

Vol. 222
No. 18



सत्यमेव जयते

PARLIAMENTARY DEBATES

Tuesday
17 March, 2011
26 Phalguna, 1932 (Saka)

RAJYA SABHA

OFFICIAL REPORT

CONTENTS

Matter raised with permission-

Wikileaks cable on money for vote in No Confidence Motion in 2008
(pages 1-14)

Statements by Ministers-

Notice issued by the Income Tax Department to the Government of
Gujarat - *Laid on the Table* (pages 15-17)

Status of implementation of the recommendations contained in the
Third Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing
Committee on External Affairs - *Laid on the Table* (page 20)

Status of implementation of the recommendations contained in the One
Hundred and Fifty-fifth Report of the Department-related
Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport, Tourism and Culture -
Laid on the Table (page 20)

Status of implementation of the recommendations contained in the One
Hundred and Fifty-sixth Report of the Department-related
Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport, Tourism and Culture -
Laid on the Table (page 20-21)

Discussion on the Working of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs - *Discussion
not concluded*

(pages 17, 21-23)

Papers Laid on the Table (pages 18-20)

©

RAJYA SABHA SECRETARIAT

NEW DELHI

PRICE : **Rs. 50.00**

Web-site Address : <http://rajyasabha.nic.in>
<http://parliamentofindia.nic.in>
E-mail Address : rsedit-e@sansad.nic.in

PUBLISHED UNDER RULE 260 OF RULES OF PROCEDURE AND CONDUCT OF BUSINESS
IN THE COUNCIL OF STATES (RAJYA SABHA) AND PRINTED BY SUNLIGHT PRINTERS,
E1/16, ANSARI ROAD, DARYAGANJ, DELHI-110002

RAJYA SABHA

Thursday, 17th March, 2011/26th Phalgun, 1932 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock,

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

MATTER RAISED WITH PERMISSION

Wikileaks cable on money for vote in No Confidence Motion in 2008

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Zero Hour. Shri Arun Jaitley, the hon. the Leader of the Opposition.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): Sir, I am grateful to you for allowing me to raise a matter of extreme public importance. There is a publication today of a cable sent in the year 2008 by an official of the US Embassy to the US establishment in Washington. It has been published today by the *Hindu* newspaper. The reading of this cable and the details mentioned therein, Sir, reflect an extraordinarily depressing situation of how our democracy has been reduced to and to what extent it has been reduced to. Sir, we had raised this issue in the year 2008 when the Left had withdrawn support from UPA-I and at that time a Vote of Confidence had been called in Parliament, there were detailed reports of floor crossing by MPs, of use of collateral consideration, moneys being displayed and all these factors were involved in influencing that Vote of Confidence. Today, Sir, this accidental leak of an American confession in this regard completely establishes the worst that we had feared at that time. What appears to have happened is that the Government reduced to a minority was wooing political parties, was wooing Independent MPs and now it stands more or less established from statements made to the American Embassy officials by representatives of the ruling party, they were actually showed cash-filled war chests. Rogue war chests were collected to be utilized in order to influence this Vote of Confidence. ...(Interruptions)... The situation reached such a ...(Interruptions)... It reached a situation that you have important functionaries making statements of how much ...(Interruptions).. Sir, ...(Interruptions)..

SHRI PRAVEEN RASHTRAPAL (Gujarat): This is based only on a newspaper report. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री उपसभापति : प्रवीण राष्ट्रपाल जी, आप बैठिए ...(व्यवधान)... उनको बुलाया गया है, उनको बोलने दीजिए ...(व्यवधान)... बाद में आप जवाब दीजिए ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री प्रवीण राष्ट्रपाल : सर, यह जो कह रहे हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: In the face of all this we say ...*(Interruptions)*... In the face of all this we say that by a thin majority of four against three, somebody had said so, let me say this and I said it earlier that these thin majorities do not confer any kind of legitimacy on these acts which seemed to have happened. You have important political functionaries now saying, "We may display to you the war chest which has been collected, and we will give you the names of the people to whom it is to be paid. We will also name.." ...*(Interruptions)*... Let the Government reply after we finish. ...*(Interruptions)*... Of course, we need a reply from the Government.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Leader of the Opposition is speaking. ...*(Interruptions)*... You can take your time and you can say whatever you want to say. ...*(Interruptions)*.. You can reply to that. ...*(Interruptions)*.. Mr. Nayak, how can I do it? ...*(Interruptions)*.. You see it is Zero Hour. Some matter has been admitted. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: I am making this charge because after what has appeared today, this Government. ...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SHANTARAM LAXMAN NAIK (Goa): Sir, ...*(Interruptions)*.

