions)...
 - MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one minute, please. ...(Interruptions)...
- SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, what is this? I do not understand...(Interruptions)...
- MR. CHAIRMAN: Do we want to have a second round of debate? We have debated it the whole day. ...(Interruptions)...
- SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: No debate at all, Sir; simple clarifications. ...(Interruptions)...
 - MR. CHAIRMAN: Your amendments are already there. ...(Interruptions)...
- SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, this is a very important issue. ...(Interruptions)...
- MR. CHAIRMAN: There is no end to it. ...(Interruptions)... There will be no end to it. ...(Interruptions)... Venkaiahji, there would be no end to it. There would be 10, 15 or 20 other Members asking for clarifications. ...(Interruptions)...
- SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, we are debating an issue which concerns a large number of farmers of this country. ...(Interruptions)...
- MR. CHAIRMAN: We have debated the whole day. ...(Interruptions)... We have also debated the Resolution moved by the hon. Leader of the Opposition. ...(Interruptions)...
- SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, this is not the way to stifle the voice of the Opposition; I am sorry to say. ...(Interruptions)...
- MR. CHAIRMAN: After a whole day's debate, you can't say that your voice is being stifled. ...(Interruptions)...
- SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, this has been happening in this House. ...(Interruptions)... The farmers' issue which had been raised has not been

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...(Interruptions)... That is not the practice. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, that has been the practice in this House. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: We have debated it. The reply has been given. Now, we move on to the next stage. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, do we have to take whatever the Minister says in his reply? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have already moved your amendments. ...(Interruptions)... I shall now put the Resolution moved by Shri Arun Jaitley to vote. ...(Interruptions)... The question is put. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. T.N. SEEMA: Sir, he said that the State Government ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am sorry; it can't be done. ...(Interruptions)... The question is put. ...(Interruptions)... Dr. Seema, please sit down. There is no procedure for it. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. T.N. SEEMA: Sir, I just wish to ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, I am sorry. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. T.N. SEEMA: Sir, let me say just one line. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, I am sorry. ...(Interruptions)... Please, sit down. No, I am sorry. It cannot be done. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI P. RAJEEVE (Kerala): Sir, the Minister has...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, as per rules, when the Minister names a Member ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No; no. ...(Interruptions)... You have debated the matter the whole day. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, the Minister has taken the name of the Member. ...(Interruptions)...

- MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no, Mr. Rajeeve. Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... This is not correct. ...(Interruptions)... This is not correct. Please, sit down. ...(Interruptions)...
- SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, the Minister has taken the name of the Member. The Chair must protect the right of the Member. ...(Interruptions)...
- MR. CHAIRMAN: No; there is no room for it here. Please, sit down. ...(Interruptions)... I would request the hon. Members not to ...(Interruptions)...
- SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, the Minister has taken the name of the Member. Please ask the Minister...(*Interruptions*)...
 - MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down.(Interruptions)..... I am sorry.
- SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, the Minister has taken the name of the Member. ...(Interruptions)... The Minister has taken the name of the Member. ...(Interruptions)... As per the rule...(Interruptions)...
- MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. You are not going to get up one by one and disrupt. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Yechury, I would request you to discipline your Members. This is not correct. ...(Interruptions)... We have had a debate. Everybody has spoken. ...(Interruptions)... The Resolution has already been moved. Now, we have to proceed further. ...(Interruptions)...
- SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I understand.....(Interruptions)... The problem arose only because the Minister took the name of an hon. Member. So, that hon. Member wanted to raise it. That was the only reason. ...(Interruptions)...
- MR. CHAIRMAN: That does not matter. ...(Interruptions)... No, no. ...(Interruptions)... Yechuryji, the Resolution has been moved. ...(Interruptions)...
- Now, I shall put the Resolution moved by Shri Arun Jaitley to vote. The question is:
 - "That this House disapproves the National Food Security Ordinance (No. 7 of 2013) promulgated by the President of India on 5th July, 2013."

...(Interruptions)...

SOME HON. MEMBERS: "Ayes". ...(Interruptions)...

9.00 P.M.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, the Resolution has been put to vote. The "ayes" have it. There were no "noes". ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Those against would please say "no".

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think, the "noes" have it, the "noes" have it, the "noes" have it. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sorry, Sir. This is not correct.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do you want a division? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, the voting was not fair at all. ...(Interruptions)... They have said 'ayes' first and now you say 'noes'. How can that be? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What do you want? ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Can the same Members vote twice, Sir? ...(Interruptions)... Can the same Members say 'ayes' as well as 'no'? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one minute. ...(Interruptions)... One minute, please. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Can the same Members say 'yes' as well as 'no'? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one minute. ...(Interruptions)... Will you please ...(Interruptions)... There is only one way out of this: if there is a demand for division, then we will have a division. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Yes, Sir. We want it. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your problem? ...(Interruptions)... Can one person speak, please? ...(Interruptions)... May others sit down, please? ...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: My objection is, kindly listen, when you called for the voting, from here 'we' and from there 'they', both said, 'Ayes' ...(Interruptions)... Then how can they say 'Noes'? ...(Interruptions)... We have it. ...(Interruptions)... When you repeated it, they said 'Noes'. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, 'Ayes' are in the majority. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, the whole world has seen it; it is going on live. When the 'Ayes' came, both sides said 'Ayes'. ...(Interruptions)... Therefore, Sir, the 'Ayes' have to be taken into consideration. ...(Interruptions)... The 'Ayes' have to be taken into consideration. They cannot say 'Noes'. ...(Interruptions)... It has gone live; the whole world has seen it. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Put it again for voting. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: Mr. Chairman, Sir, our people did not say 'Yes'. But if they are still insisting, we can ask for division. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, we request the Chairman that if they don't want to ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: He is asking for division. ...(Interruptions)... We will have division. ...(Interruptions)... A request has been made for division. ...(Interruptions)... Let the lobbies be cleared.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Let them accept their mistake. ...(Interruptions)... Let them accept their mistake. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: They have asked for division, Venkaiahji. ...(Interruptions)... They have asked for division. What is your problem with it? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: That is secondary. First, let them accept their mistake gracefully. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right. ...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

ÁÖB ÚÁ ÁÖB YJÖÖYÖB (*ÖFÐ)) : ÁÖPÖÖÖYÖ •ÖB, «ÁÖÖ »ÖÖÐÚ ÁÖPÖÖ ÖE ÆÖE "ÖÐÚÖ ÆÜ..**(34ÖBƏÖTP)...**

AB AFORNO: 451 • Ot ... Please, sit down. Secretary-General will now explain the voting procedure.

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, two resolutions are there.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, we have moved resolutions. He has moved. I have moved. Put all these together.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: All the resolutions opposing the Ordinance may be put together.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, sit down. The Resolution was moved on behalf of various Members. Let us proceed now. I shall now put the Resolution moved by Shri Arun Jaitley to vote. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Arun Jaitley and others...(Interruptions).

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Resolution was moved by Shri Arun Jaitley, that's all. The name is there on the record; nothing more will be said. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please, sit down. Don't interrupt. The question is:

"That this House disapproves the National Food Security Ordinance (No. 7 of 2013) promulgated by the President of India on 5th July, 2013".

SECRETARY-GENERAL: I am starting the voting process. The voting time starts now.(Interruptions).....

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ: It is a big embarrassment.(Interruptions).... The entire country is watching and the voting system is not...(Interruptions).... It is a big embarrassment. The entire country is watching.(Interruptions).....

The House divided

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

Ayes - 85

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

[2 September, 2013]

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

Noes-119

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri GK.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

The motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the motion moved by Prof. K.V. Thomas to vote.

The question is:

That the Bill to provide for food and nutritional security in human life cycle approach, by ensuring access to adequate quantity of quality food at affordable prices to people to live a life with dignity and for matter connected therewith or incidental thereto, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration.

The motion was adopted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We shall now take up clause-by-clause consideration of the Bill. In Clause 2, there are 38 amendments. Amendments (Nos.1-5) by Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu.

Clause 2 - Definitions

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I beg to move:

- (1) That at page 2, line 9, after the word and figure "section 3", the words "and the households covered under Public Distribution System" be inserted.
- (2) That at page 2, line 15, after the words "time to time", the words "in consultation with the State Governments" be inserted.
- (3) That at page 2, for lines 16 and 17, the following be substituted, namely:-
 - '(6) "food security" means a situation when all people at all times, have physical and economic access to sufficient, safe and nutritious food to meet their dietary needs and food preferences for an active and healthy life.'
- (4) That at page 2, lines 18 and 19, be deleted.
- (5) That at page 2, line 41, after the word and figure "section 10", the words "and the households covered under Public Distribution System" be inserted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.26-31) by Shri Prakash Javadekar.

ÁB Į**iša į Oú**ų ii **TĀO**¤ii : ÃÖ, ji Æij ii clause ¯Ö, ii amendments ∞ijOO YQOO Æii.

ÁCB ÁCPODOVO: (Ca-Ce (CO»Céd) Æú.

ÁÖB ĮĖPO įÖDÚŲŪ ŌÄÖÖ¤Ü: ÃÖ ĮŪ ÓỆ β †Ö ÖÃÕÈ ÝÕÃÖÖV, ÜÖ ÆÖMŐB ×ŨÚ clause-by-clause amendment ÛlÛE move Ûlû, Ök () pÛÆÜ ^x'ÖYÖ ÆĞĞÖ †Ö, Ü pÛÆß ÃĞĞÖ ĞÜÛpÜÖ ÆÜ.

MR. CHAIRMAN: After all the amendments are moved, then we will take up the amendments one by one.