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया (झारखण्ड) : सर, यह क्या है? ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, वे क्या बोल रहे हैं? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT (West Bengal): Let everybody have their chance to speak. Let all the parties speak on this.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*. Go to your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*. You can say once he completes. ...*(Interruptions)*. You can say whatever. ...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SHANTARAM LAXMAN NAIK: Sir, ...*(Interruptions)*.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the Government say that. ...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, after what has appeared today. ...*(Interruptions)*.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Go to your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*. Allow the Leader of the Opposition to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): Sir, you can't allow this. ...*(Interruptions)*. Sir, this can't be allowed. You allow all of us to speak. Let them respond...*(Interruptions)*. You allow all of us and let them respond. ...*(Interruptions)*.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will give time. ...*(Interruptions)*. One of you can say what you want to say. ...*(Interruptions)*. I will give an opportunity. ...*(Interruptions)*... One of you can speak. ...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, are the facts so embarrassing? ...*(Interruptions)*.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the Leader of the Opposition say. ...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, are the facts so embarrassing that the ruling party is? ...*(Interruptions)*.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will give you an opportunity. Why are all of you getting up? ...*(Interruptions)*.

श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडु (कर्नाटक) : सर, ...*(व्यवधान)*... सत्तारूढ़ पार्टी proceedings disturb कर रही है ...*(व्यवधान)*... जब सत्तारूढ़ पार्टी वाले disturb कर रहे हैं ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gnanadesikan, if you want to speak, I will give you time. ...*(Interruptions)*. I will allow you, but let him complete. ...*(Interruptions)*.

श्री राशिद अल्वी (आन्ध्र प्रदेश) : सर, ...*(व्यवधान)*... एक कमेटी constitue हुई ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI SHANTARAM LAXMAN NAIK: Sir, they will not allow us to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are presuming; what can I say?

श्रीमती माया सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश) : सर, ruling party सदन को चलने नहीं दे रही है ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI SHANTARAM LAXMAN NAIK: They will disturb the House. They will not allow us to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, this is not correct. ...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: We will hear you; don't worry. Let this be over

and then we will all hear you.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaitley, please conclude now. ...(*Interruptions*)... There are other two or three Members.

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, I will complete in one minute. Sir, it is conclusively clear now that this Government survived on the strength of a political sin, a moral. ...(*Interruptions*).

MS. MABEL REBELL (Jharkhand): No. ...(*Interruptions*).

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, I have two more sentences. ...(*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, is it a way to treat the Leader of the Opposition in the House? ...(*Interruptions*). What is this?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have asked them to sit down.

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, a Government, which survived on the strength of such a political sin, such a moral sin, has no authority, no right, to continue even for one minute. We demand that this Government must resign immediately after this episode. ...(*Interruptions*).

डॉ. प्रभा ठाकुर (राजस्थान) : सर, ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्रीमती विप्लव ठाकुर (हिमाचल प्रदेश) : लोगों ने वोट दिये हैं। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I am standing here. I think these. ...(*Interruptions*).

श्री उपसभापति : आप जाइए। ...(**व्यवधान**)... Mr. Hanumantha Rao, please sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)... आप बैठिए, बैठिए। ...(**व्यवधान**)... आप भी इस पर नोटिस दीजिए। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, this report, that has appeared today, these details of these exposures that have come today, these alleged exposures, constitute a humongous indictment of the way this Government has been functioning. And this represents not only a cross degeneration of political morality, but it also represents a cross political opportunism in the manner in which this Government survives the Confidence Motion last time. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will give you an opportunity. ...(*Interruptions*)... I will give. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, at that point of time when these images came on the national television, the whole country was shocked, and the other House set up what was known as a Cash

for Votes Committee to investigate. Now, we do not know what happened to that Committee's findings, but reliable information tells us that the findings suggested that there should be a criminal investigation into that entire happenings and the amount of money that was transferred etcetera, etcetera. We would want that criminal investigations to proceed now.

Secondly, Sir, if the Government feels that this was just a conspiracy, that these are allegations that have been hurled on the Government, we would want them to come and explain, to clear themselves here. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Naik, you are not speaking even from your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no; Mr. Shantaram Laxman Naik, if you want to say something, please go to your seat. You can't speak from that seat. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, the allegations are so dangerous. ...*(Interruptions)*... The allegations are so dangerous that they link up various individuals who are Members of this august House to the Gandhi family, to the Government and these are things that cannot be allowed. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no; please don't say. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: That cannot be allowed to go unanswered and uninvestigated.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no; you said. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Therefore, Sir, what I am asking the Government is that you have this Cash for Votes Committee recommendations of which nobody knows, what it is. Proceed criminally on these charges. Proceed against these individuals or whatever that Committee has found out and establish guilt; otherwise, there is no moral ground ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There are so many people who have already given notices.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: There is no moral ground... ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is Zero Hour. Only those who have given notice will be given preference. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: There is no moral ground for this Government to continue, Sir, unless these are established. ...(*Interruptions*)... These have to be properly answered.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: And a criminal investigation is necessary; otherwise, the Government cannot convince us.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri D. Raja.

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA (Maharashtra): You don't believe in Americans. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Prove them wrong. ...*(Interruptions)*... Prove them wrong; I will be happy. ...*(Interruptions)*... Prove them wrong. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Shantaram Laxman Naik, please go to your seat.

SHRI SHANTARAM LAXMAN NAIK: Let him quote the rules, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You don't say that we have to follow rules and all that. You go to your seat and, then, speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, all I am saying is that the Government should come and prove that wrong. ...*(Interruptions)*... You show that. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am daring you to prove that wrong. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please associate. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Raja, please associate because on the same subject there is no speech to be made.

SHRI D. RAJA (Tamil Nadu): I have given a notice, Sir.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, let him speak.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Ahluwaliaji, you can't break the rules every day. ...*(Interruptions)*... If, every day, you go on breaking the rules just because you say 'you also break' ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no; I am allowing. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am allowing. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am allowing. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Ahluwalia, don't stand up when I am on my legs. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please don't do it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... What did I say? ...*(Interruptions)*... What did I say? ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Ahluwalia, please listen to me. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have been

listening to you. Please have patience to listen to me also. What I said
...(Interruptions)... What I

said ...(*Interruptions*)... Please sit down. आप बैठिए न। ...(*व्यवधान*)... आप बैठिए। ...(*व्यवधान*)... Why are you getting up? Why are you getting up when I am on my legs. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)... What I said is, I am following the Zero Hour rules. I didn't say anything wrong. You are shouting at me. I didn't say anything wrong. ...(*Interruptions*)... वृंदा जी, आप भी जरा मदद कीजिए। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, you are taking it personally. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have not taken it personally. ...(*Interruptions*)... I have not taken it personally. ...(*Interruptions*)... What did I say? Usually, in Zero Hour, on the same subject, if three or four Members raise ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: In an unusual situation, what do we do, Sir?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is different. ...(*Interruptions*)... It is my duty as a Chairman to follow the rules on all matters. All matters are important for me. All matters are important for me. ...(*Interruptions*)... Listen to me. ...(*Interruptions*)... Mr. Ahluwalia, please listen to me. Let us not have a running commentary. Please listen to me. ...(*Interruptions*)... आप बैठिए न। ...(*व्यवधान*)... आप बैठिए। ...(*व्यवधान*)... क्या आप खामोश नहीं बैठ सकते? ...(*व्यवधान*)... What I am saying is, I have just said, 'please associate'. This is what I am saying every day when I take up Zero Hour issues. It is not a new thing. And for the Chair, all subjects are important once they are admitted. So, I am doing my duty. If I do not do my duty, if you get up and if a number of people also get up and say to the Chair, 'You follow this', this is not correct in the interest of the House. ...(*Interruptions*)...

Please, Mr. Ahluwalia, what did I say? 'You only associate'. Again, if everybody takes three minutes? So, do not break the rules.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, thank you for this opportunity. Sir, in the name of Mother India, I appeal to all political parties to address this issue with seriousness. This is, indeed, a very serious issue. Our democracy is in peril, our democratic polity is in peril. The Hindu is one of the reputed newspapers in the country and it has published WikiLeaks. It saddens me, it should sadden the Government, it should sadden everybody. What is happening in India? We, the Left parties did withdraw our support on the issue of the nuclear deal. The Government should have accepted;

but, the Government wanted to survive and money was displayed in Lok Sabha! And, it is a sad day, according to the Speaker! (*Interruptions*)
Yes, I am coming to that. Please listen. (*Interruptions*).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Raja, you should address the Chair.
(Interruptions).

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, let me complete. ...(Interruptions)... I have a right to speak, let them hear. When they speak, I will hear them. The point here is that the money power, added to it the external power, played a dangerous game. In such a situation, what should the Government have done? The Government should have taken a moral stand, ethical stand without getting into opportunism. Principles should have been upheld. But, instead of that, the Congress-led UPA Government, at that time, survived * (Interruptions).

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, no. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot allow such insinuations and they will be removed. (Interruptions). You cannot have insinuation. (Interruptions). It should not be shown. You cannot justify it. I cannot allow on record everything you say. (Interruptions). Please sit down.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, let me conclude.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us follow a good precedence while expressing our views.