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I beg to move:

- (26) That at page 2, after line 6, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - '(2a) "destitute person" means men, women or children who have no resources, means and support required for food and nutrition enabling their survival, to the extent that makes them vulnerable to live with or die of starvation:
 - (2b) "disaster" shall have the same meaning as assigned to it in clause (d) of section 2 of the Disaster Management Act, 2005;'. 53 of 2005.
- (27) That at page 2, line 9, after the word and figure "section 3", the words "and the households covered under Public Distribution System" be inserted.
- (28) That at page 2, for lines 13 to 15, the following be substituted, namely:-'(5) "foodgrains" means rice, wheat, coarse cereals, pulses, cooking oil, iodized salt or any other combination thereof conforming to such quality norms as may be determined, including on nutrition and safety, by order, by the Central Government from time to time;'.
- (29) That at page 2, for lines 16 and 17, the following be substituted, namely:-
 - '(6) "food security" means a situation when all people at all times, have physical and economic access to sufficient, safe and nutritious food to meet their dietary needs and food preferences for an active and healthy life in accordance with the four pillars of food security, i.e., availability, stability of supply, access and utilisation'.
- (30) That at page 2, lines 18 and 19, be deleted.
- (31) That at page 2, line 41, after the word and figure "section 10", the words "and the households covered under Public Distribution System" be inserted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 45) by Shri Naresh Gujral.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: Sir, I beg to move:

(45) That at page 2, lines 29 and 30, after the words "announced by the Central Government, the words "based on the Swaminathan Committee formula, that is, cost of production plus fifty per cent of cost of production" be inserted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.57 and 58) by Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav and Shri Naresh Agrawal.

Ť**ŒĿ, Ở Ö ÝŰŒŰNÖ μŰ♥₽ÃŮ** (^¢Ö¸ü ŤŰ¤₽ĬO) : ÃÖ¸ü ÆÜÖ move ®ŬÆNÌ Ûú¸ü ¸NÆĕ ÆÜ.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.68-78) by Shri D. Raja.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I beg to move:

- (68) That at page 2, line 4, for the word "Targeted", the word "Universal" be substituted.
- (69) That at page 2, after line 6, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - '(2a) "destitute person" means men, women or children who have no resources, means and support required for food and nutrition enabling their survival, to the extent that makes them vulnerable to live with or die of starvation;
 - (2b) "disaster" shall have the same meaning as assigned to it in clause (d) of section 2 of the Disaster Management Act, 53 of 2005:'. 2005.
- (70) That at page 2, lines 7 and 8, for the words "priority households", the words "Public Distribution System" be substituted.
- (71) That at page 2, for lines 13 to 15, the following be substituted, namely:-
 - '(5) "food commodities" means rice, wheat, coarse cereals, pulses, edible oil, or any other combination thereof conforming to such quality norms as may be determined, including on nutrition and safety, by order, by the Central Government from time to time;'.
- (72) That at page 2, for lines 16 and 17, the following be substituted, namely:-

- '(6) "food security" means a situation when all people at all times, have physical and economic access to sufficient, safe and nutritious food to meet their dietary needs and food preferences for an active and healthy life in accordance with the four pillars of food security, i.e., availability, stability of supply, access and utilisation'.
- (73) That at page 2, for lines 18 and 19, the following be substituted, namely:-
 - '(7) "homeless persons" means persons who do not have homes and live as such on the roadside, pavements, or in such other places, or in the open, including persons living in shelters for homeless or beggars or such other homes;'.
- (74) That at page 2, after line 26, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - '(8a) "malnutrition" means the condition that develops when the body, over a prolonged period of time, does not receive or absorb adequate and appropriate calories, proteins and other nutrients required for good health, growth and maintenance of the human body and mind;'.
- (75) That at page 2, for lines 29 to 31, the following be substituted, namely:-'(10) "minimum support price" means the assured fair and remunerative price announced by the Central Government, which is fixed at least fifty per cent more than the weighted average cost of production, at which foodgrains are procured from farmers by the Central Government and the State Governments and their agencies, for the central pool;'.
- (76) That at page 2, after line 31, the following be inserted, namely:-'(10a) "National Commission" means the National Food Commission constituted under the relevant section of this Act;'.
- (77) That at page 2, after line 42, the following be inserted, namely:-'(15a) "private contractor" means any entrepreneur, commercial enterprise or company not owned or controlled or funded or aided by the appropriate Government;'.
- (78) That at page 3, after line 5, the following be inserted, namely:-

203

- '(20a) "starvation" means prolonged involuntary deprivation of food that threatens survival of the person;
- (20b) "starvation death" means death of a person caused chronic low food intake deemed insufficient to sustain life;'.
- MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.119-123) by Shri M.P. Achuthan.

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN (Kerala): Sir, I beg to move:

- (119) That at page 2, line 4, *for* the word "Targeted" the word "Universal" be *substituted*.
- (120) That at page 2, line 12, for the word "Targeted" the word "Universal" be substituted.
- (121) That at page 2, for lines 13 to 15, the following be substituted, namely:-
 - '(5) "foodgrains" means rice, wheat, coarse cereals, pulses, cooking oil, iodized salt or any other combination thereof conforming to such quality norms as may be determined, including nutrition and safety, by order, by the Central Government from time to time'.
- (122) That at page 2, for lines 16 and 17, the following be substituted, namely:-
 - '(6) "food security" means a situation when all people at all times, have physical and economic access to sufficient, safe and nutritious food to meet their dietary needs and food preferences for an active and healthy life in accordance with the four pillars of food security, *i.e.*, availability, stability of supply, access and utilisation.'
- (123) That at page 2, for lines 29 to 31, the following be substituted, namely:-
 - '(10) "minimum support price' means assured fair and remunerative price announced by the Central Government, which is fixed at least fifty per cent more than the weighted average cost of production, at which foodgrains are procured from farmers by the Central Government and the State Government and their agencies, for the central pool."

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.153 and 154) by Shri Baishnab Parida.

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA (Odisha): Sir, I beg to move:

- (153) That at page 2, after line 42, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - '(15a) "private contractor" means any entrepreneur, commercial enterprise or company not owned or controlled or funded or aided by the appropriate Government'.
- (154) That at page 3, after line 5, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - '(20a) "starvation" means prolonged involuntary deprivation of food that threatens survival of the person.
 - (20b) "starvation death" means death of a person caused by chronic low food intake deemed insufficient to sustain life'.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.164-167) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal.

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, I beg to move:

- (164) That at page 2, after line 6, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - '(3) "destitute persons" means men, women or children who have no resources, means and support required for food and nutrition enabling their survival;
- (165) That at page 2, line 16, *after* the words "quantity of" the words "sugar, cooking oil, pulses" be *inserted*.
- (166) That at page 2, for lines 29 to 31, the following be substituted; namely:-
 - '(10) "minimum support price" means a guaranteed fair and remunerative price announced by the Central Government which will not be less than the weighted average cost of production plus 50 per cent more, at which foodgrains are procured from farmers by the Central and State Governments and their agencies for the central pool"
- (167) That at page 3, line 10, for the words "Targeted Public Distribution System" the words "Public Distribution System" be substituted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 197) by Shri N.K. Singh.

SHRI N.K. SINGH (Bihar): Sir, I am not pressing it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Amendment (No.212) by Shri Lalhming Liana; not here. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: If they are in the list, I would call them. If they are not in the list, I cannot call them. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I have requested you earlier also. Many hon. Members have given amendments. It will be better to take it up clause by clause.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We are doing that.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: That's all I am saying. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, if you agree, may I suggest a procedural matter?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, there are various amendments moved by various hon. Members. On Clause 2, you have asked the Members whether they are moving the amendments or not. Some have moved; some have not moved. Now, may I suggest you to take a combined vote for all those that have been moved and thereby, go clause by clause? It will save a lot of time. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Is there any agreement on that? ...(Interruptions)... It can be for all amendments under Clause 2 that have been moved.(Interruptions)....¤iÜÜk, ÄÜÜ ÜÜÜ ÜÜÜ ÄÜİ...(ÄÄÄÜÄ)... You don't want to take them up clause by clause.

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, they are entirely different. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is not how it is listed here. It is listed Clause-wise. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, while moving the amendment, I have a right to explain what the amendment is.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, Clause 2 is a very long one. It is the definition Clause. Sir, kindly appreciate that Section 2 is the definition clause. It contains as many as 25 sub-clauses. You can't have clause 2 straightaway. Many hon. Members have given amendments to different sub-clauses. May I request you to take up amendments on 2(1), 2(2) and 2(3) onwards, it will facilitate.(Interruptions)....

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is not our practice. We are taking up amendment by amendment, Member by Member. I have called the first amendment by Shri Venkaiahji. We have now gone past it. Shri Prakash Javadekar.(Interruptions)..... One minute.(Interruptions)..... Please listen to me. The amendments have been circulated. Those are in the knowledge of the Members. All we have to do is decide. That's all.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: When we are moving an amendment, we are given an opportunity to explain....(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is the need of duplicating the exercise? It is in the knowledge of Members.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: "From time to time in consultation with State Governments", that's the amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Whatever the amendment is, the amendment is in the knowledge of the Members of the House. All that is required now is to vote on it.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: That has been the practice. If you want to dispense with the practice, I will leave it to the House.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am not dispensing with it. It is logical. That is the purpose of circulating the amendment.(Interruptions).....

ÁÚB Ý ÇÔ † ÝÚZÁÐÓ) : <ÁÚE ÝŰÚE ÁÚBÓEÜ ÝŰÚÚ ÝVEÐ ÆÐÁÚÚ.....**(¾ÚÞÁ-ÚÚŤ)...**<ÁÚE ÝŰÚE ÚÚÞŐ ÝÚÚÚ ÝVEÐ ÆÐÁÚÚ.....**(¾ÚÞÁ-ÚÚŤ).**...

ÁÖB ŢĔŖŎijŎŰĸĹŨŦŎĀŎŎŸŨ: ŊŮŦŨŮŹŰŦŶŎŦĬŶŎ ĀŮŦſŖ ÆŰ....(¾ĎŔĠŦŌŎŦŊ...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. The whole purpose of giving amendments and circulating them to the Members of the House is that all the amendments moved or proposed to be moved are in the knowledge of all the Members. So, there is no need to duplicate that by explaining it, again and again. It is presumed that everybody has read the amendments.(Interruptions).....

[2 September, 2013]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, you will not do this.(Interruptions).....