SHRI D. RAJA: If they say 'no', I think, it is proper, appropriate that the Prime Minister comes and explains here what the stand of the Government is. I think, if the situation continues like this, the Government has lost its moral authority to stay in office and continue to rule this country because without the moral authority you cannot continue.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How many times do you want to repeat, Mr. Raja? Now, Mr. Elavarasan. ...(Interruptions)... Hon. Members, please sit down.

SHRI A. ELAVARASAN (Tamil Nadu): Thank you Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, for allowing me to speak.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will not allow you to speak for a long time. You simply associate without reading. In association, I will not allow reading. Say only a few words.

SHRI A. ELAVARASAN: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I wish to draw the attention of this august House towards the news item published in the Hindu relating to influencing the voters in south India. The newspaper has quoted...

* Not recorded.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I asked you to simply associate.

SHRI A. ELAVARASAN: The newspaper has quoted fuelling money to voters in Tamil Nadu. *(Interruptions)*.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You cannot read from the paper, first of all. I cannot allow you to read. *(Interruptions)*. Brindaji, when your turn comes you can; please do not argue for others.

SHRI A. ELAVARASAN: Sir, the rein of terror in elections. *...(Interruptions)*.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Elavarasan, you have associated. Now, Mr. Mohapatra; just association.

SHRI A. ELAVARASAN: Sir,*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is over, Mr. Elavarasan. Now, nothing will go on record.

SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA (Orissa): I will speak only one sentence, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have called Mr. Mohapatra, and whatever you say, Mr. Elavarasan, will not go on record. Let it not be recorded. Only Mr. Mohapatra now. *...(Interruptions)*... Please sit down, Mr. Elavarasan. I have not allowed you to read. First of all, reading is not allowed in association. Whatever you say will not go on record. Mr. Elavarasan, please sit down. Please sit down. *...(Interruptions)*... Mr. Elavarasan, please sit down. *...(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. ELAVARASAN: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have not allowed you to read *...(Interruptions)*... I have not allowed you to read *...(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. ELAVARASAN: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: See, first of all, reading is not allowed *...(Interruptions)*... I have not allowed you to read. *...(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. ELAVARASAN: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, nothing is going on record. *...(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. ELAVARASAN: *

* Not recorded.

SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA: Sir, while associating myself with the issue raised by the hon. Leader of the Opposition, all that I am going to say is that this Government is functioning on 'cash-and-carry' basis. Just like this House dealt with the Cash-for-Questions Scam, let us deal with this issue in that way. Thank you.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Manohar Joshi. I request you to just associate yourself.

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI (Maharashtra): I am associating with the issue and would only say a couple of sentences on this.

Sir, firstly, the issue is known to everybody in the country. From today this issue will be known to the entire world. Those who knew the Congress culture, this is not something new. ...(*Interruptions*)...

Sir, they are ruling the country by making payment for votes ...(*Interruptions*)... It has to be condemned by all sections of Parliament ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri N.K. Singh ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI: Sir, I condemn it strongly. ...(*Interruptions*)... I demand that these people should be punished. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Joshiji, you only associate ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. MANOHAR JOSHI: Yes, Sir. I am associating ...(*Interruptions*)... Lastly, Sir, I must say that the Government has no right now to remain in the Office. The hon. Prime Minister should come here. ...(*Interruptions*)... The hon. Prime Minister, if he is honest enough, must come here and immediately resign on this issue ...(*Interruptions*)... If that is not done, it is very difficult to cooperate with the Government. ...(*Interruptions*)... Thank you.

श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि (उड़ीसा) : सर, प्रधान मंत्री इस्तीफा दें। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

SHRI N.K. SINGH (Bihar): Sir, my party, while fully associating with what the hon. Leader of the Opposition has said that the moral and ethical culpability of the Government, after this clear exposes, really demand a clarification. ...(*Interruptions*)... And, we fully associate with other sentiments expressed by other members. The hon. Prime Minister has an obligation, both as the Prime Minister and Leader of the House, to come and clarify this position. ...(*Interruptions*)... Thank you.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Venkaiah Naidu. ...(*Interruptions*)... Now, let us take up the next subject. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : सर, सरकार इस्तीफा दें।...(*व्यवधान*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us take up the Zero Hour mentions ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : सर, प्रधानमंत्री इस्तीफा दें।...(*व्यवधान*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Are you not interested to listen to him? ...(*Interruptions*)... Mr. Yechury, are you not interested to listen to him? ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी (उत्तर प्रदेश) : सर ...(*व्यवधान*)...