ÁÜB [®]Ö¸äÖ †ÝŒÆÖ»Ö : ÃÖ¸Ü ÖDzÖ¸ÅÖÖ‡•Ö »ÖB∞Ö<.....**(¾ĎÆÖÖŤ)...**

DR. V. MAITREYAN: We want divison.(Interruptions)....

ÁB ÁĞÖÖÖYÖ : ŸEĞ, ŸEĞ....(¾ÖĞÖĞ)...

ÁÖB TÖ¸ÇÖ TYÖRÖ>Ö : <Ûú-¤ÔE ŰE²ŰÄÜÖ ÛÁ ÛúÆÐÜE ÃÜE ÆÐÖ ÃÖ TÖÆÐA "Ö>ÖKÜÖ....**(¾ÖXZ-ÖTT).**..µŰÆÜ <Ûú TÍ Ö Ö,ÖÖ,Ö ²ÖTÖ **'ÆB** ÆÜ....**(¾ÖXZ-ÖTT).**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right.

>0 9000 <. A 600 >0 : Sir, I said it (68 YOE 300 A) 308 Ova A 600(3403-004)

AB APOONO: மல்ல், அம்ம் மி. When there is a doubt about the voice vote, division is taken.(Interruptions)..... Okay, fine.(Interruptions).....

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Division has to be granted even if one Member asks for it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right, you have it.

ÁÖB ÖÖ¾Ä>ÖÃÖ ÖÄÄÖÄÖ: ÃÖ Ü †ÖÖ ÖÇ 66 2ÖÖYÖ ÃÖ®Ö »ÖS∞Ö<...

ÁÖB ÃÖBÖÖÖÖÖ : •ÜB...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: May I make a suggestion? On clause 2(1), all the amendments that have been moved, you take it up separately. On clause 2(2) if any Member wants to move the amendment and press for the division, you can take it up. Like that you dispose them of one by one.(Interruptions).....

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute.

>**0** 3**0 0 000** : Au0 •00 30 × 80•00 00000; × 80•00 A000.....(3408-000)....

We can demand division. It is our right.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: It is the convention in the House. It is the right of the Members. ...(Interruptions)...

>**0.38. (C,C,C,C)** + TOPE + CP CCPUAO - O, U → FRO-OPO YCCE (COOCCE....(3408-009)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I want silence in the House. Please, sit down.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I have a point of order under rule 252(4). $\tilde{A}\tilde{O}_{2}\tilde{U}$ " $\tilde{O}_{2}\tilde{U}$ " $\tilde{O}_{3}\tilde{U}$ " $\tilde{O}_{4}\tilde{U}$ "

MR. CHAIRMAN: Right, I concede your point. That is not the issue.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: I would again urge, Sir, kindly appreciate this. Clause 2 is an important clause. It is a definition clause. It has got 25 sub-clauses. As Mr. Sitaram Yechury rightly stated, if you go clause by clause, many amendments will not be pressed. Therefore, I would again appreciate if you go clause by clause, in many cases, amendments will not be pressed. We have discussed it also. But, Sir, this being an important legislation, we have to also insist upon certain issues which we have moved by way of amendments shared by a lot of Members. Therefore, you can go by that. That's all what we are saying.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one minute please.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I want to submit one small thing. My amendments are starting from 67 to 117. I have moved these amendments. I may demand division on one amendment. You can go like that. I have made a practical suggestion.

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is precisely what we are doing.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: I am only saying take clause 2, sub-clause (1); clause 2, sub-clause (2); clause 2, sub-clause (3)...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA: It is always clause by clause; no sub-clause...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute, we are going on clause 2. There are a number of amendments moved by different Members. The first ones, as listed here, are

Amendments (Nos.1-5) by Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu. Now, if he wishes for a division, it is his right. Now, do you wish division?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I said, 'division'. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right. What is the difficulty? You were not satisfied with the voice vote. You have asked for a division. Let the division take place. That's all.

ÁÖB ŁŰCRĄ W "ŰPW YŰFWŐWÖ (ŰŢÜ ÖZPĄĎ) : ÃÖ Ų ‡ÃŬ ÜE <ÛÚ †Ü Ü <♠ Ü ÛÚ Ū ¤**G⊷**Ö<... ‡ÃÜB Œ»ÖÖrÖ Ûĕ †¢rüü †YÖ¸ü xÛúÃÖB †Ö¸ü TÖ2Ö¸ü ÛúÖ 3ÖB ÆÜ YÖÖE ^ÃÖ ⁻Ö¸ü 3ÖB 2ÖÖYÖ Ûú¸ü »ÖB∞Ö<... ...(¾ÖÄÖÖÖ)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I have a suggestion.(Interruptions).... Please don't open the lobbies till the entire voting is over.(Interruptions)....

MR. CHAIRMAN: Division. Let the lobbies be cleared.(Interruptions)..... Please.(Interruptions).... Sit down. We are on Venkaiah ji's amendments.(Interruptions)..... The Secretary-General has already explained the voting procedure. It does not have to be explained again. I shall now put Amendments (Nos. 1 to 5) moved by Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu to vote. Division.(Interruptions)....

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, there may be some amendments here, which we agree to vote for and some which we do not wish to vote for.(Interruptions).... But, in this way, you are making it mandatory for us to vote for all the amendments.

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is the practice that the House has followed, and, I am following it.

ÁÖB ÖÖ ×ÃSVÖÄÖ ÖÄĞBÄÖFÖ: ÃÖFÖÖTÖŸÖ ∙ÖB, µÖÆÜ ÛúÖ\$FÔ ÛúÖ**Ä™®™d∏**ÆÖFÖ»Ö †ÖFüÖE™Ü °ÖÆ**ü** Æü....**(¾ÖÖ-ÖÖÖ)...**

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, please.(Interruptions).... Division.

The House Divided.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, there is a request, for pressing reasons, that we take an adjournment for ten minutes. Thank you.

The House then adjourned at forty six minutes past nine of the clock.

The House reassembled at fifty-six minutes past nine of the clock, MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair

MR. CHAIRMAN: Subject to correction:

Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

Ayes - 85

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

[2 September, 2013]

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O' Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

[2 September, 2013]

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

Noes-119

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P. Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri GK.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

The motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendments (Nos. 26 to 31) moved by Shri Prakash Javadekar to vote.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendment (No. 45) moved by Shri Naresh Gujral to vote.

10.00 р.м.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendments (Nos. 68 to 78) moved by Shri D. Raja to vote.

SHRI D. RAJA: On one amendment (No. 68) I want division. That is on the Universal Public Distribution System, I want division.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendment (No.68) moved by Shri D. Raja to vote.

The House divided

MR. CHAIRMAN:

Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

Ayes - 85

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

The National Food

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

Noes-119

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri GK.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

The motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put Amendments (Nos. 69 to 78) moved by Shri D. Raja to vote.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendments (Nos.119 to 123) moved by Shri M.P. Achuthan to vote.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put Amendment (Nos. 153 & 154) moved by Shri Baishnab Parida to vote.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put Amendments (Nos. 164-167) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal to vote.

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE (West Bengal): Sir, I want a division.

MR. CHAIRMAN: On which one?

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE: On amendment No. 165.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Which clause?

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, Amendments (Nos. 165, 167, 168 and 169) are relating to Clause 2. I would suggest that all these four amendments can be taken together. One consists of an amendment to include other than foodgrains, sugar, cooking oil, etc.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Those amendments are already circulated. You don't need to read them again.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I am making a proposal that would be easier for you and the whole House. Please understand. I am asking to take all these four amendments together for voting, instead of taking them separately. Listen to me, sometimes, at least, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

227

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Yechury, please keep quiet. No cross talking please.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sorry, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put amendment (No. 164) moved by Shri P. Rajeeve.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put amendment (No. 165) moved by Shri Prasanta Chatterjee to vote.

The House divided.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes – 85

Noes – 119

Ayes - 85

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O' Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

Noes-119

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

[2 September, 2013]

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Hussain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

[2 September, 2013]

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri GK.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the amendments (Nos. 166 to 168) moved by Shri P. Rajeeve to vote.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

Clause 2 was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 3, there are 38 amendments. Amendments (Nos. 6-8) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Are you moving the amendments?

Clause 3 —Right to receive foodgrains at subsidized prices by persons belonging to eligible households under targeted public distribution system

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendments to only Clause 3(1). I move:

- (6) That at page 3, for lines 19 to 22, the following be substituted, namely:-
 - "3.(1) Every person belonging to priority households and households covered under Public Distribution System and Antyodaya Anna Yojana shall be entitled to receive seven kilograms of foodgrains per month per child, nine kilograms of foodgrains per month per adult, one and half kilograms of pulses, eight hundred grams of cooking oil and two hundred grams of iodized salt per person per month at subsidized prices specified in Schedule I."
- (7) That at page 3, lines 29 and 30, *for* the words "at prices as may be determined by the Central Government", the words "at the prevailing prices at which the State charges from the eligible households" be *substituted*.

Sir, I want division. We want to improve the Bill. The Government is not willing accept that. What can we do? I seek division.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, there are similar amendments.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, if there are other amendments similar to this, they can be taken up together...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, on the same Clause, there are amendments by other hon. Members.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We cannot reopen that exercise...(Interruptions)... We are following the procedure that has been followed in the House...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, on Clause 3(1), I have my amendments. Are you going to vote it twice?...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I am asking you to dispose them all together...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Venkaiahji, I cannot do it at this stage. ...(Interruptions)...There is a set procedure...(Interruptions)...I shall, now put the amendments (Nos. 6-8) moved by Shri Venkaiah Naidu to vote.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, there are some amendments by Dr. Maitreyan, Shri Javadekar, D. Raja are same. So, instead of taking them up individually, why cannot we take them up for voting in one go?...(Interruptions)... I am asking the Chair.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Why is this confusion being created? There is a set practice of this House; we are following it.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Okay, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall, now, put the Amendments (Nos. 6 and 7) moved by Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu to vote.

The House Divided

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

Ayes - 85

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

Noes-119

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

[2 September, 2013]

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri GK.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

The motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, we will now take up Amendments (Nos. 32 and 33) by Shri Prakash Javadekar. Are you pressing?

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I beg to move:

- 32. That at page 3, for lines 19 to 26, the following be substituted, namely:-
 - "3.(1) Every person belonging to priority households and households covered under Public Distribution System and Antyodaya Anna Yojana shall be entitled to receive seven kilograms of foodgrains per month per child, nine kilograms of foodgrains per month per adult, one and half kilograms of pulses, eight hundred grams of cooking oil and two hundred grams of iodized salt per person per month at subsidized prices specified in Schedule I."
- 33. That at page 3, for lines 35 and 36, the following be substituted, namely:-

"sub-section (1) at subsidized prices shall extend to every citizen of India barring income tax payers and land owners having ten acres of irrigated land".

Sir, Amendment No. 32 is okay. I am pressing for division on Amendment No. 33 because we are saying that the income tax payers and land-owners...(*Interruptions*)...I am pressing for division only on Amendment No. 33.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall, now, put Amendment (No. 32) moved by Shri Javadekar to vote.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall, now, put the Amendment (No. 33) moved by Shri Prakash Javadekar to vote.

The House Divided

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

Ayes - 85

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

Noes-119

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P. Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri GK.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

The motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are three Amendments (Nos. 47, 48 and 49) by Dr. V. Maitreyan. Are you moving these amendments?

- DR. V. MAITREYAN: Yes, Sir. I move:-
- 47. That at page 3, lines 29 and 30, *for* the words "prices may be determined by the Central Government" the words "the existing prices for which the foodgrains are now being supplied" be *substituted*.
- 48. That at page 3, line 35, *for* the words "up to seventy-five per cent of the", the words "to the entire" be *substituted*.
- 49. That at page 3, line 36, *for* the words "up to fifty per cent of the", the words "to the entire" be *substituted*.

Sir, I press for division only on Amendment No. 47.

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right. Dr. Maitreyan seeks division on Amendment No. 47.

I shall now put Amendment No. 47 moved by Dr. V. Maitreyan to vote.

The House divided

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

Ayes - 85

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

Noes-119

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri GK.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

The motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put Amendments (Nos. 48 and 49) moved by Dr. Maitreyan to vote.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are four Amendments (Nos. 59 to 62) by Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav and Shri Naresh Agrawal. Are you moving them?

PROF. RAM GOPAL YADAV: No, Sir.

SHRI NARESH AGRAWAL: We are not moving them.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are two amendments (No. 79 and 80) by Shri D. Raja.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I move:-

- 79. That at page 3, for lines 19 to 22, the following be substituted, namely:-
 - "3.(1) Every person who is a resident shall be entitled to receive ten kilograms of foodgrains per month per person, one and half kilograms of pulses per month per person and eight hundred grams of cooking oil per month person at subsidized prices specified in Schedule I from the State Government under the Public Distribution System, ensuring universal coverage and thereby making it universal."
- 80. That at page 3, lines 35 and 36, for the words "up to seventy-five per cent. of the rural population and up to fifty per cent. of the urban population", the words "to every resident of India" be substituted.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are three Amendments (Nos. 124 to 127) by Shri M. P. Achuthan. Are you moving?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN: Yes, Sir. I move:-

- 124. That at page 3, for lines 19 to 22, the following be substituted, namely:-
 - '3. (1) "Every family shall be entitled to receive 35 kilograms of foodgrains to a family per month; 1.5 kilograms of pulses per month per person and 800 grams of cooking oil per month per person at subsidized prices specified in Schedule 1 from the State Government under the Universal Public Distribution System."
- 125. That at page 3, lines 35 and 36, *for* the words "up to seventy-five per cent of the rural population and up to fifty per cent of the urban population" the words "to every resident of India" be *substituted*.
- 126. That at page 3, line 40, the words "Subject to such schemes as may be framed by the Central Government," be *deleted*.
- 127. That at page 3, line 45, *for* the words "maternity benefit" the words "Universal and unconditional maternity benefit" be *substituted*.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one amendment (No. 155) by Shri Baishnab Parida. Are you moving it?

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA: Yes, Sir. I move:-

- 155. That at page 3, for lines 19 to 22, the following be substituted, namely:-
 - " 3.(1) Every person who is a resident shall be entitled to receive ten kilograms of foodgrains per person per month per adult, one and a half kilograms of pulses per month per person and eight hundred grams of cooking oil per person at subsidized prices specified in Scheduled I from the State Government under the Public Distribution System".
- Sir, I want division. It is a very serious issue.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendment (No. 155) moved by Shri Baishnab Parida to vote.

The National Food

263

The House divided

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

Ayes - 85

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

266

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

Noes-119

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri GK.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

The motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are two Amendments (Nos. 168 & 169) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal. Are you moving?

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, I move:

168. That at page 3, for lines 19 to 22, the following be substituted namely:-

3(1) Every person subject to sub-section (2) shall be entitled to seven kilograms of foodgrains, per person, per month or thirty five kilograms per household, whichever is higher and adequate quantity of sugar, pulses and cooking oil shall be supplied at controlled prices".

169. That at page 3, for lines 35 and 36, for the words "upto seventy-five per cent of the rural population and upto fifty per cent of the urban population' the words 'the entire population of India with the exception of income tax payees".

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are three Amendments (Nos. 202-204) by Shri Rabinarayan Mohapatra. Are you moving?

SHRI RABINARAYAN MOHAPATRA (Odisha): Sir, I move:

- 202. That at page 3, line 20, *for* the words "five kilograms of foodgrains per person per month" the words "Seven kilograms of foodgrains per person per month or thirty five kilograms per household per month, whichever is higher and adequate quantities of pulses and cooking oil" be *substituted*.
- 203. That at page 3, after line 33 the following be inserted namely:-
 - (1A) All destitute persons shall be entitled at least two meals every day, free of charge, in accordance with such scheme including cost sharing as may be prescribed by the Central Government.
 - (1B) All homeless persons shall be entitled to affordable meals at community kitchens, in accordance with such scheme including cost sharing as may be prescribed by the Central Government.
 - (1C) For households which consist of senior citizens as defined under the Maintenance of Parents and Senior Citizens Act 2007, the minimum entitlement shall be twenty five kilograms of foodgrain per household.
 - (1D) For individuals in any hostel or other institutions providing residential facilities to students belonging to Schedule Caste and Scheduled Tribes the entitlement shall not be less than twenty kilograms of foodgrains per person.
 - (1E) The State Government shall, if it is of the opinion that an emergency or disaster situation exists, provide to affected households, two meals, free of charge, for a period up to three

204 That at page 3, lines 35 and 36 *for* the words "up to seventy-five of the rural population and up to fifty percent of the urban population" the words "to all priority households" be *substituted*.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are three Amendments (Nos. 221-223) by Shri Piyush Goyal. Are you moving?

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, I move:

- 221. That at page 3, line 20, *for* the words "5 kilogram" the words "11 kilograms" be *substituted*.
- 222. That at page 3, after line 21, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - "2 kilograms of Iodine Salt per household per month, 1.3 kilograms sugar per household per month, 2 kilograms gram per person per month and 2 kilograms dal per household per month"
- 223. That at page 3, line 25, *for* the words "thirty-five kilograms" the words "fifty-five kilograms" be *substituted*.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 232) by Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad. Mr. Prasad, are you pressing your amendment?

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I am not pressing my amendment.

Clause 3 was added to the Bill.

Clause 4 - Nutritional support to pregnant women and lactating mothers

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 4, there are eight amendments. Amendments (Nos. 9 & 10) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Mr. Naidu, are you pressing your amendments?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am not pressing my amendments.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are three Amendments (Nos. 81-83) by Shri D. Raja. Mr. Raja, are you pressing your amendments?

SHRI D. RAJA: No, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are two Amendments (Nos.170 & 171) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal. Mr. Rajeeve, are you moving your amendments?

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, I move:

- 170. That at page 3, line 40, the words "Subject to such schemes as may be framed by the Central Government", be deleted.
- 171. That at page 3, line 45, after the words "Six-thousand" the words "provided by Central Government" be inserted.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

Clause 4 was added to the Bill.

Clause 5 - Nutritional support to children

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 5, there are nine amendments. Amendment (No. 34) is by Shri Prakash Javadekar. Mr. Javadekar, are you pressing your amendment?

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I am not pressing my amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (Nos. 84-85) by Shri D. Raja. Mr. Raja, are you pressing your amendments?

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I am not pressing my amendments.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 128) by Shri M.P. Achuthan. Mr. Achuthan, are you pressing your amendment?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN: Sir, I am not pressing my amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.156) is by Shri Parida. Mr. Parida, are you pressing your amendment?

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA: I am not pressing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 172 to 174) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal. Are you moving your amendments?

- 172. That at page 4, line 6, the word "exclusive" be deleted.
- 173. That at page 4, line 7, *after* the word "promoted", the words "and the Government shall ensure crèche and other facilities for working mothers to make this possible" be *inserted*.

[RAJYA SABHA]

174. That at page 4, line 14, *after* the words "water and sanitation", the words "for which the Central Government shall provide assistance" be *inserted*.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

Clause 5 was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 6, there are two amendments. Amendment (No.35) is by Shri Prakash Javadekar. Are you moving your amendment?

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: I am not moving my amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.129) is by Shri Achuthan. Are you moving your amendment?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN: Sir, I am not moving my amendment.

Clause 6 was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one amendment for insertion of new Clause 6A. The Amendment (No.86) is by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving?

SHRI D. RAJA: I am not moving.

Clause 7 - Implementation of schemes for realization of entitlements

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are two amendments (Nos. 175 & 176) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal. Are you moving?

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE: Sir, I move:

- 175. That at page 4, line 21, the number "4" be deleted.
- 176. That at page 4, lines 21 and 22, *after* the words "cost sharing between the Central Government and the State Governments" the words "in consultation and agreement with State Governments" be *inserted*.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.199) by Shri N.K. Singh. He is not present.

Clause 7 was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one amendment for insertion of new clause 7A, (No.177) by Shri Rajeeve, Dr. Seema, Shri Chatterjee and Shri Balagopal. Are you moving?

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: I am not moving.