श्री पुरुषोत्तम खोडाभाई रूपाला (गुजरात) : सर, प्रधान मंत्री इस्तीफा दें। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

श्री विजय कुमार रूपानी (गुजरात) : सर, प्रधान मंत्री इस्तीफा दें। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The hon. Finance Minister wants to say something. ...(*Interruptions*)... Mr. Yechury, are you not interested to listen the reply from the hon. Finance Minister? ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्रीमती माया सिंह : सर, प्रधान मंत्री का इस्तीफा चाहिए। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Yes, Sir. ...(*Interruptions*)... And, after listening to him, you allow us to respond. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री विनय कटियार (उत्तर प्रदेश) : सर ...(*व्यवधान*)...

श्री विक्रम वर्मा (मध्य प्रदेश) : सर, सरकार इस्तीफा दें। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Are you interested or not? ...(*Interruptions*)... You said that the Government should respond. The hon. Finance Minister wanted to respond. ...(*Interruptions*)... But, you are not allowing. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : सर, प्रधान मंत्री का इस्तीफा चाहिए ...(*व्यवधान*)... Sir, we want the hon. Leader of the House to come and give a reply. ...(*Interruptions*)... We want his resignation ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is unfair. ...(*Interruptions*)... You have asked the Chair to direct the Government to respond. ...(*Interruptions*)... The Finance Minister agreed for reply, but you are not allowing. ...(*Interruptions*)... This is totally unfair.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, let the hon. Prime Minister come and give explanation. ...(*Interruptions*)... This House is headed by the hon. Prime Minister. ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): Sir, first of all, I would like to make it quite clear. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ahluwalia, you cannot hold the House for ...(*Interruptions*)... You are holding the House. ...(*Interruptions*)... The hon. Finance Minister wants to reply, but you are not allowing ...(*Interruptions*)... It is left to you. ...(*Interruptions*)... That is left to you. ...(*Interruptions*)... You demanded that the Government should respond. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री पुरुषोत्तम खोडाभाई रूपाला : सर, प्रधान मंत्री इस्तीफा दें। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

श्री विजय कुमार रूपानी : सर, प्रधान मंत्री इस्तीफा दें। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am asking the Government to reply ...(*Interruptions*)... But you are not listening. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, we want reply from the hon. Leader of the House. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is not appreciated. ...(*Interruptions*)... He wants to speak. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, we want to listen to him ...(*Interruptions*)... I want to listen to him. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned till 12.00 hours.
The House then adjourned at twenty-five minutes past eleven of the clock.

The House re-assembled at twelve of the clock,

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu) : Sir, they must apologize for whatever they have said about the hon. Prime Minister. ...(*Interruptions*)... They must apologize. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, the Leader of the House must be called here. ...(*Interruptions*)... सर Leader of the House को बुलाया जाए। ...(*व्यवधान*)... Leader of the House को यहां बुलाया जाए, जो इस देश के प्रधान मंत्री हैं। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Member wants to say something. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री राजीव शुक्ल (महाराष्ट्र) : सर, यह कहां का रूल है कि रूलिंग पार्टी के मिनिस्टर को, वित्त मंत्री को, जवाब तक नहीं देने दे रहे हैं ये लोग! ...*(व्यवधान)*...

The hon. Finance Minister wants to make a statement.

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : आप प्रधान मंत्री को बुलाइए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री उपसभापति : आपके बोलने से हम नहीं बुलाएंगे। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : प्रधान मंत्री यहां आकर जवाब दें। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री उपसभापति : यहां गवर्नमेंट है और गवर्नमेंट जवाब दे रही है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : प्रधान मंत्री को बुलाइए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... We want the Prime Minister to come here. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yesterday, you wanted the Finance Minister to reply on the IT raids and he has come here with a statement. ...*(Interruptions)*... Do you want. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: About Gujarat? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Let him lay the statement. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let him lay it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is not correct. मिस्टर अहलुवालिया, आप जो बोलेंगे, क्या इस हाउस में वही होगा? ...*(व्यवधान)*... The hon. Finance Minister wants to make a statement. ...*(Interruptions)*... यह क्या हो रहा है? ...*(व्यवधान)*... नहीं, नहीं, आपने कल हाउस में डिमांड की थी कि the Finance Minister should reply. He has come here and he wants to make a statement. Now you say, 'no statement'. ...*(Interruptions)*... अब वे बोलेंगे, वित्त मंत्री जी, बोलिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, in the morning, the hon. Leader of the Opposition made a statement in the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री तारिक अनवर (महाराष्ट्र) : क्यों नहीं बोलने दे रहे हैं उनको? ...*(व्यवधान)*... हाउस को क्या ये ही चलाएंगे? क्या हाउस को ये लोग ही कंट्रोल करेंगे? ...*(व्यवधान)*... हम लोग सुनना चाहते हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... जिनको नहीं सुनना हो, वे बाहर चले जाएं, हम लोग वित्त मंत्री को सुनना चाहते हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... क्यों नहीं बोलेंगे? हाउस को क्या आप चलाएंगे? ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : आप प्राइम मिनिस्टर को बुलाइए। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री पुरुषोत्तम खोडाभाई रूपाला : प्रधान मंत्री को बुलाइए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री विजय कुमार रूपानी : प्राइम मिनिस्टर को बुलाइए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री तारिक अनवर : हाउस को चलने दीजिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I would like to most respectfully submit that the correspondence between a sovereign Government and its missions abroad enjoy diplomatic immunity. ...*(Interruptions)*... No aspect should be made available to them. Therefore, it is not possible for the Government to either confirm it or deny it, because we enjoy diplomatic immunity. It is a correspondence between a sovereign Government and its mission located abroad. ...*(Interruptions)*...

Secondly, every Lok Sabha is sovereign during its period of tenure. What happened in the 14th Lok Sabha cannot be judged during the tenure of the 15th Lok Sabha. ...*(Interruptions)*... The 14th Lok Sabha was dissolved in May, 2009. Thereafter, the 15th Lok Sabha has come to exist. The Government of the day is a newly elected Government accountable to the 15th Lok Sabha and not accountable to the 14th Lok Sabha. ...*(Interruptions)*... Whatever happened in the 14th Lok Sabha, which has terminated, has ended.

The third point which I would like to submit for the consideration of the hon. Leader of the Opposition is that if he is satisfied that what appears in the newspapers is an admissible evidence in any court of law ...*(Interruptions)*... I will be satisfied by his proclamation that it is an admissible evidence in any court of law in India as per the law.

This is the submission that I wanted to make. ...*(Interruptions)*... After this, Sir, I would like to make a statement because yesterday. ...*(Interruptions)*... He can make it; I have no problem. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him complete. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: You can do it after I make a statement on Gujarat. It is a very simple statement. Yesterday, you demanded it and you also said that somebody should make the statement on behalf of the Government. Unfortunately, I was not present in the House on that day. Therefore, I have come today. It is a very small and simple statement. I won't take much time and after that, you can speak.

STATEMENTS BY MINISTERS

Notice issued by Income Tax department to the Government of Gujarat

THE FINANCE MINISTER (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): A complaint was made on 10th December, 2010, and, again on 22nd December, 2010 by the Leader of Opposition, Gujarat Vidhan Sabha, to the effect that large amounts of funds were being committed to be invested by industrialists, builders, trading companies and others during the Vibrant Gujarat Global Investment Summit. It was asserted in the complaint that they either had the funds or would raise it to honour the commitments, which called for tax investigation into the source of such huge funds.

To collect further information in the matter, in order to verify the allegation, the Income Tax Investigation Directorate of Gujarat issued a letter on 17th February, 2011 to the Industries Commissioner, Government of Gujarat, seeking copies of MOUs of the value above Rs. 1,000 crore signed during the Vibrant Gujarat Summit, 2010 and 2011. The information, which was sought under section 131 (1A) of the Income Tax Act, 1961, has so far not been furnished.

Verification of allegations made in any complaint is routinely carried out by the Income Tax Department. Thank you, Sir.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): Sir, I have a clarification. But first I will ask him a question on the first statement that he has made. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): It is not a debate. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The hon. Finance Minister has agreed to give a clarification. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, when the Finance Minister has been fair enough to say that I could ask the clarification a little later, I don't think my friends should have an objection.

If what has appeared is correct, as Mr. Yechury rightly pointed out, it is a commission of an offence in India. Diplomatic immunity may be available to American diplomats but the diplomatic immunity available to a US diplomat can certainly not be claimed by the Government of India for the benefit of those Indians, who have committed an offence in India. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is an offence

committed in India. It is an offence of bribery committed by Indians in India. ...(*Interruptions*)... Where is the question of Finance Minister saying that I am claiming diplomatic immunity with regard to that correspondence? That correspondence, despite that immunity has already been published. So, there is no question of anyone claiming that immunity.

Secondly, Sir, it is very easy to say that the House, the 14th Lok Sabha was sovereign, and, it does not extend to the 15th Lok Sabha. All these factors do not apply when an offence of bribery is committed outside the House. That is the case. Now, outside the House, an offence of bribery has been committed. ...(*Interruptions*)... I am sorry. ...(*Interruptions*)... You are guilty of a cover up. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Why don't you go to the court, and, file a Public Interest Litigation on the basis of this evidence? ...(*Interruptions*)... Why don't you do it?