Clause 8 - Right to receive food security allowance in certain cases

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 8, there are 13 amendments. Amendment (No. 11) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Are you moving your Amendment?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.36 & 37) by Shri Javavedkar. Are you moving your amendments?

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 87 & 88) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving your amendments?

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.130) by Shri Achuthan. Are you moving your amendment?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one amendment no. 162 by Shri M. Rama Jois. He is not present. Then, Amendment Nos. 200 and 201 by Shri N.K. Singh; not present. Amendment No. 216 by Shri Lalhming Liana; not present. Amendment No. 224 by Shri Piyush Goyal.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, I move:

224 That at page 4, Clause 8 be deleted.

Sir. I want division.

The House divided.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

Ayes - 85

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

[2 September, 2013]

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C. P.

O' Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

Noes-119

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri GK.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

The motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (Nos. 233 and 234) by Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: I am not pressing, Sir.

Clause 8 was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up clause 9. There are 10 amendments. Amendment (Nos. 12 and 13) by Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am not pressing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Then, Amendment (No. 38) by Shri Prakash Javadekar.

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I am not pressing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 63) by Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav and Shri Naresh Agrawal.

PROF. RAM GOPAL YADAV: Sir, I am not pressing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Then, Amendment (Nos. 89 and 90) by Shri D. Raja.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 131) by Shri M.P. Achuthan.

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Then, Amendment (No. 178) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal.

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, I am not pressing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 217) by Shri Lalhming Liana; not in the House. Then, there is one Amendment (No. 235) by Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I am not moving.

Clause 9 was added to the Bill.

Clause 10 - State Government to prepare Guidelines and to Identify Priority Households

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up clause 10. There are 12 Amendments. Amendment (No. 39) by Shri Prakash Javadekar.

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I am not pressing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Then, Amendments (Nos. 50 and 51) by Dr. V. Maitreyan.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, I move:

50. That at page 4, lines 45 and 46, be deleted.

51. That at page 5, lines 1 and 2, be deleted.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Amendments (Nos. 91 and 92) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving Mr. Raja?

SHRI D. RAJA: Yes, Sir. I move:

- 91. That at page 4, for lines 37 to 46, the following be substituted, namely:-
 - "10. (1) The State Government shall ensure the proactive identification of individuals, households, and groups living in starvation or in conditions akin to starvation and provide the relief as mentioned under this section.
 - (2) While making the said identification, the State Government shall enquire into the overall life situation of the persons, groups or communities living in starvation and the question whether the person group or community was continuously deprived of adequate food entitlements by the denial of entitlements under this act or otherwise for any reason whatsoever.
 - (3) Where the conditions of starvation are found to exist the State Government shall take corrective action to ensure that functioning of the food related schemes and the delivery of entitlements under this Act or any other Acts as may be necessary".
- 92. That at page 5, lines 1 to 8, be deleted.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 132) by Shri Achuthan. Are you pressing, Mr. Achuthan?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN: No, Sir. I am not pressing it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Amendments (Nos. 179 to 181) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal. Are you moving, Mr. Chatterjee?

SHRI PRASHANTA CHATERJEE: Yes, Sir. I move:

179. That at page 4, lines 45 and 46 be deleted.

181. That at page 5, for lines 3 to 5, the following be substituted, namely:-

"Provided further that the State Government shall continue to receive the existing allocation of foodgrains from the Central Government under the present public distribution system and the Central Government shall supply the additional grain where the requirement under this Act exceeds the present allocation."

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Amendments (Nos. 205 and 206) by Shri Rabinarayan Mohapatra. Are you moving Mr. Mohapatra?

SHRI RABINARAYAN MOHAPATRA: Yes, Sir. I move:

205. That at page 4, for lines 42 to 46 the following be substituted namely:-

"(b) The remaining households as priority households which shall include citizens with the exceptions of income tax payees to be covered under the Public Distribution System, wherein the cost of identification of households shall be borne by both the Central and the State Governments in such manner as may be prescribed."

206. That at page 5, lines 1 to 5 be deleted.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 218) by Shri Liana. He is not present.

Clause 10 was added to the Bill.

Clause 11 - Publication and display of list of eligible households

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Clause 11 of the Bill. There is one Amendment (No. 93) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving, Mr. Raja?

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I move:

93. That at page 5, for lines 9 and 10, the following be substituted, namely:-

"11.(1) If a person has died of starvation, the appropriate Government shall enquire whether such person was living in conditions of prolonged food deprivation for any reason whatsoever and shall not base its conclusion on the Post mortem report.

(2) If proved that the person has died of starvation, the household to which he or she belonged shall be provided with financial assistance under the National Family Benefit Scheme regardless of whether or not he or she was the primary breadwinner of the household."

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

Clause 11 was added to the Bill.

New Clause 11A

MR. CHAIRMAN: Insertion of new Clause 11A. There is one Amendment for insertion (No. 94) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving, Mr. Raja?

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I move:

- 94. That at page 5, after line 11, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - "11A.(1) The State Government shall within six months of the Act coming into force, establish, through a Code, the processes for investigating starvation and protocols for mandatory intervention by State authorities for relief, prevention and accountability that are in conformity with the provisions of this Act, to be known as the Starvation Protocol.
 - (2) The Protocol shall establish processes which shall be transparent, reliable and respectful of the dignity of all persons.
 - (3) The State Governments shall clearly designate authorities, at State, district and local levels, directly responsible for preventing starvation and starvation death.
 - (4) All persons, households, groups or communities living in conditions of starvation shall have the right to approach the District Grievance Redressal Officer for immediate relief under this section and the District Grievance Redressal Officer shall be bound to provide such relief'.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

Clause 12 - Reforms in targeted Public distribution system

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Clause 12 of the Bill. There are 17 Amendments. Amendment (No. 14) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Are you pressing, Mr. Naidu?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: No, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 52) by Dr. Maitreyan. Are you moving, Dr. Maitreyan?

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, I move:

52. That at page 5, line 33, *after* the words "Central Government, the words "no such scheme shall be introduced without the concurrence of the State Government" be *inserted*.

Sir, I want division.

The House divided.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

Ayes - 85

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

Noes 119

[2 September, 2013]

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

[2 September, 2013]

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri GK.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

The motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are five Amendments (Nos. 95 to 99) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving?

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I move:

- 95 That at page 5, lines 22 and 23 be deleted.
- 96 That at page 5, line 29, *for* the words "over a period of time", the words "in a time bound manner" be *substituted*.
- 97 That at page 5, line 30, *after* the words "and grains banks", the words "through special schemes implemented through bodies such as Panchayats, Self Help Groups, Cooperatives, NGOs, etc." be *inserted*.
- 98 That at page 5, lines 31 to 33 be deleted.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are six Amendments (Nos. 133 to 138) by Shri M.P. Achuthan. Are you moving?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN: Sir, I move the Amendments but I am not pressing for a division. Sir, I move:

- (133) That at page 5, line 14, *after* the word "System" the words "converting it into Universal Public Distribution System" be *inserted*.
- (134) That at page 5, line 17, for the word "Targeted" the word "Universal" be *substituted*.
- (135) That at page 5, lines 22 and 23, be deleted.
- (136) That at page 5, line 29, for the words "over a period of time" the words "in a time bound manner" be substituted.
- (137) That at page 5, line 30, *after* the word "banks" the words "through special schemes implemented through bodies such as Panchayats, Self Help Groups, Co-operatives, Non-Government Organisations, etc." be *inserted*.

(138) That at page 5, lines 31 to 33, be deleted.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.163) by Shri M. Rama Jois. Not present. Amendments (Nos. 182 and 183) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal. Are you moving?

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: This is on Aadhar and cash transfer, and I move the Amendments. Sir, I move:

182 That at page 5, lines 22 and 23 be deleted.

183 That at page 5, lines 31 to 33 be deleted.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.225) by Shri Piyush Goyal. Are you moving it?

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: No, Sir.

Clause 12 was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, clause 13. There are two Amendments. Amendment (No. 100) by Shri D. Raja and Amendment (No.157) by Shri Baishnab Parida. Now, Amendment (No.100) by Shri D. Raja.

Clause 13 – Women of eighteen years of age or above to be head of household for purpose of issue of ration cards

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I move:

(100) That at page 5, after line 42, the following be inserted, namely:-

"(3) All meals provided under this Act shall be prepared in a decentralized manner through local women or their collectives which include Self Help Groups, mothers' committees and Mahila Mandals, to promote women's livelihood and preference be given single women, disabled women, Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe women and women from minority communities".

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.157) by Shri Baishnab Parida. Are you moving?

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA: Sir, I move:

(157) That at page 5, after line 42, the following be inserted, namely:-

"13A. All meals provided under this Act shall be prepared in a decentralized manner by local women or their collectives which include Self Help Groups (SHGs) mothers' Committees and Mahila Mandals, to promote women's livelihood and preference shall be given single women, disabled women, Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe women and women from minority communities".

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

Clause 13 was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Clause 14. There are three Amendments. Amendment (No.101) by Shri D. Raja, Amendment (No.139) by Shri M.P. Achuthan and Amendment (No.207) by Shri Rabinarayan Mohapatra.

Clause 14 - Internal Grievance Redressal Mechanism

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I move:

- (101) That at page 5, after line 47, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - "(2) Each public authority responsible under this legislation shall publish:
 - (i) a statement of obligations towards the citizens under this Act; and
 - (ii) a statement that violation of any of the provisions of this statement, in any manner whatsoever, will constitute a grievance.
 - (3) The grievance redressal mechanism under this Act shall accept and support complaints being made and consequent procedures being carried out in accessible formats for the disabled like Braille, oral, e-text and sign language".

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.139) by Shri M.P. Achuthan. Are you moving?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN: Sir, I move:

- (139) That at page 5, after line 47 the following be inserted, namely:-
 - "(2) Each public authority responsible under this Act shall publish a statement of obligations towards the citizens.
 - (3) Violation of any of the provisions of this Act, in any manner whatsoever, will constitute a grievance and
 - (4) The grievance redressal mechanism under this Act shall accept and support complaints being made and consequent procedures being carried out in accessible formats for the disabled like braile, oral, e-text and sign language."

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment No. (207) by Shri Rabi Narayan Mohapatra. Are you moving the amendment?

SHRI RABINARAYAN MOHAPATRA: Sir, I move:

(207) That at page 5, after line 47 the following proviso be inserted namely:-

"Provided that the cost of setting up internal grievances redressal mechanism shall be borne by both the Central and the State Government in such manner as may be prescribed by the Central Government."

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

Clause 14 was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Clause 15. There are two Amendments (Nos. 102 and 103) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving the amendments?

Clause 15- District grievance redressal officer

SHRI D. RAJA: Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendments. I move:

- 102. That at page 6, for lines 1 to 4, the following be substituted, namely:-
 - "15.(1) The State Government shall appoint or designate, an officer to the be the Grievance Redressal Officer, at panchayat/municipal level, block level and district level, for expeditious and effective redressal of

grievances of the aggrieved persons in matters relating to distribution of foodgrains or meals under Chapter II, and to enforce the entitlements under this Act.

- (2) The Grievance Redressal Officers so appointed shall address the grievances within two weeks in an effective manner.
- (3) The facilitation centres at the block and panchayat level register the grievances of aggrieved persons and forward them to the appropriate Grievance Redressal Officer".
- 103. That at page 6, for lines 12 to 15, the following be substituted, namely:-
 - "(5) The officer referred to in sub-clause (1) shall have the following obligations and powers:
 - to hear complaints regarding non-distribution of entitled food grains or meals or matters related thereto;
 - to conduct open court hearings, close to the location of the (ii) complainant; and
 - (iii) to impose penalty and give compensation. The compensation shall be given in cash or kind as per the beneficiary's choice and be five times the value of the entitlements the beneficiary was originally entitled to".

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 140-145) by Shri Achuthan. Are you moving the amendments?

SHRI M. P. ACHUTHAN: Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendments. I move:

- 140. That at page 6, line 2, after the word "Officer" the words "and Grievance Redressal Officers at the Panchayat or Municipal level and the block level" be inserted.
- 141. That at page 6, line 5, after the word "Officer" the words "and Grievance Redressal Officers" be inserted.
- 142. That at page 6, line 8, after the word "Officer" the words "and Grievance Redressal Officers" be inserted.

- 143. That at page 6, line 10, after the word "Officer" the words "and Grievance Redressal Officers" be inserted.
- 144. That at page 6, for lines 14 and 15, the following be substituted, namely:-

"action for the redressal within two weeks in an effective manner and in such manner as may be prescribed by the State Government."

- 145. That at page 6, after line 20, the following be inserted, namely:-
- "(8) Facilitation Centres at the block level shall be established to help aggrieved person to register their Grievances and forward them to the appropriate Grievance Redressal Officer."

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment No.(158) by Shri Baishnab Parida. Are you moving the amendment?

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA: Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendment. I move:

158 That at page 6, for lines 1 to 4, the following be substituted, namely:-

"15.(1) The State Government shall appoint or designate, an officer to be the Grievance Redressal Officer, at panchayat or municipal level, block level and district level for expeditious and effective redressal of grievances of the aggrieved persons in matters relating to distribution of foodgrains or meals under Chapter II of the Act, and to enforce the entitlements under this Act".

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment No.(219) by Shri Lalhming Liana. He is absent.

Clause 15 was added to the Bill.

Clause 16 - State Food Commission

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Clause 16. Amendments (Nos. 64 and 65) by Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav and Shri Naresh Agrawal. Are you moving the amendments?

PROF. RAM GOPAL YADAV: We are not moving.

- MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 104 to 106) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving the amendments?
 - SHRI D. RAJA: Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendments. I move:
 - 104. That at page 6, for lines 28 and 29, the following be *substituted*, namely:-
 - 105. That at page 7, line 30, be deleted.
 - 106. That at page 7, after line 39, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - "(11) The State Commission shall dispose of cases within two weeks and shall have the power to impose penalties and order for compensation as required under this Act.
 - (12) The members of the State Commission shall be subject to appraisal to ensure their eligibility to continue as members".

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

- MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 146 to 148) by Shri M. P. Achuthan. Are you moving the amendments?
 - SHRI M. P. ACHUTHAN: Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendments. I move:
 - 146. That at page 6, line 28, *after* the word "women" the words "and one person who is disabled," be *inserted*.
 - 147. That at page 7, line 30, the words "physically or" be deleted.
 - 148. That at page 7, after line 39, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - "(11) The State Commission shall dispose of cases within two weeks and shall have the power to impose penalties and order for compensation as required.
 - (12) The members of the State commission shall be subject to appraisal to ensure their eligibility to continue as members."

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

Clause 16 was added to the Bill.

303

Clause 17-Salary and Allowances of Chairperson, Member, Member-Secretary and other Staff of State Commission

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Clause 17. Amendment No. (208) by Shri Rabi Narayan Mohapatra. Are you moving the amendment?

SHRI RABINARAYAN MOHAPATRA : Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendment. I move:

208. That at page 7, line 40 *for* the words "The State Government" the words "Both the Central Government and the State Government" be *substituted*.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

Clause 17 was added to the Bill.

Clauses 18 to 21 were added to the Bill.

Clause 22 - Central Government to allocate required quantity of Foodgrains from Central pool to State Governments

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 22 there are eight amendments. Amendment (No. 15) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Are you moving it?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment No. (40) by Shri Prakash Javadekar. Are you moving?

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment No. (66) by Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav and Shri Naresh Agrawal. Are you moving?

PROF. RAM GOPAL YADAV: Sir, we are not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment No. (107) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving it?

SHRI D. RAJA: Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendment. I move:

107. That at page 9, line 3, *after* the word "provide", the words "at least fifty per cent" be *inserted*.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 184-186) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. Seema, Shri Chaterjee and Shri Balagopal. Are you moving the amendments?

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendments. I move:

- (184) That at page 8, line 33, *after* the words and roman numeral "Schedule I" the words "Provided that the allocation is not less than being given at present" be *inserted*.
- (185) That at page 8, lines 34 and 35 be deleted.
- (186) That at page 9, line 3, for the words "provide assistance" the words "make financial allocations" be *substituted*.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 220) by Shri Liana. He is absent.

Clause 22 was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 23 there are three amendments. First, Amendment (No. 53) by Dr. V. Maitreyan. Are you moving?

Clause 23 — Provision for Funds by Central Government to State Government in Certain Cases

- DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, I move the following amendment and demand division:
 - (53) That at page 9, for lines 9 to 12, the following be *substituted*, namely:

 "23. It shall be the responsibility of the Central Government to ensure the continuous supply of foodgrains from the Central pool to a State".

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall, now, put the amendment moved by Dr. Maitreyan to vote.

The House Divided

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

Ayes - 85

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

[2 September, 2013]

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

308

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

Noes-119

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri GK.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

The motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We shall, now, take up Amendment (No. 108) of Shri D. Raja. Are you moving?

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I move:

- (108) That at page 9, after line 12, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - "(2) It shall be the primary responsibility of the Central Government to ensure the continuous supply of foodgrains to a State".

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We shall, now, take up Amendment (No. 187) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. Seema, Shri Chatterjee and Shri Balagopal. Are you moving?

SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL (KERALA): Sir, I move:

(187) That at page 9, lines 9-10, after the words "Central

Government" the words "in consultation and agreement with State Governments in accordance with prevailing market prices" be inserted.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

Clause 23 was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause24 there are four Amendments. Amendment (No. 16) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Not moving. Amendment (No. 41) by Shri Javadekar. Not moving. Amendment (No. 226) by Shri Piyush Goyal. Not moving. Amendment (No. 236) by Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad. Not moving.

Clause 24 was added to the Bill.

Clauses 25 and 26 were added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 27, there are two amendments. Amendment (No. 109) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving?

Clause 27 – Disclosure of Records of Targeted Public Distribution System

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I move:-

- 109. That at page 10, after line 16, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - "(2) The Short Messaging Service (SMS) alert systems shall be set up, by the State Government, or local authorities, through which complaints regarding the functioning of this legislation, including the non performance of duties by the concerned officials, might be submitted.
 - (3) The SMS services shall also be used to provide members of the public with information on funds and food grains allotted to particular ration shops, ICDS centres and schools, community kitchens etc.
 - (4) The telephone lines specifically for dealing with Public Distribution System -related enquiries or complaints shall be set up for the purpose of this Act.
 - (5) Every public authority shall, specifically in relation to information about the Public Distribution System, publish all such information".

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 149) by Shri M.P. Achuthan. Are you moving it?

SHRI M. P. ACHUTHAN: Yes, Sir. I move:-

- 149. That at page 10, after line 16, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - "(2) Short Messaging Service (SMS) alert systems shall be set up by the State Government, or local authorities, through which complaints

regarding the functioning of this legislation, including the nonperformance of duties by the concerned official, shall be submitted.

- (3) SMS services shall also be used to provide members of the public with information on funds and foodgrains allotted to particular ration shops, the Integrated Child Development Services centers and schools, community kitchens, etc.,
- (4) Telephone lines especially for dealing with Public Distribution System- related enquiries or complaints shall be set up."

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

Clause 27 was added to the Bill.

Clauses 28 and 29 were added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 30, there are two Amendments (Nos.150 and 151) by Shri M. P. Achuthan. Are you moving these?

Clause 30 - Food Security for People living in Remote, Hilly and Tribal Areas

SHRI M. P. ACHUTHAN: Yes, Sir. I move:-

- 150. That at page 10, line 43, after the word "groups" the words "such as destitute and homeless persons" be inserted.
- 151. That at page 10, line 44, after the word "areas" the words "and for emergency feeding after some natural calamities" be inserted.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

Clause 30 was added to the Bill.

Clause 31 - Steps to further Advance Food and Nutritional Security

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 31, there are eight amendments. Amendments (Nos. 17 and 18) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Are you moving them?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I am not moving them, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 42) by Shri Javadekar. Are you moving it?