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: You are guilty of continuing the cover up. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: If it is an admissible evidence, then, why don't you go to the court? ...(*Interruptions*)... If you have the courage, then, go to the court. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)... One minute. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): Sir, all of us ...(*Interruptions*)... This undermines the very foundations of our Parliamentary democracy. Sir, what we are saying is that there was a Committee appointed by the 14th Lok Sabha. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, what is this? Is this a debate going on? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. HANUMANTHA RAO (Andhra Pradesh): Sir what is this going on? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, that Committee had recommended that appropriate agencies must investigate into this. What happened to that investigation? ...(*Interruptions*)... We are asking about that investigation. Sir, that Committee had recommended investigation. ...(*Interruptions*)...

The point is that there was a Committee that recommended investigation and proper criminal investigation.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is all right. That matter is over.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Now what is the Government doing about that?
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now that matter is over. ...(Interruptions)...
Now we will take up discussion on the working of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs.

DISCUSSION ON THE WORKING OF THE MINISTRY OF TRIBAL AFFAIRS

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Nand Kumar Sai. ...(Interruptions)... Shri Nand Kumar Sai. ...(Interruptions)... Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (Nominated): Sir, the working.
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record. ...(Interruptions)...
You cannot say whatever you want. ...(Interruptions)... You have no licence to ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Sir, for the development and welfare of tribals. ...(Interruptions)... I would like to congratulate the Government.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Sir, at the same time, I am constrained to point out that the total Central Plan outlay proposed for. ...(Interruptions)... Therefore, the provision amounts to ...(Interruptions)... 3.5 per cent of ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned to meet at 2.00 p.m.

The House then adjourned at twelve minutes past twelve of the clock.

The House re-assembled at two of the clock.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) in the Chair.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

Report and Accounts (2009-10) of IICPT, Thanjavur and related papers

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURE AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FOOD PROCESSING INDUSTRIES (SHRI HARISH RAWAT): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Institute of Crop Processing Technology (IICPT), Thanjavur, for the year 2009-10, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above. [Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 4191/15/11]

...(Interruptions)...

Outcome Budget (2011-12) of the Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs

THE MINISTER OF OVERSEAS INDIAN AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF CIVIL AVIATION (SHRI VAYALAR RAVI): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Outcome Budget, for the year 2011-12, in respect of the Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs. [Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 4239/15/11]

...(Interruptions)...

Outcome Budget (2011-12) of the Ministry of Road Transport and Highways

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF ROAD TRANSPORT AND HIGHWAYS (SHRI TUSHARBHAI CHAUDHARY): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Outcome Budget, for the year 2011-12, in respect of the Ministry of Road Transport and Highways. [Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 4162/15/11]

...(Interruptions)...

Outcome Budget (2011-12) of the Ministry of Tourism

THE MINISTER OF TOURISM (SHRI SUBODH KANT SAHAY): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Outcome Budget, for the year 2011-12, in respect of the Ministry of Tourism. [Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 4313/15/11]

...(Interruptions)...

Outcome Budget (2011-12) of the Ministry of Shipping

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PLANNING; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS' THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EARTH SCIENCES (SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR): Sir, on behalf of Shri G.K. Vasan, I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Outcome Budget, for the year 2011-12, in respect of the Ministry of Shipping. [Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 4202/15/11]

...(Interruptions)...

जनजातीय कार्य मंत्रालय का परिणामी बजट (2011-12)

जनजातीय कार्य मंत्री (श्री कांतिलाल भूरिया) : महोदय, मैं जनजातीय कार्य मंत्रालय के संबंध में 2011-12 के वर्ष के लिए परिणामी बजट की एक प्रति (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ। [Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 4314/15/11]

...(Interruptions)...

Report and Accounts (2011-12) of LNUPE, Gwalior and related papers

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF YOUTH AFFAIRS AND SPORTS (SHRI AJAY MAKEN): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Lakshmibai National 12 University of Physical Education (LNUPE), Gwalior, for the year 2009-10, together with the Audit Report.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above University.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above. [Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 4248/15/11]

...(Interruptions)...

Outcome Budget (2011-12) of the Ministry of Chemical and Fertilizers

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CHEMICALS AND FERTILIZERS (SHRI SRIKANT JENA): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Outcome Budget, for the year 2011-12, in respect of the Department of Chemicals and Petrochemicals in the Ministry of Chemicals and Fertilizers. [Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 4251/15/11]

...(Interruptions)...