42. That at page 11, after line 3, the following be inserted, namely:-

"(2) The Government shall buy all foodgrains that farmers offer to sell to it at statutory Minimum Support Price (MSP) through procurement centres open for every ten kilometers radius area and the MSP shall be calculated as per the recommendation of the National Farmers Commission (cost plus fifty per cent)".

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 46) by Shri Naresh Gujral. Are you moving it?

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: I am not moving it, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 110 and 111) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving them?

SHRI D. RAJA: Yes, Sir. I move:-

- 110. That at page 11, line 2, *for* the words "strives to progressively realise", the words "ensure that all guidelines, policies, programmes and laws are in place towards and in accordance with the objectives specified in Schedule III" be *substituted*.
- 111. That at page 11, after line 3, the following proviso be inserted, namely:-

"Provided further that within one year from the date of commencement of this Act, all the relevant existing guidelines, policies in particular the industrial, agricultural and wage policies and laws shall be reviewed to ensure realization of the objectives specified in Schedule III of this Act."

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 227 and 228) by Shri Piyush Goyal. Are you moving the amendments?

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: I am not moving, Sir.

Clause 31 was added to the Bill.

11.00 р.м.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 112) for Insertion of New Clause 31A by Shri D. Raja.

New Clause 31A

SHRI D. RAJA: This is a very important issue, Sir. This is about MSP to farmers and about the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes.

Sir, I move:-

112. That at page 11, after line 3, the following be inserted, namely:-

"31A. (1) The Government shall buy all the foodgrains that farmers offer to sell to it at statutory Minimum Support Prices (MSP) through procurement centres opened for every 10 kilometers radius area.

(2) All entitlements provided under this Act are universal, special efforts shall be made to ensure physical and social access to disabled persons, persons belonging to nomadic tribes, persons belonging to denotified tribes, persons belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, aged persons, and single women".

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 32, there is one Amendment (No.188) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T. N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri Balagopal. Are you moving it?

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Yes, Sir.

I move:-

188. That at page 11, line 10, the words "from its own resources" be deleted.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

Clause 32 was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 33, there are three amendments. Amendment (No. 113) is by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving?

SHRI D. RAJA : Sir, I move:

- 113. That at page 11, after line 14, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - "(2) Whoever on the ground of 'untouchability' or caste, gender, religion or race enforces against any person, any disability, restriction, exclusion or boycott with regard to,
 - (i) access to any Fair Price Shop, grain, meal, utensils or any place prescribed under this Act; and
 - (ii) access to or employment under any other provision or entitlement of the National Food Security Act, shall be punishable with imprisonment of a minimum of three months and a maximum of six months with a fine of a minimum of rupees three thousand to a maximum of rupees twenty five thousand, which shall be deductible from the person who has committed the offence.

Explanation. (1) For the purpose of this Act, place includes any shop, centre, facility or space where grain, meal or any entitlement;

- (2) A person shall be deemed to boycott another person who refuses to let such other person or refuses to permit such other person to avail of entitlement or employment under this Act; and
- (3) Enforcing disability includes the use of threat, intimidation, verbal abuse (referring to caste or general in nature), violence, humiliation and discrimination.
- (3) Whoever, being a public servant willfully neglects his duties required to be performed by him under this Act, shall be punishable with imprisonment for a term which shall not be less than six months but which may extend to one year and a fine of minimum of rupees three thousand to a maximum of rupees twenty five thousand and the same shall be deductible from the person who has committed the offence and such offence shall be a cognizable and non-bailable as defined in the Indian Penal Code, 1860"
- (4) Whoever, having already been convicted of an offence under this Chapter is convicted for the second offence or any offence subsequent to the second offence, shall be punishable with imprisonment for a term

which shall not be less than one year but which may extend to the punishment provided for that offence and a fine of minimum of rupees three thousand to a maximum of rupees twenty five thousand and the same shall be deductible from the person who has committed the offence".

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.152) by Shri M.P. Achuthan. Are you moving?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN: Sir, I move:

- 152. That at page 11, after line 14, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - "(2) Whoever on the ground of untouchability, caste, gender, religion or race enforces against any person, any disability, restriction, exclusion or boycott with regards to -
 - (i) access to any Fair Price Shops, grain, utensils or any place prescribed under the Act; and
 - (ii) access to or employment under any other provision or entitlement of the Act, shall be punishable with imprisonment of a minimum of three months and a maximum of six months with a fine of a minimum of Rupees three thousand to a maximum of rupees twenty thousand which will be deductible from the person who has committed the offence.
 - (3) Whoever, being a public servant wilfully neglects his duties required to be performed by him under this Act, shall be punishable with imprisonment for a term which shall not be less than six months but which may extend to one year and a fine of minimum of Rupees three thousand to a maximum of rupees twenty five thousand which will be deductible from the salary of the person who has committed the offence and such offence will be cognizable and non-bailable as defined in the Indian Penal code, 1860.
 - (4) Whoever, having already been convicted of any offence under this clause is convicted for the second offence or subsequent offence, shall be punishable with imprisonment for a term which shall not be less than one year and a fine of minimum of rupees three thousand to a maximum

of rupees twenty five thousand which will be deductible from the person who has committed the offence.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 209) is by Shri Rabinarayan Mohapatra. Are you moving?

SHRI RABINARAYAN MOHAPATRA: Sir, I move:

209. That at page 11, line 14 *for* the words "shall be liable to penalty not exceeding five thousand rupees" the words "and in case of destruction of any foodgrain meant for distribution under this Act, the Public Servant or authority found guilty shall be liable to pay a penalty of twenty five thousand of rupees or the market value of such foodgrains whichever is higher" be *substituted*.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

Clause 33 was added to the Bill.

Clause 34 was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 35, there is one Amendment (No. 210) by Shri Rabinarayan Mohapatra. Are you moving?

Clause 35 - Power to Delegate by Central Government and State Government

SHRI RABINARAYAN MOHAPATRA: Sir, I move:

210. That at page 11, lines 29 to 36, be deleted.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

Clause 35 was added to the Bill.

Clause 36 was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 37, there is one Amendment (No. 189) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal. Are you moving?

Clause 37 - Power to Amend schedules

SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL: Sir, I move:

189. That at page 11, line 41, for the words "by notification" the words "only with approval of Parliament" be substituted.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

Clause 37 was added to the Bill

Clause 38 - Power of Central Government to give Directions

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 38, there are five amendments. Amendment (No. 19) by Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu. Mr. Naidu, are you pressing your amendment?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am not pressing my amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 54) by Dr. V. Maitreyan. Dr. Maitreyan, are you pressing your amendment?

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, I am not pressing my amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 56) by Shri Derek O'Brien.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, I am pressing my amendment. This is a issue of federal structure, and I seek a division also. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, the rights of the States should be protected, and we support his amendment.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, I move:

56. That at page 11, clause 38, be deleted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendment moved by Shri Derek O'Brien to vote.

The House divided.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes 85

> Noes 119

Ayes - 85

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

[2 September, 2013]

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

Noes-119

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P. Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri GK.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

The motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.114) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving?

SHRI D. RAJA: Yes, Sir. I move:

- 114. That at page 11, for lines 46 to 48, the following be *substituted*, namely:-
 - 38. The Central Government, in consultation with State Governments, issue directions for the effective implementation of the provisions of the Act.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.159) by Shri Parida.

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA: Sir, my amendment is similar to Shri Derek O'Brien, so I am not pressing it.

Clause 38 was added to the Bill.

Clause 39 - Power of Central Government to make rules

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 39, there are five Amendments. Amendments (Nos. 115 & 116) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving the amendments?

115. That at page 12, lines 9 to13, be deleted.

116. That at page 12, *after* line 19, the following proviso be *inserted*, namely:-

Provided that none of the entitlements under this Act shall be reduced due to not contribution of the Central or State share.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.160) by Shri Parida. Are you moving the amendment?

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA: I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 190 &191) by Shri Rajeeve, Dr. Seema, Shri Chatterjee and Shri Balagopal. Are you moving the amendments?

SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL: Sir, I move:

190. That at page 12, line 5, the words "cost sharing" be deleted.

191. That at page 12, lines 11 to 13, be deleted.

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

Clause 39 was added to the Bill.

Clauses 40 to 43 were added to the Bill.

Clause 44 - Force Majeure

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 44, there are seven amendments. Amendment (No.20) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Are you pressing your amendment?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am not pressing my amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.43) by Shri Prakash Javadekar. Are you pressing your amendment?

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I am not pressing my amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No.117) by Shri Raja. Are you moving?

SHRI D. RAJA: Yes, Sir. I move:

117. That at page 13, clause 44, be deleted.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.161) by Shri Parida. Are you moving?

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA: Yes, Sir. I move:

161. That at page 13, clause 44, be deleted.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.192) by Shri Rajeeve, Dr. Seema, Shri Chatterjee, Shri Balagopal. Are you moving?

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Yes, Sir. I move:

192. That at page 13, lines 38-40, the words beginning with "flood" and ending with the words "under this act" be deleted.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 229) by Shri Piyush Goyal. Are you moving?

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 237) by Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : Sir, I am moving because supply must be maintained during floods and drought also. I want division.

Sir, I move:

237. That at page 13, lines 38 and 39, the words "flood, drought" be deleted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the amendment moved by Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad to vote.

The House divided.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

Ayes - 85

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

[2 September, 2013]

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O' Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

[2 September, 2013]

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

Noes-119

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

[2 September, 2013]

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

340

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri GK.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

The motion was negatived.

Clause 44 was added to the Bill.

Clause 45 was added to the Bill.

Schedule I - Subsidised prices under Targeted Public Distribution System

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Schedule-I of the Bill. There are eight amendments. There is one Amendment (No. 21) by Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu. Are you moving?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am not pressing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 44) by Shri Prakash Javadekar. Are you moving?

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I move:

44. That at page 15, line 6, *after* the words "coarse grains", the words "rupees five per kilograms for pulses, rupees ten per liter for edible oil and rupee one per kilogram for iodized salt" *inserted*.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 55) by Dr. V. Maitreyan.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, I move:

55. That at page 15, for lines 4 to 11, the following be *substituted*, namely: "Eligible households shall be entitled to foodgrains under section 3 at the subsidised price not exceeding rupees 3 per kg for rice, rupees 2 per kg for wheat and rupee 1 per kg for coarse grains".