Report and Accounts (2009-10) of TMC, Mumbai and related papers

SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR: Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Tata Memorial Centre, Mumbai, for the year 2009-10, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Centre.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above. [Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 4252/15/11]

...(Interruptions)...

STATEMENTS BY MINISTERS (Contd.)

Status of implementation of the recommendations contained in the third report of the department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on External Affairs

THE MINISTER OF OVERSEAS INDIAN AFFAIRS AND CIVIL AVIATION (SHRI VAYALAR RAVI): Sir, I make a statement regarding the status of implementation of the recommendations contained in the Third Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on External Affairs.

Status of implementation of the recommendations contained in the One hundred and fifty-fifth report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport, Tourism and Culture

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF ROAD TRANSPORT AND HIGHWAYS (SHRI TUSHARBHAI CHAUDHARY): Sir, I make a statement regarding the status of implementation of the recommendations contained in the One Hundred and Fifty-fifth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport, Tourism and Culture on Demands for Grants, for the year 2010-11, pertaining to the Ministry of Road Transport and Highways.

Status of implementation of the Recommendations contained in the One hundred and fifty-sixth report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport, Tourism and Culture

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PLANNING; THE MINISTER OF
STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN
THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE
MINISTRY OF EARTH

SCIENCES (SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR): Sir, on behalf of Shri G.K. Vasan, I make a statement regarding the status of implementation of the recommendations contained in the One Hundred and Fifty-sixth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport, Tourism and Culture on Demands for Grants, for the year 2010-11, pertaining to Ministry of Shipping.

**DISCUSSION ON THE WORKING OF THE MINISTRY
OF TRIBAL AFFAIRS (Contd.)**

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, Discussion on the Working of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Nand Kumar Sai. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (Nominated): Sir, I am on my legs. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have been saying before these people caused. ...*(Interruptions)*... that although the Scheduled Tribes constitute 8 per cent ...*(Interruptions)*... the share of the Central Plan outlay in the Budget for the coming years is only 3½ per cent. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, I am given to understand why Dr. Mungekar in the course of his intervention in the debate. ...*(Interruptions)*... have had to point out that ...*(Interruptions)*... that the Scheduled Tribe community has been deprived of ...*(Interruptions)*... legitimate views.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You go back to your seats. I will listen to you. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: I will ask the hon. Minister to at least clarify. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Scheduled Tribe has been deprived of. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, it is a matter of deep distress that. ...*(Interruptions)*... known as 25 Departments of the Ministry. ...*(Interruptions)*... I would request the hon. Minister to explain to this House ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Go back to your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: I have also questioned. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Let him speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: What was the arrangement for monitoring the outcomes of this expenditure? ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You go back to your seats. ...(*Interruptions*)... I will listen to you if you go back to your seats. ...(*Interruptions*)... If you go back to your seats, I will listen to you. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Sir, the question is of utmost importance. ...(*Interruptions*)... The Prime Minister has repeatedly stated that. ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The House stands adjourned to meet at 3.00 p.m.

The House then adjourned at eight minutes past two of the clock.

The House reassembled at three of the clock,

[MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.]

श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि (उड़ीसा) : सर, यह गम्भीर मुद्दा है। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

श्री राजनीति प्रसाद (बिहार) : हाउस चलने दीजिए। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

श्री उपसभापति : बगैर किसी नोटिस के कोई मैटर ...(*व्यवधान*)... सुबह ज़ीरो ऑवर में जो बोलना था, बोला गया। ...(*व्यवधान*)... पाणि जी, आप जाइए, बैठिए। ...(*व्यवधान*)... आप जाइए, बैठिए। ...(*व्यवधान*)... यह ठीक नहीं है। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

डॉ. प्रभा ठाकुर (राजस्थान) : सर, ...(*व्यवधान*)...

श्री वी. हनुमंत राव (आंध्र प्रदेश) : सर, ...(*व्यवधान*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we shall take up the discussion on the working of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्रीमती माया सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश) : सर, यह सरकार ...(*व्यवधान*)...

श्री जेसुदासु सीलम (आंध्र प्रदेश) : सर, ये discussion शुरू नहीं करने दे रहे हैं ...(*व्यवधान*)...

श्री उपसभापति : लोक सभा और राज्य सभा के बारे में आप क्या कह रहे हैं
... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री वी. हनुमंत राव : सर, ये discussion शुरू नहीं करने दे रहे हैं ... (व्यवधान) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House stands adjourned to meet tomorrow at
11.00 a.m.

The House then adjourned at two minutes past three of the clock
till eleven of the clock on Friday, the 18th March, 2011.