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, there are Amendments (Nos. 193 to 195) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T. N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal.

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE: Sir, it should be Rs.2/- instead of Rs.3/-.

SHRI K. N. BALAGOPAL: Sir, it is very important. We want division.

Sir, I move:

- 193. That at page 15, line 5, for the figure and words "3 per kg. for rice" the words "2 per kg for rice" be *substituted*.
- 194. That at page 15, line 6, for the words "three years" the words "at least ten years" be *substituted*.
- 195. That page 15, line 6 to 11, the words beginning with "and there *after*" and ending with "as the case may be" be *deleted*.
- MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the amendments moved by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T. N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal to vote.

The House divided.

MR. CHAIRMAN Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

Ayes - 85

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O' Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

Noes-119

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

[2 September, 2013]

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

[2 September, 2013]

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri GK.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

The motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Amendment (No. 211) by Shri Rabinarayan Mohapatra. Are you moving the amendment, Mr. Mohapatra?

SHRI RABINARAYAN MOHAPATRA: Yes, Sir, and I want division. I move:

211. That at page 15, line 5 for the words and figure "rupees 3 per kg for rice, rupees 2 per kg for wheat" the words and figure "rupee 1 per kg for rice and rupee 1 per kg for wheat" be substituted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendment moved by Shri Rabinarayan Mohapatra to vote.

The House divided

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes 85

> Noes 119

Ayes - 85

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N.

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O' Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

Noes-119

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri GK.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

The motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 230) by Shri Piyush Goyal. He is not pressing.

Schedule I was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Schedule II. There is one amendment (No. 231) by Shri Piyush Goyal. He is not pressing it.

Schedule II was added to the Bill.

Schedule III

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Schedule III. There are three Amendments; Amendments (Nos. 22 to 24) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, these are the last Amendments about remunerative prices on the Swaminathan Commission's recommendation. I request the Government to accept these Amendment. The Minister has given a commitment, but there is nothing specific here. That is why I have mentioned it. I appeal to them in the interest of the farmers, please accept these Amendments. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Naidu, are you moving the Amendments?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I move:-

- 22. That at page 17, line 10, *after* the words "remunerative prices", the words "in accordance with the recommendations of the National Commission on Farmers and, in particular, with the method of fixation of Minimum Support Price at fifty per cent more than the weighted average cost of production" be *inserted*.
- 23. That at page 17, after line 12, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - "(e) linking rivers within ten years across the country in order to secure optimum utilisation of water for irrigation and drinking purposes in rural areas".
- 24. That at page 17, after line 20, the following be inserted, namely:-
 - "(e) providing storage facilities through both public and private initiatives for the total requirement of foodgrains by the Centre from time to time and also providing godowns in every panchayat for storage of grains; and
 - (f) providing incentives for setting up of cold storage chains and also refrigeratory vans for farmers in every tehsil across the country".

The questions were put and the motions were negatived.

Schedule III was added to the Bill.

Schedule IV was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now clause 1. There is one Amendment (No.196) by Shri N.K. Singh. Not present.

Clause 1 was added to the Bill.

The Enacting Formula was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now the Long Title. There are three Amendments, Amendment (No.25) by Shri Prakash Javadekar, Amendment (No.67) by Shri D. Raja

361

and Amendment (No.118) by Shri M.P. Achuthan. Amendment (No.25) by Shri Prakash Javadekar. Are you moving?

Long Title

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I move:

(25) That at page 1, for the long title, the following be substituted, namely:-

"A Bill to ensure public provisioning of food and related measures and to provide for food and nutritional security in human life cycle approach, by ensuring social, physical and economic access to adequate quantity of food at affordable prices to all eligible persons in the country, at all times to live a life with dignity in pursuance of article 21 of the Constitution of India".

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.67) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving?

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I move:

That at page 1, for the long title, the following be substituted, namely:-(67)

"A Bill to ensure public provisioning of food and related measures and to provide for food and nutritional security in human life cycle approach, by ensuring social, physical and economic access to adequate quantity of food at affordable prices to all persons in the country, at all times to live a life with dignity in pursuance of article 21 of the Constitution of India".

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.118) by Shri M.P. Achuthan. Are you moving?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN: Sir, I move:

118 That at page 1, in the long title, after the words "by ensuring" the words "social, physical and economic" be inserted.

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

The Long Title was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now the Minister to move that the Bill be passed.

PROF. K.V. THOMAS: Sir, I move:

That the Bill be passed.

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we will continue with the Special Mentions. Hon. Members may please lay their Special Mentions on the Table.

SPECIAL MENTIONS - (Contd.)

Demand for proper implementation of the Integrated Action Plan for development of naxal affected districts in Bihar

' (ΘΕΙΘΕΨΙΟ, 'O' † 0' (ΟΙ ΘΕΙΘΕΥΙΟ) Α΄ (ΘΕΙ

Demand for mandatory attestation of documents by Gazetted officer or Notary Public for obtaining connections by mobile subscribers in the country

ÁÖB ŰŸŸĀŒĬŮ <»Ů ŰÜĞİĞĞÜÜÜ (YÜĞĞ]ÖVÖ) : ŰÆÜĞEŸÜ, ŰÜEÜ܇»Ü ×ÃÖ Ü ÜÜĞ Ö -ÖÖ¸ÛÛ ¾ÖĞŒYÜÇÜÜÜ ÜĞ X֪ ܱÜÜĞ;ÜŸÖ ÜĞ 2'ÖÇĞ ÜE ÃÖÇÛÜÜ,Ü ®O< ÜÜBÖ-ÖÖÖ »ÖÖYÜGE ÜÜ,EĞE •ÖÖ ÜÆĞ ÆĞÜ, »ÖÜÜÜÖ †3'ÖB 3'ÖB ±ú•ÖÄ ±ÃΥΟΧΑΕ ΘΕ Ο ΙΟ΄ ^ ΤΦΟΙΟ Ο Ι΄, Ο ΘΕ »Ο Ο Ο ΘΕ Ο ΑΚΟΙ ΑΚΟΙ ΑΚΟΙ Ο ΙΟ΄ ΑΚΟΙ Ο ΙΟΙ

ÆijŪ 10000±»0 † 000, 8 μ0 900 μ0 000 100 μ00 000 μ00 000 μ00 000 μ00 000 μ00 000 μ00 000 μ00 000 μ00 000 μ00 000 μ

Demand for moratorium on interest and payment of debt of the State of West Bengal

SHRI VIVEK GUPTA (West Bengal): Sir, as stated in Article 355 of the Constitution of India, it is the duty of the Union to protect every State against external aggression and internal disturbance and to ensure that the Government of every State is carried on in accordance with the provisions of the Constitution. The situation of West Bengal, which is reeling under a heavy debt burden for more than three decades, is no less than that of internal disturbance. It is classified as a debt-stressed State by the Thirteenth Finance Commission. The State Government is in a condition wherein it has to spend more than Rs. 20,000 crores a year for debt servicing. Add to this, the Central Government receives a lion's share of taxes collected from the State. This makes it difficult to push forth for development and welfare in other sectors which are essential to ensure a higher standard of living

for the people of the State. A debt restructuring plan and moratorium on principal and interest payment will put the State in a new trajectory of growth, as the State has great growth and investment potential. Such a plan is absolutely essential for the State to finance incentives to industry, infrastructure development schemes and welfare programmes.

Demand to take steps to ensure adequate utilization of allocated funds to provide relief to victims of rape in the country

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI (Gujarat): Sir, according to the CAG Report on the accounts of the Union Government, the Ministry of Women and Child Development (WCD) failed to spend a single rupee from the entire provision of Rs.239.02 crore allocated to the 'Relief to and Rehabilitation of Rape Victims' Scheme between 2009 and 2012.

According to the National Crime Records Bureau, 24,923 rape cases were registered in the country in 2012. The conviction rate was a poor 24.2 per cent. 85.1 per cent of all the rape cases in India, or 86,032 cases, are still pending in courts all over the country. The Government, far from providing infrastructure for speedier justice and for increasing the conviction rates, is not even spending funds meant for relief.

An article in the 'Indian Express', dated August 19th, states that the reason for the funds remaining unspent was that while the WCD wanted it to be a Central scheme, with the States and the Centre contributing equally, the Commission wanted disbursement handed over to States as assistance from the Centre.

In a country where women's safety and a crime like rape are grave national issues, such bureaucratic red tape is disgraceful and unacceptable. I urge the Government to ensure that the funds are properly utilized in aiding the aggrieved women.

Demand to frame a national policy to ensure compliance of standards of quality and safety in construction of buildings in country

SHRI RAMA CHANDRA KHUNTIA (Odisha): Sir, 11 persons were killed, 8 were injured and 40 persons were trapped in Gujarat in twin building collapse in Madhab Nagar locality of Attaldala area. The building is only ten years' old inaugurated by the Chief Minister ten years before. The number of deaths in last Gujarat's earthquake increased because newly constructed flats had collapsed. Recently, in Mumbai, two high-rise buildings collapsed and many peopled died.

In Delhi also, many people are dying due to building collapse. The reason is poor quality material used, indiscriminate approval of building plans and allowing the people to live in old and unsafe buildings. In Odisha, five students died in July, 2012 when a building collapsed in Ranpur, Suyakhia Sahi and Nayagarh. There are thousands of incidents where innocent people have died due to the collapse of buildings. In Ahmedabad, Mumbai, Kolkata, Delhi and Hyderabad, many old and unsafe buildings are there where people are living. Municipal authorities are not taking steps to demolish these buildings.

I urge upon the Government to undertake a detailed study by our expert group in this regard and form a National Policy in consultation with State Governments so as to improve the construction quality to that of world standards and strict implementation of the statute. Also, all old and unsafe buildings in the urban areas should be demolished immediately.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned to meet on Tuesday, the 3rd September, 2013.

The House then adjourned at twenty-five minutes past eleven of the clock till eleven of the clock on Tuesday, the 3rd September, 2013.